CGIAR

Science for a food-secure future

System Council Advisory Services – Transition matters

Business Plan Action: 8.1 - Implement System Council decision on advisory services

Purpose: This document puts forward ideas on how the System Council could ensure uninterrupted delivery of expert independent advice during the transition from CGIAR's ISPC to the new 'Independent Science for Development Council'; and establishment of the CGIAR Advisory Services Shared Secretariat

Action Requested: Subject to strategic inputs and direction provided by the System Council during its deliberations on agenda item 10 at the forthcoming SC7 meeting, **the System Council is requested to consider**, and if thought appropriate, **approve**:

(a) the appointment of current ISPC members as interim ISDC members for the respective terms set out in this document; and

(b) the ongoing appointment of the Head, Independent Evaluation Arrangement to 31 March 2019

Prepared by: System Management Office
Document category: Working document of the System Council - There is no restriction on the circulation of this document.

Preliminary interpretation note

Status of this presentation:

This document sets out a number of ideas and concepts <u>collated by the System Management Office</u> in its capacity of providing operational and secretariat support to the System Council and its Strategic Impact, Monitoring and Evaluation Committee ('SIMEC'), and thus also engaging with the ISPC Secretariat, IEA, and the Chair of the ISPC as part of their own engagement with SIMEC.

The timing of the System Council's final decision on its advisory bodes (taken electronically on 4 October 2018) <u>did not permit SIMEC</u> to meet in advance to discuss these ideas and provide a formal recommendation for the System Council's 7th meeting ('SC7').

SIMEC will meet on 12 November 2018, in advance of SC7. The ideas in this document will be discussed during that meeting. Those discussions <u>may result in a recommendation from SIMEC to SC7</u>, taking note that SIMEC's mandate includes advising and making recommendations to the System Council in regard to the System Council's role in the selection of the ISDC Chair and members; and the selection of the Head of IEA (SIMEC TOR, paragraphs 3.b and c.)

Contents

1. **Recap of SC6, May 2018 agreed decision on advisory services**

2. **Independent Science for Development Council transition matters:**

    a. Agreed next steps on search for ISDC members: What was presented at SC6 and how things changed as at 4 October 2018

    b. Practical consequences of adjusted timing – risk of void in science advice

    c. Possible approach to mitigate risks arising – ISPC to ISDC member transition plan

    d. <u>Suggested SC7 decision on ISDC initial membership</u>

3. **Transitional arrangements for evaluations**

    • Past SC decisions on Head, Independent Evaluation Arrangement

    • <u>Suggested SC7 decision for transition of evaluations</u>

1. Recap of SC6 May 2018 decision on advisory bodies

Decision - SC/M6/DP3: Future of the System Council's Advisory Services

The System Council **approved** the option as set out in the SIMEC think-piece (meeting document SC6-05) for the future functional areas and operational arrangements for the System Council's scientific advisory, impact assessment and evaluation services. (*Summarized in the boxes below*)

1. Science advisory body - Independent Science and Development Council (ISDC)	2. Standing Panel on Impact Assessment (SPIA)	3. Small expert evaluation team within the Shared Secretariat
• Up to 8 members • Report to the System Council • Retain similar structure to current (external standing panel of experts in science and development subject matters, supported by a small secretariat that reports to and takes direction from that panel) • Proposal assessment undertaken by external consultants • Shared Secretariat provides operational support (also to SPIA)	• 3 members + option for 3 additional special initiatives members • Report to System Council through SIMEC • No change to structure • Shared Secretariat also provides operational support (as for ISDC)	• Report to the System Council through SIMEC • Provides quality assurance mechanism for regular programmatic, mid-term reviews and other on-demand evaluations • Evaluations themselves undertaken by externally commissioned evaluators

For transparency, the Terms of Reference for ISDC, SPIA and Shared Secretariat that are effective from 1 January 2019 accessible at the bottom of this page: https://www.cgiar.org/how-we-work/accountability/advisory-bodies/

2a. SC6 agreed next steps on implementing ISDC decision Position at May 2018 (before ISDC TOR was approved)

CGIAR

Agreed position (May 2018): The System Council **endorsed** the **proposed workplan, timetable and planned approach to formation of the new Independent Science and Development Council ('ISDC')** set out in Part D of meeting presentation SC6-05A, taking note that Part D of the presentation was focused on the independent council members for the ISDC and that subsequent actions will be required in regard to SPIA, and approving a new multi-year evaluation strategy for the CGIAR System.

Importantly – the consultation phase between SC6 (May 2018) and the approved TOR for the ISDC (4 October 2018) resulted in two major changes as set out below:

SC6 (May 2018) agreed position on workplan for ISDC	Outcome from the System Council 4 October 2018 approved ISDC Terms of Reference
Independent Science <u>and</u> Development Council	Independent Science <u>for</u> Development Council
Two step ISDC member selection: (a) Screening group; and (b) Selection Panel	Merged into a single "Nominations Panel" to take out the complexity in approach moving forward

2a. Thus - SC6 agreed next steps on implementing ISDC decision
Updated considering changes in ISDC TOR at 4 Oct 2018

An expanded version of this table is available in document SC7-07B

Steps	Expected output/result	Who	SC6 agreed timing	*Suggested revised timing as a result of 4 October 2018 final decisions on TOR
1. Develop detailed TOR and Composition for Shared Secretariat + ISDC member criteria	Clarity on composition of Shared Secretariat and TORs; composition of ISDCouncil and members profile; agreement on advertising strategy.	SIMEC (proposal) SC (decision)	Electronic agreement by System Council by July 2018	**ISDC TOR only agreed on 4 October 2018**, thus impacting timing of other next steps. **TOR of ISDC Chair and members** to be sent to the SC for electronic approval by 14 December after strategic inputs at SC7 (November 2018)
2. Form proposed 'Screening Group' and 'Selection Panel'	Clear TORs for the two groups, with a workplan that links to key SIMEC and SC meeting dates and decision moments	SIMEC *(support from SMO)*		**4 October 2018 IDSC TOR agreed one group not two.** Proposed TOR of single '**Nominations Panel**' to be submitted to SC by 16 January 2019 for electronic approval (with ISC member criteria from item 1 above)
3. Call for nominations/ applications for ISDC membership	Compilation of a long list of applicants	SIMEC *(procurement support from SMO)*	Applications by 31 August 2018	**Applications for ISDC Chair and ISDC members submitted by 7 March 2019** (number depends on whether ISPC members are appointed as interim ISDC member)
4. Screening of applications	Review candidates against agreed criteria to provide a shortlist of recommended candidates to the Selection Panel	**Screening Group*** (see annex)	During September 2018	**Nominations Panel works during March 2019 and early April 2019** (including interviewing and reference checking)
5. Selection of candidates to put forward to the System Council	Selection of candidates for the agreed number of ISDC member vacancies to put forward to the System Council for confirmation	**Selection Panel*** (see annex)	During October 2018	**Submission of recommended candidates to System Council by 29 April 2019** (at least two weeks before SC8)
6. Confirmation of selected members	System Council to confirm selected members through no-objection	System Council	During SC7, Seattle, November 2018	**ISDC Chair and ISDC members selected during SC8, May 2019**

2b. Practical consequences of adjusted timing arising from delayed approval of ISDC terms of reference

- **Seven current serving ISPC members <u>are all</u> appointed until 31 December 2018** (agreed by electronic decision SC-M5-EDP5, effective on 7 March 2018)

- **Under the earlier approved TOR for <u>existing ISPC Members</u>, the following apply:**

  i. **Chair**: <u>Maximum 5 years</u>: Initial 3 years + possibility to renew for up to 2 years

  ii. **Members**: <u>Maximum 4 years</u>: Initial 2 years + possibility to renew for up to 2 years

- **Pragmatically**, robust search processes for the Chair of the Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC') and new members will take up to 6 months

- **Ideally**, ISDC member appointment decisions are made at SC8 (May 2019) and not electronically

- **<u>Absent a transition plan</u> between ISPC and ISDC**, <u>there will be a void</u> in external independent scientific advice available to the System Council and the System

One possible way to mitigate arising risk of gap in external independent scientific advice

ISPC Incumbent	Role	ISPC Maximum possible term	Suggested ISDC Role	Suggested Transition Arrangement
Maggie Gill (F)	Chair	31 July 2019	Interim Chair	Appointed to 30 June 2019 @ 30% effort based on current contract (40 total days) *Vacancy to fill from 1 July 2019*
Patrick Webb (M)	Member	8 October 2019	Transition Member	Both appointed to 30 September 2019 (Maximum 20 total days each) *2 vacancies to fill from 1 October 2019*
Rodomiro Ortiz (M)	Member	8 October 2019	Transition Member	
Holger Meinke (M)	Member	8 May 2020	Member	Appointed to 8 May 2020 (25 days in 2019)
Nighisty Ghezae (F)	Member	7 August 2020	Member	Both appointed to 7 August 2020 (25 days in 2019)
Prabhu Pingali (M)	Member	7 August 2020	Member	
Jennifer Thomson (F)	Member	20 March 2021	Transition Member *(unavailable post March 2019)*	Appointed to 20 March 2019 (Maximum 9 days) *Vacancy to fill from 1 July 2019*
Vacant	Member			*Vacancy to fill from 1 July 2019*

Interpretation note

Table presents one of a range of possible approaches. i.e. There are other ways to ensure an effective transition, building on the following suggested principles:

- **Don't lose all institutional knowledge at same time** (2019 is a transitional year)

- **Ensure diversity to extent possible** (region of origin; gender identity; sectoral experience; organizational experience)

- **Aim for staggered rotations from 2020** (e.g. 2 people each year after first significant year of change)

On this proposal - 5 of 8 new ISDC members will appointed in 2019 (in the 3 months between 1 July and 1 October 2019); offering up considerable scope for diversity principles to be applied, and 3 other rotate in 2010
- 4 of 4 current ISPC members fulfill their maximum/available term and no unexpected disruptions

2d. Suggested draft SC7 decision on ISDC initial membership

The System Council is requested to consider, and if thought appropriate <u>approve</u> the following decision:

<u>As a transitional arrangement</u> to move from CGIAR's Independent Science and Partnership Council ('ISPC') to CGIAR's new Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC'), and pursuant to paragraph 4.3 of the IDSC terms of reference approved by the System Council on 4 October 2018, the System Council appoints, for the respective terms and roles set out below, the following persons as members of the CGIAR System's ISDC:

Person	ISDC Role	Appointment end-date
Maggie Gill (F)	Interim Chair	30 June 2019
Jennifer Thomson (F)	Transition Member	20 March 2019
Patrick Webb (M)	Transition Member	30 September 2019
Rodomiro Ortiz (M)	Transition Member	30 September 2019
Holger Meinke (M)	Member	8 May 2020
Nighisty Ghezae (F)	Member	7 August 2020
Prabhu Pingali (M)	Member	7 August 2020

3a. Past SC decisions on evaluations

1. **Electronic decision SC/M4/EDP5, effective 3 October 2017**

    The System Council **approved** a one-year renewal of the **Head of CGIAR's Independent Evaluation Arrangement ("IEA") to 30 September 2018**, as an interim decision pursuant to paragraph 44 of the CGIAR Policy for Independent External Evaluation <u>pending the System Council's consideration and approval of revised terms of reference for its science and evaluation advisory functions</u>.

2. **Electronic decision SC/M6/EDP2, effective 4 October 2018**

    The System Council **approved** the following Terms of Reference on a no-objection basis, each with operational effect from 1 January 2019:
    a. Terms of Reference for ISDC, dated 4 October 2018
    b. Terms of Reference for SPIA, dated 4 October 2018
    c. Terms of Reference for the Shared Secretariat for CGIAR Advisory Services, dated 4 October 2018

3b. Practical consequences of past decisions on evaluations and role of Advisory Services Shared Secretariat

- The **Shared Secretariat will commence operations not later than 1 April 2019,** but preferably earlier as Shared Secretariat TOR is effective from 1 January 2019

- **A transition process is underway for staffing appointments for the Shared Secretariat**, which will include expert capacity in managing external independent evaluations commissioned by the System Council (Shared Secretariat TOR paragraph 3.4)

- **Chapters 5 and 6 of the [CGIAR Policy for Independent External Evaluation](#) require revision to take into account updated mandate, institutional arrangements, work planning and other arrangements for evaluations inside the Shared Secretariat**

- **Due solely to timing considerations as shown on the prior slide, the Head, IEA is without a formal mandate from the System Council** yet there continue to be operational deliverables

- **Pragmatically**, Head, IEA is well placed to deliver against paragraph 3.4 of the Shared Secretariat TOR until 31 March 2019

3c. Suggested draft SC7 decision on evaluations

The System Council is requested to consider, and if thought appropriate <u>approve</u> the following decision:

1. <u>As a transitional arrangement</u> to move from CGIAR's Independent Evaluation Arrangement to CGIAR's new Advisory Services Shared Secretariat arrangements for external independent evaluations commissioned by the System Council, and pursuant to paragraph 44 of the CGIAR Policy for Independent External Evaluation, the System Council renews with retroactive effect from 1 October 2018 the appointment of the Head of CGIAR's Independent Evaluation Arrangement ("IEA") to 31 March 2019 on the same contractual terms and conditions as current, provided that:

   a. <u>For the period to 31 December 2018</u>, the mandate, work planning and other arrangements for evaluations apply as set out in Chapters 5 and 6 of the CGIAR Policy for Independent External Evaluation; and

   b. <u>For the period 1 January 2019 to 31 March 2019</u>, the mandate, work planning, and other arrangements for evaluations apply as set out in paragraph 3.4 of the Terms of Reference of the CGIAR Advisory Services Shared Secretariat.