

Forming CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council

Purpose

This document sets out a 'Draft 0' version of:

1. Possible **Member Competencies for CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC')**;
2. **Terms of Reference for the external independent ISDC Chair**; and
3. An **advertising strategy for that role** building on decisions and agreed actions of the System Council at its 6th meeting in May 2018, and electronically with effect from 4 October 2018.

It should be noted that this 'draft 0' material has been collated by the System Management Office from a range of interactions and has drawn on former Fund Council material. However, it has not been reviewed or endorsed by the System Council's Strategic Impact, Monitoring and Evaluation Committee ('SIMEC') at the time of issue.

It is recommended that this document be read in conjunction with document SC7-07A (PowerPoint that puts forward a suggested transition arrangement for the ISPC to the ISDC, and transition arrangement for evaluations).

Action Requested

The System Council is requested to provide strategic input on the three elements set out in this document, with a view to approval by not later than 28 December 2018, after revision of the materials to take up inputs provided during SC7.

Document category: Working document of the System Council

There is no restriction on the circulation of this document

Prepared by: CGIAR System Management Office

A. System Council past decisions and agreed actions informing this paper

1. **Table 1** below summarizes recent past decisions and agreed actions of the System Council concerning the formation of CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC') and the appointment of its members.

Date	Decision/Action	System Council decision/action summary	Status of implementation
16-17 May 2018, SC6	Decision SC/M6/DP3	Endorsed SIMEC think piece on future functional areas and operational arrangements of advisory services	Fully implemented by System Council electronic decision of 4 October 2018
16-17 May 2018, SC6	Agreed position SC/M6/AP2	Endorsed the proposed workplan, timetable and planned approach to formation of the new Independent Science and Development Council ('ISDC') set out in Part D of meeting presentation SC6-05A	Delayed, and amended by System Council 4 October 2018 electronic decision. Thus, discussed in this paper at Part B below <i>(Note: the approved ISDC TOR includes an altered selection methodology for the ISDC members compared to that discussed at the SC6 meeting).</i>
16-17 May 2018, SC6	Related action SC/M6/AP2	For electronic decision: Agreement on: (i) the proposed Terms of Reference for the new ISDC;	Full implemented through electronic decision on 4 October 2018
		(ii) the proposed major functions and size of the shared secretariat to support the ISDC, SPIA and the evaluation function; and	Fully implemented through electronic decision on 4 October 2018
		(iii) the advertising strategy to identify candidates for the ISDC;	This paper, Part C Below
		For input: A proposal to ensure the smooth transition between the SC's ISPC to the ISDC.	Refer Seattle November 2018 meeting paper SC7-07A
4 October 2018	Electronic Decision SC/M6/EDP2	Approved the Terms of Reference for each of CGIAR's ISDC , CGIAR's Standing Panel on Impact Assessment , and the new Advisory Services Shared Secretariat .	Effective from 1 January 2019

2. Table 2 below extracts relevant provisions of the System Council approved Terms of Reference for its ISDC.

Paragraph	Provision
4.1	Up to eight (8) standing members (including the Chair) The role specification and key competencies desired for ISDC members, as well as those specific to the ISDC Chair will <u>be approved</u> and reviewed periodically <u>by the System Council</u> to ensure that they represent the optimal guidance on capacities required
4.2	Chair/Members will serve an initial three years , with the possibility of renewal up to three additional years without further extension. To the extent possible, membership terms will be staggered to ensure a gradual refreshing of members.
4.3	Chair/Members appointed by the System Council based upon a merit-based, open and competitive selection process
4.3.b	Review and consideration of applications and nominations by a nominations panel comprised of up to six (6) persons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. At least two System Council members appointed by the System Council Chair, one of whom shall be the <u>SIMEC Chair</u> or her/his delegate; ii. Two science leaders from within CGIAR¹ appointed by the System Council Chair, one involved in the delivery of research outputs in a development context and one other individual associated with major science bodies working across a range of disciplines; and iii. Two persons fully external to CGIAR, with a preference for at least one of those persons to be a highly experienced individual involved in innovation from a sector beyond agriculture
4.4	The terms of reference for the nominations panel, including membership, will be approved by the System Council through electronic means . The membership of the nominations panel will be diverse and demonstrate CGIAR's strong commitment to ensuring gender equality in all facets of its work.
4.5	The search and nominations process will be undertaken according to the administrative policies of the CGIAR System Organization and be managed by the System Management Office under the overall oversight of the nominations panel. For the avoidance of doubt, the CGIAR System Organization has no decision-making role in regard to the selection of ISDC members .

3. As set out in related meeting document SC7-07A titled 'Advisory Services Transition Matters', the original agreed timetable for the selection of the ISDC Chair and its members is not able to be implemented. The original timetable anticipated approval of the Terms of Reference of the ISDC by 30 June 2018 by electronic means. As matters turned out, the TOR was approved on 4 October 2018, setting back the original timetable by three months.

¹ The words "within CGIAR" have been added in addition to the language in the Terms of Reference to remove potential confusion about whether it was intended that these be external to the System.

4. Given the proximity of the System Council's 7th meeting to the Council's recent 4 October 2018 electronic decision, the SIMEC Chair (in his capacity as the identified Chair of the required Nominations Panel as per above), considered it more appropriate to bring the following items to the System Council for endorsement or strategic input in line with earlier agreed decisions rather than proceed electronically as earlier agreed by the System Council:

Items for endorsement from SC6 as outstanding actions/changes required

- The ISPC to ISDC transition plan (*refer separate meeting document SC7-07A*)
- Revised timetable to appoint the ISDC Chair and its members (table 3 below)

Items for strategic guidance in advance of electronic approval by 28 December 2018

- **Appendix 1** – 'Draft 0' ISDC Member Competencies
- **Appendix 2** – 'Draft 0' Terms of Reference for ISDC Chair
- **Appendix 3** – 'Draft 0' advertising strategy for ISDC Chair and the four other 2019 arising ISDC member vacancies (refer to transition plan SC7-07A for explanation of the vacancy proposals)

B. Items recommended for endorsement at SC7 for the ISDC membership

5. Pragmatically, world-class search processes take approximately 6 months to complete. The SC7 meeting document titled 'Advisory Services Transition Matters' has been developed for the purposes of ensuring continuity in the availability of high-quality independent scientific advice to the System Council, and thus the CGIAR System, whilst a search for the new ISDC Chair and members takes place.
6. The SIMEC Chair recommends for endorsement by the System Council at this 7th meeting the following **revised timetable for the appointment process** (table 3) for a new ISDC Chair and other ISDC members (to substitute the timetable agreed at SC6).

Steps	Expected output/result	Who	Suggested timing
1. Approve ISPC to ISDC transition arrangements	Agreed transition that ensures availability of independent expert science advice. Rotation approach will give rise to four ISDC member vacancies in 2019, and three additional vacancies in 2020, thus a fully refreshed ISDC membership by end 2021.	System Council	Decision to be taken at SC7 , supported by meeting paper SC7-07A
2. Finalize ISDC Chair TOR and develop TOR for ISDC members based on strategic inputs during SC7	Terms of Reference for Chair of ISDC Chair and Member roles	SIMEC (proposal) SC (decision)	Sent to Council on 14 December 2018 for electronic decision by 28 December 2018

Forming CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council

Steps	Expected output/result	Who	Suggested timing
3. ISDC mandate comes into operation	Independent advice provided according to the new ISDC Terms of Reference	ISDC	From 1 January 2019
4. Form proposed Nominations Panel (6 members)	Clear Terms of Reference with a workplan that links to key System Council meeting dates and decision moments	SIMEC Chair in consultation with SC Chair <i>(support from SMO)</i>	Final Nominations Panel TOR and composition sent to Council on 16 January 2019 for decision by 30 January 2019
5. Issue call for nominations/ applications for ISDC Chair and member vacancies considering SC7 inputs on advertising strategy	Strong pool of external independent persons to consider for appointment to CGIAR's ISDC	System Organization as procurement support	Call issued: 7 January 2019 Deadline: 7 March 2019
6. Screening of candidates	Review nominations/applications against agreed criteria to identify a shortlist of candidates for further exploration through relevant due diligence processes	Nominations Panel	By early April 2019
7. Identification of recommended ISDC Chair and recommended members to fill 2019 arising vacancies	Proposed candidates that represent the best available persons to serve on CGIAR's ISDC. May include a proposal for persons to fill the anticipated arising 2020 vacancies also	Nominations Panel	Submission to System Council by 29 April 2019
8. Confirmation of ISDC Chair and ISDC members to fill arising vacancies	System Council to approve ISDC Chair and Member appointments for arising vacancies	System Council	During SC8, May 2019
9. ISDC Chair and members take up appointments in line with SC7 agreed transition plan	Seamless transition of ISDC members	ISDC and Advisory Services Shared Secretariat	ISDC Chair 1 July 2019 Other members – as relevant to rotations

C. 'Draft 0' Items for strategic input at SC7 for the ISDC membership

7. Recognizing the strategic importance of the ISDC to CGIAR, the following three annexes set out 'Draft 0' versions of possible materials to support the search and appointment process for the ISDC Chair and ISDC members.
 - **Appendix 1** – 'Draft 0' ISDC Member Competencies
 - **Appendix 2** – 'Draft 0' Terms of Reference for ISDC Chair
 - **Appendix 3** – 'Draft 0' advertising strategy for ISDC Chair and the four other 2019 arising ISDC member vacancies (refer to transition plan SC7-07A for explanation of the vacancy proposals)

8. As noted in step 2, of table 3 above, inputs received on the ISDC Chair TOR will be used to further inform the development of a Terms of Reference for the other ISDC members. Step 2 further proposes that in the month that follows the SC7 meeting, inputs from the meeting will be used to update the material and bring a complete package to the System Council for electronic approval by the end of the year.

Appendix 1

'Draft 0' – Key Competencies, time commitment and honorarium arrangements for members of CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council

Background

1. As set out the terms of reference for the Independent Science and Development Council ('ISDC'), the ISDC will consist of up to eight members appointed by the System Council upon the recommendation of a Nominations Panel.
2. ISDC members (including the Chair), are appointed for an initial period of three years, with the possibility to be renewed by decision of the System Council for an additional three-year term.

Draft 0 – ISDC Member Competencies

3. **Draft 0 - Overall ISDC profile:** The members of the ISDC should, as a collective Council:
 - a. **Represent an appropriate balance** of scientific, programmatic and development expertise in sectors including and beyond agriculture
 - b. **Reflect eminence** in their fields with internationally-recognized achievements
 - c. **Have geographically diverse experiences** and include persons who work or have worked with a broad range of organizations across multiple countries
 - d. **To the extent possible without compromising expertise, reflect geographic, gender and age diversity**, by adopting the following principles as a guide:
 - i. Aim for at least 40 percent of the 8 members who are women
 - ii. Aim for at least 40 percent of the 8 members who are of developing country origin
 - iii. To diversify the age composition of the ISDC
4. **Draft 0 – Experience and Expertise domains:** To fulfil the functions outlined for the ISDC in its terms of reference, the search and selection of ISDC members should aim for individuals from amongst the following backgrounds, qualifications and experience the following disciplines or skills:
 - a. **Agriculture:** Key disciplines or activities related to the subject of agriculture and agri-food systems.
 - b. **Biological sciences:** The study of life and living organisms, their life cycles, adaptations and environment, covering various sub-fields of biology and biochemistry.
 - c. **Social sciences:** Academic disciplines concerned with the study of the social life of human groups and individuals, often including anthropology, economics, geography, political science and sociology.

- d. **Development:** Academic training in the processes, policy and practice of development.
 - e. **Gender equality in research impact:** Academic training and proven experience in addressing these key issues in the design and delivery of effective research programs.
 - f. **Innovation:** Fields of study and practice around the dynamics of emerging technologies, delivery and social and economic impact.
 - g. **Key cross-cutting topics** including health, big data, climate change, nutrition, youth and agripreneurship, and policy and the intersection of the various disciplines.
 - h. **Key methodological areas:** particularly in areas of foresight, horizon scanning, proposal assessment, theories of change, and data analytics.
5. **Draft 0 – Minimum competencies:** ISDC members should bring to their role the following minimum competencies:
- a. **Capacity to consolidate and filter the most relevant information:** To identify the most strategic and relevant opportunities for value-add, taking the organizational, political and institutional considerations into context
 - b. **Instill confidence:** through the provision of thoughtful analysis and highly relevant outputs
 - c. **Keeping up with cutting-edge/state of the art concepts:** Demonstrate openness to concepts that push research for development boundaries, including through innovative technologies and/or partnerships
 - d. **A facilitative and consultative approach:** Proven ability to work independently as well as part of a multi-faceted team in which individual perspectives are contributed but a common product is developed
 - e. **Proven communication skills:** Diplomatic, with an ability to present findings and recommendations in a clear, timely and concise manner in both written and oral form
 - f. **High ethical standards:** Safeguard the integrity and independence of the ISDC. Adherence to confidentiality and conflict of interest policies. Be objective and provide an expert opinion based on technical merit. No bias towards certain countries, disciplines or methodologies
 - g. **Flexibility:** Ability to adapt to changes in CGIAR's governing and operating context

Draft 0 – Eligibility to serve as an ISDC member (including the Chair)

6. ISDC members serve in a personal capacity. As such, they will not represent the positions of, or seek or accept instructions from, any other party. ISDC members will recuse themselves from any matter falling within the ISDC mandate where they have an interest, affiliation or other factor that may create an actual or perceived conflict of interest, which cannot be mitigated in accordance with the ISDC Conflict of Interest Policy (which policy shall be consistent with any approved CGIAR policy on ethics and conflict of interest).
7. To maintain the integrity and independence of the ISDC, persons will not be eligible to be appointed to serve as an ISDC member if they have been involved in any capacity with the CGIAR System in the [two][three] years prior to their appointment date. As a transitional arrangement, the System Council may appoint, with effect from 1 January 2019 members of CGIAR's Independent Science and Partnership Council ('ISPC') who are current serving members of the ISPC as at 31 December 2018.

ISDC Member commitment and honorarium arrangements (excluding ISDC Chair)

8. The time commitment of an ISDC member is up to 25 days per calendar year, as determined by the ISDC Chair. Inclusive in that time commitment will be several meetings per year, as advised by the ISDC Chair after development of the annual ISDC workplan with the Head of the Shared Secretariat.
9. ISDC members receive an honorarium², considered to be compensation for time spent, rather than a professional fee. The honorarium is calculated based on the estimated level of effort per work/task and currently stands at US\$760/day³ (subject to change on the approval of the System Council).
10. Travel expenses are paid by the CGIAR System Organization in accordance with System Management Board approved policies from time to time.

² As stated in the approved TOR of the ISDC (Article 7.5): "Where institutional arrangements of an individual ISDC member may require it, the CGIAR System Organization is authorized by the System Council to make payment of the value of the honorarium to an organization affiliated with a relevant ISDC member."

³ Taken from the current arrangements, as included in the 2019-2021 budget submission provided for ISDC

Appendix 2

'Draft 0' – Terms of Reference
Chair, CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council

Background

1. The Terms of Reference for the ISDC set out a mandate that is to be executed under the oversight of the CGIAR System Council.
2. Built on the principles of ensuring independence of advice; improved efficiency; improved communication; improved and systematic linkage between science and development through innovation and effective partnerships; and higher ownership and improved coordination of the advice by the System itself, the ISDC Chair's role is to lead and steward the ISDC's provision of world-class independent advice to the System Council.

Draft 0 – Responsibilities of the Chair

3. In the context of the defined ISDC mandate, the Chair:
 - a. Drives the articulation of an operational vision for the ISDC, including how it relates to that of other advisory services functions (e.g. the Standing Panel on Impact Assessment, CGIAR System Internal Audit Function, and evaluation needs).
 - b. Leads development of relevant processes for identifying demand for ISDC services from System Council members to guide ISDC workplans.
 - c. Conveys to the System Council and appropriate stakeholder audiences, the ISDC's independent advice and recommendations on strategic issues, foresight, research priorities and the quality of the research programs.
 - d. Maintains a close working relationship with the CGIAR System Council Chair and the System Management Board Chair and the Executive Director of the System Organization.
 - e. Acts as an Active Observer of the System Council and the System Management Board or tasks another ISDC member to represent the ISDC.
 - f. Responds to requests from the SIMEC to attend or send a delegate to SIMEC meetings and proactively to engage with SIMEC in discussions on outputs for discussion by the System Council.

- g. Chairs all meetings of the ISDC and represents all ISDC Members, unless she/he tasks another ISDC member to serve as a focal point on a matter.
- h. In consultation with members of the ISDC, allocates the workload of the ISDC between its members, ensuring that the ISDC discharges its advisory role in an effective manner.
- i. Engages regularly with the SPIA Chair, including through participation in SPIA meetings as appropriate (or delegating such attendance to another Council member).
- j. Together with the Head of the Shared Secretariat, ensures the effective management of Conflicts of Interest of ISDC members.
- k. After discussion with the Head of the Shared Secretariat on potential conflicts of interest and their effective management, responds to requests from Centers/science leaders to participate in activities organized by CGIAR Centers and/or research programs and platforms, where this can enhance the ISDC understanding of CGIAR at the operational level.
- l. Directs the development of the multi-year work plan and budget for the ISDC workstream of the Shared Secretariat, and the ISDC itself taking into consideration System Council guidance on priorities.
- m. Serves on the interview panel for the appointment of the Head of the Advisory Services Shared Secretariat ('Shared Secretariat').
- n. Oversees the performance of the Head of the Shared Secretariat for the deliverables of the Shared Secretariat and liaise with the Executive Director of the System Organization regarding the annual performance report for the Head of the Shared Secretariat according to System Organization operational templates.
- o. Contributes to the annual performance assessment on the staff of the Shared Secretariat through the Head of the Shared Secretariat.

Draft 0 - ISDC Chair competencies

- 11. **In addition to ISDC Member competencies, the ISDC Chair is expected to bring the following minimum competencies to the role:**
 - a. **Visionary with global perspective:** and strong ability to think strategically and analyze complex issues.

- b. **Dynamic strategic leader with the capacity to develop and lead a panel of global experts:** Previous experience in Chairing a high-level panel or committee, or comparable leadership engagements.
- c. **Relationship builder and constructive contributor:** Capacity to understand CGIAR and support the System's efforts to better align its work and thrive in the context of an ever-evolving dynamic environment.
- d. **Strong communication skills:** The Chair should be able to convey clearly to the System Council and other stakeholders the independent advice and strategic guidance it is providing.
- e. **Good judgment and being able to balance views:** A crucial element includes being able to manage and balance differing views and communicating alternate points in a way that brings out the respective merits of those views.

Draft 0 - ISDC Chair commitment and honorarium arrangements

- 12. The time commitment of the ISDC Chair is a maximum of **[105]** days per calendar year. Included in this time calculation is attendance at two System Council in-person meetings each year; two System Management Board in-person meetings each year; up to two in-person meetings of the ISDC each year. The average duration of such meetings will be 4 days.
- 13. The ISDC Chair receives an honorarium⁴, considered to be compensation for time spent, rather than a professional fee. The honorarium is calculated based on the estimated level of effort per work/task and currently stands at **[US\$1,000/day]**⁵ (subject to change on the approval of the System Council). Travel expenses are paid by the CGIAR System Organization in accordance with System Management Board approved policies from time to time.

⁴ As stated in the approved TOR of the ISDC (Article 7.5): "Where institutional arrangements of an individual ISDC member may require it, the CGIAR System Organization is authorized by the System Council to make payment of the value of the honorarium to an organization affiliated with a relevant ISDC member."

⁵ Taken from 2019-2021 budget submission provided for ISDC through the current ISPC Secretariat

Appendix 3

'Draft 0' – Advertising Strategy for ISDC Chair and the four other ISDC member vacancies arising in 2019⁶

Overall approach

1. The search process for the ISDC Chair and for member vacancies arising in 2019 is to be **open, transparent and global**. To strengthen the element of independence, the strategy will aim to reach a broad pool of potential candidates who are not currently affiliated with CGIAR.
2. Based on the expertise, minimum competencies and overall ISDC profile desired (*to be agreed by the System Council in advance of advertisement*), nominations and applications will be sought internationally from individuals and leading scientific and development organizations.

Placing of Advertisements

3. The following proposed placements of advertisements are intended to reach a broad readership in developed and emerging economies; the list is not exhaustive and other proposals for relevant periodicals/sites would also be considered:
 - a. Science;
 - b. Scientific African;
 - c. Nature
 - d. The Economist

Announcements and approaches

4. Announcements would be sent electronically to CGIAR stakeholders and partners to take full advantage of their professional networks; this would include Funders, Centers and CGIAR System entities. Each of these would be asked to share the announcement with potential nominees/interested parties, academies of science, national research councils, universities, centers of excellence and professional societies.

Process of submission of nominations/applications

5. The advertisements/announcements would direct potential applicants or nominators to the CGIAR.ORG website where the full TOR information and background would be available, along with a link to an online application form.
6. The online form would be designed to facilitate screening by Nominations Panel and provide simple metrics to enable an overview of expertise areas and demographic profile of applications.

⁶ Refer to transition plan SC7-07A for explanation of the vacancy proposals