



ISDC Membership and Succession Matters

Purpose

This document sets out a set of proposals relating to ISDC membership, representing a holistic approach to ensuring that that ISDC’s membership and leadership continues to deliver on the range and depth of competencies and diversity defined in its [Terms of Reference](#) and in line with System Council needs.

Action Requested

The System Council is requested to **approve** the following decision to provide for continuity in leadership and membership and appropriate succession planning for CGIAR’s Independent Science for Development Council:

Pursuant to Articles 6.1 e) and f) of the CGIAR System Framework, the System Council:

- i. Appoints Professor Holger Meinke as Chair of CGIAR’s Independent Science for Development Council (‘ISDC’) for a second three-year term effective from 21 September 2022; and
- ii. Approves the revised Terms of Reference for ISDC, as set out in [Annex 4](#);
- iii. Approves the Terms of Reference for the ISDC Vice Chair, as set out in [Annex 5](#);
- iv. Appoints Dr. Nompumelelo Obokoh as ISDC Vice Chair for a three-year term effective from 1 October 2022;
- v. Appoints Drs. Andrew Ash, Suneetha Kadiyala and Lesley Torrance as ISDC members for a second three-year term effective from 1 October 2022.

Special notice on ‘Consent Agenda’ status of this document

This item is presented to the System Council according to Article 7.1(a) of the System Council’s Rules of Procedure, permitting a ‘consent agenda’ consisting of items that require formal System Council decision but are submitted as a group for adoption by the System Council without discussion.

Further to the Rules of Procedure, **should a System Council member or Active Observer wish to remove an individual item from the Consent Agenda, that request should be communicated to the Secretary of the System Council by close of business Paris time on Wednesday 13 July 2022.**

Prepared by: System Council Secretariat (in coordination with CGIAR Advisory Services Shared Secretariat)

ISDC Renewals & Structuring Overview

1. This document sets out the background to and rationale for each of element of the holistic proposal put forward for System Council consideration. The proposal recognizes the value of continuity and effective succession planning at a time when the work of ISDC has been demonstrated to be highly respected and valued by its stakeholders. The Chair's Summary of the 14th System Council meeting in December 2021 records that *"The robustness of [the ISDC's external review of the Initiatives] demonstrated the value that strong independent advice brings to both System Council deliberations, and our scientists ..."*¹
2. The proposals have benefitted from the outcomes of a periodic assessment of the ISDC Chair, stewarded by a panel comprised of the Chair of the System Council's Strategic Impact, Monitoring and Evaluation Committee ('SIMEC'), and two SIMEC members (from the African Development Bank and Sweden) – and ISDC's annual self-assessment. The proposals have been consulted with and are endorsed by SIMEC and have been consulted with System Council Funders during pre-SC16 calls with ISDC held on 28, 29 and 30 June 2022.

ISDC chair renewal

3. Professor Holger Meinke has led ISDC for three years during the transition to One CGIAR reform. ISDC has delivered independent advice at several key strategic moments, including:
 - the external review of 32 Initiative proposals
 - the review of the Companion Document to the 2022 – 2024 CGIAR Investment Prospectus
 - reflections on the Emerging One CGIAR Research Portfolio and Investment Plan
 - ISDC's feedback for CGIAR 2030 Research and Innovation Strategy
4. The periodic assessment of the ISDC Chair undertaken on behalf of the System Council by SIMEC (March 2022) and ISDC member semi-annual assessment (December 2021) of the Chair's performance were positive. During the ongoing reform, consistency of the Chair is recommended. No present member including the Chair has served more than 2.5 years on the ISDC.
5. Prof. Meinke's ability to offer the long view of CGIAR reform, and frame ISDC advice accordingly, has been essential to support the sensitive, relevant, and timely ISDC engagement with CGIAR during a time of significant transformation. Prof Meinke's biography set out in [Annex 1](#).

¹ https://storage.googleapis.com/cgiarorg/2022/02/System-Council-14-11_Chairs-Summary.pdf

ISDC succession planning and diversity – a Vice-Chair role and nomination

6. ISDC and the CGIAR Advisory Services Shared Secretariat seek to ensure smooth succession planning and shared leadership responsibilities, while increasing diversity in the chairing of ISDC through the appointment of a Vice Chair of ISDC. The Vice Chair would fill a gap in organizational risk management by supporting the Chair and staying abreast of the ISDC workplan in its entirety.
7. Absent any unforeseen event, it would be proposed that at the end of the current ISDC Chair's overall tenure, the Vice Chair would step into the Chair role. Vice Chair appointments would follow a three-step process: i) ISDC Chair identification of potential Vice Chair from among ISDC standing members based on the ToR requirements, seeking unanimous agreement of all ISDC members; ii) vetting the nomination with SIMEC or the relevant committee of System Council; and iii) followed by System Council approval of the Vice Chair appointment.² SIMEC or the relevant committee of System Council will assess the Vice Chair after two years of service, and on this basis make its recommendation to System Council on the suitability for the Vice Chair to succeed as Chair.
8. The March 2022 assessment summary of the ISDC Chair referenced the importance of diversity and breadth for ISDC to deliver its mandate. As such, this proposal seeks to complement and support the outcomes of this assessment through a proposal to appoint a Vice Chair who will bring additional diversity dimensions in addition to complementary skills.
9. This change is proposed to be realized through:
 - **Modest changes to the ISDC's Terms of Reference**, as set out in [Annex 4](#). The opportunity has also been taken to clean up key nomenclature changes in line with decisions taken as part of the transition to One CGIAR; and
 - **A proposed Terms of Reference for the ISDC Vice Chair role**, as set out in [Annex 5](#).
10. The ISDC Chair proposes that **Dr. Nompumelelo Obokoh** to serve in the Vice Chair role. Dr. Obokoh has served as a member of ISDC since 1 July 2021.
11. In addition to review of Dr. Obokoh's biography in [Annex 2](#), **System Council members are encouraged to watch this short [video](#) to hear directly from Dr. Obokoh on her background, expertise and motivations.**

² Because of the need to fulfill this role as soon as possible in 2022, aligning the position with other proposed renewals, the ISDC chair nominated the Vice Chair with agreement from ISDC members and endorsement from SIMEC. ISDC now seeks System Council approval of the Vice Chair structuring and individual nominated.

ISDC member renewals

12. To retain the required balance of skills, expertise and diversity considerations on ISDC to deliver on its Terms of Reference and the System Council-approved [ISDC 2022-2024 workplan and budget](#) (part of the integrated CGIAR Advisory Services 2022-2024 workplan and budget), it is proposed to renew the appointment of three ISDC members whose first terms end in September 2022. These members include **Drs. Andrew Ash, Suneetha Kadiyala and Lesley Torrance**. Their biographies are set out in [Annex 3](#).
13. The ISDC members proposed for renewal contributed to a successful period coinciding with the One CGIAR reform. The most intensive task for ISDC was the development of a roadmap for the external review of Initiative proposals and completion of 32 external reviews. ISDC members participated in the TAGs such as cross-cutting communication and change management (TAG1), country and regional engagement (TAG5), financial management and modalities (TAG6), and resource mobilization (TAG7). Three ISDC members—including Drs. Suneetha Kadiyala and Lesley Torrance—also participated in the Investment Advisory Groups (IAGs).
14. Table 1 presents the composition of ISDC when one member steps down in September 2022. Through a separate process, the System Council Secretariat is proceeding to support a Nomination Panel to recruit an ISDC member to replace the member stepping down after one term.

Table 1: ISDC membership

Member	Diversity & Expertise Domains	Role	Appointment End Date
Fetien Abay Abera	F; Ethiopia; Ethiopia/US Plant breeding, seed systems	Member	30 June 2024
Andrew Ash (renewal)	M; Australia Agricultural systems, production- environment interactions	Member	30 September 2022
Vacancy 1 Oct 2022 [currently Chris Barrett]	M; USA Agricultural economics	Member	30 September 2022
Magali Garcia	F; Bolivia Agronomic engineer, land and water resources	Member	30 June 2024
Suneetha Kadiyala (renewal)	F; India; UK Nutrition	Member	30 September 2022
Holger Meinke (renewal)	M; Germany; Australia Agricultural systems, climatology, crop/plant physiologist	Chair	20 September 2022
Nompumelelo Obokoh	F; South Africa Plant biotechnology	Member	30 June 2024
Lesley Torrance (renewal)	F; Scotland Virology, plant pathology, crop science	Member	30 September 2022

Annex 1: ISDC Chair Biography

Chair Holger Meinke

Holger Meinke is Adjunct Research Professor for Global Food Sustainability at the University of Tasmania, Australia. As an internationally renowned leader in climate, agriculture, and food systems research, he provides intellectual leadership at local, national, and global level. He has published over 130 refereed papers in disciplinary and transdisciplinary journals. He supervises three PhD candidates. Professor Meinke is passionate about education that fosters critical thinking and high-quality research that has impact. He is a member of five editorial boards.

He was Director of the Tasmanian Institute of Agriculture for nine years (2011-2019). Before joining the University of Tasmania, Holger held the Chair of Crop and Weed Ecology at Wageningen University, The Netherlands (2007–2011). Prior to that he was a cropping systems scientist with the Queensland Government (1988–2007), where he co-developed the agricultural systems simulation platform, APSIM. In 2014 he became a Graduate of the Australian Institute of Company Directors (GAICD). He is a member of the National Committee for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, a subcommittee of the Australian Academy of Science that advises the Australian Government.

He has a BSc from Hohenheim University (Germany, 1983), an MSC from the Technical University Berlin (Germany, 1986) and PhD from Wageningen University (The Netherlands, 1996).

Annex 2: Biography of Proposed Vice Chair

Nompumelelo Obokoh

Nompumelelo Obokoh (nee Masubelele) holds a Ph.D. in Plant Biotechnology from the Institute of Biotechnology, University of Cambridge, UK. She is currently the Chairperson of the Board of the National Research Foundation (NRF) and the Managing Director of Langace LTD (PTY), a private consultancy firm, that provides specialised advisory services on Climate Smart Agricultural Practices & Technologies, is a Biotechnology Stewardship and Biodiversity Management. She is also an independent non-executive Director of FruitSA.

With more than 18 years working in agricultural research and innovation systems with a focus on biotechnology, Nompumelelo has led multi-institutional, multi-disciplinary, and multi-national teams and efforts to improve sustainable agricultural productivity for small-holder farmers in sub-Saharan Africa. In addition to extensive research experience in South Africa, she has worked and engaged with various stakeholders in the agricultural innovation value-chain throughout Southern, East, and West Africa. She has a strong background in biotechnology, capacity building, advocacy, private-public partnerships – including with NARES, intellectual property rights issues, and scaling up agricultural technologies.

She was appointed as a Commissioner in the South African Presidential Commission on the 4th Industrial Revolution, worked as CEO of AfricaBio (an independent non-profit association in the biotechnology sector) and as Divisional Head for Innovation Support and Protection of Companies & Intellectual Property Commission (CIPC), and with the African Agricultural Technology Foundation in Abuja, Nigeria and Nairobi, Kenya. Prior to this, she was a Senior Manager at the Agricultural Research Council in South Africa and a Post-Doctoral Research Associate at the University of Cambridge, UK.

She has received several awards including the Mandela Cambridge Scholarship, Mandela Magdalene College Scholarship, Fellow of the Cambridge Commonwealth Society, as well as the Rothamstead International - African Research Fellowship.

Annex 3: Renewal Member Biographies

Member Andrew Ash

Dr. Andrew Ash has recently retired as a Chief Research Scientist in CSIRO Agriculture and Food. He has 35 years research experience in tropical rangelands and agricultural systems concentrating his work in south-east Asia and northern Australia with a particular emphasis on developing management systems to improve profitability and environmental outcomes for rural communities. Andrew has a particular interest in achieving on-ground impact from research and implementing appropriate monitoring and evaluation methodologies. He also has taken national leadership roles in adapting to the impacts of climate variability and change. He has published over 200 scientific papers, book chapters, conference papers and technical reports. He is currently Chair of the Reef and Rainforest Research Centre and sits on a number of independent science panels in Australia.

Member Suneetha Kadiyala

Dr. Suneetha Kadiyala is a nutritionist with research interests focusing on the intersection between agriculture-food systems, equity and nutrition. Her expertise spans intervention development, complex program impact evaluations and innovative methods and metrics in agriculture-nutrition research. She is the principal investigator of several research programs such as IMMANA (Innovative Methods and Metrics for Agriculture and Nutrition Actions) to stimulate the development and application of scientifically sound methods and metrics in agriculture, health and nutrition research; UPAVAN (Upscaling participatory action and videos for agriculture and nutrition), a four-arm cluster randomized control trial (RCT) integrating maternal and child nutrition objectives into a participatory video-driven agriculture extension platform in India; and a novel realist impact evaluation of a large scale video-based maternal and child nutrition programme, SAMVAD, in 5 Indian states. She established and leads the Agriculture, Nutrition and Health (ANH) Academy, a global research network of 2,500 members, from 80 countries, working at the nexus of agriculture/food systems, nutrition and health.

Suneetha is the Management Committee Member of the London Centre for Integrative Research on Agriculture and Health. She was an Editor of Food Policy from 2014-2018 and now serves on this editorial board. Prior to joining LSHTM, she was a Research Fellow at the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) in Washington DC and New Delhi. She has a PhD from the Friedman School of Nutrition Science and Policy, Tufts University.

Member Lesley Torrance

Dr. Lesley Torrance's current role is Executive Director of Science at The James Hutton Institute where she is responsible for the strategic direction and delivery of research including overseeing the delivery of the Scottish Government's RESAS Strategic Research Programme and Underpinning National Capacity resources. She is a member of the executive team responsible for science excellence and impact and strategic planning including two large capital investment projects (The International Barley Hub and The Advanced Plant Growth Centre) that when established will transform Hutton research capabilities and catalyze stakeholder interactions and investment in translational crop science.

She has more than 35 years' research experience in plant virology and is Emeritus Professor of Biology, The University of St Andrews. She has led many multi-partner international research projects. Currently she has ongoing collaborations in Malawi and Kenya on developing sustainable and climate resilient potatoes suited to SSA production systems. She is an elected Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh and Fellow of the Royal Society of Biology and serves on the Board of the Dundee Science Centre.



Annex 4: Terms of Reference of CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council (ISDC)

1. Background

- 1.1 The Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC') is an external, impartial standing panel of experts in science and development subject matters (including food systems innovation matters that extend beyond the agricultural sector) appointed by the System Council³ and accountable to it, with the responsibility of providing rigorous, independent strategic advice to the System Council, and based on decisions taken by the System Council, the broader CGIAR System as a whole.
- 1.2 The ISDC provides its advice within the broader context of CGIAR's Strategy and Results Framework ('SRF'), and successive multi-year CGIAR Business Plans approved by the System Council upon the recommendation of the System Board. Within this strategic context, the System Council has agreed that the following operational principles guide the role and operations of the ISDC:
- Independence of advice**, being neither Funders, members of the System Council, nor implementers of CGIAR research programs and/or platforms and avoiding other potential conflicts of interest;
 - Improved efficiency**, with a view to providing advice that maximizes CGIAR's impact while reducing overall costs;
 - Improved communication**, such that various assessments and evaluation workstreams in the System are aligned with CGIAR Business Plan cycles;
 - Improved and systematic linkage between science and development through innovation and effective partnerships**, such that innovation and partnerships are embedded in all aspects of CGIAR's advisory services; and
 - Higher ownership and improved coordination of the advice by the System itself**, such that the advice provided by the advisory services needs to be communicated to and formally discussed by the System Council on a regular basis.
- 1.3 These terms of reference shall be effective on 1 January 2019.

Commented [CG1]: This change in nomenclature has been tracked in this first instance - but not in future references.

Deleted: Management

³ As defined in the CGIAR System Framework, as set out in section 2 (Key terms) below.

2. Key terms

CGIAR Business Plan is a 3-year implementation plan that provide a common planning framework to ensure better alignment in how CGIAR operates as a System, and successive 3-year plans are intended by the System to provide that alignment through to 2030.

CGIAR Research means the research carried out by the Centers and CGIAR System Partners in support of the CGIAR Strategy and Results Framework.⁴

Foresight studies are periodically (typically each 6 – 10 years) commissioned to inform the development of CGIAR's longer term research strategy, with a view to ensuring that CGIAR's research agenda is resilient to the future. Foresight studies are commissioned on topics where the issue has a strong science and research element, so that science can play a role in solving or helping the CGIAR System understand it, and there is a significant future element to the issue, either because it relates to long term trends like climate change, or because there is uncertainty to how an issue will develop in the future.

At specified points in time in line with CGIAR Business Plan cycles (typically each 3 years), **horizon scanning** exercises provide analysis on how emerging trends and developments might potentially affect CGIAR's current research agenda, thereby assisting the System Council to develop new insights into novel and unexpected issues as well as persistent problems and trends, including matters at the margins of current thinking that challenge past assumptions.

Priority setting exercises, integrating both *ex-post* and *ex-ante* analyses, assist CGIAR, and especially the System Council, to discern the relevance, weighting and emphasis to be accorded to the range of proposed CGIAR research programs in order that those programs achieve strategic coherence and optimally advance the relevance and impact of CGIAR-generated research outputs. Such guidance also assists efficient and focused use of limited research financing invested in CGIAR, particularly in regard to shared science investments funded via [Pooled and Designated funding from](#) the CGIAR Trust Fund.

The **CGIAR Advisory Services Shared Secretariat ('Shared Secretariat')** provides operational support for CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC'), CGIAR's Standing Panel on Impact Assessment ('SPIA'), and implementation of the CGIAR System's multi-year evaluation plan as approved by the System Council and operates according to its own Terms of Reference.

[Strategic Impact, Monitoring and Evaluation Committee \('SIMEC'\)](#) means the [standing committee of the System Council as defined in Article 8.2 b\) of the CGIAR System Framework](#)

Deleted: Windows 1 and 2 of

Commented [CG2]: Added this here as there are multiple references to 'SIMEC' in the TOR without the full name having been given or defined.

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

⁴ Definition from the CGIAR System Framework. CGIAR Research was defined this broadly to incorporate all the sources of funding for such research, whether from the CGIAR Trust Fund or bilateral.

System Council means the strategic governing and oversight body of the CGIAR System, which is comprised of both voting and ex-officio non-voting members. A reference in these terms of reference to the System Council means that body as fully constituted with both members and ex-officio non-voting members.

3. Mandate

- 3.1 The ISDC performs the following functions and fulfills its mandate under the overall oversight of the System Council.

Foresight work to inform CGIAR's longer term research strategy

- 3.2 At strategically relevant periods for the development and/or review of CGIAR's Strategy and Results Framework, the System Council will request foresight studies based on proposals that may arise from deliberations of the System Council and from the ISDC considering the broader global context itself. When delivering such studies, the ISDC is responsible for providing the System Council with evidence-based, impartial and strategic advice on future critical research for development areas for which CGIAR has a comparative advantage. This includes the following responsibilities to provide an evidence base to support research programming and major potential shifts in the focus of CGIAR Research:
- a. Leading CGIAR System foresighting studies to provide robust advice on the core science and development challenges inherent in delivering on CGIAR's System goals, how these should be tackled in the System's research and innovation agendas, and how science breakthroughs and major emerging science developments might be harnessed to assist, taking on board the expertise in the Centers, and ensuring effective partnering with on-going and future foresight work internationally in sectors beyond agriculture, including food, nutrition, energy and others.
 - b. Based upon outcomes of foresighting studies and System Council discussion and deliberations thereon, providing recommendations and/or proposed adjustments vis-a-viz the relative priorities for CGIAR Research in order to strengthen alignment with CGIAR's System goals and the Sustainable Development Goals.
 - c. Provide expert contributions to the System Council during the development and periodic review of the implementation of the CGIAR Strategy and Results Framework and such other research frameworks envisioned to be adopted as mid-term guidance aligned to CGIAR's planning cycles.

Horizon scanning

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

- 3.3 Aligned with CGIAR Business Plan cycles, and as requested by the System Council, the ISDC is responsible for providing the System Council with both backwards and forward-looking horizon scanning inputs that put before the System emerging issues and trends that help inform periodic reviews of the ongoing relevance of research activities within a current portfolio of CGIAR Research. Proposals for horizon scanning exercises may arise from deliberations of the System Council and the ISDC considering the broader global context itself. Delivered as impartial inputs to guide System Council deliberations, this includes:
- a. Providing analysis and assessments of developments in key aspects of agricultural research for development and food systems innovation relevant to CGIAR's goals for System Council consideration and deliberation on a regular basis. This may include amongst other areas, providing strategic advice on shifts in agricultural development policies and priorities at international and national levels, as well as shifts in public/private sector roles, mechanisms and financing, and the potential of new and innovative technologies and institutions to enhance development impact in food systems.
 - b. Based on System Council deliberations on horizon scanning inputs, commissioning in-depth studies on any relevant issues that have emerged and would provide valuable information to the System.
 - c. At the request of the System Council, overseeing the translation of outcomes of in-depth studies into pragmatic guidelines, best practice briefs and protocols on key aspects of innovation systems such as partnership, financing and business model strategies.
 - d. Contributing to mid-CGIAR Business Plan cycle reviews through the provision of advice to the System through the System Council on how the outcome of horizon scanning activities could potentially affect the CGIAR Portfolio, thereby facilitating a conversation between the System Council and System Board on possible reprioritizing and/or rebalancing of research efforts in a successive CGIAR Business Plan implementation period, including adding or removing specific elements.
 - e. Linked to the outcome of horizon scanning activities and deliberations of the System Council, within each CGIAR Business Plan implementation period, providing commentary to the System Council on the annual performance reporting of the CGIAR Portfolio.

Priority setting exercises and analyses

- 3.4 At strategically relevant periods for purposes of informing periodic proposal development and assessment processes, the ISDC is responsible for:

Deleted: prepared by the System Management Office in consultation with the Centers

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

- a. Conducting rigorous, independent analytical work on priorities and trade-offs, making use of state-of-the-art knowledge from foresight, horizon scanning and other commissioned activities; and
- b. Based upon such work, and with a focus on those resources that are provided via the CGIAR Trust Fund, as well as bilateral, providing guidance and, where appropriate, objective independent analyses to the CGIAR System through the System Council on the suggested optimal allocation of System resources to be accorded to various CGIAR research programs and platforms in order that the research activities achieve strategic coherence and optimally advance the relevance and impact of CGIAR-generated research outputs.

Deleted: Windows 1, 2 and 3 of

Guidance for periodic proposal assessment processes

- 3.5 The ISDC is responsible for providing strategic guidance and oversight to ensure a robust impartial assessment of the focus, scientific excellence, adequacy of scientific and institutional research resource capacity, and potential for impact of funding requests for research proposals in accordance with the CGIAR Strategy and Results Framework and such other research frameworks intended as mid-term guidance and approved by the System Council on the recommendation of the System Board.
- 3.6 As commissioned by the System Council, and subject to paragraph 3.7, this includes:
 - a. For new calls for proposals for a whole portfolio or major additional elements, and based on System Council deliberations on foresighting studies and horizon scanning activities, identifying for consideration and strategic direction by the System Council in advance of System Board adoption for the call for proposals:
 - i. Analysis and advice on optimizing the CGIAR Portfolio as a whole;
 - ii. Effective research modalities and structures for delivering high quality research to solve challenges relevant to CGIAR's mandate using a Quality of Research for Development Framework agreed by the System Council in consultation with the System Board;
 - iii. Efficient processes for calling for and assessing proposals, including the appropriate proposal assessment metrics as well as linkages between proposals to achieve the high-level outcomes of a call for proposals; and
 - iv. Any updated guidance relevant to the quality and relevance at entry stage of proposals taking into account the quality of research for development frame of reference and internationally accepted research standards, and the evidence-base supporting further investment as aligned to the CGIAR System Risk Management Framework and the CGIAR System's risk appetite statement.

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

- b. For material proposed adjustments to the prioritization, flagship elements and/or research structures within a current CGIAR Research Portfolio, providing commentary to support informed discussion and decision-making by the relevant governance bodies, taking guidance from horizon scanning activities, engagement with the System Council, and where necessary, inputs from the System Board and contracted external subject matter experts.
 - c. Moderating the proposal review assessment process undertaken by external subject matters experts, which experts are contracted by the Shared Secretariat, to undertake independent proposal assessment. The profile of experts and consequent search process for such experts to undertake proposal assessments will be developed by the ISDC with support from the Shared Secretariat. This process will be informed by suggestions from other bodies as necessary and considering System Council needs and the development relevancy analog. The final selection of experts will be made by the ISDC itself. With respect to the moderation of the expert assessments, Conflicts of Interest of individual ISDC members must be declared with the decision on recusal of individual members from specific expert assessments to be decided by the ISDC Chair and Head, Shared Secretariat.
- 3.7 Recognizing the benefit of ISDC guidance to the System Council on appropriate modalities and processes for proposal reviews being informed by the views and experiences of the CGIAR Research leaders, at relevant times in the CGIAR Business Plan cycle, the Shared Secretariat will facilitate the exchange of information between ISDC members and CGIAR Research leaders through a series of open webinars that are transparently scheduled to facilitate broad participation.

Other functions

- 3.8 From time to time, the System Council may also formally request broader guidance from the ISDC on matters concerning the strategic direction of CGIAR and the value of its research agenda, including:
- a. Advising the System Council on how to maximize the value of the extensive research advice available across the System, for example, where appropriate, leveraging the expertise that sits in advisory bodies to the CGIAR Centers and research programs in System-wide foresighting and horizon scanning exercises.
 - b. Providing advice, when necessary, on appropriate policies and approaches with respect to research infrastructure and platforms across CGIAR, including regarding shared and remote equipment access.
- 3.9 At strategic opportunities aligned to the CGIAR Business Plan so as to ensure that the outcomes of such conversations can be tabled at and discussed by the System Council, the System Council may request the ISDC to convene and/or broker strategic science discussions and international fora between outside experts and

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

science groups within the CGIAR System to facilitate relationship building, knowledge exchange and stronger positioning of CGIAR as a global thought leader in the global arena.

4. Members and appointment process

Membership

- 4.1 ISDC will consist of up to eight (8) standing members, which number can be reviewed by the System Council based on need and required expertise coverage, one of whom serves as ISDC Chair [and one as Vice Chair](#)
- 4.2 . The role specification and key competencies desired for ISDC members, as well as those specific to the ISDC Chair [and Vice Chair](#) will be approved and reviewed periodically by the System Council to ensure that they represent the optimal guidance on capacities required.
- 4.3 ISDC members will serve an initial three years, with the possibility of renewal up to three additional years without further extension. To the extent possible, membership terms will be staggered to ensure a gradual refreshing of members.

Deleted: ,

Deleted: including the Chair,

Appointment process

- 4.4 ISDC members, including the ISDC Chair [and Vice Chair](#), are appointed by the System Council based upon a merit-based, open and competitive selection process that includes the following elements:
- a. A broad call for applications and nominations, including a visible public element as part of that call;
 - b. Review and consideration of applications and nominations by a nominations panel comprised of up to six (6) persons from the following groups as chaired by the SIMEC Chair:
 - i. At least two System Council members appointed by the System Council Chair, one of whom shall be the SIMEC Chair or her/his delegate;
 - ii. Two science leaders appointed by the System Council Chair, one involved in the delivery of research outputs in a development context and one other individual associated with major science bodies working across a range of disciplines; and
 - iii. Two persons fully external to CGIAR, with a preference for at least one of those persons to be a highly experienced individual involved in innovation from a sector beyond agriculture.
- 4.5 The terms of reference for the nominations panel, including membership, will be approved by the System Council through electronic means. The membership of the nominations panel will be diverse and demonstrate CGIAR's strong commitment to

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

ensuring gender equality in all facets of its work. The nominations panel will be permitted to seek the views of the Chair of the ISDC during the screening process for new ISDC members, but the ISDC Chair will not personally serve on the nominations panel.

- 4.6 The search and nominations process will be undertaken according to the administrative policies of the CGIAR System Organization and be managed by the System Management Office under the overall oversight of the nominations panel. For the avoidance of doubt, the CGIAR System Organization has no decision-making role in regard to the selection of ISDC members.

5. Ethics and management of conflicts of interest

- 5.1 All ISDC members shall act in good faith in the interests of the CGIAR System.⁵
- 5.2 All ISDC members shall comply with the ISDC Conflict of Interest Policy (which policy shall be consistent with any approved CGIAR policy on ethics and conflicts of interest) and abide by ISDC procedures for managing conflicts of interest.
- 5.3 The ISDC may agree additional internal rules of procedure for itself that are consistent with these terms of reference and the operational policies of the CGIAR System Organization, which additional rules of procedure of ISDC shall be publicly disclosed by the CGIAR System Organization.

6. Engagement modalities

- 6.1 **Representative role of the ISDC Chair and Vice-Chair:** The ISDC Chair and Vice Chair represent all ISDC Members in accordance with their respective Terms of Reference, unless the ISDC Chair has tasked another ISDC member to serve as a focal point on a matter.
- 6.2 **Linkages and engagement with the System Council:** To facilitate effective linkages with and engagement between ISDC and the System Council, the following modalities apply:
- a. Pursuant to Article 3.2 of the *CGIAR System Framework*⁶, the ISDC shall have the right to appoint a representative to participate as an Active Observer at System Council meetings. This representative is expected to be the ISDC Chair unless that person is not available or delegates to another person.
 - b. Relevant to a standing ISDC agenda item for at least one meeting each year, and at both System Council meetings each year if confirmed by the System Council Chair, the ISDC Chair or her/his designated representative will be

⁵ In line with Article 3.5 of the CGIAR System Framework

⁶ <https://cgspace.cgiar.org/bitstream/handle/10947/4371/CGIAR%20System%20Framework%20-%20WEB.pdf?sequence=7>

Deleted: s

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

invited to provide the System Council with a presentation, report or other think-piece to guide System Council deliberations. Should the ISDC Chair perceive that the scheduling of ISDC matters for discussion in the System Council meetings are insufficient to provide the System Council with adequate opportunity to deliberate on ISDC inputs, the matter should be raised with the System Council Chair [after engagement with the Secretary to the System Council](#).

- c. The ISDC Chair may engage directly with the Chair of the System Council on a strategic level when need arises from either Chair.
- d. SIMEC is the key forum for preparatory conversations with ISDC on workflow design and the schedule of delivery to facilitate alignment with System Council workplans and priorities.
- e. ISDC is encouraged to seek broader System Council inputs on key studies and other deliverables. Written requests for System Council inputs will be undertaken through the System Council Secretariat.
- f. As outputs of ISDC studies or activities become available to the System Council direct, SIMEC is a forum for discussing possible mechanisms to facilitate the structured consideration and endorsement by the System Council of effective responses to the ISDC's studies or advice, so as to avoid ambiguity and strengthen decision making processes.
- g. A key responsibility of the System Council on ISDC inputs is to provide a formal reaction, including, when relevant, the pathway for advice or proposals of the ISDC to be put before the System Board for consideration and formal response to the System Council.

6.3 **Engagement with SIMEC:** As determined by the SIMEC Chair relevant to agenda SIMEC items, the ISDC Chair will be invited to participate in SIMEC meetings.⁷ Depending on the subject matter, the ISDC Chair may propose that additional ISDC members and/or the Head, Shared Secretariat also join the agenda item(s).

6.4 **Engagement with the CGIAR System Board:** Pursuant to Article 7.8 of the *Charter of the CGIAR System Organization*, a representative of the ISDC is invited by the Chair of the System Board to attend System Board meetings as an Active Observer. Based on consultation with the System Board Chair, the ISDC Chair will identify the appropriate representative and notify the Secretary of the System Board accordingly.

6.5 **Engagement with other advisory and assurance bodies:** To facilitate effective operational alignment in the respective priorities and areas of focus of both the ISDC and CGIAR's Standing Panel on Impact Assessment ('SPIA'), the ISDC Chair will engage regularly with the SPIA Chair, including through the participation of the

⁷ Participation may be in person or virtually as scheduled by the SIMEC Chair.

respective Chairs at the other body's key meetings with SPIA Chair as an ex-officio member of ISDC.

- 6.6 **Engagement with CGIAR Centers and programs:** Recognizing that the maintenance of impartiality and independence is critical to the ISDC's ability to deliver against its mandate, direct engagement of ISDC members with researchers and research managers in Centers, CGIAR research programs and platforms is expected to be through transparent mechanisms as facilitated by the Head, Shared Secretariat and in compliance with the ISDC Conflict of Interest Policy.

7. ISDC operational support and budget

- 7.1 The work of the ISDC will be supported by the Shared Secretariat, which secretariat will also be responsible for supporting the work of CGIAR's Standing Panel on Impact Assessment ('SPIA') and providing operational support for the delivery of robust, independent evaluations undertaken by external evaluators at the request of the System Council.
- 7.2 The Shared Secretariat will be located in Rome and will be hosted by and co-located with the CGIAR System Organization at a suitable location ensuring appropriate System Management Office presence. The CGIAR System Organization is responsible for providing appropriate office accommodation for the Shared Secretariat in a manner that ensures the day to day operational independence of the Shared Secretariat.
- 7.3 The terms of reference for the Shared Secretariat and the job description for its Head will be formally endorsed by the System Board as the legally responsible governing body of the CGIAR System Organization, following electronic approval by the System Council. Development of the terms of reference will be undertaken by SIMEC, based on consultations with the System Council members and other key stakeholders including the ISDC and SPIA Chairs.
- 7.4 ISDC's work will be planned and implemented according to:
- a. **A multi-year workplan and budget:** ISDC, with support from the Shared Secretariat, will direct the development of a multi-year workplan and budget with objectives and deliverables that are aligned to successive CGIAR Business Plan cycles using a template provided by the System Management Office for all System entities and the mandated functions described in these terms of reference. After a review by SIMEC for alignment with business planning cycles, the multi-year workplan and budget will be approved by the System Council as part of the multi-year consolidated budget and work plan for CGIAR System entities that is submitted to the System Council through the CGIAR System Organization according to the provisions of the CGIAR System Framework. For the avoidance of doubt, the System Organization does not

Terms of Reference: Independent Science for Development Council

determine the work plan or budget for the ISDC and is not involved in oversight of implementation of the ISDC workplan or budget.

- b. **Annual planning:** On an annual basis, a review of the optimal allocation of agreed budget ceiling and scope of activities will be undertaken by ISDC in consultation with SIMEC and the System Council's Assurance Oversight Committee.

7.5 ISDC members are entitled to receive an honorarium for actual services provided, in addition to payment of travel expenses according to the policies of the CGIAR System Organization. The amount of honorarium will be determined in accordance with policies approved by the System Council and paid according to the administrative policies of the CGIAR System Organization. Honorarium amounts will be included in the multi-year consolidated work plan and budget for the CGIAR System and its advisory bodies. Where institutional arrangements of an individual ISDC member may require it, the CGIAR System Organization is authorized by the System Council to make payment of the value of the honorarium to an organization affiliated with a relevant ISDC member.

8. Periodically assessing ISDC performance

8.1 Every three years, with the assistance of SIMEC, the System Council will undertake a review of ISDC according to criteria agreed by the System Council. Such reviews will be overseen by the System Council Chair and informed by inputs received from System Council members, the System Board members, and Center leadership and staff, including those responsible for leading CGIAR research programs and platforms.

8.2 The System Council Chair, on behalf of the System Council, will ensure that the ISDC Chair's performance is assessed at the end of year two of each three-year term in accordance with an assessment process that has been presented to the System Council for endorsement. Inputs from SIMEC members, System Council members and elsewhere within or beyond the CGIAR System are anticipated to be included in the assessment process.

8.3 ISDC may undertake internal self-assessment processes more frequently and should welcome input from non-ISDC members into those processes. ISDC is invited to submit the outputs from any self-review processes into the periodic review that is undertaken by the System Council according to paragraph 8.1.

Commented [CG3]: Deleted 'Transitional Arrangements' as this was a time-bound provision and no longer relevant

Deleted: Transitional arrangements¶

¶
The 2019 calendar year will be a transition year for the new arrangement. In this year the best arrangement for having the Shared Secretariat in Rome will be found.¶

Annex 5:

Proposed Terms of Reference Vice Chair, CGIAR's Independent Science for Development Council ('ISDC')

Background

1. The ISDC mandate comprises the following¹, to be executed under the strategic oversight of the CGIAR System Council:
 - a. **Foresight** work to inform CGIAR's longer term research strategy;
 - b. **Horizon scanning** to provide analysis on how emerging trends and developments can be taken into account in CGIAR's work;
 - c. **Priority setting** exercises and analyses integrating both ex-post and ex-ante analyses;
 - d. Guidance for periodic **proposal assessment** processes; and
 - e. **Other functions**, on the strategic direction of CGIAR and the value of its research agenda.
2. Built on the principles of ensuring independence of advice; improved efficiency; improved communication; improved and systematic linkage between science and development through innovation and effective partnerships; and higher ownership and improved coordination of the advice by the System itself, the ISDC Chair's role is to lead and steward the ISDC's provision of world-class independent advice to the System Council.
3. The Vice Chair of ISDC is appointed from the current ISDC membership by the System Council on the recommendation of the ISDC Chair, after consultation with the Chair of the System Council's Strategic Impact, Monitoring and Evaluation Committee ('SIMEC'). Only if no current ISDC member is eligible or willing to serve as Vice Chair, an open and competitive selection process would occur following the ISDC member recruitment guidelines stated in the ISDC ToR.
4. Diversity dimensions (e.g., balance between the global south and north; complementary domain expertise, complementary gender) will be guiding selection criteria. Clause 8 presents all criteria.
5. The Vice Chair is appointed for an initial period of up to three years, with a one-year assessment period for confirmation of continuation of the term. Absent any unforeseen event, it would be anticipated that the Vice Chair would be available for nomination as Chair at the conclusion of the current Chair's overall term.

Responsibilities of the Vice Chair

6. In the context of the defined ISDC mandate, the Vice Chair is expected to:

- a. Support the Chair to drive the articulation of an overall vision for ISDC, including how it relates to that of other advisory services functions (e.g., the Standing Panel on Impact Assessment ('SPIA'), CGIAR System Internal Audit Function, and evaluation needs).
- b. Along with Chair, maintain a close working relationship with the CGIAR System Council Chair, the System Board Chair and the Executive Management Team of CGIAR.
- c. Serve as Acting Chair to represent ISDC when Chair is not available.
- d. Support the Chair at all meetings and upon request chair meetings.
- e. Ensures smooth transition of governance when succeeding the Chair.
- f. Lead six ISDC monthly meetings a year and review follow-up documentation prepared by the Advisory Services Shared Secretariat.
- g. Co-lead the ISDC semi-annual meetings and review subsequent actions in close collaboration with the Chair.
- h. Serve as focal point for ISDC workplan development and monitoring.

ISDC Vice Chair Competencies

7. **In addition to ISDC Member competencies, the ISDC Vice Chair is expected to bring the following additional minimum competencies to the role:**
 - a. **Visionary with global perspective:** displaying strong ability to think strategically and analyze complex issues and be able to give clear recommendations and articulate priorities to support the System Council's discussions and decision making.
 - b. **Dynamic strategic leader with the capacity to develop and lead a panel of global experts:** Strong track-record in chairing a high-level panel or committee, or comparable leadership engagements.
 - c. **Relationship builder and constructive contributor:** Capacity to understand CGIAR and support the System's efforts to better align its work and thrive in the context of an ever-evolving dynamic environment.
 - d. **Strong communication skills:** The Vice-Chair should be able to convey ISDC's advice and strategic guidance clearly to stakeholders as well as the ability to listen to and take on board stakeholder inputs and perspectives.
 - e. **Good judgment and being able to balance views:** A crucial element includes

the ability to manage and balance differing views and communicating alternate points in a way that brings out the respective merits of those views.

- f. **Diversity** in dimensions such as geographic location, expertise, scientific discipline, and gender, complementing those of the Chair.
- g. **Willingness** to succeed into Chair role.

Eligibility to Serve as an ISDC Vice Chair

- 8. The ISDC Vice Chair serves in a personal capacity. As such, they will not represent the positions of, or seek or accept instructions from, any other party. The ISDC Vice Chair will recuse themselves from any matter falling within the ISDC mandate where they have an interest, affiliation or other factor that may create an actual or perceived conflict of interest, which cannot be mitigated in accordance with the ISDC Conflict of Interest Policy (which policy shall be consistent with any approved CGIAR policy on ethics and conflict of interest).
- 9. To maintain the integrity and independence of ISDC, persons will not be eligible to be appointed to serve as the ISDC Vice Chair if they are currently directly employed by any CGIAR entity or are currently serving on any CGIAR Center's Board of Trustees. As part of the practice of proactively managing potential or actual conflicts of interest, it is a requirement that any active involvement or previous linkage with CGIAR is declared at the time of nomination as ISDC Vice Chair, which involvement or linkage can then be assessed by the ISDC nominations panel. The successful candidate will be asked to sign an annual declaration of interest statement, including strategies to mitigate and avoid perceived and actual conflict.

ISDC Vice Chair commitment and honorarium arrangements

- 10. The time commitment of the ISDC Vice Chair is a maximum of 50 days per calendar year. Included in this time calculation is attendance at an average of two System Council in-person meetings each year and up to two in-person meetings of the ISDC each year. The average duration of such meetings will be 4 days. It also includes anticipated attendance at virtual SIMEC meetings when ISDC is an agenda item with a total time commitment up to two days.
- 11. The ISDC Vice Chair receives an honorarium², considered to be compensation for time spent, rather than a professional fee. The honorarium is calculated based on the estimated level of effort per work/task and currently stands at US\$760.00/day³ (subject to change on the approval of the System Council). Travel expenses are paid through the Advisory Services Shared Secretariat in accordance with applicable policies.

² As stated in the approved TOR of the ISDC (Article 7.5): "Where institutional arrangements of an individual ISDC member may require it, the CGIAR System Organization is authorized by the System Council to make payment of the value of the honorarium to an organization affiliated with a relevant ISDC member."

³ Taken from 2019-2021 budget submission provided for ISDC, as approved by the System Council at its 7th meeting in November 2018