

HCC PC5 HEARING
Day 2 - 28th September 2022

David Hill (Chair), Ewan Wilson, Vicky Morrison-Shaw, Nigel Mark-Brown

9.00am

D Hill

9.01am

G Kessels (Ecology) Continued from Day 1

D Hill how long protocols been in place

G Kessels

D Hill no disagreement between experts

G Kessels

D Hill useful, Council comment on

G Kessels

D Hill do bats fly to forage, for fun
plant to attract food source they're looking for, what do they feed on

G Kessels

9.11am

Dr H Mueller (Ecology) responds to D Hill questions to G Kessels

D Hill written in some way, confidence in terms of land owners

Dr H Mueller

9.18am

D Hill was that amended

Dr H Mueller

9.22am

QUESTIONS

V Morrison Shaw what is early planting
function of the size of the plants, older plants

Dr H Mueller

9.23am

D Hill trigger height attained before earthworks start
most likely tallest plant in place, some taller on the roads, 4.3m

Dr H Mueller

V Morrison Shaw system using faster growing trees, pine, roosters

Dr H Mueller

D Hill even if they're dead
spaces attractive, Peacockes, any issues with recreational activities
is noise an issue, mountain biking

Dr H Mueller

9.31am

N Mark Brown new roads that cross bat areas, if not planting soon will be an issue, as soon as roads put in
cost quite an issue, even if cars are not using it, it will affect bats

earthworks, not traffic, could bats fly over 20m gap

Dr H Mueller

9.33am

D Hill what time do bats become active, in terms of construction time, planned issue

Dr H Mueller

9.34am

V Morrison Shaw what height do bats roost, predators, controlling
is there a way to protect the roost tree

Dr H Mueller

D Hill height of artificial boxes, 10m, optimum height

Dr H Mueller

9.39am

J McKensey (Lighting)

9.45am

D Hill is that a circular definition, Ms Manley, did she have trouble interpreting that

J McKensey

9.50am

V Morrison Shaw what is the difference - 150, 250, 350, higher than 350

D Hill depends on ambient light

J McKensey

9.55am

D Hill what is the luminance of a full moon

J McKensey

10.03am

QUESTIONS

N Mark Brown para 12, already explained

D Hill advisory notes

10.05am

V Morrison Shaw para 20 outdoor lights, 5 mins, general standard
any other with similar limit
planting and buffer areas

J McKensey

D Hill

10.16am

Dr M Baber (Ecology)

10.24am

D Hill not seeing alternative to planting, assumptions

Dr M Baber

10.29am
QUESTIONS

V Morrison Shaw model updated when planting done in other areas, less planting less obligations
Dr M Baber
D Hill if data live, how incentivising work, defer to capitalize, tomorrow's results, huge risk
Table 8, p35, Mr Kessel's evidence, proposed compensation package, how numbers translate from
top to bottom of Table

Dr M Baber

10.38am
D Hill time 25 years, 37 hectares being lost, high and moderate value, straight line incorrect
how get to 700 hectares, heroic assumptions in the model
if buffer uncertainty, move out to 25 years, reduce not increase

Dr M Baber

10.44am
V Morrison Shaw examples, producing outcomes, or new
Dr M Baber

10.48am
N Mark Brown model, lead person, Dr Mueller peer review
DOC expert, not transparent, write yours out, provided for DOC to consider
DOC prefer another one

Dr M Baber

10.51am
D Hill assumptions Appendix K, understand different outcomes, data accurate but not sufficient
Dr M Baber

10.53am MORNING BREAK
11.11am RESUMED

SUBMITTER TABLED EVIDENCE

WEL - Sara Brown

Ron Lockwood - Bevan Houlbrooke

WRC - Andrew Carnell (Transport)

Transpower - Trudi Burney

Ministry of Education - Daniel Thorne

Metlifecare - Bianca Tree

SUBMITTERS

Kainga Ora

11.11am Susannah Tait (Planning) with Brendon Liggett

11.20am
D Hill more efficient use of land for housing, density is key issue
where ended up with the island

Susannah Tait

D Hill is this the typical size Kainga Ora building
B Liggett

11.24am
V Morrison Shaw considered smaller sizes
Susannah Tait

11.28am
D Hill seen submissions, arguing for starting small and building up, not persuaded because?
Susannah Tait

11.37am
V Morrison Shaw where figure 35 come from
Susannah Tait

11.44am
QUESTIONS

D Hill cutting density, average, play around with sizes, don't have an application to change
not persuaded about 35, aspirational target, development pressures
averaging another way of dealing with it
bigger scale

Susannah Tait

11.50am
V Morrison Shaw para 63B buildings on same site, need for set-back servicing, 1m
Susannah Tait

11.52am
Shortbread Ltd
Lynne Sun (Planner) and Stephanus Meyer (Engineer)

11.57am
D Hill not our job to determine that matter, for the Council to deal with
V Morrison Shaw market value not based on medium density
Susannah Tait Refers to PowerPoint

12.01pm
S Meyer
D Hill
A Craven
S Meyer
D Hill put indicative things in or not

12.06pm
QUESTIONS
E Wilson unfair financial burden, resource consent, who should carry the burden?
landowner not take any responsibility

Susannah Tait

12.07pm

N Mark Brown location of wetland, suit client better, what big concern, cost, not seen from drawings

S Meyer

N Mark Brown Mr Craven comment on that

A Craven

Susannah Tait

12.12pm

The Adare Company

Dr Robert Makgill and Mike Doesburg (Legal)

12.14pm

D Hill has Mr Parsons been listening in

V Morrison Shaw attention to have regard to

Dr R Makgill agree in so far as

V Morrison Shaw fauna extended to Bat Fauna

Dr R Makgill ecology, habitat protected, not fauna itself

V Morrison Shaw NPS aspect Turiwhaimana

Dr R Makgill responded

12.24pm

D Hill we do have 6C
tension in the evidence

Dr R Makgill

12.32pm

V Morrison Shaw site visit to island on Thursday, access

Dr R Makgill

12.37pm

V Morrison Shaw much less dwellings per hectare, 10, 20 per hectare

Dr R Makgill

12.42pm

D Hill evidence, also a Peacocks population, residential loyalty, don't move widely,
also 'and'

Dr R Makgill

12.45pm

LUNCH BREAK

1.17pm

RESUMED

D Hill

1.18pm TEAMS SESSION - Dr Stuart Parsons (Bat Ecology expert)

1.27pm

QUESTIONS

V Morrison Shaw evidence, bats remaining faithful to roost sites, different areas

Dr Stuart Parsons

V Morrison Shaw
Dr Stuart Parsons

expected age a bat lives too

1.29pm
N Mark Brown
Dr Stuart Parsons

competing evidence from HCC and DOC models

1.30pm
D Hill

bat behaviour, why range so widely, tasty morsels or other, manufacture environments
do they occupy each others' roost, fussy diet

Dr Stuart Parsons

1.33pm
Dr Hill

bat management plans
who centre should be

Dr Stuart Parsons
Dr R Makgill
A Blayney

1.47pm
QUESTIONS
N Mark Brown

co-ordinated delivery, what do you mean
areas like road crossings particularly problematic
work happening now

A Blayney
D Hill

how wide a break bats will not link to, gap, landowners, undisturbed
when bats leave their roosts, do they fly the same path, follow corridors if set up

A Blayney

1.53pm
V Morrison Shaw
A Blayney
D Hill

50 versus 100 issue DOC raises, 50 minimum, 100 without the bespoke
if construct corridors, what is magic of 50

A Blayney

1.56pm
D Hill
A Blayney

do we need a dual carriageway

1.58pm
Dr Stuart Parsons
D Hill

distance, functionality
noise, anything else

Dr Stuart Parsons

2.00pm
Dr Sarah Flynn (Ecology expert)

2.04pm
QUESTIONS
N Mark Brown
Dr Sarah Flynn

strong technical leadership, also involved in looking at appropriate models

N Mark Brown part of the enhancement panel
reason model is needed, find the money immediate work

Dr Sarah Flynn

2.10pm

D Hill posing a two step process, work within Plan Change upfront, offset area funded

Dr Sarah Flynn

2.13pm

V Morrison Shaw para 9, simple metrics

Dr Sarah Flynn

2.14pm

E Wilson timeframe required overarching plan what needs to be done for the habitat, quantum around it

Dr Sarah Flynn

2.16pm

Dr R Makgill

2.37pm

QUESTIONS

V Morrison Shaw weight to draft, bio diversity

Dr R Makgill

2.38pm

AFTERNOON BREAK

3.00pm

RESUMED

D Hill

Talks about site visit on Thursday

Dr R Makgill

D Hill

Need to go onto island

L Muldowney

D Hill

3.01pm

David Peacock (Corporate)

3.03pm

D Hill

3.04pm

QUESTIONS

V Morrison Shaw extent of land holdings. Shared

David Peacock

3.05pm

Hamish Anderson (Corporate and Commercial considerations)

3.09pm

V Morrison Shaw no code of conduct in your statement

Dr R Makgill

V Morrison Shaw deferral of development. Supermarket first to go in
experts for Council, location on east side for supermarket, size remain same, on the Woolworths side.
any supermarkets been across a road, integrated

Hamish Anderson
3.14pm
D Hill a well established catchment, higher risk, smaller scale, splitting retail across a road

Hamish Anderson
D Hill supermarket first
3.16pm
V Morrison Shaw island, what is development under consent, when were they granted, lapse period
hold any other within the Peacockes area

Hamish Anderson

3.17pm
D Hill consent you hold, commercial part same as PC5, articulate activities permitted
Hamish Anderson

3.18pm
E Wilson timeframe when you start next October, amount of dwellings and when
which location

Hamish Anderson
E Wilson your approach to landscaping, habitat, getting ahead of it
indication when vegetation to maturity point
how measure impact of habitat improvements

Hamish Anderson
Dr R Makgill

3.26pm
D Hill dwelling uptake PC5 Amberfield
how seeing the market, Auckland apartments acceptable, more resistance here
scheduling, time to play around if variation, in Court, appeal

Hamish Anderson

3.31pm
Wayne Bredemeijer (Urban Design expert)

3.38pm
QUESTIONS
V Morrison Shaw connecting to river, view shaft through to river, not easy to see
Wayne Bredemeijer

3.42pm
Richard Bowker (Retail expert)

3.45pm
QUESTIONS
D Hill not sure 42A picked that up, looking for in primary, add a couple more
20,000m cap, independently reviewed, not absolute

Richard Bowker

3.47pm

V Morrison Shaw

Mr Akehurst two supermarkets, 9,000 on east side
what is medium size supermarket

Richard Bowker

3.49pm

D Hill

size determined by the operator, 4,500m, available size quite an impact

Richard Bowker

3.51pm

V Morrison Shaw

size of car parking, accommodated within the site

Richard Bowker

D Hill

4 lane highway hard to cross

Richard Bowker

3.56pm

5 minute BREAK

4.03pm

RESUMED

Mike Doesburg (Legal)

4.05pm

TEAMS SESSION - Ray O'Callaghan (Engineering expert)

4.06pm

D Hill

High Noon situation here

NO QUESTIONS

4.07pm

Tony Penny (Transport expert)

4.14pm

D Hill

why express confidence close the gap between the two of you, before Monday. Mr Black

Tony Penny

Dr R Makgill

questions to Mr Penny

Tony Penny

4.17pm

END OF TEAMS

4.19pm

Andrew Collings (Planning expert)

Refers to PowerPoint

4.44pm

D Hill

where is the requirement for the aggregate, not absolute, negotiable
required minimum is captured, accuracy of the map

Andrew Collings

4.52pm

E Wilson

question on H, what are you articulating, not up to 800

Andrew Collings

4.57pm

D Hill

Andrew Collings

is it redundant

5.02pm

QUESTIONS

D Hill

**bat habitat enhancement plan, need for plan to go further, skills
need for panel to have more than planning/advisory function**

Andrew Collings

5.05pm

N Mark Brown

Andrew Collings

experience with Amberfield, bat management, familiar with Peacocke area

5.06pm

V Morrison Shaw

Andrew Collings

D Hill

heard from Ecological witnesses, Waipa as part of panel members

Dr Robert Makgill

5.08pm

L Muldowney

Re site visit

5.09pm

ADJOURNED