

BEFORE THE HEARING PANEL

IN THE MATTER of the Resource Management Act
1991

AND

IN THE MATTER Proposed Plan Change 9 to the
Operative Hamilton City District Plan

AND

IN THE MATTER Session on Hamilton City Council
Re-categorisation of Built Heritage
Items

STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF LAURA LIANE KELLAWAY

ON BEHALF OF WAIKATO HERITAGE GROUP # 427

DATED 22 03 2024

INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Laura Liane Kellaway. I hold a Bachelor of Architecture Degree and a Master of Architecture Degree from the University of Auckland. I am a member of ICOMOS New Zealand. I am a registered Architect and a Fellow of the New Zealand Institute of Architects. I have practised for over thirty years specialising in heritage with experience in the building, heritage consultancy and architecture. I am a Waikato based Historian.
2. I am acting on behalf of the Waikato Heritage Group. I have previously presented evidence to the hearing panel in Hearing Session 1 and 2 in 2023. I attended the Joint Witness Conference Built Heritage Expert Conferencing Session 2 held on 23 November 2023 as an expert, and I provided the WHG Categorisation report dated 1 March 2024. The Waikato Heritage Group submission number is # 427 and includes a further submission.
3. I carried out site visits to some of the proposed Hamilton City Council (HCC) Heritage Items from the public domain across 2022- 2024. I have also visited several of the places prior to 2023 in a both a personal and professional capacity.
4. I note my conflict in relation to a personal submission, and as a former member of the Waikato Heritage Group.

CODE OF CONDUCT

5. I am familiar with the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses (Environment Court Practice Note 2023) and although I note this is a Council hearing, and agree to comply with this code. The evidence presented in this report on the HCC Categorisation report is within my area of expertise, except where I state that I am relying on information provided by another party. I have not knowingly omitted facts or information that might alter or detract from opinions I express.

SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

6. The scope of this evidence is to respond to the HCC Categorisation report Appendices B and C as directed by Direction 21.
7. The purpose of this evidence is to set out the position of WHG on particular Built Heritage Items referred to in the HCC Categorisation report :
 - (i) Of the BH items no longer pursued by HCC, whether WHG continues to support its inclusion in Schedule 8A;
 - (ii) Of the BH items which HCC continues to pursue, whether WHG continues to oppose or support its inclusion in Schedule 8A

8. The scope includes the HCC Appendix C which are those items seen as 'medium'.
9. In forming a professional view on the above, I have drawn upon the original draft WSP assessments provided by HCC, documentation available in records that are easily accessible, and my own knowledge of the places and history of Hamilton.
10. As noted Waikato Heritage Group (WHG) have previously highlighted a range of discrepancies in the draft WSP assessments, and limitations as result of errors, issues with histories and lack of additional research. It would appear the draft assessments have not been updated since original notification in the interim time of Plan Change 9 and retain inherent errors.
11. I have assumed there have been no additional reports or updates to reports since this time as I have not found any reference to such in any hearing documentation, or evidence of a peer review.
12. It is noted that WHG submissions and further submissions WHG have previously made comment on specific proposed HCC items. This includes the proposed Ruakura Homestead H158 and Caretaker House ¹Memorial Park H244. Both items are commented on and supported by WHG in this report.

REPORT ON HCC CATEGORISATION SCHEDULES

13. As directed by the commissioners in Direction 21, I have addressed, with assistance from the WHG, the proposed HCC historic heritage items categorisation.
14. Following the submission of the re-categorisation reports, I have viewed the HCC Categorisation Memorandum of Counsel on behalf of Hamilton City Council in Response to Panel Direction #21 dated 1 March 2024. .
15. I have appended the HCC Appendix B "High" and Appendix C "Medium". Within the HCC Number column is the WHG position taken.
16. The HCC number column notates "SUPPORT" as in support of the proposed item, "OPPOSE" as likely to oppose. Where there is no comment provided WHG are neutral on the proposed item and I do not intend to provide further comment.
17. It is unclear who was the author of the HCC Memorandum Report categorisation lists, and the basis of the review.
18. HCC's Categorisation Report was based on the updated assessment methodology as set out in the interim guidance, but has not updated the underlying evidence that supports the HCC list. Mr Muldowney has noted that HCC do not intend to review the existing WSP drafts (Memorandum 1 March 2024) . In my view a review of the WSP reports would ensure more accurate and robust assessments. Some errors viewed are technical, such as no address or

1 Proposal has Parr House history.

incorrect suburb, but others have not included known designers, builders and dates of construction. This has implications for the significance of the built heritage item when assessing against the updated criteria.

19. Professionally, it is challenging to provide a firm position on all the items set out within the HCC categorisation report without updates and corrections to the baseline information.
20. To illustrate this I provide some examples. H147 the former Farmers Building has a known architect, Aubrey de Lisle. The issue by council of building permits to owner Lewis for the two buildings covered in H182, now Dora's café, place their construction as 1922 and 1923; Lewis was a prolific local builder. H221, the Gosling and Higgins Building, was also significantly the Frankton Town Board and Frankton Borough Chambers.
21. There are also inconsistencies in quantifying the value assessments. For example H205 Garden Place Sundial has three high and two moderate values yet has been re-categorised as 'medium'.
22. A number of assessments have included area histories which are outside the relevant area, such as the inclusion of the Jolly family's history as relevant to areas south of Rotorua, and of Captain East's history as relevant to Claudelands rather than Colonel Moule whose militia Crown Grant it was, not East's. H215 at 717 Grey Street places the building in Hamilton East when it is currently and historically part of Claudelands, therefore the given history does not take the Claudelands history into account. Such errors may render an assessment less credible.
23. Although the online planning maps have been updated there has been no review or alignment within the WSP reports to include information on existing HCC District Plan Special Character areas and proposed Historic Heritage Areas (HHAs) within the draft individual reports, which may affect heritage valuing. In my view some of this information was known at the time of reporting and should be included, and would support valuing.
24. As noted in my evidence of 1 March 2024 at the time of filing WHG Categorisation Report, I agree with Mr Muldowney that "a more thorough process will likely be needed for individual items that go forward under Outstanding and High proposals."
25. WHG has some additional information, however I consider that there is substantial work if asked to review each item as an overall process. Historical knowledge and some basic desktop research has been used when examining both Appendix B and C, but it is beyond the capacity of WHG to address this in full. It is anticipated this will be completed by HCC prior to individual hearings.

CONCLUSION

26. The summary result of the review of the HCC Categorisation schedules is that:
- a. 2 of the proposed items within HCC Appendix B (Outstanding and High) are supported with additional information, and
 - b. 23 are opposed in HCC Schedule C (medium) because the ranking is in my view too low and in some cases information may not been sufficiently researched to address heritage valuing.
27. In my view it would be prudent for HCC to check and update individual assessments prior to individual hearings to reduce errors and improve historic information that may impact summary heritage values.
28. WHG has indicated that they would appreciate a further discussion with HCC to further resolve some of the proposed built heritage items.

Dated this day of 21 March 2024.



Laura Liane Kellaway

Appendix 1 – HCC Schedule B and C with WHG notes

APPENDIX B - Built Heritage items HCC will pursue

Address	Schedule 8A ID#	With WHG comment	Recategorisation
Former National Insurance Company Building, 137 Alexandra Street, Hamilton Central	H148		High – Plan Ranking B
18 Anglesea Street, Central City	H149		High – Plan Ranking B
Central Police Station, 12 Anzac Parade, Hamilton Central	H153		High – Plan Ranking B
3 Balloch Street, Fairfield	H154		High – Plan Ranking B
Former United Evangelical Church, 2 Bettina Road, Fairfield	H157		High – Plan Ranking B
Ruakura Homestead and Agricultural Research Station, 10 Bisley Road	H158	SUPPORT	Outstanding – Plan Ranking A
10 Boundary Road, Claudelands	H167		High – Plan Ranking B
65 Braid Road, St Andrews	H168		High – Plan Ranking B
St Joseph's Church and Spire, 86-88 Clarkin Road, Fairfield	H173		High – Plan Ranking B
Fairfield Primary School, 260 Clarkin Road, Fairfield	H174		High – Plan Ranking B
83 Cook Street, Hamilton East	H185		High – Plan Ranking B
Nawton Hall, 4 Crawford Street, Avalon	H186		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Ammunitions Store, 60 Dey Street, Hamilton East	H188		High – Plan Ranking B
74 East Street, Enderley	H190		High – Plan Ranking B
106 Forest Lake Road, Forest Lake	H197		High – Plan Ranking B
3 Frances Street, Hamilton East	H199		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Guardian Royal Exchange Building, 14 Garden Place, Hamilton Central	H206		High – Plan Ranking B
Former MLC Building, 20 Garden Place, Hamilton Central	H207		High – Plan Ranking B
14 George Street, Claudelands	H208		High – Plan Ranking B
'Cluny', 103 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H210		High – Plan Ranking B
Egan's Chambers, 379 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H212		High – Plan Ranking B
707-711 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H214		High – Plan Ranking B
A. Ebbett's Residence, 13 Hammond Street, Hamilton Central	H217		High – Plan Ranking B
Hamilton West School Main Classroom Building, 36 Hammond Street, Hamilton Central	H218		High – Plan Ranking B
Fairfield Buildings, 1004 Heaphy Terrace, Fairfield	H220		High – Plan Ranking B
Gosling & Higgins Building, 62 High Street, Frankton	H221	SUPPORT	High – Plan Ranking B
Richmond House, 29 Horne Street, Hamilton Central	H222		High – Plan Ranking B
Frankton Junction Presbyterian Church, 11 King Street, Frankton	H226		High – Plan Ranking B
8 Kotahi Avenue, Beerescourt	H228		High – Plan Ranking B
Harris House, 58A Lake Crescent, Hamilton Lake	H230		High – Plan Ranking B
74 Lake Crescent, Hamilton Lake	H231		High – Plan Ranking B
4/13 Manning Street, Hamilton Central	H236		High – Plan Ranking B
57 Memorial Drive, Claudelands	H244		High – Plan Ranking B

Address	Schedule 8A ID#	With WHG comment	Recategorisation
50 Nixon Street, Hamilton East	H249		High – Plan Ranking B
179 Nixon Street, Hamilton East	H250		High – Plan Ranking B
287 Peachgrove Road, Fairfield	H260		High – Plan Ranking B
Swarbrick Memorial Arch, Hamilton Lake Domain	H261		High – Plan Ranking B
12 Piako Road, Claudelands	H266		High – Plan Ranking B
11-13, 15-17, and 19-21 Pinfold Avenue, Hamilton East	H268, H269, H270, H271, H272 and H273		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Black House, 7 Queens Avenue, Frankton	H274		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Masonic Hall, 166 River Road, Hamilton East	H279		High – Plan Ranking B
414 River Road, Fairfield	H282		High – Plan Ranking B
534 River Road, Fairfield	H283		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Rototuna Church, 144 Rototuna Road, Rototuna	H285		High – Plan Ranking B
120 Sandwich Road, Saint Andrews	H286		High – Plan Ranking B
61 Silverdale Road, Silverdale	H288		High – Plan Ranking B
Sikh Temple, 1418-1426 Te Rapa Road, Horotiu	H290		Outstanding – Plan Ranking A
24 Thames Street, Claudelands	H292		High – Plan Ranking B
Hamilton Court, 89 Tristram Street, Hamilton Central	H293		High – Plan Ranking B
Former President's House, 504 Tuhikaramea Road, Temple View	H294		High – Plan Ranking B
Former C. L. Innes & Co Building, Meteor Theatre, 1 Victoria Street, Hamilton Central	H302		High – Plan Ranking B
Innes Memorial Arch, Ferrybank Park, Corner of Victoria Street and Anzac Parade	H303		High – Plan Ranking B
Former Shattocks Butchery, 137 Ward Street, Hamilton Central	H309		High – Plan Ranking B
Hamilton West Cemetery, 59 Willoughby Street, Whitiara	H311		Outstanding – Plan Ranking A
B Block, Waikato University, University of Waikato Campus, Hillcrest	H314		High – Plan Ranking B
72 Wellington Street, Hamilton East	Hxxx		High – Plan Ranking B
21 Stanley Street, Claudelands	Hxxx		High – Plan Ranking B

APPENDIX C

APPENDIX C - Built Heritage items HCC no longer pursues

Address	Schedule 8A ID#	With WHG comment	Recategorisation
39 Abbotsford Street, Whitiara	H138		Medium
18A Albert Street, Hamilton East	H139	OPPOSE	Medium
80 Albert Street, Hamilton East	H140		Medium
84 Albert Street, Hamilton East	H141		Medium
110 Albert Street, Hamilton East	H144		Medium
Former Farmers Building, 62 Alexandra Street, Hamilton Central	H147	OPPOSE	Medium
Hamilton Municipal Offices, 260 Anglesea Street, Hamilton Central	H151		Medium
Anglesea Street Retaining Wall, Anglesea Street	H152	OPPOSE	Medium
15 Bell Street, Hamilton East	H156		Medium
1 & 3 Bledisloe Terrace, Hamilton East	H159 and H160	OPPOSE	Medium
12 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H161	OPPOSE	Medium
14 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H162	OPPOSE	Medium
18 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H163	OPPOSE	Medium
26 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H164	OPPOSE	Medium
30 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H165		Medium
32 Bond Street, Hamilton East	H166	OPPOSE	Medium
38 Brookfield Street, Hamilton East	H169	OPPOSE	Medium
88 Brookfield Street, Hamilton East	H170		Medium
10 Claude Street, Fairfield	H175		Medium
28 Claudelands Road, Hamilton East	H178		Medium
110 Clyde Street, Hamilton East	H180		Medium
134 Clyde Street, Hamilton East	H181		Medium
101-105 Collingwood Street, Hamilton Central	H182		Medium
60 Cook Street, Hamilton East	H183		Medium
78 Cook Street, Hamilton East	H184		Medium
4 Daisy Street, Claudelands	H187		Medium
4 East Street, Five Cross Roads	H189		Medium
23 Enderley Avenue, Five Cross Roads	H191		Medium
45 Firth Street, Hamilton East	H192		Medium
49 Firth Street, Hamilton East	H193		Medium
53 Firth Street, Hamilton East	H194		Medium
54A Firth Street, Hamilton East	H195		Medium
69 Forest Lake Road, Forest Lake	H196		Medium
116 Galloway Street, Hamilton East	H201		Medium

Address	Schedule 8A ID#	With WHG comment	Recategorisation
150 Galloway Street, Hamilton East	H202		Medium
195 Galloway Street, Hamilton East	H203		Medium
203 Galloway Street, Hamilton East	H204		Medium
Garden Place Sundial, Garden Place, Hamilton Central	H205	OPPOSE	Medium
17 George Street, Claudelands	H209		Medium
259 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H211		Medium
644 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H213	OPPOSE	Medium
717 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H215	OPPOSE	Low
Rotary Centennial Clock, 314 Grey Street, Hamilton East	H216	OPPOSE	Medium
43 Horne Street, Hamilton Central	H223		Medium
27 Ingleton Terrace, Fairfield	H224		Medium
2 Kitchener Street, Claudelands	H227		Medium
10 Kotahi Avenue, Beerescourt	H229		Medium
95 Lake Road, Frankton	H233		Medium
9 Manning Street, Hamilton Central	H235		Medium
24 Manning Street, Hamilton Central	H237		Medium
26 Manning Street, Hamilton Central	H238		Medium
6 Marama Street, Frankton	H239		None (Demolished)
12 Marama Street, Frankton	H241	OPPOSE	Medium
39 Marama Street, Frankton	H243	OPPOSE	Medium
28 Naylor Street, Hamilton East	H245		Medium
35 Naylor Street, Hamilton East	H246		Medium
60 Naylor Street, Hamilton East	H247		Medium
43A Nixon Street, Hamilton East	H248		Medium
9 Oakley Avenue, Claudelands	H252		Medium
9 Oxford Street, Five Cross Roads	H254		Medium
17 Oxford Street, Five Cross Roads	H255		Medium
25 Palmerston Street, Hamilton Central	H256		Medium
27 Palmerston Street, Hamilton Central	H257		Medium
31 Palmerston Street, Hamilton Central	H259		Medium
Nolan House, 103 Pembroke Street, Hamilton Lake	H262		Medium
Former Courthouse, 136 Pembroke Street, Hamilton Lake	H263	OPPOSE	Medium
9 Piako Road, Claudelands	H265		Medium
38 Piako Road, Claudelands	H267		Medium
9 Queens Avenue, Frankton	H275	OPPOSE	Medium
80 Rimu Street, Maeroa	H277		Medium
129 Rimu Road, Maeroa	H278	OPPOSE	Medium

Address	Schedule 8A ID#	With WHG comment	Recategorisation
7 Seddon Road, Frankton	H287		Medium
Former St George's Church, 32A Somerset Street, Frankton	H289		Medium
243 Ulster Street, Whitiora	H297		Medium
409 Ulster Street, Beerescourt	H298		Medium
18 Union Street, Claudelands	H299		Low
18A Union Street, Claudelands	H300		Medium
9 Upper Kent Street, Frankton	H301		Medium
Former Imperial Chambers Building, 231 Victoria Street, Hamilton Central	H304	OPPOSE	Low
Former Norwich Union Insurance Building, 341 Victoria Street, Hamilton Central	H305	OPPOSE	Medium
1212 Victoria Street, Whitiora	H307		Medium
80 Wellington Street, Hamilton East	H310		Medium
2 Woodstock Road, Fairfield	H312		None (Demolished)
Remains of 1879 Union Bridge Foundations, Waikato River	H315		N/A
Remains of Hamilton Punt Jetty Piles, Waikato River	H316		N/A
Former Roose Shipping Co. Ltd Wharf, Waikato River, Grantham Street	H317	OPPOSE	Medium
Russian Bell Tower, Hamilton Gardens	H318		Medium
Te Rapa Pā Memorial Plaque, Park Terrace, Hamilton Central	H319		Low