

BEFORE THE HEARING PANEL

IN THE MATTER of the Resource Management Act
1991

AND

IN THE MATTER Proposed Plan Change 9 to the
Operative Hamilton City District Plan

AND

IN THE MATTER Session on Classification of
Built Heritage Items

STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF LAURA LIANE KELLAWAY

ON BEHALF OF WAIKATO HERITAGE GROUP # 427

DATED 01 03 2024

INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Laura Liane Kellaway. I hold a Bachelor of Architecture Degree and a Master of Architecture Degree from the University of Auckland. I am a member of ICOMOS New Zealand. I am a registered Architect and a Fellow of the New Zealand Institute of Architects. I have practised for over thirty years specialising in heritage with experience in the building, heritage consultancy and architecture. I am a Waikato based Historian.
2. I am acting on behalf of the Waikato Heritage Group. I have previously presented evidence to the hearing panel in Hearing Session 1 and 2 in 2023. I also attended the Joint Witness Conference Built Heritage Expert Conferencing Session 2 held on 23 November 2023 as an expert.
3. The Waikato Heritage Group submission number is # 427 and includes a further submission.
4. I note my conflict in relation to a personal submission, and as a former member of the Waikato Heritage Group.

CODE OF CONDUCT

5. I am familiar with the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses (Environment Court Practice Note 2023) and although I note this is a Council hearing, and agree to comply with this code. The evidence presented in this categorisation report is within my area of expertise, except where I state that I am relying on information provided by another party. I have not knowingly omitted facts or information that might alter or detract from opinions I express.

SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

6. As noted Waikato Heritage Group has a preliminary schedule of proposed items of 194, of which 39 have previous underlying assessments, which will need to be updated at a later stage, along with the remaining items which have preliminary evidence only.
7. The purpose of this evidence is to provide a categorisation report against the updated assessment methodology as set out in the interim guidance.¹
8. The purpose of the report is to use the new proposed levels of significance against the proposed WHG list and associated assessments, based on newly-proposed six levels, and provide the commissioners with the tabulated results under each category. It is an initial step to assist in further discussion on the Built Heritage items, and to align levels with the revised categories for proposed HHAs.
9. The re-assessment, using the updated assessment methodology as set out in the interim guidance, has not fully re-examined the underlying evidence that supports the WHS preliminary list and associated assessments provided. It does not include revised assessments, which may be needed later for individual items.

1 This first step will not involve any critical revision of the WHG Preliminary List or the assessments under the Operative District Plan. It will simply take that existing work and apply it to the new significance scale. Further critical revision may be required as each individual Built Item progresses further.

CATEGORISATION REPORT

10. As directed by the commissioners in Direction 21, I have addressed the proposed historic heritage items provided by Waikato Heritage Group (WHG) with the Waikato Historical Society as a Draft Preliminary Schedule for the Hamilton City Council District Plan Change 9 (PC 9) as notified on 22 July 2022. This includes the assessments available under the Operative District Plan criteria.
11. Interim guidance [dated 27 November 2023] from the Hearing Panel (Panel) on the assessment methodology to be applied to Built Heritage items states –

“...at this juncture we find it unlikely that BH items of medium significance will be included in Schedule 8A”.
12. I note that with reservation, as per my previous statements, that the potential imposition of the proposed new “medium” significance threshold, may mean some items of historic heritage may be excluded.
13. As directed in order to advance the analysis of the WHG submission, similar to proposed by HCC, I have completed the exercise and tabulated the outcome in the appended Tables 1 to 6. The agreed significance descriptors have been used:
 - i. Outstanding significance
 - ii. High significance.
 - iii. Medium significance.
 - iv. Low significance.
 - v. None/No significance.
 - vi. Unassessed significance
14. I have included the full list but identified those items where an earlier assessment was provided.
15. I agree with Mr Muldowney that “a more thorough process will likely be needed for individual items that go forward under Outstanding and High proposals.”
16. I agree with Mr Muldowney (para 11) that “while there are strong similarities with the Outstanding and High categories under both approaches, there may be some BH items that do not retain that rating.” I have therefore within each table identified the original WHG preliminary ranking based on the HCC ODP “A and B” ranking, for reference.
17. Table 6 has items either have not been assessed or an error was made in the original submission. These proposed items will not be pursued.

Modification from Moderate to Medium

18. The guidance from the Panel, even if significance at this level was proven, is that “Medium” items are unlikely to be included in the Panel’s final version of Schedule 8A. Until the categorisation reports are available and some comparison made, I note that the impact of the

proposed threshold of exclusion of 'medium' at this early stage may put some identified historic heritage items at risk.

CONCLUSION

19. The tables provide the information as requested in the interim guidance in regards the WHG list.
20. The re-categorisation has affected the overall WHG list. In my view further assessment against the interim guidance criteria will need to be considered in the next stages.

Dated this day of 1 March 2024.


Laura Liane Kellaway

Appendix 1 – Categorisation Report Tables 1 to 6

TABLE 1 OUTSTANDING SIGNIFICANCE

* ASSESSMENT REPORT SUBMITTED

Italics indicates change from original submission

WHG No. original	Historic Heritage Item	Address	Legal Description	HCC OP Criteria	WHG Proposed Ranking
1*	NZCDC Te Rapa (former) main buildings	1344-1380 Te Rapa Road	Lot 1 DPS29922, Lot 1 DPS 10458, Pt Lot 3 DPS 5134	a b c d e	A
12*	Deanwell School	43, 49 Deanwell Avenue	Pt Lot 3 DPS 7385 (SO 44867)	a b c d f	A
28*	CAC Ammunition Workers' Flats (former) (8 surviving blocks)	84-86, 92-118 Peachgrove Rd		a b c f	A

TABLE 2 HIGH SIGNIFICANCE

WHG No. original	Historic Heritage Item	Address	Legal Description	HCC OP Criteria	WHG Proposed Ranking
2*	Frankton Saleyards	165 Norton Road	Pt Allotment 8 Te Rapa Parish	a b c f	A
3*	GE Clark & Sons building	25 Ward St		a b c	A
4*	Ambury & English dairy factory and powerhouse (later Frankton NZCDC)	Norton Road		a b c d	A <i>Refer Existing HCC Scheduling</i>
5*	NZCDC Frankton Box factory (former)	Norton Road			A
6*	NZCDC Frankton kiln (former)	Norton Road			A
7*	NZCDC Tin Factory	Norton Road			A
8*	NZCDC small office building	Norton Road			A
9	St Andrew's Intermediate School complex [1977 buildings and landscape] – now Hamilton North Primary School	90 Heath Street/Warwick Avenue			A
10	St Andrew's Intermediate School gym – now Hamilton North Primary School	90 Heath St/ Warwick Avenue			A
11	Founders Memorial Theatre	229 Tristram Street	Sec.2 and 3 SO 57554	a b f	A UNDER DEMOLITION
13	Department of Electricity Buildings Central Waikato Electric Power Board buildings [4] and 2 houses	146,144 Peachgrove Rd/9, 15 Ruakura Rd	Section 2 SO 468541, Lots 1 and 2 DPS 72197	a c d g	A
14	Hamilton Teachers College (1960)	[211] Hillcrest Road	Pt DP 3544	a b c f	A

15	Ruakura Agricultural Research Centre main bldg (Tower Block) and library			a b c d f g	A
16	Ruakura Farmers' Hall			a b c f	B
19	Oranga building, University of Waikato	Knighton Road	Pt Allotment 414 Kirikiriroa Parish	a b c f	B
21*	Former Ruakura staff houses – four houses	178 Ruakura Rd (University of Waikato Gate 3)	Allotment 413 Kirikiriroa Parish	a b c	B
23*	Hui Te Rangiora Marae	89 Clarence St			A+ Cultural
24*	Te Puna-o-te-Ora hostel original building	26 Colombo St			A+ Cultural
26	Gateway of Bishops court	294 River Road			A
27	Te Manaakitanga, Melville High School	6 Collins Rd, Deanwell			A
29*	CAC Ammunition Factory US Army building (former)	corner Dey St and Cambridge Rd	Pt Section 38 Hamilton East Town Belt	a b c	A
30*	Interior of surviving courtroom in 1931 courthouse (#H7 exterior)	116 Anglesea Street	Pt Allotment 407 Town of Hamilton West & Pt Allotment 407B Town of Hamilton West	a b c	A
31*	Frankton Police station [former] (<i>one of pair</i>)	110 Kent St	Lot 1 DPS 59017	a b c	B
32*	Frankton Police House [former] (<i>one of pair</i>)	108 Kent Street	Lot 1 DPS 59017	a b c	B
33	Former Public Works office fence and wall remnant	9- 13 Knox St	Lot 1 DPS 53857	a b	B
34*	Tidd Homestead [former]	1 A,B,C Marama Street		a b c e	B
35	Armstrong house	77 Lake Domain Drive (cnr Killarney Rd)		a b	B

36*	House (<i>1 of pair</i>)	24 Marama St	Pt Lot 23 DP 5042	a b c	B
37*	House (<i>1 of pair</i>)	26 Marama St	Lot 20 DP 5042	a b c	B
38	Te Awa Flats	Little London Lane		a b	B
39*	House	1 Rostrevor Street		a b c	B
40*	Offices	21 Rostrevor Street		b	B
41	<i>Jack</i> House	25 Hillsborough Terrace		a b	B
43	Villa (<i>1 of group of 3</i>)	90 Rifle Range Road	Lot 17 DPS 6288	a b c	B
44	Villa (<i>1 of group of 3</i>)	92 Rifle Range Road	Lot 14 DPS 6288	a b c	B
45	Villa (<i>1 of group of 3</i>)	94 Rifle Range Road	Lot 12 DPS 6288	a b c	B
47*	House (Barton House)	87 Tristram St	Lot 1 DPS 75754	a b	B
49	Villa	30 Albert St	Pt Allotment 305 Town of Hamilton East	a b c	B
50	Villa	32 Albert St	Pt Allotment 305 Town of Hamilton East	a b c	B
51	Villa (<i>Formerly T Maunder/W Gallagher</i>)	85 Seddon Rd	Lot 9 DP 24191	a b c	B
53	A Maunder house and garage	4 Tainui St	Lot 3 DP 31009	a b c	B
54	<i>Former De Lisle</i> residence	6 Woodstock Rd	Lot 24 DP 27284	a b d	A
56	Rev. Blamire's house	9 Marama St	Lot 2 DP 367942	a b	B
57	Hayes Paddock shop and flats	corner Plunket St & Jellicoe Drive	Lot 129 DPS 930	a b c	B
61	Laurenson Settlement House (11 in set)	78 Forest Lake Road		a b c	A
63	Laurenson Settlement House (11 in set)	140 Forest Lake Road		a b c	A

65	State House (duplex)	91-93 Forest Lake Road		a b c	B
66	State House	95 Forest Lake Road		a b c	B
67	State House	101A Forest Lake Road		a b c	B
68	State House	53 Carey Street		a b c	B
70	State House	57 Carey Street		a b c	B
72	State House	96 Forest Lake Road		a b c	B
73	Frankton Post Office [former] 1910	188 Commerce Street	Lot 1 DPS 54354	a b c	B
75*	Horse Hitching post	Corner Grey & Clyde Streets		a b	A
76*	Horse Hitching post	Corner of Grey and Te Aroha Streets		a b	A
77	Former NZR offices	High Street	Pt Allotment 7 Te Rapa Parish	a b c	B
78	Former NZR offices	Empire St	Pt Allotment 7 Te Rapa Parish	a b c	B
79	Former NZR goods shed	Empire/High St	Pt Allotment 7 Te Rapa Parish	a b c d	B
80*	NZR Underground platform, railway	Bryce/Ward/Anglesea Sts		a b d	A
81*	Hamilton Railway Station (1974)			a b c	A
82	HBC septic tank	Memorial Park/Parana Park		a	B
84	HBC septic tank	Edgecumbe Park		a	B
85	<i>Hamilton Borough</i> Reservoir 1921 (north of reservoir H27)	Ruakiwi Rd		a	B
87	No.1 Substation Heaphy Tce; Claudelands Substation; Central Waikato Electric Power Board	732 Grey St	Lot 2 DP 15048	a b c d	B

89	Frankton Rest Rooms, 1945	Kent St		a b c	B
90	HBC Pumping Station <i>and Waterworks Building</i>	Cobham Drive, by river SO 19338, SO 35542		a c	B
91	Frankton drain from Rotoroa to Hutton's bacon factory	Extends from Killarney Road railway crossing [southern side] to Hamilton Railway Station [west side]		a c	B
93	<i>Waikato Hospital Board</i> offices [former] 1937	6 Sapper Moore-Jones Place		a b c	B
94	Te Awhina Private Hospital (former) 1917	2 Bryce Street (on street)	Lot 1 DPS 27882	a b c	B
95	Private hospital /Te Rahui Wahine, Maori Girls' Hostel 1919	4 Bryce St (rear)	Pt Lot 11- 12 DP 11019	a b c	B
96	Entrance steps to former Cornfoot homestead	107 Lake Road, corner of Tainui Street		a b	B
97	<i>Former J Gordon Smith House</i>	218 Pembroke St		a b c	B
98	Smith Laboratory	Waikato Hospital campus		a b c	B
100	<i>Former Duncan/Smith homestead</i>	18 Goodall St	Lot 1 DPS47472	a b c	B
101	<i>Former Thomson house</i>	60 Dinsdale Rd	Lot 7 DPS 10308	a b c	B
103	<i>Former Elliott Homestead</i>	155 Grandview Road		a b c	B
104	House Ellicott Road (1 of set of 5)	10 Ellicott Road		a b c	B
105	House Ellicott Road (1 of set of 5)	12 Ellicott Road		a b c	B
106	House Ellicott Road (1 of set of 5)	14A Ellicott Road		a b c	B

107	House Ellicott Road (1 of set of 5)	16 Ellicott Road		a b c	B
108	House Ellicott Road (1 of set of 5)	20 Ellicott Road		a b c	B
109*	<i>Former Chocqueel</i> Bungalow	8 Rifle Range Road		a b c	B
110	<i>Former</i> NZR Railway House AB209 [former]	9 Weka Street		a b c d g	B
111	<i>Former</i> Jackson Farmhouse	5 Elizabeth Street		a b	B
112	<i>Former Bregmen</i> Farmhouse	257 Cambridge Road (corner Morrinsville Road)		a b c	B
116	<i>Former</i> Gurnell Homestead	430 Ulster St		a b	B
117	<i>Pratt</i> Transitional villa and workshop	27 Rimu St	Lot 12 DP 7223	a b c	B
120	Farmhouse (former <i>Fairholm Hospital &</i> <i>St Joan's Hospital</i>)	371 Peachgrove Rd		a b c	B
121	<i>Former</i> Thomas Farmhouse	219 Gordonton Rd ,Horsham Downs		a b	B
122*	"Flaxdale" – former Barugh farmhouse	135 Horsham Downs Rd		a b c	A
123	Farmhouse – former Clement farmhouse	114 Horsham Downs Rd		a b c	B
125	<i>Former</i> <i>Steele/Coates/Casey/</i> <i>Lichfield</i> Farmhouse	136 Hillcrest Road		a b	A
126	<i>Knighton Estate</i> Farmhouse	154 Old Farm Road	Lot 8 DPS 10165	a b	B
128*	<i>Former</i> James <i>Primrose</i> Farmhouse – James Primrose	326 Peachgrove Rd		a b c	B
130	<i>Former</i> Butler Farmhouse	161 Tramway Rd		a b c	B
132	Farmhouse – Gillett (1879)	Southwell School, Peachgrove Rd		a b	B
133*	<i>Former</i> Farmhouse – Williamson (1884)	44 East St		a b	A/B

134	Frankton saleyards office building	Kent St (north end)- Angus Flood & Griffiths		a b c	B
136*	FAC building (former, now Forlong's)	cnr Kent and Empire St	Allotment 441 Te Rapa Parish	a b c	B
142	Newton King Building [former]	634 Victoria Street		a b c	B
146	Brick wall below St Peter's, built by Silvester Davis	51 Victoria St		a b	B
147	Angus Flood Griffiths office and interior and mural	1088 Victoria St		a b c d	B
149*	Vacuum Oil Co. (Caltex) building	Waterloo Cres		a b	A
150	Lala Building	206-210 Commerce St		a b c f	B
151	Former Belgraves Drapery and Clothing (1958)	189-199 Commerce St (corner of Kent St)		a b c	B
152	Coronation Building [1937]	175 Commerce St (corner of Kent St)		a b c	B
156	Marriotts Grocery (former)	92 Rimu Street		a b c	B
157	Muir Shop/Carlton Takeaways	82 -84 High Street, Frankton		a b c	B
159	<i>Former Annie McPherson</i> House	705A Grey Street (21 Te Aroha St)		a b c	B
160	Deco shop & shed with chimney	699 Grey Street		a b c	B
161	<i>Former Geo Boyes Office Shops</i>	6 Alma St		a b c	B
162	<i>Formerly Hamilton Auto Supplies</i> Shop	8 Alma St		a b c	B
163	Government Life Building	42-48 Ward Street		a b c	B
164	Gailers Cake Kitchen	799 Victoria Street Hamilton North		a b c	B

166	Shop (Giddings Buildings?)/Scout Shop	651 Victoria Street		a b c	B
167*	Shop /Maunder Building	226-228 Victoria St	Pt Allotment 115, Town of Hamilton West	a b c	A
168	Shop /W H McKenzie Building/ former Waterbed World	232 Victoria St		a b c	B
169	Miropiko Kindergarten	River Rd		a b c d	B
170*	Jamieson Kindergarten	Storey Ave		a b c	B
172	Forest Lake School dental clinic	Forest Lake School, Storey Avenue		a b c	B
176	Dame Hilda Ross Fountain (Founders Memorial Theatre)	229 Tristram Street	SO 41930	a b c f	B
177	Te Rahui Hostel (former Bishopscourt house, former Jesmond Dene)	294 River Rd		a b c f	A
178	Te Rahui Hostel (complex)	294 River Rd		a b c f	A
181	Hamilton Cenotaph and Memorial Wall	Memorial Park, Memorial Drive		a b c f	B
183*	Hamilton West Cemetery	59 Willoughby St		a b c f	A
184	Frankton NZR Settlement memorial trees	Rifle Range Road, edge of Swarbrick Park		a c f	B
185	St Stephen's Presbyterian Church Melville (1926)	Corner Mahoe Street and Ohaupo Road		a b f	B
187	Former George Parr House	103 Memorial Drive, Parana Park	Pt Allotment 219	a b c	B
188	Parana Park Memorial Bridge	Parana Park	Pt Allotment 219	a b c f	B
190	HCC Changing rooms and toilets	Lake Domain		a b c f	B
191*	Little Bull	Hamilton Gardens		a b c f	A

192	Changing rooms and toilets (former Canoe Club room)	Wellington Street		a b c f	B
193	Waipahihi FE Smith House Interior	129 Cambridge Road			B
194	Frankton Railway Institute Interior	Pukeko Street			B (HNZ) (HCC ODP)
Refer 30	Hamilton Court- court room Interior	Anglesea Street			A
Refer 174	Angus Flood Griffiths office [former] Interior	Victoria Street			B

TABLE 3 MEDIUM SIGNIFICANCE

WHG No. original	Historic Heritage Item	Address	Legal Description	HCC ODP Criteria	WHG Proposed Ranking
17*	Campbell Building, Ruakura			a b c	B
18	Ruakura Superintendent's house			a b c f	B
20	Gallagher workshop and showrooms	18 and 20 Norton Rd	Lot 1 DPS 80574; Lot 15 Deeds Plan 144	a c	B
42	Villa	123 Massey St		a b c	B
46	Villa	137 Massey Street		a b c	B
48	House (Galloway)	11 Hobson Street	Lot 26 DP12543	a b c	B
52*	Former Lambeth house	3 Seddon Rd	Lot 1 DP 31009	a b	B
55	Villa	243 Ulster St	Pt Allotment 176 Town of Hamilton West	a b c	B
58	House (<i>last of Seven Sisters, Jack</i>)	56 Wellington St	Pt Allotment 130, Town of Hamilton East	a b e	B
59	Bungalow (E & B)	9 Alfred St	Lot 1 DPS 92246	a b	B
60	Roach family houses	7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17 Galloway St		a b c	B
62	Laurenson Settlement House	134 Forest Lake Road		a b c	A
64	Laurenson Settlement House	148B Forest Lake Road		a b c	A
69	State House	55A Carey Street		a b c	B
74	Post and Telegraph building (Former)	63 King Street		a b	B
88	Hamilton East Plunket Rooms and toilets	Steele Park, Grey St DEMOLISHED 2023		a b c	B
102	Hamilton Borough Council nursery (1917)	Cobham Drive		a g	B

114	Farmhouse	50 Forest Lake Rd		a b c	B
115	Farmhouse	46 Forest Lake Rd		a b c	B
118	Farmhouse	78 Maeroa Rd		a b c	B
119	<i>Former Thomas Church</i> Farmhouse	73 Church Rd		a b c	B
129	Farmhouse	11 Powells Rd	Allotment 449 Kirikiriroa Parish	b	B
131	Farmhouse (former) (later Southwell School) (WHG withdrew)	90 Alfred St		a b	B
135	GE Clark granary	Ward St Lane		a b c	B
138	Waikato Federated Farmers building	169 London St		a b	B
139	Rothwell's butchery (former)	corner of Whatawhata Rd and Dinsdale Rd		a b c	B
140	Maeroa butchery [former]	146-150 Maeroa Rd (Sugar Bowl café)	Lot 29 Deed 305	a b c	B
141	Burgess, Fraser and Co. Ltd [former] office building	301 Barton St (south side next to Casabella Lane)		a b c	B
144	Pre-NZCDC dairy factory worker's house (former)	4A Tahi St		a b c	A
145	Dr Pollard house	[1] Whatawhata Rd DEMOLISHED 2023		a b	B
148	Tui Dairy (confectioner's shop)	999 Heaphy Terrace (corner of Heaphy Terrace and Howden Road)		a c	B
153	Proudlock's Cycle shop	135 and 137 Commerce [corner of Keddell St]		a b c	B
154	Frankton Gospel Hall (Former)	1 Keddell St		a b c	B
158	Shop	701 Grey Street		a c	B
165	Kendall's Ltd (Former)	15 Haig St/17 Empire St		a b c	B
171	Forest Lake School	Forest Lake School, Storey Avenue		a c	B
173	Melville Primary School 1924 building	Ohaupo Rd		a b c	B

174	Kimihia School bldg (former) Melville Primary School former	Ohaupo Rd		a b c	B
175	Frankton School 1924 building	Massey St		a b c	B
179	Boyes Park Fountains	Boyes Park, Norton Rd South	Section 1 SO 57554	a b c	B
182	WWII Memorial Gates	Anzac Parade		a b c f	B
186	South Auckland Education Board office [former]	Tristram St cnr London St		a b	B

TABLE 4 LOW SIGNIFICANCE

No items

TABLE 5 NO SIGNIFICANCE

No items

TABLE 6 NOT ASSESSED /NOT PURSUED

WHG No. original	Historic Heritage Item	Address	Legal Description	HCC ODP Criteria	WHG Proposed Ranking
22	Winstone's Ltd Offices (Former)	745 Te Rapa Rd	Lot 1 DPS 63468	a b	B
25	Hemi Tapu Marae	161 Massey St			A - (NO LONGER PURSUED AS PART OF EXISTING SCHEDULED ITEM #H84)
71	State House	92 Forest Lake Road		a b c	B
83	HBC septic tank	St Andrew's Golf Course		a	B
86	<i>Hamilton Borough</i> Concrete base of first water reservoir (1902)	Ruakiwi Rd		a	B
92	HBC Pumping Shed	North end Rotoroa Lake Domain		a c	B
99	Dinsdale -homestead	85 Dinsdale Rd	Lot 2 DPS 18732	a b c	B
113	"St Hilda" house (Duck farmhouse)	485 Rotokauri Rd, <i>Rotokauri</i>		a b	B
124	Farmhouse	50 Saxby Rd		a b	B
127	Farmhouse (old Farm Road)	120 Old Farm Rd	Lot 1 DPS 9007	a b (rarity)	B
137	The Cowshed. Ruakura No.5 dairy (former)	University of Waikato		a c f	B
143	Waikato Wool & Skin Co. Ltd factory building (former)	13 Waterloo Street - INCORRECT ADDRESS		a b c	B
155	Hughes & Jenkins drapery shop (former)	112 Commerce St (corner of Lake Road)- INCORRECT ADDRESS		a b c	B
180	Manse for First Church	9 King St		a b c	B
189	Skating rink	Lake Domain		a b c f	B