

## Amy Yasutake-Watson

### Slide 1:

Our house, 23 Oxford Street lies within the Oxford Street (East) and Marshall Street HHA. And that is the HHA I will be focussing on during this presentation. Mr Miller stated in his report that our HHA had a representative set of 1920s dwellings, with a central front door, symmetrical windows, and held strong similarities with the prefabricated Ellis & Burnand, and Railway cottages (Origin Consultants Ltd, 2023). But as you can see we do not have a central front door.

### Slide two:

The only street-visible properties that have a central front door and symmetrical windows are 25 and 33 Oxford Street. It leads me to question what houses Mr Miller and Knott were viewing during their site visits.

### Slide 3: SA352/126 24 May 1922: Title for Oxford Street

Mr Miller refers to this land title in his report and stated that these lots were sold to private owners in the 1920s, presumably to prove this is when the houses were built. But only three properties, 29, 33, and 23 were sold in the 1920s. So his statement was incorrect.

He indicated that Oxford properties showed strong similarities to prefab Ellis and Burnand and railway cottages, and local builders who had copies of railway and state housing plans often built similar looking private homes. Insinuating that this is what had occurred here. We were also classified as a railway workers' suburb in Mr Knotts's June 2022 report, with no check of land titles (Richard Knott Limited, 2022).

### Slide 4:

However, first mention of prefabricated Ellis and Burnand Ltd housing was in 1926 ("Ellis and Burnand, Ltd.," 1926), and based on the title, three houses (including mine) were built before or in 1925 when the title changed hands. So how could the houses be Ellis and Burnand or be copies of them?

### Slide 5:

Furthermore, the 1933 Ellis and Burnand catalogue ("Artistic Booklet.," 1928) showed their prefabricated houses had three distinct features including (Ellis & Burnand Ltd, 1933);

### Slide 6:

Highly visible vertical battens where the prefabricated panels joined,

### Slide 7:

A flat weather board profile (seen here). And a very small area with their largest building measuring less than 58m<sup>2</sup>. None of the houses in our HHA have these features. Miller added in a footnote that no confirmed connection was made between our HHA and Railway housing or Ellis and Burnand (Origin Consultants Ltd, 2023). To add to this, Dr Kai Gu quoted the Waikato Regional policy statement in regard to Historic and Cultural Heritage Assessment Criteria in his peer review, saying "the heritage place or area needs to have a direct association with, or relationship to, a person, group, institution, event or activity that is of historical significance to Waikato or the nation" (Gu, 2023). Nowhere did he mention that a house or group of houses that look similar to other house types should be protected.

So if the base of this proposed Oxford Street (east) and Marshall Street HHA is that some of the houses imitate another house typology, how can this be classed as a heritage value? If there are no genuine heritage features within our HHA, and no evidence of heritage values, there is no justification for the establishment of this HHA.

Based on our argument, we suggest:

1. you all visit the street and see for yourself and then
2. remove this fictitious HHA from Schedule 8D.

Thank you for your time.

**References:**

Artistic Booklet. (1928, June 8). *Waikato Times*, 103(17423), 8.

Ellis & Burnand Ltd. (1933). *From the Forest Giant to the Home*. Puke Ariki Collection Online.

<https://collection.pukeariki.com/objects/36532/house-designs-and-plans>

Ellis and Burnand, Ltd. (1926, June 3). *Waikato Times*, 100(16813), 8.

Gu, K. (2023). *STATEMENT OF REBUTTAL EVIDENCE OF KAI GU (Historic Heritage Areas)*.

Origin Consultants Ltd. (2023). *HAMILTON CITY COUNCIL PC 9: HISTORIC HERITAGE AREAS. Peer*

*Review Assessment. March 2023* (pp. 28–31).

Richard Knott Limited. (2022). *Hamilton City Historic Heritage Area Assessment* (p. 34).