BEFORE THE HEARING PANEL

IN THE MATTER of the Resource

Management Act 1991

AND

IN THE MATTER Proposed Plan Change 9 to

the Operative Hamilton

City District Plan

AND

AND IN THE MATTER Session 1 Historic Heritage

Areas

FINAL HEARING STATEMENT OF LYNETTE JOYCE WILLIAMS ON BEHALF OF NIALL BAKER - Submitter 199.9

DATED 25 MAY 2023

INTRODUCTION

- 1. My full name is Lynette Joyce Williams.
- 2. My qualifications and experience are as set out in paragraphs 1 to 9 of my primary statement of evidence dated 28 April 2023 (**Primary evidence**).
- 3. I reconfirm that I have read and am familiar with the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses in the Environment Court Practice Note 2023 and I agree to comply with it. I have not knowingly omitted facts or information that might alter or detract from opinions I express.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 4. I have been engaged by Niall Baker, a resident of Fairview Downs, who has submitted that parts of Fairview Downs be included as an Historic Heritage Area (HHA).
- 5. Fairview Downs is situated in north-eastern Hamilton. It is accessed from Tramway Road, Powells Road and Wairere Drive and is bounded on three sides by rural land, some of which is undergoing subdivision; the south side is constrained by land belonging to Tainui Group Holdings (TGH) Ruakura Industrial Development Limited, formerly Crown Land occupied by the Ruakura Agricultural Research station.
- 6. The proposed HHA includes only the earlier parts of the suburb relating to Hamilton's 7th and 8th Extensions. It includes houses on both sides of the main streets of Northolt Road, Fairview Street and Raymond Street, some in part only, and the streets within that area. It excludes purpose-built retail outlets.
- 7. There are approximately 460 houses within the proposed HHA; there are a few small businesses operating from houses. The houses within the proposed HHA include an older farmhouse dating from the 1920s-early 1930s, but nearly all date from the mid-1960s through to 1975.
- 8. My research on the land history, subdivision history and key historical figures shows that Fairview Downs is an example of the undertakings of large-scale private residential construction companies from the mid-1960s and 1970s, primarily Peerless Homes, who developed much of the area north of Powell's Road, and Beazley Homes who developed much of the area south of Powell's Road.
- 9. In my professional opinion, based on the research undertaken, the area of Fairview Downs:
 - a) Is representative of the identified Development Period: Early Post War Expansions (1950 to 1980) as proposed by Mr Knott (formerly Heritage Theme) which has historic heritage significance to the development of the city. I note parts of Fairview Downs (covering much of the area proposed as the HHA) is included within this Development period on the map provided by Mr Knott¹. The map period is shown as from 1950-1970s but the description has 1980 as the end date.

¹ Addendum - Hamilton City Historic Heritage Area Assessment dated 6th March 2023, Appendix 1 – Periods of Development which have Historic Heritage Significance to the Development of the City.

- b) It has a substantial number of original dwellings of the period which contribute to the story of Hamilton's history and development patterns.
- c) It has historical significance for the development of the city of Hamilton. It has particular significance for the development of the north-eastern area of Hamilton as it expanded into Waikato County/District farmland.
- d) The 1960s to 1970s subdivisions are still clearly identifiable and reflect a distinctive part of Hamilton's architectural heritage as the residential lots were built on within a very short time-frame, as can be seen from the subdivisional plans and associated Certificates of Title.
- e) One house, at 11 Powells Road, within the proposed HHA relates to the earlier farming period of the suburb.

RESPONSE TO REBUTTAL EVIDENCE BY DR ANN MCEWAN ON BEHALF OF SNR LIMITED

Paragraphs 7 and 8

10. Dr McEwan is correct in stating that best practice to verify the history and potential heritage value of some or all of Fairview Downs would include the preparation of a comprehensive history of residential development in the suburb. This was not possible in the timeframe available, and as with the other HHAs proposed by Mr Knott, only a general overview has been presented. I agree that a further detailed assessment is required.

Paragraph 9

11. Dr McEwan states that the additional evaluation should be undertaken using the criteria for heritage assessment that are to be found in the Operative District Plan rather than the assessment criteria developed by Mr Knott. As I noted in my Primary evidence, reviewing the proposed Plan Change 9 (PC9) provisions did not form part of my brief. I have not assessed Fairview Downs against the proposed HHA criteria. My research provides information that would support and inform this evaluation for Fairview Downs.

Paragraphs 10 and 11

- 12. Dr McEwan considers that I have not established the 'specific history of Fairview Downs, its housing and its association with the rural farming community on the outskirts of Hamilton represent significant aspects of the history of Hamilton'.
- 13. At paragraph 11, Dr McEwan states that she does not consider my historical summary addresses the potential historic significance of the area.
- 14. In my Primary evidence, I commented that Fairview Downs has historical significance for the development of the city of Hamilton, with particular significance for the development of the north-eastern area of Hamilton as it expanded into Waikato County/District farmland.
- 15. I would like to clarify that I consider Fairview Downs has <u>a level of</u> historical significance, and further detailed assessment is required. The statement made in my Primary evidence was intended to signal Fairview Downs contribution to the story of Hamilton's history and development patterns. In my Thematic Review of the History of Hamilton (dated November 2021) which was made available as part of the Plan

Change 9 documentation, I noted the 1962 extension of Hamilton City included Fairview Downs. The 1962 extensions almost completely encircled the existing city, predicting growth on all fronts. Not all the areas within the extension had been subdivided as residential at that time (page 98).

16. Similarly, my statement regarding the 'distinctive part of Hamilton's architectural heritage' arises from my research of the key subdividers and the development history. My research found Peerless Homes developed much of the area north of Powell's Road, and Beazley Homes and others developed within the area south of Powell's Road. There is a distinctive set of 1960s-1970s housing extant in the area. As previously noted, a further detailed assessment is required.

Paragraphs 10 and 13

- 17. Dr McEwan has put forward her view that for Fairview Downs to be considered an HHA, comparative analysis with other suburbs of similar residential developments from the same period is required. In my view, there is insufficient information provided by Mr Knott in the HHA assessment reports that would allow for a comparative analysis of this kind.
- 18. As I noted in my 'Historical Study of Fairview Downs' during the 1960s-70s period Fairview Downs stood apart from the main urban area, projecting into farmland on three sides, with Ruakura Agricultural Research Station on the south side and Chedworth Park Farms (H Webb) to the north-east. The fourth side was defined by a main road, Tramway Road. Fairview Downs developed in a rural setting, effectively a separation that was recognised by its residents. In her further submission Deborah Fischer states that "We were city kids living in the country" which may have engendered a strong sense of identity amongst residents.
- 19. To the best of my knowledge there have been no in-depth studies of this period of Hamilton's development; further research requires primary research using limited information sources.
- 20. The initial scoring by Mr Knott does not include historic research and identification of the wider context of the history of this suburb.

CONCLUSION

- 21. In my view the specific history of Fairview Downs, its housing and its location within a rural setting on the outskirts of Hamilton represent significant aspects of the history of Hamilton.
- 22. My research on the land history, subdivision history and key historical figures increases the historical understanding of Fairview Downs to assist with heritage valuing of Fairview Downs and its significance to the history of Hamilton. Further historical research is still required, as per my original evidence, and a re-assessment of Fairview Downs should be undertaken

² Further submission of Deborah Fisher, Plan Change 9. Dated 17 November 2022

23. For the Fairview Downs proposed HHA, it is my view that it is representative of the identified Development Period: Early Post War Expansions (1950 to 1980) as proposed by Mr Knott which has historic heritage significance to the development of the city.

Lynette J. Williams

26 May 2023