



DEVELOPMENT CODE DECISION APPEAL

Permit info: AV/4 DSRFY 2024-0003
Application Date: 3/22/24 Rec'd by: AV/4 CW
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

6015 Glenwood Street • Garden City, ID 83714 • 208.472.2921
• www.gardencityidaho.org • building@gardencityidaho.org

APPELLANT

Name: Geoff Huwer dba Company: Alworth HOA
Address: 5062 Alworth St. City: Garden City
State: ID Zip: 83714
Tel.: 208-342-4424
E-mail: alworthhoa@gmail.com boingers@aol.com

APPEAL

Application File No., Name and location:

DSRFY 2024-0003

5003 Alworth

Date of Decision:

03/11/2024

Whose Decision are you appealing?

Staff

Design Review Committee

Planning & Zoning Commission

What specific decision(s) and or conditions are you appealing? (please attach if necessary)

See attached

How are you adversely affected by the decision? (please attach if necessary)

See attached

Please identify any evidence or supporting information to support your position that code was misinterpreted or misapplied. (please attach if necessary)

See attached

I consent to this application and hereby certify that information contained on this application and in the accompanying materials is correct to the best of my knowledge. I agree to be responsible for all application materials, fees and application correspondence with the City. I will hold harmless and indemnify the City of Garden City from any and all claims and/or causes of action from or an outcome of the issuance of a permit from the City.

Geoff W. Huwer
Signature of the Applicant

3/22/24
(date)

Alworth HOA
5062 Alworth St
Garden City, ID 83714
alworthhoa@gmail.com

March 22, 2024

RE: 5003 Alworth St. DSRFY2024-0003 – Appeal of decision

Mr. Mayor, City Council Members and Design Review Committee,

The purpose of this letter is to provide detail for our appeal challenging the Design Review approval of the proposed apartment project at 5003 Alworth St.

My name is Geoff Huwer and my wife, Betsy and I live at 5062 Alworth St, an artisan townhouse community whose entrance is almost directly across from 5003 Alworth St. As the current president of the Alworth Subdivision HOA, with a membership of 16 townhome units, by vote, we unanimously appeal the design review approval of this project based on the following.

Code and Policy Review:

Based on Garden City Comprehensive Plan, the area, from the 50th St & Alworth intersection to the Boise River, is identified as an Activity Node. This area already has 2 apartment complexes with multiple buildings all of which are 3 stories and in alignment with density and height requirements (Mallard Point & Legacy @ 50th St). Comment made on page 12 of Design Review states that our area “does not align with the Node due to its lack of commercial amenities that would make the node a neighborhood, local, and regional destination.”

Required Findings GCC 806B-3

1. “The proposed design shall be compatible with the neighborhood in scale and intensity.”
Shown as compliant as conditioned.

Rebuttal: Our neighborhood is mostly single-family units, owner occupied townhouses, and apartments with a maximum height of 3 stories. The proposal of the 7 story, 110 apartment building is not compatible with our neighborhood in unit density or height. When we were told the size of the building at the Neighborhood Meeting, it was a jaw dropping reaction. The proposed building is taller than any other Garden City building, that we know of.

2. “The proposed design shall not create an adverse impact on the surrounding neighborhood.”

Rebuttal: The shear mass/height of the building on such a small area will be excessively large for the neighborhood. The added traffic resulting from 110 apartments, with a single ingress/egress on Alworth Street, will place an undue strain on the safety of the neighborhood. With no loading zone within the confines of the development and only a single ingress/egress, delivery/moving trucks, and US Mail vehicles will create chaos on Alworth.

Code Section: Title 8 – No compliance issues noted or Compliant as conditioned.

1. Required setbacks are 5' on all sides of the property – No Compliance issues noted.

Rebuttal: The site plans for this development have been revised repeatably, as part of the review process which has caused confusion. Because this is an extremely large building for the lot size we ask that there be a complete set of overlay site plans for survey, civil, architectural and landscaping for review. Additionally, we ask that there shall be no variances approved for this project with regard to changes in the placement of the building and trash enclosure, etc.

2. Quality of life amenities – Open Space/Recreation – Compliant as conditioned

Rebuttal: Quality of life amenities show an open grassy area of at least 50' X 100' which appears to be along the sidewalks on Alworth & 50th. Another open space is located on the third floor in the center of the building, surrounded by 5 stories of apartments on all 4 sides. The final open space is on the roof deck. How does that comply with Goal 4 of the Comprehensive Plan of putting the "Garden" into Garden City?

While we look forward to Garden City growing into a vibrant community, our concern is that the approval of this development is not in the best interest of harmonious growth. The proposed project is obtuse and redundant. It has a higher density than anything else in Garden City. While C-2 zoning doesn't have any height or density requirements, it should. Restrictions should be applied to this project to make a cohesive transition to neighboring R-3 zoning. Dropping the height to 3 floors of residential and adding a secondary ingress/egress on 50th St. would greatly lower the blood pressure of the fire department, police department and local residents, to be sure.

Thank you for your time and attention to the appeal.

Sincerely,



Geoff Huwer

Alworth Subdivision HOA President

Board Members:

Geoff Huwer 208-342-4424, Zachary Matthews 208-608-4687

Alworthhoa@gmail.com