

"HALAKHAH IN THE AGE OF SCIENCE"

I. INTRODUCTION.

1. The challenge of changing world scene upon traditional Judaism in its philosophical aspects discussed by previous lecturers. The advent of modern science brought with it a new conception of the universe & man's place in it, and Judaism had to react to the new philosophies. This philosophic intercourse is no doubt of great significance.

But ultimately, Judaism's survival depends on: HALAKHAH. If no preservation of H., then no matter how successful the phil. adjustment - - no Judaism. And if succeed in holding to H. in changing world, then philosophers will have to struggle, but they will have something of value to say in end. For - just as philosophies nourished by mod. science conflicted with philosophy Judaism, so practical discoveries and inventions of natural science presented great problems Halakhist. And - just as in natural science, the science itself is basic and primary, and the philosophy issues from it; so in Judaism, Halakhah is the given, the primary data, the raw material; and from this a philosophy of Judaism must grow; not vice-versa...

2. For indeed the modern age of science has presented some mighty challenges to the H. Examples: ARTIFICIAL INSEMINATION (late 19th cent - reproduction without copulation - yet we must answer from a literature first written 1800 yrs. ago, codified 500 yrs ago); ELECTRICITY...RADIO & TV (including the Ethics of Communication)...

3. HALAKHAH had before it 3 CHOICES ON HOW TO REACT to mod. science & technology:

- A) SUCCUMB. since 2 different worlds, hence H. outmoded. At very least - all new is permissible
- B) IGNORE. restrict H. & communicants to ghetto. Declare all new forbidden
- C) CREATIVE RESPONSE: use the challenge of mod. world as incentive to inner advantage.

Is testimonial to the inner vitality of H. that it naturally chose third alternative.

\*\*\*"DITHER" - - Warren Weaver editorial "Science" - kinetic friction less than static....



4. To appreciate NATURE of the CHALLENGE to H., and the SCOPE of the PROBLEM, need background:

B) WRITTEN AND ORAL LAW - TALMUD

התהליך לפני ובר תמי

since H. MIN HA-SHAMAY IM, 2 consequences:  
1. IMMUTABLE - Maimonides' 9th IKKAR: *אין שום דבר שיהיה לו סוף או תכלית*  
2. ETERNALLY RELEVANT

THUS: source TENSION - if immutable & eternally relevant - how apply changing world?

1. Is contention those who hold H. valid that not only can H. find answers to these practical problems, but: THAT HALAKHA HAS A JUDGMENT TO MAKE ON MAN HIMSELF IN MOD. WORLD;

2. \*\*\*STORY OF Upranjanika.

3.(ELDA): CAIN REPRESENTS CREATIVE, PROGRESS. ABEL IS "SHOMER"...CANNOT AFFORD TO KEEP ABEL DEAD.

4. Therefore: "H. & MOD. SCIENCE" ought be discussed on 2 levels: legal & philosophic; how

J. LAW reacts...& PHILOS: NOT what previous lecturers - ~~in~~ the classic phil. problems as causality & freedom, creation vs. evolution - rather: moral, spiritual judgment on mod. life derived from the primary constructs of Halakhot, extrapolate to inclusive principles try to find basic fundamentals which can then be made to apply larger, universal situations.

EXAMPLES: Continued NUCLEAR BOMB testing (indiv. vs. society); FIFTH AMENDMENT;

CAPITAL PUNISHMENT; POPULATION CONTROL; BUSINESS ETHICS; PUBLIC MORALS....

\*\*\*TONIGHT I concentrate on LEGAL, for if H. fails here, its voice on the larger problems of the day must be muted. The straight Halakhic question is more fundamental.



1. Branch RABBINIC LITERATURE most relevant: RESPONSA LIT. ("case history law")...

BOOKS ...containing OVER 100,000 responsa on. 1221 831.2 alone!

*English readers*  
\*\*refer them to TUCHMAN column in TRADITION... Also Schechter article... ~~NOAM~~... Freehoff...

\*\*\*R. JACOB ETLINGER (50-113112 A16) Geramn - mid-18th cent - asked if permitted to

attempt submit to therapy of HYPNOSIS - questioned it as: 4185 2/19/62 2/19/62 2/19/62

Answered: full permission. Is a natural phenomenon, tho reason, mechanism unknown.

And appends this remark: *ואני אמתוהי צי, שגם שגם דענוס אמו, להחזיקוה אליו תהיו*  
*א. יצא מאדל כע נור הסוד כס פה מן הים, ואלו יאן אחרו לאסר שני הסוד רק*  
*מי לאסרה הרמה כיון כלול ונקט.*

...thus revealed MATURE UNDERSTANDING COMPLEXITY NATURE; IMMENSITY TASK FACING INVESTIGATOR  
OF NATURAL PHENOMENA; ALSO - EMPIRICAL NATURE OF PSYCHOLOGICAL THERAPY.

3. This attitude of RESPECT BUT NO FEAR for nat. science by Halakhists also revealed by LATE CHIEF RABBI HERZOG: TECHNOLOGY OFTEN OFFERS OWN SOLUTIONS TO PROBLEMS IT CREATED. THUS: AUTOMATIC MILKING MACHINES FOR USE ON SHABBAT (already in use); HYDROPONICS...

\*\*\*Story: wait long enough, science will change a bit...DOCTOR TO G.I. CAN'T SLEEP.....

4. HOW DO IT? SECULAR LAW easier -- tho it too works on basis of respect of a constitution

which inviolate. But they can: \*\*LEGISLATION (us: no Sanhedrin, rare Tekanah);

which inviolate. But they can: \*\*LEGISLATION (as the case may be);

\*\*CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT OR CHANGE (we can't - TORAH MIN HA-SHSMAYIM);

\*\*INTERPRETATION . *allows for degree of freedom w/ stated boundaries* Open to us too. *Our method.* Taxes creative ingenuity of Halakhist.

5. INTERP. IN HAL. LIT. FOR MEETING NEW SITUATIONS involves generally a logical analysis of a known Halakhic problem with roots in precedent; then extending the principles to cover the problems under consideration. IN THIS THE HALAKHAH HAS BEEN EMINENTLY SUCCESSFUL. A GREAT DEAL OF PRECEDENT \* "YAM HA-TALMUD"... ~~for even more~~



6. and even more: HALAKHAH MUST BE CONSIDERED FUNDAMENTALLY AS A METHODOLOGY. H. is first & foremost a METHOD, & that's why new problems don't frighten it...

Main part this lecture will be to show how Halakha as a method is employed to these ends.

7. FASCINATING: in seeking precedent in literature to apply to it the Halakhic Method in meeting new problems, modern halakhists often chose as starting points UNUSUAL TEXTS - CURIOSITIES, passages and cases no ~~one~~ ever thought could be applied. CHOSE AGGADOT ...MIDRASHIM...LEGENDS..."HILKHETA LI-MESHICHA" - - for these BIZARRE incidents were treated in a manner that did not conflict with the Halakha that applies to normal life. THUS, for example, IF & WHEN A ROBOT IS EVER CREATED IN HUMAN FORM, CAN THINK FOR HIMSELF, & INVENTED BY A JEW...WILL HAVE PRECEDENT FOR DECIDING HIS RELIGIOUS STATUS, MINYAN, SHABBAT, MURDER, ETC. (Chakham Tzevi and R. Jacob Emden). THUS TOO (see later) the questions of ARTIFICIAL INSEMINATION AND LIE DETECTOR. \*\*\*OUR ability to use those texts today is TRIBUTE TO COMPREHENSIVE SCOPE, EXHAUSTIVE SWEEP OF ENCYCLOPEDIA TALM. LIT. Hence even today should not castigate those who study seemingly irrelevant tractates (KODOSHIM ...as in natural science: basic research...

#### IV. EXAMPLES FROM THE RESPONSA LITERATURE.

1. SIMPLE LOGICAL ANALYSIS APPLIED TO NEW SITUATION: INTRAVENOUS OR ENEMA FEEDING ON YOM KIPPUR. *i.e. pure Halakhic method*

Talmud: no mention this form getting nutrition. If' לא יקח - no problem. No קיום  
 ' ענין ? R. ABRAHAM SAMUEL SOFER ( מגן אברהם, Pressburg, 1870's): analyzed eating: הנאה - pleasure of act of eating; הנאה - nutritional benefit of having eaten. In intravenous or enema - no' הנאה. Hence, is not הנאה.

2. EXTENSION KNOWN PRINCIPLES TO NEW SITUATIONS: CHEMICAL CHANGES OF FORBIDDEN FOODS.

MUSSAK (Talmud Ber. 43 only what blessing on smelling) - R. ASHER vs R. YONAH on EATING. *(musk?)*

RASH: מגן אברהם, and since comes from BLOOD - forbidden. R. YONAH: מגן אברהם thus permissible. MAGEN AVRAHAM (Y.D. 201) forbids, but if' מגן אברהם, i.e. completely new substance, permits. THUS Rabbi David Z. Hoffmann (student KETAV SOFER...) permits medicine made of hemoglobin even for' מגן אברהם. THUS manifold contemporary problems resulting from food chemistry CAN be answered - - but require sc. research, halakhic



3. ANOTHER EXAMPLE DIRECT EXTENSION OF KNOWN PRINCIPLES: FINGERPRINTING ON SHABBAT.

R. Aaron Walkin ("Zekan Aharon", 1938) - -who incidentally declares it obligatory for proselyte recite KADDISH upon death non-Jewish parent - - questioned by army recruit: is it part of "writing" on Sabbath? Walkin: R. YOSE and RABBIS (Sab.103) if major category is WRITING (כתיבה) or MARKING (סימון) - - depending on whether boards of Tabernacle were matched by alphabetical letters or other symbols. But since both ultimately forbidden, so too fingerprinting out.

4. ELECTRICITY presents one of major problems:

(originally; later: 72104)

- A) Sabbath Candles: R. YITZCHAK SHMELKES (Lemberg, Bet Yitzchak, 1875) - permissible. Most: NO
- B) CHANUKAH candles: " " No. [Yahrzeit - No. 2: symbols (נל-2, soul-body)]
- C) example of a "KULA": No. סימון קול.
- D) Most important: is it considered a form of work forbidden on Shabbat? And if so: what?
1. Discussed by at turn of century R. YITZCHAK SHMELKES, R. SHALOM MORDECAI SCHWADRON, ....
  2. First thought: סימון, BURNING, FIRE. BUT - no flame! Esp. incandescent bulb.
  3. Related to talmudic discussion of metal embers - סימון פתיל / סימון  
and how Rishonim classify that act of "tempering". (mention: heat, light, oxidation.)  
(actually: סימון) Yerushalmi: סימון
  4. Chief Of Chaplains GOREN: assigns to פתיל - COOKING! (Talmud: softening tar is פתיל)
- Mention AOJC - my article there.

5. USE OF MACHINES FOR PRODUCING RELIGIOUS ARTICLES.

- A) MATZOS - once an occasion of great controversy. Similarly:
- B) TZITZIT - here are two questions: requirement of סימון, intending work for religious purpose; and סימון, that it be prepared by human effort. First can be achieved by simple mental effort. Second: those who are permissive maintain that pushing the button which activates the machine is reckoned as responsible for the whole process.

6. PRAYERS AND BLESSINGS BY RADIO, PHONOGRAPH, ETC. (mention 7211)

- A) Must we answer AMEN to blessing on radio, tape?
- B) Rabbi Toledano: Radio OK - speakers KAVANAH applies to the voice. Not so with tape - no immediacy - you can tape voice, can't record a KAVANAH.
- C) RABBI UZIEL - in deciding against phonograph, tape, protests excessive gadgetry, mechanization  
OF RELIGION:  
זכור ומחנך את הילד לדרך הישרה, ואת הילד לדרך הישרה, ואת הילד לדרך הישרה.  
זכור ומחנך את הילד לדרך הישרה, ואת הילד לדרך הישרה, ואת הילד לדרך הישרה.



out

1. Forbidden because of <sup>אין להם</sup> ~~אין להם~~ - since gentiles don't smoke on their fast days.

2. Permitted - for this very reason: no mimicry. 1107

(שנה ב' - עמוד 12 - פארווארט - 1937 - 1938 - 1939 - 1940 - 1941 - 1942 - 1943 - 1944 - 1945 - 1946 - 1947 - 1948 - 1949 - 1950 - 1951 - 1952 - 1953 - 1954 - 1955 - 1956 - 1957 - 1958 - 1959 - 1960 - 1961 - 1962 - 1963 - 1964 - 1965 - 1966 - 1967 - 1968 - 1969 - 1970 - 1971 - 1972 - 1973 - 1974 - 1975 - 1976 - 1977 - 1978 - 1979 - 1980 - 1981 - 1982 - 1983 - 1984 - 1985 - 1986 - 1987 - 1988 - 1989 - 1990 - 1991 - 1992 - 1993 - 1994 - 1995 - 1996 - 1997 - 1998 - 1999 - 2000 - 2001 - 2002 - 2003 - 2004 - 2005 - 2006 - 2007 - 2008 - 2009 - 2010 - 2011 - 2012 - 2013 - 2014 - 2015 - 2016 - 2017 - 2018 - 2019 - 2020 - 2021 - 2022 - 2023 - 2024 - 2025 - 2026 - 2027 - 2028 - 2029 - 2030 - 2031 - 2032 - 2033 - 2034 - 2035 - 2036 - 2037 - 2038 - 2039 - 2040 - 2041 - 2042 - 2043 - 2044 - 2045 - 2046 - 2047 - 2048 - 2049 - 2050 - 2051 - 2052 - 2053 - 2054 - 2055 - 2056 - 2057 - 2058 - 2059 - 2060 - 2061 - 2062 - 2063 - 2064 - 2065 - 2066 - 2067 - 2068 - 2069 - 2070 - 2071 - 2072 - 2073 - 2074 - 2075 - 2076 - 2077 - 2078 - 2079 - 2080 - 2081 - 2082 - 2083 - 2084 - 2085 - 2086 - 2087 - 2088 - 2089 - 2090 - 2091 - 2092 - 2093 - 2094 - 2095 - 2096 - 2097 - 2098 - 2099 - 2100 - 2101 - 2102 - 2103 - 2104 - 2105 - 2106 - 2107 - 2108 - 2109 - 2110 - 2111 - 2112 - 2113 - 2114 - 2115 - 2116 - 2117 - 2118 - 2119 - 2120 - 2121 - 2122 - 2123 - 2124 - 2125 - 2126 - 2127 - 2128 - 2129 - 2130 - 2131 - 2132 - 2133 - 2134 - 2135 - 2136 - 2137 - 2138 - 2139 - 2140 - 2141 - 2142 - 2143 - 2144 - 2145 - 2146 - 2147 - 2148 - 2149 - 2150 - 2151 - 2152 - 2153 - 2154 - 2155 - 2156 - 2157 - 2158 - 2159 - 2160 - 2161 - 2162 - 2163 - 2164 - 2165 - 2166 - 2167 - 2168 - 2169 - 2170 - 2171 - 2172 - 2173 - 2174 - 2175 - 2176 - 2177 - 2178 - 2179 - 2180 - 2181 - 2182 - 2183 - 2184 - 2185 - 2186 - 2187 - 2188 - 2189 - 2190 - 2191 - 2192 - 2193 - 2194 - 2195 - 2196 - 2197 - 2198 - 2199 - 2200 - 2201 - 2202 - 2203 - 2204 - 2205 - 2206 - 2207 - 2208 - 2209 - 2210 - 2211 - 2212 - 2213 - 2214 - 2215 - 2216 - 2217 - 2218 - 2219 - 2220 - 2221 - 2222 - 2223 - 2224 - 2225 - 2226 - 2227 - 2228 - 2229 - 2230 - 2231 - 2232 - 2233 - 2234 - 2235 - 2236 - 2237 - 2238 - 2239 - 2240 - 2241 - 2242 - 2243 - 2244 - 2245 - 2246 - 2247 - 2248 - 2249 - 2250 - 2251 - 2252 - 2253 - 2254 - 2255 - 2256 - 2257 - 2258 - 2259 - 2260 - 2261 - 2262 - 2263 - 2264 - 2265 - 2266 - 2267 - 2268 - 2269 - 2270 - 2271 - 2272 - 2273 - 2274 - 2275 - 2276 - 2277 - 2278 - 2279 - 2280 - 2281 - 2282 - 2283 - 2284 - 2285 - 2286 - 2287 - 2288 - 2289 - 2290 - 2291 - 2292 - 2293 - 2294 - 2295 - 2296 - 2297 - 2298 - 2299 - 2300 - 2301 - 2302 - 2303 - 2304 - 2305 - 2306 - 2307 - 2308 - 2309 - 2310 - 2311 - 2312 - 2313 - 2314 - 2315 - 2316 - 2317 - 2318 - 2319 - 2320 - 2321 - 2322 - 2323 - 2324 - 2325 - 2326 - 2327 - 2328 - 2329 - 2330 - 2331 - 2332 - 2333 - 2334 - 2335 - 2336 - 2337 - 2338 - 2339 - 2340 - 2341 - 2342 - 2343 - 2344 - 2345 - 2346 - 2347 - 2348 - 2349 - 2350 - 2351 - 2352 - 2353 - 2354 - 2355 - 2356 - 2357 - 2358 - 2359 - 2360 - 2361 - 2362 - 2363 - 2364 - 2365 - 2366 - 2367 - 2368 - 2369 - 2370 - 2371 - 2372 - 2373 - 2374 - 2375 - 2376 - 2377 - 2378 - 2379 - 2380 - 2381 - 2382 - 2383 - 2384 - 2385 - 2386 - 2387 - 2388 - 2389 - 2390 - 2391 - 2392 - 2393 - 2394 - 2395 - 2396 - 2397 - 2398 - 2399 - 2400 - 2401 - 2402 - 2403 - 2404 - 2405 - 2406 - 2407 - 2408 - 2409 - 2410 - 2411 - 2412 - 2413 - 2414 - 2415 - 2416 - 2417 - 2418 - 2419 - 2420 - 2421 - 2422 - 2423 - 2424 - 2425 - 2426 - 2427 - 2428 - 2429 - 2430 - 2431 - 2432 - 2433 - 2434 - 2435 - 2436 - 2437 - 2438 - 2439 - 2440 - 2441 - 2442 - 2443 - 2444 - 2445 - 2446 - 2447 - 2448 - 2449 - 2450 - 2451 - 2452 - 2453 - 2454 - 2455 - 2456 - 2457 - 2458 - 2459 - 2460 - 2461 - 2462 - 2463 - 2464 - 2465 - 2466 - 2467 - 2468 - 2469 - 2470 - 2471 - 2472 - 2473 - 2474 - 2475 - 2476 - 2477 - 2478 - 2479 - 2480 - 2481 - 2482 - 2483 - 2484 - 2485 - 2486 - 2487 - 2488 - 2489 - 2490 - 2491 - 2492 - 2493 - 2494 - 2495 - 2496 - 2497 - 2498 - 2499 - 2500 - 2501 - 2502 - 2503 - 2504 - 2505 - 2506 - 2507 - 2508 - 2509 - 2510 - 2511 - 2512 - 2513 - 2514 - 2515 - 2516 - 2517 - 2518 - 2519 - 2520 - 2521 - 2522 - 2523 - 2524 - 2525 - 2526 - 2527 - 2528 - 2529 - 2530 - 2531 - 2532 - 2533 - 2534 - 2535 - 2536 - 2537 - 2538 - 2539 - 2540 - 2541 - 2542 - 2543 - 2544 - 2545 - 2546 - 2547 - 2548 - 2549 - 2550 - 2551 - 2552 - 2553 - 2554 - 2555 - 2556 - 2557 - 2558 - 2559 - 2560 - 2561 - 2562 - 2563 - 2564 - 2565 - 2566 - 2567 - 2568 - 2569 - 2570 - 2571 - 2572 - 2573 - 2574 - 2575 - 2576 - 2577 - 2578 - 2579 - 2580 - 2581 - 2582 - 2583 - 2584 - 2585 - 2586 - 2587 - 2588 - 2589 - 2590 - 2591 - 2592 - 2593 - 2594 - 2595 - 2596 - 2597 - 2598 - 2599 - 2600 - 2601 - 2602 - 2603 - 2604 - 2605 - 2606 - 2607 - 2608 - 2609 - 2610 - 2611 - 2612 - 2613 - 2614 - 2615 - 26

out?

- C) Is compared (in NOAM II) to problem of IDENTIFICATION BY PHOTOGRAPH!

Thoroughly discussed by Lemberg Rabbi Zvi Hirsh Orenstien. ( 53122 )

942

- B) Research on domestic animals during late 19th century. First test-tube baby:1866

Estimate today in USA - tens of thousands. How solve from old Halakha?

- משימה י"ב: ללאו אמן בן אמן, רחל פרידמאן וסוכה"ע - ... חתומים: אמן אמן אמן

~~\*\*~~don't know what led to this question. Perhaps just exhaustive consideration of

all possibilities in a law. PERHAPS (Zeide's suggestion) an anti-Christian statement.

EVEN eminent 18th century Talmudist, Constantinople, MISHNEH LEMELEKH denied possibility

**\*\*ANYWAY** - Talmud considers her a VIRGIN. If AMVATI considered COPULATION, then greater

question: אברהם וישראל. Hence indicates that not regarded as forbidden union.

But must consider possibility of incest - - whole matter taken up BEGINNING EVEN HA-EZER!!



10. ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF AN UNUSUAL TEXT PLUS KNOWN PRINCIPLES: LIE DETECTOR & TRUTH SERUM.

- A) Saved for last because personal element - my She'elah to Grandfather, his response
- B) FOR EXAMINING WITNESSES IN CAPITAL CASES: Not Good. Talmudic (Sanh 32) principle of ' יְנוּי - i.e. while every effort for defendant, still justice (required by לְפָנֵי הַדָּרֵשׁ אֵין מִדָּוָה) demands that witnesses not be intimidated by judges who show open suspicion. WITNESSES TO BE EXAMINED TO ESTABLISH FACTS, NOT TEST CREDIBILITY.
- C) Yet - INTERESTING MIDRASH (Yalkut Esther; Targum Sheni) - splendors of Throne of Solomon - - surrounded lions, bears, eagles, etc. Also: MENAGNIN PAK'B'IN (ingenious apparatus of wheels) - if witness came to Solomon intending to give false testimony - wheels turned, lions roared etc., came clean.
- D) Zeide: Isn't this a violation of principle of ' יְנוּי ?
- E) Answer: Talmud that Davidic Kings acted as judges only in non-capital trials, as financial. Hence, Solomon's "Lie Detector" was used for civil, economic law, where CHOSMIN doesn't apply, since no ' לְפָנֵי הַדָּרֵשׁ אֵין מִדָּוָה .
- ~~F) However, in Tannaitic days~~
- F) FURTHER - - ' לְפָנֵי הַדָּרֵשׁ אֵין מִדָּוָה , i.e. where judges suspect perjury they are required to investigate vigorously, even to use CHOSMIN. HENCE may conclude that if MERUMAH a lie detector device becomes OBLIGATORY!!

(class: as 217, better from YERUSHALAYIM to be 126/126)

## V. CONCLUSION.

- A) What I tried to show by both exposition & illustration is that the Halakhah, kept "in a dither" by modern science, certainly has the capacity to respond, to formulate an approach that is both liveable and does no violence to the letter & spirit of our Eternal Law.
- B) Solutions do exist - -for past, present & future problems. Perhaps to some we have not yet developed a definitive approach - but remember that a PESAK DIN is not like pushing a button on IBM electric brain: Halakhah is a specific methodology applied to very large number texts, requiring human ingenuity, and such un-technological considerations as psychological motives, sociological effects, etc.



C) Add a final word of caution: there are those to whom a "solution" is not a "solution" unless it satisfies their quest for convenience or comfort. Such thoughts do not generally enter into consideration. Like the Rabbi who was challenged by a skeptic who asked whether it was really true that G-d answered all prayers and Rabbi answered, "YES, BUT SOMETIMES THE ANSWER IS 'NO'", so sometimes a solution must be NO.

D) Above all -- the Halakha, being MIN HASHAMAYIM, has to have its integrity respected, and yet can prove relevant to all generations. It has the capacity to survive and even be strengthened in the Age of Science. But from us it requires courage, the strength of our convictions. It requires great, concentrated intellectual effort.

AND ABOVE ALL \* - it requires a reverent approach. When Moses entered upon Holy Ground, approaching the Burning Bush, the voice of G-d commanded him, *קח את נעליך* -- take your shoes off your feet. When you remove your shoes you tread lightly and carefully, you do not trample underfoot all that is sacred and precious.

If we will remove our shoes out of reverence for the Torah, we will discover that the Heavens above our heads will be opened, receptive to the genuineness of our intentions and responsive to the historic effort that our generation must make to preserve our heritage and hand it on even stronger than when we received it.

*Excellent - but beginning  
to show that sufficiently  
well organized. ~~That~~ "Differ"  
didn't do over too well.*