



## 6. Criticism by Mitn of Has:

- \**Antinomianism*--thus: a) זמני תפילה; b) הרהור בד"ת במבואות המטונפים;  
c) distortion of תורה לשמה (צ"צ agreed: if not for Mitn's criticism,  
Has would have gone over deep end...)
- \**Lifestyle--No Decorum*--dancing; drinking; singing; Yiddish interjections...
- \**Zaddikism as Idolatry*--
- \**Downgrading of ת"ת*--became largely irrelevant as Hasm  
produced own great ת"ח
- \**Communal separatism*-- turned into כת, weakened קהל
- \**Supercilliousness of the Pious* (=דבקות) (same crit'm -- by BESHT! -- |||—  
(מתוך לשמה בא ללא לשמה)
- \**Theological*--over stressed immanence over transcendence  
(too complicated to go into now)

## 7. Length of Controversy--several generations, but gradually abated--until Rav Shach vs Lubavitch

## 8. What Caused Rapprochement?

- \*Simply: passage of time
- \*Common enemy: Haskalah, Reform, secularization, modernity
- \*They took each other's criticism seriously

## 9. Today?

- \**Theology*--Hasm hardly mention, and added very little that's new (except  
for HaBaD's misbegotten emphasis on Messianism);  
Mitn--don't know/care
- \**Mood*-- all pretty much alike--witness any wedding...
- \**Inwardness vs Intellection*--moved closer to each other
- \**Talmud Torah*--Hasm have largely accepted Mitn valuation--although  
some deficiencies in certain Has circles. So, here--Mitn prevailed
- \**Antinomianism*--hardly an issue-except, marginally, for זמני תפילה.  
So--Mitn influence won the day
- \**Zaddikism*--clear triumph of Has! RYs=Zaddikim... דעת תורה...  
And even HaBaD= personal & family direction;
- \**Communal Separatism*--Has prevailed: most Mitn equally opted out of  
larger Jewish community

## 10. Lessons for Our Time:

*Caveat: always dangerous to read from one historical context to another!*

*In our own schools--*

- \*Study theology (מחשבה)--both classical & modern--in our own schools!
- \*No neglect of fundamental experiential element (to wit: youth seminar successes)--but even in our own schools!
- \*Continued emphasis on ת"ת as central value (and: social "glue"). BUT--  
Don't allow chasm to develop betw ת"ת & unlearned Jews...

*In our own schools and throughout Jewish community--*

- \*No arrogance/self-righteousness --neither intellec'l snobbism of ת"ת, nor of the "super-frum"--even in our own schools!
- \*Can tolerate certain כת properties, but not those that lead to turning back on כלל ישראל (Besht very strong on this)

Neither triumphalism nor  
inferiority feelings --one  
with fondness in both  
directions --  
simultaneously

*The Internal Debates Within Orthodoxy--*

- \*No חרמות or any form of shunning--is *always* counter-productive--and lower emotional temperature of debates within Orthodoxy.
- \*Be self-critical--as were Besht & RH Volozhiner...

Terms of the internal debates: Interesting "discovery" when doing my thesis: מצרף העבודה is reputed debate betw Has & Mitn--defense of Hasm--and is pseudepigraphic. Also, was plagiarized in work known as ויכוחא רבא.

What is *not* mentioned by any scholars is a further plagiarism, of ויכוחא רבא, in work called משיבת נפש. This little book contains an introduction not found in the other two, and in it the anonymous author lays down rules for true dialogue:

- a) לעזוב השנאה, כי השנאה תעוות הענין ומטה השכל (no contempt)
- b) להסיר כעס מלבך...דהוא סר מדרך האמת
- c) אל תבקש גדולה לעצמך (no triumphalism--or defeatism)
- d) שלא לאהוב את הנצחון, כי הרוצה בנצחון אינו הולך אחר האמת

\*אהבת ישראל--esp as preached by Hasm, & practiced in very earliest Hasc circles--need to feel that *all* Jews are one family...