

A Note on Our Questionnaire

THE EDITORIAL STAFF of *Minnesota History* wish to thank the more than three hundred readers who took the time and trouble to fill out and return the questionnaire enclosed in our June issue. We especially appreciated the many thoughtful comments and suggestions, some of which extended to complete letters. The interest and enthusiasm demonstrated by our readers is most encouraging and indicates beyond question that the quarterly has many devoted and loyal followers.

There were several suggestions that we run a "letters to the editor" column. The idea is a good one, but it made us smile. Seldom indeed would we have any letters to print. Let us, therefore, emphasize here and now that comments, suggestions, and criticisms are welcome at any time—not only when we send out a questionnaire.

The answers were predictably varied and included many stimulating ideas and suggestions. The single most frequently expressed opinion was that the magazine is fine as it is, or, in one reader's pointed words: "It's absolutely OK for its purpose. DON'T go to 'tinkering'!"

The question of its real purpose produced some of the most widely differing views, as reflected in the following comments:

"It appears you have the choice of making this a popular history magazine or a scholar's annotated journal. I prefer the popular approach. All my life I have felt there was a conspiracy among historians to make history as dull as possible. Many of your articles reinforce this conviction."

"Please do not sacrifice articles of a scholarly nature as an attempt to appeal to a wider reading mass."

"There are more general readers than scholars."

"I like it as it is. Please do not make it another *popularized* magazine."

"The magazine . . . should continue as a periodical of general interest."

"Far more bibliographical footnotes, source evaluation, critical comparison—in short, straightforward scholarly articles."

"I feel the Society, while maintaining its scholarly status, should make a continued effort to enlist larger numbers of the average state

citizens in its projects. The magazine helps in this effort."

"Please remember that *Minnesota History* is a reference source—not merely a magazine to be read casually and then thrown away."

Seventy-three per cent of those who answered the questionnaire preferred articles of general interest and fourteen per cent wanted more scholarly articles. The remaining twelve per cent asked for some of each or liked it "the way it is." A few pointed out that the best scholarly articles are readable and interesting. This is undoubtedly so; there is no necessary conflict between conscientious scholarship and good writing. The article which has both truly brightens an editor's day!

More illustrations were favored by seventy per cent; eight per cent wanted fewer; and some twenty-one per cent liked the present balance. Color illustrations were voted down by sixty-four per cent, though a number of the answers were qualified. "They would be nice but would not justify the cost," seemed to be the feeling of many. A few suggested that color be used only in special issues or where it added meaning, but "not just for glamour."

Suggested topics for future treatment ranged through Minnesota's history. Some of the more heavily favored areas were: pioneer life; the stories of local communities; Indians; exploration; the fur trade; politics, both early and recent; immigration; biography; historic sites; and the development of various Minnesota industries. Many recent members realize that much has already been published on the topics of their choice, and a few suggested that early articles of particular value be reprinted.

Miscellaneous comments included a number on the June issue—"more like 'A Legend of the Fur Trade'"—and on Ignatius Donnelly, who appears to be just as controversial now as when he was alive. There were also some comments on the postage metered at the top of the questionnaire. This was required by postal regulations and was not intended for return mail.

We wish to express our appreciation once again and to assure the many readers who "wouldn't change a thing" that no major alterations in *Minnesota History* are planned for the near future.

Ed.

Immigration and American History: Essays in Honor of Theodore C. Blegen. Edited by HENRY STEELE COMMAGER. (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1961. x, 166 p. \$4.50.)

Reviewed by Kenneth O. Bjork

MOST *Festschriften* suffer from a tendency either to eulogize where eulogy is redundant or to weave futile patterns from threads of ideas once strong and vital in research and thought. It is refreshing, therefore, to open a volume of eleven essays that grew out of a well-planned conference in 1960, on the occasion of Theodore C. Blegen's retirement as dean of the graduate school of the University of Minnesota, and to be caught up at once in the excitement of exploring with its ten authors new areas of investigation and of considering new interpretations of the immigrant story. This is indeed a fitting manner of honoring a man who has done so much—as scholar, author, editor, and administrator—to give the study of immigration the place that it deserves in American history.

After an opening statement by editor Commager, Oscar Handlin calls attention to many facets of the movement of peoples within our national boundaries and emphasizes the tenacious grip of the traditional community from which the immigrant was uprooted. He also stresses the dehumanizing effects of urban industrial life as well as other elements of tragedy that give grandeur to America's growth.

Mrs. Ingrid Semmingsen, in her sketch of the image of America in Europe, examines the parts played in creating it by America letters, newspapers, and returning emigrants. She probes into the consequences of emigration in the homeland—a neglected subject in European academic circles—and tentatively concludes that “contact through emigration brought great-

est results when the difference between America and the Old World was discernible, but not too great.”

by telling the life stories of an Irishman, a Swede, and a German, and by drawing on a rich knowledge of social history, Philip D. Jordan strikes a warm human note and dismisses—we hope for good—the myth of one America born full grown and of one distinctive American type. John T. Flanagan explores the place of the immigrant in American fiction, suggesting among other things the great value of literature as a historical source. What we now need, he writes, “is a new Rölvaag, whose native tongue is Hungarian or Finnish or Greek. . . . Instead of a glorification of the husbandman there will be a tribute to the industrial worker.”

It would have been strange indeed if one of the participants in the conference had not turned the spotlight on immigration as a world problem. This Carlton C. Qualey has done with rare ability and economy of words. The “era of free movement of peoples is past,” he concludes, modern industrialism having made it “improbable that there will be any large-scale agricultural migration, except under formal auspices and probably by force.” In a second paper Mr. Qualey points to largely unexploited source materials, making special note of government and business archives. He also pleads for an increased formal study of population movements and their consequences.

The migration of ideas provides a rich cultural vein, and if Henry A. Pochmann finds few nuggets after sinking his shaft into it, he at least comes up with a bucket full of questions in an essay touching on literature, education, and general culture.

Franklin D. Scott maintains that the national approach is fruitful in the study of migration and its effects both in America and in Europe, but he also thinks that we are “failing to study sufficiently in depth,” and recommends the making of a “major interdisciplinary, organized effort . . . to tap the informational materials” of a now “closed chapter of American history.” Father Colman J. Barry discusses further pros-

MR. BJORK, the head of the history department in St. Olaf College, Northfield, is well known for his work in the field of Scandinavian immigration.

pects in immigration studies: the Civil War, the Southwest and Far West, nativism, class and ethnic relationships, and hitherto unused collections of source materials.

The book appropriately closes with an essay by Dean Blegen on "The Saga of the Immigrant." In it he characteristically urges the use of diverse materials and tools, suggests studies that remain to be done, deals with problems of publication, and advocates the founding of a "Journal of Immigration."

All in all, this is a collection bristling with ideas and stimulating suggestions for fruitful labor, individual and collective. It is also a competent review of studies begun and projects completed. The volume, which profits from skillful editing and handsome design, contains a bibliography of Dean Blegen's writings and a satisfactory index.

TWIN CITY TRAVELOGUE

The Twin Cities. By CAROL BRINK. (New York, The Macmillan Company, 1961. 197 p. Illustrations, map. \$5.00.)

Reviewed by Lucile M. Kane

CAROL BRINK has written a most perplexing book about the twin cities of St. Paul and Minneapolis. Focused on the present, it is a mixture of personal observations, a travelogue-type narrative, and snatches of history. Mrs. Brink herself analyzed its character when she wrote late in the book that it is "a very personal and informal review of the two cities. . . . To do justice to any great city, a lifetime of labor and research is needed, and more discernment and understanding than any one individual is likely to achieve."

In the personal element, combined with the author's high literary skill, lies the book's strength. Forty years a resident of the Twin Cities, this imaginative woman absorbed a sense of the metropolis denied more cloistered fact diggers. Her descriptions of the Mississippi River through the changing seasons, majestic grain elevators, carnivals and festivals, and out-of-the-way churches are spun in poetic prose. Anecdotes skillfully narrated enliven the

MISS KANE, who is curator of manuscripts on the staff of the Minnesota Historical Society, is engaged in writing an economic study of Minneapolis as a water-power city.

chapters. Though many of them are thrice-told, they emerge in this retelling with so much verve that Twin Citians may feel they are meeting old friends dressed up in brand new clothes.

The book has two limitations. Historical perspective is lacking; the author founds the cities and then leaves them in a vacuum. Moreover, the fascinating story of the cities' evolution as the twin capitals of a metropolitan empire, their rivalry with other western centers like Chicago and Kansas City, and the century-long battle for transportation facilities and favorable rates is an epic that even a book centered on the modern twins should not overlook.

And Mrs. Brink, alas, did not do her homework carefully, for errors are so numerous that they seriously limit the book's usefulness. This reviewer can only hope that she will devote, not a lifetime, but a few years, to diligent research and produce another more accurate and complete book on the cities, for rare is the writer with so mature a talent for animating urban history.

NURSING SCHOOL

Education for Nursing: A History of the University of Minnesota School. By JAMES GRAY. (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1960. 239 p. Illustrations. \$5.00.)

Reviewed by Philip D. Jordan

NARRATIVES, if not histories, of both the medical and allied professions are always welcome, if only because they fill gaps in areas which have received too little attention. Mr. Gray's pleasantly written book attempts to set down the beginnings and growth of nursing education at the University of Minnesota. The story is well worth the telling, for the university's school of nursing was the first of its kind in the United States. Established in 1909, when major changes were under way in education and social thought, the school pioneered in arranging curriculum, raising standards, and making the nursing profession more respected than it had been when only hospital-controlled schools graduated young ladies.

Mr. Gray, in eighteen chapters, comments

MR. JORDAN, who is professor of history in the University of Minnesota, is the author of numerous books, including *The People's Health*, a history of public health in Minnesota.

upon the labors of the first four directors of the school, reports the days of disaster and the years of growth, shows the developing relationships between the school and other segments of the university, and dwells at length upon the contributions of Katharine J. Densford, who retired in 1959 after twenty-nine years as director.

"The unique feature of the Minnesota plan," writes Mr. Gray, "is that it has been developed as a strictly educational program. . . . The advantage to both the student and the university is that classes and clinical experience can be arranged within the regular school day. Hospital practice is set up on the basis of the student's needs rather than on the basis of the needs of the hospital."

Those concerned with the future of student nurse education will be pleased to learn that Minnesota has discarded the practice of offering a girl in training instruction in return for her work. Beginning in 1961-62, candidates for a degree in nursing enroll in the university in the same manner as do students in other colleges. In short, says Mr. Gray, "they will pay tuition and receive education in return." It must be pointed out, however, that, in this case, the university was a follower, not a leader.

Education for Nursing possesses considerable merit. It is a first attempt to narrate the development of a distinguished educational enterprise. The book should be of interest to the nursing profession, to graduates of the school, and to those who have been instrumental in molding a philosophy of nursing education. It is another bit of evidence testifying to the public service program of the university. Thousands of citizens have benefited in one way or another as a result of progress in nursing education.

Perhaps it might have been helpful if the author had placed his subject in a more adequate frame of reference. In addition, his story lacks the perspective and historical judgment that, for example, made James H. and Mary J. Rodabaugh's *Nursing in Ohio* (1951) an outstanding contribution. Future investigators may find the volume exasperating to use because it lacks citations to sources and has no bibliography. These omissions also make it virtually impossible to establish the accuracy of either fact or interpretation. There is considerable padding, and, in places, an excess of pretentious moralizing. The scholarly approach is absent, for approbation characterizes the volume and

not a page is marred by criticism. Objectivity, no doubt, might have been easier had the author terminated his account at an earlier date. When, one day, an adequate history of the University of Minnesota is written, Mr. Gray's little book will provide stimulus for considerable revision of the role of the school of nursing. Until that time the present recital must be appreciated as a base upon which to build.

REGIONAL NEIGHBORS

The Great Lakes Frontier: An Epic of the Old Northwest. By JOHN ANTHONY CARUSO. (Indianapolis, The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1961. 432 p. Maps. \$6.50.)

Blue-Water Boundary: Epic Highway of the Great Lakes and the Saint Lawrence. By ALIDA MALKUS. (New York, Hastings House, 1960. x, 308 p. Illustrations, maps. \$6.50.)

Reviewed by June Drenning Holmquist

BEYOND a certain overlapping in material and geographical area covered, the two books under review have little in common. Although they invite comparison because of the similarity in subject matter, the authors' focus, purpose, and treatment vary widely. Professor Caruso of West Virginia University has produced a well-written volume which is a pleasure to read and a satisfaction to recommend. The author has a knack for the apt phrase, an admirable facility for conciseness without the sacrifice of meaningful and colorful detail, and a fine grasp of his subject. His well-rounded narrative concerns the development of the Old Northwest into the states of Illinois, Ohio, Indiana, Michigan, and Wisconsin. He touches only briefly on Minnesota, probably preferring to deal with it in a later work, since the present book is only the second in a projected six-volume study of the American frontier.

From Jolliet and Marquette in 1673 to the admission of Wisconsin as a state in 1848, Professor Caruso traces many of the historical threads that are woven into the area's past. In the 175 years under study, the Revolution and the War of 1812 were fought, Tecumseh and his dream of federation were vanquished, and set-

MRS. HOLMQUIST is associate editor on the staff of the *Minnesota Historical Society*.

tlers pushed their way into the heart of the continent to establish five states. The author carries the development of each from the days of exploration up to statehood. In so doing, he provides valuable background on the period immediately preceding the creation of Minnesota Territory. His final chapter, entitled "Americanization of Michigan and Wisconsin," sets the scene for the birth of the territory. Lewis Cass and Henry R. Schoolcraft figure prominently in its pages. Also of interest is the author's account of Josiah Snelling's role in the fall of Detroit during the War of 1812.

The jacket of the second book, *Blue-Water Boundary*, informs the reader that its author grew up in Michigan and that she is a professional writer with twenty-four books to her credit. It also tells us that "here is the whole complex story of the mighty . . . Great Lakes and the St. Lawrence River." In making such a claim, the publisher does Miss Malkus a disservice, for it is evident on every page that the author is not a historian.

She has assembled a rambling, frequently inaccurate, oddly organized account of the exploration and development of the region traversed by the Great Lakes – St. Lawrence waterway, especially the American side of the border. She ricochets from an opening chapter on the building of the Sault Ste. Marie canal by Charles Harvey in 1855 into a brief six-page look at the geology of the area, and then on to her trip down the lakes aboard the freighter "Pontiac." She bounds on to Cartier and Champlain, the Iroquois, the missionaries (but not Father Frederic Baraga who rates only a paragraph in a later chapter dealing with iron mining and whose name is misspelled), Frontenac, and the French and Indian wars. Nine more chapters carry the breathless reader through the Revolution and the War of 1812, the fall of Detroit, and the exploits of Lewis Cass. Three chapters on the inauguration of steam navigation, the opening of the Erie and Welland canals, and wrecks on the Great Lakes bring him to the period of the 1830s and the exploits of Dr. William Beaumont, Schoolcraft, Louis Agassiz, and Douglass Houghton. The industrialization of the region, with brief mentions of its iron, copper, and timber resources, the fight to build the St. Lawrence Seaway, Great Lakes fishing and the lamprey, and the Mackinac Bridge, are superficially covered in later chapters.

That the author loves the area she describes is evident, but that her knowledge of it is very uneven is equally evident. Minnesotans will find a chapter on Duluth-Superior harbor marred by inaccuracies and misstatements ("between the two cities flows the Saint Francis River") that indicate Miss Malkus is on somewhat unfamiliar ground. The opening of the Minnesota iron ranges rates a confusing page and a half. The book leaves this reviewer with the impression that she was invited to a banquet which turned out to be only a tea with many little sandwiches. Professor Caruso's solid and well-documented book provides the banquet.

SEAWAY POLITICS

The St. Lawrence Waterway: A Study in Politics and Diplomacy. By WILLIAM R. WILLOUGHBY. (Madison, The University of Wisconsin Press, 1961. xiv, 381 p. Illustrations, maps. \$6.00.)

Reviewed by Arthur J. Larsen

THIS is a valuable piece of work on an interesting and important project. Mr. Willoughby describes it as a study in the "engineering of consent" rather than one of plain engineering. Throughout the volume he emphasizes the diplomatic and political aspects of the struggle to make the St. Lawrence waterway more usable to man. His focus is upon the developments which, during the last half-century, led to the opening of the Great Lakes–St. Lawrence Seaway, and he mentions only fleetingly the earlier history of the route as a channel for exploration and trade. Two centuries are disposed of in five relatively short chapters with unimaginative titles, and the remaining thirteen chapters deal with the efforts after 1902 of a group of dedicated men to realize a dream. Mr. Willoughby's treatment is chronological, with only slight deviations into topical discussions.

The seaway is still too new for us to know what its total effect will be upon the economy of the mid-continent. We can be sure, though, that whatever the obstacles to its full utilization by ocean-going vessels, it will have a major impact upon the area it serves. Unfortunately, Mr. Willoughby does not attempt to evaluate its economic results, but he has successfully pointed out the political and diplomatic problems that had to be solved in bringing the seaway to its present state of usefulness.

The most intensive effort to promote the project began at the end of World War I and continued, with minor interruption during World War II, until 1954, when the final details were worked out to the satisfaction of both the United States and Canada. A treaty negotiated as early as 1932 contained answers to most of the problems raised by critics of the plan, but it was continually rejected by the United States Senate through the efforts of powerful and determined interest groups which fought vigorously to throttle the scheme. The story of how this opposition was whittled away is an absorbing one, ending with the realization by Eastern steel companies that Minnesota's iron ore resources were diminishing. When the steel industry threw its support behind the seaway so that transportation of ores from Labrador could be guaranteed, political opposition died away.

The author has done a tremendous job of research, but many Minnesota readers may regret, as I do, that he did not use the valuable records of the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence Tidewater Association in the possession of the St. Louis County Historical Society at Duluth. He did have access to the papers of former governor Henry J. Allen of Kansas, who long served on the executive committee of the association, and was its president for a number of years. But Allen's papers do not tell the whole story of the part of the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence Tidewater Association in rousing sentiment for the seaway during a score of years between 1919 and 1939. As a result, Mr. Willoughby is inclined to minimize the work done by Charles Patten Craig, the irascible, high-pressure promoter from Duluth, who, as executive director of the association, got the big push going.

The text is well annotated. I venture, however, to express a feeling shared by many readers of technical literature: placing the footnotes at the end of the text undoubtedly cuts down the cost of printing, but it makes critical reading so difficult as to discourage use of the book. Mr. Willoughby's bibliography is a decidedly valuable addition, and, on the whole, both he and the University of Wisconsin Press are to be congratulated on the production of a volume so readable, so attractive in format, and so complete.

MR. LARSEN is a member of the history faculty in the University of Minnesota, Duluth.

TETON CHIEF

Spotted Tail's Folk: A History of the Brulé Sioux. By GEORGE E. HYDE. (Norman, University of Oklahoma Press, 1961. xix, 329 p. Illustrations, maps. \$5.00.)

Reviewed by Everett W. Sterling

THE LATEST volume on the Plains Indians by George Hyde fills a hole in the story of the Sioux, for his account takes up the history of the Brulé Teton at the time of their migration from the borders of western Minnesota to the White River country west of the Missouri late in the eighteenth century. Their new hunter's paradise, recently controlled by the Arikara, was soon despoiled by wasteful habits and the operations of traders, upon whom the Brulé were dependent for guns and ammunition.

In 1834, when Spotted Tail was eleven years old, his people joined other Sioux bands in their migration to better hunting country along the North Platte where the horse herds of the Pawnee were close at hand.

Located on one of the principal emigrant routes to the Far West, the Brulé were involved in events that led to war with the whites and imprisonment at Fort Leavenworth for Spotted Tail. There he became convinced of the necessity for a friendly policy toward the whites if his people were to remain close to a main artery of western travel. Nevertheless, throughout the tribe's many moves from one agency to another along the Nebraska-South Dakota border, Spotted Tail resisted all efforts to make his people agriculturalists and carried on a relentless war against the hated Pawnee. The story ends with his murder by Crow Dog, also of the Brulé tribe, in 1881.

The author presents Spotted Tail as a leader superior in ability to Red Cloud and Crazy Horse: at the same time that he successfully opposed the civilization policies of the United States Indian office, he recognized the futility of armed resistance on the part of Indians living relatively close to centers of white strength. That he got along well with army men and government officials is taken by Mr. Hyde as a sign of his strength and not his weakness. Partisans of another type of Indian leader will not be pleased with this interpretation.

MR. STERLING is professor of history in the University of South Dakota at Vermillion.

There are errors in Mr. Hyde's book, but they are of little consequence when set beside his keen analysis, wise judgment, and the overall job he has done in pulling together the story of the *Brulé* during this period.

PLAINS STATE STORY

History of South Dakota. By HERBERT S. SCHELL. (Lincoln, University of Nebraska Press, 1961. xiii, 424 p. Illustrations, maps. \$5.50.)

Reviewed by Elwyn B. Robinson

HERBERT S. SCHELL is a short, stocky, white-haired gentleman in his early sixties, who has headed the graduate school at the University of South Dakota for a quarter of a century. He has written several books, including *South Dakota: Its Beginnings and Growth* (1942), *Dakota Territory during the Eighteen Sixties* (1954), and *South Dakota Manufacturing to 1900* (1955), as well as many articles on the region. Though a native of Pennsylvania, Mr. Schell knows more South Dakota history than any other living person; he is a thorough scholar, and his new book is by far the best history of the state ever written.

Five of the twenty-four chapters in this history cover the period before white settlement; twelve deal with the formative years from the 1850s to the first decade of the twentieth century; three more chapters bring the story down to 1960; and four others discuss persistent themes — the acculturation of the Sioux, manufacturing, agricultural adaptation, and cultural life.

The author reveals to his readers a colorful pageant: The first Dakotans, roaming the country after the withdrawal of the last ice sheet, hunted elephants and sabre-toothed tigers. Much later, near the dawn of historic times, the Sioux on the upper Mississippi retreated before the attacks of the better-armed Cree and Chipewewa and entered South Dakota. Then fur traders tied the Missouri country to St. Louis, and when the fur traffic declined townsite speculators arrived and white settlement began. Pressure from the settlers forced Congress to cre-

ate Dakota Territory in 1861 and then to admit South Dakota and North Dakota as states in 1889.

Mr. Schell describes how travel over the Platte River trail to California brought the army to the region, how Populism and Progressivism brought political revolt and democratic controls, how the scramble for the last free land completed the settlement of South Dakota, and, indeed, how every national development — including two world wars, depression, prosperity, and urbanization — was reflected in the history of the state. Such thoughtful attention to broader relationships is one of the special merits of the book.

As is the duty of the scholar who writes on a broad subject, Mr. Schell has made a synthesis of the works of others — putting together in one unified account the results of research found in many monographs and learned articles, bulletins of the agricultural experiment station, masters' theses, doctoral dissertations, and other special studies. Yet he has added much from his own original research. Thus on many topics the book contains new material for students of the region. It is especially informative on such subjects as political history, the last land rush, public land use, statehood, agricultural history, and the Sioux.

Mr. Schell writes clean, concise prose, which happily the University of Nebraska Press has embodied in a handsome book, well printed on good paper, with a great many attractively reproduced pictures, clear maps, and footnotes located at the bottom of the pages. Also included is a long and useful essay on additional reading.

The volume should have wide appeal. The many persons fascinated by the epic of Western settlement will want to read it, and it will help the people of neighboring states like North Dakota to better understand their own areas. In South Dakota the book, so full of significant facts and sound judgments, should be in every school, library, newspaper office, and public institution, and in every home where books are cherished and read. Concerned as they must be with the future of their state, school children, college students, civic-minded citizens, and state leaders and officials should read and ponder its contents. Its publication, celebrating the centennial of Dakota Territory, is an important step in South Dakota's progress toward cultural maturity.

MR. ROBINSON, who is professor of history in the University of North Dakota at Grand Forks, has in progress a history of North Dakota.

WILDERNESS JOURNEY

The Lonely Land. By SIGURD F. OLSON. (New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 1961. x, 273 p. Illustrations, maps. \$4.50.)

Reviewed by Russell W. Fridley

THIS is the third book by Minnesota's famous woodsman, Sigurd F. Olson, who once again demonstrates his rare ability to describe the varied moods and experiences one encounters in the wild and vast North Country. Readers will find it as absorbing as *The Singing Wilderness* and *Listening Point*, for it is an account of a five-hundred-mile canoe trip taken by the author and five companions down the Churchill River from Ile-à-la-Crosse to Cumberland House.

The infinite variety of experience possible in the wilderness is a constant theme of the author, and whether he is shooting a rapids, observing a sunset, pitching a pup tent, or selecting a camp site, his power to evoke images and capture the feeling of the wild country is compelling. As in his previous books, Mr. Olson gives us unforgettable word portraits from the vast region he loves. Readers of *The Lonely Land* will long remember his descriptions of Father Moraud, the "bush priest" whom the travelers met in the Churchill River country; of lob pines along the historic canoe route; the red cliffs of Amisk; pictographs in the valley of the Snake River; the frightening loss and fortunate recovery of one of the party's canoes; and the shooting of Silent Rapids, with a deep awareness of Alexander Mackenzie's grim caution that it is a dangerous stretch.

This book was inspired by an unusual group of men who made an uncommon canoe trip, traversing a country virtually unchanged since the days when it was penetrated by explorers and voyageurs. They brought with them a keen sense of the history and folklore of this vast and solitary land—especially its fur-trade traditions. "Ghosts of those days," writes Mr. Olson, "stalk the portages and phantom brigades move down the waterways, and it is said that singing still can be heard on quiet nights. I wonder when the final impact of the era is weighed on the scales of time if the voyageur himself will

not be remembered longer than anything else. He left a heritage of the spirit that will fire the imaginations of men for centuries to come."

The superb illustrations by Francis Lee Jacques enhance the value of the volume.

HISTORIANS IN DISAGREEMENT

The American Past: Conflicting Interpretations of the Great Issues. Edited by SIDNEY FINE and GERALD S. BROWN. (New York, The Macmillan Company, 1961. 2 volumes, xiii, 606, xii, 550 p. Paper. \$7.00.)

Reviewed by Rodney C. Loehr

THESE TWO VOLUMES endeavor to give college students some notion of controversies among historians over the American past. Thirty-four issues have been chosen and the differing views of two historians presented. The setting for each issue is provided by introductory comment, and much of the material included has been drawn from historical literature not always easily available.

One must note that the issues are not necessarily political, and the selections are not a calendar of American partisan rivalry. For the most part they deal with controversies among historians, but many of these do concern the interpretation of past political questions. Selections range from "The Puritan Oligarchy: Authoritarian or Libertarian?" discussed by James T. Adams and Clifford K. Shipton, to "The Presidency of Eisenhower: Years of Leadership or of Postponement?"—with comment from Merlo J. Pusey and William V. Shannon. Such hardy perennials as the American Revolution, the making of the Constitution, Hamilton and Jefferson, the War of 1812, American Negro slavery, Jacksonian Democracy, the Civil War and reconstruction, the robber barons, the Turner thesis, Populism and Progressivism, and World War I are included. Though one would expect to find varying assessments of the New Deal, the editors instead gave space to such matters as the Monroe Doctrine, the views of John C. Calhoun, manifest destiny, immigration, the Spanish-American War and the literature of the 1920s. This reviewer doubts that questions which have been included about

MR. FRIDLEY is director of the Minnesota Historical Society.

MR. LOEHR is associate professor of history in the University of Minnesota.

Pearl Harbor, Yalta, McCarthyism, and the Eisenhower regime will continue to bulk large in coming years.

Is it possible that future citizens will see accepted "conservative" and "liberal" interpretations of American history? The selection entitled "The American Businessman as Robber Baron: Fact or Legend?" with comments by Chester M. Destler and Thomas C. Cochran, and the section on "Politics and Administration in the Gilded Age: Cynicism or Modest Improvement?" in which the protagonists are Richard Hofstadter and Leonard D. White, suggest such a possibility.

On the whole, both issues and partisans are well chosen. The latter include such champions as Carl L. Becker, Charles A. Beard, Joseph H. Dorfman, Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., Bernard A. De Voto, Oscar Handlin, Thomas A. Bailey, and John D. Hicks—whose discussion of "The Persistence of Populism" first appeared in *Minnesota History*. With such a galaxy of talent twinkling in these volumes, students should profit from exposure to the showers of provoking thoughts expressed. This reviewer suspects, however, that they will turn up in class demanding that their instructors tell them which interpretation is "right."

... on the HISTORICAL HORIZON

A ONETIME MINNESOTA resident's action-filled narratives, which contain "a strong autobiographical element," are the subject of an article by John T. Flanagan on "Franklin Wells Calkins, Romancer of the Wilderness," in the Spring number of the *Wisconsin Magazine of History*. According to the author, Calkins traveled extensively in Wisconsin, Iowa, Minnesota, the Dakotas, Nebraska, and Wyoming in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and used these states as background for his tales about hunting, Indians, and pioneer life. Minnesota's pineries and northern lake country provide the setting for a number of these adventures. An example of Calkins' fiction, "A Piece of Frontier Strategy," from his book *Frontier Sketches* (1893), is reprinted in the issue.

A SECTION on "Peter Rindisbacher, der Indianermaler aus dem Emmental" is included in a lengthy and involved study of "Scythica Vergiliana: Ethnographisches, Archäologisches und Mythologisches zu Vergils Georgica," which Professor Karl Meuli contributes to a volume of *Beiträge zur Volkskunde* issued to commemorate the five-hundredth anniversary of the University of Basel (Basel, Switzerland, 1960. 200 p.). The author reproduces pictures by both Rindisbacher and George Catlin to illustrate the use of snowshoes in winter hunts in North America, and he expresses the belief that they were similar to the hunts in wintry Scythia described by Vergil. The career of Rindisbacher, the Swiss artist from Emmental who depicted life in the Red River Settlement, is reviewed in great detail. Professor Meuli includes in his sketch

accounts of Lord Selkirk's colony, of Rindisbacher's ancestry and family, of the journey to America, of the hardships endured in the Red River country, and of the migration southward to Fort Snelling, Prairie du Chien, Galena, and St. Louis, adding an excellent evaluation of the frontier artist's work. Among the sources cited are not only the numerous American accounts of the artist, including those in *Minnesota History* and *The Beaver*, but such hitherto unexploited European sources as the manuscript records in the "Staatsarchiv des Kantons Bern." Among the pictures by Rindisbacher reproduced are paintings and sketches of the Arctic, hunting, Red River, and other views, as well as Indian portraits from the Peabody Museum at Harvard University, the Glenbow Foundation in Calgary, Alberta, the United States Military Academy at West Point, the Public Archives of Canada at Ottawa, and other collections.

B.L.H.

THE BUSINESS correspondence of David Blakely has provided Margaret L. Brown with considerable material for her presentation, "David Blakely, Manager of Sousa's Band," appearing in the *Bulletin* of the New York Public Library for May and June. The author traces Blakely's early career as a journalist, including his Minnesota activities from 1857 to 1865 and from 1874 to 1885. She tells how in the early 1880s he became interested in the formation of several Minneapolis musical groups and thus "gained invaluable experience" as a manager. In 1885 he brought to Minneapolis the band of Patrick S. Gilmore, who, according to the author, was so impressed with the arrangements Blakely

had made that he asked him to manage concert tours for his organization. With that, "Blakely was started on the most profitable business of his life." Material from the Blakely Papers, owned by the New York Public Library, is used to illustrate the problems he encountered during his years with Gilmore and later with John Philip Sousa.

UNDER THE TITLE "All my immense labor for nothing . . ." in the June issue of *American Heritage*, Humphrey Doermann tries to summarize in eight and a half pages the various careers of Ignatius Donnelly. As a "personality sketch" the article abounds in intimate touches, is readable, compact, and commendably accurate. The reader who is unacquainted with Donnelly's life will find the piece interesting and colorful, but he will gain little idea of the Minnesotan's true stature in agrarian reform movements. Nor will he receive much help from the editor's brief suggestions "For further reading," for two of the three books mentioned — Gerald W. Johnson's *The Lunatic Fringe* and Martin Gardner's *In the Name of Science* — are neither informative nor reliable as sources on Donnelly. R.G.

NOTES from the political conventions of 1856 by Murat Halstead, "a Cincinnati journalist with an intense devotion to the principles of freedom and abolitionism," have been edited by William B. Hesseltine and Rex G. Fisher for publication in an annotated volume entitled *Trimmers, Trucklers & Temporizers* (Madison, State Historical Society of Wisconsin, 1961. 128 p. \$3.50.). Expressing "no doubts" that the big question before the people was the extension of slavery, Halstead wrote "caustic" reports describing how the politicians tried to avoid the issue. The editors observe that his accounts of "the conventions which offered Fillmore, Buchanan, and Fremont to the American electorate had an incisive quality and make a useful and fresh source for an understanding of the efforts of politicians to stay the coming civil war."

INFORMATION on "Effigy Mounds National Monument," an area containing "ample tangible evidence of prehistoric occupation," is given by archaeologists Wilfred D. Logan and John E. Ingmanson in the April issue of the *Palimpsest*. The authors follow briefly the history of the site from the late Pleistocene period to the coming of the white man and summarize the long struggle for its preservation and establishment as a national monument. Photographs of the area are included.

THE MINNESOTA SCENE

TWO HIGHLY specialized iron tools used by Minnesota Indians are discussed in illustrated articles appearing in the *Minnesota Archaeologist* for April. In what he believes to be the first published work on "Birch Bark Cutting Tools," Fred K. Blessing describes this "unique implement" employed by the Chippewa. Burton W. Thayer examines the uses of "A Sioux Quill Iron," and suggests that these implements may have been manufactured by government-employed blacksmiths.

A STUDY of the *Pleistocene Geology of the Randall Region, Central Minnesota* by Allan F. Schneider comprises number 40 of the *Bulletins* of the Minnesota Geological Survey (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1961. 151 p. \$4.25.). Of a highly technical nature, the work delves deeply into the glacial geology of the area immediately west of the Mississippi River in western Morrison and eastern Todd counties. The author describes in detail the surface geology and Pleistocene history of the land and reviews significant regional relations. The book is illustrated with numerous charts, pictures, and maps.

A CENTENNIAL number of *Brown County's Heritage*, published by the Brown County Historical Society at New Ulm, was issued in March to commemorate "1861: First Year of the Civil War" (11 p.). It presents a chronological account of the raising of volunteers in Brown County and gives vivid glimpses of the military events of that year through extracts from manuscripts owned by the local society. These range from a petition sent to Congress in February, 1861, by fifty-three New Ulm citizens praying that the government take active measures against the rebel states, to a letter from a Brown County volunteer in the First Minnesota Battery of Light Artillery, who wrote to his wife on New Year's Day, 1862, that "only a successful ending of this war will repay me."

THE INFLUENCE of a St. Paul street on a well-known Jazz Age novelist is the subject of an article by Irvin Letofsky entitled "F. Scott Fitzgerald on Summit Avenue" which appears in the April issue of *Select*. As a boyhood resident on and near Summit Avenue, Fitzgerald was obviously fascinated by the fashionable thoroughfare and all it stood for. Mr. Letofsky presents some new material supporting this theme drawn from interviews with several of Fitzgerald's early St. Paul acquaintances, who recall their associations with the future novelist. The author

also quotes various references to Summit Avenue found in the novelist's writings, including the vivid description of the "proudful avenue" and its "pretentious stone houses" which appeared in a two-part serial called "The Popular Girl," published in the *Saturday Evening Post* in 1922.

FEATURE ARTICLES on the Alexander Ramsey house in St. Paul appear in both the *Minneapolis Sunday Tribune* and the *St. Paul Sunday Pioneer Press* for April 9. Writing in the *Pioneer Press*, Kathryn Boardman describes "the lovely gray-stone house" as one of "Minnesota's most tangible links with the Civil War past." Hal Quarforth's article in the *Tribune* is accompanied by six interior photographs of the mansion. Both pieces are based on interviews with Miss Anna E. R. Furness, the granddaughter of Alexander Ramsey, who still resides in the historic home at 265 South Exchange Street. Reminiscences and family anecdotes are included, as well as descriptions of the house and its contents.

A BRIEF history of St. Paul Lodge No. 59 of the Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks is included in a booklet published in commemoration of the organization's 74th Anniversary (St. Paul, 1961. 68 p.) Beginning with an account of its founding on December 5, 1886, the group's varying fortunes are followed, from its days of prosperity during the 1890s, when it was nicknamed the "Silk Stocking Lodge," through its decline in the late 1930s and early 1940s, to its present revival, which was marked by the dedication of a newly acquired lodge building in 1958. The events and the names of the men who took part in them have been gathered from the records of the organization and from contemporary newspapers.

UNDER the title "Fares, Transfers, and Other Pertinent Facts About Streetcars — 1873–1960," in the Winter issue of *Hennepin County History*, Joseph W. Zalusky examines the development of the Minneapolis Street Railway Company — its fare rates, costs of operation, and drivers' duties. Special attention is given to the transfer, "an idea that contributed considerable" to the growth of the system. "A Portfolio of Twin City Transfers" and photographs of early local streetcars are included. Appearing in the same issue is a short article by Avery Stubbs on "The Presbyterians in Western Hennepin County: 1863–1876." The author tells how the denomination flourished under the leadership of the Reverend James Hunter and the Reverend Charles Thayer. In a second piece Mr. Zalusky describes "The New Minneapolis Library & Athenaeum: Its Unusual History."

NEWS OF THE SOCIETY

A PORTFOLIO of outstanding color reproductions of four paintings which represent "Frontier Minnesota" is the first project of the Graphic Arts Reproduction Fund of the Minnesota Historical Society. It is hoped that income from the sale of these prints — which will include "Lake Superior, 1869," by Francis Hopkins; "Fort Snelling, 1844," by J. C. Wild; "St. Paul, 1855," by S. Holmes Andrews; and the "Battle of Nashville," by Howard Pyle — will help to establish a permanent fund dedicated to making available to more Minnesotans the pictorial resources of the society's collection. The initial project is being prepared at no cost to the society by various members of the Twin Cities graphic arts industry, who are pooling their skills and resources to create reproductions which will be a lasting source of pride to those who own them.

THREE MINNESOTA historic sites of national significance have recently been called to the attention of the National Park Service by the Minnesota Historical Society. In renewing its request that the Northwest Angle be considered for national monument status, the society also asked that Fort St. Charles be studied separately for possible designation as a national historic landmark. Similar action was requested on behalf of Lake Itasca, which, as the ultimate source of the Mississippi River, was the goal of a three-century search by explorers of many nations. The site of the ancient Sioux village of Kathio on the shore of Mille Lacs Lake was at the same time recommended for consideration as a national monument.

A NEW pictorial history of *The Sioux Uprising of 1862*, by Kenneth Carley, will be published in October by the society (80 p.). Containing ninety-six illustrations and a two-page map, it will present a lively, accurate, and concise account of the bloody uprising which depopulated southwestern Minnesota and introduced a generation of Indian fighting on the Great Plains. It will include a bibliography and an index and will be priced at \$3.75 for a cloth-bound edition and \$2.50 in a paper cover.

READERS who are looking for information on the loon, Minnesota's new state bird, will find ten pages devoted to the subject in the Fall, 1961, issue of the *Gopher Historian*, the society's magazine for schools. The material includes an article, a story, a poem, and several pages of photographs. Separate copies of this issue may be ordered from the society for fifty cents each.



Copyright of **Minnesota History** is the property of the Minnesota Historical Society and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. Users may print, download, or email articles, however, for individual use.

To request permission for educational or commercial use, [contact us](#).