

**Before the Hearings Panel
At Porirua City Council**

Under Schedule 1 of the Resource Management Act 1991

In the matter of the Proposed Porirua District Plan

Between **Various**

Submitters

And **Porirua City Council**

Respondent

**Addendum to Council reply on Historic Heritage –
Hearing Stream 3 – Interior listing of Gear Homestead –
Caroline Elizabeth Rachlin on behalf of Porirua City Council
Date: 11 February 2022**

INTRODUCTION:

1 My full name is Caroline Elizabeth Rachlin. I am employed as a Senior
Planner for Porirua City Council.

2 I have prepared this Addendum to the Council reply on behalf of the
Porirua City Council (**Council**) in respect of matters raised through
Hearing Stream 3.

3 Specifically, this statement of evidence relates to the interior listing of
Gear Homestead.

4 Within this Addendum I also refer to the Addendum to the Council
reply on Historic Heritage of Mr Gregory Vossler and Mr Ian Bowman.

5 I am authorised to provide this evidence on behalf of the Council.

QUALIFICATIONS, EXPERIENCE AND CODE OF CONDUCT

6 Appendix C of my s 42A report sets out my qualifications and experience.

7 I confirm that I am continuing to abide by the Code of Conduct for Expert
Witnesses set out in the Environment Court's Practice Note 2014.

SCOPE OF REPLY

8 This reply is an addendum to the Council Right of Reply on Historic
Heritage. It specifically relates to heritage item HHA007 Gear Homestead
'Okawai', which is listed in SCHED2 – Historic Heritage Items (Group A)
of the Proposed Porirua District Plan (**PDP**).

9 This reply follows Hearing Stream 3, held on 6 – 8 and 10 December
2021, and Minute 17 of the Hearing Panel, which provides the Council
until 11 February 2022 to reply on the potential listing of the interior of
Gear Homestead.

10 The main topics addressed in this reply include:

- Assessment and recommendations
 - Summary of recommendations and Section 32AA Evaluation
- 11 Appendix 1 has recommended amendments to PDP provisions, with updated recommendations differentiated from those made in Appendix A of the s42A report and in my reply on Historic Heritage.
- 12 Appendix 2 includes an extract from the table of recommended responses to submissions and further submissions in relation to the submission from Heritage New Zealand (Heritage NZ) [65.59]. It contains recommendations differentiated from those made in Appendix B of the s42A report.

Assessment and recommendations

- 13 In response to Minute 17, the Council commissioned a heritage assessment in relation to the potential listing of the interior of Gear Homestead.
- 14 Mr Vossler and Mr Bowman’s heritage assessment and associated recommendations on this matter are set out in their Addendum to the Council reply on Historic Heritage.
- 15 I attended the site visit referred to in their reply. This has helped inform my understanding of the approach undertaken to assess the significance of the interior and the recommendations for listing.
- 16 Mr Vossler and Mr Bowman, in summary, recommend that:
- Three interior spaces are included in the feature description entry for Gear Homestead; and
 - An associated Statement of Significance for the interior of the homestead is included in the feature description.
- 17 Their recommendations regarding each of the three interior spaces are set out at paragraphs 14.1.1 – 14.1.3 of their reply. Their

recommendations are based on including the spaces in their entirety but with certain features in each space excluded from the listing.

18 I agree with and adopt their recommendations and therefore recommend an addition to the schedule entry details for heritage item HHA007 as shown in Appendix 1 to my reply.

19 I have considered three options for how this interior listing detail should be integrated within the PDP. Matters which I have considered include:

- Approaches taken in other plans (as previously covered in my s42a report¹); and
- The extent and form of the recommendations made by Mr Vossler and Mr Bowman, i.e. including a small number of spaces or rooms with exceptions per space.

20 These three options are:

- Integrating the interior listing and interior statement of significance information directly into the entry for HHA007.
 - Under this approach the detail for the three spaces would be located directly beneath the Feature description for HHA007². The interiors Statement of Significance would be located under the Statement of Significance and Relevant HH-P1 Values.
- Inserting a new table under the existing listing entry for HHA007 specific to interiors. (i.e. including feature description per space and the statement of significance on interiors). This approach includes a notation in Feature description for HHA007 to refer to Table 1 for interior feature descriptions.

¹ Section 3.10.2.1 of my Historic Heritage section 42A report.

² The feature description for HHA007 is “Original house and ancillary buildings (including the woolshed)”.

- Include an entire new schedule or appendix on Interior listing of heritage items. This approach could include a table such as under option 2 above.

- 21 In my opinion option 2 is the most appropriate option. It is clear and specific and readily accessible. It avoids a lengthy description within the 'Feature Description' section of HHA007, which would be the case under option 1. Given that there are only three interior spaces for listing and they each contain short descriptions, I do not consider a separate schedule or appendix is necessary, as would be the case under option 3.
- 22 I have considered whether any consequential changes are required to other parts of the PDP, such as to the introduction to SCHED2 – Historic Heritage Items (Group A). In my opinion no consequential changes are necessary.
- 23 I note that the introduction to SCHED 2 – Historic Heritage Items (Group A), (including as proposed to be amended through my reply on Historic Heritage) details what is included in the schedule entry for each heritage item, including that interiors are excluded from the schedule entry unless specifically identified under Feature description. In my opinion, it is not necessary to refer to interiors elsewhere in the PDP, such as within the provisions.
- 24 I consider that the option recommended provides a framework for integrating future interior scheduling.

Summary of recommendations and Section 32AA Evaluation

Summary of recommendations

- 25 Consistent with Mr Vossler and Mr Bowman's recommendations, I recommend that the Hearings Panel amend SCHED2 – Historic Heritage Items (Group A) in relation to HHA007 – Gear Homestead 'Okawai' to add interior specific listing as shown in Appendix A.

26 I recommend for the reasons given in the assessment that the submission of Heritage NZ [65.59] is **accepted in part**.

Section 32AA Evaluation

27 In my opinion, the listing of parts of the interior of Gear Homestead in SCHED2 – Historic Heritage Items (Group A) is more appropriate in achieving the objectives of the PDP than the notified provisions. In particular I consider that:

- There is sufficient and certain information to list the three identified interior spaces of the Gear Homestead.
- The details of the interior feature description is clear that it is only certain spaces within the building (in their entirety with exclusions specified) that are listed. This provides clarity of which parts of the interior spaces are and are not included and will avoid unnecessary resource consents.
- The listing of the interior spaces recognises their significance and assists in protecting them from inappropriate modifications or removal. Any alterations or additions will, for example, require resource consent. However, works to repair and maintain these listed interior spaces will be permitted providing HH-S1 is met.
- The inclusion of the interior spaces is more appropriate than the status quo (i.e. no interior protection) or other options such as listing the full interior of the heritage item or the entirety of the three spaces (with no exclusions).
- The listing of the interior spaces recognises their significance and gives effect to HH-P1 of the PDP.
- The proposed change will better achieve HH-01 and HH-02 and HCH-01 and more appropriately recognise and provide for s6(f) of the RMA.

- While there will be some additional costs from interior listing (at the point at which resource consents are required), it should be recognised that this cost is only triggered if the works affect the listed interior spaces (i.e. three spaces out of the entire building). As such there is an economic cost, but this needs to be weighed against the possible inappropriate modification or irreversible loss of historic heritage, which in terms of social and cultural effects would be significant.
- There are environmental, social and cultural benefits from the interior listing. The listing would provide appropriate regulatory control from potentially inappropriate modifications to these significant interior spaces. The listing would not result in no changes or development being able to take place, however any changes would need to be carefully assessed and managed to ensure that the historic and cultural values are recognised, protected and maintained. There are social and cultural well-being benefits for the community, such as educational opportunities.

Date: 11/02/2022

Cl Rachein

.....

Appendix 1 – Recommended amendments to PDP provisions

In order to distinguish between the recommendations made in the s42A report, my Reply on Historic Heritage and the recommendations that arise from this Addendum to Council reply:

- s42A recommendations are shown in red text (with underline and ~~strike out~~ as appropriate);
- Recommendations from my Reply on Historic Heritage in response to evidence are shown in blue text (with underline and ~~strike-out~~ as appropriate); and
- Recommendations from this Addendum to Reply on Historic Heritage are shown in blue text (bold) (with underline and ~~strike-out~~) as appropriate.

SCHED2 - Historic Heritage Items (Group A)

SCHED2 contains Group A Heritage Items and associated heritage settings.

Information under Feature description identifies what is included in the schedule entry for each heritage item. The interiors of heritage items are excluded [from the schedule entry](#) unless specifically identified [under Feature description](#)³. Where a heritage item has [a](#)⁴ heritage setting this is stated. Not all heritage items have a heritage setting and some are marked as n/a* to indicate heritage settings may be considered for inclusion at a future date, through a future plan change. The Planning Maps show if a site contains a heritage item and heritage setting through the inclusion of a heritage item symbol within the site. Where relevant, the heritage setting is also shown. In some cases, the extent of a heritage item is outlined on the planning maps. Heritage settings do not always follow site boundaries.

Detail on HNZPT or NZAA information is provided in SCHED2 for information purposes only. This includes places on the New Zealand Heritage List/Rārangī Kōrero (The List) or in the NZAA site recording scheme.

HHA007 Gear Homestead 'Okowai'		
Location & legal description	Okowai Road (Lot 1 DP 54351)	Statement of Significance
Feature description (See HHA007 Table 1 for interior feature description ⁵)	Original house and ancillary buildings (including the woolshed)	The Gear Homestead (Okowai) is named after James Gear, an early and major player in Wellington's industry. He established the Gear Meat Preserving and Freezing Company in Petone in 1882 and the activity continued at this site for some 100 years. The house was completed on the site in 1887 and it is assumed to have been designed by Robert Edwards in the Italianate style, popular at that time for grand homes. The building has high architectural values because of its high level of stylistic representativeness and authenticity of fabric and form. The building and its remaining grounds (substantial areas were lost for housing and road works) are now (from 1975) in Porirua City
HNZPT-or NZAA⁶ listing	HNZPT ⁷ Category 2: List Number 1328	

³ Clause 16 RMA

⁴ Ibid

⁵ Heritage NZ [65.59]

⁶ Heritage NZ [65.62]

⁷ Ibid

		Council ownership. It has retained a prominent setting which contributes to its value.
<u>NZAA site number⁸</u>	<u>R27/322⁹</u>	
Heritage Setting	Refer Map	It operates today as a cafe and function venue, and has high social amenity values accordingly. The association with Gear, an important industrialist of the time, gives the site and house high historic values as does its relative rarity as a country house of this period in Porirua. Due to the age of the site's occupation, it has high archaeological value and the building's intactness of structure gives it high scientific and technical value. Relevant HH-P1 Values: Historic, Physical, Social, Surroundings, Rarity and Representativeness
<u>HHA007 – Table 1¹⁰</u>	<u>Gear Homestead 'Okowai' Interior feature description and Statement of Significance¹¹</u>	
<u>Room/ space and location¹²</u>	<u>Feature description of room/space¹³</u>	<u>Statement of Significance - Interior¹⁴</u>
<u>The ground floor smoking room located centrally on the southern side of the central entry hall¹⁵</u>	<u>The ground floor smoking room in its entirety, excluding the plaster ceiling lining, light fittings, sprinkler head, fire detector sensor and ceiling mounted speaker¹⁶</u>	<u>The interior of Gear Homestead has moderate district and regional significance as the home of James Gear, a successful and wealthy businessman who built the house in the mid-1880s as a country residence. The original interior design of the house is associated with and reflects the Gear family lifestyle: formal dining, drawing and smoking rooms on the ground floor, with large bedrooms and accommodation for servants on the first floor.</u> <u>Although the level of authenticity of many of the interior spaces has been reduced by internal modifications over time, the ground floor smoking room and first floor stair landing/hall and preparation room are relatively intact internal spaces that play a primary role in understanding the distinct heritage significance of the place.</u>
<u>The first-floor stair landing/hall located to the</u>	<u>The first-floor stair landing/hall in its entirety,</u>	<u>Relevant HH-P1 Values: Historic, Physical, Social, Representativeness</u>

⁸ Heritage NZ [65.62]

⁹ Heritage NZ [65.60, 65.62]

¹⁰ [Heritage NZ \[65.59\]](#)

¹¹ [Ibid](#)

¹² [Ibid](#)

¹³ [Ibid](#)

¹⁴ [Ibid](#)

¹⁵ [Ibid](#)

¹⁶ [Ibid](#)

<p><u>east facing rear (eastern elevation) of the building</u>¹⁷</p>	<p><u>excluding the plasterboard ceiling lining, cornice, carpet, light fittings, sprinkler head, motion detector and the break glass fire alarm call point</u>¹⁸</p>	
<p><u>The first-floor preparation room located centrally on the north facing elevation of the building</u>¹⁹</p>	<p><u>The first-floor preparation room in its entirety, excluding the plasterboard ceiling lining, painted timber wall dado rail, sprinkler head and the dumb waiter</u>²⁰</p>	

¹⁷ Ibid

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ Ibid

Appendix 2 – Recommended responses to submissions and further submissions

In order to distinguish between the recommended responses in the s42A report and the recommended responses that arise from this report:

- Recommendations from this report in response to evidence are shown in blue text (with underline and ~~strike-out~~ as appropriate).
- Recommendations from this Addendum to Reply on Historic Heritage are shown in blue text (bold) (with underline and ~~strike-out~~) as appropriate.

Table B 1: Recommended responses to submissions and further submissions

Sub. Ref.	Submitter / Further Submitter	Provision	Decision Requested	Section of this Report where Addressed	Officer's Recommendation	Officers' Reasons/Comments	Recommended Amendments to PDP?
65.59	Heritage NZ	Introduction	Make specific that the interiors of a number of scheduled items on SCHED2 are included, including HHA002, HHA004, HHA005, HHA006.	Section 3.10	Reject Accept in part	See body of the report- See body of this Addendum to Reply	No Yes