

Ranking criteria explained

The ranking criteria reflect the demands of the Toxic Tech campaign to the electronics companies. Our two demands are that companies should:

clean up their products by eliminating hazardous substances;

takeback and recycle their products responsibly once they become obsolete.

The two issues are connected. The use of harmful chemicals in electronics prevents their safe recycling when the products are discarded. Companies score marks out of 30, which are then re-calculated to give a mark out of 10 for simplicity.

Toxic chemicals criteria

Greenpeace wants to see electronics companies clean up their act.

Substituting harmful chemicals in the production of electronics will prevent worker exposure to these substances and contamination of communities that neighbour production facilities. Eliminating harmful substances will also prevent leaching/off-gassing of chemicals like brominated flame retardants (BFR) during use, and enable electronic scrap to be safely recycled. The presence of toxic substances in electronics perpetuates the toxic cycle - during reprocessing of electronic waste and by using contaminated secondary materials to make new products.

Until the use of toxic substances is eliminated, it is impossible to secure 'safe' recycling. For this reason, the points awarded to corporate practice on chemicals (five criteria, double points for PVC – and BFR-free models) are weighted more heavily than criteria on recycling, because until the use of harmful substances is eliminated in products, it is impossible to secure 'safe', toxic-free recycling.

Where two companies score the same number of total points, the company with the higher score on the chemicals criteria will be ranked higher.

The electronics scorecard ranks companies on:

Chemicals policy and practice (5 criteria)

- 1. A chemicals policy based on the Precautionary Principle
- 2. Chemicals Management: supply chain management of chemicals via e.g. banned/restricted substance lists, policy to identify problematic substances for future elimination/substitution
- 3. Timeline for phasing out all use of vinyl plastic (PVC)
- 4. Timeline for phasing out all use of brominated flame retardants (not just those banned by EU's RoHS Directive)
- 5. PVC- and BFR-free models of electronic products on the market.

Policy and practice on Producer Responsibility for taking back their discarded products and recycling (4 criteria)

- 1. Support for individual (financial) producer responsibility that producers finance the end-of-life management of their products, by taking back and reusing/recycling their own-brand discarded products.
- 2. Provides voluntary takeback and recycling in every country where its products are sold, even in the absence of national laws requiring Producer Responsibility for electronic waste.
- 3. Provides clear information for individual customers on takeback and recycling services in all countries where there are sales of its products.
- 4. Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled.

Click here to see more detailed information on the ranking

Ranking regrading: Companies have the opportunity to move towards a greener ranking as the guide is updated every quarter. However penalty points are deducted from overall scores if Greenpeace finds a company lying, practising double standards or other corporate misconduct.

Disclaimer: Greenpeace's 'Guide to Greener Electronics' aims to clean up the electronics sector and get manufacturers to take responsibility for the full life cycle of their products, including the electronic waste that their products generate. The guide does not rank companies on labour standards, energy use or any other issues, but recognises that these are important in the production and use of electronics products.

Ranking guide addition: We first released our 'Guide to Greener Electronics' in August 2006, which ranked the 14 top manufacturers of personal computers and mobile phones according to their policies on toxic chemicals and recycling.

In the sixth issue of the Guide, we have added the leading manufacturers of TVs – namely, Philips and Sharp – and the game console producers Nintendo and Microsoft. The other market leaders for TVs and game consoles are already included in the Guide.

For the latest version greenpeace.org/greenerelectronics

A penalty point has been deducted from Nokia and Motorola's overall score for corporate misbehaviour as a result of Greenpeace testing of the companies' takeback practice in the Philippines, Thailand, Russia, Argentina and India.

TOSHIBA Ranking = 7/10

Toshiba has climbed up the ranking from 10th position to joint 6th by making commitments to phase out PVC plastic and brominated flame retardants (BFRs) from its entire product range by 2009 and improving on its reporting of the quantities of old products it recycles.

Toshiba has now made a commitment to Individual Producer Responsibility for its end-of-life products. However, it fails to score any points for this improvement because, in the US, it is a member of the Electronic Manufacturers' Coalition for Responsible Recycling which does not support IPR but instead demands that consumers pay ARFs (Advanced Recycling Fees).

Toshiba offers models of laptops whose circuit boards are free from BFRs, EcoMark certified products without polyvinyl chloride (PVC) and provides examples of other components and parts that are free from these harmful substances.

TOSHIBA Overall Score

	BAD (0)	PARTIALLY BAD (1+)	PARTIALLY GOOD (2+)	GOOD (3+)
Precautionary Principle				
Chemicals Management				
Timeline for PVC phaseout				
Timeline for BFR phaseout				
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)				
Individual producer responsibility				
Voluntary takeback				
Information to individual customers				
Amounts recycled				

TOSHIBA Detailed Scoring

Chemical Score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Precautionary Principle				Toshiba scores top marks for committing to the total eradication of specified chemical substances, regardless of lack of full scientific certainty. More information here. See commitment #4.
Chemicals Management				Toshiba has Green Procurement Guidelines for suppliers and ranks suppliers. More information here and here.
Timeline for PVC phaseout				Toshiba has now committed to phasing out PVC from all their products, with a timeline of 2009 – not only from their notebook PCs and mobiles. More information here and here.
Timeline for BFR phaseout				Toshiba is committed to phasing out all BFRs from their whole product range, with a timeline of 2009 – not only from their notebook PCs and mobile phones. More information here.
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)		Toshiba make a range of notebook PCs including the 'Dynabook', 'Qosmio', 'Satellite', 'Tecra' and 'Portege' models that have circuit boards free of halogens and antimony. Toshiba also make EcoMark-certified products, some of which do not contain PVC. The information is difficult to access, but can be found in 'Factor T' brochure. Halogen-free Notebook PC, the Portégé. Examples of products some of whose components are PVC-free and/or BFR-free, but no product systems totally free of these substances. Info on environmentally conscious products. See Factor T brochure pdf. Product information in Japanese here and here. More information in Japanese.		

TOSHIBA Detailed Scoring

EPR/recycling score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Support for Individual Producer Responsibility	Toshiba believes that IPR provides incentives for Design for Recycling. More information. For full marks, a stronger commitment to IPR is needed. However, Toshiba scores no points on this criteria because in the US, it is a member of the Electronic Manufacturers' Coalition for Responsible Recycling which does not support EPR, but is demanding that consumers pay ARFs (Advanced Recycling Fees). More information.			
Provides voluntary takeback where no EPR laws exist			Voluntary takeback of PCs and TVs as well as (B2B) business equipment is offered in US. PC takeback is also provided in Canada, South Korea and Australia and New Zealand. Toshiba claims to have "recycling programs in regions that cover 80% of total sales volume." More information here and here.	
Provides info for individual customers on takeback in all countries where products are sold			Improved geographical coverage and comprehensive information to customers in those countries with takeback programmes in place. More information.	
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled				Toshiba now reports its ratio of "recycling weight to the sales weight" for specified products (including TVs, PCs and 3 types of home appliances) based on current (not past) sales. For 2006, the recycling rate is 12.4%. More information here.