



Ranking criteria explained

The ranking criteria reflect the demands of the Toxic Tech campaign to the electronics companies. Our two demands are that companies should:

- clean up their products by eliminating hazardous substances;
- takeback and recycle their products responsibly once they become obsolete.

The two issues are connected. The use of harmful chemicals in electronics prevents their safe recycling when the products are discarded. Companies score marks out of 30, which are then re-calculated to give a mark out of 10 for simplicity.

Toxic chemicals criteria

Greenpeace wants to see electronics companies clean up their act.

Substituting harmful chemicals in the production of electronics will prevent worker exposure to these substances and contamination of communities that neighbour production facilities. Eliminating harmful substances will also prevent leaching/off-gassing of chemicals like brominated flame retardants (BFR) during use, and enable electronic scrap to be safely recycled. The presence of toxic substances in electronics perpetuates the toxic cycle – during reprocessing of electronic waste and by using contaminated secondary materials to make new products.

Until the use of toxic substances is eliminated, it is impossible to secure 'safe' recycling. For this reason, the points awarded to corporate practice on chemicals (five criteria, double points for PVC – and BFR-free models) are weighted more heavily than criteria on recycling, because until the use of harmful substances is eliminated in products, it is impossible to secure 'safe', toxic-free recycling.

Where two companies score the same number of total points, the company with the higher score on the chemicals criteria will be ranked higher.

The electronics scorecard ranks companies on:

Chemicals policy and practice (5 criteria)

1. A chemicals policy based on the Precautionary Principle
2. Chemicals Management: supply chain management of chemicals via e.g. banned/restricted substance lists, policy to identify problematic substances for future elimination/substitution
3. Timeline for phasing out all use of vinyl plastic (PVC)
4. Timeline for phasing out all use of brominated flame retardants (not just those banned by EU's RoHS Directive)
5. PVC- and BFR-free models of electronic products on the market.

Policy and practice on Producer Responsibility for taking back their discarded products and recycling (4 criteria)

1. Support for individual (financial) producer responsibility – that producers finance the end-of-life management of their products, by taking back and reusing/recycling their own-brand discarded products.
2. Provides voluntary takeback and recycling in every country where its products are sold, even in the absence of national laws requiring Producer Responsibility for electronic waste.
3. Provides clear information for individual customers on takeback and recycling services in all countries where there are sales of its products.
4. Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled.

Click here to see more detailed information on the ranking

Ranking regrading: Companies have the opportunity to move towards a greener ranking as the guide is updated every quarter. However penalty points are deducted from overall scores if Greenpeace finds a company lying, practising double standards or other corporate misconduct.

Disclaimer: Greenpeace's 'Guide to Greener Electronics' aims to clean up the electronics sector and get manufacturers to take responsibility for the full life cycle of their products, including the electronic waste that their products generate. The guide does not rank companies on labour standards, energy use or any other issues, but recognises that these are important in the production and use of electronics products.

Ranking guide addition: We first released our 'Guide to Greener Electronics' in August 2006, which ranked the 14 top manufacturers of personal computers and mobile phones according to their policies on toxic chemicals and recycling.

In the sixth issue of the Guide, we added the leading manufacturers of TVs – namely, Philips and Sharp – and the game console producers Nintendo and Microsoft. The other market leaders for TVs and game consoles are already included in the Guide.

For the latest version [greenpeace.org/greenelectronics](https://www.greenpeace.org/greenelectronics)

A penalty point has been deducted from Nokia's overall score for corporate misbehaviour as a result of Greenpeace testing of the companies' takeback practice in the Philippines, Thailand, Russia, Argentina and India.

MOTOROLA Ranking = 6.3/10

Motorola rises from 14th position to 12th. The penalty point that it incurred at the last ranking for corporate misbehaviour on its take-back and recycling practice has now been lifted. Testing of Motorola's take-back programme by Greenpeace revealed improvements in Motorola's take-back service in the Philippines, Thailand, and India. No take-back service is available in Russia.

Although the company offers its customers an increasing number of models of mobile phones whose circuit boards are free from brominated flame retardants (BFRs), its product portfolio includes home network equipment (e.g. set-top boxes, wireless routers) and network equipment (e.g. base stations), as well as walkie-talkies. Motorola has now made a commitment to restrict (but not necessarily phase out) polyvinyl chloride (PVC) plastic from its mobile products by June 2008. It still has to provide information on PVC-free models and to commit to timelines for eliminating all BFRs and PVC from its entire product portfolio.

Motorola now provides voluntary take-back/recycling services in 57 countries, accounting for more than 90 % of global mobile phone sales. Top marks to Motorola for reporting its recycling rate of 3.32%, as a percentage of sales 12-24 months before – the average lifespan of a mobile phone.

MOTOROLA Overall Score

	BAD (0)	PARTIALLY BAD (1+)	PARTIALLY GOOD (2+)	GOOD (3+)
Precautionary Principle				
Chemicals Management				
Timeline for PVC phaseout				
Timeline for BFR phaseout				
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)				
Individual producer responsibility				
Voluntary takeback				
Information to individual customers				
Amounts recycled				

MOTOROLA Detailed Scoring

Chemical Score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Precautionary Principle				Motorola has a definition of the precautionary principle which identifies precautionary measures to be taken. More information.
Chemicals Management				Motorola provides a list of banned and reportable substances in its Global Common Specification No. 12G02897W18 (updated August 2007) More information. As a pdf.
Timeline for PVC phaseout		By June 2008, Motorola is to restrict use of PVC in newly designed mobile devices parts and products – only restrict, not eliminate and only in mobile phones, not Motorola's whole product portfolio. More information.		
Timeline for BFR phaseout	No commitment to eliminating all uses of BFRs. More information.			
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)		Motorola list 55 models of mobile phone whose circuit boards are free of BFRs. No models free of PVC are listed. Moreover, Motorola's product portfolio includes home network equipment (e.g. set top boxes, wireless routers) and network equipment (e.g. base stations), as well as walkie-talkies. More information.		

MOTOROLA Detailed Scoring

EPR/recycling score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Support for Individual Producer Responsibility				Motorola makes a clear statement in support Individual Producer Responsibility. More information.
Provides voluntary takeback where no EPR laws exist			Motorola offers recycling services in 57 countries, representing over 90% of global mobile phone unit sales, in line with their goal for 2007. However, African countries are missing, as are markets like Russia. In v.6 of the Guide Motorola was served a penalty point after testing of Motorola's take-back programmes by Greenpeace in the Philippines and Thailand revealed that Motorola staff are not informed about the take-back service or provide misleading information. The penalty point has now been lifted following re-testing by Greenpeace of the takeback service. More information. Motorola's goal for 2007 is to provide take-back in 90% of countries where they have sales (see their 2006 Corporate Responsibility Report, p.23).	
Provides info for individual customers on takeback in all countries where products are sold			Information is provided to individual customers in the countries where Motorola offers voluntary programmes. More information. The number of take-back points within some countries has increased (eg. Thailand)	
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled				Motorola is reporting its recycling rate of 3.32%, as a percentage of sales, comparing them with sales 12-24 months prior – the average lifespan of a mobile phone. The end-of-life mobiles are collected via regulatory and voluntary programmes, including Motorola's own 'bring back' events. More information.