

# Carting Away the Oceans





Written by: Casson Trenor

Greenpeace is an independent campaigning organization that acts to expose global environmental problems and achieve solutions that are essential to a green and peaceful future.

Published April 2011 by

**Greenpeace USA**

702 H Street NW Suite 300

Washington, DC 20001

Tel/ 202.462.1177

Fax/ 202.462.4507



**Printed with 100%**

Wind Power

Recycled

Post-Consumer Waste

Processed Chlorine Free Paper





# Table of Contents

---

<b>State of the Oceans</b>	<b>4–6</b>
----------------------------	------------

---

<b>Supermarket Score Card</b>	<b>7</b>
-------------------------------	----------

---

<b>A line in the sand: the US market is saying no to orange roughy</b>	<b>8</b>
--	----------

---

<b>The rise of responsible retail: Companies are taking a stand for the Ross Sea</b>	<b>9</b>
--	----------

---

<b>The face of change: Where We Started/ How Far We've Come</b>	<b>10–11</b>
---	--------------

---

<b>What Consumers Can Do</b>	<b>12</b>
------------------------------	-----------

---

<b>What Supermarkets Must Do</b>	<b>13</b>
----------------------------------	-----------

---

<b>Neck-and-neck: The race to greener pastures</b>	<b>14</b>
--	-----------

---

<b>Supermarket Profiles</b>	<b>15–40</b>
-----------------------------	--------------

---

# State of the Oceans

IT IS IMPORTANT  
THAT THE ITEMS WE OFFER OUR CUSTOMERS  
ARE THOSE THAT WE CAN  
CONTINUE TO PROVIDE  
WELL INTO THE  
FUTURE  
AND TO PROVIDE RESPONSIBLY.

—JEFF LYONS, SENIOR VP, COSTCO CORPORATION

TARGET STRIVES TO BE A RESPONSIBLE  
STEWARD OF THE ENVIRONMENT...  
OUR GUESTS NOW HAVE AN ARRAY OF  
SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD  
CHOICES AT GREAT PRICES.

—GREG DUPPLER, SENIOR VP, TARGET CORPORATION

Our oceans are in peril. Despite the sustainable seafood movement gaining steam globally, the devastation wrought by global industrialized fishing continues on a massive scale. In spite of overwhelming evidence and strong warnings from the scientific community, we continue to plunder our seas.

While the oily gleam of sardines, mackerels, and other small, rapidly-growing fish in wetcase ice is becoming more common, most seafood merchants continue to focus on large, predatory fish such as cod, sharks, and tuna. Globally, populations of these ecologically vital animals have dropped by as much as 90 percent. Bycatch remains a scandalous problem: each day, an enormous portion of the world's total seafood catch is tossed over the sides of fishing boats due to inefficient, indiscriminate fishing methods. The worst of the destructive fishing practices, bottom trawling, is responsible for 80 percent of all bycatch incurred globally.

Even in these dark times, however, there is room to celebrate. This is the fifth iteration of Greenpeace's Carting Away the Oceans (CATO) project, and there can be no doubt that over the past four years, this report has tracked a current of progress and innovation emanating throughout the seafood sector. Through progressive policy development, public support for conservation measures, and the elimination of unsustainable seafood inventory items, a conventional mega-grocer—Safeway—has captured the top spot from the previous standard-bearer, the Target Corporation. In doing so, Safeway has underscored the reality that supermarkets from all sectors can and must incorporate sustainability into their seafood operations as the industry evolves. Indeed, we have now seen the CATO pole position held by companies representing all three grocery sectors included in this report: specialty (Whole Foods twice in 2008 and Wegmans in 2009), big-box (Target in 2010), and conventional (Safeway in 2011).

It is clear that certain markets have become deeply invested in making better decisions and providing safer, more sustainable seafood options for their customers. At the same time, an opposite, dismal truth has become impossible to ignore: there are still numerous seafood retailers that have yet to take any responsibility for the seafood they sell, or for the damage they are doing to our oceans.

# State of the Oceans

Throughout much of 2010 and into the first months of 2011, Greenpeace engaged in a direct campaign to expose the practices of one of the worst historical performers in CATO rankings: Costco. In August 2009, the company's lack of a sustainable seafood policy, misleading labeling practices, and unsustainable inventory items led Greenpeace to initiate a series of online and on-the-ground actions addressing the company's irresponsible behavior. Thankfully, Costco leadership reacted relatively swiftly to the groundswell of dissatisfaction from concerned customers and activists alike. In February 2011, the company released a detailed sustainable seafood statement announcing the discontinuation of nearly a dozen unsustainable species and outlining a path towards real progress in the areas of aquaculture and canned tuna.

This victory was the result of actions taken by tens of thousands of people demanding change across the country. These activists took up the call and confronted Costco directly: phone calls, letters, e-mails, in-store demonstrations, and a number of other creative tactics. Eventually, the company responded to the pressure from its customer base, and we were rewarded with a store that—while still a long way from perfect—has made impressive strides in the direction of becoming a more responsible seafood operation.

Consumers deserve to be able to purchase seafood from retailers that care about the condition of our oceans and that properly steward our marine resources. The days of selling fish with no regard for the environment are over. Companies have two choices—they can implement strong seafood policies and become leaders, or they can ignore reality and continue their unsustainable seafood practices until many popular seafood items are no longer available. And increasingly, if they choose the latter course, they will reap the wrath of a consumer public that has simply had enough.

**WALMART'S OVERALL GOAL IS TO INCREASE THE AVAILABILITY OF SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD GLOBALLY. THIS COMMITMENT TO SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD IS A JOURNEY THAT WE WANT MANY OTHERS TO TAKE WITH US.**

—TAKEN FROM THE FAQ DOCUMENT ON WALMART'S COMMITMENT TO SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD RESTATEMENT.

AS STEWARDS OF OUR ENVIRONMENT, WE REALIZE BY INVESTING IN OUR OCEANS AND RIVERS TODAY WE WILL PROVIDE OUR **CHILDREN AND FUTURE GENERATIONS** THE HEALTH BENEFITS PROVIDED BY FISH AND SEAFOOD FOR YEARS TO COME.

—TAKEN FROM HARRIS TEETER'S SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD POLICY.

WE'RE PROUD OF OUR SEAFOOD PROGRAM, **YET WE WILL ALWAYS CONTINUE TO WORK TOWARDS HIGHER STANDARDS** AND ENCOURAGE OUR SUPPLIERS AND THE INDUSTRY TO DO THE SAME. WHAT IS BEST TODAY MAY NOT BE BEST TOMORROW. **SUSTAINABILITY IS A NEVER-ENDING GOAL.**

—TAKEN FROM WEGMANS' SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD POLICY.



## The Role of Supermarkets

Supermarkets are one of our strongest connections to the oceans. Our relationship with fish is largely one of predator and prey, and, for most Americans, grocery stores are the preferred hunting grounds.

KIDS PROBABLY AREN'T THINKING MUCH ABOUT SEAFOOD NOW, BUT THEY WILL WHEN THEY GROW UP, AND WE WANT THEM TO BE ABLE TO ENJOY HEALTHY SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD JUST LIKE WE HAVE.

—PHIL GIBSON, GROUP DIRECTOR FOR SEAFOOD, SAFEWAY.

In the United States, consumers buy about half of their seafood at the fish counter, but conservation efforts in this arena have a history of bypassing retail operations and concentrating on the individual shopper. Unfortunately, this method alone will not reduce pressure on our fish stocks to acceptable levels—rather, the supermarkets themselves must begin to participate in global ocean conservation.

Retailers have a tremendous amount of power in the seafood industry. Over the past four years, we have seen many companies begin to engage in proactive, thoughtful actions: ending objectionable projects, participating in sector-wide conservation initiatives, and creating sustainable seafood policies that will enable stores to continue to sell seafood in an ethical and responsible manner far into the future.

Other retailers, however, have yet to get on board. These industry laggards continue to ignore the writing on the wall and refuse to reform their behavior, electing instead to sell unsustainable species without remorse. These

kinds of irresponsible actions highlight a general disregard for our planet, our shared resources, and our future. Companies that act this way do not merit our patronage.

## Call to Action

Greenpeace calls upon all seafood retailers to enact strong, effective, sustainable seafood policies that will reduce pressure on flagging fish stocks by prohibiting destructive practices, such as bottom trawling and other high-bycatch fishing methods, and end purchasing from unsustainable stocks. These policies must also include protocols that increase overall transparency within the chain of custody, both to avoid the spoils of pirate fishing and to provide more information to the customer at point-of-purchase. Retailers must begin to participate more actively in the political process; they must use their massive buying power to leverage positive change in our oceans and to support governmental initiatives that will create marine protected areas (MPAs) and other measures integral to a sensible, ecosystem-based fisheries management approach. Lastly, responsible retailers should demonstrate their commitment to this process by removing unsustainable species from their inventories immediately. If we are to save our oceans from destruction, we cannot continue to sell unsustainable species like shark, orange roughy, and hoki. There is a better way to sell seafood. It's time for progressive retailers to take the reins and lead the industry away from the environmentally negligent practices that have brought us to the brink of catastrophe.

SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD?  
WELL, IT'S NOT LIKE WE REALLY  
HAVE A CHOICE,  
IS IT? —OVERHEARD AT THE  
2011 INTERNATIONAL  
BOSTON SEAFOOD SHOW.

# Supermarket Seafood Sustainability Scorecard

RANK	RETAILER	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1	SAFEWAY	64.61									
2	TARGET	63.74									
tie	WEGMANS	63.74									
4	WHOLE FOODS	61.77									
5	AHOLD	59.22									
6	HARRIS TEETER	58.35									
7	ALDI	54.62									
8	A&P	51.63									
9	PRICE CHOPPER	47.90									
10	DELHAIZE	47.66									
11	COSTCO	44.89									
12	TRADER JOE'S	44.57									
13	WALMART	44.50									
14	H. E. BUTT	43.81									
15	KROGER	42.03									
16	GIANT EAGLE	32.38									
17	PUBLIX	21.50									
18	SUPERVALU	15.0									
19	WINN-DIXIE	11.5									
20	MEIJER	10.0									

# A line in the sand: the US market is saying no to orange roughy

When it comes to the worst of the worst, enough is enough. Orange roughy is a fish that can reach nearly one hundred years of age, bears few young (by fish standards), and doesn't mature sexually until it enters its twenties, making the species particularly unfit to withstand the ravages of industrialized fishing. To make matters worse, the world's main orange roughy fisheries—all found in New Zealand—use highly destructive bottom trawl gear to capture these animals. Management of these fisheries has been shown again and again to be ineffective and corrupt.

Thankfully, the US market seems to be running out of patience with these fisheries. Over the past year, store after store has discontinued the sale of orange roughy, and momentum to move away from selling orange roughy, bolstered by a growing awareness among seafood customers, is stronger than ever before.

In 2007, of all 20 retailers analyzed in the CATO report, only Whole Foods and A&P—both of which have gone on to become leaders in sustainable seafood—had discontinued orange roughy. The other 18 stores still sold the species.

By the end of 2008, Ahold USA, Target and Wal-Mart had also dropped orange roughy.

In 2009, the sale of orange roughy ended in all Aldi and Wegmans stores.

By the first quarter of 2010, Trader Joe's had also dropped orange roughy, clearly stating that their decision was due to environmental concerns.

By early 2011, Costco, Harris Teeter, H.E.B, and Safeway had all ceased selling orange roughy. Costco issued a public statement that used orange roughy as a case-in-point example of unsustainable seafood.



As of the time of writing, only eight companies—Delhaize America, Giant Eagle, Kroger, Meijer, Price Chopper, Publix, SUPERVALU, and Winn-Dixie—continue to sell orange roughy. Many of these stores are in the bottom half of the CATO rankings; In fact, with the notable exceptions of Price Chopper and Delhaize, these stores are the bottom six members of the 2011 CATO ranking list.

This is no coincidence. The science condemning orange roughy fisheries is clear and unequivocal. To sell such a critically endangered fish is an insult to the very concept of sustainable seafood. Any store with an effective sustainable seafood policy would immediately be prevented from engaging in this practice.

Greenpeace urges these remaining eight companies to join the rest of the industry to evolve beyond the wasteful and destructive practices that underpin the orange roughy fishery.





# The rise of responsible retail: Companies are taking a stand for the Ross Sea

There is other no place on Earth like the Ross Sea. Known as the “Last Ocean”, the world’s only remaining intact oceanic ecosystem serves as mentor, teacher and living laboratory as we strive to better understand the dynamic and complex workings of life beneath the waves.



Over the last several years, calls to protect this area have grown louder as new voices joined the chorus. Scientists and environmentalists have aligned with policymakers and industry representatives in a last-ditch effort to spare the Last Ocean from the ravages of industrialized fishing pressure.

Last year’s Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) certification of the Antarctic toothfish (more palatably termed Chilean sea bass in stores and on menus) fishery in the Ross Sea was not only a tremendous setback to these efforts, but yet another black mark on the reputation of the MSC. If the MSC’s standards allow for certification of a fishery operating in an area proposed by pre-eminent scientists and regulatory authorities as a strong candidate for a no-take marine reserve, the standards are clearly in need of re-evaluation. It is hard to see what could be sustainable about a fishery targeting a slow-growing and mysterious animal that plays such a key role as both predator and prey in the Ross Sea. Have we learned nothing from our mistakes elsewhere around the globe?

Thankfully, the marketplace itself is beginning to revolt. The vast majority of the world’s Chilean sea bass is sold in the United States, and, as so far, two US seafood retailers have stood up to this madness:

*“Wegmans will not sell any seafood products sourced directly from the Ross Sea due to unresolved concerns over the fisheries, and Wegmans believes a no-take Marine Reserve would benefit this area.”—wegmans.com*

*“Safeway has pledged to not buy or sell toothfish (Chilean Sea Bass) harvested from the Ross Sea and encourages Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources (CCAMLR) member countries to designate the entire Ross Sea as an MPA.”—safeway.com*

It is no coincidence that the two companies willing to take a public stand on such a critical conservation issue also find themselves in the top spots of this year’s CATO ranking. Greenpeace salutes the leadership at Wegmans and Safeway, and urges all other seafood retailers to join in the efforts to protect the Ross Sea and its fragile ecosystem. We have a great deal yet to learn about our oceans, and only the Ross can educate us on the reality of how an intact ocean actually functions. This knowledge is critical if we are to truly understand how to foster a sustainable and prosperous seafood industry.



# The face of change: Where We Started/How Far We've Come

## 2008



When Greenpeace first released *Carting Away the Oceans* in 2008, the seafood retail sector was in disarray. Not a single market managed to attain a “Pass” in the first round of scoring—even progressive retailers like Whole Foods, Ahold, and Target were found severely wanting. Orange roughy and Chilean sea bass commonly appeared in seafood cases across the country, and the phrase “sustainable seafood policy” was dismissed by merchandisers and executives alike as a pointless pipe dream. The illusion that the oceans were impervious to change reigned supreme.

## 2009



Over the next year, we began to see movement. A few companies detached themselves from the pack and began to eke their way up the ranking list, developing prototypical seafood policies and dropping one or two red-list items. Customer awareness grew as well, and across the country concerned shoppers began asking questions about sustainable seafood.



# The face of change: Where We Started/How Far We've Come

## 2010



By 2010, significant progress was underway. A handful of forward-thinking companies began to use sustainability and environmental responsibility to distinguish themselves from their competitors. Unsustainable species like orange roughy and shark are disappearing from seafood sections at a steady clip. Over half of the top twenty seafood retailers in the United States had crafted seafood policies that have, to some degree, reigned in unsustainable sourcing practices. Companies like Safeway and Whole Foods joined forces with independent third-party environmental groups like FishWise and the Monterey Bay Aquarium in order to improve their operations and better promote sustainable seafood to their customers. And on the CATO scorecard, over half of the companies analyzed in the report attained a “Pass.”

## 2011



As we enter 2011, the rate of change continues to accelerate. Five new companies have entered the CATO “Pass” column, leaving only five obvious laggards in the “Fail” category. H-E-B’s total score increased by 3.6 points, the largest one-year jump of any retailer in CATO history. Safeway has joined Wegmans in calling for a no-take marine reserve to encompass the Ross Sea, the world’s last relatively pristine oceanic ecosystem. Four additional stores have dropped orange roughy, three have ceased the sale of Chilean sea bass, and one—Price Chopper—has eliminated shark.

The facts are clear. We, together—consumers, industry, activists, scientists—are changing the state of our planet through our seafood choices. With every discontinued red-list species, every progressive stand taken by a retailer, and every comment made by a concerned customer to a store manager, we find ourselves closer to our overarching mutual goal: a healthy ocean, full of life, capable of sustaining us as we work toward the prosperity that comes from thoughtful, responsible stewardship.

Certainly there is still a great deal of work to be done, but it’s important to recognize how far we have come. Truly, the seafood retail sector is changing for the better—and not a moment too soon.

# What Consumers Can Do

In a perfect world, those who take their paychecks from the oceans would have the wisdom and foresight to steward it properly for the good of all. Unfortunately, we are trapped by an industry that has run roughshod over the treasures of the deep for too long, crushing them with trawl nets, slicing them to ribbons in purse seines, and cutting their throats, thousands at a time, in the name of short-sighted profit.

While some retailers have truly begun to step up and fight for a better world, many still resist the obvious and continue to plunder our oceans. Faced with this reality, it is up to consumers to make our voices heard and to demand the change we want to see in our oceans.

Four simple ways to heal the oceans at your grocery store:

- 1) **Speak your mind.** Tell your seafood merchant that you're concerned about overfishing, bycatch, and ineffectual management. Demand to know the truth behind your seafood options.
- 2) **Know the facts.** Familiarize yourself with the Greenpeace red list items and other species of concern in your area. Refuse to compromise.
- 3) **Vote with your dollar.** Reward seafood merchants that are taking it upon themselves to make sustainable choices. When your local store brings in a new, sustainable seafood product, give it a try, and let the team behind the counter know you appreciate it.
- 4) **Eat less fish.** Today's demand for seafood far outstrips what can be delivered from sustainable sources. While we work together to ensure that someday all seafood will be sustainable, reducing seafood consumption now can help lessen the pressure on our oceans, ensuring fish for the future.





# What Supermarkets Must Do

Retailers have the power to bring about enormous positive change in our oceans. The buying power that these companies can leverage is strong enough to rebuild depleted stocks, create protective measures for vulnerable habitat areas, and promote smart, strong fishery management across the globe.

In order to accomplish these goals, retailers must address four specific tasks:

- 1) Create an effective, publicly available sustainable seafood policy.** Retailers that have sensible guidelines governing their seafood practices are better able to ensure that they are not causing undue harm to the oceans through their operations. Additionally, allowing the public access to these policies increases transparency and allows consumers to purchase seafood with confidence.
- 2) Support initiatives and participate in partnerships designed to promote positive change in the oceans.** Retailers can no longer afford to ignore the political process involved in ocean conservation and fishery management. If we are to safeguard our oceanic resources for future generations, seafood merchants must begin to weigh in on the side of conservation and responsible stewardship on a political level.
- 3) Increase overall transparency in labeling, signage, and chain of custody.** Sustainability is impossible to achieve without establishing strong traceability mechanisms. This traceability should be passed on to point-of-purchase, allowing seafood consumers to make educated choices based on all available information. The usage of Latin names, FAO (the UN's Food & Agriculture Organization) catch areas, and other important data helps to dispel the misrepresentation and confusion in the conventional seafood industry.
- 4) Stop selling red-list species.** There are some fisheries that simply should not be patronized at this time due to stock depletion, overfishing, or irresponsible fishing methods. Similarly, there are certain species of fish and shellfish that, based on their physiology and life history, are unable to support significant fishing pressure. Responsible merchants must end the sale of these animals if we are to have any chance of repairing the damage we have done to our oceans.



# Neck-and-neck: The race to greener pastures



This is the fifth CATO report, but the checkered flag has yet to wave. The first major retailer to cross that 7 out of 10 line and enter the CATO “green” retailer category will set an example for the industry, not only by being first, but by understanding that crossing this line is not the end of the journey. Our planet is a dynamic system, and sustainability is a moving target. A company with its policies and internal sense of responsibility developed to a high level will surely understand this, and will continue to press forward, ensuring fish for the future while raising the bar for sustainable retail.

## Here’s a breakdown of what some of the front-runners could do for a nitro burst down the home stretch:

**Aldi:** Aside from Target, no one can touch you when it comes to red-list species. If you clarify the information in your sourcing policy and make the details publicly available, you’ll be in great shape. You would benefit from taking the Ross Sea pledge.

**Ahold:** You’ve got strong and determined internal guidance and were one of the first companies to get serious about Chilean sea bass—take the Ross Sea pledge and make it public. Consider strengthening your sourcing policy when it comes to aquaculture.

**Harris Teeter:** You’re poised to become a leader in transparency—keep it up. Add more information to the website (FAO catch areas, farming methods, etc) to help your customers make even more informed decisions. Take the Ross Sea pledge, lose the Chilean sea bass, and shift to domestic sources for your grouper.

**Safeway:** Welcome to the leading edge. Hold on to it by publishing a serious canned tuna policy that’s going to embrace pole-and-line and FAD-free tuna, eliminate canned yellowfin, and demand progress from the ISSF. Use your purchasing power to support clean aquaculture technologies, and get involved in fishery improvement projects designed to rebuild and strengthen key domestic fisheries.

**Target:** More than just about any other company, you have an uncanny knack for innovation and tackling the hard targets. Take on another major challenge and own it, like you did with the elimination of farmed salmon. Try pushing the envelope with in-store labeling and taking the Ross Sea pledge.

**Wegmans:** Your willingness to take ethical stands on conservation issues and your admirable seafood sourcing policy distinguish you from just about any other retailer. Try to take a critical look at some of the remaining items in your inventory—drop the skate and imported grouper. It might make sense to get involved in fishery management projects regarding red snapper and swordfish. Consider adding more information at point-of-sale.

**Whole Foods:** Your policy is second –to –none, and the whole country sees you as a natural leader here. The only issue is inventory, but it’s a big one. The Earth Day plan is fantastic, but resist the temptation to bring in MSC-certified items when they’re still clearly of serious environmental concern. Lose the Atlantic halibut, the skate, and the hoki, and take the Ross Sea pledge.



# STORE PROFILES



# 1. Safeway



Rating—6(6.5)

Policy—67.04

Initiatives—75.43

Transparency—58

Red list sales—10

Score—64.62

## PASS

**Banners:** Carr's, Dominick's, Genuardi's, Pavilions, Randall's, Safeway, Tom Thumb, VONS

**Background:** Safeway is among the largest grocery chains in the United States and operates over 1700 supermarkets under eight banners, mostly in the Western and Southwestern regions, as well as in the mid-Atlantic region and in Canada. Safeway offers a wide array of grocery items, including store brand organic foods and nontoxic household products.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Through a combination of progressive policy decisions, inventory changes, and remarkable public initiative support, Safeway has managed to capture the top spot in this year's Carting Away the Oceans rankings. The amount of work necessary to effect such dramatic change in such a sizable retailer cannot be overstated, and Greenpeace congratulates the team at Safeway for putting such effort into this task.

Key points of improvement include policy development in both capture and farmed seafood sourcing, new language aimed at promoting key conservation initiatives, a marked increase in available consumer-focused information at point-of-sale and online, and a substantial decrease in the red list species carried by the chain.

Greenpeace is thrilled to see Safeway on this trajectory and eagerly awaits further developments in the coming months and years. There is no doubt that it is companies with this sort of willingness to challenge paradigms and assumptions – not to mention with the gumption to take a public stand on important political conservation issues – that will lead the charge into the realm of truly sustainable seafood sales.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Safeway's seafood policy continues to expand in strong and meaningful ways. While the policy's complexities and details are not yet at the level of retailers like Whole Foods or Wegmans, the company's purchasing guidelines have strengthened

enormously in recent months. Safeway's policy precludes the retailer from adding any new red list species to its inventory, and thus many of the stipulations that would trigger such a listing (destructive gear types, high fish meal in feed, etc.) are immediately eliminated from the realm of possibility.

It should be noted that this policy is not fully retroactive yet; there are a number of red list species that Safeway continues to sell which the company would not be able to newly add to its inventory under these new guidelines. Greenpeace looks forward to the further application of this policy to remaining current inventory species.

At the time of this writing, Safeway did not have a sustainability policy regarding shelf-stable seafood. Greenpeace is hopeful that such an initiative may be underway.



**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Safeway is emerging as a true leader, increasingly speaking out in support of progressive marine policy in a variety of different arenas.

Most notably, Safeway has recently published language regarding the Ross Sea and its commitment not to buy seafood from this area. This position, pioneered first by Wegmans, has now been echoed by Safeway, which further strengthened their position with a public call for a no-take marine reserve to encompass this ecologically invaluable area.

Safeway continues to support the ongoing MLPA process in California (creating protected coastal marine areas) and seems poised to increase its engagement in key fishery improvement projects aimed at rebuilding stocks and protecting areas of high biodiversity. It has also promised to support protective measures for Gulf of Mexico bluefin tuna spawning areas, but this has yet to materialize.

Safeway's partnership with FishWise, a nonprofit environmental organization dedicated to achieving a greater level of sustainability and transparency within the seafood retail industry, seems to be a driving force behind a great deal of the progress demonstrated by the company. Greenpeace salutes both organizations for their increasingly remarkable contributions to ocean conservation.

Safeway is also a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force, as well as its Sustainable Seafood Working Group.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Safeway has increased the amount of information available to its customers through the development of in-store brochures and informational kiosks as well as through the development of online educational tools. The main principles and parameters of the company's sustainable seafood policy are widely available in a variety of forms (in-store brochures, CSR documents, etc.), but some of the details used in the actual purchasing process do not seem to be accessible to the public.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Safeway continues to make important strides in this area. Most recently, the chain discontinued sale of orange roughy, a fishery known to be associated with a number of destructive ecosystem effects. As Safeway's seafood policy strengthens, Greenpeace expects to see the chain make further progress in this area through the discontinuation of key red list species and/or the support of particular fisheries that demonstrate an ability to provide these products without causing undue harm to our marine ecosystems.

**Safeway currently sells ten of the twenty-two red list seafoods:** Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.





## 2. Target (Tied with Wegmans)



Rating—6(6.4)

Policy—65.22

Initiatives—64.75

Transparency—53

Red list sales—07

Score—63.74

# PASS

**Banners:** SuperTarget

**Background:** Target has built a successful “big box” store concept based on low prices and trendy products. Target’s grocery division, SuperTarget, offers groceries, organic products, and household goods under one roof. SuperTarget currently operates more than 218 grocery locations in 22 states. Target is making significant strides toward improving its seafood sustainability as part of its overall mission to be a good corporate steward of the environment.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Target has plateaued somewhat after capturing the top spot in the 2010 Carting Away the Oceans rankings. That said, the company is still making progress in key areas, and Target’s seafood team continues to push forward in policy development concerning both capture fisheries and aquaculture.

Like many other companies in this ranking, Target received a slight decrease in its overall policy score this year due to new information indicating that its seafood policy does not currently apply to shelf-stable items. Recent information from the company suggests that this is likely to change in the near future. Greenpeace encourages Target to focus more attention to shelf-stable goods, such as canned tuna, as the company’s policy continues to mature.



**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Communications from the company indicate that Target’s sustainable seafood policy is almost complete and should be publicly available in the near future. Luckily, this policy is already being applied internally, and has resulted in key positive decisions such as the elimination of Chilean sea bass (Patagonian and Antarctic toothfish).



In 2010, formative changes to Target’s policy resulted in the discontinuation of all farmed salmon products due to concerns over environmental degradation. In a press release following the decision, Greg Duppler, Target’s senior vice president of merchandising, announced that “Target strives to be a responsible steward of the environment, while also providing our guests with the highest-quality food choices.”

Historically, Target’s sustainable seafood policy has been applied most stringently to its own brands, Archer Farms and Market Pantry, but the guidelines are now being used more broadly. Target’s Food Safety & Quality Assurance team, as well as third-party organizations, assess and monitor Target seafood vendor programs. Target gives additional consideration to vendors that demonstrate responsible harvest (wild caught and farmed) and processing policies and practices, as well as to certified products.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Target is a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force and its subsidiary, Seafood Working Group. In addition to working with industry groups that represent producers, processors, and conservation organizations, Target also consults with seafood scientists on its seafood sustainability and supports certification groups such as the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) and the Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA). Information from the company suggests that new partnership endeavors are underway.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Target is actively incorporating seafood labeling and information programs into its efforts to promote sustainability. Moreover, recent messaging efforts within the company regarding environmental issues associated with conventional salmon farming have been broadcast widely to its customer base and to the media and industry at large. Product-specific sustainability information is disseminated through circulars and seafood advertising campaigns.. While the items highlighted by Target as sustainable options may not necessarily reflect Greenpeace's perspective, creating an avenue to present this type of information at point-of-purchase is a major step toward greater transparency.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Target has become a true leader in this area. The company has taken a tremendous step forward through the elimination of Chilean sea bass, and is currently working on addressing its remaining red list inventory, which has now been reduced to only seven of the twenty-two species: Alaska pollock, Atlantic sea scallops, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.





## 2. Wegmans Food Markets (Tied with Target)

**Wegmans**

Rating—6(6.4)

Policy—75.21

Initiatives—83.78

Transparency—54

Red list sales—15

Score—63.74

**PASS**

**Banners:** Wegmans

**Background:** Wegmans is a family-owned chain of 77 supermarkets with outlets in New York, Pennsylvania, New Jersey, Virginia, and Maryland. In 2010, it was ranked #3 in Forbes Magazine's "100 Best Companies to Work For." Wegmans is consistently referred to as a paragon of progressive and responsible retail, and appears poised to grow considerably in the coming years.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Wegmans continues to prove itself a small-yet-mighty example of progressive ocean stewardship. The chain sets a strong standard for the industry, continuously striving to improve its policy and to participate in important conservation initiatives. Perhaps most impressive is the company's willingness to take progressive, ethical stances on significant policy issues, such as their developing commitment regarding the Ross Sea and their participation in projects aimed at resuscitating the Chesapeake Bay.

The major area necessitating improvement is Wegmans' overall inventory, which still contains more than a dozen red list species. This is particularly troubling given the fact that Wegmans' own seafood sourcing policy dictates that "when there is a sustainability concern with a particular species, [Wegmans] works . . . to acquire seafood that is caught responsibly and prevents the depletion of natural resources. If we find that a better alternative is not available, that item will be removed from our selection." In spite of this clear directive, Wegmans continues to sell items like skate, imported grouper, and Chilean sea bass, none of which are available from sustainable sources.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Wegmans has a publicly available sustainable seafood sourcing policy that incorporates guidelines for sourcing both wild-caught and farmed products. Wild-caught items must be captured according to local regulations and properly reported and capture methods used must meet Wegmans standards. Stock strength, bycatch rates, and social impacts are also taken into account.

Farmed products are sourced from suppliers that are working to "minimize or eliminate the use of wild fish in the feed, pesticides, and antibiotics." Wegmans also strives to avoid patronizing farms that cause undue habitat alteration and/or land loss, are associated with human rights abuses, or source broodstock from red-grade fisheries.

Wegmans actively seeks out products that have been certified by bodies such as the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) and works with outside conservation and scientific groups to develop seafood sourcing standards. Additionally, under Wegmans' policy, products that are not available from responsible sources will be removed from the store's selection. This directive has led Wegmans to eliminate several key red list seafood items from its inventory. Unfortunately, over a dozen unsustainable products can still be found in the Wegmans seafood department.





Like many other companies in this ranking, Wegmans received a slight decrease in its overall policy score this year due to new information indicating that its seafood policy does not currently apply to shelf-stable items. Recent information indicates that Wegmans may be in the process of expanding its sustainable seafood work to encompass grocery.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Wegmans is a true champion in this area. The retailer seems more willing than nearly any other major grocer to take strong stands on political conservation measures, both directly and otherwise. A recent augmentation of the company's long standing Ross Sea pledge has added a call for the establishment of a no-take marine reserve to the pre-existing language that stated Wegmans' decision not to source seafood from the area. Wegmans has also participated in the ongoing revitalization of the Chesapeake Bay in a number of ways, both through engagement with policymaking bodies (concerning blue crab harvest regulations and quotas) and through its supplier connections.

Wegmans' chain of custody is certified by the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC), a claim that very few US retailers can make. Wegmans also uses Environmental Defense Fund (EDF) guidelines in some areas of its seafood purchasing, most notably farmed shrimp.



Wegmans participates in the Food Marketing Institute's sustainability initiative and supports the "Common Vision for Environmentally Sustainable Seafood," an initiative of the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions that aims to build an active partnership between conservation organizations and seafood retailers in support of achieving sustainable fisheries.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Wegmans is committed to providing information about sustainable seafood to its customers. The Wegmans sustainable seafood sourcing policy is now available online and in print. Packaged seafood that qualifies for sustainability statements is discussed in the Wegmans Family Statement and, if applicable, also carries the MSC logo. Wegmans employees are trained to be knowledgeable about seafood choices, labeling, and sustainability.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** The single greatest obstacle preventing Wegmans from vaulting over the 7.0/10 mark and achieving a "green" score in the Carting Away the Oceans report is the company's inventory. The company often cites MSC certification as an excuse to continue the sale of red list species; Greenpeace would highly encourage Wegmans to eliminate key red list species which have no sustainable source – skates and rays (excepting invasives) and Chilean sea bass are excellent examples of products that fall into this category.

For the third year in a row, Greenpeace surveys found that Wegmans sells fifteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, monkfish, ocean quahog, red snapper, redfish, skates and rays, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

It should be mentioned that Wegmans is actively engaged in sustainability projects within the categories of South Atlantic albacore and tropical shrimp.

## 4. Whole Foods Market



Rating—6(6.2)

Policy—80.88

Initiatives—76.68

Transparency—58.5

Red list sales—18

Score—61.77

# PASS

**Banners:** Harry's Farmers Market, Whole Foods Market, Wild Oats

**Background:** Whole Foods Market, a rapidly expanding company with more than 300 stores in the United States, Canada, and United Kingdom, is the world's largest purveyor of natural and organic products. Whole Foods claims to stay ahead of the growing consumer trend toward sustainable living by constantly reviewing the health, nutritional, and environmental impacts of the products it sells.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Whole Foods Market is among the most progressive members in the US seafood retail sector. Although it has dropped to #4 in this update of the Carting Away the Oceans project, the chain is poised to potentially recapture the top spot. Greenpeace celebrates Whole Foods' recent announcement detailing the company's plans to eliminate nearly all red list species by Earth Day, 2012 – such progressive action will surely have a tremendous positive impact on our oceans.

Unfortunately, at the time of this report, Whole Foods still sold a tremendous amount of red list seafood species. Whole Foods' resistance to shifting its inventory away from species like Atlantic halibut, Chilean sea bass, and hoki is far and away the most significant impediment to the chain clinching the pole position.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Whole Foods maintains the strongest and most complex sourcing policy of any of the twenty retailers examined within the context of this report. While there is still room for improvement, Whole Foods' policy is indeed at the front of the pack in terms of its comprehensive and science-based nature. In developing and implementing these standards, Whole Foods called upon the expertise of scientists, environmentalists, and the company's suppliers. In addition, Whole Foods provides suppliers with training on its standards.

Whole Foods's extensive policy seeks out MSC-certified products, eliminates certain unsustainable items from potential sale, and invites the cooperation of independent scientific and environmental organizations. Moreover, it requires fish farms to minimize the environmental impacts

of their operations, which includes having protocols to prevent fish from escaping the farms. Antibiotics, growth hormones, and poultry and mammalian by-products may not be used in feed. Also included are strong traceability measures that ensure farmed seafood is tracked from farm to store. The slight decrease in Whole Foods' policy score since last year's report is a result of the removal of language concerning the use of genetically modified organisms (GMOs) in fish feed.

Although we note that Whole Foods has incorporated the use of certification bodies into its seafood sustainability policy, Greenpeace does not endorse any seafood certification program, including the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC).

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Whole Foods supports sustainable fishing practices by actively partnering with suppliers, the MSC, and other groups to encourage responsible practices. Whole Foods supports the "Common Vision for Environmentally Sustainable Seafood," an initiative of the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions that aims to build an active partnership between conservation organizations and seafood retailers in support of achieving sustainable fisheries.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Whole Foods uses a pioneering labeling program in concert with the Monterey Bay Aquarium (MBA) and the Blue Oceans Institute (BOI). The program is designed to increase available information at point-of-purchase regarding the sustainability of various seafood options. Whole Foods provides



information to its customers on its Web site and trains its seafood counter staff to answer questions about seafood sourcing and catch methods. The company's Aquaculture Standards are available online, setting a strong example in terms of transparency. Brochures on mercury in seafood are available to consumers upon request. Whole Foods also educates its customers about the environmental benefits of frozen seafood, which can take the slow boat to market and thus has a much smaller carbon footprint, as opposed to fresh seafood, which requires immediate shipping.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Recent announcements from Whole Foods leadership indicate that the company is on track to discontinue all red-list species over the course of the next two years. As of Earth Day 2011, the chain claims that it will only sell sustainably sourced tuna and swordfish. Earth Day 2012 will see the subsequent discontinuation of all other red list species except for a few items from the Atlantic, which will be replaced by Earth Day 2013. Greenpeace applauds this progressive decision and looks forward to the culmination of Whole Foods' work. If the company does indeed discontinue these species, there is little doubt that it will surpass the 7.0/10 score needed to qualify as a "green" retailer within the context of this report – assuming that it doesn't simply use MSC certification as a shield.

Still, at the time of this writing, Greenpeace surveys found that Whole Foods still sold eighteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic halibut, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, bigeye tuna, Chilean sea bass, Greenland halibut, grouper, hoki, monkfish, ocean quahog, red snapper, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

It should be mentioned that Whole Foods is actively engaged in sustainability projects within the categories of Atlantic salmon, South Atlantic albacore, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

IN ONLY A FEW SHORT YEARS, WE PLAN TO HAVE FULLY SUSTAINABLE SEAFOOD DEPARTMENTS. IN FACT, WE'VE ALREADY BEGUN TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN.

—TAKEN FROM THE WHOLE FOODS SEAFOOD SUSTAINABILITY STATEMENT.





# 5. Ahold



Rating—6(5.9)

Policy—62.77

Initiatives—58.09

Transparency—63

Red list sales—12

Score—59.22

## PASS

**Banners:** Stop & Shop, Giant, Martin's Food Market, Ukrop's

**Background:** Ahold USA is the US subsidiary of Netherlands-based grocery giant Royal Ahold. In the United States, Ahold operates approximately 750 grocery stores in New England and along the East Coast. Ahold continues to make significant strides toward seafood sustainability, especially in the areas of transparency to consumers and overall inventory.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Ahold is a consistent player in the realm of seafood sustainability and has again managed to improve its overall score by making key decisions involving inventory. The company's recent decision to discontinue the sale of imported grouper underscores Ahold's slow-but-steady dedication to sustainable seafood.

Like many other companies in this ranking, Ahold received a slight decrease in its overall score this year due to new information indicating that its seafood policy does not currently apply to shelf-stable items.

Ahold could improve its overall score by strengthening its sourcing policy (especially in the realm of shelf-stable goods such as canned tuna); backing policy initiatives such as proposed marine reserves; and continuing to remove red list species, such as Atlantic cod and bottom-trawled monkfish, from its product list.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Ahold has a ten-point sustainable seafood policy that covers both wild-caught and farmed seafood. Its sustainability program, Choice Catch, aims to reduce the negative impacts of commercial fishing. Ahold makes purchasing decisions based on the results of seafood sustainability audits conducted with the help of the New England Aquarium. Issues addressed in its sustainable seafood policy include avoiding illegally caught seafood; considering social, ecological, and economic impacts; and supporting scientific research and stakeholder initiatives aimed at improving seafood sustainability. Ahold gives preference

to farmed seafood suppliers that are taking steps to reduce the environmental impacts of their operations as well as reduce the use of wild-caught fish for feed, antibiotics, and pesticides.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Ahold supports the Common Vision for Environmentally Sustainable Seafood, an initiative of the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions, which aims to build an active partnership between conservation organizations and seafood retailers in support of achieving sustainable fisheries. Ahold also chairs the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainable Seafood Working Group and is involved in numerous other seafood sustainability initiatives and related projects.

Ahold utilizes several seafood certification systems, including the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC), GlobalGAP, and the Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA). Although we note these practices, Greenpeace does not endorse any seafood certification programs.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Ahold currently leads the retail sector in overall transparency. The company has a publicly available sustainable seafood policy on its website, and it also provides in-store information to its seafood consumers. Ahold is also beginning to encourage consumers to avoid unsustainable species.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Ahold's red list inventory has decreased recently with the elimination of imported grouper. Greenpeace surveys identified twelve of the twenty-two red list seafood items on sale at Ahold retail banners: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, monkfish, ocean quahog, red snapper, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



## 6. Harris Teeter



Rating—6(5.8)

Policy—63.39

Initiatives—62.5

Transparency—53.5

Red list sales—11

Score—58.35

# PASS

**Banners:** Harris Teeter

**Background:** Harris Teeter is an upscale supermarket chain with over 200 stores within eight US states: Delaware, Florida, Georgia, Maryland, North Carolina, South Carolina, Tennessee, and Virginia. The company is a wholly owned subsidiary of Ruddick Corporation, which is based in Charlotte, North Carolina, and is Ruddick's most profitable company. Harris Teeter is an expanding chain that offers store enhancements like chef-prepared meals, sushi, and organic and natural products.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Harris Teeter has made admirable progress over the past year, including on-going policy development, the establishment of an online seafood information center within the company's website, and the discontinuation of orange roughy. These developments have resulted in a significant increase in the retailer's overall score. Harris Teeter remains #6 in the Carting Away the Oceans rankings, but has drastically closed the gap and is now within striking distance of the top performers in the industry.

Harris Teeter's stated goal is "to offer top quality seafood while being cognizant of the sustainability of supply, environmental impact on marine life and other species as well as social and economic impacts." Impressive recent developments suggest that this goal is indeed being taken to heart within the company.

Greenpeace encourages Harris Teeter to continue on its current trajectory by eliminating red list items from its inventory, and by augmenting its already impressive online informational center with further information, such as FAO catch areas and aquaculture information. The company could also improve substantially by taking progressive positions on key political initiatives, such as petitioning for the development of no-take marine reserves in the Ross Sea or other important areas.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Harris Teeter has a comprehensive set of sustainable seafood procurement guidelines that are regularly reviewed and revised. These guidelines cover both wild-caught and farmed seafood. The company's policy dictates that it a) source wild-caught species from suppliers of fisheries with management systems that use scientific data and b) seek out farmed seafood products with minor environmental impacts, such as domestic catfish, tilapia, and mussels.

Jennifer Thompson, spokesperson for Harris Teeter, has informed Greenpeace that the company "is committed to long-term partnerships with fishermen, communities, and suppliers that practice and support responsible fishing and sustainable management of our rivers and oceans." Additionally, the company refuses to purchase any trans-shipped product and requires providers of certain farmed products to be ACC certified. While Greenpeace does not support the ACC certification system, it does recognize the need for traceability and progress within the aquaculture sector.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:**

Harris Teeter is unique insofar as it is the first US chain to explicitly implement the Greenpeace Blacklist – the world's most comprehensive register of pirate fishing vessels – in its sourcing guidelines; the company has stated that it will not sell seafood that is traced back to any ship on the Blacklist. Harris Teeter is also in the process of developing full traceability to vessel across all seafood categories.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Harris Teeter has recently unveiled a comprehensive new online informational clearinghouse dedicated to seafood transparency. Consumers browsing the Harris Teeter website now have access to an unprecedented level of information about the seafood options sold by the company. Greenpeace applauds Harris Teeter's progress in this area and encourages the chain to continue to add information to this well-designed database.

Harris Teeter also provides consumers with information on mercury in seafood. To promote sustainable choices, Harris Teeter provides extensive training for seafood managers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** In 2010, Harris Teeter officially discontinued the sale of orange roughy, one of the most unsustainable products common to the US seafood market sector. Recent Greenpeace surveys found that Harris Teeter continues to sell eleven of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

## 7. ALDI



Rating—5(5.46)

Policy—50

Initiatives—52.5

Transparency—44

Red list sales—07

Score—54.63

# PASS

### Banners: Aldi

**Background:** The Aldi chain of supermarkets started in Germany and now operates in eighteen countries. Aldi has over 1000 stores across the United States, making it one of the largest grocery retailers in the nation.

**Greenpeace Comments:** The team at Aldi has made massive progress in the realm of sustainable seafood, much of which has only recently come to light. Aldi sells fewer red list items than any other major retailer; it is also currently developing a comprehensive seafood policy and working to improve its overall transparency.

Greenpeace applauds Aldi for its efforts thus far, and expects the chain to continue to improve in this arena. The company seems to be embracing the concept of running a major seafood operation that does not hinge on the sale of numerous unsustainable, red list items.

It should also be mentioned that while much of this increase in Aldi's overall score is due to recent developments, a portion of it is also reflective of pre-existing information which, prior to this most recent survey, Greenpeace—or Aldi customers—simply did not have access.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Aldi has a seafood sourcing policy that takes certain environmental issues into account, but has not yet made it public and has announced no plans to do so. Greenpeace has based Aldi's policy score on what information was made available by the company (cross-referenced with visible inventory.) It is likely that this score will improve as more information becomes available.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Aldi has stringent policy-driven sourcing standards to which its suppliers must conform. Additionally, Aldi is working closely with Sustainable Fisheries Partnership (SFP) and advocates for improvements within the context of certification organizations such as the MSC and GAA.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Aldi labels all non-grocery seafood products with Latin name and gear type. It was

also the first grocer in the US to introduce comprehensive FAO catch area labeling on all fresh/frozen seafood products. Aldi could continue to improve transparency by putting more effort into communicating the issues surrounding seafood sustainability to its consumers, and by increasing the overall amount of relevant information available to them.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys found Aldi sells seven of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic sea scallop, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna. Some of these items are only sold during short periods of the year; Greenpeace would urge Aldi to consider discontinuing these products altogether in favor of more sustainable options.





# 8. The Great Atlantic and Pacific Tea Company (A&P)



Rating—5(5.2)

Policy—30

Initiatives—57

Transparency—51.5

Red list sales—08

Score—51.63

## PASS

**Banners:** A&P, A&P Super Foodmart, Food Basics, The Food Emporium, Pathmark, Super Fresh, Waldbaums

**Background:** The Great Atlantic & Pacific Tea Company (A&P) is a sizeable player in the seafood retail sector that concentrates primarily in the Mid-Atlantic region of the United States. The company has recently filed for Chapter 11 bankruptcy protection, and a number of its outlets have been sold off to other retail operators in an effort to slim the company back down to fighting weight. At the time this report was written, A&P operated 395 stores under its six banners.

**Greenpeace Comments:** After re-engaging in sustainable seafood development a year ago, A&P has made some progress in certain areas (most notably transparency) but has also taken some steps backwards. Original commitments made in the areas of initiative participation have not yet come to pass, and this has brought the company's score in that area down. At the same time, A&P continues to increase the amount of information available to its customers at point-of-sale, and has made progress on removing red list species from its overall inventory.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** This is A&P's weakest area. The company does not yet have a sustainable seafood policy, but it is in the process of developing one. Based on the current inventory of the retailer, Greenpeace expects the policy will be quite strong once it comes into effect.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** A&P has leveraged its buying power to move its suppliers toward a more sustainable sourcing system. Unfortunately, new information has indicated that A&P has not met its previously stated expectations in certain levels of supplier participation, and the company's score has decreased slightly in this area. That said, A&P demands that its suppliers avoid purchasing products from vessels on the Greenpeace Blacklist, and is currently engaged in increasing and promoting overall transparency throughout the chain of custody.

A&P is a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force, as well as its Sustainable Seafood Working Group.

**Labeling & Transparency:** A&P has improved substantially in this area over the past year. The company has introduced new labeling practices that increase the amount of information available to customers at point-of-sale, including catch method (for wild fishery products) and farm-level identification (for aquaculture products). A&P also disseminates information to its customers via in-store signage, flyers, and its website.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** This is the company's strongest area. A&P's red list inventory has decreased from last year with the recent discontinuation of grouper. The company also claims to only source monkfish caught exclusively via gillnet. This is a significant step forward: due to positive stock recovery in the Atlantic, Greenpeace no longer considers non-bottom trawled monkfish to be a red list item.

A&P continues to sell eight of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 9. Price Chopper



Rating—5(4.8)

Policy—57.49

Initiatives—75.43

Transparency—40

Red list sales—14

Score—47.90

## PASS

**Banners:** Price Chopper

**Background:** Founded and managed by the Golub family, Price Chopper is a New England grocery chain with 125 stores in New York, Vermont, Connecticut, Pennsylvania, New Hampshire, and Massachusetts. Price Chopper is privately held by the Golub family and employees and, as the name suggests, offers low prices on a variety of modern amenities like artisan breads, custom-cut meats, trendy seafoods like sushi, and natural, organic, and kosher products.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Price Chopper has improved significantly since last year, making strides in initiative, participation and in discontinuing four red list species, including Chilean sea bass and shark. Greenpeace applauds this progress and expects Price Chopper to continue to improve as its sustainable seafood program evolves. Given recent progressive endeavors undertaken by the chain, Greenpeace would not be surprised to see Price Chopper emerge as a true leader within this category in the coming months and years.

Greenpeace would encourage Price Chopper to consider engaging in public support for key political initiatives, like the creation of no-take marine reserves, as an avenue for improvement. Moreover, while Greenpeace salutes Price Chopper's progress, concern remains over the number of red list species sold by the chain.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Price Chopper's sustainable seafood policy is undergoing development. Although it is on the right track, it does not yet seem to apply to certain categories within the seafood department. The policy ostensibly prohibits the company from selling certain items that are judged untraceable or too unsustainable to be justifiable, but it has not forestalled the sale of orange roughy. Greenpeace urges Price Chopper to immediately cease selling orange roughy and other particularly unsustainable species still carried by the store.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Price Chopper is building new relationships with industry partners and with NGOs in an effort to promote a more sustainable seafood operation. It has recently undertaken a project to this end in conjunction with the Sustainable Fisheries Partnership. The company is also in the process of reviewing and assessing the standards put forth by certification bodies such as the MSC and GAA.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Price Chopper does not yet sufficiently label its seafood products, but work is beginning in this area. Additionally, Price Chopper has begun to use its web presence, as well as in-store flyers, to disseminate information about seafood sustainability.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Price Chopper has improved dramatically in this area over the past year. The chain has recently ceased purchasing both shark and Chilean sea bass, and no longer sells Atlantic halibut or imported grouper. Greenpeace applauds Price Chopper for taking these actions, and strongly encourages the company to follow suit by ending the sale of equally unsustainable species like orange roughy.

Greenpeace surveys found that Price Chopper sells fourteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, hoki, monkfish, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 10. Delhaize

DELHAIZE  GROUP

Rating—5(4.8)

Policy—65.06

Initiatives—51.59

Transparency—44

Red list sales—16

Score—47.66

PASS

**Banners:** Bloom, Bottom Dollar, Food Lion, Hannaford Bros., Harveys, Kash n’Karry, Sweetbay

**Background:** Delhaize America is owned by the Belgian food retailer Delhaize Group, which has many subsidiaries, including major supermarket chains that operate over 1500 grocery stores in sixteen US states. The company is making the most of the US market trends toward organic and natural foods, especially in its Sweetbay stores that focus on healthy living and nutrition.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Delhaize continues to build upon its recently established seafood sourcing policy, particularly within the realm of aquaculture. The chain continues to participate in fishery management initiatives and is working to increase overall transparency within the chain of custody.

That being said, the retailer lags far behind many other progressive chains in its overall inventory. It is unacceptable that a chain moving such a tremendous volume of seafood continues to sell inexcusable species like Atlantic halibut, orange roughy, and sharks.

Greenpeace would strongly urge Delhaize not to go down the path of developing a seafood sourcing policy that, while comprehensive in scope, fails to prevent the chain’s sale of even the most egregiously unsustainable species (such as mako shark).

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Delhaize’s policy is still very much a work in progress, but it does cover all of the seafood sold by the chain (excepting pet foods, which may be incorporated at a later date.) The company’s policy currently states that it will “sell only seafood from fisheries that are managed by competent authorities and have a management plan in place that incorporates a science-based approach to ensure sustainability.” We are forced to question this language in the face of some of the items that are sold at Delhaize banners.

Greenpeace encourages Delhaize to revisit the language in its policy regarding capture fisheries as soon as possible and consider whether or not certain items—such as mako shark and orange roughy—should be removed from sale given the company’s pledge.

Delhaize is on track to meet its goal of sourcing 100% Aquaculture Certification Council (ACC) certified product within its aquaculture categories. While Greenpeace does not support the ACC due to numerous unresolved concerns over the efficacy of the certification organization, we do acknowledge the importance of regulation and traceability within this sector.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Delhaize has begun to pressure its suppliers to fall in line with the company’s evolving sustainable seafood policy, thus serving as a much needed lever for change within the industry as a whole. That said, this seems to be more applicable to aquaculture than capture fishery items – although the chain has taken a stand on pirate-fished seafood and refuses to purchase it.

Hannaford Brothers, one of the Delhaize banners, is currently engaged in fishery management and improvement projects with the Gulf of Maine Research Institute (GMRI). While little specific information on these projects was made available to Greenpeace, laudable goals such as reduced carbon footprints, cleaner gear types, and the sustainability of local fishing communities are being targeted.

**Labeling & Transparency:** While Delhaize has significantly increased the transparency of its seafood chain of custody, none of the retailer’s banners sufficiently label seafood products. Thus, Delhaize’s consumers are unable to avoid purchasing destructively fished species.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Even though Delhaize recently discontinued monkfish, overall inventory continues to be Delhaize’s weakest area – to the point where it begins to call into question the effectiveness of the chain’s sustainable seafood purchasing policy. Delhaize must direct its attention to eliminating red list species if it hopes to progress toward a truly sustainable seafood operation. Recent Greenpeace audits have revealed that the chain currently sells an abysmal sixteen of the twenty-two red list products: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic halibut, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, redfish, sharks, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 11. Costco



Rating—4(4.5)

Policy—50.56

Initiatives—42.5

Transparency—18.5

Red list sales—08

Score—44.89

## PASS

**Banners:** Costco

**Background:** Costco is the largest wholesale club operator in the United States and operates about 530 membership warehouse stores that sell products in bulk at below-retail prices. Costco serves more than fifty million cardholders around the globe and in forty US states.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Costco has recently announced significant improvements to its seafood operation, much to the delight of countless seafood consumers and environmentally conscientious customers across the globe. The big-box titan endured a nine month Greenpeace campaign before releasing a new seafood statement detailing a litany of progressive changes, including red list reductions, pledges to support progressive aquaculture, and the identification of the need for serious attention to the canned tuna sector.

Greenpeace congratulates Costco on taking such significant steps towards seafood sustainability, and eagerly anticipates the positive change on the water that will surely result from such a massive company beginning to address the imperiled nature of our oceans.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Costco's most recent sustainable seafood statement, released in February 2011, is a formative policy that will likely be augmented and improved in the coming months and years. Within capture fishery products, the policy strongly ties the company to the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) and eliminates numerous red list species previously sold by the company. While Greenpeace does not endorse the MSC due to numerous unresolved issues, there is no doubt that the simple act of complying with an outside certifier will lead – and indeed, has already lead – to positive change.

Aquaculture initiatives are more long-term but they, too, seem promising. The company's language indicates a pledge to pursue the ongoing Aquaculture Stewardship Council (ASC) development process, and then to push for progress and reform among its current shrimp and salmon suppliers. Given that the ASC shrimp and salmon standards are still to be finalized, Greenpeace does not yet have a position on their effectiveness. The fervent hope is that both standards can facilitate progress at a level that will make a positive impact to these industries and to the ecosystems with which they interact.



**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Costco is an active participant in dialogues with World Wildlife Fund (WWF) regarding the environmental and social impacts of shrimp aquaculture. The company has also broadened its partnership with WWF to include its wild-caught species and is currently undertaking a category-wide appraisal to discern how best to pursue further sustainable growth in this area. Beyond this, Costco defers to its main salmon supplier, Marine Harvest, to represent it within the ASC salmon aquaculture dialog, and largely supports the International Sustainable Seafood Foundation (ISSF) in the realm of canned tuna. Greenpeace has a number of concerns about both the efficacy and trajectory of the ISSF, and is hopeful that Costco's new path towards sustainable seafood will exert a positive influence on the Foundation's direction.

**Labeling & Transparency:** This is an area in which Costco still has a great deal of work to do. While the retailer should be congratulated for drafting a publicly available seafood policy, the transparency does not extend to point-of-sale. Beyond wild/farmed labeling, Costco does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** This has been an area of massive improvement for Costco over the last year. According to the company's most recent statement on this issue, it has ceased the sale of the following species: Atlantic cod, Chilean sea bass, Greenland halibut, grouper, monkfish, orange roughy, redfish, shark, skates and rays, swordfish and bluefin tuna. Greenpeace congratulates Costco on this remarkable achievement.

As significant as this announcement is, it is critical to note two points that merit further clarification. The first is that the company reserves the right to sell these species if they are able to locate product certified by the MSC. Greenpeace is concerned about this language and will maintain a high degree of vigilance to ensure that Costco does not use this clause as a back door to return to the sale of key red list items, such as orange roughy (should an orange roughy fishery ever gain MSC certification). A second point is that a number of the species indicated in the announcement were probably never sold by the retailer in the first place – bluefin tuna is a good example of this. All things considered, however, there is no doubt that the company has made a serious shift towards stocking sustainable seafood.

Recent Greenpeace surveys, as well as communications from the company, indicate that Costco continues to sell nine of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, bigeye tuna, ocean quahog, South Atlantic albacore tuna, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 12. Trader Joe's



Rating—4(4.46)

Policy—57

Initiatives—33.27

Transparency—24

Red list sales—09

Score—44.57

## PASS

**Banners:** Trader Joe's

**Background:** Trader Joe's operates more than 300 stores in at least 23 states and prides itself on offering low prices and a wide array of single-serving and prepared meals made with natural and organic ingredients. Trader Joe's buys directly from producers and offers grocery products under its own private label.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Since announcing its sustainable seafood goals in 2010, Trader Joe's has been making slow but detectable progress. The company has introduced several new seafood products that underscore the shift towards sustainable options, and reports that plans remains on track for it to make its goal of discontinuing all unsustainable seafood products by December 31, 2012.

Greenpeace is encouraged to see Trader Joe's moving forward, but hopes that some of the company's long-standing pledges – such as improvements in labeling and the establishment of NGO partnerships – come to pass sooner rather than later.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Trader Joe's seems to have an internal sustainable seafood policy in place, but the parameters are not publicly available. The overarching goal of eliminating all unsustainable seafood products before 2013 will need a high degree of attentiveness to many of the areas outlined in the Greenpeace retailer survey, such as stock health and capture method for wild fisheries, feed content and waste management for farmed products..

Greenpeace encourages Trader Joe's to offer its customers more information on the choices behind its products, and to elaborate on the benchmarks within its sourcing policy.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Trader Joe's is not formally affiliated with any retailer groups, fishing industry groups, seafood companies, third-party auditors, or environmental conservation organizations working on seafood sustainability. The company has indicated that it is observing several developing aquaculture certification systems, but is not yet prepared to adopt a single standard.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Trader Joe's does not yet sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species, but it has begun to address this issue internally. A 2010 announcement by the company detailed plans to revisit its labeling practices, but this has not yet come to fruition. Greenpeace encourages Trader Joe's to push forward in this arena, as the company is highly vertically integrated and may be more easily able to augment labeling on a large scale than other, more conventional retailers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Trader Joe's red list inventory has not changed since last year's Carting Away the Oceans report. Recent Greenpeace surveys found that Trader Joe's sells nine of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, bigeye tuna, Greenland halibut, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.





# 13. Wal-Mart



Rating—4(4.5)

Policy—45

Initiatives—50

Transparency—37

Red list sales—13

Score—44.50

## PASS

**Banners:** Walmart, Sam's Club

**Background:** Walmart is the world's largest retailer. It operates more than 7400 retail outlets in the United States and in over a dozen other countries. In addition to selling grocery items, Walmart sells clothing, electronics, toys, household merchandise, and other goods. The company espouses three main sustainability goals: to utilize 100 percent renewable energy, to create zero waste, and to sell products that sustain our natural resources.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Walmart has made progress in certain key areas of its seafood operation over the last year (and especially in the month leading up to release of this report). Unfortunately, in other areas, the chain has actually slid backwards since the 2010 iteration of Carting Away the Oceans— partially due to the reintroduction of red list species. This is a particularly worrying development due to the retailer's immense size and its tremendous draw on the world's fishery and aquaculture resources.

Walmart has only recently re-engaged in the sustainable seafood movement and its stagnation amidst the significant progress made by many other retailers has resulted in the company dropping down the rankings, from #9 in 2010 to its current rank of #13, despite its score increasing slightly.

Greenpeace is encouraged by Walmart's announcement of new sustainable seafood policy measures, and encourages the retailer to continue by strengthening these commitments beyond simple adherence to certification, and to adopt a leading role in conservation initiatives. Moreover, the company could prove an

invaluable in the development of a more sustainable canned tuna sector if it were to turn its attention to the reformation of this key seafood area. At the time of this writing, shelf-stable and grocery seafood items were not covered by Walmart's sustainable seafood policy.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** In March 2011, Walmart released an updated policy commitment that requires all suppliers to either have attained certification or have a plan to do so by June 2012. This policy applies to all fresh and frozen seafood products (although not to grocery or shelf-stable), both wild-caught and farmed.

Walmart uses the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) certification system as an indicator for sustainability of wild-caught species. The company is making progress towards its stated goal of selling only certified wild species; that said, Walmart still sells a tremendous amount of non-certified wild-caught seafood every year.

Walmart uses standards developed by the Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA) and the Aquaculture Certification Council (ACC) as a sustainability indicator for farmed products. According to communications from the company, Walmart is working with Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA) and Aquaculture Certification Council, Inc. (ACC) towards ensuring that its foreign suppliers adhere to Best Aquaculture Practices (BAP) standards.

**Sustainability Initiatives:** Walmart partners with environmental groups such as Environmental Defense Fund, Conservation International, World Wildlife Fund, and the Natural Resources Defense Council, along with dozens of other large and small organizations. Walmart also

supports the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions and its "Common Vision for Environmentally Sustainable Seafood," which aims to build an active partnership between conservation organizations and seafood retailers in support of achieving sustainable fisheries.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Walmart labels products that are MSC-certified. In 2007,

Walmart introduced natural shrimp in 500 stores nationwide, using two labels that described to consumers what they were buying with the ACC standards, both at the factory and farm levels. Since 2008, all shrimp purchased by Walmart is certified by the Aquaculture Certification Council.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** While Greenpeace celebrates the fact that Walmart has recently discontinued Chilean sea bass, it is both frustrating and baffling to learn that the chain has recently reintroduced two red list items: Greenland halibut and redfish. One step forward, two steps back, it seems.

Greenpeace surveys found that Walmart sells twelve of the twenty-two red list species: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, bigeye tuna, Greenland halibut, grouper, hoki, ocean quahog, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

# 14. H.E. Butt



Rating-4(4.4)

Policy-58.65

Initiatives-36.58

Transparency-26

Red list sales-11

Score-43.81

## PASS

**Banners:** H.E.B., Central Market

**Background:** H.E. Butt is one of the most successful privately held grocers in the country and currently operates more than 300 stores in Texas and Mexico. H-E-B takes a conventional approach to grocery retailing and is expanding its offerings of non-grocery items in order to compete with retailers like Wal-Mart, especially in urban areas like Houston, TX.

**Greenpeace Comments:** H-E-B has demonstrated impressive improvement since it finished at the very bottom of last year's Carting Away the Oceans report. H-E-B's recent survey response indicated the presence and application of a sustainable seafood policy (although it is still early in development), some participation in industry and NGO-led initiatives, and a substantial decrease in overall red list inventory. In fact, even though H-E-B is ranked #14 in this year's report, the company has leapt from an overall score of 0.8/10 in 2010 to 4.4/10 in 2011, a total increase of 3.6 points – the largest one-year shift of any company in the history of this project.

H-E-B has only recently begun to provide Greenpeace with access to the information necessary to accurately assess the company's performance in this sector. This information is critical for this project to safely move beyond its reliance on strongly precautionary conclusions. Much of H-E-B's progress reflected in this iteration of the Carting Away the Oceans report likely began some time ago, but until now, Greenpeace has been unable to acquire the relevant information.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** H-E-B has an internal sustainable seafood policy. Little is known about the policy and it appears to be undergoing development, but it has resulted in important progressive decisions, such as the elimination of orange roughy. The company claims that this policy also extends to cover shelf stable goods, such as canned tuna.

According to Dya Campos, Director of Public Affairs for H-E-B, the company's sourcing policy explicitly precludes the sale of GMO seafood. Greenpeace applauds this progressive decision on the part of H-E-B leadership and strongly encourages other retailers to follow suit in this area.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** H-E-B demands that its suppliers adhere to the company's sourcing standards, including compliance with certification organizations such as the Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA). The company also works with industry-funded groups as well as local NGOs on a host of issues related to seafood sustainability. H-E-B is currently engaged in a project aimed at reducing bycatch and unintended mortality in Gulf of Mexico shrimp fisheries.

**Labeling & Transparency:** H-E-B disseminates information on its website and in its stores concerning seafood sustainability, but does not go into depth on the detail of its sourcing policy or the products it chooses to purchase. At point of sale, H-E-B does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** H-E-B has joined the pack of progressive seafood retailers that have turned their backs on the abhorrently destructive orange roughy fisheries in New Zealand and elsewhere. A statement from H-E-B indicates that the company has discontinued the species pending the depletion of current inventory. Other species, such as shark and swordfish, seem to have been discontinued as well, but it is unclear how recently this occurred.

Information provided by the company (augmented by recent Greenpeace in-store audits) indicates that H-E-B still sells eleven of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, ocean quahog, red snapper, South Atlantic albacore tuna, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

# 15. The Kroger Company



Rating—4(4.2)

Policy—51.12

Initiatives—45

Transparency—42

Red list sales—17

Score—42.03

## PASS

**Banners:** Baker's, City Market, Dillon's, Food 4 Less, Foods Company, Fred Meyer, Fry's, Gerbes, Hilander, Jay C Food Stores, King Soopers, Kroger, Owen's, PayLess Super Markets, Quality Food Centers (QFC), Ralph's, Scott's, Smith's

**Background:** Kroger is the nation's largest grocery retailer, operating nearly 2500 stores in 31 states. In order to compete with other high-volume retailers, Kroger offers discount prices on seasonal goods, merchandise, grocery items, and perishables such as fresh seafood and organic produce.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Over the past year, Kroger has demonstrated measurable improvement in its nascent commitment to seafood sustainability. The company has dipped in the overall rankings this year, but this is largely because of the more rapid progress made by other retailers rather than by a lack of movement on the part of Kroger.

Kroger's ongoing partnership with the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) is beginning to manifest in a broadening commitment to the Marine Stewardship Council (MSC), and the company also continues to push towards a more comprehensive adoption of Global Aquaculture Alliance (GAA) aquaculture standards. While Greenpeace does not support or endorse either of these certification bodies due to a number of unresolved concerns, the organization acknowledges the importance of progress in the retailer's sourcing behavior. Greenpeace is hopeful that these partnerships will eventually result in the discontinuation of species like orange roughy and Chilean sea bass.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Kroger has now developed a sustainable seafood policy that is aimed at identifying the challenges posed by the major categories of seafood sold by the company, and subsequently at finding ways to improve these categories if necessary. The company is pushing towards certification in both capture and aquaculture categories. Greenpeace strongly urges Kroger to act sooner rather than later and to end the sale of key unsustainable species such as orange roughy, hoki, and Chilean sea bass.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Kroger is working a partnership with WWF to analyze the species carried by the chain and determine a path for progress. This work is still in early stages.

Kroger is a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force and its recently formed Sustainable Seafood Working Group. The company is engaged in the Aquaculture Dialogs, a WWF-led multi-stakeholder effort to create standards for aquaculture operations. Kroger also publicly endorses the principles of the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions' "Common Vision for Environmentally Sustainable Seafood," an initiative that aims to build an active partnership between conservation organizations and seafood retailers in support of achieving sustainable fisheries.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Kroger's new efforts to investigate its seafood supply will certainly increase transparency within the retailer's chain of custody. Kroger now offers some information on seafood sustainability on the company's website, but does not provide any significant level of in-store labeling or point-of-purchase information.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Kroger recently issued a statement announcing the discontinuation of shark (as well as bluefin tuna and marlin.) This is an important and powerful first step; after all, the company will not be able to significantly improve until it begins to remove unsustainable items from its inventory.

Greenpeace surveys found that Kroger stores still sell sixteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, hoki, monkfish, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 16. Giant Eagle



Rating-3(3.2)

Policy-33

Initiatives-37.5

Transparency-19

Red list sales-15

Score-32.38

**FAIL**



**Banners:** Giant Eagle

**Background:** Giant Eagle operates over 230 stores in four states through direct corporate ownership and franchises. The company focuses on families by providing children's play centers, express prepared meals, and the "Market District" – an in-store counter with chef-prepared fresh seafood, meats, and vegetables for convenient meals. Giant Eagle has many progressive policies concerning the environment, but it has yet to include seafood sustainability as a visible part of its efforts.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Giant Eagle has ignored multiple inquiries from Greenpeace about its seafood policies and practices. All of the information in this report is gleaned from annual reports, industry data, consumer surveys, and publicly available information.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Giant Eagle now has a publicly available "Sustainable Seafood Statement" that seems to indicate the presence of some sort of internal purchasing policy. Giant Eagle's significant score increase this year is largely based on the Statement and on other information that Greenpeace was able to obtain through its own research.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Giant Eagle recently formed a partnership with the World Wildlife Fund (WWF). Little is known about the nature or results of this partnership. Giant Eagle is also a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force, but not its Sustainable Seafood Working Group.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Giant Eagle's website provides its customers with some information on sustainable seafood through its Sustainable Seafood Statement. The company once had a comprehensive set of recommendations available to curious web browsers, but the recommendations were removed rather than updated when they were found to be out-of-date. This is lamentable, as providing such information for public view was a progressive decision.

Within the stores themselves, the company does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys found that Giant Eagle sells fifteen of the twenty-two red list seafood items: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, grouper, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp and, yellowfin tuna. Giant Eagle has historically sold shark products, but none was found in recent months by Greenpeace activists and auditors. The sale of shark may or may not have been formally truncated by Giant Eagle – Greenpeace would strongly urge the company to officially discontinue shark if it has not already done so.



# 17. Publix



Rating–2(2.2)

Policy–10

Initiatives–35

Transparency–07

Red list sales–15

Score–21.50

## FAIL



**Banners:** Publix

**Background:** Publix is the largest employee-owned supermarket chain in the United States. A fast-growing chain, Publix currently operates over 1000 supermarkets in five southern states and is quickly outpacing southern competitors like Winn-Dixie. Publix is neither a “big box” store nor a small neighborhood grocery – it offers basics like dairy, produce, deli, bakery, and meat and seafood counters, as well as an expanding line of GreenWise Market items.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Publix still has yet to implement a sustainable seafood policy. The company last year announced the creation of a “Publix seafood ranking system,” but Greenpeace could locate no information on the results of this ranking or on the system itself.

Publix does not offer any information on seafood sustainability to its customers, and responses to Greenpeace inquiries have been largely lacking in substance, providing little information on any seafood developments that may or may not be occurring within the company.

Publix sells a number of seafood species that are generally associated with serious sustainability concerns, such as shark, orange roughy, and Chilean sea bass. Publix would serve its customers, employees, and the oceans well by ceasing its support for these destructive fisheries.

All of the information in this report is gleaned from annual reports, industry data, consumer surveys, publicly available information, and Publix customer correspondence.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Publix does not have any tangible sustainable seafood policy. The “Publix seafood ranking system” was announced in May 2010, but no information on the system, its parameters, or its results has been made public. Whether or not this system has had any effect whatsoever on Publix’s seafood inventory is unknown.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Publix is working with the Sustainable Fisheries Partnership, but Publix has not shared any details of the objectives or results of this partnership with Greenpeace. Publix has also partnered with the Ocean Conservancy on certain issues, and is a member of the Food Marketing Institute’s Sustainability Task Force.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Publix does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species, and the company does not promote sustainable seafood to its customers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys and information provided by Publix customer correspondence have revealed that Publix still sells fifteen of the twenty-two red list species: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, Greenland halibut, grouper, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, shark, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.

# 18. SUPERVALU



Rating—2(1.5)

Policy—10

Initiatives—20

Transparency—10

Red list sales—18

Score—1.5

## FAIL



**Banners:** Acme, Albertson's, Biggs, Bristol Farms, Country Market, Cub Foods, Farm Fresh, Hornbacher's, Jewel-Osco, Lucky, Save-a-Lot, Shaw's, Star Market, Shop n' Save, Shoppers

**Background:** SUPERVALU is a supersized grocery retailer. Through an extensive network of subsidiaries, SUPERVALU operates more than 2500 stores nationwide. Its numerous banners ensure a SUPERVALU store format for a variety of consumer demographics—gourmet, specialty groceries, bulk and discount groceries, etc.

**Greenpeace Comments:** In the wake of recent improvements by nearly all of the company's direct competitors (including Kroger, Wal-Mart, Costco, Safeway, and Delhaize, among others), SUPERVALU has become the last nationwide retailer refusing to actively engage in seafood sustainability in any significant way. Greenpeace is extremely concerned with the company's behavior and strongly urges SUPERVALU leadership to take rapid and meaningful steps to address this situation immediately.

SUPERVALU did not respond to Greenpeace inquiries during this round of surveys. As such, all of the information in this report is gleaned from annual reports, industry data, consumer surveys, and publicly available information.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** SUPERVALU does not have a sustainable seafood policy. The company's partnership with the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) has not yet led the company to address this issue in any visible fashion.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** SUPERVALU has teamed up with WWF to investigate the company's seafood operation. Whether this has yet led to any improvements remains unknown as information on the process is not publicly available and the company's inventory remains unchanged.

SUPERVALU is a member of the Food Marketing Institute's Sustainability Task Force, although it is difficult to see that this has had any influence on the company so far.

**Labeling & Transparency:** SUPERVALU does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species, and the company does not promote sustainable seafood to its customers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys found that SUPERVALU retail banners continue to sell an abysmal eighteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, Greenland halibut, grouper, hoki, monkfish, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, redfish, shark, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



# 19. Winn-Dixie



Rating-1(1.3)

Policy-0

Initiatives-0

Transparency-0

Red list sales-12

Score-01.25

## FAIL



**Banners:** Winn-Dixie

**Background:** Since emerging from Chapter 11 bankruptcy proceedings in late 2006, Winn-Dixie has been renovating and rebuilding its grocery business. Headquartered in Florida, Winn-Dixie operates more than 500 grocery stores in the southeastern United States.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Winn-Dixie continues to ignore all inquiries from Greenpeace about its seafood policies and practices. Winn-Dixie's inaction on seafood sustainability results in its consistently low score on Greenpeace's seafood scorecard. Conscientious consumers would do well to take note of the company's disregard for seafood sustainability and to shift their purchasing dollars elsewhere. There is no reason that we should reward a company that seems bent on plundering our oceans with such callous disregard.

All of the information in this report is gleaned from annual reports, industry data, consumer surveys, and publicly available information.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Winn-Dixie does not have a sustainable seafood policy.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Winn-Dixie is not affiliated with retailer groups, fishing industry groups, seafood companies, third-party auditors, or environmental conservation organizations working on seafood sustainability.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Winn-Dixie does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species, and the company does not promote sustainable seafood to its customers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys found that Winn-Dixie sells thirteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaska pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, grouper, monkfish, ocean quahog, orange roughy, red snapper, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.





Rating-1(1.0)

Policy-0

Initiatives-0

Transparency-0

Red list sales-14

Score-1

FAIL

**Banners:** Meijer

**Background:** Meijer started as a tiny grocery shop in 1934. Today, the privately held Meijer grocery chain is one of the largest grocery retailers in the Midwest. Meijer stores are open twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week. In addition to selling groceries, Meijer offers automobile services, household goods, in-store restaurants, gas stations, and electronics.

**Greenpeace Comments:** Meijer has finally hit rock bottom. The company still has yet to offer the slightest acknowledgement of seafood sustainability in any way, shape, or form. It's not easy to perform so poorly given the growth of sustainability awareness in the US seafood sector, but Meijer has managed to soldier through, eyes closed and hands clamped firmly over ears as the company comes to rest at the very bottom of the Carting Away the Oceans rankings. Well, Meijer, congratulations – it has taken four years, five surveys, and an astounding ability to ignore reality, but you've finally done it: you are officially the least sustainable major seafood retailer in the United States.

All of the information in this report is gleaned from annual reports, industry data, consumer surveys, and publicly available information. All of the sarcasm in this report is sourced internally from frustrated activists that have run out of patience with this company's total disregard for the welfare of our oceans.

**Sustainable Seafood Policy:** Meijer does not have a sustainable seafood policy.

**Seafood Sustainability Initiatives:** Meijer is not affiliated with retailer groups, fishing industry groups, seafood companies, third-party auditors, or environmental conservation organizations working on seafood sustainability.

**Labeling & Transparency:** Meijer does not sufficiently label seafood products so that consumers can avoid purchasing destructively fished species, and the company does not promote sustainable seafood to its customers.

**Red List Seafood Sales:** Greenpeace surveys found that Meijer stores sell fourteen of the twenty-two red list seafoods: Alaskan pollock, Atlantic cod, Atlantic salmon, Atlantic sea scallops, Chilean sea bass, Greenland halibut, grouper, ocean quahog, orange roughy, redfish, South Atlantic albacore tuna, swordfish, tropical shrimp, and yellowfin tuna.



“That ranking you guys do, I hate it. It takes up so much time; it has made my life a hell of a lot more difficult. But I have to tell you, it’s working. And I want you to promise me that no matter what I say or what anyone else says, you’re not gonna stop doing it.”

—Senior seafood retail executive, name withheld.

**DON'T WORRY, WE WON'T.**

**—GREENPEACE**





FR.951







# GREENPEACE

[greenpeace.org](http://greenpeace.org)

