CaseBank:

Cases added during April 2024 (sorted by Court)

www.casebanklaw.com

INSTRUCTIONS/ELEMENTS

ac STATUTORY CONSTRUCTION

STATUTORY CONSTRUCTION

RULE - RULES OF GRAMMAR - USE OF WORD "AND"

Supreme Ct finds PC 136.1 ambigous in its use of the word "AND" and then invokes Rule of Lenity to hold that 136.1 does NOT cover dissuading a witness AFTER the case has been filed.

REYNOZA

P. v. ()

V. ()

CAL

4/22/2024

MISC -

WITNESS INTIMIDATION - 136.1(b)(2) PC - MUST HAPPEN BEFORE FILING

Supreme Ct finds PC 136.1 ambigous in its use of the word "AND" and then invokes Rule of Lenity to hold that 136.1 does NOT cover dissuading a witness AFTER the case has been filed.

RFYNO7A

P. v. ()

CAL

SENTENCING

4/22/2024

cd MOTIONS

1385

LIMITS ON - CAN'T USE TO GIVE LESSER GUN ENHANCEMENT - NOT

PC 1385 gives court authority to dismiss a PC 12022.53 gun enhancement and SUBSTITUTE a non-12022.53 gun enhancement.

McDAVID

P. v. ()

CAL

ENHANCEMENTS - SENTENCING

GUN USE - 12022.53 PC - 1385 AUTHORITY TO PICK NON-12022.53 LESSER PC 1385 gives court authority to dismiss a PC 12022.53 gun enhancement and

SUBSTITUTE a non-12022.53 gun enhancement.

McDAVID

P. v. ()

CAL

4/29/2024

4/29/2024

ee MENTAL HEARINGS

MISC - MENTAL HRGS

MISC - SETTING THE MAX TIME OF POSSIBLE HOSPITAL CONFINEMENT

Def pleads guilty to non-life crimes and to strike allegations and is then found NGI. HELD: his max time of confinement in Hospital is affected by the strike allegations — the max time is LIFE. (not 25-to-life, just LIFE).

GRAY

P. v. ()

4/4/2024

MISC - MENTAL HRGS

MISC - SETTING THE MAX TIME OF POSSIBLE HOSPITAL CONFINEMENT

2016: Def pleads guilty to crimes and to one-year prior allegations under PC 667.5(b) and is then found NGI. HELD: Even if his max time of confinement in Hospital is affected by the 667.5(b) allegations, PC 1172.75 does NOT authorize changing it.

GRAY

P. v. ()

4/4/2024

MENTAL HEARINGS

5:

dd PETITIONS TO RESENTENCE

PETITIONS TO

1172.75 PC - 667.5 PRIORS - AMENDING NGI MAX HOSPITAL TIME

2016: Def pleads guilty crimes and to one-year prior allegations under PC 667.5 (b) and is then found NGI. HELD: Even if his max time of confinement in Hospital is affected by the 667.5(b) allegations, PC 1172.75 does NOT authorize changing it.

GRAY

P. v. ()

4/4/2024

5:

4:2

d PETITIONS TO RESENTENCE

PETITIONS TO

1172.6 PC - SUMMARY DENIALS - GUILTY PLEAS AFTER SB 1437

Def took a plea bargain for Manslaughter six months AFTER SB 1437 amended 187 et seq. HELD: def is NOT eliqible for relief under PC 1172.6.

LEZAMA

P. v. ()

EVIDENCE

4:3

4:1

4/22/2024

bb

ae MISC ODDS & ENDS

ODDS & ENDS

COMPASSIONATE RELEASE - PC 1170(e)

Prisoner w/ rapidly increasing ALS requests Compassionate Release under PC 1172.2. Denied because def, a gang killer, could still "order" other gang members to do violence. REVERSED. Def was a Gang soldier, not a gang leader. No "reasonable risk" he will give orders.

LEWIS

P. v. ()

1/3/2024

HEARSAY

FIRST COMPLAINT - (FORMERLY FRESH COMPLAINT)

DCA acknowledges that "fresh complaint" became "first complaint" 30 years ago. The circumstances of the first report of being molested is relevant regardless how much time passed between the molest and the report.

FLORES

P. v. ()

4/15/2024

CaseBank:

Cases added during April 2024 (sorted by Court)

www.casebanklaw.com

CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES

RETROACTIVE

BENEFIT TO DEF - MENTAL DIVERSION - 1001.36 PC - AMENDMENTS TO

Def's request for Mental Health Diversion - PC 1001.36 - was denied. Convicted by jury. 10 days before sentencing, 1001.36 was amended to expand eligibility. HELD: Amendments to PC 1001.36 are RETROACTIVE. REMANDED for reconsideration of def's eligibility.

BROWN

P. v. ()

3/26/2024

4:1

3:

DOUBLE JEOPARDY

CONVICTED OF RELATED LESSER / RE-TRIAL ON HUNG GREATER

Def charged with Watson 187 and DUI Veh Manslaughter. Convicted of Manslaughter, jury hung on 187. HELD: because PC 191.5 is NOT a lesser to 187, Jeopardy did NOT attach to 187 count can be retried.

BAROOSHIAN

P. v. ()

4:1

MOTIONS

4/16/2024

SEARCH & SEIZURE

AUTOS / CONTAINERS

PC TO SEARCH AUTO - GANG DEF'S CAR 20 FEET FROM DETENTION SITE

911 call said group of men at location X and one of them had a gun. GANG cops arrive, one person flees, detained, and gun found on his person. Others (including def) at location ID'd as Gang members. Def patted down, no gun detected. HELD: NO PC to search def's car 20 feet away for guns.

MOSLEY

def v. SUP CT

4/5/2024

PETITIONS TO

1172.6 PC - SUMMARY DENIALS - ACTUAL KILLER - ENHANCEMENT

Original 187 complaint had co-def's. Def pled no contest to new Manslaughter complaint w/out co-defs. Def also admitted personal use and GBI enhancements. HELD: Plea and Admissions DO NOT per se establish def was actual killer. PC 1172.6 petition cannot be SUMMARILY denied.

ESTRADA

P. v. ()

4/9/2024

PETITIONS TO RESENTENCE

2:8

2:6

MOTIONS

OTHER TRIAL ISSUES

WHEELE

RCJA - DDA PREEMPT - 231.7(g) PRESUMPTIVE INVALID REASONS

DDA preempts juror X. CCP 231.7 objection. HELD: Since lack of employment is Presumptively Invalid, "lack of life experience" is pretty close and it too should be closely scrutinized by the court. Court overruled objection without explicitly finding the Presumption was overcome. REVERSED.

URIOSTEGUI

P. v. ()

4/5/2024

2:6

PETITIONS TO RESENTENCE

PETITIONS TO

1172.6 PC - SUMMARY DENIALS - PROVOCATIVE ACT CASES

Def's PC 1172.6 petition properly summarily denied. SB 1473 et al did not affect PROVOCATIVE ACT Murder cases.

CUNNINGHAM

P. v. ()

4/23/2024

INSTRUCTIONS/ELEMENTS

HOMICIDE

MALICE (IMPLIED) - DISREGARD FOR INJURY IS NOT ENOUGH

DDA argued to jury that Implied Malice is callous disregard for the likelihood of someone "getting hurt". HELD: loose talk in appellate opinions on this subject are wrong. Callous disregard for the likelihood of DEATH is required.

FAY

P. v. ()

4/29/2024

NEW TRIAL - NEW EVID

NEW EVIDENCE - CT DISCRETION TO HOLD EVID HEARING

After conviction, before sentencing, def's wife tells def atty she conspired with victim's mother to frame def. Trial ct denied Mtn for new trial without an evidentiary hrg. HELD: Abuse of discretion to not, at least, put wife on the stand before not believing her.

B. D. R.

2:1

1:5

P. v. ()

4/10/2024

SENTENCING

1/3

SENTENCING

RESTITUTION

GENERALLY - ADDING RESTITUTION AFTER PROBATION COMPLETED

Def pled to Hit-and-Run (VC 20001) and stipulated to a Restitution order for harm done by the crash. HELD: Restitution order was NOT pursuant to PC 1202.4, but was under PC 1203.1. THEREFORE, it could NOT be amended once term of probation ended.

KOONTZY

P. v. ()

4/25/2024

RESTITUTION

CRIMES - HIT-AND-RUN CASES (20001 VC)

Def pled to Hit-and-Run (VC 20001) and stipulated to a Restitution order for harm done by the crash. HELD: Restitution order was NOT pursuant to PC 1202.4, but was under PC 1203.1. THEREFORE, it could NOT be amended once term of probation ended.

KOONTZY

P. v. ()

4/25/2024

1:5

CaseBank: Cases added during April 2024 (sorted by Court)

www.casebanklaw.com

SENTENCING

SENTENCING

DIVERSION

DIVERSION - MENTALLY ILL - 1001.36 PC - ORDERING RESTITUTION

Mental Health Diversion (PC 1001.36) lasts two years. After that time runs, it is too late to add a RESTITUTION Order, even if the Diversion had not yet been formally terminated.

BERLIN

P. v. ()

1:5

RESTITUTION

MISC - ORDERING RESTITUTION TO MENTAL HEALTH DIVERSION

SPONTANEOUS DECLARATION - DELAYED REACTION TO OLD EVENT

While the precise moment of the statement was spontaneous, this case involved

a 5 year delay and the declarant agonized over the pros and cons of telling her

mother about being sexually abused. HELD: Inadmissible under Ev 1240

Mental Health Diversion (PC 1001.36) lasts two years. After that time runs, it is too late to add a RESTITUTION Order, even if the Diversion had not yet been formally terminated.

BERLIN

P. v. ()

4/26/2024

bb

JUVENILE

MISC - JUVENILE

RECORDS - SEALING OF - 781 W&I

4/26/2024

A dismissal of a Juvi petition under W&I 782 does not mean the findings never happened. Minor's later request for SEALING under W&I 781 should be denied if case involved adjudication for forcible lewd conduct per W&I 781(a)(1)(F).

TAYLOR C.

In Re ()

4/16/2024

1:3

1:3

1:5

EVIDENCE

LOZANO

HEARSAY

P. v. ()

4/10/2024