

BELVEDERE PLANNING COMMISSION

MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

January 18, 2023 6:30 P.M.

A. CALL TO ORDER OF THE REGULAR MEETING

Chair Pat Carapiet called the regular meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers. The meeting was also available via Zoom webinar. Commissioners present: Pat Carapiet, Marsha Lasky, Larry Stoehr, Ashley Johnson and Nena Hart. Commissioners Absent: Claire Slaymaker and Kevin Burke Staff present: Director of Planning and Building Irene Borba, City Attorney Ann Danforth, Associate Planner Samie Malakiman, City Clerk Leticia I Miguel and Technician Nancy Miller.

B. OPEN FORUM

This is an opportunity for any citizen to briefly address the Planning Commission on any matter that does not appear on this agenda. Upon being recognized by the Chair, please state your name, address, and limit your oral statement to no more than three minutes. Matters that appear to warrant a more-lengthy presentation or Commission consideration will be agendized for further discussion at a later meeting.

Dr. William Rothman called to give advice on microphone use during the meeting.

C. REPORTS

Commissioner Stoehr requested that the record be noted that the Draft Minutes (Item 1) are only intended to be a summary of the meeting and that the full details of the meeting may be found on the recording published on the City website.

D. CONSENT CALENDAR

MOTION: To approve the Consent Calendar as agendized below.

MOVED BY: Larry Stoehr, seconded by Nena Hart

VOTE: AYES: Pat Carapiet, Marsha Lasky, Ashley Johnson, Nena Hart,
Larry Stoehr
ABSENT: Claire Slaymaker and Kevin Burke.
ABSTAIN: None

1. Draft **Minutes of the December 14, 2022**, special meeting of the Planning Commission.

E. PUBLIC HEARINGS

2. Demolition, Design Review, Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), and Variance applications for the property located at **53 Alcatraz Avenue** (APN 060-102-55). The project proposes to demolish 56% of the 884 square-foot home, and Design Review to construct a 571 square-foot residential addition. The project would include a 555 square-foot roof deck; 267 square-feet of which would be covered with a shade trellis. The project would convert the 546 square-foot carport into a 500 square-foot, two-car garage, and convert the existing basement into a 793 square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit. New landscaping and fencing are proposed, and the existing 313 square-foot rear deck would be enlarged to 450 square-feet. A Variance is requested to expand the rear deck into the rear yard setback. Project Applicant: Toni Sutherland; Property Owner:

Toni Sutherland. *Staff recommends approval of the proposed project. Staff recommends that the project is Exempt from CEQA. Recusals: None*

Associate Planner Samie Malikaman presented the staff report. A slide show presentation accompanied his remarks.¹

Matt Petersen, project architect presented the project. A slide show accompanied his remarks.² He presented some responses to questions and comments from Commissioners at site visits prior to the meeting.³ Proposed are a reduction in the amount of lighting, some planter boxes on the deck for more privacy screening including at the area of the proposed small spa and along the adjacent public lane.

Open public hearing.

There was no public comment.

Close public hearing.

Some Commissioners expressed concern with the proposed removal of a large Oak tree, excess lighting and there was difference of opinion as to whether the contemporary design style was in keeping with the neighborhood. The consensus was support of support the requested Variance for the small deck encroachment. Also discussed was whether the applicant could consider reconfiguration of the plan to allow for the retention of the Oak tree and the elimination of the roof deck (the latter could not be supported) possibly by repositioning the Master Bedroom. All Commissioners present were unable to support the Design Review request for the project as currently presented and would like to see it come back after modification per this discussion.

The applicant agreed that the best option for the project was to request a continuance to address concerns expressed at the meeting.

MOTION: To continue the project applications for 53 Alcatraz Avenue to a future Planning Commission meeting.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Ashley Johnson.

VOTE: AYES: Pat Carapiet, Ashley Johnson, Larry Stoehr, Nena Hart
Marsha Lasky

ABSENT: Kevin Burke, Claire Slaymaker

- Public hearing to consider recommending City Council approval of an Ordinance **Amending the Belvedere Municipal Zoning Code**, Chapters 19.08 “Definitions” and 19.79 “Accessory Dwelling Units and Junior Accessory Dwelling Units”. *Staff recommends that the Commission recommend approval to the City Council of the proposed amendments and that the project is Exempt from CEQA.*

Director of Planning and Building Irene Borba presented the staff report.

Commissioners discussed the proposed amendments and asked for clarifications of some of the provisions which are changes to the current Ordinance.

¹ The slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

² The slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

³ The slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

