

BELVEDERE PLANNING COMMISSION

MINUTES

REGULAR ADJOURNED MEETING

February 28, 2023 6:30 P.M.

A. CALL TO ORDER OF THE REGULAR MEETING

Chair Pat Carapiet called the adjourned meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers. The meeting was also available via Zoom webinar. Commissioners present: Pat Carapiet, Kevin Burke, Nena Hart, and Marsha Lasky. Commissioners attending via Zoom: None. Commissioners Absent: Larry Stoehr (due to recusal on the only agenda item), Ashley Johnson and Claire Slaymaker. Staff present: Director of Planning and Building Bradley Evanson, Associate Planner Samie Malakiman, and Technician Nancy Miller. City Attorney Andrew Shen was in attendance via Zoom.

This meeting was adjourned on February 21, 2023 and recommenced on February 28, 2023.

Chair Carapiet recapped the discussion from the February 21, 2023 meeting on Item 2, **31 Cove Road**. The meeting resumed where it left off during the initial meeting where Commissioners were asking questions of the applicants.

E. PUBLIC HEARINGS

2. Demolition, Design Review, and Revocable License applications for the property located at **31 Cove Road** (APN 060-082-21). The project proposes demolition of an existing 1048 square-foot home and 310 square-foot carport, and Design Review Permit to construct a new 2,966 square-foot residence and attached two-car garage. The project would include landscape and driveway improvements. A Revocable License is required for sidewalk improvements within the Cove Road public right-of-way. *Staff recommends that the project is categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15301(l)(1) Existing Facilities, and Section 15303(a) New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures.* Project Application: David Holscher; Property Owner: Peter & Jennifer Daly. ***Recusals: Stoehr***

Commissioner Lasky inquired about the reason for the arrangement of the garage and associated stairs. Is it correct there is no way in the current design to allow for direct access to the house from the garage.

David Holscher, project architect replied that they positioned the garage to maximize the open area in the rear.

Chair Carapiet asked whether why the applicant removed the trees and vegetation on the easement side without a permit.

Mr. Daly, property owner, said they intended to do a good thing in cleaning up the area, but apparently that was a mistake. The tree company removed the plum tree without being asked to do so.

Chair Carapiet observed that the front fence is all white, where all the other homes on that side of Cove Road have natural wood fences.

Mr. Holscher replied they are considering changing that.

Jenny Daly, property owner, explained that the second floor addition will be for future visiting grandchildren. They met with the neighbors at 33 Cove Road, the McMullens during the development of the design and made several modifications in response to concerns expressed.

They believe the current application is compliant with Belvedere requirements and requests approval.

Open public hearing.

Karina Ousterhout, neighbor at 29 Cove Road, asked that the 3 windows on the side of the proposed home facing her home be reduced in size and the proposed hot tub location be reconsidered for relocation.

Roberta McMullen, 33 Cove Road, neighbor to the project, recapped previously submitted correspondence She expressed concerns with privacy impacts from the proposed home including loss of sunlight and privacy from windows facing her home, the access staircases and doors on the north side facing her property and the shadowing of the large upper story. She requested that the upper story be reduced in height, moved forward, and roof pitch lessened. She requested that the project be resubmitted with these issues addressed.

Barry McMullen, 33 Cove Road, and shared photographs relative to the story poles and shadowing from the project. He cited issues of privacy relative to windows, doors and stair placement, and the height and siting of the upper story. He and his wife agree with the recommendations of the staff report.

David Ford, resident of Tiburon spoke in support of the McMullens in regards to changes including moving the upper story forward, changing the side windows to a clerestory type on both sides, and reconfiguring the garage location so that the house access is from within the garage thereby eliminating the side stairs and doors and the impacts on privacy.

Jerry Butler, 25 Cove Road, stated that attention to protecting the existing easements behind the properties be protected for the access road and for landscaping as per agreements with the Belvedere Land Company.

No one else wished to speak.

Close public hearing.

Commissioner Lasky suggested modifications to the design including reduction of the size and height of the upper story and lower story, moving of the upper story forward, and replacement of lost trees with at least four new 24" box trees between properties in the back yard area. Additional bougainvillea plantings on the outside of the front fence will soften the appearance. Replacement of screening trees at the rear alley will hide the shopping center from view.

Commissioner Burke has reviewed the neighborhood context and the proposed home appears to be in scale with many of the more recent remodels on the street. He appreciates the siting of the home to provide larger setbacks from the road and the neighbors. The second story of the home could still be addressed such as a reduced roof slope, window modifications on both sides and possible consideration of making the exterior stairs into interior stairs. Replanting of trees at the alley and between 31 and 33 Cove Road would be supported.

Commissioner Hart stated she agrees with the staff report recommendations and her fellow Commissioners. She believes that the project can be modified to take care of the concerns of neighbors and the Commission while keeping to the size of the desired new home. There seem to be some opportunities to revise the downstairs floor plan and access from the garage into the home.

Chair Carapiet has visited the site and both neighbors' homes. As a FEMA home this will be one of the highest heights in the zone. Clerestory windows are a successful solution for side windows.

Belvedere Planning Commission Adjourned Meeting Minutes

February 28, 2023

Page 3

She agrees with her fellow Commissioners. A natural wood front fence would be her preference. She requested that the designated and required second parking be shown on the plans. Plantings that respect the easement need to be clearly called out in the landscape plan in accordance with the requirements of the easement agreement.

The applicant agreed to request a continuance tonight on this item. They requested the hearing to be at the April meeting of the Planning Commission.

MOTION: To continue the item to the April regular Planning Commission meeting for **31 Cove Road** to consider modifications to the proposed project as discussed at this meeting.

MOVED BY: Nena Hart, seconded by Kevin Burke.

VOTE: AYES: Pat Carapiet, Nena Hart, Kevin Burke and Marsha Lasky.
ABSENT: Ashley Johnson, Claire Slaymaker and Larry Stoehr.
RECUSED: Larry Stoehr.

PASSED AND APPROVED at a regular meeting of the Belvedere Planning Commission on March 21, 2023 by the following vote:

VOTE AYES: Pat Carapiet, Ashley Johnson, Larry Stoehr, Kevin Burke,
Claire Slaymaker, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: None

APPROVED: 
Pat Carapiet, Planning Commission Chair

ATTEST: 
Beth Haener, City Clerk