

# Appendix E: Review of Previous Housing Element

## Table of Contents

<b>Appendix E Review of Previous Housing Element .....</b>	<b>E-1</b>
E.1 Introduction.....	E-2
E.2 Description of Past Commitments.....	E-2
E.3 Progress in Implementation .....	E-3
E.4 Effectiveness of Programs for Special Housing Needs.....	E-4
Preservation of “At Risk” Units .....	E-19
Rehabilitation of Existing Units.....	E-19
E.4 Appropriateness in Goals, Objectives and Policies .....	E-19
E.5 Summary.....	E-19

## **E.1 Introduction**

---

California Government Code 65588(a) requires that each jurisdiction evaluate the effectiveness of the existing Housing Element, the appropriateness of the goals, objectives, and policies, and the progress in implementing the programs over the planning period of the Housing Element. This chapter includes a review of the programs of the previous Housing Element, and evaluates the degree to which these programs have been implemented during the previous planning period. This section also includes a detailed review of the City's progress toward facilitating the production of its share of the regional housing need. The findings from this evaluation have informed the City's 2023 – 2031 Housing Plan.

## **E.2 Description of Past Commitments**

---

The primary focus of The City's 2015 - 2023 Housing Element was to identify current and projected housing needs within the City of Belvedere and to identify specific implementation programs necessary to address these needs. Based on public participation in a number of community-wide meetings in 2008 as well as the evaluation by the General Plan Update Steering Committee, the following six goals were identified:

- Goal 1: Work together to achieve Belvedere's housing goals;
- Goal 2: Maintain and enhance the quality of existing housing and residential neighborhoods;
- Goal 3: Assist in the development of affordable housing to meet the needs of the community;
- Goal 4: Remove governmental constraints and encourage housing for special needs populations that is coordinated with support services;
- Goal 5: Promote energy conservation and sustainable design; and
- Goal 6: Ensure equal housing opportunity.

In order to achieve these goals, the 2015 Housing Element listed a series of policies and actions. The policies covered a range of actions, including: taking a proactive leadership role in working with housing stakeholders to achieve housing goals; encouraging construction of mixed-income projects to provide low and moderate income units; conserving existing affordable housing by continuing to regulate conversions of rental developments to condominium ownership; providing adequate sites to enable construction of new housing units, including units affordable to lower-income households; assisting in developing affordable housing; and promoting second units. The policies comply with State Housing Law guidelines.

## E.3 Progress in Implementation

The City of Belvedere's housing programs identified in the 2015-2023 Housing Element were generally implemented consistently and have been maintained during the period. These programs improved coordination between City and County departments and agencies, preserved existing housing, removed potential constraints to affordable housing, and addressed programs and services necessary to meet the housing needs of the City's residents, property owners, and other affected parties.

As a mostly built-out City, housing development in Belvedere has been modest during the 5th Cycle, with five (5) new units added to the City's housing stock, achieving approximately 31.2 percent of the City's RHNA. This indicates that residential growth was slower than anticipated, which may be in part due to high cost of land and development costs Belvedere's stable population trend, and the overall lack of financial incentives for property owners to further develop their property. Affordable to moderate-income household units that were created during the planning period included new accessory dwelling units.

Table E-1, Housing Units Produced identifies the City's 2015-2023 RHNA and all completed residential units during the period.

**Table E-1      Housing Units Produced, 2015-2023**

<i>Affordability</i>	<i>New Construction Need</i>	<i>Housing Units Produced</i>	<i>Percent Achieved</i>
Extremely Low	2	*	*
Very Low	2	0	0.0%
Low	3	0	0.0%
Moderate	4	4	100.0%
Above Moderate	5	1	20.0%
<b>TOTAL</b>	16	5	31.2%

SOURCE: HCD Annual Progress Report Dashboard (as of November 23, 2021).

NOTE: This table should be updated prior to finalization to account for units through July 1, 2022.

Overall, Goal 1 of the City's 2015 - 2023 Housing Element, achieving Belvedere's housing goals, was not accomplished. Permitted development also did not adequately provide opportunities for households at a range of income levels in accordance with Goal 3, assisting in the development of affordable housing. The permitted housing units, likewise, did not provide opportunities for housing for special needs populations as described under Goal 2.

While Belvedere promoted development and implemented many of its housing programs, the City ultimately did not achieve the 2015-2023 RHNA. The experience of Belvedere and other small communities throughout the State demonstrates that it is very difficult for local governments to meet their fair share housing goals working alone.

Throughout the 5th Cycle, the City of Belvedere has worked toward achieving the goals and objectives of the 2015-2023 Housing Element. While the majority of goals, policies, and programs included in the 2015-2023 Housing Element continue to be appropriate to address the City's housing needs, the Housing Plan has been updated to provide clearer guidance, to remove redundancies, and to provide more specific direction to encourage affordable and special needs housing.

Table E-2 discusses implementation of the 2015-2023 Housing Element programs. This table describes each program itemized by the goal that it supports, the objective of the program during the 2015-2023 period, and program's status and progress. Potential recommended revisions to programs and changes to increase the effectiveness of programs are also included to inform the 6th Cycle Housing Element Update.

## **E.4 Effectiveness of Programs for Special Housing Needs**

---

Government Code Section 65588 requires that local governments review the effectiveness of the housing element goals, policies, and related actions to meet the community's special housing needs (e.g., low income households, elderly, persons with disabilities, large households, female headed households, farmworkers, and persons experiencing homelessness). In the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Element, there were nine actions to meet the housing needs of statutorily protected groups. As shown in Table E-2, during the 2015-2023 RHNA period, the City worked diligently to continuously promote housing for special needs groups in a variety of ways by:

- Continuing to permit emergency shelters in accordance with State law and providing resources to persons seeking shelter;
- Assisting senior and lower income residents in need of housing rehabilitation;
- Assisting persons with a disability and senior residents in need of home accessibility and accommodation;
- Continuing to ensure that transitional/supportive housing be subject to the same permit processing procedures as other housing in the same zone;
- Continuing to support Belvedere facilities and programs that serve individuals experiencing homelessness. Belvedere is a member of the Richardson Bay Authority which successfully removed dangerous and non-seaworthy anchor outs in Richardson Bay by offering housing on land or berths in Sausalito. Additionally, Belvedere contributes financially every year to Marin County housing for the homeless population.
- Continuing to allow for and promoting the development of ADUs, a unique housing option well-suited to meet the needs of the City's lower-income workforce, and elderly populations. The City is working with county and other Marin Jurisdictions to develop ODDS guidelines and information regarding ADU's & JADU's, and has improved local City resources available to property owners

informing them of second unit opportunities. The City eliminated fees for secondary units, and the Belvedere's success motivating the development of second units is evidenced by the completion/finaling of 5 additional second units in the past 6 years.

- Applying for and receiving approval of SB 2 planning grant & LEAP & REAP Grants to pursue broader planning and implementation investments and facilitate compliance with the sixth-cycle Regional Housing Needs Assessment, which will expand capacity to implement programs in support of special housing needs.
- Financially supporting the work of MHA, which assists with the management of affordable housing stock. The City also maintains a list of all available affordable units in the City and updates it annually. These efforts help maintain the affordability of three deed restricted affordable housing units for low income populations.
- The City has successfully enforced the condominium conversion ordinance and preserved rental housing stock. There has not been any conversion of for-rent apartments to for sale during the period, and there have been no rental units lost during the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle.
- Supporting housing serving special needs populations. For example, the City paid for utility undergrounding for Farley Place, an affordable apartment community in Belvedere for older adults.
- Continuing to participate in local and county programs to support housing serving special needs populations.
- Assisting in maintaining the affordability of the development by contacting affordable housing developers and assisting in identifying and applying for federal, state, and local financing and subsidy programs.
- Supporting the Marin Housing Authority in implementing the home sharing program to serve extremely low and very low income populations.
- Reviewing all ordinances and modified as necessary to require new developments include units that can be adapted for use by disabled residents. Ordinances have also been reviewed and modified as necessary to require that new developments include special reduced parking standards for senior citizens and handicapped uses (BMC 19.37.070). Staff also continues to make available the SC-H Zoning Overlay for parking reductions for affordable housing and senior housing.
- Continuing to comply with all state mandated streamlining provisions for development projects, including affordable housing and multi-family rental housing development. The City is a full service organization with limited staff and resources. All efforts are made to reduce staff review time for all projects.
- Reviewing and modifying Zoning Ordinances to provide a process for individuals with disabilities to make requests for reasonable accommodations regarding relief from the various land use, zoning, or building laws, rules, policies, practices and/or procedures of the City.

The City has considered the cumulative efforts to address special housing needs and finds that many of the City's existing programs to address the community's special housing needs, particularly for lower income households, workforce, the elderly, persons experiencing homelessness, and persons with disabilities, continue to be relevant and will continue in the next planning period. Through this review, the City has identified the need to amend specific Housing Programs to more thoroughly address the needs of large households, female headed households, and to encourage new housing opportunities for all special needs groups. New programs are particularly needed to encourage the production of more housing types that serve these groups. The City will continue to review progress towards addressing these needs as part of each Housing Element Annual Progress Report.

**Table E-2 Overview of Adopted Programs**

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
<b>Goal 1: Work Together to Achieve Belvedere's Housing Goals</b>			
Program 1.1	<b>Local Government Leadership</b> Take a leadership role and collaborate on Inter-jurisdictional efforts to plan for and provide housing.	Respond to housing needs within a countywide framework	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City took a leadership role in the County-wide implementation and adoption of Objective Design Standards. Participated in the monthly Marin County Planning Directors meetings and with the Housing Working Group, both groups are designed to plan for and promote new housing opportunities across the county. For example, the City is working with County and other Marin jurisdictions to develop ODDS guidelines and information regarding ADUs &amp; JADUs.</p> <p>The City also applied for and received approval of SB 2 planning grant &amp; LEAP &amp; REAP Grants to pursue broader planning and implementation investments and facilitate compliance with the sixth-cycle Regional Housing Needs Assessment.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate.</p>
Program 1.2	<b>Identify Existing Employee Housing Opportunities</b> Work with local school districts, other public agencies, and existing businesses to assist in the provision of housing for public employees. Continue the City's program to subsidize the housing cost of City employees in an effort to recruit and retain City Staff in an expensive housing market.	Assist in the provision of housing for public employees	<p>Although no units were identified in this period, there is continued community interest to further develop and improve this program.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue and Modify</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate. As part of the 6<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element, the City plans to develop an inclusionary rental fact sheet and questionnaire for all new Accessory Dwelling Units. Program 1-B promotes this program to all property owners adding additional dwelling units. New Program 3-D involves creation of a workforce housing fund.</p>

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 1.3	<b>Work with the Marin Housing Authority</b> Continue to implement the agreement with the Marin Housing Authority (MHA) for management of the affordable housing stock in order to ensure permanent affordability.	Maintain affordability of deed restricted housing units.	Successful. The City financially supports the work of MHA and has effectively worked with the Marin Housing Authority on to maintain a list of all available affordable units in the City and update it annually. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate.
Program 1.4	<b>Conduct an Annual Housing Element Review</b> Assess the progress of Housing Element implementation through annual review by the Belvedere Planning Commission and City Council. Provide opportunities for public input and discussion, in conjunction with State requirements for a written review by April 1st of each year.	Comply with State requirements to provide annual assessment of Housing Element.	The City complies with State requirements to provide an annual assessment of Housing Element. <b>Status:</b> Continue and Modify <b>Recommendation:</b> This program will be continued but based on the progress review, establish annual work priorities for Staff, Planning Commission and City Council to consistently improve implementation of Housing Element programs.
<b>Goal 2: Maintain and Enhance the Quality of Existing Housing and Residential Neighborhoods</b>			
Program 2.1	<b>Enforce Condominium Conversion Ordinance</b> Continue to apply the Condominium Conversion Ordinance, which was adopted by the City in 1983, and regulate the conversion of rental housing to for-sale condominiums.	Regulate the conversion of for-rent apartments to for-sale condominiums through continued implementation of the ordinance	Enforcement of the ordinance has been successful. There have not been any conversion of for-rent apartments to for sale during the period. There is strong community interest to protect rental housing. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate and the ordinance will be further enforced in the future.



<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 2.2	<b>Preserve Rental Housing</b> Monitor the rental stock in Belvedere to maintain a reasonable rental stock, recognizing the need for such units to accommodate those preferring to rent or those unable to purchase homes in Belvedere.	Monitor the rental stock	Belvedere has a stable base of rental units. There is strong community support for the preservation of rental housing, and unit replacement requirements in place should any future units be lost. Rental housing has been preserved during the period.  <b>Status:</b> Continue  <b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate and rental housing will continue to be monitored in the future. Program 3-F describes the City's replacement requirements should any rental housing be lost.
Program 2.3	<b>Demolition Regulation</b> Amend the Zoning Ordinance to require the discretionary review of a demolition permit for full or partial removal of any housing unit from the City's housing stock. Under this policy, removal of a unit could include the full, physical demolition of a housing unit or any interior wall demolition that would merge two separate living units.	Preserve the number of housing units that exist in Belvedere	Belvedere has updated BMC 21.21.040 which requires that an application for a demolition permit shall not be complete until such application is accompanied by all necessary and complete applications for the proposed future development of the property.  <b>Status:</b> Complete, continue enforcement  <b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate and coupled with Program I-A which requires ADUs in newly constructed residences, housing units will be preserved and likely expanded.
Program 2.4	<b>Conduct Home Pre Sale Inspections</b> Continue to inspect all residential units prior to resale. The inspections indicate zoning violations and point out safety related matters to assure that the units are safe and conform to the Building Code.	Ensure that housing units are safe and conform to the Building Code. Inspect all residential units prior to resale.	Successful. This is an effective program as residential units are inspected prior to resale to point out safety related matters and conform to the Building Code. A total of 416 units were inspected over the 5 <sup>th</sup> cycle.  <b>Status:</b> Continue  <b>Recommendation:</b> This program continues to be appropriate.

Program	Program Description	Objectives	Progress, Status & Recommendations
<b>Goal 3: Assist in the Development of Affordable Housing to Meet the Needs of the Community</b>			
Program 3.1	<b>Provision of Adequate Sites for Affordable Housing</b> Provide adequate residential development sites to address the City's housing needs for units affordable to extremely low, very low, and low income households. Allow more intense development on residentially designated properties adjacent to commercial property.	Facilitate development on underutilized parcels adjacent to commercial areas by amending R-3 zone.	While the City continues to maintain an inventory of vacant and underutilized properties and assists developers identifying land suitable for development, the R-3 zone was not changed during the period. R-3 Rezoning was to include increased lot coverage, reduced minimum lot size, and a requirement for minimum density. <b>Status:</b> Not completed, Modify <b>Recommendation:</b> Program 2-D and 2-E describes not only the rezoning of R-3 to accommodate broader development standards, but the C-I zone will also be rezoned to a mixed-use zone, with designated minimum and maximum densities, and will include inclusionary provisions.
Program 3.2	<b>Creation of Second Units</b> A. Public Education on Second Units B. Amnesty Program for Second Units C. Financial Assistance for Second Units D. Remove Owner-Occupied Requirement E. Increase Maximum Second Unit Size F. Reduce Minimum Lot Size G. Eliminate Second Unit Application Fee	Facilitate the creation of new second units during the planning period through public education and outreach and removal of development constraints.	Belvedere, in coordination with the County of Marin and other local jurisdictions, created an ADU website and workbook in 2020-2021 utilizing SB2 planning grant funds for joint project. Belvedere has improved local City resources available to property owners informing them of second unit opportunities. City ADU ordinances have been updated to adhere with State law and will continue to be updated as required. In the last two years Belvedere has significantly improved implementation of this program as is evident by significant recent new unit development, see <b>Appendix A for more information.</b> . All aspects of this program except for Financial Assistance are in place. The City will also consider amendments to the Zoning Ordinance within one year of Housing Element adoption to create development incentives, such as a floor area bonus, to encourage the development of deed-restricted units affordable to very low and exceptionally low income households. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> Because of the importance of ADUs in Belvedere, the 6 <sup>th</sup> Cycle Element includes a suite of programs ( I-B, C, D, E, and F) that describe Belvedere's continued efforts to motivate the creation of second units. Policies to incentivize ADUs are in place and being further developed.

Program	Program Description	Objectives	Progress, Status & Recommendations
Program 3.3	<p><b>City Limit Line Modification.</b></p> <p>Work with the Belvedere Land Company (BLC) and Town of Tiburon, and the Local Agency Formation Commission (LAFCo), to potentially adjust the city limit line to create more regularly configured parcels with greater redevelopment potential.</p>	Facilitate the redevelopment of the downtown Belvedere area by removing lot line constraints.	<p>The City of Belvedere and the Town of Tiburon have and will continue to be responsive to the property owner's redevelopment intentions. Only recently has BLC provided the City with a letter outlining their redevelopment plans.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> The City of Belvedere and the Town of Tiburon recognize the need to resolve the lot line irregularities and the zoning differences that exist for the properties owned by The Belvedere Land Company along Tiburon Boulevard. Belvedere is in discussions with the property owner to align zoning and plan to work with LAFCo to facilitate a resolution of the lot lines. Program 2-D outlines the zoning changes designed to align zoning with Tiburon.</p>
Program 3.4	<p><b>Prepare Information and Conduct Outreach on Housing Issues.</b></p> <p>Coordinate with local businesses, housing advocacy groups, neighborhood groups, and participate in the Marin Consortium for Workforce Housing in building public understanding and support for workforce and special needs housing and other issues related to housing.</p>	Create broader community understanding and support for affordable and special needs housing.	<p>The City has done this on more of an as need basis depending on how new housing laws may affect Belvedere. The City conducted a housing law update 2021 which was well attended and appreciated. The City continues to use the City website for related housing information.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> The City of Belvedere is in the process of a complete overhaul of its communications and website. The City will also present more information to property owners to help them better understand their development opportunities and to assist with redevelopment programs and inclusionary housing opportunities.</p>
Program 3.5	<p><b>Establish an Affordable Housing Fee for New Market Rate Housing, Remodeling and Additions.</b></p> <p>Conduct a nexus study to evaluate the establishment of an affordable housing fee for residential projects involving one or more units and fees based on square foot basis for major remodels and additions.</p>	Create a funding source to be used to develop or rehabilitate units affordable to extremely-, low-, and very low-income households.	<p>This program was not pursued but interest remains to continue the program.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Modify</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Program I-A outlines the inclusionary housing policy the City is proposing. In addition to an Affordable Housing Fee for residential projects, In-lieu fees are proposed if the property owner opts not to construct the required affordable housing. Any fees collected will be reserved in the Affordable Housing Development Fund (Program I-H)</p>

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 3.6	<p><b>Adopt a Housing Trust Fund Ordinance</b></p> <p>Adopt a Housing Trust Fund Ordinance, specifying that monies paid into the fund (including contributions as well as Affordable Housing Fees) will be used to develop or rehabilitate units affordable to very low and low income households. Explore other streams of financing to add to or match these funds, and establish administrative guidelines for use of the funds, including the requirement to utilize a certain percentage of the Affordable Housing Fee to meet the housing needs of extremely low income households, consistent with all applicable statutory obligations.</p>	Adopt a Housing Trust Fund Ordinance that includes the requirement to utilize a certain percentage of the Affordable Housing Fee to meet the housing needs of extremely low income households.	<p>This program was not pursued but interest remains to continue the program.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Renew effort</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> This program has generated a great deal of interest and is included in Program I-H. City staff is working on the program parameters currently. The City will seek partnerships with local foundations to help seed the fund while fees are approved.</p>
Program 3.7	<p><b>Seek Federal and State funds for qualifying development projects.</b></p> <p>Apply for State and Federal monies for direct support of a proposed project that will provide low-income housing construction or rehabilitation. Upon receipt of an application for multifamily development, the City shall work with the developer to assess potential funding sources, such as, but not limited to, the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), and HOME.</p>	Identify and secure State and/or Federal funding to supplement local support for the creation of new units affordable to extremely low income households.	<p>Small cities, such as Belvedere, have limited financial and staffing resources and require substantial state and/or federal assistance, which is not available at the levels necessary to support the City's housing needs.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> While the City did not apply for any funds in the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle, Belvedere will seek the technical assistance of area non-profit housing developers and agencies to develop housing financing opportunities, including housing affordable to lower income households.</p>

Program	Program Description	Objectives	Progress, Status & Recommendations
<b>Goal 4: Remove Governmental Constraints and Encourage Housing for Special Needs Populations</b>			
Program 4.1	<p><b>Transitional and Supportive Housing, Emergency Shelters.</b></p> <p>As part of the Governmental Constraints analysis for the Housing Element update, revisions to the Belvedere Zoning Ordinance were identified as appropriate to better facilitate the provision of a variety of housing types for all households, but especially those with extremely low and very low incomes.</p>	Amend the Zoning Ordinance to allow transitional and supportive housing, community care facilities, and manufactured housing in residential zoning districts, SROs in the Commercial (C-I) zoning district, and emergency shelters in the Recreation (R) zoning district	<p>In 2014 zoning ordinances were amended to allow transitional and supportive housing, community care facilities, and manufactured housing in all residential zoning districts. Additionally, the C-I zone was amended to allow SROs as a permitted use.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Completed</p> <p>Further amendments to comply with State law are described in Program 2-C.</p>
Program 4.2	<p><b>Participate in multi-jurisdictional efforts to provide emergency shelters for Marin County's homeless population.</b></p> <p>In addition to meeting the legal requirements of Senate Bill 2, the City of Belvedere will also seek to participate in regional solutions to providing emergency shelter for homeless families and individuals.</p>	Assist with funding for the construction of new facilities and/or the expansion of existing facilities to serve the homeless	<p>Belvedere is a significant participant and contributor to facilities that serve individuals experiencing homelessness. The Richardson Bay Authority (Belvedere is a member) has been successful in removing dangerous and non-seaworthy anchor outs in Richardson Bay by offering housing on land or berths in Sausalito. Additionally, Belvedere contributes every year financially to Marin County housing for the homeless population. As described above in Program 4.1, The City has amended zoning to permit emergency shelters and development standards to facilitate their development.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Belvedere will continue to participate in county programs to help fund emergency shelters to serve individuals experiencing homelessness (see Program 3-H)</p>

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 4.3	<p><b>Assure Good Neighborhood Relations Involving Emergency Shelters and Residential Care Facilities.</b></p> <p>Encourage positive relations between neighborhoods and providers of emergency shelters and residential care facilities. Providers or sponsors of emergency shelters, transitional housing programs and community care facilities will be encouraged to establish outreach programs with their neighborhoods.</p>	<p>Ensure that housing serving special needs populations is an integrated part of the community and a good neighbor to traditional residential uses.</p>	<p>Belvedere actively supports housing serving special needs populations. As example, the City has paid Farley Place's share for utility undergrounding. Belvedere residents have a history of support for housing that serves lower income populations; local support by individuals and the Belvedere Community Foundation provided needed funds to ensure this senior housing would be developed. 3 deed-restricted units are restricted in perpetuity.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Belvedere will continue to participate in local and county programs to support housing serving special needs populations and assist in maintaining the affordability of the development by contacting affordable housing developers and assisting in identifying and applying for federal, state, and local financing and subsidy programs.</p>
Program 4.4	<p><b>Engage in Countywide Efforts to Address Homeless Needs.</b></p> <p>Actively engage with other jurisdictions in Marin to provide additional housing and other options for the homeless, supporting and implementing Continuum of Care actions in response to the needs of homeless families and individuals. Participate and allocate funds, as appropriate, for County and non profit programs providing emergency shelter and related counseling services.</p>	<p>Participate in finding solutions to homelessness in Marin County.</p>	<p>As described in Program 4.2, Belvedere is a significant participant and contributor to facilities that serve individuals experiencing homelessness. The Richardson Bay Authority (Belvedere is a member) has been successful in removing dangerous and non-seaworthy anchor outs in Richardson Bay by offering housing on land or berths in Sausalito. Additionally, Belvedere contributes every year to the Marin County homeless programs and services. Belvedere does not currently have any unsheltered people.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Belvedere will continue to participate in county programs to fund development of facilities to serve individuals experiencing homelessness.</p>

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 4.5	<p><b>Create Home sharing and Tenant Matching Opportunities.</b></p> <p>Continue the City's relationship with organizations such as the Marin Housing Authority in implementing the home sharing program to serve extremely low and very low income populations. Advertise program availability through the City's website and materials available in City Hall.</p>	<p>Create opportunities for those who need housing (including those with very low and extremely low incomes) to be matched up with those who have it to offer.</p>	<p>Belvedere maintains a good working relationship with the Marin Housing Authority in implementing the home sharing program to serve extremely low and very low income populations.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Advertise program availability through the City's website, local media, and materials available in City Hall.</p>
Program 4.6	<p><b>Adaptable Units for the Disabled.</b></p> <p>Ensure that new housing construction can include units that can be adapted for use by disabled residents, if desired. Designing the units for adaptability could include the inclusion of structural members that will allow for the installation of grab bars, the installation of electrical outlets at a height that is easier to reach, or similar measures.</p>	<p>Support the development of new housing that includes units that can be adapted for use by disabled residents.</p>	<p>Belvedere has reviewed all ordinances and modified as necessary to require new developments include units that can be adapted for use by disabled residents.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Completed, but continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Continue to review ordinances to ensure new housing construction can include units that can be adapted for use by disabled residents (see Program 3-G)</p>

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 4.7	<b>Parking Reductions</b> Maintain reduction of parking standards for multi-family residential units deed-restricted to use by seniors and/or disabled persons to facilitate the creation of small units at a higher density through use of the Senior Citizen/Handicapped Overlay. Allow alternative parking standards for non-age restricted affordable projects as provided for under state density bonus law.	Develop parking standards for units dedicated for use by seniors or disabled individuals. Provide parking reductions for affordable projects through State density bonus provisions.	Belvedere has reviewed all ordinances and modified as necessary to require new developments include special reduced parking standards for seniors citizens and handicapped uses (BMC 19.37.070). Staff also continues to make available the SC-H Zoning Overlay for parking reductions for affordable housing and senior housing. <b>Status:</b> Completed <b>Recommendation:</b> Continue to review ordinances to ensure new housing construction is not constrained by parking regulations. These changes are included in Program 2-C
Program 4.8	<b>Fee Reductions for Affordable Housing</b> Develop a reduced fees schedule to encourage the development of affordable housing to serve extremely low and very low income populations.	Provide reduced fees to encourage the development of affordable housing affordable to extremely low, very low, and low income households.	Belvedere currently does not charge any planning fees for secondary units. This program was not pursued beyond the application of reduced fees for secondary units which is specifically relevant for Belvedere. Interest remains high to continue and further develop the program. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> The waiving or reduction of fees will be further supported by the City's Affordable Housing Fee Trust Fund. The City shall promote the benefits of this program to the development community by posting information on its web page and creating a handout to be distributed with land development applications. Promotion of assistance is included in Program I-I.
Program 4.9	<b>Assist in the Effective Use of Available Rental Assistance Programs</b> Develop and implement measures to make full use of available rental assistance programs for lower income households, but especially those in the extremely low and very low income categories.	Encourage the full use of available rental assistance programs for households with extremely low, very low, and low income	This program was not pursued but interest remains to continue the program. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> Encourage owners of new rental units to accept some Section 8 certificates. Maintain descriptions of current programs to hand out to interested persons. Provide funding support, as appropriate. Coordinate with the Marin Housing Authority on rental housing assistance programs such as Shelter Plus Care, AB 2034, HOPWA, the Rental Assistance, Rental Deposit Program, and Welfare to Work Program.



<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 4.10	<b>Streamline Permit Processing for Multi-family rental projects</b> Expedite the permit processing timeframe for new multi-family rental projects and aim to reduce the typical processing time from 48 to 24 weeks.	Reduce the Staff review time for multi-family rental projects.	Belvedere complies with all state mandated streamlining provisions. The City is a full service organization with limited staff and resources. All efforts are made to reduce staff review time for all projects, including multi-family rental projects. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> Continue to follow CA streamlining provisions for all housing applications. Review policies and procedures to ensure the timely review of multi-unit rental projects. Program 2-L addresses streamlining requirements of SB 35 and SB 330.
<b>Goal 5: Promote Energy Conservation and Sustainable Design</b>			
Program 5.1	<b>Energy Conservation, Smart Growth and Sustainable Design</b> Through its work with the Marin Climate and Energy Partnership (MCEP), Belvedere will be taking a number of significant actions towards becoming a sustainable city in the near future.	Create a more sustainable community.	Belvedere has adopted its 2030 General Plan along with the accompanying Climate Action Plan which will implement land use and conservation strategies to address energy conservation and climate change, implement new initiatives to foster the community's environmental sustainability, and promote new energy conservation programs. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> The City will continue to work with Marin Climate Energy Partnership as it implements provisions and goals outlined in the Climate Action Plan.
Program 5.2	<b>Implement Rehabilitation and Energy Loan Programs</b> Coordinate with the Marin Housing Authority and PG&E to make available loan programs to eligible owner- and renter-occupied housing for improvements to housing units and for energy conservation measures.	Increase the energy efficiency of existing residential units.	The City continues to coordinate with the Marin Housing Authority and PG&E to make available loan programs. <b>Status:</b> Continue <b>Recommendation:</b> Advertise program availability through the City's website and materials available in City Hall.
<b>Goal 6: Ensure Equal Housing Opportunity</b>			

<i>Program</i>	<i>Program Description</i>	<i>Objectives</i>	<i>Progress, Status &amp; Recommendations</i>
Program 6.1	<p><b>Respond to Housing Discrimination Complaints</b></p> <p>Provide information regarding equal housing opportunity at the public counter in City Hall and on the City's website. The City Manager is the designated Equal Opportunity Coordinator in Belvedere with responsibility to investigate and deal appropriately with complaints.</p>	Ensure fair access to housing for all segments of the community.	<p>The City Manager is the designated Equal Opportunity Coordinator, and the City refers complaints to the appropriate legal service, county, or state agency or Fair Housing Advocates of Marin.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Continue</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> Continue to provide information regarding equal housing opportunity at the public counter in City Hall, in local media, and on the City's website. Refer discrimination complaints to the appropriate legal service, county, or state agency or Fair Housing Advocates of Northern California (FHANC). Discrimination complaints will be referred to Fair Housing Advocates of Northern Marin, the Marin Housing Authority, Legal Aid, HUD, or the California Department of Fair Employment and Housing, as appropriate. Information regarding the housing discrimination complaint referral process will be posted on the City's website.</p>
Program 6.2	<p><b>Reasonable Accommodation</b></p> <p>Amend the Zoning Ordinance to provide individuals with disabilities reasonable accommodations in rules, policies, practices and procedures that may be necessary to ensure equal access to housing.</p>	Ensure fair access to housing for all segments of the community.	<p>The City has reviewed and modified Zoning Ordinances to provide a process for individuals with disabilities to make requests for reasonable accommodations in regard to relief from the various land use, zoning, or building laws, rules, policies, practices and/or procedures of the City.</p> <p><b>Status:</b> Complete</p> <p>Program 3-G commits the City to confirming compliance with Reasonable Accommodation procedures.</p>

SOURCE: City of Belvedere

## **PRESERVATION OF “AT RISK” UNITS**

According to the 2015 Housing Element, there was no affordable project at risk of converting to market rate within 10 years from the beginning of the 2015–2023 planning period.

## **REHABILITATION OF EXISTING UNITS**

The City identified no housing units in need of rehabilitation in the 2015–2023 planning period.

## **E.4 Appropriateness in Goals, Objectives and Policies**

---

The goals, objectives, and policies identified in the 2015 Housing Element were appropriate for the 2015-2023 timeframe because they directly related to the program requirements listed by the California Department of Housing and Community Development.

The greatest progress made in producing housing was in the *Moderate-Income* category, where the City permitted 100 percent of the needed units. The City permitted none of its needed very low- or low-income units. As was the case in prior years, the cost of land and housing construction remained high in Belvedere, making affordable housing difficult to develop in the Belvedere market.

## **E.5 Summary**

---

Like many communities, the City of Belvedere experienced less development than expected in its 2015–2023 planning period. Of the 16 units it identified in its table of quantified housing objectives (incorporated into Table 42 starting on page 119 of the 2015 Housing Element), the City permitted only five (5) units (approximately 31 percent), all of them for moderate- or above moderate-income households.

Nonetheless, the goals, objectives, policies, and actions in the 2015–2023 Housing Element complied with State Housing Law that was in effect at the time and provided proper guidance for housing development in the City. In the 2023-2031 Housing Element update, objectives for each of the goals will be modified as appropriate to more specifically respond to the housing environment in Belvedere. Policies will also be modified as needed to respond to current Housing Element Law and existing and anticipated residential development conditions.