

**Design Review Board
March 19, 2024, 9:00 a.m.
LTV Studios 75 Industrial Road
Wainscott, New York 11975**

Those Present Were:

Robert Caruso, Chair
Kristin Corwin, Vice-Chair
E. Ann Duffey, Member
Susan F. Davies, Member
Kathryn Davis, Member
Heather Baris, Member
Gabrielle McKay, Village Deputy Clerk
Jared Mandel, Architect for White's Apothecary – 81 Main Street
Eric Clemente, NSE Windows Managing Partner for White's Apothecary – 81 Main Street
Michael Giangrande, Marvin Representative for White's Apothecary – 81 Main Street
Steve Garland, Agent for 55 Newtown Lane The Condo Owners Association – 110 Park Place

Those Absent Were:

C. Sherrill Dayton, Member

Robert Caruso : Good morning and welcome everyone. I call to order the Design Review Board for Tuesday, March 19th, 2024.

Minutes

Robert Caruso : The first item on our agenda are the minutes of **January 16th, 2024**. Are there any corrections or questions?

Susan F. Davies : I have a correction.

Robert Caruso : Oh, sure.

Susan F. Davies : The pages aren't numbered, unfortunately, but on the portion for the East Hampton Square Associates, LLC where the Committee was appointed.

Robert Caruso : Yes.

Susan F. Davies : It's myself and not Heather Baris, it's Kathryn Davis.

Robert Caruso : Okay.

Susan F. Davies : So that...

Eric Clemente: Nice to meet you. Um, the profile is within, actually, Mike is here from Marvin. The profile for the windows between the clad and the wood is reasonably...essentially identical. What Marvin has sought out to do over the many years in manufacturing, is essentially tailored to a historical and classical design. As we all know, there's particularly nothing out there that is as beautiful as a wood window. But we all understand and know, with that being said, that the maintenance costs and the durability is sometimes diminished. And so Marvin has spent many, many years in research and development to essentially develop a window that's essentially identical to a wood window, but it allows it to withstand the test of time. And what we've seen over many years of working with these windows is that they essentially fit the bill, right? They fit the bill for keeping the design, the beautification of what we want, because we know that no window is designed like that, while also maintaining the position of aesthetics that we look for. It even comes down to the coloring that is on the windows, uh, they don't have a sheen or a gloss to them, right, uh, so they essentially keep the same look, the same feel.

Robert Caruso : The same matte finish.

Eric Clemente: The same the same matte finish. This is a sample of the color swatches, if you'd like to see,

Michael Giangrande: Um, this window right here, this sample, although it's black, we'll kind of show you how matte the finish is. The entire concept of this window is to mimic the look of wood. So, this one has an historical casing on it, but you'll see the bottom rail is going to be tall. You can have this little sill. When the sunlight hits the cladding, whether it's black, white or color, you don't get that reflection, kind of absorbs the light.

Robert Caruso: So, I'm sorry...so we're talking double insulated glass. Is that what we're talking about? So, it's not true divided light, so it's just, um, you know...

Jared Mandel: Well, uh, simulated divided light.

Robert Caruso: Simulated divided. Yeah. Because it can't have. Yeah. Well, it could, uh, could. Well, it does, doesn't it? Yeah.

Michael Giangrande: Yeah. Typically, you find that in a wood window which can be done, but even then, true divided light, meaning six individual panes of insulated glass and the sash for any manufacturer can be problematic. You have, you know, instead of one possibility of steel fail, you have six.

Robert Caruso : So, six over six, is that the configuration?

Eric Clemente: For this particular project, they're clear.

Robert Caruso: Are they six over six?

Eric Clemente: Sorry. Yeah, they're four...they're four over zero.

Robert Caruso : Four over zero, okay.

Jared Mandel: Regarding the appearance from the outside, the only way you'd really be able to see the profile is if you look closely at the glass and looked and saw that.

Robert Caruso : Yes, I see them. Okay.

Kristin Corwin: So, what is it? It's made out of the extruded aluminum?

Michael Giangrande: Well, it's a wood window, and the aluminum is just on the exterior to protect...to protect the wood.

Robert Caruso : But it's a composite? Am I correct, a composite...a composite window, or no?

Michael Giangrande: I believe, uh, elsewhere on the project, there is fiberglass.

Eric Clemente: On the...Uh, elsewhere in the project, uh...

Robert Caruso : The side windows.

Eric Clemente: ...using composite. But the front would be aluminum.

Robert Caruso : So this is aluminum?

Eric Clemente: Extruded aluminum.

Robert Caruso : Okay.

Kathryn Davis: So that's what you have here?

Michael Giangrande: Yes.

Robert Caruso : Okay.

Eric Clemente: As a matter of fact, do you have your phone for a second? Uh, Jared, I had that case study. (Jared Mandel provided Eric Clemente with his phone) This was in particular a job that was done as a feature in a in a local area, local district that you guys may be familiar with in Sag Harbor.

Robert Caruso : Oh, okay.

Kathryn Davis: You included that in the...

Eric Clemente: I'm sorry?

Kathryn Davis: Isn't that included in the material?

E. Ann Duffey: Yes.

Kathryn Davis: The Sag Harbor project?

Jared Mandel: I'm sorry.

Kathryn Davis: Is it in the materials?

Eric Clemente: Yes, it's in the material, yeah. So, um, one of the features of that study, let me just pull that up right here, was the historical church, and in doing so, it was very important to that district to keep that look. Um, but again, it was important to be able to use something that, again, was long lasting. And you know, we look to be able to keep that consistency and, you know, that that idea and that mindset.

Robert Caruso : You did use the extruded aluminum on that?

Eric Clemente: Yes, sir.

Robert Caruso : All right. Well, thank you.

Kristin Corwin: What's the cost differential? Is it a lot less expensive?

Eric Clemente: So, the cost differential up front could be anywhere from 20 to 40%, but in doing so there's additional cost in maintenance. These windows are essentially created to be maintenance free, which allows the Village to ensure that, you know, generations thereafter can allow something to deteriorate per se. Um, so, uh, I guess it's...we're unable to put a number on that, but we can tell you that it's going to be...they, you know, they will be no maintenance costs for a very long time.

Robert Caruso : And the aluminum, it doesn't like, you know, after a while when you have a metal material on, I don't care what it is, after a while it sort of blisters, or it gets...from the moisture in the water over years and years...Does that happen to this material?

Michael Giangrande: It really doesn't. We use a Kynar, you probably heard the term Kynar. We use a 70% Kynar, which if AMA rates the window, it's a 2605 rating. So, the color retention is...the human eye after 20 years, can barely perceive the difference if you were to take a swatch of the original and put it next to it.

Robert Caruso : And as a maintenance thing, does it have to be...for the owner there, does it have to be repainted after like five years or you paint it once and it's good for how long then?

Jared Mandel: Well it's warranty for 20 years. Um, but we've seen that it lasts way longer than that.

Robert Caruso : You have?

E. Ann Duffey: But this is factory color, it's not painted again once it's on site, it's factory. It's a factory...

Eric Clemente: And the aluminum is a plane grade aluminum. So, you know, I'm sure we've all flown many times as we go onto the plane, you could see the plane that's been flying through the air thousands and thousands of miles. We all know that those planes aren't repainted over and over, and those planes always look clean. Essentially, this is the same type of finish and the same type of material.

E. Ann Duffey: Is this the color that you set?

Eric Clemente: That's the stone white, yes.

E. Ann Duffey: This is the color you're planning to use?

Susan F. Davies : On the windows or on the siding?

Eric Clemente: The windows.

Susan F. Davies : And the siding is?

Bill Hajek: This is the windows on the second floor, but this is the entire storefront as well, right? It's the whole storefront.

Robert Caruso : So is this white or is it...do I see gray in this? Is this white?

E. Ann Duffey: It's an off-white.

Michael Giangrande: It's stone white. Um, they used to be two whites, one was arctic white, but it almost gave a bluish tint.

Robert Caruso : Oh, we don't want that.

Michael Giangrande: Which typically people didn't want for historic. So, that color is what matches typical painted white windows.

Robert Caruso : So now when the building is completely finished now, when we walk and we look at the front of the building, would it all read as white?

Eric Clemente: Yes.

Robert Caruso : And the buildings next to it, will it look white like they're white, or is it going to be an off-white?

Michael Giangrande: Uh, well, this is attached to the...

Jared Mandel: The storefront would be PVC right on the storefront itself.

Eric Clemente: Correct. It would be the PVC material to identically match the wood material. Again, it's something that would be a synthetic material that we would be able to replicate what's existing there. Um, that would be impervious to the elements. It's an inorganic that has been developed to I guess battle the rot, warp, cracking, splintering, molding, things of that nature, right.

Kathryn Davis: But the real reason is the cost?

Eric Clemente: No, absolutely not. The real reason is, again, maintenance, you know, from wood that, you see, the wood that's created today to what was created in the 1950s, the two very conceptually different woods. The woods that are created today have extremely large differences in the aesthetics, in the strength and in the durability. Uh, it's no longer created with tight knots. And you have that strength, and you have that natural resistance to bugs and things of that nature. Um, so we're looking to put a material again for the benefit that we both see as the owners as well as the Village, something that's going to be long lasting, withstanding that we can match identically to what's there in wood.

Robert Caruso : Because the reason for that is the way the wood is produced today, it's not old wood and the trees and everything, it's completely different. So, then you would have to use something like mahogany or something like this that is more...I mean that is maintenance free, but you'd have to use mahogany and not pine. Because pine is...pine is a waste of time.

Eric Clemente: Pine is so soft that if the snowplows came through and a rock hit it, it would chip it and it would just become something that would rot and warp over time.

Robert Caruso : I know this from my own thing. Yeah, Poplar isn't any good either, you have to use mahogany or teak.

Michael Giangrande: Even dug fir.

Eric Clemente: But it doesn't have the rich, the richness. So, if we could use a PVC type of material, um, that we could, we could mimic exactly what's there. Um, we're essentially being able to put in something that will last forever, that will be maintenance free, and that maintains the look and aesthetic that we're looking for.

E. Ann Duffey: And you're copying the profiles?

Eric Clemente: I'm sorry?

E. Ann Duffey: You're copying the profiles that are there.

Eric Clemente: Yes, the idea would be to copy.

Kathryn Davis: They're getting rid of wood.

Robert Caruso : Yes. I actually think it'll look better without that one. Uh, yeah. Billy, any input on the, uh, on the vinyl for the verticals? What is your opinion? No. Okay. All right.

Susan F. Davies : Aren't the guidelines for the historic buildings that they have to be put in the same kind of material to be restored and not...I mean sure everything evolves, but wood is wood and...

Eric Clemente: The guidelines are great. We actually agree with the guidelines. Um, we just disagree with the material that's used. So, we want to be able to use material that is long lasting. Um, and that is essentially maintenance free, that we can keep the aesthetic. If we decide to go with the, with the pine material, um, or a soft wood, we can ensure that, you know, we're not going to be able to maintain the look and feel that we need. Um, so we're actually...with PVC, we're probably going to go in a direction where it's going to actually keep its beautification longer than what we were expecting.

Robert Caruso : Well, Board members, uh, it's your decision. What would you like to do here? Now, I think since it's a Historic District, uh, I think one of the most important things is that all the front of the building is all wood, am I correct?

Eric Clemente: The side is, yes.

Robert Caruso : Okay. Tom, what is your opinion?

E. Ann Duffey: So, all the facial board is wood?

Robert Caruso: About the windows? What do you...I mean.

Tom Preiato: I don't really have a stance on it.

Kathryn Davis: I don't know if I feel comfortable approving changing all the wood to vinyl.

Susan F. Davies : The upstairs...on the upstairs, fine, but downstairs, I think it should stay.

Robert Caruso : I think so too, yes. And what is your, Ann, what is your opinion about the total?

E. Ann Duffey: Personally, I think you're going to have a maintenance issue that's worse for the Village than...

Robert Caruso : Okay, okay. And I'm sorry, Kristen, we are setting a precedent.

Kristin Corwin: I know, I mean, if we approve this, then everybody's going to want to change to PVC.

Kathryn Davis: I think it's setting a precedent that...

4426

Robert Caruso : Yeah, think my own opinion is that once we start doing this and we have windows on the top different, we're going to have things on the bottom different. And then the buildings next door and then all the Historic Districts, it's going to create a problem. Um, so I think what we'll have to do is we're going to have to say that you'll have to stay with, if it's okay with the Board, the wood material, the wood materials?

Michael Giangrande: Inside and outside?

Robert Caruso : Yeah. Because it's, uh...

Kristin Corwin: Well just on the first floor.

Kathryn Davis: The storefront.

Robert Caruso : Yeah, just the storefront.

Kathryn Davis: I think when you buy a historic building, you know what you're getting into.

Robert Caruso : I think that Kate has a very good point. You're getting...this is, you know, what are we really talking about, maintenance? I mean, it's really...it's not that horrible. I mean, they're basically new windows, right? They're new windows, so it's not like they're 100 years old, you know.

Michael Giangrande: And the wood has a preservative that keeps it from...

Robert Caruso : I would have to say...I would have to say for the owner...and I, if I was the owner, for a 20% increase, we're not talking about an 80% increase, but for a 20% increase, I don't really think it's outrageous to expect to pay for that, cost wise.

Eric Clemente: It's more than that, though, it's triple. For the storefront, it's triple.

Robert Caruso : Yeah, okay. But it is one portion of the building. We're allowing the sides and...okay. So, I think let's go ahead and stay with the wood, as described, wood everywhere.

E. Ann Duffey: What about first floor?

Susan F. Davies : And what about the design, do we want the design to stay the same?

Kathryn Davis: I thought we had said that the design was staying...

Susan F. Davies : The drawing is not staying the same, that's submitted.

Bill Hajek: I think the last time this was approved, the Board, or reviewed and approved, the Board approved the changed design of the storefront windows, but I think that was probably due to the fact that it was all going to be a wood product.

Robert Caruso : That's right. So, we're going to stay with the wood product and we're going to stay with the design. Okay. All right. Uh, any other questions. So, this is what we're going to do.

Kristin Corwin: Which design are you going to stay with, the original?

Robert Caruso : Original, yeah. Original. Yes, okay.

Kristin Corwin: Not what's...not here. So this...this one this or this? (referring to the plans approved previously as well as the plans provided with the more recent application).

Bill Hajek: So, I...my understanding is that they're proposing the three panels with the divides on top.

Robert Caruso : Yes.

Bill Hajek: And that's...the Board is asking for that to be wood. If you want it to stay exactly the way it currently is right now, then that's a different...

E. Ann Duffey: But we already approved it.

Bill Hajek: Yes. You already approved it this way, correct.

Robert Caruso : We're going to stay with...

Bill Hajek: The request was just to change it from wood to the aluminum.

Robert Caruso : So, we're going to stay with what we approved and we're going to insist that everything be out of wood.

E. Ann Duffey: Right, for the storefront.

Robert Caruso : With the storefront. So, do I have a motion to approve this as it's...we're going to do this, uh, or are you going to come back now again?

Jared Mandel: Uh, there's not much more to present at this point.

Robert Caruso : Billy.

Bill Hajek: We just...I would suggest that the Board, if the Board's going to approve it, it be approved, conditioned on submission of plans that reflect this conversation, which is how it was approved last time that they were going to come back with plans showing all details on the wood products.

Robert Caruso : So why don't you do that and come back with everything and then we'll go over it.

Jared Mandel: The only change that there would be is that the upper windows being clad.

Bill Hajek: But I feel comfortable reviewing those for the Board if you would like me to.

Kathryn Davis: I thought we were saying that the entire front of this store has to be in wood, because we don't want to set a precedent for the Village.

Bill Hajek: It already... Yeah. So, the detail around the doors, they're going to...

Kathryn Davis: And we feel comfortable splitting buildings up like that? I understand on the sides we said PVC was fine, but for the whole front, we don't want the rest of the Village saying that they can change all their historic buildings and do half wood, half vinyl. Don't we want to keep the whole facade?

Robert Caruso : I think we want to keep the upstairs windows in the wood, but the whole thing. Okay, because we're not...once we start piecemealing things together, it's a very bad idea.

Bill Hajek: It's the Board's call.

Robert Caruso : Okay, so, you'll come back with the proper plans. You're going to come back.

Jared Mandel: We're already approved for what we're talking about right now. Okay. So, what we're requesting is a little bit of relief, at least for the second floor, because the eye may be a little bit further away, as the Board discussed, and that the paint would be the same or the appearance of this window. I think we kind of got past, I thought we did the, the part of that...the upper portion would look the same, whether it was in wood or another material, it's still the same finish, nothing's going to change. So, at that point, if you're on the second floor, if you're looking up at the second floor, nothing is going to change.

Kathryn Davis: It's not the same material because wood would be painted, and the clad windows are factory made.

Robert Caruso : She's totally correct.

Jared Mandel: The color would be the same exact color.

Robert Caruso : Yes, but it's not...it's aluminum, right?

Kathryn Davis: It doesn't look the same as paint. If you put a painted window next to a factory made clad aluminum window.

Susan F. Davies : Would it look different?

Eric Clemente: If we, um, if we were able to exhibit to the Board a wood and an aluminum side by side comparison, unbeknownst to which material, um, are we certain that we would be able to choose which one was which?

Robert Caruso : No, no, I, I feel that this is a Historic District, and we have to maintain the status quo, that it's going to be wood.

Jared Mandel: So, what would be the approach then at this point? Can we, um, can we essentially adjourn at this point? And then...because we're going with the old application, we can adjourn right now and have time to present further clarity. I know that we may not stand a chance or stand a chance.

Robert Caruso : Okay, look, we've already discussed it. It's all going to be wood, the Board members, this is what we all want to do. We can't have a juxtaposition of aluminum and vinyl, and let's just stay with wood. It's only the front, we're giving you relief with the sides, and we can't have people in all the Historic Districts do a juxtaposition of "well, that window over there on the right, on the top because people won't see it is okay, and then we that went over there, nobody will see, so that's okay". And once we have that, we're going to have chaos.

Susan F. Davies : I agree.

Robert Caruso : That's a really bad step to go into. So, we have to maintain our standards for the Village. And we can't do piecemeal because this one is less maintenance by 20%, and this costs more by 40%. Once we get into this, we're in a dangerous territory. So, we're going to maintain that this is a Historic District. The upper windows are going to be wood. The bottom is all going to be wood. It's going to maintain this look okay. And uh, so I guess you'll have to come back on this?

E. Ann Duffey: No, they've already approved it.

Robert Caruso: Or we've approved it. And just make sure that when you start this, that it is correct, because otherwise it will be...you'll have to redo it.

Jared Mandel: 100%.

Robert Caruso : So, we can't throw in some aluminum windows or some vinyl windows. What we approve, we expect it to be as such, and we don't want to contact you and tell you you're doing the wrong thing and put a Stop Work Order.

Jared Mandel: Completely understood.

Robert Caruso : Okay. You understand that totally? Well, thank you. All right. And Board members, thank you. Billy, thank you. Tom, thank you.

Jared Mandel: I appreciate it for you hearing the case again. Thank you.

55 Newtown Lane Condo Owners Association – 110 Park Place – SCTM#301-3.2-2-1

Robert Caruso : The next item on the Agenda is 55 Newtown Lane, the Condo Owners Association, 110 Park Place. Is the applicant present?

Steve Garland : Good morning, Mr. Chairman. Good morning, Board members. Yeah. My name is Steve Garland. I am the owner of Premier Home Builders, LLC, based out of East Patchogue. I'm here today to represent my clients for what we think is a relatively simple change at 110 Park Place. What we are proposing here is to change out the existing metal burgundy roof, um, which is clearly aged. And I mean, I'm sure you guys drive by it every day. It's not very sightly. And what we would like to do is basically change that out to a new black aluminum, standing seam roof, which would basically be the same as what you see here now, just that we are requesting to change the color to black. And then besides that, we are looking for approval to basically clean up the exterior and repaint it with a fresh coat of white paint.

Robert Caruso : Okay, thank you. Billy, your input on this? Okay, Board members?

Susan F. Davies : You're also...where Fierro's Pizza and things are, changing that to black as well on the building that goes down to Clic?

Steve Garland : Right, so if you look closely, um, there is a small cornice detail there, which are these small white blocks, and above that is actually...it's already painted to match the burgundy roof. So, we just wanted to represent that we're going to change that burgundy to black above that cornice section as well, just as you see on the original.

Kathryn Davis: Are you changing the material or are you just repainting it?

Robert Caruso : The existing structure, which is basically, it's like some kind of concrete block, um, that's all going to stay. The only material change is the metal.

Robert Caruso : Yeah. And the metal, it's basically aesthetically, or is it leaking or?

Steve Garland : Um, this is basically aesthetic only.

Kathryn Davis: So, you're replacing the metal with black metal?

Steve Garland : We want to replace the metal with black metal, correct.

Robert Caruso : The only thing that I noticed about it is that the existing metal, if you take a look Board members at the building to the right, it's a brick, it's a red brick, and the metal, you know, it all ties together in a way. Do you notice that? Whereas the black has got a sort of like...it terminates, and it I don't know it's really an aesthetic question, Board members. It's like...the black on Newtown Lane or the metal sort of could go, but I just...it's sort of like a connecting piece.

E. Ann Duffey: Is it black or bronze?

Steve Garland : Um, the proposed roof or the existing?

E. Ann Duffey: The proposed.

Steve Garland : It's black.

Kathryn Davis: Do you have a sample of the metal?

Steve Garland : I did not bring a sample. I could always bring one to you if you wanted.

Kathryn Davis: It would be helpful to see a sample of the material. Blacks are so different.

Steve Garland : That's true.

Robert Caruso : Okay, so why don't you do that, and we'll reschedule, and you can bring a sample of the material, okay?

Steve Garland : Sure. Absolutely.

Robert Caruso : Any other questions? Kate? Sue?

Kathryn Davis: That's great.

Robert Caruso : Anne, any questions? Okay. Thank you then. So, you'll come back with a sample. Okay. Thank you very much. Have a nice day.

Robert Caruso : Board members, any other questions? If not, then I would entertain them. Motion to adjourn today. Do I have that motion?

E. Ann Duffey: I'll make a motion.

Robert Caruso : Thank you. Do I have a second?

Kristin Corwin: I'll second.

Robert Caruso : Thank you. All in favor?

Board in Unison: Aye.

Robert Caruso : Great.

FILED
VILLAGE OF EAST HAMPTON, NY
DATE: 6/11/24
TIME: 10:20 AM

LaBrille M. K.

