REGULAR MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL

<u>March 7, 2023</u>

The meeting was called to order by President McGee at 7:05 PM

The Clerk called the roll. Absent members: 0 Present Members in person 11 (Anderson-Burgos, Bartley, Givner, Maldonado Velez, McGee, McGiverin, Murphy-Romboletti, Puello, Rivera_I, Rivera_J, Tallman). Present Members on Zoom 2 (Jourdain, Vacon).

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

The name of Councilor Tallman was pulled to head the roll call voting.

President McGee stated that 8 years ago, Councilor Bartley brought forward the idea of annually inviting and recognizing the Parade Committee.

The Holyoke Caledonian Pipe Band entered the chambers playing music.

Councilor Bartley reiterated that this was a tradition started 8 years earlier to connect the City Council closer to the Parade Committee. He expressed gratitude for their attendance, noting that the 70th parade and the 46 road race was coming soon. He then stated that a new tradition was being started this year in inviting award winners from the Ancient Order of Hibernians, their Man of the Year as well as the Ladies AOH Woman of the Year. He further stated that Jay Whelihan was unable to attend and would receive his proclamation that Sunday at their breakfast. He then presented Mary O'Connor with a City Council proclamation. He then stated that Parade Committee President, Karen Casey, was away and unable to attend, and that the committee's 1st Vice President, Hayley Dunn, would introduce Parade Committee dignitaries.

H. Dunn thanked the Council for inviting them and expressed that they were delighted to come back for the annual recognition. She then explained that the work was a collaborative effort among the 250 committee members who worked year round to secure sponsors, plan the parade, and recruit entertainment and music. She then thanked city departments for their help in putting it on every year. She then stated that Karen Casey would be given her proclamation when she returned, adding that Ms. Casey had extended her sorrow for not being there that evening. She then introduced Holyoke Caledonian Pipe Band as the Citizenship Award winner. She then stated that Rohan Award winner, Cathy McEvady was unable to attend. She then introduced Jennifer Voyik-Morrison as the Gallivan Award winner. She further introduced O'Connell Award winner, Kelly McGiverin.

K. McGiverin stated that she would not give a speech even though her dad wanted to. She then quipped that she knew what it was like to stand at the President's podium like her dad had as Council President many years earlier.

H. Dunn offered recognition to JFK Award recipient, Lenny Jacobson, who would be honored at an event the evening before the parade. She also recognized Ambassador Award winner, Claire Cronin, U.S. Ambassador to Ireland. She stated that Ms. Cronin would be honored at a breakfast the morning of the parade and would be marching with several other officials from Ireland. She then introduced 2023 Grand Colleen, Abby Ross Glasheen.

A. Glasheen stated that her fellow court members, Caroline, Mara, Lauren, and Katie would have loved to have been there as well. She then stated that this was an honor and she felt blessed to be from a city that cherished and honored many cultures and traditions. She then expressed her excitement to celebrate 'green season' with everyone.

H. Dunn introduced the year's Grand Marshal, Jane Coughlin Chevalier.

J. Chevalier expressed her excitement, noting that the parade had just been cancelled due to COVID the last time they had been in chambers. She then recalled that the committee had a mini wake that night, and all had been very emotional hearing the bagpipes. She then expressed how great it was to be back and have a great parade weekend this year.

H. Dunn stated that an amazing showcase was ready to go for parade weekend, adding that it could be watched on 22 News as well as livestreamed online.

Councilor Bartley offered thanks to Patti Devine for providing her talented calligraphy skills in writing out proclamations for the City Council.

The Caledonian Pipe Band ushered the committee out of chambers.

Motion was made and seconded to take a roll call vote that for the purposes of this meeting would be applicable to all motions to received, refer items to committee, remove items from the table, lay items on the table, package items together, or suspend the rules, unless there is an objection.

President McGee explained that the reason for that motion was that if any members were attending on Zoom, for Open Meeting Law purposes, it was taken to avoid having to take a roll call vote for every motion.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up the President's Report out of order.

PRESIDENT'S REPORT

(17:30)

President McGee stated that Homework House would be holding their annual spelling bee on April 27th. He noted the Council often put together a team. He recalled that he, Councilor McGiverin, and former Councilor Valentin had participated and got one word right and then made a sign begging for votes. He then stated that anyone looking to create a team should reach out to Homework House.

He then thanked Mayor Garcia and several councilors that traveled to Puerto Rico, presented an award on behalf of the Volleyball Hall of Fame to Hector "Picky' Soto, and represented the city while visiting the island.

He then stated that the St. Patrick's Day breakfast [held by the Holyoke Chamber of Commerce] would be at Wyckoff Country Club on March 15th.

He then stated that councilors should be at Kmart plaza at 10 a.m. for the parade to line up and get flowers.

He then stated that he had served the city for 18 years and had come to the point where it was time to take on a new role and chapter in his life. He then joked that he was planning to run for mayor, quickly taking it back and expressing that Mayor Garcia had been a phenomenal mayor that had been a pleasure

to work with. He then announced that he would not be seeking reelection to his City Council seat that vear. He further stated that it had been an honor to serve the community, first as Ward 6 City Councilor. later moving and immediately being elected to serve Ward 7. He offered thanks the Council for allowing him to serve as President for 6 years. He noted that he also briefly served as mayor. He added that this was a good time to consider his future and prioritize seeing his kids grow up. He then noted that this would be his last time marching in the parade. He then explained that he was announcing at this time to allow the residents of Ward 7 to decide who would run and have a chance to get their names out. He explained that it had been an amazing journey, expressing his gratefulness to both past and present councilors. He offered additional thanks to city department heads and employees who had supported him throughout his years. He then emphasized that the city had phenomenal employees who worked very hard. He then recalled Patti Devine approaching him and convincing him to run when the Ward 6 seat was to become vacant. He then offered thanks to the residents of Ward 6 for giving him that opportunity, noting that they currently had a great councilor serving them. He also offered thanks to the residents of Ward 7 for allowing him to continue serving and helping people. He then emphasized that through working together, people can make the city its best for now and for future generations. He then expressed pride in projects they had worked on together, including Scott Tower, Community Field, the Library project, the coming new school at Peck, the Computer Center, the Senior Center, new city vehicles. streets, sidewalks, and trees, and the coming rehab of the Victory Theatre. He then offered emotional thanks to Brenna Murphy McGee for giving him 3 amazing children as the greatest gift anyone could be given. He then expressed how much he looked forward to seeing them grow up. He then offered thanks to those who helped get him to where he was, including several families from the community. He also thanked Councilor McGiverin for offering him the valuable lesson, saying "don't blink" or your kids will grow up too fast. He then recalled that when his children were born, he promised them he would be there for them. He then encouraged the Council to work together to make the year, the city's 150th, a memorable one.

LAID ON THE TABLE

President McGee asked if item 1 was to remain on the table.

Councilor Vacon confirmed that it was.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order that following the adoption of a resolution in support of the district, that the Ordinance Committee work with the mayor and the appropriate city and state departments to adopt an ordinance creating a Puerto Rican Cultural District within the City of Holyoke.

---> Laid on the table.

Motion was made and seconded to remove item 2 from the table.

Petition of Steven P. Glaude for a zone change application from BG to BH for 2203 Northampton St.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to allow Atty Bissonnette to address the Council.

President McGee asked if there were any updates on the petition. He then clarified that the address on the petition should say 2201-2211.

Councilor Bartley asked if he should offer a reminder on the question.

Atty Bissonnette asked of this was referring to an address at the former Kmart.

Councilor Bartley stated that it was.

Atty Bissonnette stated that there was nothing new to discuss.

Councilor McGiverin asked if there was a time clock ticking after the public hearing.

Councilor Vacon stated that it was referred to the Law Department because it was not clear if it was in order for a zone change to be requested by this person. She added that there had not been a public hearing.

Councilor Bartley stated that a good point had been raised in that the application had been filed and while it had not yet been accepted, there may be a time concern to consider.

President McGee, communicating from the Admin Asst, stated that it was 65 days from the date it was received.

Councilor Bartley emphasized that meant a clock was ticking. He then noted that the petitioner did not own the parcel.

Atty Bissonnette confirmed that was correct.

Councilor Bartley stated that the question was whether or not the person should petition for a zone change on a parcel on which he did not have any interest. ---> Laid on the table.

Councilor McGiverin stated that item 3 should remain on the table.

From Assistant City Solicitor, Kathleen Degnan, legal forms from Ordinances passed at the February 7, 2023 meeting ---> Laid on the table

PUBLIC COMMENT

(33:00)

Patricia Devine, 58 Magnolia Avenue, thanked the City Council for their hard work and long hours, adding that it was worth the hard work. She also offered thanks to President McGee for his service to city, as Chief of Staff for Michael Kane, as the Ward 6 and 7 City Councilor, briefly as acting mayor, and most of all as her friend. She then offered a gift to him.

President McGee quipped that the gift would need to be under \$50. He then offered an opportunity for others to speak who may have missed the signup due to the band being in the space.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to allow others to participate in Public Comment.

Orlando Rivera, 193 Chestnut Street, stated that he had been a resident of Holyoke for 4 1/2 years and had grown to love the city. He then stated that he worked with several organizations including Neighbor2Neighbor, Hopeful Holyoke Center, Wayfinders, and Tapestry, and often picked up needles in the neighborhood of his own accord. He added that he had knocked a lot of doors and was able to get a staircase closed that had been regularly used for addiction for many years for overdoses. He then explained that his purpose for speaking was to address the Police Department audit and share one of his own experiences with the department. He then stated that he had opposed ShotSpotter, adding concern that the funds would be used for the machine rather than more important things the department needed, most importantly building a relationship with the community. He then explained that an incident happened at his building, leading to police knocking on several doors. He added that even though the building had several cameras, he was stereotyped for his appearance as someone who could be beating up a woman, officers pushed into his apartment and pointed tasers at him in front of his children. He then stated that the had observed some improvements in police presence in his neighborhood. He then suggested that the police needed to have better communication and develop better relationships.

Nancy Capron, 72 Congress Avenue, Apt 1L, stated that it was disturbing to read in the MRI report that some patrol detectives would pick out 3 city councilors as threats. She then noted that one councilor was exercising his free speech rights. She further noted that another was referred to as a convicted felon and that his role as chair of the Public Safety subcommittee made him a threat even though he had served his time and was exercising his right to participate in the public life of the community. She also noted that another councilor was in the process of his protected rights of due process outlined in the Constitution. She then suggested that the councilors were owed an apology by those detectives.

Nathan Chung, 9 Prue Avenue, Apt 4A, stated that in using the state's L3 data, he suggested that if the CPA surcharge was reduced from 1.5% to 0.5%, it would result in the committee losing its only staff member along with significant loss of funding. Noting the argument made that it would reduce tax burden, he emphasized that the surcharge already had a exemption on property values up to \$100,000. He then suggested that for a property valued at \$200,000, the surcharge was roughly 0.0141% of the property's value. He added that of the 8,500 residential properties in Holyoke, 1,200 were already fully exempt. He then suggested that for a majority of the properties in the city, there would be minimal impact if the proposed reduction were approved.

Jesus Candelario, 1109 Dwight Street, stated that he was the owner of Jay's Bed & Breakfast. He then suggested that the Fire Department appeared to be on a mission to go after businesses in the city regarding permits, making businesses feel threatened that they may have to close or leave the city. He then stated that the Fire Department was categorizing his business as a discotheque/bar. He then emphasized that his business was a bed & breakfast. He then noted that he had submitted special permit paperwork. He added that many other businesses were being impacted, such as the Log Cabin, Hamel's, Delaney House, and Brennan's. He then reiterated that the Fire Department appeared to be on a mission going after vibrant businesses in the city that many residents had known and supported. He then suggested that the mayor needed to step up and say something.

John Rivera, 125 Cabot Street, stated that he would be addressing the Police Department audit. He then stated that the audit was a racist, classist, extremely biased report that should be discarded. He then suggested that a new audit should be done by an agency that was not biased. He then emphasized that MRI was full of former police officials. He further suggested that they were hired to perform a useless

SWOT analysis that could have been done by any intern at one of the nearby 5 colleges. He then questioned the conclusion that cops needed more money. He then stated that infrastructure needed to be built that would address the needs of the city's people, such as better wages, better education, afterschool programs, safer neighborhoods, and investments in more lights, better parks, rent control, and the disposal of all slumlords who were leeches on the city and its livelihood. He then requested that the City Council call for a new audit.

COMMUNICATIONS

(46:20)

From Joshua A. Garcia, letter appointing Ms. Jaime Morrow, 9 Coolidge St. Springfield, Mass for the position of Interim Chief Procurement Officer: Ms. Morrow will replace Ms. Lori Belanger and will serve Lori's remainder of the term; Said term will expire on November 30, 2025.

From City Solicitor Lisa Ball: Update on outside legal fees from period of 11/4/22 to 2/3/23.

Councilor Bartley asked that the item be laid on the table so that he can ask questions at the next meeting. ---> Laid on the table

From Brenna Murphy McGee, MMC & Jeffery Anderson-Burgos, Admin. Ass't. to City Council minutes of February 21, 2023.

---> Received and Adopted.

From Anthony Dulude, Executive Director Holyoke Retirement Board, letter re: Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) for Fiscal Year 2023.

Councilor Jourdain suggested that the item be referred to Finance, noting that it would require a vote of the City Council. He then explained that it would give retirees an extra 2% COLA increased, retro to January.

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

From Alicia Zoeller, Administrator Office of Community Development, FY2023 CDBG Proposal Book & FY2023 CDBG Allocation Recommendations and FY2023 Resolution. ---> Received and referred to the Development and Governmental Relations Committee.

From The Wistariahurst Foundation, 2020 Return of organization exempt from Income Tax. ---> Received and referred to the Development and Governmental Relations Committee.

From Scott MacPherson, Executive Director for Holyoke Media, Annual report.

Councilor McGiverin stated that the item had been discussed in committee but could go to committee for the archives.

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

From Citizens of Holyoke, petition to meet with City Council to discuss Mayor Joshua Garcia's recent removal of The Chair of the Holyoke Historical Commission, Paola Ferrario.

Councilor McGiverin suggested that the Law Department should be copied so that they can weigh in on whether or not a personnel issue can be discussed.

---> Received and referred to the Public Service Committee. Copy to Law Department.

Board of Fire Commission minutes of January 18, 2023. ---> Received.

PETITIONS

(49:30)

Petition for pole and wire locations, The gas & Electric Department requests permission to locate a line of wires, cables, poles and fixtures, including the necessary sustaining and protecting fixtures, along and across the following public way or ways:

One (1) 45' pole between property line of 175 Lincoln St. & Holyoke Park on corner of Northampton and Lincoln St. Holyoke, Mass.

---> Received and set up a public hearing.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 14 and Late File B as a package/

Petition of Jesus Candelario, for a zone change at 1109 Dwight St from R-2 to B-G. ---> Received and referred the Development and Governmental Relations Committee.

Petition of Jesus Candelario, for a special permit for a non-conforming use (4.7.2) at 1109 Dwight St

President McGee clarified that Mr. Candelario was initially told he needed a zone change but after further review, he was instructed that he needed a special permit.

Councilor Bartley noted that Mr. Candelario was the title owner of the address. He then asked why the zone change wouldn't be going to Ordinance.

President McGee stated that they should go together since the intended change required a special permit.

---> Received and referred to the Development and Governmental Relations Committee.

REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

(51:10)

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Per Constituent request, that an additional handicap parking space be added at 204 Oak St. for Josephine Rivera. Although a designated handicap

space was created during the summer of 2022, that space is regularly occupied by other vehicles with handicap plates, indicating additional need.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the Disabilities Commission did not need to weigh in on this request since they had already vetted the appropriateness of the need. She added that the committee could determine if the additional space was warranted because the other one was being regularly used with properly placarded vehicles.

Councilor Jourdain stated that his name could be signed to all of the Ordinance Committee reports.

Councilor Rivera_I stated that while he would be supporting the request, he suggested there should be a conversation with the Disabilities Commission to clarify how many spaces one person could apply for. He noted that some tighter streets had few spaces available and multiple handicap spaces end up taking up most of a street's available parking.

President McGee suggested that the Commission could be invited to address that question.

Councilor Givner emphasized that this was for a resident where someone else on the street with a placard is using the spot she initially applied for. She then stated that the assumption was that if there was another person always using the spot, it was considered that there was need for more spots.

Councilor Anderson-Burgos emphasized that it was illegal to make spots for specific people, adding that if there was another person using it, then there was need. He suggested that this was the best route to go to save time.

Councilor McGiverin suggested that a good rule of thumb was that a residential handicap space should be for someone who lives in the neighborhood. He noted they used to put placard numbers on the signs and no longer could. He then emphasized that the Handicap Committee and Ordinance Committee both screen the requests. He added that if the person living there has a placard and they park on their street overnight, then they are not taking space from their neighbors but using a specific space because of their need. He recalled one application being denied because the purpose of the space was for them to unload their car but they were parking off street and in their garage.

---> Report of Committee received and the Ordinance passed its first reading.

The Ordinance passed its second reading.

The Ordinance was passed to be enrolled.

The Committee has considered the same and find that it is truly and properly enrolled.

Report of Enrollment received.

The Ordinance was passed to be Ordained and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0.

Approved by the Mayor

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Special permit application for Carefully Curated LLC at 400 Race St (028-07-016) to operate a marijuana manufacturing establishment.

have considered the same and Recommended that the special permit be granted with the following conditions:

1. That the owner of the building always pay the commercial property tax rate to the extent allowed by federal, state, and local laws for the duration of the Special Permit.

2. That the business retains a minimum 30% Holyoke residents for non-security jobs.

3. That the hiring preference be given to security personnel that are retired Holyoke police or are a retired member of another police department that now lives in the city of Holyoke.

4. There shall be no marijuana consumption allowed on site.

5. That the hours of operation be set according to City ordinances.

6. That the applicant must abide by Massachusetts General Laws and guidances from the Cannabis Control Commission.

7. That the petitioner/applicant shall conform with city and state health laws, rules, and regulations, including odor nuisance controls, for the duration of the permit.

8. That if substantial progress has not occurred within 2 years of issuance of the Special Permit, an extension shall be required.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the applicant had another special permit approved, but the property owner requested they change their location. She added they came in with essentially the same application but with a different security plan approved by the Police Department to address the change in address. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 12--Nays 0--Absent 0--Abstain 1 (Murphy-Romboletti). Councilor Murphy-Romboletti did not vote or participate in discussion on this item.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up item 15C through 15F as a package.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order that a No Parking sign be placed for (no parking Friday mornings) adjacent and to the south of the entrance to the parking lot of 31 Beacon Ave(on Waldo Street), and to the south of the driveway directly across the street on Waldo Street

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that there were logistical issues, and this would allow for removal and emptying of a dumpster.

---> Report of Committee received and the Ordinance passed its first reading.

The Ordinance passed its second reading.

The Ordinance was passed to be enrolled.

The Committee has considered the same and find that it is truly and properly enrolled. Report of Enrollment received.

The Ordinance was passed to be Ordained and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0.

Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That the City Engineer remove the signs near 970/980 Hampden St.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the signs were not needed.

---> Report of Committee received and the Ordinance passed its first reading.

The Ordinance passed its second reading.

The Ordinance was passed to be enrolled.

The Committee has considered the same and find that it is truly and properly enrolled. Report of Enrollment received.

The Ordinance was passed to be Ordained and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0.

Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order The city council and DPW amend any ordinances to allow for road improvements at Whiting Farms Rd. to allow for a dedicated Left-hand turn into K-Mart Plaza and to allow for motorists to also travel towards the Mall in a dedicated lane.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the Engineer evaluated the area. She then stated that this would require action and other considerations relative to financing, and that it was recommended to be moved forward.

Councilor Bartley commended the committee and the Engineer for their work. He then expressed his intent to discuss the matter with the Finance chair and the Mayor. He then emphasized that something needed to be done with the thousands of square feet remaining dormant with hundreds of parking spaces on a busy road just a mile from a major highway. He then expressed a hope that OPED would work to engage with developers who would want to use the location. He then suggested that the change to the left turn would be a benefit but was only a preliminary step.

Councilor Tallman stated that he heard from people almost every day asking what was happening with the former Kmart location. He also noted that half of the plaza's lot was well maintained while the other half was full of potholes and had no painted lines. He suggested that the left hand turn would be a good addition.

Councilor Rivera_I stated that while he agreed with getting the location up and running, he believed there needed to be more done to hold the property owner accountable to address the conditions of the lot. He emphasized that it was not the responsibility of the businesses at the plaza. He then expressed his intent to vote against this change, adding that he believed it would likely lead to cars getting backed up to the intersection with Northampton Street.

Councilor Bartley stated that the owner of the property has been spoken with and the Board of Health had fined them for litter and other issues. He noted that they owned the property that included D'Angelo's, Denny's, Taco Bell, and Burger King. He added that the Fire Department and the former Building Commissioner had also spoken with them on the condition of the lot. He then suggested that members of the public could reach out to the Board of Health to make complaints. He also noted that the property owner had been responsive when the city had reached out to them.

Councilor Givner reiterated that the owner needed to be held more accountable. She then expressed concern about the turn lane. She then suggested that the entrance could be closed off and require that people enter through the Northampton Street entrances.

Councilor Vacon noted that the Engineer evaluated the area and found there to be adequate line of sight and enough room to put in a dedicated lane for a left hand turn. She emphasized that people were already making a left hand turn on a regular basis regardless or turning around at the fire station, creating another public safety hazard. She then stated that the Engineer found this to be a reasonable solution. Councilor Givner noted that while the Engineer did find there was enough room for a designated turning lane with the current traffic, it might have to be reconfigured or thought about differently if additional development at the plaza led to greater traffic. She reiterated her suggested that it be closed off.

Councilor Rivera_I noted that years prior, many reasons and studies went into the Council deciding to make it what it currently was. He suggested that if the left lane was allowed, it would likely get packed fast with the right on red at the nearby intersection. He noted that while people were taking the illegal left turn, it was minimized due to it being illegal. He added that if it was allowed, a lot of people would be taking that turn instead of going straight down.

Councilor Anderson-Burgos noted that when he worked in the plaza for over 10 years, he recalled many near accidents because of people illegal turning. He then suggested that it could be a future issue if something opened at the former Kmart location and led to more traffic. He then suggested that it would help prevent accidents if it were closed as Councilor Givner suggested.

President McGee recalled that when there was a left turn, there was a row of strips that would get wiped out by plows and car would hit it. He then suggested that a left hand turn would allow for flow of traffic and make it a little safer than illegal turns at that spot as well as at the fire station. He added that anything that could happen in the future would require site plan review. He then stated that this change would allow the current issues to be addressed.

---> Report of Committee received and the Ordinance passed its first reading.

The Ordinance passed its second reading.

The Ordinance was passed to be enrolled.

The Committee has considered the same and find that it is truly and properly enrolled.

Report of Enrollment received.

The Ordinance was passed to be Ordained and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 11--Nays 2 (Givner, Rivera_I)--Absent 0. Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order The recently installed handicap sign at 363 Chestnut St please be removed by request original petitioner.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the request to remove came from the petitioner.

---> Report of Committee received and the Ordinance passed its first reading.

The Ordinance passed its second reading.

The Ordinance was passed to be enrolled.

The Committee has considered the same and find that it is truly and properly enrolled.

Report of Enrollment received.

The Ordinance was passed to be Ordained and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0. Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Special permit extension application for Victoria Frost LLC at 679-689 Main St & Beaulieu St property abutting 679 Main St (055-00-009, 009.1, 009.2) to extend the special permit originally granted on August 4, 2020, to operate a cannabis product cultivation, manufacturing, and dispensary facility.

have considered the same and Recommended that the special permit extension of one year be granted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the applicant had made a lot of progress but were waiting for final funding to come through. She added that it was a fairly good development for the area.

Councilor Jourdain asked to clarify that all current conditions previously put on the permit would remain the same and that the only change was the term.

Councilor Vacon confirmed that was correct.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 11--Nays 0--Absent 0--Abstain 2 (Bartley, Murphy-Romboletti). Councilor Bartley and Councilor Murphy-Romboletti did not vote or participate in discussion on this item.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Special permit application amendment of Holyoke 420 LLC dba Holyoke Cannabis at 380 Dwight St (021-01-003) to remove original condition prohibiting delivery, add suite #4 for a new vault, add new sallyport location, and amend hours condition so that they be set according to city ordinance.

have considered the same and Recommended that the amendments to the special permit be granted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon recalled that this business had been the subject of a complaint from the property owner who had not signed the original application for the special permit as required. She then stated that the applicant has stated that the owner supported the amendments and information was attached to that effect. She noted that the amendment application was not signed by the owner. She also noted that nobody spoke against or in favor of the amendments during the public hearing. She then stated that the Law Department had offered guidance that the committee should be assuring all details are covered in order to be in compliance with state law and local ordinances in order to avoid certain legal exposures. She then expressed her intent to not vote for the amendments because there had been a specific complaint about the owner not signing the application.

Councilor Jourdain asked if it would be possible to table it in order to reach out to the owner to request a letter stating what their position was on the amendments.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to allow the Law Department to address the Council.

Atty Bissonnette recalled there was a letter from the owner listing several complaints relative to the applicant. He noted it led to litigation, adding that while the city was not a party to that, there were some discovery requests served. He then explained that the matter had been amicably settled, resulting in the request to amend the special permit to comply with a few of the changes requested by the landlords, including no sharing of a sallyport, removal of signs, and adding a new vault. He emphasized that the amendments would reflect several of the changes requested by the owner.

Councilor Vacon asked if the city had any exposure due to part of the complaint being about the fact that the special permit application had not been signed by the owner.

Atty Bissonnette stated that while he shared those concerns, the changes were a direct result of the owner's concerns and that the owner agreed with them.

Councilor Vacon stated that under those conditions, she could support the amendments.

Councilor Rivera_I suggested adding a condition that approval be contingent upon the applicant getting a signature from the property owner.

President McGee suggested that based on what Atty Bissonnette stated, it likely did not matter. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 11--Nays 0--Absent 1 (Maldonado Velez)--Abstain 1 (Murphy-Romboletti). Councilor Murphy-Romboletti did not vote or participate in discussion on this item.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order that Order to put signs at the Lyman Terrace neighborhood stating "Resident Parking Only" and have residents apply for parking permits.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be referred to the Holyoke Housing Authority.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the situation was complicated but the Engineer evaluated it and determined it was the jurisdiction of the Housing Authority.

Councilor Tallman recalled residents speaking to him about the difficulty of finding parking. He expressed a hope that the Housing Authority would move this forward to help those people. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 15J through 15N as a package.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Petition for Speed hump for Hillside Ave

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to not install temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Petition for Speed Hump from citizens for Moss Ave

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to not install temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That speed humps be placed on Moss Ave.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to not install temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That speed humps be placed on Memorial Dr

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to not install temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That speed hump be placed on Fenton St

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to not install temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that many of these had been reviewed previously, but then referred back to committee during a period of transition between city engineers. She added that the new Engineer was asked to look at the data and review after a fresh look. She then stated that they use a variety of measures to determine if they were warranted, including observing if traffic is high enough in speed to then observe if speed humps would create a significant enough correction to provide a safety improvement. She then stated that after reviewing the provided graphs, the committee agreed with the Engineer's recommendation to not install.

Councilor Bartley noted that it was his request to send these back to committee. He then expressed appreciation to the Engineer. He noted that all of these requests came from the constituents he served in Ward 3. He then expressed his intent to support the recommendation of the Engineer, noting the report was comprehensive but very readable. He then emphasized that citizens were not prevented from bringing up the issues again, noting that the data was a snapshot of a one week time period.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 150 through 15Q as a package.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order Speed hump petition from Citizens of Mackintosh Terrace.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to proceed with installing temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That speed humps be placed on Mackintosh Terrace.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to proceed with installing temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner

Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order That speed humps be placed on Mackintosh Terr.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's report to proceed with installing temporary speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the findings of the study were different for this street when compared to the others, noting it was worth moving forward to determine if temporary speed humps would accomplish an improvement in speeding.

Councilor Bartley noted this street bordered the south side of Crosier Field in Ward 3. He also noted that the proximity to a public park as well as a school had been part of the criteria that was looked at. He also observed that this was often used as a cut through from South Street to Northampton Street. He noted that speed humps generally have the desired effect after they've been installed.

Councilor Tallman asked if there was a mention of a request for Bemis Road.

Councilor Vacon stated that the Engineer affirmed that the temporary speed humps already approved for Upland Road would be going in soon, which would then be followed by the installation on Mackintosh. She then stated that Bemis would be further down because there were other expected projects taking place on that road.

President McGee recalled that Bemis had issues with how many to install, as well as a planned resurfacing to happen first.

Councilor Tallman recalled that a few years earlier, they expected to resurface within 5 years. He then expressed his intent to speak with the DPW, noting that Bemis was often used as a cut through between Northampton Street and Easthampton Road. He emphasized that residents had been asking for an update to those and had also requested a truck exclusion because tractor trailers had often been using it as a shortcut.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted

The Committee on Ordinance to whom was referred an order that a no parking sign be placed in front of 5 Whiting Avenue at the request of the residents.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Linda L. Vacon Jose Maldonado-Velez Kocayne Givner Kevin A Jourdain Israel Rivera_I

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Vacon stated that the Engineer noted it was already in ordinance and that the sign just needed to be installed, which had since been done.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted

(1:39:00)

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that in accordance with M.G.L. Chapter 44 Sec. 53A, the City Council hereby accepts the provisions of the "FY2023 STATE 911 DEPARTMENT EMERGENCY MEDICAL DISPATCH GRANT PROGRAM, \$18,375, NO MATCH, " grant and authorizes the establishment of a Fund or other method appropriate for the accounting of the receipts and expenditures of all resources associated with the administration of said grant.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that the Fire Department would use this grant to offset some reimbursement expenses that were related to the Cataldo Ambulance contract.

---> Report of Committee passed two readings and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0.

Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, FIFTEEN THOUSAND AND 00/100 Dollars (\$15,000.00) as follows: FROM:

12441-51101 PAY-SEALER OF WEIGHTS & MEASURES \$15,000.00

TOTAL: \$15,000.00 TO: 12442-57100 IN STATE TRAVEL \$500.00 12442-58501 EQUIPMENT 12,750.00 12442-54200 OFFICE SUPPLIES 1,750.00 TOTAL: \$15,000.00

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that the new Sealer of Weights & Measures, Marcus Gabrieli, was well spoken and knowledgeable of the job. He then emphasized that the job tended to be underrated in terms of its importance, noting that scales at places such as grocery stores and gas station relied on this position to assure those tools remain calibrated and working properly. He then explained that the funds for the transfer would come from the salary line since the position had bene vacant for some time. He then explained that state travel was for educational purposes and conferences Mr. Gabrieli was attending. He added that the equipment and supplies were for necessary items to the work that needs to be done, including foe the cannabis industry.

Councilor Bartley emphasized that the position paid for itself. Noting the details of item 39 later in the agenda, he asked what that was for.

Councilor McGiverin stated that he had not yet looked at the incoming orders and would suggest that it be sent to committee. He then stated that the Auditor mentioned to him that a couple of the items in that transfer may have inadvertently been placed together.

President McGee read from the details of that transfer and noted that there was an invoice of \$18,000 from the Commonwealth of Massachusetts Division of Standards. He noted that when the city did not have a Sealer of Weights & Measures, the state was paid to cover the need.

Councilor McGiverin noted that in addition to paying the state, the city needed to invoice the people for which this position performs their duties for the city. He noted that the state was not invoicing the companies and the city wasn't collecting the revenue it was entitled to.

Councilor Bartley emphasized that by having the position filled, it would help businesses run more efficiently and be more compliant.

Councilor Tallman noted that Mr. Gabrieli came in very fired up to do the job and was training with and collaborating with people in neighboring communities.

---> Report of Committee passed two readings and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--

Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0. Approved by the Mayor.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, TWO HUNDRED AND 00/100 Dollars (\$200.00) as follows: FROM: 12941-51830 CLOTHING ALLOWANCE \$200.00 TOTAL: \$200.00 TO: 12942-53190 EDUCATION & TRAINING \$200.00 TOTAL: \$200.00

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted.

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that there was a surplus in the clothing allowance account and that the transfer would allow two employees to attend a pesticide class related to their employment. He noted that there were questions of why the Council needed to vote on a \$200 transfer, emphasizing that it was less about the amount but that each of the items were in different classifications, requiring a vote by state law. ---> Report of Committee passed two readings and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 0. Approved by the Mayor.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 16D, 16E and 16I as a package.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that our City Solicitor draft a ballot question for the next eligible election for voters to decide if the CPA tax should be reduced from 1.5% to 0.5% in light of the current financial hardship of our taxpayers.

Taxes will increase by over \$200.00 per year for a house valued at \$236,262 due to repeated inability to achieve 7 votes of the City Council for lower taxes for homeowners. This increase is taking place along with significant increases in sewer, gas, electricity, food & heating prices. Voters should have the right to decide the rate. City Council initiated the CPA tax here originally, so needs to vote to place it on the ballot again for voters to decide.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order be adopted, as amended to 1%.

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin

Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

---> Laid on the table.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order From Mayor Joshua A. Garcia list of Historic Preservation related repairs needed on city buildings as requested by Councilor Jourdain, Councilor Bartley, I. Rivera and Councilor Vacon on order filed April 5, 2022

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

---> Laid on the table.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that we invite in the CPA board members to give an update on the program.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin offered gratitude to the CPA, and specifically Meghan Magrath on presenting a historical recap of what the committee had done in the last 4 years. He noted that the city was able to use the funds through the local tax as well as from the state level. He then stated that a list had been provided on historic repairs and projects. He then explained that the CPA has 3 categories they could fund: historic preservation, open spaces and recreation, and affordable housing. He noted they work closely with city departments and organizations on these categories. He then highlighted 3 larger projects they had funded for affordable housing, including a building on Chestnut Street through Valley Opportunity Council, 2 houses on Jackson Street through habitat for Humanity, and a Wayfinders project known as Library Commons. He added that open space projects included Gloutak Woods and Scott Tower/Anniversary Hill. He also added that recreation projects included the Boys & Girls Club playground, Mayer Field improvements, Community Field, and the Miracle League accessible playground. He further stated that

historic preservation projects included the stained glass windows at City Hall, the exterior of the High Street building where Valley Opportunity Council was located, the Smith's Ferry Cemetery, the Wistariahurst Museum electrical upgrade, among many others. He then stated that the CPA was required to spend a certain percentage on each category or it has to be encumbered and carried over for future phases of their work. On the ballot question, he noted that it was explained they had were allowed to spend a certain percentage on administrative costs. He further explained that with the 1.5%, the administrative cost allowed them to keep a staff person, emphasizing that going too low on what would come in would change the formula for each of the categories and the amount available for administrative costs, likely putting them out of the ability to pay for a staff member. He then suggested that a ballot question should be open ended and not imply that voters should take a specific position, but that there should be components for education explaining what a yes or a no vote would mean. He noted that the committee came up with simple language that the Law Department would be putting into a ballot question form. He then suggested that the 1.5% made a lot of sense to support the kinds of projects the CPA had been able to fund, adding up to an average of around \$38 for a single family home. He then noted his agreement that the voters should have a choice on changing it from 1.5% to 1.0%.

Councilor Rivera_I stated that as a member of the CPA for around 5 years, he observed there had been an opportunity to fix parks, open spaces, and other parts of the community that did not qualify for CDBG funding. He expressed a hope that they could continue addressing those parks that did not qualify. He stated that while he understood the concerns around mitigating the impacts of inflation on taxpayers, he expressed concern over how the parks would be improved if the funding was decreased or ended altogether. He suggested that the city would not have the funding to invest in improving parks.

Councilor Vacon stated that while nobody would argue that the funded projects were a negative, but that they were very good, the problem was that the price of everything was going up. She further emphasized that when the argument is made that something is only a small amount more, people were already seeing increases for other things such as food, gas, utilities, or rent. She noted that the CPA was an additional tax that could have been approved either through a citizens petition to add it to the ballot, or through the chosen method which was the City Council choosing to make it a ballot initiative. She then suggested that it was odd that once it was initiated in one way, it could only be changed in the same way. She then emphasized that she was advocating on behalf of taxpayers who were bearing the burden of living in homes they had already paid for but were getting priced out due to many other expenses. She also stated that while she believed administrative costs could be taken on by other committees if the CPA tax was lowered to 0.5%, she understood the perspective of the committee and found 1% to be better than nothing. She also emphasized that taxpayers were already paying thousands of dollars each to pay for city government for limited city services in many cases. She also suggested that addressing many of the projects could be accomplished by more effective and wiser use of taxpayer money through the city budget.

Councilor Murphy-Romboletti commended the CPA Committee for their work as volunteers. She then suggested that the ballot question should ask if voters were okay with keeping the 1.5% surcharge. She noted that she had been contacted by people on both sides of the aisle on the issue. She then asked to clarify what would happen next if the Council voted in support of this item.

Councilor McGiverin stated that they had referred the item to the Law Department to put it into appropriate form for the ballot question. Noting that the language was likely not back yet, he suggested that the vote be tabled.

President McGee clarified that the Council would be receiving ballot question language to approve.

Councilor Anderson-Burgos stated that while he voted to advance the item out of committee, he expressed his intent to vote against the item. He then stated that he had not received any outreach from constituents regarding the CPA. He then recognized that the CPA had led to many improvements throughout the community. He emphasized that everyone was benefiting from the CPA. Noting that voter turnout would be low for the current year, he suggested that it should take place the following year when turnout would be higher.

Councilor Jourdain suggested that the Law Department should use the exact same language as when it was first adopted. He noted that it was controversial the first time around. He then expressed his perspective that people should be given a chance to vote on it, noting that he heard from many constituents who were not happy because he voted to put it on the ballot. He recognized that there were good arguments on both sides, adding that people should have a chance to weigh the pros and cons. He noted that the worst case scenario for the proponents would mean a reduction of around \$250,000. He then expressed that he had been impressed with the CPA, emphasizing that they had been thorough and had funded many great projects. He stated that his one concern was that they not give funds to private organizations while important public projects needed to be done. He noted that many constituents had made the argument that they already give the city around \$60 million and wondered why the city needed another \$800,000 on top of that. He then stated that there should be no issue with placing it on the ballot in the current year's election, noting that the people would already be entrusted to elect the City Council and the School Committee.

Councilor Rivera_I suggested that it was not necessarily true that it would be loss of around \$250,000, noting that a change would impact the formula for how much they would get back from the state. He also suggested that while people may not feel they're getting the services they should from the taxes they pay, most agreed that the CPA money was being well spent. He emphasized that the projects those funds were spent on were tangible impacts that people could see. He also emphasized that there is rarely anything left out of the general budget at the end of the year to be able to spend on the kinds of projects the CPA covered. He then suggested that the question should also give people an option to increase the percent, noting it could go up to 3%.

President McGee noted that the Council still needed to wait for legal form.

Councilor McGiverin agreed that the language should be as close to the original language as possible. He then stated that while he loved the suggestion of giving people an option to increase, it spoke to the problem with ballot questions. He noted that while ballot questions allowed everyone to take a vote on a specific item, doing it menu style would lead to results being all over the place, making it hard to determine exactly what happened. He recalled that the question the first time around was for 1.5%, as well as exempting the first \$100,000 of property value. He noted that the current average value of a single family home was around \$200,000-\$235,000, emphasizing that the tax did not start getting applied until after the first \$100,000. He stated that 194 communities in the state used CPA, with the mean percentage being 1.5%, with some being higher and some being lower. He emphasized that this yes/no question would not be the same as the last time as this would be a question about lowering the percentage.

President McGee suggested that the Council would be better served debating the topic after the language was received.

Councilor Jourdain, in response to questions about his previous calculations, noted that the CPA was being funded at \$800,000 a year. He added that by reducing that by 1/3rd, it would reduce what they receive by around \$270,000.

Councilor Vacon asked that the item be tabled to get the legal language for the next meeting.

President McGee asked if 16E and 16I should be voted on as they were just complied with.

Councilor McGiverin suggested that all 3 be tabled because they all went together with the discussion. ---> Laid on the table.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 16F, 16G, and 16H as a package.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order Holyoke media come into finance to give an update and discuss appointments.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that there was a request for information from Holyoke Media. He commended Scott MacPherson for the detailed presentation of Holyoke Media and for their annual report. He then stated that regarding the membership of their board included one appointment made by the City Council - which still needed to be done - one by the Mayor, the School Committee, 5 at-large members, and one appointment made by their Board of Directors. He added that they also had 3 full time staff members. He then encouraged that their building be visited which offered facilities to any member of the community at no charge. He noted they were responsible for the public access channel and worked close with the City Council, School Committee, and various city boards in getting meetings broadcast and recorded during the COVID pandemic. He also noted that a portion of the franchise fees they managed went to the IT Department at the School Department.

Councilor Tallman noted that he had a small glass souvenir from the Holyoke Public Schools studio opening in 2005. He noted that the franchise fee provided a half million dollars every year.

Councilor Jourdain noted that Mr. MacPherson offered to set up a tour of their new facilities for councilors.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that the City Treasurer be invited into a Finance meeting to update on his cleanup efforts within the department.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Finance to whom was referred an order that the Treasurer and Flynn Financial please appear before the Finance Committee to discuss how our Stabilization Funds are being invested. The City Council would also like to receive quarterly financial statements on these investments going forward. In advance of the meeting, please provide us the financial statements for the period July 1, 2019-June 30, 2022 so we can be prepared for the meeting and our discussion. Please also provide us any applicable regulations or rules from the state related to how Stabilization funds may be invested.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Joseph McGiverin Kevin A Jourdain Will Puello Juan Anderson-Burgos Peter Tallman

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that there was a productive discussion on how the Treasurer's Department was doing since Rory Casey took over, emphasizing the position's importance to the financial makeup of the city, a job that included cash reconciliation of revenues, payroll reconciliation, tax titles, and stabilization fund investments. He noted that Mr. Casey found there to be structural inequities that he was making progress to address. He then stated that a newly hired consultant, Sarah Hunter, joined the discussion to offer recommendations and talk about steps they were taking to change the way things were done in that office. He noted that the city had gotten behind in reconciling revenue and that she was helping the process of getting books closed. He expressed that the ideal would be to get the current year up to date. He then stated that the discussion then transitioned to focusing on the city's investments managed by Flynn Financial. He noted that they worked with many city departments as well as many notfor-profit agencies in the city. He then explained that much was learned about the stabilization fund and the city's investments, but would defer to Councilor Jourdain to describe the focus on the questions he asked which were related to Mass General Laws and other concerns. He then noted that the company was not on commission but charged 0.3 of 1% per million for their work. He added that the fund had grown through the investments over the years. He also stated that they were assured there was oversight that state laws were being adhered to in terms of what those funds were allowed to be invested in.

Councilor Jourdain commended Mr. Casey as the new Treasurer for working diligently to improve the office and the city's situation. He then expressed that it continued to be concerning that there were continued problems such as making sure the checkbook was balanced. He noted that reports to be filed to the state had been getting done on time, emphasizing that many other communities were getting theirs

done months before Holyoke. He recalled that the issues stretched back to IG investigations several years back. He reiterated that he understood Mr. Casey was working hard to get things on track. He then suggested that a serious conversation needed to be had to address the city's investment policy. He emphasized that the stabilization fund was the city's emergency fund and it was concerning that it would be put into risky investments. He suggested that it be invested in ways that may produce lower rates of gain but would be safer. He also suggested that there be more focus on reporting requirements.

(2:44:00)

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 17A, 17B, 17G, 17H, and 17I as a package.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order From Mayor Joshua Garcia, Police Audit documents

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that the Mayor be invited to a Public Safety meeting for presentation of the Police Department audit.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that David Kurz, Sean Kelly, and Michael Healey from MRI were in attendance. He then stated that the main points of the report were that a strategic plan needed to be developed regarding how to improving the structures within the department and utilizing officer time on task, that a communications plan needed to be developed as a pivotal way to assure the community knew what was happening within the department, and that they needed to engage in an accreditation program to verify that the department was following standards of best practices. He emphasized that the department had not been currently accredited. He noted that it would not prevent lawsuits but it would be important in court cases because it would show that the department was taking steps to assure best practices were being focused on. He noted many officers were being assigned to special assignments such as working

in evidence rooms and behind desks, and performing mechanical work. He added that the department had 64% police presence on the streets as opposed to the average of 89% in many other communities. He also stated that of 60 patrolmen, 35 were supervisors. He noted that Chicopee had a higher percentage of officers policing the streets. He further emphasized that the report found the department to be a substantial liability to the city with policies that had not been updated in many years and appeared to be copy and paste from other departments. He also emphasized that the department was not training officers when they came out of the academy, adding that the recommendation was that they receive training immediately coming out of the academy as well as when they get promoted to new positions. He further noted that there needed to be maintenance on cameras, many that had not worked in years, as well as maintenance on cell doors that often were not able to be opened. He added that there needed to be a capital improvement plan.

Councilor Vacon stated that while she was a big fan of accreditation, there were basic needs to be addressed before going down the path. She suggested that the most significant thing to jump out at her was bringing the staff complement up. She noted that many officers were tired and often being forced to work overtime. She noted that the Chief explained that they were working toward increasing numbers through new hires, even while others were about to retire, but that it would take time to get there. She then emphasized that while many things did need to get fixed, the department was working on many immediate needs such as card swipes and other functional things needed for safety in the jail. She then observed that the Chief appeared to have a proactive attitude toward fixing many things highlighted in the report. She also suggested that every department needed this sort of approach. She also noted that one of the factors impacting availability of officers was time off that had been negotiated into contracts. Noting one survey of officers which appeared to show that 58% of officers would take a better deal elsewhere if they could take it, she emphasized that only 33% of officers responded to the survey. She also emphasized that officers were devoted to their job and dedicated to the city.

Councilor Bartley suggested that the mayor should call a special meeting to fully discuss the audit report and have projections and timelines explained. He noted that the report was very fresh information that required more in depth discussion. He then noted that the representatives from MRI had been stunned that the city was self-insured. He suggested that the topic should be talked about more so that a plan can be worked out. Noting that they were planning to have 2 officers pulled to focus on Shot Spotter, he questioned why the department could not have officers available for a traffic squad. He suggested that rather than filing an order before the department could not comply with the ordinance, there should be an order to have them work on complying with it.

Councilor Rivera_I stated that he agreed with that concern.

Councilor Bartley expressed concern about the lack of training on use of tasers. He also noted that the report also focused on the need to address organizational culture. He then emphasized that the officers did take pride in where they worked and that it should be used as a point to build from.

Councilor Rivera_I stated that he suggested filing the order on the traffic squad because he did not trust that the ordinance would be complied with and no solution was being offered to comply with it. He then expressed concern that only 33% of the officers responded to the survey, noting that the city spent a lot to get their analysis. He also noted that the representatives from MRI sensed that many officers had an attitude of feeling defeated. He expressed agreement with funding them at the capacity they needed if those funds were being used effectively and efficiency. He also noted that the survey showed that 69% of the officers did not believe the department was well managed. Emphasizing that the police were out trying to do the best job they needed to do, he stated that this report was about improving their service to the city.

Councilor Tallman expressed agreement that they needed to work with the mayor to improve working conditions and how to get the most and best out of the department. He questioned how the contractual concerns could be changed once those provisions about time off were in there. He also emphasized that many of the officers were getting burned out and they needed to work on making their working conditions better.

Councilor Givner stated that there were systemic issues to be addressed, and questioned if throwing more people and money at a problem was unlikely to fix the issues without systems being addressed first. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that the Chief of Police, business owners, and residents that live in those communities are invited to discuss safety measures to prevent shootings. We would also like to invite the licensing board to discuss the process of what happens when a licensed business has incidents that heavily impact public safety. The purpose of this order is to provide the public some transparency given the recent shooting at the Unicorn Inn and to advise the City Council on any legislative steps we can take.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that Michael Moriarty from the License Board providing an in depth explanation into their processes, noting that within his tenure of more than 6 years, he had only seen 2 shootings at local establishments they worked with. He then explained that in regards to the shooting at the Unicorn Inn, there were a lot of complicating factors. He noted that in typical situations where an incident takes place, they don't take a business's license but that there has to be a complaint filed first. He added that in those situations, they'll call a meeting in adherence with 48 hour open meeting law requirements. He then explained that regarding the Unicorn Inn, they voluntarily shut down to assure they could address the issues. He added that they were already going through the relicensing process at that time, and had other items to address. He further stated that once they got those issues addressed, they were able to get their license again and reopen. He then stated that the Police Chief explained that such businesses don't have the same requirements to submit safety plans as cannabis businesses do. He noted that the License Board required plans that were more geared toward fire exists and capacity numbers.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that the honorable city council invite in the chief of police to discuss whether or not the department has a "Traffic Squad", ordinance references the designation of 6 officers that are required to act as traffic officers. Constituents are concerned with drivers that speed, eat stop signs, etc...

Investment in a "Traffic Squad" as city ordinance states, should help tremendously with mitigating some of our constituent concerns.

Sec 50-42. – Traffic squad—Designation and training of members.

The chief of police shall designate six members and such additional members as may from time to time

be required to act as traffic officers. Such members shall receive and be given thorough and adequate training in the regulation and direction of traffic, in accordance with a uniform and recognized standard.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that Police Chief Pratt explained that he had never seen a traffic squad in his years of service going back to 1993. He noted that the rule was created in the 1970's that may needed to be amended, emphasizing that the department did not have the capacity to have a traffic squad. He then expressed his intent to file an order to amend the ordinance to either fix it or strike it out.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order That the police department provide an update on what steps and systems are being put in place to ensure that shot spotter will work effectively and efficiently when the new technologies installed.

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that the technology was now working, and that 2 officers had been trained using existing setups in other communities where it was already being used in order to get experience on using the program. He noted that the technology had already resulted in an arrest. He then noted that his questions focused on future maintenance and strategic planning on keeping up on it.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 17E, 17F, and 17J as a package.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that our City Engineer evaluate and determine the installation of a crosswalk. The crossing guard stands on the corner of Kane and Knollwood Circle. This is a request from school staff and our School Committee member.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's recommendation to install a crosswalk be accepted.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that the Engineer's recommendation suggested that the crosswalk be approved.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that our city engineer evaluate the intersection of Evergreen and Bray Park Drive for improvements due to safety concern.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's recommendation to install a yield sign be accepted.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I noted that the Engineer's memo suggested that the sign may require an ordinance in legal form.

Councilor Vacon clarified that with this item, the Engineer addressed the request to make improvements by suggesting that a yield sign be installed. She suggested that it may not need to be in ordinance form as it could be put up for a safety matter.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to allow Atty Bissonnette to address the Council.

Atty Bissonnette stated that the Engineer can install a yield sign. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

The Committee on Public Safety to whom was referred an order that traffic calming measures be recommended by our City Engineer for Bray Park Drive and access to the plaza. Install temporary speed humps on Bray Park Drive to slow traffic.

have considered the same and Recommended that the Engineer's recommendation to not install speed humps be accepted.

Committee Members:

Israel Rivera_I

Kocayne Givner Todd A. McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Rivera_I stated that the Engineer made a recommendation.

Councilor Vacon clarified that the Engineer did not recommend speed humps. ---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

President McGee stated that there were no reports from the Public Service Committee or the Development and Governmental Relations Committee.

Councilor Bartley asked to clarify what happened with 17C and 17D.

President McGee stated that they remained tabled in committee.

(3:22:20)

The Committee on Charter and Rules to whom was referred an order Order that we add a rule 9Bviii (Committee) to read "The Youth Services Committee shall have jurisdiction over matters relating to the youth and are the representing body for the Joint Committee of the City Council and School Committee"

have considered the same and Recommended that the order has been complied with

Committee Members:

Jose Maldonado-Velez Tessa Murphy-Romboletti Todd A McGee

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor Maldonado Velez stated that he was trying to see how effective and efficient the Council can be. He added that the order partly focused on the fact that one of the City Council rules required that there be a youth representative and he wanted to have a discussion on that. He also noted that during the committee meeting, a random person was there which caused a scare. He then encouraged that councilors look out for each other. He commended President McGee for handling the situation well.

Councilor Bartley stated that while he believed the committee was on the right track, he suggested that someone needed to take the lead on addressing the rule to have a youth member beginning that fall. He added that there needed to be rules in place to avoid having such a member from staying until late at night. He then suggested that when orders like this get filed, those filing them need to be prepared to take on the work. He then suggested that most legislative bodies would not often be defined as efficient, and that crafting legislation is never going to be simple when everyone has a right to speak. He then emphasized that a lot of great legislation for the benefit of the city had bene produced by this body over the years. He further emphasize that getting to final results require give and take.

Councilor Maldonado Velez suggested that the Council experienced a flip and many new councilors got elected in the last election because of many of the points he made.

Councilor McGiverin suggested that the Charter and Rules did well in knowing how to evacuate quickly when the situation required it.

President McGee suggested that this order was complied with under the intent that another order would be filed to deal with setting it up as discussed with a process to be put in place. He then commended the committee's members for how they handled the situation as well as the police for their response. He then recommended caution in the future.

---> Report of Committee received and recommendation Adopted.

Councilor McGiverin asked if legal form had been provided on an order regarding hiring a paralegal in the Law Department.

President McGee stated that he did not have that.

Councilor McGiverin stated that it may have been part of a package of materials for item 3.

President McGee stated that there were no reports from the Joint Committee of the City Council and School Committee.

ORDERS AND TRANSFERS

(3:30:30)

President McGee thanked Admin Asst Anderson-Burgos for decorating the chambers for the evening's St. Patrick's Day festivities.

TALLMAN — Ordered, that the City Council hold interviews to appoint a member of the public to the Holyoke Media board.

Councilor Tallman asked how a member of the public would be found.

President McGee stated that it would have to be advertised for through the Personnel Department.

Councilor McGiverin asked that the Admin Asst use social media to promote it as well. ---> Received and referred to the Public Service Committee. Copy to Mayor, Personnel, Admin Asst.

TALLMAN — Ordered, that the Police Chief, Auditor, and Treasurer come before the Finance Committee to review the process of newly hired RollKall Technologies LLC and try to find a process to find a procedure to pay down the current deficit in the off duty fee account. Sent to Finance

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

BARTLEY, MCGIVERIN — The DPW Superintendent and the BPW chair come before the City council Finance Committee for a friendly discussion regarding the city's current waste management including recycling fees, dumping fees, amount of trash dumped, amount of recycling (paper and plastic) diverted

from the landfill. Are there strategies Holyoke needs to implement to improve this aspect of government? Please include any contracts so that we can review them in advance of the meeting. ---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

JOURDAIN — Ordered, that the City Council work with the Treasurer to review and codify the city's investment policy by ordinance

---> Received and referred to the Ordinance Committee.

JOURDAIN — Ordered, that the City Council establish a OPEB Liability Trust Fund pursuant to Chapter 32B, Section 20 including voting on approval of local option and then forming the Board of Trustees. Holyoke has a projected liability of \$224 Million (June 2019) and is 1 of handful of cities not to have begun starting to fund their Trust Fund.

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

JOURDAIN — Ordered, beginning in Fiscal Year 2024, funding for the city's OPEB Trust Fund will become a part of the operating budget and the long term goal will be to fully fund the outstanding OPEB liability by 2040.

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

JOURDAIN — Ordered, that the City Council invite in the Retirement Board Director Mr Dulude to discuss if the City should stay with 2035 schedule or move to a 2040 schedule for fully funding the unfunded retirement fund liability. The Director also please give us an update on status of the unfunded liability and the city's plan to address it.

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 29 through 32 as a package.

MCGEE — Ordered, that the Zoning Ordinance, Section 7.8 WIRELESS TELECOMMUNICATION FACILITIES AND ANTENNAS, be amended to include Small Wireless Facilities.

---> Received and referred to the Ordinance Committee.

MCGEE — Ordered, that the Zoning Ordinance be amended to add a Section for Tiny Houses, in addition to amending Section 2 DEFINITIONS, and any other Sections that may apply to this use. ---> Received and referred to the Ordinance Committee.

MCGEE — Ordered, that the Zoning Ordinance be amended to add a Section for AirBNB, in addition to amending Section 2 DEFINITIONS, and any other Sections that may apply to this use. ---> Received and referred to the Ordinance Committee.

MCGEE — Ordered, that the Zoning Ordinance, Section 6.4.2 Exemptions, be amended to add a letter, (k) Banners or signs associated with a civic or municipal program may be allowed in all districts. Community or commercial sponsorship may be displayed on said banner or sign provided that the banner or sign itself is not be greater than six (6.0) square feet. These installations must be approved by the City and by the Department of Public Works as applicable.

---> Received and referred to the Ordinance Committee.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 33 and 34 as a package.

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, TWO THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED NINETY THREE AND 90/100 Dollars (\$2,293.90) as follows: FROM: 12201-51105 FIREFIGHTER \$2,293.90 TOTAL: \$2,293.90 TO: 12201-51180 INJURED ON DUTY \$2,293.90 TOTAL: \$2,293.90

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Passed two readings and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 13--Nays 0--Absent 1 (Rivera_I).

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, TWENTY SEVEN THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED FORTY FOUR AND 58/100 Dollars (\$27,544.58) as follows: FROM: 12101-51104 LIEUTENANT \$3,883.22 12101-51105 SERGEANT 13,447.60 12101-51107 PATROLMEN 10,213.76 TOTAL: \$27,544.58 TO: 12101-51180 INJURED ON DUTY \$27,544.58 TOTAL: \$27,544.58

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

UNDER DISCUSSION:

Councilor McGiverin stated that the requests were an accounting mechanism of transferring pay from salary accounts to injured on duty accounts for public safety employees injured while on duty.

President McGee stated item 33 had 1 employee and item 34 had 10 employees. ---> Passed two readings and Adopted on a call of the roll of the yeas and nays--Yeas 12--Nays 0--Absent 1 (Rivera_I). Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take up items 35 through 39 as a package.

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, FIVE THOUSAND FOUR HUNDRED EIGHTY ONE AND 00/100 Dollars (\$5,481.00) as follows: FROM: 12201-51105 FIREFIGHTERS \$5,481.00 TOTAL: \$5,481.00 TO: 12201-51101 FIRE CHIEF \$5,481.00 TOTAL: \$5,481.00

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, SIXTEEN THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED AND 00/100 Dollars (\$16,500) as follows: FROM: 8812-10400 SEWER STABILIZATION \$16,500 TOTAL: \$16,500 TO: 60402-53011 SEWER – PROFESSIONAL SERVICES \$16,500 TOTAL: \$16,500

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, ONE HUNDRED THOUSAND AND 00/100 Dollars (\$100,000) as follows: FROM: 8815-10400 CANNABIS STABILIZATION \$100,000 TOTAL: \$100,000 TO: ..-.. SUBSTANCE ABUSE PROGRAMS \$100,000 TOTAL: \$100,000 To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

MCGIVERIN — that the amount of TWO THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED TWENTY THREE AND 40/100 Dollars (\$2,523.40) be authorized from the PURCHASING Department's TELEPHONE USAGE CHARGES (11382-53410) appropriation in fiscal year 2023 for services rendered in fiscal year 2022 which were unencumbered at the 2022 fiscal year end.

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

MCGIVERIN — that there be and is hereby appropriated by transfer in the fiscal year 2023, THIRTY SEVEN THOUSAND THREE HUNDRED FIFTY NINE AND 87 /100 Dollars (\$37,359.87) as follows: FROM: 11512-53010 SOLICITOR-SPECIAL COUNSEL \$37,359.87 TOTAL: \$37,359.87 TO: 12202-53011 (Fire Dept) INFORMATION TECHNOLOGIES \$19,359.87 12402-53008 WEIGHTS & MEASURES SERVICES 18,000.00 TOTAL: \$37,359.87

To the City Council:

I hereby recommend the passage of the above order at the meeting of your Council to be held Tuesday, March 7, 2023.

Joshua A Garcia, Mayor

---> Received and referred to the Finance Committee.

LATE FILED ORDERS AND COMMUNICATIONS

(3:36:40)

From Mayor Joshua A. Garcia, Executive Order on Remote Participation in Public Meetings ---> Received.

MCGEE, RIVERA_I -- That the mayor call a special meeting to have a full discussion on the police audit to get a detailed discussion on all points of the report.

Motion was made and seconded to suspend the necessary rules to take final action. ---> Received and Adopted. Copy to the Mayor.

Adjourned at 10:42 PM