footprint of the building would remain the same. The applicant is also proposing some minor modifications to the site including an expansion of the existing driveway, new bollard lighting and a handicap ramp on the rear of the building to provide exterior access to the lower level of the building. The Church has modified the proposed relationship with Basset Psychological Services in response to concerns of operating a business in the residential district and has proposed several conditions that they believe will limit the scope of Basset Psychological Services to ensure that the use could be considered an associated use with a place of worship.

Ms. Roblero explained that the applicant submitted a revised plan, which was considered by the Planning Commission on December 17, 2018. The changes to the application are outlined below:

44 45

46

47 48

49 50

51 52

53 54

55

56 57

- The driveway to the proposed Ministry Center was altered to provide for an increased setback from the adjacent property. The original submission showed the curve of the driveway to be approximately 2' off of the shared property line, which was a concern. The curve of the driveway is now shown at approximately 24.37' from the shared property line with the straight portion of the driveway being approximately 19' from the property line;
- In the original submission, the applicant proposed allowing a private company (Basset Psychological Services) be permitted to have offices in the Ministry Center as an associated use to the Church. Moving the permanent location of Basset Physiological Services to the building was cause for concern due to the fact that it could set a precedent for allowing a business to operate from a conditionally permitted use in a

ramp along the back of the building.

58

59

residential district. In response to concerns raised by staff, Planning Commission members and adjacent property owners, the Church withdrew the request to allow for Basset Psychological Services to operate from the Ministry Center. Instead, Basset Psychological Services would partner with the Church of the Saviour as well as The Montgomery Nursery School on-site to provide services; however, the physical location for the business would remain in Madeira. The Ministry Center would be used for group meetings, counseling and storage, which are uses directly related to the conditionally permitted use;

66 67

65

The applicant submitted a revised landscape plan to provide for a visual screen between the Ministry Center and the adjacent properties and stated that the Church will commit to maintaining the plantings; and.

68 69

70

71

72

73

74

75

The applicant provided some additional information regarding the proposed bollard lighting for the driveway. The bollard lights will be approximately 42" in height with louvers to distribute light downward. The applicant has stated that the light distributes 1 footcandle of light in a 4' radius with 0 footcandles at a 6' radius. The bollard lights would be installed approximately 1' - 2' from the driveway and therefore, will be in compliance with the light trespass regulations. The applicant has stated that they estimate there will be a need for 7 bollard lights on the north side of the driveway and 6 bollard lights on the south side. The Church is still evaluating the need for bollard lighting along the proposed handicap

76 77 78

79

80

Ms. Roblero explained that after hearing testimony and discussing the application, the Planning Commission voted 5-1 to recommend approval of the expansion of the conditional use permit to allow for the building at 8003 Pfeiffer Road to be used as a Ministry Center and approved the Final Development Plan with the following conditions:

81 82 83

84

1. The final design of the landscaping be reviewed and approved by Staff and the City Arborist. Landscaping shall be properly maintained as required by the Zoning Code and the Property Maintenance Code.

2. Post-construction stormwater best management practices shall be utilized as reviewed and approved by the City Engineer and the final stormwater management construction drawings shall be approved by the City Engineer.

89 90 91

3. The final location of the bollard lighting shall be reviewed and approved by Staff.

92 93 94

4. Any parallel parking spaces shall meet the dimensions as established in Schedule 151.3210(A).

5. The width of the drive shall be in compliance with the Zoning Code pending a legal opinion on whether the drive shall be considered a 'driveway' or an 'access drive'.

99

6. Any additional impervious surface due to modifications to the site plan based on conditions 4 and 5 shall be accounted for and the additional stormwater shall be accommodated appropriately.

100 101 102

City Council held a Public Hearing to consider the recommendation of the Planning Commission on January 23, 2019. After considering the case and hearing the testimony, City Council voted to remand the case back to the Planning Commission to get further clarification on several items as shown below:

104 105 106

103

Further clarification on the relationship between the Church and Basset Psychological Services and if Planning Commission is comfortable considering this an associated use with a place of worship;

Further clarification on what stormwater best management practices will be used and if the Planning Commission is recommending that best management practices be used for the entire site or only for the expanded drive;

- Planning Commission to review the final layout of the drive and verify that it meets the required setbacks provided in the Zoning Code and the Law Director's written opinion;
- Clarification of the existing impervious surface coverage and if Planning Commission is comfortable with the total impervious surface coverage including the expanded drive; and,
- Clarity on what existing landscaping would remain between the proposed Ministry Center and the adjacent properties.

Since the Public Hearing before City Council, the Church of the Saviour has made slight modifications to the proposed plans and/or provided additional clarification as described below:

- Basset Psychological Services: The Church has modified the proposed relationship with Basset Psychological Services in response to concerns of operating a business in the residential district. The Church has proposed several conditions that they believe will limit the scope of Basset Psychological Services and ensure that the use could be considered an associated use with a place of worship. The conditions proposed by the Church are below:
  - o Services offered at the Ministry Center will be limited to faith-based counseling;
  - o Services will be contracted by the Church for church or community programs on behavior or mental health;
  - o There will be no charges for use of the Ministry Center;
  - o The Church will contract with the provider for client counseling;
  - o Counseling space will be less than 25% of the total floor area; and,
  - o There will be no signage for the provider of services.
- Stormwater: The Church has provided drainage plans, which include best management practices, for the
  entire property. The proposed changes include new storm pipes to direct water to the existing detention
  basin, expansion of the existing detention basin with a modified outlet structure that will provide
  additional flood control as well as serving as a best management practice and a bioretention garden along
  the drive to the Ministry Center. The proposed stormwater plans have been reviewed and approved by
  the City Engineer;
- Drive layout: The drive to the Ministry Center has been revised to remove any parking along the drive. The proposed drive is 20' in width, which is the maximum width permitted for a driveway in the residential district. The proposed drive also meets the setback requirement as established in the Zoning Code and as confirmed in the Law Director's opinion;
- Impervious surface requirements: The applicant provided a table showing the existing amount of impervious surface to be 44%. The proposed changes to the site would increase the impervious surface to 45%; and,
- Landscaping: The landscaping plan has been provided with additional clarification on which trees will be removed and which trees will be remaining.

Following the Public Hearing, the applicant submitted a revised plan, which was considered by the Planning Commission on March 4, 2019 (see minutes). After hearing testimony and discussing the application, the Planning Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of the expansion of the conditional use permit to allow for the building at 8003 Pfeiffer Road to be used as a Ministry Center and approved the Final Development Plan with the following conditions:

• The conditions of use for the Ministry Center as proposed by the Church of the Saviour shall be imposed;

- Basset Physiological Services shall not move their office to the site; and,

 A continuous evergreen screen be planted between the existing driveway and the adjacent property to the
west. A plan for this planting shall be reviewed and approved by Staff and the City Arborist.

Ms. Roblero explained that since the Public Hearing before City Council, the applicant has removed all parking along the proposed drive in order to reduce impervious surface coverage as well as address concerns that the drive would have a more commercial feel with parking along the drive. The applicant has proposed an extensive evergreen buffer along the drive to the Ministry Center and the adjacent property owners and has provided additional clarification on what trees will be removed. Staff understands that the concerns from adjacent property owners about the removal of the existing vegetation; however, Staff believes that the majority of the existing vegetation is honeysuckle or scrub brush and that the proposed plan will provide for an effective buffer. The Church has also provided a plan to provide for an evergreen landscape buffer between the existing driveway and the property to the west, which has been approved by the City Arborist.

She stated at the Public Hearing before City Council, concerns regarding the use of the building for a private business persisted. The applicant has proposed several conditions to limit the scope of Basset Psychological Services and ensure that the use could be considered an associated use with a place of worship. Staff believes that the conditions proposed by the Church, in addition to a condition stating that the business shall not being moved to the site, would effectively limit the scope of Basset Psychological Services and ensure that the use is tied to the mission of a place of worship.

Ms. Roblero stated the applicant provided additional clarification of the proposed impervious surface coverage as requested by City Council. The existing conditions of the site provide for 44% impervious surface coverage and the proposed site improvements would increase the impervious surface coverage to 45%, which is less than the percentage previously recommended for approval by the Planning Commission. Staff believes that the increase in impervious surface is minor and is supportive of 45% impervious surface coverage due to the fact that the applicant has shown that the additional water runoff can be accommodated by the existing stormwater detention and best management practices will be installed for the entire site.

Ms. Roblero closed by stating that Staff is in support the recommendation of the Planning Commission to allow for the expansion of the conditional use permit to allow for the building at 8003 Pfeiffer Road to be utilized as a Ministry Center with the conditions as established by the Planning Commission.

Russ Naber, Church of the Saviour-Mr. Naber commented on the difficulty and frustration of the process but stated that he felt all needs have been represented in the revisions. He stated that the Church wanted to do the right thing even when they are not in agreement. Mr. Naber provided a summary of the changes made in the plans in regard to the landscape, width of the driveway and the drainage plans. He further explained that he met with Mr. Riblet, Ms. Roblero and Mr. Donnellon regarding Basset Services. He stated that as a result of that meeting the proposed services have been amended to match the approved associated uses as set forth per the code.

Mr. Cappel asked Mr. Naber if the changes to the stormwater management would retain more water than was able to be done in the past.

Mr. Naber replied that it would as they have added outlets in the basin.

Mrs. Bissmeyer asked if the amended services by Basset would only be offered thru the Church.

Mr. Naber replied that the contract with Basset Services would now be offered as part of the ministry of the Church.

Gerri Harbison, 7975 Pfeiffer Road-Mrs. Harbison thanked the Church for working with all the neighbors to come to an agreeable solution. She personally thanked Mr. Naber for his tireless efforts in working with the property

City Council Public Hearing Minutes April 3, 2019 Page 5.

owners and City staff. She stated that she is happy with the revisions.

Steve Silverman, 7504 Golf Green Drive-Mr. Silverman stated that he wanted to extend his appreciation to the Church for diligently working with the community. He explained that it was stated that the Public Works Director had review the storm water proposal and asked who has reviewed it from Hamilton County.

Mr. Heitkamp replied that it does not have to be reviewed by Hamilton County as the City has adopted their building code and requirements.

Mr. Suer stated that he felt this process resulted in a good faith effort on the part of the Church to address issues at the public meetings. He stated that for the applicant the process does seem tedious, however the City is very thorough and as a result we have a better project now that has met the needs of all involved.

Mr. Margolis thanked Mr. Naber. He stated that it has been somewhat of an adversarial process and that Mr. Naber has diligently worked through the process to reach compromise with the Planning Commission, the Board of Zoning Appeals and the neighbors.

Mayor Dobrozsi thanked the Planning Commission for their diligence in working through the process and for clarifying information when City Council remanded it back to them. He stated that this was a first time in a long time (if ever) that an application had been remanded back to the Commission. Mayor Dobrozsi also thanked staff for their dedication to working with all parties to reach a solution.

With all discussion complete, Mr. Cappel made the motion to approve the recommendation of the Planning Commission to allow for the expansion of the conditional use permit to allow for the building at 8003 Pfeiffer Road to be utilized as a Ministry Center with the conditions as established by the Planning Commission.

Mr. Margolis seconded. City Council unanimously agreed.

The roll was called and showed the following vote:

AYE: Cappel, Bissmeyer, Dobrozsi, Roesch, Suer, Margolis
(6)
NAY:
ABSTAIN: Harbison
(1)

Mayor Dobrozsi asked if there was any further business to be heard in the Public Hearing. There being none he asked for a motion to adjourn from the Public Hearing.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Connie Gaylor, Clerk & Council