1 2 3	City of Montgomery City Council Public Hearing Mir November 1, 2023	nutes
4 5	Present	City Council Members Present
6	Brian Riblet, City Manager	Craig Margolis, Mayor
7	Terry Donnellon, Law Director	Lee Ann Bissmeyer, Vice Mayor
8	Tracy Henao, Asst. City Manager	Mike Cappel
9	Gary Heitkamp, Public Works Director	Ron Messer
10	Maura Gray, Finance Director	Sasha Naiman
11	Greg Vonden Benken, Asst. Police Chief	Ken Suer
12	Paul Wright, Fire Chief	
13	Matthew Vanderhorst, Community and Information Serv. Dir.	Council Members Absent
14	Amy Frederick, Community Engagement Coordinator	Chris Dobrozsi
15	Connie Gaylor, Clerk of Council	
16		
17		

City Council convened its Public Hearing for November 1, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at City Hall with Mayor Margolis presiding.

Mayor Margolis requested a roll call.

The roll was called with all members present except Mr. Dobrozsi. Mr. Cappel moved to approve Mr. Dobrozsi's absence as he had previously notified Council of his scheduled absence. Mrs. Naiman seconded. City Council unanimously agreed.

Mayor Margolis explained the process for the Public Hearing. He explained that in a public hearing Council has the following options when considering an application:

- Approve the Recommendation
- Deny the Recommendation
- Remand the matter to Staff for more specific information or
- Take the matter under advisement and vote at another public meeting within thirty days.

Mayor Margolis explained that if City Council chooses the final option, it is suggested that they announce the date and time of the subsequent hearing when the matter will be discussed and considered for vote.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

 An application on behalf of McNair Living, LLC for a Modification of the Vintage Club Planned Development List of Conditions and Exceptions and Underlying Zone Change

 Mr. Chesar explained it is requested that City Council consider a recommendation from the Planning Commission for a modification of the Vintage Club Planned Development List of Conditions and Exceptions and an Underlying Zone Change to a portion of the property. The applicant, McNair Living, on behalf of Traditions VC Developer LLC, is proposing to construct a 144-unit Mixed Use/Independent Living Facility.

 Mr. Chesar explained that in June of 2023, a Concept Plan discussion occurred with the Planning Commission. Further information was requested regarding the parking analysis, proposed changes to the List of Conditions and Exceptions and building elevations to help understand the massing, scale, and height of the proposed building. In July of 2023, the Planning Commission held a public hearing and reviewed a proposed General Development Plan, rezoning request, and modification request to the Planned Unit Development's list of Conditions and Exceptions. Based on feedback heard from the public and Planning Commission the applicant modified the architecture, massing and increased parking while providing further summary details regarding the operations and use of the proposed 201,473 square feet facility with a total of 144 units as well as outward facing restaurants along Vintage Club Drive.

58

61

62

63

65

67

68

69

70

71 72

73 74

75

76 77 78

79

80

81

82

83 84

85

86

87

88 89

90

91

92

93

94

95 96 97

98 99

109

Mr. Chesar stated that the Planning Commission met on September 11, 2023 to consider a General Development Plan application as well as a Modification of the Vintage Club Planned Development List of Conditions and 59 Exceptions and Underlying Zone Change to a portion of the property (Auditor Parcels 6030A230231, 60 6030A230230, 06030A230218 & 6030A230219) from 'D-3' - Multi-Family with a Planned Unit Development (PUD) Overlay to 'L-B' - Limited Business with a Planned Unit Development (PUD) Overlay to allow for a 144 unit Mixed Use/Independent Living Facility. After hearing testimony and discussing the application, the Planning Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of the General Development Plan, proposed PUD 64 modifications and underlying zoning change. Mr. Chesar noted that a general development plan is generally a rough idea of the development; however, the applicant created a more refined plan to present at this meeting. 66

The four significant changes to the List of Conditions and Exceptions (not minor changes such as language correction references to the City Engineer/potential new development team, etc.):

- Removal of the Residential D3 section due to Staff's suggestion to make the underlying zoning consistent with 'LB' - Limited business. The language is no longer necessary as the zone would not exist.
- Limiting the density to 144 units for the new structure.
- Adjustment to Building Height to permit what has been already approved in the Vintage Club Development of up to 57 feet.
- Recognizing the intent for outdoor community space related to the forthcoming restaurant and increasing the setback to allow for outdoor dining and open space from 20 feet to 30 feet.

The conditions recommended by the Planning Commission are shown below:

- Acceptance of the ULI parking analysis provided by the applicant and updated parking plan of 1.2 parking ratio for the independent living units.
- Further discussions with the City regarding appropriate access configuration with the condition to be reviewed and refined as necessary during Final Development Plan approval.
- Review current pedestrian access options and make enhancements where possible to the public parking garage.
- The stormwater management, utility and grading plans be reviewed and approved by the City Engineer.
- A copy of the NPDES permit from the Ohio EPA be supplied to the Community Development Director.
- A copy of the Post Construction Best Management Plan Inspection and Maintenance Plan (I & M Plan) be properly recorded after completion of the stormwater improvements.

Mr. Chesar closed by stating the project is a significant development that will support the Vintage Club moving toward completion of the overall development that began over 16 years ago. The proposed McNair/Bespoke independent living concept is a distinctive development that will allow an upscale mixed-use facility providing housing alternatives for an aged and active population that desires independent style living that is not in a traditional nursing or assisted living type of facility. It will also serve to provide restaurant amenities to the overall Vintage Club that is walkable and holds true to the intentionally planned village concept.

Mr. Cappel asked for confirmation that the Bespoke facility is a for profit business.

Mr. Chesar replied that it was.

100 101 Mrs. Naiman asked for confirmation that the parking is calculated at 1.2 spaces per unit.

102 Mr. Chesar replied that was correct. 103

104 Mr. Donnellon stated that there will still be a small portion that will not be rezoned in the area of the public 105 parking garage. 106

107 Michal Giesler, 214 Legacy Lane-Ms. Geisler asked if the entrance and exit of the facility will be off the 108 roundabout.

City Council Public Hearing Minutes November 1, 2023 Page 3.

Mr. Chesar replied there would be access off the roundabout and also by the Christ Hospital.

Tom Hume, Traditions Building and Development -Mr. Hume thanked City Council and Staff for their support over the years. He stated that this project is one of the final pieces in completing the Vintage Club. He stated that he felt McNair brings everything to the table as it is a high end project and a great addition to the city. He stated he felt McNair has worked to try to meet as many needs as was possible.

<u>Les Stretch, McNair Living</u> – Mr. Stretch thanked City Council, staff and the residents for their collaboration on the project. He explained that none of their facilities are exactly the same and that meeting with the cities and the residents makes them unique and special. Mr. Stretch explained the changes made as result of resident feedback and the Planning Commission's requested changes. He stated the following changes:

<u>Building Massing</u>: In order to address verbalized concerns about the scale of the building in relation to the surrounding Vintage Club development, we relocated a number of units from the street edge to the south side of the property near the tree line.

• Vintage Club Blvd. - This reduced the number of stories from three stories to two stories.

 Vintage Club Drive - This reduced a portion of the building stories down from four to two stories adjacent to our drop off area, creating a more varied building scale at the termination of Vintage Club Drive.

• Legacy Lane - This reduced the building scale from four to three stories along the eastern edge closest to the neighbors along Legacy Lane.

<u>Building Set Back</u>: The Project has been pulled back from Vintage Club Blvd. an additional 12 feet from where it was previously shown to the City of Montgomery Planning Commission. This has created a larger public realm along the street.

<u>Building Presentation</u>: The Project has been reduced in its overall width by 12 feet, shortening the length of building along Vintage Club Blvd.

<u>Building Parking</u>: The 12-foot reduction in width allowed us to add an additional 29 parking spaces along the western property line adjacent to the public parking garage.

<u>Building Height</u>: The average overall building height has not changed from what was previously presented; however, with the reduction in stories along most of Vintage Club Blvd., the perceived building height from street level on the Blvd. has been reduced.

Mike Hawkins, 215 Legacy Lane- Mr. Hawkins stated that he wanted to relay that he felt Mr. Humes and McNair Living have worked hard to bring a great project about and is in favor of the development.

Mr. Suer stated that he thought the project was well vetted and reviewed. He explained that he has walked the site using the renderings to understand how it would fit in and relate to the other buildings. He stated that the entire development began 16 years ago and has gone through various stages and phases. He stated that there have been many issues large and small over that time, but they have always been worked out. In general, he feels the project has turned out nicely. He stated that this building will finish off the front area of the development and will be a good mix of uses. He stated that the developer along with staff have addressed the concerns that have arisen.

Mr. Messer stated that it was good to see and hear input from all parties. He stated he felt the completion of the development with this final facility would be a good thing.

Mrs. Naiman stated that she was happy that people spoke up to voice their needs and concerns. She stated that she appreciates the process of collaboration.

City Council Public Hearing Minutes November 1, 2023 Page 4.

Vice Mayor Bissmeyer stated to the audience that Council is aware of the concerns that the residents have. She explained that things have changed since the original plan and she feels that Council, Staff and the Developer have done the best that can be done at the given time. She stated that she felt this final product would address the concerns for options for residents who wish to downsize and/or need the optional services. She stated that now the focus would be on the restaurants and retail to finish it all out.

Mr. Cappel stated that he agrees with all of Council comments. He stated he feels it is a great project that fits our community. He thanked McNair for coming to the City.

Mayor Margolis restated that the options available to City Council related to this request were:

• Approve the Recommendation

• Deny the Recommendation

• Remand the matter to Staff for more specific information or

Take the matter under advisement and vote at another public meeting within thirty days.

 Mr. Cappel made a motion to approve the recommendation from the Planning Commission for a modification of the Vintage Club Planned Development List of Conditions and Exceptions and an Underlying Zone Change to a portion of the property as presented. Vice Mayor Bissmeyer seconded.

The roll was called and showed the following vote:

AYE: Cappel, Bissmeyer, Margolis, Naiman, Suer, Messer (6)
NAY: (0)
ABSENT: Dobrozsi (1)

An application for Expansion of a Conditional Use and Final Development Plan of a parking area for the Gate of Heaven Cemetery located at 11000 Montgomery Road

Mr. Chesar explained it is requested that City Council consider a recommendation from the Planning Commission regarding the Application for Expansion of a Conditional Use and Final Development Plan for the Gate of Heaven Cemetery regarding the construction of a new paved 20 space parking lot.

Mr. Chesar explained that the Archdiocese of Cincinnati/Gate of Heaven Cemetery as a part of growth in internment services previously received City Council approval on October 5, 2022 to construct two new mausoleums with the first mausoleum currently under construction and the second anticipated as needed in the future. Each mausoleum structure is approximately 2,860 square feet. The mausoleums will be located on the western side of the cemetery approximately 240 feet away from Montgomery Road between the offices and columbarium structures. The applicant is now requesting approval of additional parking spaces to support the overall office as well as forthcoming mausoleum uses.

Mr. Chesar explained that the property is zoned 'A' Single Family Residential, and cemeteries are conditionally permitted use in the district. The property has been utilized as a cemetery since 1947. The surrounding properties to the north are zoned 'A' Single Family Residential and 'D3' Multi-Family Residential (Vintage Club), east and south are zoned 'A' Single Family Residential and used for single family residences. The property to the west is mostly located in the township with a small area zoned 'GB' General Business. Overall, a majority of the frontage of the property is bound by Montgomery Road on the west and I-275 on the south.

Mr. Chesar stated that the Planning Commission met on September 11, 2023, to consider the application for the expansion of a conditional use and the Final Development Plan. After hearing testimony and discussing the

City Council Public Hearing Minutes November 1, 2023 Page 5.

application, the Planning Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of the expansion of the conditional use permit and approve the Final Development Plan. The conditions recommended by the Planning Commission are shown below:

214215216

217218

212

213

- Final stormwater regulations be met in conformance with Hamilton County Stormwater Regulations.
- The Final Development Plan be approved with City Council's approval of the Expansion of Conditional Use.
- Final landscaping be approved subject to the City Arborist.

219220221

222

223

Mr. Chesar stated in closing the project enhances the development of internment services provided by the Gate of Heaven Cemetery. The proposed parking area is on a small portion of the overall property and is intended to serve visitors to the cemetery. Overall, it appears the addition of parking spaces should not have any negative impact on surrounding properties. Therefore, Staff supports the recommendation of the Planning Commission.

224225226

Mr. Cappel asked if there were any flooding issues in the area of the parking.

227228

229

Mr. Chesar replied that there were none of which he was aware. He stated that it was such a small area that it may be exempt from the flood plan. He stated that Gate of Heaven's engineers would be required to comply with the Hamilton County requirements.

230231

Mr. Messer asked about the setback requirements of the parking lot and asked if it could be seen from the road.

233234

Mr. Chesar stated the while it could, it would be difficult with the landscaping and traffic to notice it.

235236

Vice Mayor Bissmeyer asked how many acres that Gate of Heaven encompassed.

237

238 Mr. Chesar replied approximately 160.

239240

Mr. Suer stated that he felt this was a small project in comparison to others we deal with. He stated that the landscaping would be a good buffer.

241242243

Mayor Margolis called for a motion on the recommendation.

244245

Mr. Cappel moved to approve the recommendation from the Planning Commission regarding the Application for Expansion of a Conditional Use and Final Development Plan for the Gate of Heaven Cemetery regarding the construction of a new paved 20 space parking lot as presented. Vice Mayor Bissmeyer seconded.

247248249

246

The roll was called and showed the following vote:

250 251

AYE: Cappel, Bissmeyer, Margolis, Naiman, Suer, Messer	(6)
NAY:	(0)
ABSENT: Dobrozsi	(1)

253254

252

255256

An application for Expansion of a Conditional Use and Final Development Plan for an accessory service building for The Audi Connection

257258

Mayor Margolis stated that he would recuse himself from the discussion on this item as he lives in close proximity to the property. Mayor Margolis asked Vice Mayor Bissmeyer to officiate over the discussion and exited the dais.

259260261

262

263

Mr. Chesar explained that it is requested that City Council consider a recommendation from the Planning Commission for an Expansion of a Conditional Use to allow for the construction of a new accessory service building for The Audi Connection at 9678 Montgomery Road. The new service building would be approximately

3,502 sq. ft. with four service bays as well as an additional car wash bay.

Mr. Chesar provided background explaining that the Audi Connection is a conditionally permitted use in the 'GB' – General Business District and has been in operation in this location since 2005. An approved 2021 Planning Commission expansion onto the property at 9722 Montgomery Road included additional display and inventory space for the dealership. As part of the project, an existing curb cut on the property at 9722 Montgomery Road was eliminated. The 9722 Montgomery Road LLC property is owned by members of the Joseph family; however, it is not the same ownership as the group who own the existing Audi and cannot be consolidated.

The Board of Zoning Appeals on June 20, 2023, approved a variance to allow the service building to have side yard setbacks of 5' where 10' is required per Schedule 151.1205(A) of the Montgomery Zoning Code. The setback variance approved allowed for the service building to be located closer to the Chevrolet Car Dealership to the north in lieu of a potential southern location that could have had more impact on residential properties to the south and east.

The property to the north is zoned 'GB' and used for parking for Columbia Chevrolet. The property to the east is zoned 'A' Single Family and used for single family residences. The property to the south of the existing Audi is zoned 'GB' and used for another car dealership. The properties to the east across Montgomery Road are zoned 'GB' and used for an office building and a vacant retail building.

Mr. Chesar stated the Planning Commission met on September 11, 2023, for a final development plan application on the project and considered the application for the expansion of a conditional use. After hearing testimony and discussing the application, the Planning Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of the expansion of the conditional use permit and approve the Final Development Plan. The conditions recommended by the Planning Commission are shown below:

• Final stormwater regulations be met in conformance with Hamilton County Stormwater Regulations.

• Area for vehicles waiting to be serviced or returned to the customers following service shall be indicated on the approved site plan.

All service operations will occur in the enclosed building with service doors closed.

• The Final Development Plan be approved with City Council's approval of the Expansion of Conditional Use.

Mr. Chesar stated in closing, the project is a significant development that will expand the onsite car washing and servicing space for Audi Connection. The proposed expansion will also provide for a reduction of traffic on Montgomery Road as currently Audi is using the wash bay at the Chevrolet dealership and will not need to do so with the new service building construction. It should be noted that the wash bay is only for cars, serviced by Audi and will not be open to the public.

Mr. Messer asked if noise would be a consideration for the adjacent property owners.

Mr. Chesar replied that the doors would be closed when cars were being washed and that there could be noise from the blowers as cars were exiting the building. He stated that the applicant could address that question as well.

Mr. Cappel asked if the runoff from the car wash would connect to the storm sewer.

Mr. Heitkamp and Ms. Henao both replied that it would drain to the sanitary sewer.

Vice Mayor Bissmeyer asked if by adding this portion to the building would impact the loading and unloading of the cars. She stated she still sees trucks unloading vehicles in the center turn lanes, which is against the law.

Mr. Chesar stated it will not impact the loading and unloading but it was a good reminder to the applicant that it

City Council Public Hearing Minutes November 1, 2023 Page 7.

316 should not be happening.

Mr. Messer asked if this addition would require additional employees.

Kevin Bleichner, Audi Connection- Mr. Bleichner addressed Council's questions. He explained that the addition would add two bays with lifts, two detail bays and one car wash bay. He stated that it would allow for increased employment of technicians. He also added that the addition will match the exact exterior materials as the existing building.

Vice Mayor asked for a motion on this item.

Mr. Messer moved to approve the recommendation from the Planning Commission for an Expansion of a Conditional Use to allow for the construction of a new accessory service building for The Audi Connection at 9678 Montgomery Road with the conditions recommended. Mr. Suer seconded.

The roll was called and showed the following vote:

AYE: Cappel, Bissmeyer, Naiman, Suer, Messer	(5)
NAY:	(0)
ABSENT: Dobrozsi	(1)
ABSTAIN: Margolis	(1)

Mayor Margolis joined Council on the dais.

Mayor Margolis asked if there was any further business to be heard in the Public Hearing. There being none, he asked for a motion to adjourn from the Public Hearing.

Mr. Cappel made a motion to adjourn. Vice Mayor Bissmeyer seconded. City Council unanimously agreed.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:10 p.m. 346

Connie Gaylor, Clerk of Council

Corne Marelo