

CITY OF OAKWOOD  
STATE OF OHIO  
DECEMBER 9, 2019

The Council of the city of Oakwood, State of Ohio, met in a work session and executive session at 6:00 p.m. in the conference room of the city of Oakwood, 30 Park Avenue, Oakwood, Ohio, 45419. Council then met in a regular session at 7:30 p.m. in the council chambers of the city of Oakwood.

The Mayor, Mr. William Duncan, presided, and the Clerk of Council, Ms. Lori Stacel, recorded. Mayor Duncan opened the meeting by asking all present to participate in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Upon call of the roll, the following members of Council responded to their names:

MR. WILLIAM D. DUNCAN.....	PRESENT
MR. STEVEN BYINGTON .....	PRESENT
MR. ROBERT P. STEPHENS.....	PRESENT
MRS. ANNE S. HILTON.....	PRESENT
MR. CHRISTOPHER B. EPLEY .....	PRESENT

Officers of the City present were the following:

Mr. Norbert S. Klopsch, City Manager  
Mr. Robert F. Jacques, City Attorney  
Ms. Carol Collins, Leisure Services Director  
Mrs. Cindy Stafford, Finance Director  
Chief Alan Hill, Public Safety Director  
Mrs. Jennifer Wilder, Personnel and Properties Director  
Ms. Lori Stacel, Clerk of Council

The following visitors registered:

Brian Barr, *Oakwood Register*  
PSO Kyle Sewert and Family  
Various Members of Oakwood Safety Department  
Bill Frapwell, 400 Hathaway Road, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Dave Dickerson, 216 Lookout Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Don Weir, 124 E. Thruston Boulevard, Oakwood, OH 45409  
Laura Rapoch, 310 Wonderly Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Sam Casebere, 62 Forrer Road, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Lucas Butler  
Aidan Shook  
Judy Cook, 937 Far Hills Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Cate Berger, 423 Glendora Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Ben & Erin Kunz, 31 Triangle Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Sam Dorf, 101 Oak Knoll Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Rick Carlile, 145 Wisteria Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Leslie Picca, 317 Dellwood Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Susanne Ordonez, 440 Irving Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45409  
Raul Ordonez, 440 Irving Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45409  
Wolfgang Kuhn  
Lisbeth Kuhn  
Jason Reynolds, 253 Wonderly Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Jan Kelly, 254 Telford Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Mark Risley, 2502 Shafor Boulevard #4, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Ellen & Steve Walters, 474 Lookout Ridge, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Tim Benford, 132 Greenmount Boulevard, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Sabrina Neeley, 123 Oak Knoll Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Grant Neeley, 123 Oak Knoll Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Connie Kearns, 417 Dellwood Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Leon Chuck, 228 Triangle Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Carol Holm, 223 Hilltop Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Anthony Smith, 11 Dellwood Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Cadi Polk, 336 Corona Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Stefanie Campbell, 217 Schenck Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45409  
Julia Randel, 214 Spirea Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Michele Berry, 120 Grandon Road, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Sam Pennington, 225 Lonsdale Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Meghan Henning, 951 E. Schantz Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Patty Caruso, 185 Lookout Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Crecia Orsello, 37 Park Road, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Rachel Collopy, 305 Orchard Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Joshua Ginsberg, 225 Rubicon Road, Oakwood, OH 45419  
Matt Currie, 263 Ridgewood Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419

Lindsey Banning, 335 Wiltshire Boulevard, Oakwood, OH 45419  
 Earl Banning, 335 Wiltshire Boulevard, Oakwood, OH 45419  
 Suki Kwon, 901 Acorn Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419

The following individuals were observed in attendance, but did not sign in:  
 John Enis, 233 Wisteria Drive, Oakwood, OH 45419  
 Healy Jackson, 118 Lonsdale Avenue, Oakwood, OH 45419  
 Dan Turben, 204 Forrer Boulevard, Oakwood, OH 45419  
 Ellis Jacobs, Sr. Attorney with ABLE

Mrs. Hilton advised Council she had read the meeting minutes of the November 4 regular session and work session and November 18 work session and executive session. Mrs. Hilton reported she found the minutes correct and complete. Therefore, it was moved by Mrs. Hilton and seconded by Mr. Epley that the minutes of the sessions of Council aforementioned be approved as written and the reading thereof at this session be dispensed with. Upon a viva voce vote on the question of the motion, same passed unanimously and it was so ordered.

#### STATUS REPORTS

Report from Citizen Budget Review Committee – Mayor Duncan invited Budget Review Committee Chair Dave Dickerson and Vice Chair Bill Frapwell to make a few comments about the committee's role in providing input on financial matters.

Dave Dickerson and Bill Frapwell addressed Council. Mr. Dickerson shared that the Oakwood Budget Review Committee (BRC) has been in place for over 30 years. The committee consists of 35 members with five representing each of Oakwood's seven voting precincts. The committee's role is to advise city staff and Council on city financial matters, and to communicate the viewpoint of Oakwood residents regarding the extent of public services they desire and their willingness to pay the associated costs. The key to the committee is that members provide not only their own opinions but also provide the opinions of other Oakwood residents.

The committee was very pleased to see city staff propose a balanced budget for 2020 for the second year in the row. The committee worked with city leaders to cut costs and to find new sources of revenue so that we can continue to receive the finest city services here in Oakwood.

In regards to the proposed 2020 budget, the committee met four times this year to receive detailed briefings on financial matters and to provide feedback and counsel to Oakwood city leaders. They believe that the budget proposal before City Council tonight is a responsible one and will meet the needs of the Oakwood community. The BRC fully endorses the budget and recommends to city council that the 2020 Budget be approved as presented. Recognizing the capital equipment needs in maintaining the City, including the stormwater infrastructure, the BRC also supports the \$3 per month increase in the residential stormwater fee.

On behalf of the citizen volunteers on the budget committee, Mr. Dickerson thanked Council and city staff for providing the BRC an opportunity to serve the community.

Mr. Frapwell shared that city staff works hard to find ways to save money while still effectively running the City. He thanked Mr. Klopsch and city staff for going out of their way to provide financial information with transparency. He closed his comments by stating that the BRC and citizens of Oakwood appreciate having a sense of where the money is going.

Mayor Duncan thanked Mr. Dickerson and Mr. Frapwell for their leadership and also thanked the members of the Budget Review Committee for their voluntary service. He shared that there are a few openings on the BRC, so City Council will be looking for qualified candidates.

Honoring Detective Jorge Del Rio – Mayor Duncan stated that we will now play a video honoring Detective Del Rio for his service to the Dayton community. Following the video, Mayor Duncan added that he was honored to attend Detective Del Rio's funeral along with Oakwood Public Safety Chief Hill, Captain Jones and Captain Pruszynski.

Mayor Duncan invited Chief Hill to share some personal comments about Detective Del Rio. Chief Hill read the following statement:

*"Nobility – greatness of character and high ethical qualities or ideals that serve a cause greater than self; faithfulness to a higher calling or purpose.*

*The nobility of policing defines the career of Detective Jorge Del Rio. For 12 years, Detective Del Rio patrolled the streets of the City of Dayton until his true calling came, his assignment to the Dayton DEA Drug Task Force. Since 2001, Detective Del Rio served our region in this capacity making an immeasurable impact. Detective Del Rio was a highly skilled and highly trained investigator who was a natural for this assignment.*

*Dr. Stephen Covey stated the actions of any police officer can impact an individual life or even a community for generations. And that is exactly what Detective Del Rio did for the past 18 years. Detective Del Rio served on the front line of the war on drugs impacting countless of individual lives, without them knowing it, and making our community a safer place to live and work all while remaining anonymous, to most, until the time of his death. Making a difference in the quality of life is an opportunity that policing provides and few other professions can offer. Detective Del Rio died while removing a massive quantity of deadly narcotics from our region.*

*Detective Del Rio's death is extremely personal to me as I had the great pleasure and honor of working alongside Jorge during my last assignment with the Montgomery County Sheriff's Office before being hired by Oakwood. We served together on the Dayton DEA Drug Task Force. Jorge was a tremendously kind and generous man with a great personality who was always willing to lend a helping hand to a newly assigned fellow task force officer. I saw firsthand Jorge's daily commitment and dedication to this dangerous and critically necessary assignment.*

*On November 4, Jorge was shot while executing a search warrant on a drug house, something Jorge had done hundreds, if not thousands, of times before in his career. He passed away on November 7, 2019. Daily, the men and women who serve in these capacities are selflessly disregarding their own safety for the betterment of others. For those of us that have been there, we are fully aware of what is potentially waiting on the other side of that door; a world of drugs and violence and everything else that comes along with it. Many stories about dangerous drug enforcement actions are often reported in media outlets but far too often we fail to take a moment to recognize that there are men and women, such as Jorge, who are willing to give their life, in hopes of making a difference in the lives of others.*

*So now, we honor Jorge for his commitment and dedication to his drug enforcement work, and we remember Jorge for his contributions to making our Dayton region and beyond a better place. I pray for his wife, four daughters, and three grandchildren, along with all the people who loved and knew Jorge that they can find comfort in knowing that Jorge served his family and community with honor and valor, and had a life changing impact on countless lives.*

*Rest comfortably my friend, we will take it from here!"*

Message from Principal Tim Badenhop – Mayor Duncan read the following note from Oakwood Junior High Principal Tim Badenhop. This note was distributed to all students and parents at Oakwood Junior High during the week of Detective Del Rio's funeral.

*"In light of a week that's been, I'll use this week's brief note to share how thankful I am for the partnership we have with the Safety Department. This probably isn't a surprise to those of you who are in the building frequently, but we have the daily opportunity to interact with officers who come by to check in, walk the hallways, and simply make their presence known to our students and staff. I think I can speak for nearly everyone in the building when I write that I feel safer each day in knowing that the department is always working to keep the community safe.*

*A story that is often retold in our halls dates to one morning a few years ago. Similar to what happened last week with a squirrel meeting its untimely demise in connection with a power outage, one of the furry critters blew the transformer supplying electricity to our building. A community member heard the loud noise apparently coming from the school building and called the dispatcher at the Safety Department, who in turn called OHS to check in. When that call could not be completed (due to the outage), our campus was FILLED with officers in what seemed like mere seconds. Looking back, it's a fun story to tell – the officers were a little over-equipped to encounter a retired rodent. In the moment, though, I'm certain that the officers didn't come to the building expecting a fun story. They came anyway. More likely, they came because. And they came prepared to do whatever would keep your children and our students, staff, and faculty safe – regardless of what that meant for each officer. I had never really doubted that they would come if there were ever a threat, but now I simply know they will.*

*When you get the opportunity, be sure to thank an officer. I'm sure thankful for their willing service to our students, staff, faculty, and community!"*

PSO Swear-In – Mayor Duncan recognized new Public Safety Officer Kyle Sewert and his family. He then administered the Oath of Office. Chief Hill welcomed and introduced PSO Sewert. He shared that PSO Sewert has been certified and actively working in all three public safety disciplines for the past ten years. His experience and background makes him a natural fit for the Oakwood public safety organization.

Citizens Police Academy – Mr. Stephens read the following letter from Oakwood resident Healy Jackson:

*“Reflections of a Citizen Police Academy Graduate*

*When I applied to participate in Oakwood’s 10-week Citizen Police Academy program, I assumed its purpose was primarily to raise citizen awareness and build support for the Public Safety Department. Even though I already appreciated how quickly our officers respond to emergencies, patrol our neighborhoods, and attend block parties, I felt obligated to commit, thinking that if citizens don’t participate in community-building programs the City offers, such programs won’t survive. With that thought, I applied.*

*It took just one class for me to realize that I had a lot to learn about the department’s operations. Most importantly, I came to realize that our relatively small public safety department has an impact that reaches far beyond our community.*

*And what did I learn about the department that motivates this article?*

- *I now comprehend the tremendous economic advantages of a consolidated safety department. Had Oakwood not started its combined department of police, firefighters, and emergency services back in 1927, it is unlikely, due to the influence of labor unions, that we would enjoy the economic advantages our department ensures today.*
- *I understand how the department determines new hires. Candidates must have completed 12 months of employment as a full-time police officer, career firefighter, or paramedic. The average new hire has 6.5 years of service. Officer candidates submit to psychological testing, a medical exam, background investigation, and at least two oral interview boards. Rank and file officers serve on the interview boards because they have a vested interest in the skills and temperaments of new hires.*
- *I learned that members of the department rotate through specialized assignments: The Kettering Regional Special Weapons and Tactics (SWAT) team, the Miami Valley Communication Council’s Tactical Crime Suppression Unit (TCSU), the FBI Joint Terrorism Task Force (JTTF), and the TCSU Accident Investigation Team. Each of these assignments requires advanced, specialized training that far exceeds the training most police officers receive. These skilled teams have had high impact minimizing crimes within our city limits these past few years. Because the assignments rotate and our officer retention is high, our street patrol officers stay prepared for the extraordinary.*

*Given the training and the years of experience Oakwood officers have, one might wonder why an officer would want to spend a career in Oakwood. I concluded it is because Oakwood’s 29 officers spend the vast majority of their time helping people rather than enforcing the law. Last year officers responded to 5,751 citizen-initiated calls for service and 1,395 9-1-1 calls. They helped investigate 115 traffic crashes, answered 113 fire calls for service, and made 420 EMS runs. It must feel good to use one’s expertise to ensure others’ well-being.*

*Another reason for officer satisfaction is because there is a culture of professionalism and respect within the department. The officers I observed truly embrace their department’s motto, “Service Before Self,” and its core values. I saw the respectful manner in which officers shared information about each other’s training and years on the force. Their deep camaraderie evidenced by how they pool their resources to make the Citizen Police Academy instructive and enjoyable.*

*A third reason I suspect officers choose to work in Oakwood is that there are opportunities to advance their skills in firearm use, criminal investigations, crime analysis, particular response team protocols, technical equipment, and training and emergency management. Oakwood officers continuously train to maintain the high-level skills of investigators, analysts, and crises first responders. Their skills and knowledge extend to law enforcement and intelligence from across seven municipalities. Before my first class, I grossly underestimated the range of training our public safety employees receive. I didn’t appreciate how many Oakwood officers are considered an expert in their area and leverage that expertise to teach others in departments throughout the country.*

*The hours I spent driving a fire truck, taking fingerprints, using firearms, handling fire equipment, simulating traffic stop scenarios, and applying the “use of force” continuum were unique experiences for me. My real takeaway from the Academy, however, is that I*

*learned the officers in my community, although highly trained to protect me in a dangerous circumstance, are most often involved in doing the behind the scenes work that builds trust with residents and facilitates a sense of security. This relationship explains why Oakwood citizens feel comfortable calling the police when they see something they think should be investigated or want their homes watched when they are out of town.*

*Next August, you will have the opportunity to apply for the 3rd Citizen Police Academy. I believe you will find it rewarding and excellent use of your time."*

Mayor Duncan thanked Mrs. Jackson for her comments. He then invited Chief Hill to speak about the Citizens Police Academy (CPA).

Chief Hill shared that the Oakwood Public Safety Department hosted its second Citizens Police Academy (CPA) this year. The CPA is a unique opportunity for citizens to better understand the job of a public safety officer and also serve as a way for Safety Department personnel to hear the needs and expectations of the community. Oakwood's Public Safety Department is the sole department in the state of Ohio that operates as a fully consolidated department. All of Oakwood's sworn officers are state certified in law enforcement, firefighting and emergency medical services. The CPA is a 10-week program where participants meet one night per week for approximately two hours. The next CPA will be held in the fall of 2020.

Mayor Duncan encouraged residents to attend the next Citizens Police Academy. It is a great opportunity to learn more about the unique services the Oakwood Public Safety Department provides. Mayor Duncan then confirmed with Chief Hill that the class size is typically around 12 to 15 people.

Traffic Enforcement – Mayor Duncan read the following letter from Rabbi Nochum Mangel, Executive Director of the Chabad of Greater Dayton.

*"I am writing you to let you know that I am a proud resident of Oakwood and that I am proud of the progress that Oakwood has made in welcoming minorities to its community.*

*When I first came to Dayton, we decided to locate to the south suburbs, even though the majority of the Jewish community and most of its institutions were in the north. I was well aware of the history that Oakwood had regarding Jews buying homes or living in its neighborhood. Therefore we didn't know what to expect when we decided to move here and to establish Chabad of Greater Dayton, a Jewish institution, in the center of Oakwood.*

*As I got to know more and more of our neighbors, residents, and the city government and management, especially Norbert Klopsch, it became clear to me that Oakwood was a great place to be, for our community and for us personally.*

*Whether it was the zoning board's accommodation of Chabad's needs for parking, the cooperation of Captain Mike Jones of the police to work with us in facilitating safety at special events, or the helpfulness of the Oakwood Schools, our life here has been wonderful.*

*I remember the powerful emotions, so many members of the Dayton community felt when Mayor Judy Cook joined us in her official capacity the night we dedicated our new center and when she participated in our giant public menorah lighting ceremony. She acknowledged the intolerant past and embraced the new Oakwood that welcomed and celebrated this public beacon of Jewishness in its midst.*

*People greet us regularly as we walk the sidewalks; my wife and I, and our children made acquaintances easily sitting and chatting in the city's parks. The feeling has been warm and welcoming for us from the start.*

*I am not so foolish to think that this or any other community is perfect. Show me a utopia, and I'll move there. But I know for a fact that my experiences have been consistently positive. Political leaders have been responsive; administrators have been encouraging and cooperative. First responders have always been courteous and friendly. When we had smoke in our garage, for instance, the fire crew was helpful and stayed until everything had been set right to make sure that we don't need to worry anymore. We have never experienced prejudice here from anyone. Quite the contrary, Oakwood is a place we are proud to call home.*

Mayor Duncan then read the following statement which is Oakwood City Council's response to the ABLÉ report on traffic enforcement in Oakwood.

*"On September 30, 2019, the city of Oakwood received a five page report entitled "Who Gets Stopped in Oakwood? The Racial Divide". The report was prepared by Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. ("ABLE"). The authors are Ellis Jacobs, Senior Attorney with ABLE, and Dr. Martha Hurley, Ph.D., University of Dayton Professor and Director of Criminal Justice Studies. The report is attached as Exhibit A. Exhibit B attached hereto is a statement read aloud and into the record by Mayor William Duncan at the October 7, 2019 Oakwood City Council meeting. As mentioned in the October 7, 2019 statement, the city of Oakwood takes all matters related to the delivery of public safety services very seriously. The city committed to completing a thorough review of the report and to prepare a written response. This document is that response.*

#### TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT

*The city of Oakwood has a long history of placing strong emphasis on traffic enforcement. This has been the case for decades and will continue. It is a cornerstone of our Public Safety Department's policing philosophy and plays a key role in reducing crime, OVI, and other traffic offenses that often directly or indirectly contribute to unsafe situations, and vehicle and/or pedestrian accidents. The result is a community where all citizens are comfortable in their homes and on city streets, and in particular where parents are confident that their children are in a safe environment.*

#### WHY IS TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT A HIGH PRIORITY IN OAKWOOD?

*The entire city of Oakwood consists of approximately two square miles with nearly all of the land area devoted to residential living. Exhibit C attached hereto is a map of Oakwood that shows in yellow highlight the residential land and blue highlight the commercial. Oakwood is essentially one big residential neighborhood. State Route 48 (Far Hills Avenue) bisects Oakwood. It is a 4-lane highway serving as a major and primary thoroughfare between downtown Dayton and the southern Montgomery County suburbs. In 2016, about 13,400 vehicles per day travelled through Oakwood along Far Hills Avenue. The count was about 15,300 per day in 2019. (Source: Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission)*

*There are four public schools in Oakwood, one elementary on the west side of Far Hills Avenue and an elementary, junior high and high school on the east side. Oakwood is a walking community in every respect. Given the small geographic size of the community and short distances to each of the four schools, Oakwood does not operate a school busing system. Hundreds of Oakwood students in grades 1-12 cross Far Hills Avenue daily as they travel to and from school, play in and around our community, go home for lunch, and socialize with friends. The unique characteristics of our community demand regular and focused attention on traffic enforcement.*

#### THE REPORT

*From a data analysis perspective, the ABLE report is seriously flawed in several ways, rendering it inconclusive at best or invalid at worst. The primary flaws are:*

- 1. The report focuses on a comparison, by race, of traffic citations. It presents a breakdown by race of persons receiving traffic citations, yet does not provide a breakdown by race of persons driving through the community, as this information is unknown and unknowable. The report also does not present a breakdown by race of persons that are driving through the community with suspended drivers licenses, outdated vehicle registrations, active warrants or in stolen vehicles. During our subsequent discussions with the authors of the report, they acknowledged this lack of significant key data.*
- 2. The report directly compares the city of Oakwood with the city of Kettering, yet the two communities are very different. Oakwood is about 2 square miles, almost entirely residential, and with one major thoroughfare bisecting it. Kettering is a mixed use community of about 18 square miles with a roadway network much more expansive than Oakwood. Like for Oakwood, the report provides no data on the breakdown by race of persons driving on the various Kettering streets, nor does it address differences in Oakwood and Kettering traffic enforcement priorities.*

#### LICENSE PLATE CHECKS

*An important tool used by the Oakwood Public Safety Department, and by police departments throughout Ohio and nationwide, is license plate checks, whether officer initiated or via automatic license plate readers. This tool is used to locate persons with active warrants for arrest and stolen vehicles. It also identifies unlicensed and suspended drivers. The ABLE report expresses concerns about the use of license plate checks as a policing tool, despite the fact that it has been upheld as a valid, lawful tool by*

federal courts, including our own 6<sup>th</sup> Circuit U.S. Court of Appeals. (See *United States v. Ellison*, 462 F.3d 557 (6<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2006).) Oakwood finds this tool particularly useful to ensure a safe community. There can be no question that unlicensed, uninsured, or suspended drivers pose a danger to everyone, and there is value in detecting these offenses when they occur.

From January 1, 2016 through October 28, 2019, the Oakwood Public Safety Department made 152 warrant arrests. These arrests originated from a variety of scenarios including: 1) investigation of suspicious persons; 2) dispatch calls for service; 3) routine field interviews; 4) other local agencies locating a subject on an Oakwood warrant; and 5) traffic stops. Of the 152 arrests, 34 were a direct result of random license plate checks. Nearly one quarter of the persons with arrest warrants were found via random license plate checks. It is also important to note that when running license plate checks, officers must obtain additional information before they have sufficient probable cause to make a traffic stop for any reason other than an outstanding warrant. When a plate check identifies a licensing issue, it only indicates that the vehicle's registered owner has an outstanding licensing issue. The officer must confirm that the person driving matches the description of the registered owner, and this must occur before initiating the traffic stop. Although license plate checks are an important and valuable policing tool, they are only one small part of the Oakwood traffic enforcement program.

In 2016, the year that was analyzed by ABLE, the Oakwood Public Safety Department made 392 traffic stops through the use of random license plate checks, stops that resulted in the operator receiving a traffic citation for a suspended driver's license or driving without a license. Of those 392 stops, 143 involved black drivers. During the same year, the Safety Department conducted 4,302 traffic stops. Of these traffic stops, 2,216 or 52% resulted only in a warning to the driver. The legal, lawful, and standard practice of conducting license plate checks accounts for only about 9% of our total enforcement activity, and just 3% of our total enforcement activity involved license plate stops of black drivers. The two streets where license plate checks are most often conducted are Far Hills Avenue and Shroyer Road. The daily vehicle traffic volume on these two streets is about 29,000 cars per day or 10.6 million vehicles annually. (Source: Miami Valley Regional Planning Commission)

#### THE OAKWOOD MUNICIPAL COURT

Oakwood has its own municipal court and employs a city prosecutor. The prosecutor and court operate in compliance with all state laws and the court is recognized as well run and fair to all. There is no evidence to suggest that persons of any race or ethnicity are treated differently in the Oakwood Municipal Court. The Oakwood Municipal Court operates a driver's license intervention program to assist those who are cited for driving while unlicensed or under suspension. Through this program, many participants have been successful in resolving outstanding suspensions, forfeitures, and warrant blocks, earning substantial charge reductions and exiting the program with a valid driver's license and automobile insurance.

#### PERCEPTION OF OAKWOOD

Some people perceive Oakwood as unwelcoming to minorities. This is an image assigned decades ago, but it is not an accurate description of our community today. Oakwood has become more diverse over the past decade or two and we believe that this positive trend will continue.

#### ACTIONS THE CITY WILL TAKE

The ABLE report recommended that Oakwood commission an independent study of its current traffic stop data, and adopt policies and provide training to ensure that all people driving in Oakwood are treated fairly and without discrimination. In subsequent meetings with city staff, the ABLE authors also requested that the Oakwood Public Safety Department discontinue the use of random license plate checks.

The city will not commission an independent study because an independent study would not change the fact that the ABLE report cannot be interpreted meaningfully without additional data that is both unknown and unknowable.

In the delivery of public services, the city continuously looks for opportunities to improve. Notwithstanding that the ABLE report is inconclusive at best or invalid at worst, the city will take the following actions:

1. We will continue to regularly review and update as necessary our existing anti-bias policies to reflect law enforcement best practices. A copy of our existing policy, which has been in place since 2012, is attached hereto as Exhibit D;

2. *We will continue our training of Oakwood Public Safety Officers and Command Staff on matters relating to cultural diversity, implicit and explicit bias and related topics, consistent with recognized law enforcement best practices. Our current training, which has also been in place since 2012, is effective and equals or exceeds training provided by other local jurisdictions. We will evaluate post-training impact assessment programs to determine if they add value to our training and provide measurable and meaningful benefits;*
3. *We will continue our policies and procedures relating to the conduct of lawful license plate checks;*
4. *We will continue to openly support the positive values of diversity in our community and encourage like support by all of our citizens; and*
5. *We will continue to support our Public Safety Department and its outstanding professionals to ensure they enforce our traffic laws and keep our community safe."*

Mayor Duncan stated that this response will be available on the City's website and will be distributed to the media.

Mr. Stephens then read the following:

*"As the Oakwood City Council Committee Chair for Safety & Traffic, I feel the responsibility to remark on this issue. I have lived in Oakwood my entire life, excluding the four years I lived in Cincinnati and Cleveland immediately following college. I know we all have opinions as to why this is such a special community, but there is one consistent factor that I'm sure everyone can not only agree on, but also value as #1 for all of our citizens.....public safety.*

*We are very fortunate that we live in a community that is only 2.2 square miles, because it allows for our special cross-trained safety department. Due to our small size, we can maintain this department and receive the benefits. Our officers can be at any home or business in an extremely short amount of time. They can go into a home with a small kitchen fire and put it out immediately, they can react to a person having a health crisis and start medical response on the spot, and they can arrive at a home or business in need and immediately address any policing matter that is required.*

*We are fortunate to not have much "active" crime in Oakwood and that is due to our ability to police our streets and neighborhoods on a regular basis. We are able to devote the time and resources to police our streets and neighborhoods on a regular basis in part because we do not have much "active" crime in Oakwood. The reason we make traffic enforcement a high priority in our city is simple, it leads to a safe community, and we are fortunate that we can dedicate the personnel to this important task!*

*We are a walking community, not just our students, but our citizens love to walk and jog our beautiful streets. We are a major thoroughfare between the largest city in the Miami Valley and our south suburbs, and most importantly, we view traffic enforcement as a positive way to police our city. I find random license plate checks as a pro-active way to prevent crime. My guess is that some people in this room tonight have had their plates run as they were driving in our city and they were not pulled over. That is for one simple reason....they were not breaking the law. It's very simple, if you don't break the law you won't be pulled over.*

*I find the comments that we may be pulling over one race more than another to be invalid. We most certainly don't restrict anyone from driving in or through our town, buying a home in our town, or having a business in our town. We welcome all! We welcome everyone to use our streets and we simply ask that you obey the law. That goes for visitors AND residents, for all people. Due to our policing efforts, we are a safe community and I value that as a parent, friend, local businessman, volunteer, and Councilman in our wonderful city."*

#### VISITORS

Mayor Duncan welcomed visitors wishing to address City Council. He asked that visitors state their name and address, limit their comments to three minutes or less, and try not to repeat comments that have already been made by others. Council will avoid engaging in dialogue with those persons making comments so that the time can be spent hearing from as many citizens as possible.

Dan Turben, 204 Forrer Boulevard, said that he feels that the recent newspaper articles are unsettling and do not represent Oakwood. He explained that he has witnessed discrimination first-hand in the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s, but has only experienced a warm and giving community in Oakwood. Oakwood is fortunate to have the best public safety department. The



department should hire the best candidates regardless of gender or race. Mr. Turben hopes that the Public Safety Department continues to aggressively enforce traffic laws. He closed his comments by stating that he does not know the motivation of the ABLE project or Dr. Hurley, but that their conclusions do not represent the Oakwood he knows. In the 30 years that he has lived in Oakwood, he has not experienced or seen discrimination.

Sam Dorf, 101 Oak Knoll Drive, shared that he was struck by this evening's council agenda. He commented that the Oakwood Public Safety Department does a fantastic job keeping the City and citizens safe. That said, he disagrees with City Council's reading of the ABLE report because he believes that implementing some policy changes would have a positive impact on the Oakwood community, and the perception of Oakwood. Mr. Dorf pointed out the reference of a "new Oakwood" in Rabbi Mangel's letter. It is important to recognize that changes are occurring in Oakwood, but Oakwood is still young. Mr. Dorf closed his comments by urging City Council to develop a task force to discuss issues involving community diversity and inclusion.

Grant Neeley, 123 Oak Knoll Drive, commented that the random license checks are in no way random. He opined that the stops must be done through some type of system in place. He said that the ABLE report was admittedly incomplete, but a casual observer notices the preponderance of the people pulled over are African American.

Leslie Picca, 317 Dellwood Avenue, stated that the diversity concerns being raised are not about anti-policing. There is qualitative data that some people, particularly African Americans, do not feel safe in Oakwood. This hurts all of us in Oakwood. Ms. Picca shared that while working on the UD campus, she has heard that Oakwood is perceived by many as a racist community. She suggested that inclusivity training not only be provided to the Public Safety Department, but also to City Council as well.

Ellen Walters, 474 Lookout Ridge, shared that she has been a resident for over 56 years and that members of her family have been pulled over and ticketed multiple times since they have lived in Oakwood. She does not feel that traffic enforcement is specific to race. She stated that if people do not learn to obey the laws, they can deal with the consequences. Oakwood does have a reputation for strictly enforcing traffic laws, but she does not feel that diversity is an issue. We are a walking, jogging, biking community and following traffic laws is imperative. She added that if UD professors feel that diversity perceptions are a problem, they should try to set the record straight with their students. Oakwood's superior Public Safety Department does a great job protecting the citizens of Oakwood. She closed her comments by thanking the officers.

Steve Walters, 474 Lookout Ridge, shared that he concurs with City Council's results. He shared a few of his experiences with the Public Safety Department. He stated that overall, he is extremely happy with the public safety services and he would like strict traffic enforcement to continue.

John Enis, 233 Wisteria Drive, shared that he had been in the Air Force and lived in many different places and that Oakwood is a very nice city. Oakwood is safe, while the surrounding cities have much higher crime rates. That's not by chance. It is because we enforce traffic laws. The ABLE report makes observations correlative, but the measuring of bias is unclear. He said that it is unsettling that people are so willing to accept the accusation of bias. That is offensive unless you have strong data to support it. There is a well-known police theory called broken window policing. When you see graffiti in an area, you tend to feel uncomfortable, not because the graffiti may necessarily be offensive, but rather because of the lawlessness that it represents. Aggressive policing of small crimes helps to prevent large crimes from happening. He shared a few recent news stories where policing had positive results. He believes the biggest danger of the ABLE report is if policing efforts are reduced. Mr. Enis suggested that City Council should consider increasing police enforcement and adding traffic cameras.

Tony Smith, 11 Dellwood Avenue, shared that he has lived in Oakwood for many years. He has experienced respectful and courteous Public Safety Officers. He shared a story about how he was stopped by an Oakwood Safety Officer for running in the street. The officer was very courteous and very respectful and was concerned for his safety. The officer stated that the safety department had received some phone calls about how he ran. People want him to be more careful. He said that it is possible that concerns noted in the ABLE report do not stem from Public Safety, but from community expectations and diversity acceptance.

Meghan Henning, 951 E. Schantz Avenue, thanked City Council for their response. She then thanked the Public Safety Department. She does not feel that the ABLE report, or citizens focusing on diversity, are anti-Oakwood or anti-police. With some of the comments made this evening, she has noted some feelings of defensiveness. All people have biases, that is normal. She asked City Council to work with the community to make changes and to not be defensive.



Mr. Stephens explained that each year, City Council passes an annual house-keeping ordinance to align the local traffic and criminal ordinances with changes that have been made at the state level. This ordinance will adopt the 2019 replacement pages for the Traffic Code and the General Offenses Code, and although this is the second reading, it is being presented as an emergency ordinance so the updates can be incorporated into Oakwood codes by the beginning of 2020.

Thereupon, it was moved by Mr. Stephens and seconded by Mr. Epley that the ordinance be passed as an emergency measure.

Upon call of the roll on the question of the motion, the following vote was recorded:

MR. WILLIAM D. DUNCAN.....	YEA
MR. STEVEN BYINGTON.....	YEA
MR. ROBERT P. STEPHENS.....	YEA
MRS. ANNE HILTON.....	YEA
MR. CHRISTOPHER EPLEY.....	YEA

There being five (5) yea votes and no (0) nay votes thereon, said ordinance was declared duly passed and it was so ordered.

AN ORDINANCE  
 BY MR. EPLEY NO. 4896  
 AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND "APPENDIX A – PUBLIC  
 SERVICES RATE SHEET" OF THE OAKWOOD STREETS AND  
 PUBLIC SERVICES CODE TO INCREASE THE  
 STORMWATER FEE.

A copy of the ordinance, having been placed on the desks of each member of Council prior to introduction, was read by title.

Mr. Epley explained that this is an ordinance to make modest increases in the rate for stormwater utility services.

The city operates four services as public utilities: water, sanitary sewer, stormwater, and refuse. Each of these services are supported entirely by user fees and not by general tax revenues. In order to meet operational and upcoming capital needs for the stormwater utility, the City Manager has recommended increasing the monthly stormwater management fee from \$7 to \$10 per residential unit, or Equivalent Residential Unit.

This fee increase was presented to the citizen Budget Review Committee as part of the 2020 budget briefing on October 15, and their response was positive. Oakwood's stormwater rate has not been increased since 2017.

This was a first reading of the ordinance, so Mr. Epley made no motion.

AN ORDINANCE  
 BY VICE MAYOR BYINGTON NO. 4897  
 AN ORDINANCE TO MAKE APPROPRIATIONS FOR  
 CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES OF THE  
 CITY OF OAKWOOD, STATE OF OHIO, DURING THE FISCAL  
 YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2020.

A copy of the ordinance, having been placed on the desks of each member of Council prior to introduction, was read by title.

Vice Mayor Byington explained that this is the annual budget ordinance, which appropriates the city's funding for 2020. This ordinance is required under Section 6.05 of the City Charter and, when adopted, provides formal authorization to the city manager to spend public dollars in providing city services.

Oakwood's total city budget is divided into five primary parts with budgeted spending in each as follows:

General City Services	\$ 13,407,933
Refuse:	\$ 1,655,376
Water Utility:	\$ 1,171,688
Sanitary Sewer Utility:	\$ 1,866,190
Stormwater Utility:	\$ 530,044

He then invited the City Manager and Finance Director to make a presentation on the budget.

Mr. Klopsch referenced a PowerPoint presentation on the 2020 budget and reviewed the following:

Mr. Klopsch highlighted the following 2019 events and projects:

- New City Website: Oakwood launched a new and improved website in June 2019. The new website includes a mobile-friendly interface that adapts to all devices (phones, tablets, laptops, desktops) creating a better user experience for all users.
- 45<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Smith Gardens: Smith Gardens was donated to the City 45 years ago. Several events were held to celebrate this incredible gift to Oakwood.
- Concrete and Asphalt Street Repairs: The City completed a number of street projects and will continue to invest in roadway infrastructure.
- 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Citizen Police Academy: The Oakwood Public Safety Department hosted its second successful Citizens Police Academy (CPA).
- ACORN Program: The Public Safety Department offers the ACORN (Assisting and Contributing to Oakwood Resident Needs) Program. The program is designed to assist residents in times of emergency, and provide peace of mind through proactive community outreach, implementing safety plans, and advocating for the well-being of Oakwood's senior and at-risk population.
- Russell Wealth Management: Construction of the Russell Wealth Management office building was completed this year. The business is now operating at Sugar Camp.
- Element Oakwood: The Element Oakwood condos are almost completed. The first group of residents is scheduled to move in early next year. Hills Developers, Inc. projects that the condos will be at full capacity as early as summer 2020.
- Fire Inspections at Oakwood Businesses: Formal fire inspection processes were put in place this year for all Oakwood businesses. The inspections focus on fire education and safety.
- On-Line Bill Payment System: The online bill payment system was implemented during the first week of March and is already heavily used by Oakwood residents.
- Upgraded Cardboard Recycling Center: The City made significant improvements to the cardboard drop off by the Creager field parking lot. Oakwood recycles large amounts of cardboard and the City does not pay any recycling fees for cardboard.
- Assessment of City Parks: Leisure Services Staff completed a detailed assessment of city parks and is developing a plan for major capital improvements.
- Water Tower & Water Plant Improvements: The Public Works Department completed improvement projects at the water tower and water softening plant totaling around \$125,000. The City will continue to maintain the water system infrastructure to provide the best quality water.
- Oakwood Historical Society: The Oakwood Historical Society continues to thrive with their different event offerings.
- Festival of Trees Event/Smith Gardens Fundraiser: In conjunction with celebrating the 45th anniversary of the city receiving Smith Gardens, the Leisure Services staff created a new event called the "Holiday Festival of Trees Auction". Residents, businesses and professionals participated with 34 trees donated for the silent auction. This event raised over \$4,000 in donations that will be used toward the upkeep of Smith Gardens.
- Rotary Hazardous Waste Collection: The Oakwood Rotary Club continues to offer a quarterly program where volunteer Rotarians travel the community to collect and dispose of hazardous waste. This program has operated for over ten years.
- Oakwood Farmers' Market: The Oakwood Farmers' Market had another successful year.

Mr. Klopsch displayed graphs for Income Tax receipts and Property Tax receipts.

The municipal income tax typically grows each year, helping to offset annual cost increases. The 90% credit factor approved by City Council is expected to raise about \$600,000 in new revenue, revenue that replaces money lost over the years as numerous communities raised their tax rates.

In regards to property taxes, there was a decrease as a result of a property tax levy expiring in 2008, and an increase with a new levy approved by Oakwood voters in 2013. The minor changes from year to year are a result of increases in the total valuation of Oakwood property.

About 64% of the local municipal income tax paid by Oakwood residents is remitted to the city of Oakwood. About 36% is remitted to the taxing jurisdictions where Oakwood citizens work. Prior to the 10 % credit reduction, about 55% of local taxes went to other jurisdictions.

The Property Tax breakdown consists of 68.4% to Oakwood Schools; 1.7% to Montgomery County; 0.3% to Developmental Disabilities; 2.0% to Five River MetroParks; 13.7% to Human Services; 4.0% to Sinclair; 8.5% to the city of Oakwood; and, 1.4% to Wright Library.

Mr. Klopsch reported that as Vice Mayor Byington previously mentioned, Oakwood's total city budget is divided into five primary parts with budgeted spending in each as follows:

General City Services:	\$ 13,407,933
Refuse:	\$ 1,655,376
Water Utility:	\$ 1,171,688
Sanitary Sewer Utility:	\$ 1,866,190
Stormwater Utility:	\$ 530,044

Mr. Klopsch presented 2020 revenues and expenses (in millions):

	<u>Revenue</u>	<u>Expenses</u>
General City Services:	\$13.64	\$13.41
Refuse Operations:	\$1.35	\$1.66
Water Utility:	\$1.17	\$1.17
Sanitary Sewer Utility:	\$1.80	\$1.87
Stormwater Utility:	\$0.47	\$0.53

Mr. Klopsch then provided a comparison of 2019 and 2020 capital expenses:

	<u>2019 Budget</u>	<u>2020 Proposed</u>
General City Services:	\$1,461,100	\$1,343,100
Refuse Operations:	\$220,000	\$320,000
Water Utility:	\$290,000	\$30,000
Sanitary Sewer Utility:	\$50,000	\$380,000
Stormwater Utility:	\$0	\$160,000

The 2020 Refuse budget includes \$300,000 for a new refuse packer truck, and the sanitary sewer budget includes \$330,000 for a new Vactor truck.

Mr. Klopsch then provided highlights of the 2020 Budget related to taxes and fees. The budget includes: the 10% income tax credit reduction factor approved in 2018; proposes a \$3/month fee increase for stormwater; and no fee increases in Water, Sanitary Sewer or Refuse. The last tax and fee increases for the income tax rate was in 1984; property taxes was in 2013; water rates was in 2017; sanitary sewer rates was in 2018; stormwater rates was in 2017; and refuse rates was in 2019.

For General City Services, the 2020 beginning balance is estimated to be \$9,666,524 for General Operations, which is about nine months of operating expenses. The 2020 budget includes \$1,343,100 for capital expenses. The 2020 budgeted revenue is \$233,910 above revenue.

For Refuse Operations, the 2020 beginning balance is estimated to be \$616,985. Refuse rates were last raised in January 2019 when they were increased from \$27 to \$30 per month. The 2020 budget includes \$320,000 for capital expenses. The 2020 budgeted revenue is \$304,776 below expenses.

For the Water Utility, the 2020 beginning balance is estimated to be \$1,135,981. Water rates were last increased in January 2017 and Oakwood currently has the 7<sup>th</sup> lowest water rates of 66 Miami Valley jurisdictions. There is \$30,000 included for capital expenses in 2020. The 2020 budgeted revenue is \$1,812 above expenses.

For the Sanitary Sewer Utility, the 2020 beginning balance is estimated to be \$1,411,502. Sewer rates were last raised in January 2018. Oakwood currently has the 46<sup>th</sup> lowest sewer rates of 63 Miami Valley jurisdictions. The 2020 budget includes \$380,000 for capital expenses. The 2020 budgeted revenue is \$66,490 below expenses.

For the Stormwater Utility, the 2020 beginning balance is estimated to be \$309,605. The monthly residential fee has been \$7 since January 2017. The fee will be increased to \$10 beginning in January 2020. The 2020 budget includes \$160,000 for capital expenses. The 2020 budgeted revenue is \$62,709 below expenses.

Mr. Klopsch closed his presentation by noting that the citizen Budget Review Committee endorses the 2020 Budget, including the stormwater rate increase.

Vice Mayor Byington explained that Oakwood is fortunate to have a citizen budget committee that currently includes 35 members that is equally represented by residents from each of Oakwood's seven voting precincts. That committee met four times this year, and as reported earlier this evening by Committee Chair Dave Dickerson and Vice Chair Bill Frapwell, endorses this 2020 budget. Vice Mayor Byington stated that the level of transparency mentioned by Mr. Frapwell with the budget is to be commended. Residents appreciate knowing exactly where their money is going.



There being five (5) yea votes and no (0) nay votes thereon, said ordinance was declared duly passed and it was so ordered.

A RESOLUTION  
BY MR. STEPHENS NO 1866  
A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING A TEN-YEAR PARTICIPATION  
AGREEMENT WITH THE MONTGOMERY COUNTY ECONOMIC  
DEVELOPMENT/GOVERNMENT EQUITY (ED/GE) PROGRAM.

A copy of the resolution, having been placed on the desks of each member of Council prior to introduction, was read by title.

Mr. Stephens explained that the Montgomery County ED/GE Program is a regional cooperative program that promotes economic opportunity; business, industrial, commercial, and research facility expansion; and job creation. The city of Oakwood has participated in the Montgomery County ED/GE Program since its inception in 1991. Oakwood's last renewal of the agreement took place in 2011, and is due to renew participation again as the county rolls out an updated ED/GE plan for 2020.

This resolution will authorize Oakwood's participation in the updated program in ways that are feasible and appropriate to the city's needs, resources, and responsibilities in the community.

Thereupon, it was moved by Mr. Stephens and seconded by Mrs. Hilton that the resolution be passed.

Upon call of the roll on the question of the motion, the following vote was recorded:

- MR. WILLIAM D. DUNCAN.....YEA
- MR. STEVEN BYINGTON .....YEA
- MR. ROBERT P. STEPHENS.....YEA
- MRS. ANNE HILTON .....YEA
- MR. CHRISTOPHER EPLEY.....YEA

There being five (5) yea votes and no (0) nay votes thereon, said resolution was declared duly passed and it was so ordered.

AN ORDINANCE  
BY VICE MAYOR BYINGTON NO. 4900  
AN ORDINANCE AMENDING SECTION 147.03,  
DEPOSITORIES, OF THE OAKWOOD ADMINISTRATIVE  
CODE TO UPDATE PROCEDURES USED TO DESIGNATE  
DEPOSITORIES FOR THE CITY'S ACTIVE FINANCIAL  
DEPOSITS.

A copy of the ordinance, having been placed on the desks of each member of Council prior to introduction, was read by title.

Vice Mayor Byington explained that this ordinance updates part of the city's Administrative Code relating to the city's financial deposits. The code includes an outdated provision that effectively requires the city to engage in a bidding process every five years before selecting a bank or banks with which to deposit funds. This procedure made sense years ago, when changing banks was as simple as moving the money, signing new signature cards, and obtaining new checks. But banking now involves electronic financial links between the city and a variety of state agencies, wire transfers, ACH deposits, and automatic debits, all of which make changing banks a much more onerous and disruptive undertaking.

This ordinance streamlines the process by allowing the city to simply renew its depository agreements every five years without soliciting new bids. Bidding would only be required in the event that the city desires or needs to change banks for any reason.

Thereupon, it was moved by Vice Mayor Byington and seconded by Mr. Epley that the second reading be waived and that the ordinance be passed tonight.

Mayor Duncan confirmed with Mr. Jacques that a 4/5 vote will need to occur in order to waive the second reading.

Upon call of the roll on the question of the motion, the following vote was recorded:

- MR. WILLIAM D. DUNCAN.....YEA
- MR. STEVEN BYINGTON .....YEA
- MR. ROBERT P. STEPHENS.....YEA
- MRS. ANNE HILTON .....YEA
- MR. CHRISTOPHER EPLEY.....YEA

There being five (5) yea votes and no (0) nay votes thereon, said ordinance was declared duly passed and it was so ordered.

STAFF REPORT

Finance Report: Finance Director Cindy Stafford referenced a PowerPoint presentation and updated Council on the following topics: 2019 Financials through November 30, 2019; New Employees; and Online Payment Portal.

In regard to the 2019 financials through November 30, 2019, Mrs. Stafford referenced a chart for General City Services, excluding transfers, showing budgeted versus actual for receipts are: \$13,009,892 and \$12,919,620; and disbursements are: \$14,124,175 and \$11,644,312. Receipts are at 99% primarily as a result of income tax and property tax, which are two of the largest revenue streams. Income taxes are currently at 98% of budget, and property taxes are at 102% of budget. The income tax credit reduction was estimated to result in \$600,000 of additional income. This credit reduction was needed to offset income tax rate increases by the communities where our residents work. To date, \$538,000 has been recovered. The investment income is about \$30,000 more than last year as a result of the current market. Other revenues include \$134,000 workers' compensation rebate from an expense paid in 2017. Disbursements are 82% of the budget. Disbursements are operated on a cash basis, so if the encumbrances are added in, disbursements will be 90% of budget. Mrs. Stafford expects that by the end of the year, general city services revenue will be slightly above budget and expenditures slightly below budget.

For the Refuse Funds, excluding transfers, budgeted versus actual for receipts are: \$1,375,400 and \$1,255,241; and disbursements are: \$1,444,504 and \$1,162,294. Receipts are at 91% and Disbursements are at 80%, with encumbrances at 84%.

For the Enterprise Funds (including the Water Utility Funds, Sanitary Sewer Utility Funds, and Stormwater Utility Funds) excluding transfers, budgeted versus actual for receipts are: \$3,300,600 and \$3,183,675 and disbursements are: \$3,753,032 and \$2,530,982. Receipts are 96% and disbursements are 67%, with encumbrances at 87%. Mrs. Stafford explained that most of the sewer costs are driven by Montgomery County and the city of Dayton and their timing of billing for wastewater treatment.

With the retirement of Assistant Finance Director Alice Young at the end of September, Tracy Martin was promoted to the Assistant Finance Director position. Tracy Martin has worked for the city of Oakwood for 32 years, with the last 14 years being in the Finance Department. Gloria Corona-Luna, a new Accounts Payable Clerk, started at the beginning of October. Mrs. Stafford shared that she is developing a plan to cross-train all finance department employees.

The Online Payment Portal is available on the City's website. Payments such as utility, income tax, and many other payments can be made online through the portal. The payment portal is fee based. The City does not receive these fees. Mrs. Stafford encouraged residents to receive monthly invoice statements electronically. She explained that just because you get an electronic statement does not mean that you are required to pay online. There are currently about 3,500 monthly statements, and only 711 of those are receiving e-statements.

Mrs. Hilton inquired about the service fee for the online portal.

Mrs. Stafford shared that the minimum fee is \$1.95. The fee depends on the type of payment being made, as required by law.

Mayor Duncan inquired about the number of applicants for the recently filled Accounts Payable Clerk position.

Mrs. Stafford shared that there were nearly 100 applications.

CITY MANAGER'S COMMENTS – NONE

COUNCIL COMMENTS

Mayor Duncan wished everyone a happy and safe holiday season.

The public meeting concluded at 9:54 p.m.



MAYOR

ATTEST:



CLERK OF COUNCIL