



# KEYSER MARSTON ASSOCIATES

## DRAFT PARKLAND DEDICATION IN-LIEU FEE AND PARKLAND AND RECREATION FACILITY DEVELOPMENT IMPACT FEE NEXUS STUDY

*Prepared for:*  
**City of San Rafael**

*Prepared by:*  
**Keyser Marston Associates, Inc.**

**August 18, 2025**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>I. INTRODUCTION, SUMMARY OF CURRENT PROGRAM AND FINDINGS OF STUDY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
A. Summary of Current Program .....	1
B. City's Objectives for Updating its Parks Dedication and Fee Program .....	1
C. Report Background and Legal Context .....	2
D. Findings And Conclusions.....	7
<b>II. DETERMINATION OF QIMBY PARKLAND DEDICATION REQUIREMENT AND IN-LIEU FEES.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>III. MITIGATION FEE ACT NEXUS FINDINGS .....</b>	<b>11</b>
A. Purpose .....	11
B. Use of Fee.....	11
C. Relationship .....	11
D. Need.....	11
E. Proportionality .....	12
<b>IV. DEMAND FOR NEW PARK AND RECREATION FACILITIES AND SUPPORTED IMPACT FEE AMOUNTS.....</b>	<b>13</b>
A. Population and Residential Demand for Park and Recreation Facilities .....	13
B. New Residential Development .....	13
C. Parks and Recreation Facility Inventory and Standards .....	14
D. Existing Facilities Inventory Replacement Cost Method for Establishing Fee Amounts .	15
E. Replacement Cost of Existing San Rafael Parks and Recreation Facilities.....	15
F. Maximum Supported Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fees for Subdivision Projects that Do Not Dedicate Park Land .....	17
G. Maximum Supported Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Subdivision Units .....	18
H. Maximum Supported Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Non-Subdivision Units.....	19
<b>V. Estimated Range and Maximum Amount of Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee Revenue through 2040 .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>VI. USE OF FEE REVENUE .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>VII. IMPACT FEES IN NEIGHBORING CITIES, MAXIMUM SUPPORTED FEES, AND RECOMMENDED FEES.....</b>	<b>25</b>
A. Park and Recreation Fees in Neighboring Jurisdictions.....	25
<b>Appendix A: Inventory of Parks from Citywide Parks and Recreation Master Plan, Recent Residential Land Sales in San Rafael, and Parkland and Recreational Facility Construction Cost Estimates .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>Appendix A Table 1. City Operated Parks by Type and Recreation Provided.....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Appendix A Table 2. Residential Land Sales - Marin County.....</b>	<b>30</b>

<b>Appendix A Table 3. Recreation Facility Construction Cost Estimates Prepared for Other Bay Area Park Development Impact Fee Nexus Studies.....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>Appendix A Table 4. American Community Survey, 2023: City of San Rafael Population, Household, Vacancy and Household Size Data.....</b>	<b>32</b>

#### **List of Tables**

<b>Table 1. Parkland Dedication Requirements for Residential Subdivision Units.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Table 2. Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fee for Residential Subdivision Units .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Table 3. Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Residential Subdivision Units.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Table 4. Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Non Subdivision Projects .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Table 5. Quimby Land Dedication Requirement .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Table 6. Maximum Parkland Dedication In-lieu Fee for Residential Subdivisions Units ...</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Table 7. Current and Projected San Rafael Population .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Table 8. Existing Park and Recreation Facilities Operated by the City of San Rafael.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>Table 9. Replacement Cost of Existing San Rafael Parks and Recreation Facilities - Existing Inventory Method .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>Table 10A. Calculation of Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fees for Subdivision Units that Do Not Dedicate Land, to be Paid at Entitlements or Building Permit .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Table 10B. Calculation of Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Subdivision Units, to be Paid at Building Permit.....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Table 10C. Calculation of Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Non-Subdivision Units, to be Paid at Building Permit.....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>Table 11. Estimated Range of Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee Revenue through Yr. 2040.....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>Table 12. Parks Development Impact Fee Project List.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>Table 13. Parkland Dedication and In-lieu Fee Requirements for Residential Subdivisions and Park Facility Impact Fees – Select Peer Jurisdictions .....</b>	<b>26</b>

## **I. INTRODUCTION, SUMMARY OF CURRENT PROGRAM AND FINDINGS OF STUDY**

This Parkland Dedication In-lieu Fee and Parks and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee Nexus Study (Report) provides the City of San Rafael (City) with the necessary technical documentation to support updating its current Park Dedication and In-Lieu Fee program for residential subdivision projects and to establish a Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee to fund parks and recreation capital facilities, including land acquisition, park improvements and recreation facilities. The study has been prepared by Keyser Marston Associates, Inc. (KMA).

### **A. Summary of Current Program**

The City's existing "Park Dedication and In-Lieu Fee" program is provided in Chapter 15.09 of the City's municipal code. The program's basic standard is that subdivision projects shall provide three (3) acres of land for each one thousand (1,000) residents, which translates into a dedication requirement of 300 square feet<sup>1</sup> of parkland per each new residential unit that is built within a subdivision. At the City's discretion, the code also provides provisions for the payment of a fee in lieu of dedicating land. The amount of the fee is determined by an appraisal of the property and the application of the appraised per square foot value to 300 square feet per residential unit.

The in-lieu fees are used to acquire land and construct park and trail improvements to meet the City's per capita parks service standards, which are contained in the City's General Plan 2040. The General Plan 2040 establishes a standard of four (4) acres of parkland per 1,000 residents.

The amount of available vacant property suitable for subdivision in San Rafael is very limited, with most new developments being built on in-fill lots. The City's current program does not apply to new residential construction that is not part of a subdivision, but the new non-subdivision units do increase the demand for park and recreation facilities.

### **B. City's Objectives for Updating its Parks Dedication and Fee Program**

The City's primary objectives for updating its Park Dedication and In-Lieu Fee program and adopting Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees are as follows:

- Require new non-subdivision residential development in the City to mitigate the demand that it generates for parkland and recreational facilities.
- Ensure that residential development within subdivision projects pay an impact fee to construct facilities in addition to an in-lieu payment for land dedication.

---

<sup>1</sup> Chapter 15.09 of the City of San Rafael Municipal Code.

- Ensure that the impact fee requirements on non-subdivision projects are consistent with the provisions of the California Mitigation Fee Act (AB 1600 et.seq.).
- Ensure that the parkland dedication and in-lieu fee requirements for subdivision developments are consistent with the provisions of the Quimby Act (Section 66477 of the California Government Code).
- Revise the City's current parkland dedication requirement and in-lieu fee option for new subdivision residential units to be based on maintaining the City's current level of service of 1.824 acres of City-operated parks per 1,000 residents. The parkland dedication requirement and in-lieu fee option will be expressed in terms of number of square feet of land per new residential unit and in-lieu fee dollar amount per new residential unit, respectively.
- Establish a recreation facility development impact fee to apply to all new subdivision residential units. The amount of the impact fee will be based on the estimated cost to maintain the City's current per capita service level of park facilities, recreation community center facilities, and cultural facilities. The fee amount will be expressed as a dollar per square foot of livable area of new residential units.
- Establish a parkland and recreation facility development impact fee to apply to all new non-subdivision residential units. The amount of the impact fee will be based on the estimated cost to maintain the City's current service levels of parkland, park facilities, recreation community center facilities and cultural facilities.
- Establish a bifurcated parkland dedication, in-lieu fee, and development impact fee structure that differentiates between single family detached residential units and multi-family residential units (i.e., units in buildings with two or more units).
- Establish fee levels that align with current land acquisition, park facility, and recreation community center development costs.

## **C. Report Background and Legal Context**

### **1. Quimby Act (Section 66477 of the California Government Code)**

The City's current program is based on the provisions of the Quimby Act. In summary, the Act requires residential projects that require approval of a tentative map or parcel map to either dedicate land, pay a fee in lieu of dedication, or both. The fees may be used to develop new or rehabilitate existing neighborhood or community parks or recreational facilities within the neighborhood that serves the project. The dedication of land, or the

payment of fees, or a combination of both, cannot exceed the proportionate amount necessary to provide three (3) acres of neighborhood and community park area per 1,000 persons to reside within the subdivision, unless the amount of existing neighborhood and community park area within the jurisdiction exceeds the limit, in which case the jurisdiction may adopt a higher standard not to exceed five (5) acres per 1,000 per thousand residents expected to reside within the subdivision. Given that the City of San Rafael currently provides approximately 1.824 acres of parks per 1,000 residents, the City of San Rafael intends to modify parkland dedication requirements for subdivision projects to be equivalent to the current level of service of 1.824 acres per 1,000 residents.

## **2. The California Mitigation Fee Act (AB 1600)**

The Mitigation Fee Act (Section 66000 – 66008 of the California Government Code) permits local jurisdictions to adopt parks and recreation development impact fees on new development to fund the associated, additional costs of providing parks and recreation capital facilities.

This Report provides the necessary technical analysis to support a schedule of fees to be established by an Impact Fee Ordinance and/or Resolution. The Mitigation Fee Act allows the City to adopt by Resolution a fee schedule consistent with the supporting technical analysis and findings provided in this Report. The Resolution's approach to setting the fee allows periodic adjustments of the fee amount as may be necessary over time, without amending the enabling Ordinance.

The technical analysis in this Report estimates the parks and recreation facility fee schedule that will fund new development's "fair share" contribution to future City investments in parks. The key requirements of the Mitigation Fee Act that determine the structure, scope, and amount of the proposed fee program are as follows:

- **Collected for Capital Facility and Infrastructure Improvements.** Development impact fee revenue can be collected and used to cover the cost of capital facilities and infrastructure required to serve new development and growth in the City. However, impact fee revenue cannot be used to cover the operation and maintenance costs of these or any other facilities and infrastructure.
- **Cannot Fund Existing Needs.** Impact fee revenue cannot be collected or used to cover deficiencies in existing City capital equipment and facilities. The portion of capital costs required to meet the needs of the City's existing population must be funded through other sources.
- **Must be Based on a Rational Nexus.** An impact fee must be based on a reasonable nexus, or connection, between new growth and development and the need for a new facility or improvement. As such, an impact fee must be supported by

specific findings that explain or demonstrate this nexus. In addition, the impact fee amount must be structured such that the revenue generated does not exceed the cost of providing the facility or improvement for which the fee is imposed. The Mitigation Fee Act requires that the following requirements be satisfied when a public agency establishes, increases, or imposes a fee as a condition of approval of a development project:

- a. Identify the purpose of the fee.
- b. Identify the use to which the fee is to be put. If the use is financing public facilities, the facilities shall be identified.
- c. Determine how there is a reasonable relationship between the fees use and the type of development project on which the fee is imposed.
- d. Determine how there is a reasonable relationship between the need for the public facility and the type of development project on which the fee is imposed.
- e. Determine how there is a reasonable relationship between the amount of the fee and the cost of the public facility or portion of the public facility attributable to the development on which the fee is imposed.

The City can choose to charge parks and recreation development impact fees below the maximum, supportable fee schedule. Such downward adjustments in the fee schedule, if selected, are typically based on policy considerations related to considerations of development feasibility and fee levels in peer cities.

The purpose of this report is to demonstrate that the Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees comply with the Mitigation Fee Act.

### **3. Assembly Bill (AB) 602**

Assembly Bill (AB) 602, enacted by the State of California in 2021, amended Sections 65940.1 and 66019 of, and added Section 66016.5 to the Government Code. AB 602 requires that if a local agency conducts and adopts an impact fee nexus study after January 1, 2022, the local agency shall follow all of the following standards and practices:

- a. Before the adoption of a development fee, an impact fee nexus study shall be adopted.  
***The nexus study contained in this report meets this requirement.***
- b. When applicable, the nexus study shall identify the existing level of service for each public facility, identify the proposed new level of service, and include an explanation of why the new level of service is appropriate. ***This nexus study identifies the City's current level of park and recreation service at approximately 1.824 developed park acres per 1,000 residents, and three recreation community***

**centers, and one cultural center per 58,331 residents. The City of San Rafael will maintain this standard and apply it to future residential development.**

- c. A nexus study shall include information that supports the local agency's actions, as required by subdivision (a) of Section 66001 of the Government Code, which are listed above under the rational nexus requirement. ***This nexus study meets these requirements.***
- d. If a nexus study supports the increase of an existing fee, the local agency shall review the assumptions of the nexus study supporting the original fee and evaluate the amount of fees collected under the original fee. ***The City of San Rafael does not currently levy development impact fees for park and recreation improvements. The balance of collected parkland dedication in-lieu fees is insufficient to provide the parkland and facilities necessary to serve new development.***
- e. A nexus study adopted after July 1, 2022, shall calculate a fee imposed on a housing development project proportionately to the square footage of proposed units of the development. A local agency that imposes a fee proportionately to the square footage of the proposed units of the development shall be deemed to have used a valid method to establish a reasonable relationship between the fee charged and the burden posed by the development. A nexus study is not required to comply with the requirements to calculate a fee imposed on a housing development project proportionally to the square footage of the proposed units if the local agency makes the following findings:
  - An explanation as to why square footage is not an appropriate metric to calculate fees imposed on a housing development project.
  - An explanation that an alternative basis of calculating the fee bears a reasonable relationship between the fee charged and the burden posed by the development.
  - That other policies in the fee structure support smaller developments, or otherwise ensure that smaller developments are not charged disproportionate fees.
  - ***The maximum fee amounts supported by this nexus study are calculated proportionally to the square footage of the proposed residential units.***
- f. Large jurisdictions (i.e., Counties with a minimum population of 250,000 residents and any jurisdictions within such a county) shall adopt a capital improvement plan as a part of the nexus study. This study includes a Parks Development Impact Fee Project List attached as Table 12.



- g. All studies shall be adopted at a public hearing with at least 30 days' notice, and the local agency shall notify any member of the public that requests notice of intent to begin an impact fee nexus study of the date of the hearing.
- h. Studies shall be updated at least every eight years, beginning on January 1, 2022.
- i. The local agency may use the impact fee nexus study template developed by the California Department of Housing and Community Development pursuant to Section 50466.5 of the Health and Safety Code. ***This nexus study uses the template developed by the Turner Center for the Department of Housing and Community Development pursuant to Section 50466.5 of the Health and Safety Code.***

***This report demonstrates that all fee components comply with AB 602.***

#### ***4. Existing Facilities Inventory Replacement Cost Method for Establishing Fee Amounts***

In accordance with the provisions of AB 602, this nexus study uses the “Existing Inventory Method” described in the “Impact Fee Nexus Study Templates” document that was prepared in 2023 by the Turner Center for Housing Innovation at UC Berkeley for the California Department of Housing and Community Development. Under this approach, the cost of facilities to serve new development is calculated based on the cost to replace the City’s existing inventory of park facilities and the City’s existing population. Dividing the replacement cost of existing inventory by the City’s population yields a park facility replacement per capita cost factor that can then be applied to the average household size of new development to generate a cost per unit. Per the requirements of the Mitigation Fee Act, the per unit cost estimate is converted into a fee per square foot of livable residential area by dividing the per unit cost by the average square footage of new residences.

The City’s inventory of parkland and recreational facilities is currently comprised of:

- 106.41 acres of community, neighborhood, and special use parks<sup>2</sup>
- Three recreation community centers; and
- One cultural center.

Per the US Census – American Community Survey published in 2023, the City of San Rafael’s population is 58,331. The City’s 106.41 acres of parks is equivalent to approximately 1.824 acres per 1,000 residents, which is significantly less than the General Plan 2040 service standard of 4 acres per 1,000 residents. The replacement cost of the City’s existing inventory of parkland and recreational facilities has been estimated based on cost estimates prepared by City staff, as well as generic community and neighborhood park improvement cost estimates prepared by architects for other cities.

---

<sup>2</sup> The list of parks, park acreage, and facilities offered at each park is provided in Appendix A, Table 1.

Under this methodology, new development will be required to fund park improvements at the same rate and service level (i.e., 1.824 acres per 1,000 residents) that existing development has provided to date. Thus, new development will not be funding any existing deficiency.

The City has identified the planned park improvements to potentially be funded by future park impact fee revenues (and other sources, as necessary) through the year 2040, which coincides with the time horizon of the City's General Plan. The Parks Development Impact Fee Project List is provided as Table 12.

## D. Findings And Conclusions

### 1. *Quimby Parkland Dedication Requirements for Residential Subdivision Units*

Table 1 provides the parkland dedication requirements that will apply to all new residential units within subdivisions. As shown, developers will be required to dedicate 206 square feet of parkland per single family detached residential unit and 184 square feet of parkland per multi-family residential unit.

**Table 1. Parkland Dedication Requirements for Residential Subdivision Units**

	Sq. Ft. of Park Land per Dwelling Unit
Single Family Detached Units	206 (205.78)
Multi-family Units	184 (184.33)

See Table 5 for detailed calculations.

### 2. *Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fee for Residential Subdivision Units*

Table 2 shows the maximum supported parkland dedication in-lieu fee to apply to residential subdivision projects that do not dedicate improved parkland. The in-lieu fees will be collected at the time that a building permit is issued for the new units.

**Table 2. Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fee for Residential Subdivision Units**

	Maximum Supported In-Lieu Fee, Per Unit
Single Family Detached Units	\$12,596
Multi-Family Units	\$11,282

See Table 10A for detailed calculations.

### 3. *Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Residential Subdivision Units*

Table 3 shows the maximum supported recreation facility development impact fees to be levied on all residential units built within subdivisions. The maximum fee schedule is based on the cost to replace the City's existing inventory of park improvements and facilities as quantified in this

Report. The impact fees will be collected at the time that building permits are issued for new development.

**Table 3. Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Residential Subdivision Units**

	Maximum Supported Development Impact Fee, Per Square Foot of Livable Area
Single Family Detached Units	\$4.50
Multi-Family Units (units in buildings with 2 or more units)	\$8.35

See Table 10B for detailed calculations.

#### *4. Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Non-Subdivision Projects*

Table 4 shows the maximum supported parkland and recreation facility development impact fees to be levied on all non-subdivision residential developments. The maximum fee schedule is based on the nexus findings and technical analysis contained in this Report. The parkland and recreation facility development impact fees will apply to new residential development to fund a share of future parkland and recreation capital facilities investments throughout the City. The impact fees will be collected at the time that building permits are issued for new development. The calculation of the fee is presented in Section IV of this report.

**Table 4. Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Non Subdivision Projects**

	Maximum Supported Development Impact Fee Per Square Foot of Livable Area
Single Family Detached Units	\$9.98
Multi-Family Units (units in buildings with 2 or more units)	\$18.50

See Table 10C for detailed calculations.

#### **5. Fee Indexing**

Since land and construction costs continue to rise, it is important that the fees be indexed to inflation. The fee schedule should be adjusted annually by a construction cost index, such as the Engineering News Record. Per AB 602, the nexus analysis and fee calculations are required to be updated every eight years.

## II. DETERMINATION OF QUIMBY PARKLAND DEDICATION REQUIREMENT AND IN-LIEU FEES

Under the Quimby Act, the dedication of land for parks, or the payment of fees, or a combination of both, cannot exceed the proportionate amount necessary to provide three (3) acres of neighborhood/community park area per 1,000 future residents of persons of the subdivision, unless the amount of existing neighborhood/community park area within the jurisdiction exceeds the limit, in which case the jurisdiction may adopt a higher standard not to exceed five (5) acres per 1,000 per thousand residents expected to reside within the subdivision. The dedication and fee amounts are to reflect the residential density of the subdivision and the average number of persons per household.

As detailed in Section IV, the City currently provides a service level of 1.824 acres of community, neighborhood, pocket, and special use parks per 1,000 residents. The average household size of single family detached occupied and total single family detached units in the City is 2.62 and 2.59, respectively. The average household size of multi-family occupied units and total multi-family units is 2.36 and 2.32, respectively. While the City currently requires subdivision projects to dedicate 3 acres of parkland per 1,000 residents or pay an in-lieu fee equivalent to the cost of dedication, the City has decided to modify the dedication requirement to mirror the level of park acreage that the City is currently providing to the residents of San Rafael, which is 1.824 acres. The formula for calculating the required dedication of parkland square footage per residential unit is as follows:

$$\text{Average household size times Quimby standard (acres per 1,000 residents) / 1,000 times 43,560 square feet}$$

As shown in Table 5, under the City's new policy, the land dedication requirement will be 206 square feet per single family detached unit and 184 square feet per multi-family unit.

**Table 5. Quimby Land Dedication Requirement**

	Avg. Household Size	Quimby Standard (Acres per 1,000 pop.)	Sq. Ft. of Park Land per Dwelling Unit
<i>Calculation</i>	<i>A</i>	<i>B</i>	<i>C= (A*B/1000)*43560</i>
<b>Single Family Detached Units</b>	<b>2.59</b>	<b>1.824</b>	<b>206 (205.78)</b>
<b>Multi-family Units</b>	<b>2.32</b>	<b>1.824</b>	<b>184 (184.33)</b>

Note: Formulas may appear to yield slightly different figures than shown due to rounding.

As detailed in Section IV, the estimated cost of acquiring parkland is approximately \$2.61 million per acre, or \$60 per square foot of parkland. Given a dedication requirement of 206 square feet of parkland per single detached dwelling unit, the calculated maximum fee amount is \$12,349 per single family detached unit. It is standard for adopted impact fees to include an allowance for administering impact fees. A typical allowance is 2%, which has been assumed in this

analysis. Including a 2% administrative fee allowance, the maximum in-lieu fee per single family detached residential unit is \$12,596 per unit and the maximum in-lieu fee for multi-family units is \$11,282 per unit.

**Table 6. Maximum Parkland Dedication In-lieu Fee for Residential Subdivisions Units**

	Sq. Ft. of Park Land per Dwelling Unit	Cost to acquire parkland per square foot of parkland based on existing level of service	Land Dedication In-Lieu Fee per Dwelling Unit
<i>Calculation</i>	<i>C</i>	<i>D</i>	<i>E= (C * D)*1.02</i>
<b>Single Family Detached Units</b>	<b>205.78</b>	<b>\$60.00</b>	<b>\$12,596</b>
<b>Multi-Family Units</b>	<b>184.33</b>	<b>\$60.00</b>	<b>\$11,282</b>

Note: Formulas may appear to yield slightly different figures than shown due to rounding. See Table 10A for detailed calculations.

DRAFT

### III. MITIGATION FEE ACT NEXUS FINDINGS

This chapter describes the necessary “nexus” between new development in the City of San Rafael and the proposed capital facilities investments, as required under the Mitigation Fee Act – Government Code Section 66000. The park and recreation development impact fees will fund investments in parks and recreation facilities, improvements, and land acquisitions required to maintain existing levels of park facilities in the City – the “fair share” contribution of new development.

Nexus findings address: (1) the ***purpose*** of the fee and a related description of the facility for which fee revenue will be used, (2) the specific ***use*** of fee revenue, 3) the ***relationship*** between the facility and the type of development, (4) the relationship between the ***need*** for the facility and the type of development, and (5) the relationship between the amount of the fee and the ***proportionality*** of cost specifically attributable to new development. The subsections below describe the nexus findings for the parks and recreation development impact fee.

#### A. Purpose

The fee will be used to expand the provision of parks and recreational facilities to maintain the current level of service and meet the future sport, health, and recreational needs of residents. The fee will also ensure that parks and recreation capital facilities in San Rafael keep pace with new growth, while supporting significant accessibility improvements and rehabilitation to existing facilities.

#### B. Use of Fee

Fee revenue will be used to acquire land for parks and to construct/renovate improvements, such as playing fields, trails, basketball courts, restrooms, community centers, etc.

#### C. Relationship

New residential development in the City of San Rafael will increase the demand for and use of parks and recreation facilities. To address the impacts of new residential development, parks and recreation development impact fees will be levied on the square footage of additional residential development. Fee revenue will be used to help fund new parks and recreation facilities in response to the increased demand, as well as significant renovations to existing facilities to modernize and enhance accessibility.

#### D. Need

Each new development will bring new residents to the City and will generate incremental, new demand and use of the City’s parks and recreation facilities. New revenues to fund investments

in additional parks and recreation capital improvements are necessary to maintain the City's parks and recreation capital facilities service standards and the current level of service. Additionally, significant reinvestment is needed to existing facilities to enhance accessibility.

#### **E. Proportionality**

The maximum, supportable parks and recreation fee schedule has been based on the cost to maintain the current per capita inventory of parkland and recreation facilities. As a result, the fee program cost estimates are directly proportional to the relative increase in new development. The fees comply with the essential nexus and rough proportionality requirements articulated in the U.S. Supreme Court case *Sheetz* because they are imposed for the legitimate government land use interest of providing park land and facilities to serve new development and the fees do not exceed the estimated costs of providing the land and facilities for that purpose.

DRAFT

#### IV. DEMAND FOR NEW PARK AND RECREATION FACILITIES AND SUPPORTED IMPACT FEE AMOUNTS

##### A. Population and Residential Demand for Park and Recreation Facilities

Based on the most recent available Census data as reported in the American Community Survey of 2023, approximately 58,331 people reside in San Rafael. Based on projections prepared by the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG), the City anticipates that the City's population will reach 66,880 by 2040, which reflects a population growth of 8,549 residents through 2040.

The City's General Plan 2040 establishes a standard of four (4) acres of parkland per 1,000 residents, which reflects the current service level provided by a combination of regional parks, community and neighborhood parks located within the greater San Rafael Planning Area. The application of this service standard to a projected growth of 8,549 residents would indicate that an additional 34.2 acres of parkland would be needed by 2040 to serve the growth in population. The City has elected to base the adoption of parkland and recreation facility development impact fees on a lower standard of 1.824 acres per 1,000 residents, which reflects the current inventory of parks that are operated by the City of San Rafael. Applying the reduced standard of 1.824 acres of parkland to a projected population growth of 8,549 residents would indicate that an additional 15.6 acres of parkland will be needed by 2040 to meet the needs of new residents.

In addition to parks, new residents also create more demand for recreation facilities that are provided by the City's three community centers and a historic building that serves as a cultural center.

**Table 7. Current and Projected San Rafael Population**

	2025	2040	Increase
Total Population	58,331	66,880	8,549
Additional Park Acres Needed based on Existing City Level of Service of 1.824 Acres Per 1,000 Residents			15.6 acres

Note: Formulas may appear to yield slightly different figures than shown due to rounding.

##### B. New Residential Development

Given the limited availability of undeveloped land, the majority of new residential development is occurring on infill sites. Ownership projects are generally comprised of townhomes and small scale condominiums, with a limited number of single family detached units. Unit sizes of new townhomes and condos range from 1,300 to 1,800 square feet per unit, with prices in the \$1.1 million to \$1.3 million range. Densities range from 10 units to 30 units per acre. There has been considerable activity in the rental market in San Rafael, with a number of applications by projects that are seeking density bonuses and stream-line processing through the provisions of



SB 330. Project heights range from 2 to 13 stories, with two projects at 7 to 8 stories. The average size of rental units is 800 to 900 square feet. The largest pipeline project is the redevelopment of the Northgate shopping center, which is slated to include over 1,400 rental apartments and townhomes. Other significant pending projects include a 210-unit apartment project and a 187-unit apartment project.

Based on the distribution of the City's residential inventory between single family detached homes and multi-family homes, new development trends, and the sizes of new residential units, the calculation of park impact fees reflects the assumptions that new single family detached units will average 2,300 square feet and that new multi-family units will average 1,111 square feet.

### C. Parks and Recreation Facility Inventory and Standards

In 2023, the City adopted a Citywide Parks and Recreation Master Plan. The Master Plan provides a comprehensive assessment of the City's park system, a needs assessment, goals, plans, and an action plan for undertaking priority projects. As summarized below in Table 8 and detailed in Appendix A, Table 1, the City has a total inventory of 106.41 acres of existing City-operated parks. Of the existing acreage, approximately 39% are neighborhood parks, 32% are community parks, and 26% are special use parks. Additionally, the City provides three community centers, including a recreational swim center, and one cultural center.

**Table 8. Existing Park and Recreation Facilities Operated by the City of San Rafael**

Total Acres	
Community Parks	33.81
Neighborhood Parks	41.33
Pocket Parks	3.27
Special Use Parks	<u>28.0</u>
All Parks	106.41
Albert J. Boro Community Center	1
San Rafael / Albert Park Community Center	1
Terra Linda Community Center	1
Falkirk Cultural Center	1

*Detailed in Appendix A, Table 1 of this report and Tables 6 and 8 of the Citywide Parks and Recreation Master Plan.*

Per the City's General Plan 2040, descriptions of these types of parks are as follows:

- **Community Parks** are typically 10 acres or larger and include a variety of facilities, such as recreation centers, swimming pools, tennis courts, and multi-use athletic fields. San Rafael's community parks serve residents throughout the City and beyond.

- **Neighborhood Parks** are typically between one and ten acres in size and include a range of facilities, such as softball fields, playgrounds, lawn areas, basketball courts, and picnic areas. They are within walking distance of many users.
- **Pocket Parks** are less than an acre in size and draw from a small area, such as a one quarter mile radius. Facilities are limited to children's play structures and lawn areas.
- **Special Use Parks** include parks that serve a unique purpose or activity. Examples include Starkweather Park along the Bay, and community gardens.

The City's inventory of 106.41 acres and population of 58,331 yields a level of service equal to 1.824 acres of parkland per 1,000 residents. The Park and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee will be based on maintaining this current level of service. For consistency purposes, the parkland dedication requirement and in-lieu fee provisions for subdivision projects will be revised downward from the existing 3 acres per 1,000 residents to 1.824 acres per 1,000 residents.

#### **D. Existing Facilities Inventory Replacement Cost Method for Establishing Fee Amounts**

In accordance with the provisions of AB 602, this nexus study uses the "Existing Inventory Method" described in the "Impact Fee Nexus Study Templates" document that was prepared in 2023 by the Turner Center for Housing Innovation at UC Berkeley for the California Department of Housing and Community Development. Under this approach, the cost of facilities to serve new development is calculated based on the cost to replace the City's existing inventory of park facilities and the City's existing population. Dividing the replacement cost of existing inventory by the City's population yields a park facility replacement per capita cost factor that can then be applied to the average household size of new development to generate a cost per unit. Per the requirements of the Mitigation Fee Act, the per unit cost estimate is converted into a fee per square foot of livable residential area by dividing the per unit cost by the average square footage of new residences.

#### **E. Replacement Cost of Existing San Rafael Parks and Recreation Facilities**

Table 9 provides an estimate of the value of the City's current parks and facilities as measured by the estimated cost to replace the parks and facilities. Replacement costs include the cost to acquire the 106.4 acres of parkland, improve the land with park facilities, and rebuild the community centers. As shown on Table 9, the replacement cost of the City's parkland and recreational facilities is estimated to total \$506.82 million. The total replacement cost translates into a per capita value of \$8,689, or \$8,862 after inclusion of a 2% administration cost allowance.

**Table 9. Replacement Cost of Existing San Rafael Parks and Recreation Facilities - Existing Inventory Method**

Community Center and Cultural Facilities						
		Estimated Replacement Cost			Source	
		<u>SF</u>	<u>\$/SF</u>			
San Rafael Community Center		17,500	\$1,943	\$34,002,500	City estimate	
Terra Linda Park and Community Center		5,552	\$1,943	\$10,787,536	City estimate	
Albert J. Boro Community Center		14,487	\$1,943	\$28,148,241	City estimate	
Falkirk Cultural Facility		5,500	\$2,526 <sup>1</sup>	\$13,892,450	City estimate	
<b>Total Replacement Cost of Three Community Centers and One Cultural Facility</b>				<b>\$86,830,700</b>		
Parks						
	Acres	Land Cost Per Acre <sup>1</sup>	Imp. Cost Per Acre <sup>2</sup>	Land Cost	Improvement Costs <sup>3</sup>	Total Park Replacement Cost
Community Parks	33.81	\$2,613,600	\$1,400,000	\$88,365,816	\$47,334,000	\$135,699,800
Neighborhood Parks	42.33	\$2,613,600	\$1,320,000	\$110,633,688	\$55,875,600	\$166,509,300
Pocket Parks	2.27	\$2,613,600	\$750,000	\$5,932,872	\$1,702,500	\$7,635,400
Special Parks	<u>28.00</u>	\$2,613,600	\$1,320,000	\$73,180,800	\$36,960,000	<u>\$110,140,800</u>
<b>Total Replacement Cost of Parks</b>	106.41			<b>\$278,113,200</b>	<b>\$141,872,100</b>	<b>\$419,985,300</b>
<b>Replacement Cost of Total Inventory of Community Centers and Parks</b>						<b>\$506,816,000</b>
					Per Capita	\$8,689
					Per Capita Replacement Cost With 2% Admin. Cost	\$8,862

<sup>1</sup> Estimate reflects the base replacement cost estimate of \$1,943 per square foot of building area plus a 30% premium to account for the additional cost associated with replacing an historical structure.

<sup>2</sup> Based on recent land sales in Marin County for residential development with a downward adjustment to \$60 per square foot to reflect discount for the variety of entitlement conditions, densities, and market conditions that impact the value of different properties given a range of circumstances. See Appendix A, Table 2.

<sup>3</sup> Based on cost analyses prepared by architects for standard park facilities. See Appendix A, Table 3.

**Parkland Acquisition Costs** – The cost to acquire parkland has been estimated based on recent land sales for residential development in San Rafael and nearby communities. These sales are provided in Appendix A, Table 2. Ten of the thirteen sales were for sites of less than one acre. The remaining three sales included sales of 3.7 acres, 9.5 acres, and 23 acres. Most of the sales are for properties in Downtown San Rafael. The properties vary with respect to the quality of location, entitlements, usability, and other factors. As noted, the average price in 2024 dollars was \$125 per square foot of land area, with prices ranging from a low of \$15 per square foot to \$191 per square foot. Given that the City's parks are located throughout the City, for purposes of this analysis, a conservative average value of \$60 per square foot has been selected for purposes of estimating the average value of city parkland. Applying \$60 per square foot to the inventory of 106.41 acres yields an estimated value of \$278.11 million for the City's parkland.

**Park Facilities Replacement Costs** – The cost of developing park facilities varies significantly, depending on the nature of the facilities. Appendix A, Table 3 provides cost estimates for generic park improvements by type of park that were prepared by architects and engineers for

impact fee studies in other jurisdictions. Based on this information, an average improvement cost of \$1.40 million per acre has been assumed for community parks, \$1.32 million for neighborhood and special parks, and \$750,000 per acre for pocket parks. Applying these replacement cost estimates to the City's inventory of parks yields a value for city-wide park improvements of \$141.87 million.

***Community Center and Cultural Center Replacement Cost*** – The City of San Rafael intends to significantly renovate the San Rafael Community Center and the Terra Linda Park and Community Center over the next five to ten years and has prepared cost estimates for the renovations. Based on the renovation estimates and general construction cost information, the City has estimated replacement costs for each of the three community recreation centers and the Falkirk Cultural Facility, which is a historic complex. As shown on Table 9, the aggregate replacement cost of these facilities is estimated at \$86.83 million.

#### **F. Maximum Supported Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fees for Subdivision Projects that Do Not Dedicate Park Land**

Table 10A provides the calculation of the Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fee for subdivision projects that do not dedicate parkland based on the replacement cost data provided in Table 9. This fee may be paid at either the time that a final map is approved or when building permits are issued. Because the size of units may not be known at the final map stage, a fee paid at that time would be paid on a per unit basis. If the in-lieu fee is paid at the time of building permit, then it could be levied based on the number of livable square feet. The maximum supported parkland dedication in-lieu fee for subdivision units that do not dedicate parkland is \$12,596 per single family detached unit and \$11,282 per multi-family unit. The maximum fee includes an allowance for a 2% administration fee.

**Table 10A. Calculation of Maximum Parkland Dedication In-Lieu Fees for Subdivision Units that Do Not Dedicate Land, to be Paid at Entitlements or Building Permit**

	<u>Land</u>	
Total Value of City Inventory of Parks and Park Facilities	\$278,113,200	
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	
Per Capita Parks and Facilities Replacement cost	\$4,767.85	
<b>Avg. Unit Population, accounting for vacancy (ACS 2023)</b>		
Single Family Detached Units	2.59	
Multi-Family Units (bldgs. with 2+ units)	2.32	
	<u>Avg. Unit Livable SF</u>	
Per Dwelling SF Parks and Facilities Replacement Cost		
Single Family Detached Units	2,300	
Multi Family Units	1,111	
<b>Maximum Land Dedication In-Lieu Fee for <i>Subdivision Units that Do Not Dedicate Land</i>, Paid at Building Permit</b>		
	<u>Single Family Detached Units</u>	<u>Units in Multi Family Bldgs. 2+DU</u>
Total Value of City Inventory of Parkland	\$278,113,200	\$278,113,200
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	58,331
Per Capita Parkland Replacement Cost	\$4,767.85	\$4,767.85
Avg. hhld size	2.59	2.32
In-Lieu Fee Per Unit	\$12,348.72	\$11,061.40
<b>Max. Land Dedication In-Lieu Fee</b>	<b>\$12,349</b>	<b>\$11,061</b>
<b>Max. Land Dedication In-Lieu Fee with 2% Admin. Allowance</b>	<b>\$12,596</b>	<b>\$11,282</b>

### G. Maximum Supported Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for Subdivision Units

Table 10B provides the calculation of the Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee for subdivision projects. This fee covers only the cost of park improvements and recreation facilities. This fee will be collected at the time that the units pay building permit fees. The maximum supported recreation facility development impact fee for subdivision projects is \$4.50 per square foot of livable area for single family detached units and \$8.35 per square foot for multi-family units.

**Table 10B. Calculation of Maximum Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Subdivision Units, to be Paid at Building Permit**

	Facilities	
Total Value of City Inventory of Parks and Park Facilities	\$228,702,800	
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	
Per Capita Facilities Replacement cost	\$3,920.78	
Avg. Unit Population, accounting for vacancy (ACS 2023)		
Single Family Detached Units	2.59	
Multi-Family Units (bldgs. with 2+ units)	2.32	
Per Dwelling SF Parks and Facilities Replacement Cost	Avg. Unit Livable SF	
Single Family Detached Units	2,300	
Multi Family Units	1,111	
Maximum Recreation Facility Impact Fee for All Subdivision Units, to be Paid at Building Permit		
	Single Family Detached Units	Units in Multi Family Bldgs. 2+DU
Total Value of City Inventory of Park Facilities	\$228,702,800	\$228,702,800
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	58,331
Per Capita Facilities Replacement cost	\$3,920.78	\$3,920.78
Avg. hhld size	2.59	2.32
Fee Per Unit	\$10,154.81	\$9,096.20
Avg. Unit Livable SF	2,300	1,111
Max. Facility Impact Fee, per Livable SF before Admin.	\$4.42	\$8.19
Max. Facility Impact Fee, per Livable SF with 2% Admin. Allowance	\$4.50	\$8.35

#### **H. Maximum Supported Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Non-Subdivision Units**

Table 10C provides the calculation of the Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee for all non-subdivision projects. The maximum fee covers the demand for both parkland and recreation facility improvements that are generated by new development. This fee will be collected at the time that building permit fees are paid, unless later payment is required by law. The maximum supported parkland and recreation facility development impact fee for all non-subdivision units is \$9.98 per square foot of livable area for single family detached units and \$18.50 per square foot for multi-family units.

**Table 10C. Calculation of Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fees for All Non-Subdivision Units, to be Paid at Building Permit**

	<u>Land</u>	<u>Facilities</u>	<u>Land and Facilities</u>			
<b>Total Value of City Inventory of Parks and Park Facilities</b>	\$278,113,200	\$228,702,800	\$506,816,000			
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	58,331	58,331			
<b>Per Capita Parks and Facilities Replacement cost</b>	<b>\$4,767.85</b>	<b>\$3,920.78</b>	<b>\$8,688.62</b>			
<b>Avg. Unit Population, accounting for vacancy (ACS 2023)</b>						
Single Family Detached Units			2.59			
Multi-Family Units (bldgs. with 2+ units)			2.32			
<b>Per Dwelling SF Parks and Facilities Replacement Cost</b>	<u>Avg. Unit Livable SF</u>					
Single Family Detached Units	2,300					
Multi Family Units	1,111					
<b>Maximum Parkland and Recreation Facility Impact Fee for <u>All Non-Subdivision Units</u> - to be Paid at Building Permit</b>						
	<u>Single Family Detached Units</u>			<u>Multi Family (Bldgs. 2+ units)</u>		
	<u>Land</u>	<u>Facilities</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Land</u>	<u>Facilities</u>	<u>Total</u>
Total Value of City Inventory of Parkland and Facilities	\$278,113,200	\$228,702,800	\$506,816,000	\$278,113,200	\$228,702,800	\$506,816,000
Population of City of San Rafael (ACS 2023)	58,331	58,331	58,331	58,331	58,331	58,331
Per Capita Total Inventory Replacement Cost	\$4,767.85	\$3,920.78	\$8,688.62	\$4,767.85	\$3,920.78	\$8,688.62
Avg. hhld size (ACS 2023)	2.59	2.59	2.59	2.32	2.32	2.32
Fee Per Unit	\$12,348.72	\$10,154.81	\$22,503.53	\$11,061.40	\$9,096.20	\$20,157.60
Avg. Unit Livable SF (New Units)	2,300	2,300	2,300	1,111	1,111	1,111
<b>Max. Parkland and Facility Impact Fee, per Livable SF, before Admin.</b>	<b>\$5.37</b>	<b>\$4.42</b>	<b>\$9.78</b>	<b>\$9.95</b>	<b>\$8.19</b>	<b>\$18.14</b>
<b>Max. Facility Impact Fee, per Livable SF, with 2% Admin. Allowance</b>	<b>\$5.48</b>	<b>\$4.50</b>	<b>\$9.98</b>	<b>\$10.15</b>	<b>\$8.35</b>	<b>\$18.50</b>

## **V. Estimated Range and Maximum Amount of Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee Revenue through 2040**

The maximum amount of revenue that would be generated by the adoption of the maximum parkland and recreation facility development impact fees through year 2040 has been estimated. The estimates have been calculated under the assumption that the City's population increases by 8,549 over the period and that household sizes remain at 2.59 for single family detached units and 2.32 for multi-family units. The maximum revenue scenario reflects the assumption that 100% of new residential units are not located within subdivisions and they pay full fees for both acquiring parkland and building park facilities (including community centers). The minimum revenue scenario reflects the assumption that 100% of new residential units are located within subdivisions and that the units pay only park facility impact fees. Both scenarios reflect the assumption that all residential units will be subject to recreation facility development impact fees. However, the City may elect to exempt individual homeowner projects or small projects with fewer units than a threshold to be selected, which would reduce the estimated maximum amount of achievable revenue.

As shown in Table 11, under the maximum revenue scenario, it is estimated that approximately \$75.8 million of parkland and recreation facility impact fee revenue would be generated by new development through the year 2040. The minimum amount of impact fee revenue is estimated to be \$34.2 million. Based on development trends, it is expected that fee revenue will be in the range of \$59.1 million to \$67.5 million, which yields an average projection of \$63.3 million, or \$7,403 per new resident, which is less than the per capita cost to replace the existing inventory of parkland and facilities and maintain the existing level of service.

As discussed in Section VI, the City has prepared a "Parks Development Impact Fee Project List (Table 12). It is estimated that the cost of undertaking the improvements eligible to be funded with development impact fees is \$110.2 million, which exceeds the estimated maximum amount of impact fee revenue that could be generated by the adoption of the maximum fee amounts supported by this nexus study.

Therefore, the maximum fee levels established by this nexus analysis are consistent with the requirements of the AB 602 and the California Mitigation Fee Act.



**Table 11. Estimated Range of Parkland and Recreation Facility Development Impact Fee Revenue through Yr. 2040**

	100% Non-Subdivision - Land and Facility Fee				100% Subdivision - Land Dedication; Facility Fee Only			
	<u>SF, Detached</u>	<u>Multifamily</u>	<u>SF, Detached</u>	<u>Multifamily</u>	<u>SF, Detached</u>	<u>Multifamily</u>	<u>SF, Detached</u>	<u>Multifamily</u>
Population Growth – 2040	8,549	0	0	8,549	8,549	0	0	8,549
Household Size	2.59	2.32	2.59	2.32	2.59	2.32	2.59	2.32
Units	3,301	0	0	3,685	3,301	0	0	3,685
s.f./ unit	2,300	1,111	2,300	1,111	2,300	1,111	2,300	1,111
Total s.f.	7,591,776	0	0	4,095,052	7,591,776	0	0	4,095,052
Per SF Fee	\$9.98	\$18.50	\$9.98	\$18.50	\$4.50	\$8.35	\$4.50	\$8.35
Implied Revenue (100%)	\$75,764,609	\$0	\$0	\$75,764,609	\$34,189,091	\$0	\$0	\$34,189,091

Subdivision/ Non Subdivision Scenarios				
Max Fee Scenario	Min. Fee Scenario	Total Revenue	Expected Range	Per New Resident
% Of Units that Are Not Within Subdivision and Pay Full Impact Fees	% of Total Units That are within Subdivisions with Land Dedication			
100%	0%	\$75,765,000	\$63,292,000	\$8,862
90%	10%	\$71,607,000		\$8,376
80%	20%	\$67,450,000		\$7,890
70%	30%	\$63,292,000		\$7,403
60%	40%	\$59,134,000		\$6,917
50%	50%	\$54,977,000	\$63,292,000	\$6,431
40%	60%	\$50,819,000		\$5,944
30%	70%	\$46,662,000		\$5,458
20%	80%	\$42,504,000		\$4,972
10%	90%	\$38,347,000		\$4,486
0%	100%	\$34,189,000		\$3,999

## VI. USE OF FEE REVENUE

The City plans to use parkland and recreation facility development impact fee revenue to 1) acquire parkland and construct new facilities to maintain the current level of service; and 2) undertake significant reinvestment in existing facilities to expand and modernize facilities to best meet the needs of the community. The Parks Development Impact Fee Project List, which identifies planned capital investment to be undertaken during the next 15 years, is provided in Table 12. As shown, the list includes:

- Park and Community Center Renovation Projects;
- New Amenity Projects;
- Improvements to existing Amenities; and
- Land Acquisition and Development of New Parks

The Parks Development Impact Fee Project List identifies the location of planned improvements, the anticipated schedule, the estimated total cost of each improvement, and the portion of each improvement's total cost that is eligible to be funded by parkland and park facility development impact fee revenues. As shown, the projects that are eligible to be funded by park impact fees is estimated to total \$110.16 million, which exceeds the total revenues projected to be collected from the park impact fees and parkland dedication in-lieu fees. As such, the City's Parks Development Impact Fee Project List demonstrates that the City has eligible projects on which to spend the fee revenues. The City will annually review and update the Parks Development Impact Fee Project List, in accordance with Government Code section 66002, to ensure that it continues to reflect the City's parkland and facilities needs.

Table 12

## Parks Development Impact Fee Project List

	Land or Development	Size (acres of new park land)	Total Cost	New Development Share of Cost	Timing	Location
<b>Park &amp; Community Center Renovation Projects</b>						
Terra Linda Park Renovation	Development	existing	\$5,000,000	\$5,000,000	5 years	Terra Linda Park
Terra Linda Community Center Renovation	Development	existing	\$21,000,000	\$21,000,000	5 years	Terra Linda Community Center
Terra Linda Community Garden Renovation	Development	existing	\$1,600,000	\$1,600,000	5 years	Terra Linda Community Garden
Albert Park Field & Stadium Renovation	Development	existing	\$4,500,000	\$2,250,000	10 years	Albert Park
Falkirk Cultural Center Accessibility Improvements	Development	existing	\$5,500,000	\$5,500,000	10 years	Falkirk Cultural Center
		<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>\$37,600,000</b>	<b>\$35,350,000</b>		
<b>New Amenity</b>						
Freitas Park North Parcel	Development	existing	\$644,500	\$644,500	5 years	Freitas Park
Bernard Hoffman Play Area and Pathway Improvement	Development	existing	\$500,000	\$500,000	10 years	Bernard Hoffman Park
Starkweather Park Boat ramp	Development	existing	\$1,275,000	\$1,275,000	15 years	Jean & John Starkweather Park
		<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>\$2,419,500</b>	<b>\$2,419,500</b>		
<b>Amenity Improvements</b>						
Freitas Park tennis courts and pathway development	Development	existing	\$250,000	\$187,500	5 years	Freitas Park
Gerstle Park lower play area improvement project	Development	existing	\$1,600,000	\$1,600,000	5 years	Gerstle Park
Oleander Park playground and pathway improvements	Development	existing	\$300,000	\$300,000	5 years	Oleander Park
Gerstle Park Pathway Improvements	Development	existing	\$700,000	\$350,000	5 years	Gerstle Park
Santa Margarita tennis court, basketball court, play area and pathway improvements	Development	existing	\$1,600,000	\$1,600,000	5 years	Santa Margarita Park
Riviera Park Play Area and Pathway Improvement	Development	existing	\$400,000	\$400,000	10 years	Riviera Park
Oliver Hartzell Park Play Area and Pathway Improvement	Development	existing	\$300,000	\$300,000	10 years	Oliver Hartzell Park
Gerstle Park Tennis Court Improvements	Development	existing	\$500,000	\$500,000	10 years	Gerstle Park
Boyd Park Tennis Court Improvements	Development	existing	\$700,000	\$700,000	10 years	Boyd Park
Starkweather Park Trail Improvements	Development	existing	\$750,000	\$375,000	15 years	Jean & John Starkweather Park
Bret Harte Sports Court and Pathway Improvement	Development	existing	\$200,000	\$100,000	15 years	Bret Harte Park
Bret Harte Park Play Area Improvement	Development	existing	\$500,000	\$500,000	15 years	Bret Harte Park
Victor Jones Sports Court Improvement	Development	existing	\$600,000	\$600,000	15 years	Victor Jones Park
		<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>\$8,400,000</b>	<b>\$7,512,500</b>		
<b>Land Acquisition and Development</b>						
Canal Boatyard	Development	1.65	\$4,126,850	\$4,126,850	5 years	620 Canal Street
Montecito/Dominican Neighborhood	Land	1	\$2,613,600	\$2,613,600	5 years	Montecito/Dominican
	Development		\$1,289,000	\$1,289,000	5 years	
Winward Way	Development	6.22	\$10,017,580	\$10,017,580	10 years	Winward Way
West End/Fairhills Neighborhood	Land	2	\$5,227,200	\$5,227,200	10 years	West End/Fairhills
	Development		\$2,578,000	\$2,578,000	10 years	
Lincoln/San Rafael Hill Neighborhood	Land	2	\$5,227,200	\$5,227,200	10 years	Lincoln/San Rafael Hill
	Development		\$2,578,000	\$2,578,000	10 years	
Contempo/Deer Park Neighborhood	Land	4	\$10,454,400	\$10,454,400	15 years	Contempo/Deer Park
	Development		\$5,156,000	\$5,156,000	15 years	
Northbridge/Marin Lagoon Neighborhood	Land	4	\$10,454,400	\$10,454,400	15 years	Northbridge/Marin Lagoon
	Development		\$5,156,000	\$5,156,000	15 years	
		<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>\$64,878,230</b>	<b>\$64,878,230</b>		
<b>SUMMARY</b>						
	<b>Renovation Projects</b>		\$37,600,000	\$35,350,000		
	<b>New Amenity Projects</b>		\$2,419,500	\$2,419,500		
	<b>Amenity Improvement Projects</b>		\$8,400,000	\$7,512,500		
	<b>Land Acquisition and Development</b>		\$64,878,230	\$64,878,230		
	<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>\$113,297,730</b>	<b>\$110,160,230</b>		
	<b>TOTAL NEW ACREAGE</b>		<b>20.87</b>			

## **VII. IMPACT FEES IN NEIGHBORING CITIES, MAXIMUM SUPPORTED FEES, AND RECOMMENDED FEES**

### **A. Park and Recreation Fees in Neighboring Jurisdictions**

KMA surveyed the park impact fees levied by the cities within Marin County and other Bay Area jurisdictions. The park and recreation development impact fees of peer jurisdictions are summarized in Table 13. The requirement that can most appropriately be compared across jurisdictions is the “Park Development Impact Fee Amount,” which applies to all non-subdivision units and funds both parkland acquisition and park facilities. As shown on Table 13, the park impact fee amounts of the selected peer jurisdictions are as follows:

	<b>Single Family Detached</b>	<b>Multi-Family</b>
Novato	\$10,354 per DU	\$10,354 Per DU
Santa Rosa	\$14,890 to \$17,314 per DU	\$11,169 to \$14,415 per DU
Vallejo	\$14,315 per DU	\$9,808 to \$12,907 per DU
San Ramon	\$23,951 per DU	\$14,371 per DU
Concord	\$11,910 to \$16,691 per DU	\$7,055 to \$11,470 per DU

Table 13. Parkland Dedication and In-lieu Fee Requirements for Residential Subdivisions and Park Facility Impact Fees  
Select Peer Jurisdictions

	Novato	Petaluma	Santa Rosa <sup>1</sup>	Napa	Vallejo	San Ramon	Concord
General Plan Parkland Dedication Standard, Residential Subdivisions	4.5 acres per 1,000 residents	3.4 acres per 1,000 residents	3.0 acres per 1,000 residents; Land dedication is required if GP designates a park within the proposed subdivision.	2.5 acres per 1,000 residents	4.25 acres per 1,000 residents	4.91 acres per 1,000 residents	5 acres per 1,000 residents
Acreage Dedication Requirements per Residential Unit, Subdivision units	SF detached = .0124 SF attached = .0102 Duplex = .0113 Apts. 3 to 4 Du= .0107 Apts. 5+ DU = .0101	SF = .0099 MF = .0067 ADUs = .0034	SF detached = .00825 SF attached = .00813 Duplex = .00798 MF = .00657 Moblie Homes = .00492	SF detached = .007175 SF attached = .00515 Duplex = .005325 MF = .004575 Moblie Homes = .003775 ADU = .0025	SF detached = .01296 SF attached = .01169 Duplex = .01058 MF = .00889 Moblie Homes = .00778	SF = .01577 MF = .01035	VL Density = 0.016000 Low Density = 0.13933 Med. Density = 0.01010 High Density = 0.00950 Downtown, seniors, special needs = 0.00700
Land Improvements Required with Land Dedication (Subdivisions)	Full street imps. , utility connections. drainage, and fencing.	Required to construct all public improvements slated for park and to be reimbursed for costs from in-lieu fees.	Full street imps. , utility connections. drainage, and fencing.	Full street imps. , utility connections. drainage, and fencing.	Not specified.	Shall have access to streets.	
In-Lieu Fee Conditions (Subdivisions)	If no park facility designated in GP for the property; or if subdivision has 50 or less parcels	Payment of fee is at election of applicant if subdivision contains less than 50 lots.	All development must pay park impact fee. If land is dedicated, a credit is received equal to the value of the land (as established by a City ordinance).	It is at the City's discretion if land dedication, an in-lieu fee, or a combination are required	It is at the City's discretion if land dedication, an in-lieu fee, or a combination are required	If no park facility designated in GP for the property; or if subdivision has 50 or less parcelsor if city determines dedication is not appropriate.	It is at the City's discretion if land dedication, an in-lieu fee, or a combination are required
In-Lieu Fee Amount (Subdivision units)	Required dedicated acreage per unit times the fair market value of buildable land.	Equal to park land acquisition fees adopted for non-Quimby Act developments.	All development must pay park impact fee. If land is dedicated, a credit is received equal to the value of the land (as established by a City ordinance).	Value of land to be dedicated + 20% towards the costs of all off-site improvements, which would have been dedicated.	In 2009, the in-lieu fee amount reflected a land value cost of \$526,918 per acre. The 2009 in-lieu fees were as follows: SF detached = \$6,829 per du SF attached = \$6,157 per du Duplex = \$5,575 per du; MF = \$4,680 per du Mobile home = \$4,097 per du. Per municipal code, in-lieu fees scheduld to increase annually based on the engineering News Record Construction Cost index.	Appraised value of land dedication requirement times a factor of 1.02	Set by resolution, varies by zipcode. VL /Low Density = \$11,910 to \$16,691 per du Med. Density = \$8,170 to \$11,470 per du High Density = \$7,055 to \$9,914 per du Dwnntn, Senior, SN + \$5,233/du to \$7,304 per du ADU = \$4,508 to \$8,345 per du

Table 13. Parkland Dedication and In-lieu Fee Requirements for Residential Subdivisions and Park Facility Impact Fees Select Peer Jurisdictions

	Novato	Petaluma	Santa Rosa <sup>1</sup>	Napa	Vallejo	San Ramon	Concord
Park Development Impact Fee Amount	Novato levies a fee for Recreation and Cultural Facilites.  SF unit = \$10,354.03 per du; MF unit = \$10, 354.68 per du ADU = \$5,17.34 per du. Need to clarify fee obligation for Subdivision projects.		Fee Amount varies by location SF detached = \$14,890 to \$17,314 SF attached = \$13,011 to \$14,415 Duplex = \$12,843 to \$14,230 MF = \$11,169 to \$12,375 ADUs > 750 sf / MHs = \$8,877 to \$9,939		SF detached = \$14,315 SF attached = \$12,907 Duplex = \$11,686 MF = \$9,808 Mobile Homes = \$8,588 Developers who dedicate land or pay an in-lieu fee receive a credit against the park impact fees	Facility Fees: Subdiv. SF = \$5,300 per du Subdiv. MF = \$3,421.63 per du  Non Subdiv. SF = \$23,951.43 per du Non Subdiv. MF = \$14,370.86 per du	Set by resolution, varies by zipcode. VL /Low Density = \$11,910 to \$16,691 per du Med. Density = \$8,170 to \$11,470 per du High Density = \$7,055 to \$9,914 per du Dwntn, Senior, SN + \$5,233/du to \$7,304 per du
Park Land Acqisition Fee		SF unit = \$2,293 per du; MF unit = \$1,551 per du ADU = \$787per du.	Part of Park Development Impact Fee Amount.	All projects: SF detached = \$6,581 SF attached = \$4,723 Duplex = \$4,884 MF = \$4,196 Mobile Homes = \$3,462 ADU = \$2,293		Land Dedication In-lieu Fee for Subdivision projects: SF = Appraised value of 687 sf of land X 1.02 MF = appraised value of 451 sf of land X 1.02	
Park Land development Impact Fee (Applied to All Residential Development)		SF unit = \$7,585 per du; MF unit = \$5,107 per du ADU = \$2,601 per du.	See Park Development Impact Fee	All projects: SF detached = \$1,003 SF attached = \$720 Duplex = \$744 MF = \$639 Mobile Homes = \$528			
Commercial Park Land Acquisition and Development Impact Fee, Per 1,000 SF of Gross Building Area		Commercial = \$1,872 Office = \$1,789 Industrial = \$1,140					

1) All residential developments are required to pay the Park Development Impact Fee. If a project dedicates land, the developer receives a partial credit equal to the value of the dedicated land. The per acre land value credit is established by City Ordinance.

**Appendix A:**  
**Inventory of Parks from Citywide Parks and Recreation Master Plan,**  
**Recent Residential Land Sales in San Rafael, and**  
**Parkland and Recreational Facility Construction Cost Estimates**

---

**Appendix A Table 1: City Operated Parks by Type and Recreation Provided**

Park Name	Size	Ballfield	Basketball Court	Bocce Facilities	Handball Court	Multi-Use Turf Field (soccer/foot-ball)	Par Course	Playground	Pool	Reservable Picnic Area	Restroom	Tennis Court	Water Feature
<b>Community Park</b>													
Albert Park	13.34	x		x				x				x	
Pickleweed Park	17.60	x				x		x		x	x		
Terra Linda Park	2.87		x					x	x	x	x		
<b>Neighborhood Park</b>													
Bernard Hoffman Field	3.80	x											
Bret Harte Park	0.46		x					x			x		
Freitas Park	2.69							x		x	x	x	x
Gerstle Park	6.00		x					x		x	x	x	
Loch Lomond	3.00							x			x		
Los Ranchitos Park	3.00		x		x			x			x		
Oleander Park	2.28							x					
Peacock Gap Park	4.14						x	x			x	x	
Santa Margarita Park	5.00		x					x		x	x	x	
Sun Valley Park	5.00		x					x		x	x		
Victor Jones Park	5.96	x	x					x		x	x		
<b>Pocket Park</b>													
Arbor Park	0.30												
Beach Park	0.44			x									
Hillview Park	0.26												
Munson Park	1.46												
Oliver Hartzell Park	0.54							x					
Riviera Park	0.27							x					
<b>Special Use Park</b>													
Boyd Memorial Park	1.75							x				x	
Falkirk Cultural Center Grounds	3.60												
Jean and John Starkweather Shoreline Park	21.30										x		
<b>Special Use Park - Community Garden</b>													
Canal Community Garden	0.35												
Terra Linda Community Garden	1.00												
<b>Total</b>	<b>106.41</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>

Source: Citywide Parks and Recreation Master Plan, Tables 6 and 8



**Appendix A Table 2**  
**Residential Land Sales - Marin County**  
**April 2020 - April 2025; Source: CoStar**

<u>Property Address</u>	<u>Property City</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Est. 2024 price @3 % per year</u>	<u>Land SF Gross</u>	<u>2024</u> <u>Price per</u>	<u>Transaction Notes</u>
						<u>SF</u>	
1515 4th Street	San Rafael	\$4,244,799	11/23/2020	\$4,638,406	38,981	\$119	Project has been approved for 183 independent living, assisted living and memory care units.
930 Irwin / 543 4th St.	San Rafael	\$2,254,073	4/1/2022	\$2,391,346	21,963	\$109	Proposed 8-story project with 210 units. SB 330 application. Bankruptcy sale. Site is currently improved with a 11,000 sf office building.
815 B Street	San Rafael			\$4,057,560	23,623	\$172	41 unit project completed in 2021. 2024 Assessed land value. Avg. unit size is 856 sf.
1230 5th Avenue	San Rafael	\$6,100,000	7/28/2020	\$4,350,920	28,358	\$153	SB 330 application for 187 residential units. 12 stories. Property is currently improved with a 11,000 sf building. Value reflects 2024 assessed land value.
555 Northgate Drive	San Rafael	\$8,100,000	3/7/2024	\$8,100,000	96,703	\$84	Property improved with 23,100 sf office building. Max. permitted density is 43.6 du/acre. Application for 250 units due to density bonus
1580 Lincoln Avenue	San Rafael	\$1,150,000	11/3/2020	\$1,256,636	18,391	\$68	use at time of sale was a retail garden center. Permitted density of 43.6 units per acre.
Loch Lomond Dr	San Rafael	\$24,950,000	4/15/2021	\$27,263,539	159,865	\$171	The parties involved in this deal could not be reached for comment. Per public record, this is the sale of 37 residential lots for \$24.95 million or about \$674k per lot. Part of the Village at Loch Lomond Marina, News reports that 18 detached homes, 14 townhouses and five condominiums will be built. All will be offered for sale at full market value, not low-income. Permit ready.
1010 Grand Ave (Part of a 2 Property Sale)	San Rafael	\$1,925,000	10/16/2020	\$2,166,604	28,314	\$77	The 0.65 Acre land was sold for \$1,925,000. The property highlights 3 unique property offering represents several opportunities for either owner users, value add investors or a possible total redevelopment. Very conveniently located just 3 blocks from the San Rafael Transit (Smart Station) and Highway 101 with just a short walk to all amenities and transportation.
508 3rd Street	San Rafael	\$1,850,000	1//2020	\$2,082,191	11,974	\$174	Purchased for use as a parking lot.
21 G Street	San Rafael	\$1,425,000	4/1/2018	\$1,701,525	10,454	\$163	Purchased for development of eight townhomes.
1203 Lincoln Avenue	San Rafael	\$5,000,000	3/1/2017	\$6,149,369	32,234	\$191	Purchased for developmen tof 36 townhomes. Resold in 2018 for \$9.375 million for development of senior care home.
Lucas Valley Rd	San Rafael	\$5,600,000	6/30/2021	\$6,119,271	417,305	\$15	This land in San Rafael, CA was sold on 6/30/2021 by Bacciocco Enterprises LLC for \$5.6M, which is \$584,551.15 per acre, to The Oak Senior Living LLC. This land had been designated for an assisted living facility with 126 units for senior living and 5 affordable housing units on the almost 9.6 acres along Highway 101. The Oaks Senior Living Community had been approved by the Marin County Board of Supervisors in 2018. All information for this report was provided by public record at the time of this recording.
14 Skylark Dr	Larkspur	\$126,000,000	2/9/2022	\$133,673,400	1,022,095	\$131	Confirmed by the seller, this is the sale of the leased fee interest in the property. The seller retains the lease hold interest.
<b>Average</b>						<b>\$125</b>	
<b>Average, weighted by acreage</b>						<b>\$107</b>	
<b>Median</b>						<b>\$131</b>	
<b>Value Used for Calculating Maximum Fee</b>						<b>\$60</b>	

**Appendix A Table 3**
**Recreation Facility Construction Cost Estimates Prepared for Other Bay Area Park Development Impact Fee Nexus Studies**

	<u>Year of Study</u>	<u>Improvement Cost per Acre</u>	<u>Hhld size</u>	<u>Park Acres Standard Per 1,000 Residents</u>				<u>Sources</u>
				<u>Regional</u>	<u>Reg. Rec</u>	<u>Community</u>	<u>Neigh</u>	
<b>Sonoma County Parks Fee</b>	2020		2.3	15	5	2.5	2.5	
Regional Rec. Area improvements		\$93,700						Improvement costs are based on cost of 5 parks (26 acres).
Community Parks		\$283,000						
Neighborhood parks		NA						
<i>Inflated to 2025\$</i>								
<i>Regional Rec. Area improvements</i>		<i>\$137,000</i>						
<i>Community Parks</i>		<i>\$413,000</i>						
<b>City of Tracy</b>	2024							
15-acre Community Park		\$1,324,887	3.5 - SF			1	3	WRT + 10% design and planning, 10% construction mgmt. and 15% contingency.
5-acre Neighborhood Park		\$1,251,114	2.8 - 2 to 4					
<i>Inflated to 2025\$</i>								
<i>15-acre Community Park</i>		<i>\$1,400,000</i>						
<i>5-acre Neighborhood Park</i>		<i>\$1,320,000</i>						
<b>City of South San Francisco</b>	2015						3	
<i>Inflated to 2025\$</i>		\$981,250						
		\$1,650,000	3.45 - SF					Improvements based on recommendations from Group 4 Architect. Estimates based on recent park construction and anticipated costs.
			2.98 - 2 to 4					
			2.53 - 5 to 19					
			2.04 - 20 to 49					
			50+ - 1.78					
			mH - 2.65					

# Appendix A Table 4

## American Community Survey, 2023: City of San Rafael Population, Household, Vacancy and Household Size Data

	San Rafael Housing Units	Population	Avg. hhld size, Occupied Units	Total Unit Supply	Vacant Units	Vacancy Rate	Check Occ	Avg. hhld size with vacancy
<b>Total</b>	23,250	58,331	<b>2.51</b>	<b>24,212</b>				<b>2.41</b>
<b>Owner Occ</b>	12,042	28,551	2.37	<b>12,151</b>	109.36	0.90%	12042.00	2.35
1 unit	10,464	25,366	2.42	<b>10,559</b>	95.03	0.90%	10464.00	2.40
2 units to 4	282	656	2.33	<b>285</b>	2.56	0.90%	282.00	2.31
5 or more	920	1,599	1.74	<b>928</b>	8.36	0.90%	920.00	1.72
mobile home	326	829	2.54	<b>329</b>	2.96	0.90%	326.00	2.52
Boat/RV, Van, etc.	50	101	2.02	<b>50</b>	0.45	0.90%	50.00	2.00
<b>Ex. Boat, MH</b>	<b>11,666</b>	<b>27,621</b>	<b>2.37</b>	<b>11,772</b>	105.95	0.90%	11666.00	<b>2.35</b>
<b>Renter Occ.</b>	11,208	29,780	2.66	<b>11,460</b>	252.12	2.20%	11208.00	2.60
1 unit	2,425	8,371	3.45	<b>2,480</b>	54.55	2.20%	2425.00	3.38
2 to 4 units	2,452	5,599	2.28	<b>2,507</b>	55.16	2.20%	2452.00	2.23
5 or more	6,274	15,618	2.49	<b>6,415</b>	141.13	2.20%	6274.00	2.43
mobile home	37	79	2.14	<b>38</b>	0.83	2.20%	37.00	2.09
Boat/RV, Van, etc.	20	113	5.65	<b>20</b>	0.45	2.20%	20.00	5.53
<b>Ex, Boat, MH</b>	<b>11,151</b>	<b>29,588</b>	<b>2.65</b>	<b>11,402</b>	250.84	2.20%	11151.00	<b>2.60</b>
<b>Ttl, Ex. B &amp; MH</b>	<b>22,817</b>	<b>57,209</b>	<b>2.51</b>	<b>23,174</b>	<b>357</b>		<b>22,817</b>	<b>2.47</b>

Occupied Owner and Renter Units			
	Supply	Pop.	hhld size
	23,250	58,331	2.51
<b>1 unit</b>	<b>12,889</b>	<b>33,737</b>	<b>2.62</b>
<b>2 to 4 units</b>	<b>2,734</b>	<b>6,255</b>	<b>2.29</b>
<b>5 or more</b>	<b>7,194</b>	<b>17,217</b>	<b>2.39</b>
<b>mobile</b>	<b>363</b>	<b>908</b>	<b>2.50</b>
<b>Boat</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>214</b>	<b>3.06</b>
<b>Total, Ex. B &amp; MH</b>	<b>22,817</b>	<b>57,209</b>	<b>2.51</b>
<b>2+ units</b>	<b>9,928</b>	<b>23,472</b>	<b>2.36</b>

Owner and Renter With Vacant Units			
	Supply	Pop.	hhld size
	23,611	58,331	2.47
	13,039	33,737	2.59
	2,792	6,255	2.24
	7,343	17,217	2.34
	367	908	2.48
	71	214	3.02
	23,174	57,209	2.47
	10,135	23,472	2.32