

To: Josh Minshall, PE, City of San Rafael
From: Andrew Lee, TE
Cc: David Parisi, PE, TE
Date: October 24, 2016
Subject: 1010 Northgate Drive Traffic Study Peer Review

Parisi Transportation Consulting prepared this memorandum to summarize our review of the Northgate Walk project applicant's traffic memo (W-Trans, August 29, 2016) and parking analysis (W-Trans, September 14, 2016).

1. Trip Generation for Northgate Drive, W-Trans, August 29, 2016

Per the City of San Rafael's comments submitted to the applicant on August 1, 2016, the existing vehicle trip generation of the site has been updated to reflect a 25 percent diverted trip reduction. The net increase of the project calculated against the existing (actual) use is consistent with the City's direction.

The vehicle trip distribution as noted in the August 29, 2016 memo has not changed since the February 5, 2016, submittal to the City. The City noted a different trip assignment to/from Northgate Drive, but the difference would not affect traffic volumes through the two study intersections.

The August 29, 2016 memo adequately responds to prior City comment regarding trip generation and trip distribution.

2. Parking Analysis for the Northgate San Rafael Project, W-Trans, September 14, 2016

The project proposes to redevelop 1005 Northgate Drive to provide senior housing, and subdivide 1010 Northgate Drive to replace the existing parking lot with multifamily housing. The project would provide 542 parking spaces, with 274 spaces dedicated to the 235-room hotel and 307 spaces dedicated to senior and multifamily housing.

The hotel currently includes 5,791 square feet of conference space and 2,556 square feet of café/bar uses. City comment directed the applicant to explicitly account for hotel space apart from the number of guest rooms, and recommended against any reduction of the parking for the hotel and hospitality uses."¹

¹ Ragghianti | Freitas LLP, September 19, 2016, 14. DPW Comments - Parking, 3.1 City comment.

Parisi Review – Project Residential Component

The parking quantities required by the City, as presented in Table 1 of the parking analysis, are consistent with San Rafael City Municipal Code 14.18.040.²

The reduced parking quantities presented in Table 1 of the parking analysis are consistent with the provisions of the state density bonus law.³ The state density bonus law reduces the parking requirement for one bedroom apartments from 1.5 spaces per unit to one space per unit, and eliminates the City's requirement of one guest parking space for every five units. The project does not propose changes to the City's parking requirement for units with two or three bedrooms.

The residential component of the project as proposed appears to satisfy state and local off-street parking requirements.

Parisi Review – Project Hotel Component

The project proposes to subdivide the 1010 Northgate Drive property in order to redevelop the northeast corner, which is existing hotel parking, into multifamily housing.

As shown in the applicant's conceptual reference site plan (April 14, 2016), the existing hotel site provides parking for 294 vehicles. There are 235 spaces for the hotel rooms (one space per room), 10 spaces for employee parking (maximum shift of 20 employees), and 49 spaces for hospitality. We interpreted these 49 parking spaces as the amount allocated toward the hotel's complementary uses, i.e. the conference room space and restaurant / bar. The City's municipal code states that for hotels with convention or banquet facilities, the required parking in addition to the hotel is determined by a parking study and specified in the use permit. As such, the 49 spaces required for hospitality should already be identified as part of the hotel's use permit, and a reduction in the total hotel parking from 294 spaces to 274 spaces (listed as 272 spaces in the conceptual plan) would constitute a change in the hotel's use permit.

The main premise of the parking study is that the reduced hotel parking would continue to satisfy hotel parking demand because some conference space and café / bar patrons would also be hotel guests (i.e., internal trip capture); some hotel, conference space and café / bar patrons would travel by a mode other than personal vehicle (e.g., taxi and shuttle); and peak parking demand for the hotel uses would occur at different times of the day. The W-Trans parking analysis provides further justification of the adequacy of the reduced parking demand by providing a parking occupancy study for a Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday in October 2016, calculations for internal trip capture between shared uses, and calculations for parking demand by time of day.

²

https://www.municode.com/library/ca/san_rafael/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=IIT14ZO_DIVIVREA_PALSEDI_CH14.18PAST_14.18.040PARE

³ Kronick (2015) "Maximizing Density Through Affordability: A Developer's Guide to the California Density Bonus Law." p. 15.

http://www.kmtg.com/sites/default/files/publications/density_bonus_law_2015_web_version.pdf

The existing parking supply at the hotel appears to indicate that internal capture and parking demand by time of day have already been taken into account when the hotel's use permit was approved. There are 49 parking spaces allocated for hospitality in addition to the 245 spaces allocated to the rooms and hotel employees. The hotel's largest conference room space, the Marin Room, has a banquet capacity of 220 persons and a theater / reception capacity of 300 persons.⁴ The maximum capacity of the Marin Room exceeds the hotel's existing 294 parking spaces, which we interpret as a preexisting assumption of carpooling, internal trip capture, and differential parking demand by time of day when the hotel's use permit was approved. There are three other conference rooms at the hotel, the Napa Room, Sonoma Room, and Boardroom, with a combined banquet capacity of 260 persons.

As proposed, the project would reduce the hotel parking supply by a net 20 parking spaces. The likelihood for parking demand exceeding supply would primarily depend on the size and frequency of events at the conference room space, rather than full occupancy of the hotel. The Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Parking Generation, 3rd Edition notes that most hotels maintain an overall average occupancy ratio of 60 to 70 percent, with highest occupancy occurring on Saturdays (72 percent).⁵

We recommend the project applicant consider one of the following measures to mitigate the loss of these 20 spaces:

1. Reconfigure to the proposed project to provide the existing 294 hotel parking spaces.
2. Provide valet services to accommodate up to 294 parking spaces during events where the occupancy would be expected to exceed a certain number of attendees.
3. Establish a shared parking agreement with 1050 Northgate Drive to allow hotel parking in the adjacent parking lot on days where office parking demand is low, e.g., Saturdays and Sundays.

Parisi Review – Other Notes

The parking study states that the existing hotel's conference space would increase from 5,230 square feet to 5,791 square feet. A review of the hotel's floor plan indicates that the total meeting room square footage is already 6,605 square feet.⁶ It is unclear whether or how the meeting room square footage will change with the planned reconfiguration.

The parking study notes a net surplus of 20 spaces for the project site. However, the study does not state how these surplus spaces would be configured, i.e., whether they would be accessible exclusively by residential or hotel uses, or shared between uses. If the project applicant wishes to allow shared parking between residential units and the hotel, when needed, then these spaces should be clearly indicated as such, e.g., "condo guest and hotel parking allowed."

⁴ http://www.starwoodhotels.com/fourpoints/property/meetings/overview_map.html?propertyID=1260

⁵ Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE, 2004) Parking Generation, 3rd Edition, p. 70.

⁶ http://www.starwoodhotels.com/fourpoints/property/meetings/overview_map.html?propertyID=1260; total of Marin, Napa I&II, Napa III, Boardroom and Sonoma room square footage.