

Community Development Department - Planning Division

Meeting Date: September 7, 2022

Case Numbers: P18-009

Project Planner: Jeff Ballantine, Senior Planner

Monica Ly, Senior Planner

Agenda Item: 3

# REPORT TO DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

SUBJECT: Senate Bill (SB 35) Objective Design Standards – Review of draft "objective" planning

design standards and for a ministerial ("by-right") process required by Senate Bill 35 (SB 35).

APN: Citywide, File No: P18-009.

#### SUMMARY

In response to recent Senate Bill 35 (SB 35), local jurisdictions are required to have a ministerial, "byright" process for qualifying residential development projects of two or more dwelling units located near major transit stops. Qualifying projects must comply with "objective planning standards" established by the local jurisdiction, must provide specific levels of affordable housing, and must meet other specific requirements. "Objective planning standards" must be prescriptive, meaning they cannot be subjective or structured to exercise discretion. Developers pursuing a request for streamlined ministerial review are required to pay prevailing wage for construction. Draft standards have been prepared for review of and input by the DRB and Planning Commission and adoption by the Council.

## **BACKGROUND**

In 2017, Governor Brown signed <u>Senate Bill 35 (SB35)</u>, which established new housing development legislation under State Government Code Sections 65400, 65582.1 and 65913.4. SB 35 became effective on January 1, 2018. The new legislation created a mandated, ministerial ("by-right") process for <u>qualifying</u> residential development projects. One of the requirements to be eligible as a qualifying project is that developers pursuing a request for streamlined ministerial review are required to pay prevailing wage for construction and meet the following requirements: 1) include two or more dwelling units; 2) must be located near a major transit stop; 3) provide certain levels of affordable housing; and 4) meet other specific requirements (described below).

## SB 35 Criteria

More specifically, SB 35 identifies the following criteria whether a project qualifies for streamlined SB 35 review:

- The project proposes to develop at least two residential dwelling units;
- The project is proposed to be developed on a legal parcel with 75% of its perimeter contiguous parcels developed with urban uses and zoned for, or designated in the San Rafael General Plan to allow, residential or residential mixed-use;
- At least two-thirds (2/3rds) of the proposed development is designated for residential use;
- The project must provide an affordable housing component projects containing 10% or more of the total residential unit count affordable to households making below 50% - 80% (low income) of the area median income for Marin County. The required affordability housing can change annually, based on a City's housing production in the prior year, as documented in the Annual Housing Report required to be filed annually (each April);

- The project meets all applicable "objective planning standards" developed by the City;
- Meet the following minimum-required parking requirements:
  - One parking space per unit shall be required for qualifying projects that are <u>more than</u> ½-mile of public transit.
  - No off-street parking is required for qualifying projects that: 1) are within ½-mile of public transit; 2) are located within a historic district; 3) are in an area where on-street parking permits are required but are not offered to the occupants of the development; or 4) are within one block of where a car-share vehicle is available.
- The project applicant must certify that it will comply with the following wage requirements defined in Government Code Section 65913.4(a)(8):
  - o If the development is not in its entirety a public work project (as defined in Labor Code section 1720 et seq.), all construction workers employed in the development of the project must be paid at least prevailing wages, unless the project includes 10 or fewer units and does not require a subdivision. For projects that require a subdivision or that propose 75 or more units that are not 100 percent subsidized affordable housing, prevailing wages must be paid and a skilled and trained workforce, as defined in Government Code section 65913.4(a)(8)(B)(ii), must be used to complete the development.

### State Reporting Requirements

This legislation was coupled with Senate Bill 879 (SB 879), which set forth new annual reporting requirements on housing approvals and construction to the State Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). SB 879 establishes the amount of affordability required to qualify for SB 35 streamlined review. The required affordability can change annually, based on the prior years' housing production. The affordability to be included in a project to be eligible for SB 35 streamlined review is established, as follows:

- 10% for cities that do not submit their annual housing production report to the state or do not produce the required number of above moderate-income units (<120% county median income).
- 50% for cities that do not submit their annual housing production report to the state or do not produce the required number of low-income units (50%-80% of county median income),

For 2022, the threshold for projects to be eligible in San Rafael is 10%, based on San Rafael's housing production during 2021. This requirement can change annually.

#### Ministerial Review Process

Under SB 35, cities are required to review qualifying projects using a ministerial, "by-right", review process, which means that no discretionary approvals can be required, and the City is required to process applications within the time frames specified in Government Code Section 65913.4(c) (cited above). The review process would be also be streamlined because, as a ministerial project, the project would not be subject to environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). For San Rafael, that means that qualifying projects would not be required to apply for a Use Permit (when required by the Code) or Design Review Permit or go through DRB review or any public hearing or discretionary planning process as is typically required. Therefore, the ministerial, "by-right", process would be similar to the processing of a building permit, where staff would review the application to determine whether it qualifies and if so, confirm it meets the City's objective planning standards. There would be no public hearing, or public process for qualifying projects.

In November 2018, the City Council adopted enabling legislation through a Zoning Ordinance amendment establishing the required ministerial review process. Section <u>14.16.245</u> was adopted (Ordinance 1964) and states

14.16.245 - Ministerial "by-right" process for multi-family housing projects.

A residential housing development project that contains two (2) or more residential units located on one or more contiguous parcels may qualify for the state-mandated ministerial, "by-right" approval process. Pursuant to California Government Code Section 65913.4, the "by -right," ministerial process is applicable to qualifying residential development projects that are located near major transit. The availability of the "by-right" approval process is determined by the city's annual housing progress report to the state department of housing and community development. Qualifying residential projects must: a) comply with a list of objective planning standards; b) meet specific levels of affordable housing; and c) be subject to a commitment to specific hiring (skilled and trained workforce) and prevailing wage requirements. The applicability of and requirements for the "by-right" process shall be adopted by resolution of the city council.

# Objective Planning Standards

"Objective planning standards" must be prescriptive and quantifiable, meaning they cannot be subjective or structured to exercise discretion, require no personal or subjective judgment and must be verifiable by reference to an external and uniform source available prior to submittal. The City's Zoning Ordinance (Title 14 of the San Rafael Municipal Code) contains a variety of objective development standards. Minimum building setbacks, maximum building height, maximum lot coverage, and minimum off-street parking spaces are examples of existing objective standards within the City's Zoning Ordinance that are still applicable to SB 35 applications.

City policy documents such as the San Rafael Design Guidelines (2019) and the Design Guidelines Applicable to All Hillside Residential Development Projects (1991) contain numerous guidelines that are not considered objective and that would not be applicable to SB 35 applications. For instance, the following are examples of Design Guidelines that are not objective because they are not quantifiable, and they require subjective judgement as to whether a particular project complies with each guideline:

- Where there is an existing pattern, particular attention should be given to maintaining a consistent streetscape
- All building facades should be varied and articulated.
- Long monotonous walls should be avoided
- Adjacent buildings should be considered and transitional elements included to minimize apparent height differences

In addition, the review criteria in SRMC Section 14.25.050 for Environmental and Design Review Permits includes numerous criteria that are not considered objective. Some examples include:

- The project architecture should be harmoniously integrated in relation to the architecture in the vicinity in terms of colors and materials, scale and building design
- Design elements and approaches which are encouraged include:
  - Creation of interest in the building elevation;
  - Pedestrian-oriented design in appropriate locations

#### Downtown Precise Plan

The proposed Objective Design Standards would not apply to parcels located within the Downtown Precise Plan (DPP) since the DPP is a form-based development standards document adopted in

August 2021 that already includes sufficient objective design standards that regulate all parcels located within the DPP area.

# Previous Public Hearings

On July 16, 2019, draft objective design standards were brought to the Design Review Board for consideration. However, the Design Review Board primarily asked clarifying questions from City Staff and provided minimal comments on the proposed standards during this meeting. On August 13, 2019, draft objective design standards were then brought to the Planning Commission for consideration. Similarly, the Planning Commission primarily asked clarifying questions from City Staff and provided minimal comments on the proposed standards during this meeting.

#### SB 35 Applications Received

To date, the City has received three applications for ministerial, streamlined review under SB35. The following is a summary of these applications:

- 1010 Grand Avenue, 420 4<sup>th</sup> Street, and 450 4<sup>th</sup> Street: The project proposes to demolish all existing buildings on the site; to merge the three existing parcels into one parcel; and construct a new 6-story multifamily residential building with 35 residential units. SB 35 Letter of Intent submitted on 1/31/2022. Currently in tribal consultation process.
- **1515 4**<sup>th</sup> **Street:** The project proposes to demolish the existing building on the site; to merge the two existing parcels into one parcel; and construct a new 7-story multifamily residential building with 191 residential units and 4,000 square feet of commercial space. SB 35 Letter of Intent submitted on 6/9/2022. Currently in tribal consultation process.
- **703** 3<sup>rd</sup> **Street:** The project proposes a new eight story building with 119 residential units and 23,620 square feet of commercial ground floor space. SB 35 Letter of Intent submitted on 8/12/2022. Currently in tribal consultation process.

All three of these proposed projects are located within the Downtown Precise Plan area.

#### **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The next step to complete the required ministerial, "by-right" process and ensure that the City has some standards to address design in the "by-right" process is to develop the objective planning design standards. Therefore, staff has prepared the attached draft SB 35 of objective planning standards.

- <u>Exhibit 1</u> includes a Memorandum on Selected Topic Areas that provides analysis for proposed building mass and articulation standards, including example standards from other cities.
- Exhibit 2 includes draft objective design standards. Most of these standards are inherited and slightly modified from the standards originally brought to both the Design Review Board and Planning Commission in 2019. Please consider these as a very early draft of the standards.

## **ANALYSIS**

In developing the SB 35 "objective planning standards" staff used existing design criteria, fine tuning the criteria to be as objective and quantifiable. Sources used to develop these draft standards include: San Rafael General Plan 2020 (primarily the Neighborhood and Community Design Elements), San Rafael Zoning Ordinance. Downtown Vision, Good Design Principles for Downtown, and Residential Design Guidelines. Staff is referring this to the Board for their review and recommendation on these standards. The key is that any new standards must meet the objective planning standards definition..."Objective planning standards" must be prescriptive and quantifiable, meaning they cannot

be subjective or structured to exercise discretion, require no personal or subjective judgment and must be verifiable by reference to an external and uniform source available prior to submittal." Development standards are inherently objective and quantifiable. In an attempt to ensure some level of design standards for these ministerial projects, staff has incorporated many of the design principles that are found in the above sources and attempted to make them as objective and quantifiable as possible.

#### NEIGHBORHOOD CORRESPONDENCE

Notice of this meeting was mailed to everyone on the Planning Division's mailing list who has expressed interest in receiving updates on proposed policy documents and ordinance amendments.

At the time of publication, staff had not received any public comments. Any comments received after the reproduction of this staff report, will be forwarded to the Board under separate cover

#### RECOMMENDATION

Since this is a complex, multi-faceted, and massive undertaking to draft objective design standards, City staff recommend that the Design Review Board (DRB) primarily focus on providing input on the following:

- 1. The proposed building mass and articulation standards described in Exhibit 1.
- 2. The overall format and structure of the Draft Objective Design Standards in Exhibit 2
- 3. The preferred structure for how City staff share information with the DRB and how the DRB provides input on the Draft Objective Design Standards

In addition, the DRB is welcome to share initial input on the following items:

- 1. Are the proposed objective planning standards appropriate and objective. If not, please provide some recommendations on how to improve them;
- 2. Are there other objective planning or design standards that can be added to these tables to ensure high quality design; and
- 3. Provide any other feedback on the proposed process and objective design criteria

#### **EXHIBITS**

- 1. Memorandum on Selected Topic Areas
- 2. Draft Objective Design Standards



# DESIGN REVIEW BOARD MEMORANDUM

September 7, 2022 Agenda Item 3

TITLE: OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS

ATTACHMENT 1 - MEMORANDUM ON SELECTED TOPIC AREAS

## **TOPIC AREAS**

The following are key topic areas within the draft Objective Design Standards that City staff seek feedback from the Design Review Board.

#### **BUILDING MASS AND ARTICULATION**

# **Existing Non-Objective Criteria**

The review criteria in SRMC Section 14.25.050 for Environmental and Design Review Permits includes numerous criteria intended to influence the building façade design and articulation that are not considered objective and that would not be applicable to SB 35 applications. Some examples include:

- Design elements and approaches which are encouraged include:
  - o Creation of interest in the building elevation;
  - Pedestrian-oriented design in appropriate locations
  - Variation in building placement and height

## **Shortcomings of Existing Regulations**

The City does not have any existing regulations that address the potential for large blank walls on new multifamily residential buildings. Large blank walls create an unattractive and oppressive streetscape which detracts from the quality of life and architectural character of a neighborhood, especially for direct neighbors. Blank walls also disproportionately accentuate the size and mass of a structure and contribute little to a neighborhood's aesthetic character.

## **Regulations from Other Cities**

Municipalities prohibit blank walls on facades in many ways. Some rely on a design review board's subjective determination that a wall is articulated enough to not be a 'blank wall'. Form based codes either affirmatively require windows and articulations or define the maximum horizontal frontage that a blank wall can occupy. Another traditional standard requires a minimum amount of the façade to be composed of windows or other transparent materials. These requirements often differentiate between ground floor transparency requirements and upper floor transparency requirements. The tables below provide regulations from other cities pertaining to (1) a minimum number and/or depth of building projections or recesses; (2) a maximum length for blank walls; and (3) a minimum amount of transparency (e.g. windows).

# Minimum Façade Projections and/or Recesses

The following table summarizes regulations from other cities pertaining to minimum façade projections and/or recesses.

City	Standard	Source
City of EI Cerrito	All street-facing facades shall have at least one horizontal or vertical projection or recess at least four feet in depth, or two projections or recesses at least two and one-half feet in depth, for every 25 linear feet of wall. The articulated elements shall occupy at least 50 percent of the height of the structure, and may be grouped rather than evenly spaced in 25 foot modules.	ECMC Section 19.06.030.I (link)
City of San Jose	Articulate all building façades facing a street or public open space for at least 80 percent of each façade length. Articulate all other building façades for at least 60 percent of each façade length. Façade articulation can be achieved by providing material and plane changes or by providing a rhythmic pattern of bays, columns, balconies, and other architectural elements to break up the building mass. Building elements such as bays, windows, and balconies that project from façades must have at least two feet of plane change	San Jose Citywide Design Standards, pg. 42 ( <u>link</u> )
City of Santa Barbara	If the building façade on the front elevation is longer than 50 feet, incorporate an offset for each 50 feet of building wall length. The offset(s) shall be a minimum 18 inches deep and 20 feet long and extend the full height of the building	Objective Design Standards, Section II.A.2.A ( <u>link</u> )
City of Alameda	All building facades that face or will be visible from a public street shall be articulated by including features that meet at least two of the following standards:  (1) At least 25% of the area of the façade is offset (through recesses or projections) at a depth of at least two feet from the remainder of the façade.  (2) For every 50 horizontal feet of wall, facades include at least one projection or recess at least four feet in depth, or two projections or recesses at least two feet in depth. If located on a building with two or more stories, the articulated elements must be greater than one story in height.  (3) For every 50 feet of horizontal building wall, there is a vertical feature such as a pilaster at least 12 inches in both width and depth and extending the full height of the building  (4) – (8) Additional standards for recessed windows, variety in materials, and a horizontal design feature	Alameda Objective Design Review Standards, pgs. 4, 5 (link)
City of Santa Cruz	Building frontages that are longer than 30 feet wide and face onto a public frontage, or rear or side yard setback, shall be articulated in one of the following three ways (Note that articulation is not required for the sides or rears of buildings that are built to zero lot-line):  (1) Provide a horizontal change in plane for every 30 feet of frontage, rounded up to the nearest whole number (e.g., a frontage of 31 feet would be required to provide two changes in plane). The change in plane must be at least 4 feet deep and 6 feet wide, and	Santa Cruz Objective Development Standards Pgs. 13-15 (link)

City	Standard	Source
	must be open to the sky; or	
	(2) Provide a horizontal change in plane for every 30 feet of frontage, rounded up to the nearest whole number. The change in plane must be at least 2 feet deep and 6 feet wide, and be combined with a change in material; or	
	(3) Provide a horizontal change in plane at an interval of 50 feet or less. The change in plane must be at least 6 feet deep and 12 feet wide, and be combined with a change in material. When implemented as building notches, such notches may contain balconies, as long as the railing is at least 70 percent see-through or transparent.	

# Maximum Blank Wall Area

The following table summarizes regulations from other cities pertaining to maximum blank wall area.

City	Standard	Note
City of San Pablo	Blank walls are limited to 30% of linear frontage or 20', whichever is less	San Pablo Specific Plan Table 4-1 ( <u>link</u> )
Redwood City	No street frontage wall may run in a continuous plane for more than twenty (20) feet without an opening.	Redwood City Zoning Ordinance 55.8.D ( <u>link</u> )
Santa Rosa	Blank walls (facades without doors, windows, landscaping treatments) shall be less than 30 feet in length along sidewalks, pedestrian walks, or publicly accessible outdoor space areas.	Santa Rosa City Code 20-39.030 ( <u>link</u> )
City of Alameda	Ground-Floor Features. Any wall (including the wall of a parking structure) that faces a public street, public sidewalk, public pedestrian walkway, or publicly accessible outdoor space shall include at least one of the following features on the ground floor. No wall may run in a continuous plane of more than 15 feet on the ground floor without at least one of the following features.  (1) A transparent window or door that provides views into building interiors, or into window displays at least five feet deep  (2) Decorative features and artwork, including but not limited to decorative ironwork and grilles, decorative panels, mosaics, or relief sculptures  (3) A permanent vertical trellis with climbing plants or plant materials	Alameda Objective Design Review Standards, pg. 5 ( <u>link</u> )

# Minimum Transparency for Façade

The following table summarizes regulations from other cities pertaining to minimum transparency for building facades.

City	Standard	Note
City of Fairfield	50% ground floor, 30% upper floor	Table 25-H2 (link)
City of El Cerrito	30% ground floor, 25% upper floor	San Pablo Specific Plan pg. 02-41 ( <u>link</u> )
City of Alameda	At least 30 percent of the area of each street-facing facade must consist of windows or other transparent openings. This requirement applies to portions of buildings backed by residential uses.	Alameda Objective Design Review Standards, pg. 5 ( <u>link</u> )

# Proposed Standard for Building Mass and Articulation

The table below summarizes proposed standards for Design Review Board consideration, relating to building mass and articulation. The proposed standards set a conservative regulatory floor to ensure that no walls presented to the public or to residents are large, oppressive blank walls. The 15% transparency standard and maximum 30' of blank wall are the least restrictive standards used by neighboring jurisdictions.

(1) At least 25% of the area of each façade is offset (through recesses or projections) at a depth of at least two feet from the remainder of the façade.
(2) Blank walls (facades without doors, windows, landscaping treatments) shall be less than 30 feet in length along public streets, sidewalks, pedestrian walks, or publicly accessible outdoor space areas
(3) All building <u>walls</u> shall have a minimum 30% transparency on each floor.
(Note: Transparency is defined as any material or area of the façade where it is possible to see through to the next wall or at least 10 ft.).
How is transparency defined?
What level of transparency is an appropriate minimum for ground and upper floors?
Should ground floor commercial spaces have a greater transparency requirement?
Should the sides or rear of the building have a transparency requirement? Should side or rear walls have transparency requirements only if visible from the public right of way?

# San Rafael

OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS



**DRAFT**AUGUST 31, 2022



# **Table of Contents**

# Introduction

Background	1
Background and Purpose	2
Applicability	3
Values and Guiding Principles	4
Values and Guiding Principles	5
How to Use This Document	6
Document Structure	5
How to Use This Document	5
Site	
Site	
Site, Surrounding Context, and Internal Site Circulation	
Relationship to Transit	
Block Size	
Site Access Location	1
Pedestrian and Bicycle Access Location	5
Driveways and Vehicle Drop-offs	5
Services and Utilities Access and Location	5
Site Organization, Planning, and Design	1
Building Placement	5
Active Frontages	5
Paseo Placement and Design	5
Open Space Placement and Access	5
Bicycle Parking Placement	5
Vehicular Parking Placement and Surface Parking Design	5
Site Lighting	5
Landscaping and Stormwater Management	5
Building	
Massing	1
Massing Relationship to Context	5

Form, Proportion, and Scale	5
Historic Adjacency	5
Access and Entrance Design	1
Pedestrian and Bicycle Entrances Design	5
Vehicular Entrances and Driveways	5
Services and Utilities Entrances and Design	5
Building Elements	1
Façade Design and Articulation	5
Roofs and Parapets	5
Decks and Balconies	5
Awnings, Sunshades, and Screens	5
Parking Garage Design	5
Bird Safety	5
Materials and Colors	5
Architectural Lighting	5
Signage	5
Pedestrian Level	
Ground Floor Treatment and Uses	1
Commercial Frontages	5
Residential Frontages	5
Mitigating Blank Walls	5
Open Space Design	1
Privately-Owned (and Maintained) Public Open Space Design	5
Common and Private Open Space Design	5
Public Art	1
Public Art in Private Development	

# SITE ACCESS LOCATION

# **Driveway and Vehicle Drop-offs**

## **ANALYZE CONTEXT AND SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY**

Separate driveways from pedestrian rights-of-way and other multimodal transportation services.

# Rationale

Driveways create large gaps in the streetwall, increase safety risks for pedestrians and bicyclists, and negatively impact the continuity of walkways and active frontages. Sharing driveways, limiting the number of driveways for each development, and designing them thoughtfully can help mitigate some of these negative impacts.

# **Standards**

# S-1 Curb Cuts:

Driveway curb cuts and vehicular access from the street to off-street parking shall be the minimum required pursuant to the City's Engineer's driveway and parking standard. For sites less than 100 feet in width, no more than one driveway curb cut is permitted. For sites that are greater than 100 feet in width, two driveway curb cuts are permitted and must be at least 40 feet separated from inside edge to inside edge.

# SITE ACCESS LOCATION

# Services and Utilities Access and Location

## **ANALYZE CONTEXT AND IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN**

Locate services, utilities, and their access away from active frontages, pedestrian, bicycle, and transit areas.

## Rationale

Adequate service and utility facilities are critical to the functionality of buildings. However, these facilities interfere with the continuity of active frontages, façade transparency, and other community characteristics that support a positive public realm. Sensitive placement of service areas, utilities, and service entrances supports pleasant and safe public spaces and makes walking, bicycling, and riding public transit enjoyable.

# **Standards**

# S-1 Utility Location

Utilities installed specifically to service a new development should be located on private property and not in the public right of way.

# S-2 Utility Screening

Utility transformers or boxes shall be underground. An exception to this standard requires the applicant to provide documentation indicating the infeasibility of compliance and the transformer or box shall then be screened and not visible from a public right of way.

# S-2 Backflow preventers

Place back flow preventers inside a vault or out of sight, if a back flow preventer cannot be placed in a vault or out of sight, it must be screened with either architecture or landscaping.

# SITE ORGANIZATION, PLANNING, AND DESIGN

# **Building Placement**

ANALYZE CONTEXT, PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN, AND IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN

Activate the public realm by placing buildings near streets and public open spaces.

# Rationale

Places designed for people encourage interaction and connections between people and environment. Locating buildings with active frontages along streets and public spaces such as sidewalks, paseos, POPOS, and plazas helps frame the space and contributes energy, visual interest, and eyes-on-the-street.

# **Standards**

S-1 Building Orientation

Building entrances shall be designed to face a public street or alley When buildings are adjacent to a public street or alley, primary building entrances shall be designed to face the public street. SITE ORGANIZATION, PLANNING, AND DESIGN

# Landscaping and Stormwater Management

**DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY AND IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN** 

Create welcoming places and enhance the quality of the environment with sustainable landscaping areas.

# Rationale

Landscaping softens open spaces and buildings to create welcoming places and reinforces site organization and circulation paths. Green stormwater infrastructure and Low Impact Development (LID) techniques when used for landscaping can create unique features, manage stormwater, and enhance environmental quality and character of developments.

# **Standards**

S-1 Storm water pollution prevention standards

*Proposed:* Compliance with storm water pollution prevention standards (MCSTOPP). Storm water treatment facilities shall not be in areas that are counted toward meeting the minimum common outdoor area requirements.

## S-2 Street Trees

If there are no street trees on the frontage, street tree(s) are required to be installed and must be shown on the site plan. Street trees shall be installed at intervals of 30 feet on center, as sidewalk utilities and site access allows, in accordance with the City of San Rafael's Approved Street Tree List.

# **MASSING**

# **Massing Relationship to Context**

SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY, DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY, AND STRENGTHEN COMMUNITY CHARACTER

Design building massing to transition to the scale of the surroundings.

## Rationale

As the City of San Rafael continues to grow, the architecture of new buildings needs to respond to the surroundings and provide a transition between old and new places to support a cohesive neighborhood.

#### **Standards**

# S-1 Massing

No building shall be greater than 200 feet in length. Proposed buildings greater than 400 feet in length shall provide a midblock connection, courtyard, or public paseo.

A. The minimum width for a midblock connection or paseo shall be 20 feet and consist of a minimum of a walking path, landscaping, and lighting.

# S-2 Building Size

For every 100 feet of building length, there shall be a plane-break along the façade comprised of at least five feet in depth by 25 feet in length. The offset shall extend from grade to the highest story.

# S-3 Stepback Above 30 feet

For properties abutting residential district, buildings stories/floors above 30 feet shall be designed to step back 2 feet from the lower building wall/plane.

# S-4 Corner Buildings

For all corner buildings, the corner shall have a separate architectural treatment such as a projection or inset to define the building corner. The treatment shall be minimum of 10 feet of width along each street frontage.

# SITE ACCESS LOCATION

# **Pedestrian and Bicycle Access Location**

## STRENGTHEN COMMUNITY CHARACTER AND SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY

Maximize pedestrian access and shape project identity around entrances that accommodate both pedestrians and bicycles.

## Rationale

Pedestrian and bicycle entrances connect buildings to their surroundings and encourage street activity. They should be clearly identifiable and easily accessible. Orienting them towards streets helps create active sidewalks and promotes a safe public realm.

# **Standards**

S-1 Ramps (Newly Proposed Standard – Ready for Review)
Barrier free ramps shall be located on-site and not extended into public sidewalk or right-of-way.

# Façade Design and Articulation

ANALYZE CONTEXT, PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN, AND DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY Design buildings with attractive, timeless, and sophisticated contemporary architecture.

#### Rationale

The design and articulation of building façades adds to the visual richness of developments and creates patterns and scale within neighborhoods. Elements such as bay windows, balconies, changes in plane and height, and differentiation of materials and colors facilitate façade articulation and mitigate the monolithic appearance of large walls and roofs.

# **Standards**

# S-1 Window and Privacy

When a new residential development is abutting an existing residential building, windows in the new structure that are within 20 feet of facing residential bedroom windows or private open space shall have opaque but translucent glazing at or below 5 feet above finished floor.

# S-2 Architectural Detailing

All facades shall meet all objective design standards to ensure the same level of care and integrity throughout the building design. Façade sidewalls located along a zero-lot line, where at time of approval, are visible from a right-of-way, shall continue the color, material, and pattern of the main façade.

## S-3 Facades

For every 50 feet of building length, there shall be a plane-break along the facade no less than 10 feet in length.

# S-4 Minimum Articulation

All street-facing facades shall have at least one horizontal or vertical projection or recess at least three feet in depth, or two projections or recesses at least two feet in depth, for every 50 linear feet of wall. The articulated elements shall occupy at least 50 percent of the height of the structure, and may be grouped rather than evenly spaced in 50 foot modules. Exceptions to this rule may be granted by either the Planning Commission via a use permit or through the review of the Design Review Board.

# S-5 Clearance with Architectural Details

Buildings shall not have architectural features that project more than 4 feet into the public right of way and adequate vertical clearance of 15 feet above sideway shall be maintained.

# **Roofs and Parapets**

ANALYZE CONTEXT, PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN, AND DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY

Design roofs to be compatible with surroundings and add character to buildings.

## Rationale

Roof forms and materials greatly impact the appearance and character of buildings and cityscapes. Articulated roof forms create an interesting skyline and can emphasize certain elements of the building massing using combination of different roof forms including but not limited to flat, gables, pitched roofs, and other design strategies such as variations in roof and parapet heights. Flat roofs allow for a contemporary design and provide space for multipurpose facilities including community spaces, low maintenance green roofs, green stormwater infrastructure, renewable energy generation, and mechanical equipment required for the building.

## **Standards**

# S-1 Screen Rooftop Equipment

Roof-mounted mechanical equipment shall be screened from public view by a parapet wall, decorative equipment screen, or other architectural treatment. The point of view for determining visibility shall be five feet above grade at a distance of 200 feet.

# S-2 Eaves

*Proposed:* Horizontal eaves longer than 40 ft shall be broken-up by roof form articulations with at least a five ft variation.

# **Parking Garage Design**

ANALYZE CONTEXT, PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN, DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY, IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN, AND SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY

Design parking structures to enhance both the streetscape and adjoining properties.

# Rationale

Lining parking structures with active frontages and occupied spaces brings activity and life back to streets. Placing parking garages towards the rear of developments helps to avoid disruptions to the public realm.

# **Standards**

S-1 Parking Garage

Parking garage and other service, utility, and loading entries shall be accessed from side streets or rear alleys. Parking should be located on rear portion of lot. If not possible, parking must be setback by 10 feet from the property line and can only occupy 20% of linear street frontage.

# **Bird Safety**

# **PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN**

Conscious building design prevents negative impacts on wildlife.

## Rationale

It is vital to ensure that building design, façade materials, and artificial night lighting do not confound birds and lead to their injury or death.

## **Standards**

S-1 Bird Safety Treatment on Parallel Panes

Use a bird safety treatment on parallel panes of glass 30 feet or less apart, such as skyways, walkways, and other glass building connectors (see Fig 3.46).

S-2 Bird Safety Treatment on Transparent Atria
Use a bird safety treatment on transparent atria, free-standing glass
features, and glass architectural elements that protrude from the primary building
mass.

S-3 Bird Safety Treatment on Facades with more than 20% glazing For façades with more than 20 percent glazing within 60 feet of grade and located within 300 feet from a body of water, including creeks and vegetated flood control channels; or within 100 feet of a landscaped area, open space, or park larger than one acre in size, apply a bird safety treatment to at least 90 percent of the glazed areas within 60 feet of grade.

S-4 Non-reflective Glazing

Do not use mirrored glass or glazing with a reflective index above 20 percent.

# **Materials and Colors**

ANALYZE CONTEXT, PROVIDE QUALITY DESIGN, AND DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY

The quality of the materials and color palette helps define a building's character.

## Rationale

Quality materials on building façades convey longevity and sustainability. Unique materials inspired by the context create a sense of place and activity. The composition of materials and colors grounds a building in its surroundings.

#### **Standards**

- S-1 Ground floor elevation fronting primary streets must have high quality materials and texture for at least 50 percent of the non-glass areas. High quality materials include (but are not limited to) stone, marble, granite, brick, tile, wood, terracotta, and steel.
- S-2 Materials transitions along any façade must occur on the inside corner of plane change. When material changes need to happen in the same plane, use trims, cornices, or other architectural elements to create a corner for material transition
- S-3 For buildings taller than four stories, limit the use of stucco to a maximum of 60 percent of any façade that faces a street, open space, or paseo in General Plan growth areas.
- S-4 For buildings taller than four stories, not provide unbroken multi-story sections of the same material, texture, or color for more than 150 feet of façade length and more than two-thirds of the number of floors in height.

# S-5 Façade Colors

Facades shall include between 2 and 4 colors. One color shall be the 'main color' and be used on no less than 50% of the non-glazed area of a building's façade. The other colors shall be defined each as an 'accent color' each of which shall not be used on more than 20% of the non-glazed area of a building's façade.

S-6 Colors on all Elevations

Buildings shall include the same colors and materials on all elevations. At least one accent color is required to appear on all elevations.

## S-7 Gloss finishes

"Gloss" paint finishes shall not be used for a building's main color but may be used for accent colors and on trim. The highest sheen that may be used for a main color is semi-gloss.

# S-8 Main Building Color

The main color shall have a light reflective value of between 20% and 80%. Trim and accent colors may use colors of any light reflective value.

# S-9 Prohibited colors.

Proposed: Fluorescent, iridescent, or metallic paints are prohibited.

# S-10 Metal roof finishes.

Metal seam or other metal roofing, if used, shall be anodized, fluorocoated, or painted with a non-gloss finish. Copper and lead roofs shall be natural or oxidized.

# S-11 Stucco Colors.

Any colors used on stucco walls shall be incorporated into the stucco.

# **GROUND FLOOR TREATMENT AND USES**

# **Commercial Frontages**

IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN, DESIGN EQUITABLE PLACES, SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY, AND STRENGTHEN COMMUNITY CHARACTER

Support interesting and safe public spaces with active commercial frontages.

## Rationale

Ground floors with active frontages create engaging streets that are comfortable to use and visually appealing for pedestrians.

# **Standards**

S-1 Street Frontage

*Proposed:* Ground floor/street level architectural features, such as retail storefronts and entrances, shall be designed to be pedestrian in scale, with a maximum of one-floor in height.

# **OPEN SPACE DESIGN**

# COMMON AND PRIVATE OPEN SPACE DESIGN

IMPLEMENT ACTIVE DESIGN, DESIGN EQUITABLE PLACES, SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY, AND DESIGN FOR SUSTAINABILITY

Provide active and passive open spaces and common areas for building residents and other users.

## Rationale

Common open spaces create opportunities for shared gatherings and recreational activities between building occupants. They provide access to the outdoors for all tenants and visitors, which is important in dense developments.

Private open spaces for individual tenants consist of decks, balconies, porches, and patios. They provide space for residents to enjoy the outdoors in solitude and may overlook the public realm.

#### **Standards**

S-1 Useable Outdoor Space

Multifamily residential buildings not located in a duplex or multifamily residential zoning district are required to provide a minimum of 100 sq. ft. of common and/or private useable outdoor area per dwelling unit.