# DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIVISION OF HOUSING POLICY DEVELOPMENT

2020 W. El Camino Avenue, Suite 500 Sacramento, CA 95833 (916) 263-2911 / FAX (916) 263-7453 www.hcd.ca.gov



March 20, 2023

Alicia Giudice, Director Community Development Division City of San Rafael 1400 Fifth Avenue, Top Floor San Rafael, CA 94901

Dear Alicia Guidice:

### RE: City of San Rafael's 6<sup>th</sup> Cycle (2023-2031) Draft Housing Element (Update)

Thank you for submitting the City of San Rafael's (City) draft housing element update received for review on December 20, 2022. Pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (b), the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) is reporting the results of its review. Our review was facilitated by telephone conversations on February 15, 2023 and March 9, 2023 with you, Alexis Captanian, Liz Darby, and Barry Miller. In addition, HCD considered comments from Canal Alliance, Community Action Marin, Legal Aid of Marin, TransForm, YIMBY Law/Greenbelt Alliance, Kevin Bruke, David Kellogg, and Jenny Silva pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (c).

The draft housing element addresses many statutory requirements; however, revisions will be necessary to comply with State Housing Element Law (Article 10.6 of the Gov. Code). The enclosed Appendix describes the revisions needed to comply with State Housing Element Law.

For your information, pursuant to Assembly Bill 1398 (Chapter 358, Statutes of 2021), if a local government fails to adopt a compliant housing element within 120 days of the statutory deadline (January 31, 2023), then any rezoning to accommodate the regional housing needs allocation (RHNA), including for lower-income households, shall be completed no later than one year from the statutory deadline. Otherwise, the local government's housing element will no longer comply with State Housing Element Law, and HCD may revoke its finding of substantial compliance pursuant to Government Code section 65585, subdivision (i). Please be aware, if the City fails to adopt a compliant housing element within one year from the statutory deadline, the element cannot be found in substantial compliance until rezones to accommodate a shortfall of sites pursuant to Government Code section 65583, subdivision (c), paragraph (1),

subparagraph (A) and Government Code section 65583.2, subdivision (c) are completed.

Public participation in the development, adoption and implementation of the housing element is essential to effective housing planning. Throughout the housing element process, the City must continue to engage the community, including organizations that represent lower-income and special needs households, by making information regularly available while considering and incorporating comments where appropriate. Please be aware, any revisions to the element must be posted on the local government's website and to email a link to all individuals and organizations that have previously requested notices relating to the local government's housing element at least seven days before submitting to HCD.

Several federal, state, and regional funding programs consider housing element compliance as an eligibility or ranking criteria. For example, the CalTrans Senate Bill (SB) 1 Sustainable Communities grant; the Strategic Growth Council and HCD's Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities programs; and HCD's Permanent Local Housing Allocation consider housing element compliance and/or annual reporting requirements pursuant to Government Code section 65400. With a compliant housing element, the City meets housing element requirements for these and other funding sources.

For your information, some general plan element updates are triggered by housing element adoption. HCD reminds the City to consider timing provisions and welcomes the opportunity to provide assistance. For information, please see the Technical Advisories issued by the Governor's Office of Planning and Research at: <a href="https://www.opr.ca.gov/planning/general-plan/guidelines.html">https://www.opr.ca.gov/planning/general-plan/guidelines.html</a>.

HCD appreciates the diligent efforts and outstanding dedication your team provided in the preparation of the City's housing element. We are committed to assisting the City in addressing all statutory requirements of State Housing Element Law. If you have any questions or need additional technical assistance, please contact Chelsea Lee, of our staff, at Chelsea.Lee@hcd.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Melinda Coy

Meh 5

Proactive Housing Accountability Chief

**Enclosure** 

# APPENDIX CITY OF SAN RAFAEL

The following changes are necessary to bring the City's housing element into compliance with Article 10.6 of the Government Code. Accompanying each recommended change, we cite the supporting section of the Government Code.

Housing element technical assistance information is available on HCD's website at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/hcd-memos">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/hcd-memos</a>. Among other resources, the housing element section contains HCD's latest technical assistance tool, *Building Blocks for Effective Housing Elements (Building Blocks)*, available at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements/building-blocks">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements/building-blocks</a> and includes the Government Code addressing State Housing Element Law and other resources.

## A. Review and Revision

Review the previous element to evaluate the appropriateness, effectiveness, and progress in implementation, and reflect the results of this review in the revised element. (Gov. Code, § 65588 (a) and (b).)

As part of the evaluation of programs in the past cycle (Chapter 2), the element must provide an explanation of the effectiveness of goals, policies, and related actions in meeting the housing needs of special needs populations (e.g., elderly, persons with disabilities, large households, female-headed households, farmworkers and persons experiencing homelessness).

#### B. Housing Needs, Resources, and Constraints

1. Affirmatively further[ing] fair housing in accordance with Chapter 15 (commencing with Section 8899.50) of Division 1 of Title 2...shall include an assessment of fair housing in the jurisdiction. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(10)(A).)

<u>Enforcement & Outreach</u>: While the element discusses outreach capacity for fair housing issues and includes an analysis of fair housing complaints, it must also describe the City's compliance with existing fair housing laws and regulations. For additional information, please see pages 28-30 on HCD's Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing (AFFH) Guidance Memo at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/affh/docs/AFFH">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/affh/docs/AFFH</a> Document Final 4-27-2021.pdf.

2. Include an analysis of population and employment trends and documentation of projections and a quantification of the locality's existing and projected needs for all income levels, including extremely low-income households. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(1).)

<u>Extremely Low-Income (ELI) Households</u>: While the element included the total number of existing ELI households, it must also quantify the number of existing ELI households by tenure (i.e., renter and owner).

3. Include an analysis and documentation of household characteristics, including level of payment compared to ability to pay, housing characteristics, including overcrowding, and housing stock condition. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(2).)

<u>Overpayment</u>: While the element included the total number of low-income households overpaying for housing, it must also quantify the number of low-income households that are cost burdened by tenure (i.e., renter and owner).

<u>Housing Conditions</u>: While the element identifies the age of the housing stock and includes some information on housing stock conditions from American Community Survey (ACS) data (pp. 3-53), it must also estimate the number of units in need of replacement and rehabilitation. For example, the analysis could include estimates from a recent windshield survey or sampling, estimates from the code enforcement agency, or information from knowledgeable builders/developers, including nonprofit housing developers or organizations.

4. An inventory of land suitable and available for residential development, including vacant sites and sites having realistic and demonstrated potential for redevelopment during the planning period to meet the locality's housing need for a designated income level, and an analysis of the relationship of zoning and public facilities and services to these sites. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(3).)

The City has a regional housing needs allocation (RHNA) of 3,220 housing units, of which 1,349 are for lower-income households, 521 are for moderate-income households, and 1,350 are for above-moderate income households. To address this need, the element relies on pipeline projects, vacant and underutilized residential sites, mixed-use sites, and Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs). To demonstrate the adequacy of these sites and strategies to accommodate the City's RHNA, the element must include complete analyses:

Progress in Meeting the RHNA: The element relies on a significant number of pipeline projects to meet its RHNA. Specifically, the element identifies 1,989 units that are either pending, approved, or under construction. The element must demonstrate these units are expected to be constructed during the planning period. To demonstrate the availability of units within the planning period, the element could analyze infrastructure schedules, the City's past completion rates on pipeline projects, outreach with project developers, and should describe any expiration dates on entitlements, anticipated timelines for final approvals, and any remaining steps for projects to receive final entitlements. In addition, given the City's reliance on pipeline projects, the element must include programs with actions that commit to facilitating development and monitoring approvals of the projects (e.g., coordination with applications to approve remaining entitlements, supporting funding applications, expediting approvals, rezoning or identification of additional sites should the applications not be approved).

Adequate Site Alternative: Table 4.2 indicates the City is crediting 44 units affordable to extremely low-income households towards its RHNA as part of a Homekey Project. To credit these units toward the City's housing need, the element must demonstrate compliance with all the statutory requirements (Gov. Code, § 65583.1, subd. (c)(2)(D)). For example, the element must demonstrate that the affordability for the units determined will be maintained for at least 55 years, units be made available for people experiencing homelessness as defined in Section 578.3 of Title 24 of the Code of Federal Regulations and will be affordable to very-low and low-income households at the time the units were identified for preservation, among other things. For additional information and an Alternative Sites Checklist, see the *Building Blocks* at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/site-inventory-analysis/adequate-sites-alternatives/docs/adequate site alt checklist.pdf">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/building-blocks/site-inventory-analysis/adequate-sites-alternatives/docs/adequate site alt checklist.pdf</a>.

Realistic Capacity: While the element provides analysis and assumptions of realistic buildout for sites included in the inventory (pp. 4-14-23), additional information is required to fully address this requirement. Specifically, the element appears to assume residential development on sites with zoning that allow 100 percent nonresidential uses. The element identifies mixed-use sites located within and outside of Downtown San Rafael and notes that these sites represent a substantial opportunity for housing, but it must still account for the likelihood of nonresidential uses. The element should include analysis based on factors such as development trends, performance standards or other relevant factors. For example, the element could analyze all development activity in these nonresidential zones, how often residential development occurs and adjust residential capacity calculations, policies, and programs accordingly.

Small and Large Sites: Sites larger than ten acres in size or smaller than a half-acre in size are deemed inadequate to accommodate housing for lower-income households unless it is demonstrated, with sufficient evidence, that sites are suitable to accommodate housing for lower-income households. While the element included a few examples about developments on small and large sites (pp. 4-3, 4-15, 4-21), it must also provide specific examples with the densities, affordability, and if applicable, circumstances leading to lot consolidation or subdivision. The element should relate these examples to the sites identified to accommodate the RHNA for lower-income households to demonstrate that these sites can adequately accommodate the City's lower-income housing need. Based on a complete analysis, the City should consider adding or revising Program 38 to include incentives for facilitating development on small and large sites.

<u>Suitability of Nonvacant Sites</u>: While the element includes an analysis demonstrating the potential for redevelopment of nonvacant sites, including information such as age of structures, low improvement to land value ratios, and expressed developer interest, additional information is required to address this finding. The element should analyze the extent that existing uses may impede additional residential development. For example, the element includes sites with existing anchor supermarkets, religious institutions, and fast-food chain restaurants (Appendix B). To better correlate the potential for converting existing uses to higher density residential development, the element should relate past development trends described on pages 4-16 and 4-19 to the sites identified in the

inventory and add or modify programs as necessary to encourage and facilitate residential development on these sites. This is particularly significant considering that several of these sites were included in prior planning cycles.

In addition, as noted in the element, the City relies upon nonvacant sites to accommodate more than 50 percent of the RHNA for lower-income households. For your information, the element must demonstrate existing uses are not an impediment to additional residential development and will likely discontinue in the planning period (Gov. Code, § 65583.2, subd. (g)(2).). Absent findings (e.g., adoption resolution) based on substantial evidence, the existing uses will be presumed to impede additional residential development and will not be utilized toward demonstrating adequate sites to accommodate the RHNA.

Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs): The element projects 200 ADUs to be constructed over the planning period, averaging 25 units per year. This projection was based on annual permit data from 2018-2021 (pp. 4-13). However, Annual Progress Reports submitted by the City indicated building permit figures of 24, 13, 36, and 18 for 2018, 2019, 2020, and 2021, respectively. The element should reconcile these figures and adjust assumptions as appropriate. In addition, a cursory review of the City's ordinance by HCD discovered areas which appear to be inconsistent with State ADU Law. As a result, the element should add or modify a program to update the City's ADU ordinance in order to comply with state law. For more information, please consult HCD's ADU Guidebook, updated in July 2022, which provides detailed information on new state requirements surrounding ADU development.

<u>Availability of Infrastructure</u>: The element includes some discussion on water and sewer providers in the City but describes some infrastructure limitations including drought and the need for capital improvement projects (pp. 4-36). The element must clarify whether there is sufficient total water and sewer capacity (existing and planned) to accommodate the regional housing need and include programs if necessary.

Electronic Sites Inventory: Pursuant to Government Code section 65583.3, subdivision (b), the City must utilize standards, forms, and definitions adopted by HCD when preparing the sites inventory. Please see HCD's housing element webpage at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements</a> for a copy of the form and instructions. The City can reach out to HCD at <a href="mailto:sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov">sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov</a> for technical assistance. Please note, upon adoption of the housing element, the City must submit an electronic version of the sites inventory with its adopted housing element to <a href="mailto:sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov">sitesinventory@hcd.ca.gov</a>.

#### Zoning for a Variety of Housing Types:

Emergency Shelters: While the element acknowledged that emergency shelter parking
requirements should be updated pursuant to AB 139 (Chapter 335, Statutes of 2019),
no corresponding action in Program 4 was found. The element should be revised to
demonstrate consistency with AB 139, which requires only sufficient parking to
accommodate all staff working in the emergency shelter, provided that the standards
do not require more parking for emergency shelters than other residential or
commercial uses within the same zone. In addition, while the element included some

discussion on development standards for emergency shelters in the area south of Bellam/east of I-580, it must also include analysis on proximity to transportation and services for these sites, hazardous conditions, and any conditions inappropriate for human habitability.

For your information, Chapter 654, Statutes of 2022 (AB 2339), adds additional specificity on how cities and counties plan for emergency shelters and ensure sufficient and suitable capacity. Future submittals of the housing element may need to address these statutory requirements. For additional information and timing requirements, please see HCD's memo at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/sites/default/files/docs/planning-and-community/ab2339-notice.pdf">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/sites/default/files/docs/planning-and-community/ab2339-notice.pdf</a>.

- Supportive and Transitional Housing: The element states that supportive and transitional housing are treated as residential uses subject only to those restrictions that apply to other residential uses of the same type in the same zone (pp. 5-25). Additionally, the element included Table 5.7, listing allowable uses per zoning district. However, this table did not reflect whether transitional and supportive housing are allowed in zones that allow for residential uses (e.g., downtown commercial, community commercial, etc.,). The element should reconcile this information and specifically clarify whether the City permits these types of housing as a residential use and only subject to those restrictions that apply to other residential dwellings of the same type in the same zone pursuant to Government Code section 65583 (a)(5). Finally, supportive housing shall be a use by-right in zones where multifamily and mixed uses are permitted, including nonresidential zones permitting multifamily uses pursuant to Government Code section 65651. The element must demonstrate compliance with these requirements and include programs as appropriate.
- Housing for Agricultural Employees: The element must demonstrate zoning is consistent with the Employee Housing Act (Health and Safety Code, § 17000 et seq.), specifically, sections 17021.5 and 17021.6. Section 17021.5 requires employee housing for six or fewer employees to be treated as a single-family structure and permitted in the same manner as other dwellings of the same type in the same zone. To address this, the element references an action to be included in its programs (pg. 5-29) but no such program was found. In addition, 17021.6 requires employee housing consisting of no more than 12 units or 36 beds to be permitted in the same manner as other agricultural uses in the same zone. For additional information and sample analysis, see the Building Blocks at <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements/building-blocks/farmworkers">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/planning-and-community-development/housing-elements/building-blocks/farmworkers</a>.
- 5. An analysis of potential and actual governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including the types of housing identified in paragraph (1) of subdivision (c), and for persons with disabilities as identified in the analysis pursuant to paragraph (7), including land use controls, building codes and their enforcement, site improvements, fees and other exactions required of developers, and local processing and permit procedures... (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(5).)

<u>Land-Use Controls</u>: While the element included discussion of development standards in many residential districts, including the Downtown Precise Plan districts, it must also provide analysis on development standards for the Downtown Station Area Plans. In addition, the element identifies open space and minimum lot coverage requirements for multi-family development in the HR-1 zones as constraints and identifies programs to address these constraints (pp. 5-10; 5-14). However, no corresponding actions were found in Program 42 (Zoning Text and Map Revisions). Accordingly, Program 42 should be modified to address these constraints.

Processing and Permit Procedures: The element identified the Planned Development (PD) process for parcels greater than five acres as a constraint on housing and indicates that the City's General Plan contains an action to make the PD process optional for parcels greater than five acres (pp. 5-7). Accordingly, Program 41 (Streamlining of Development Approval) should also be modified to address this constraint. In addition, the element should address public comments on this revised draft submittal and discuss compliance with the Permit Streamlining Act and intersections with CEQA and timing requirements, including streamlining determinations and add or modify programs as appropriate.

Zoning, Development Standards, and Fees: The element must clarify compliance with new transparency requirements for posting all zoning, development standards, and fees on the City's website and add a program to address these requirements, if necessary.

<u>On-/Off-Site Improvements</u>: While the element includes a general discussion of on-/off-site improvements (pp. 5-43), it must specifically identify subdivision level improvement requirements, such as minimum street widths (e.g., 40-foot minimum street width), and analyze their impact as potential constraints on housing supply and affordability.

#### Constraints on Housing for Persons with Disabilities:

- Family Definition: Zoning should implement a barrier-free definition of family. The element must identify and analyze the City's definition of family as a potential constraint on housing for persons with disabilities and include programs as appropriate.
- Group Homes: The City's Zoning Code appears to isolate and regulate group homes based on the type of population served (Table 5.7). Notably, the element notes that group homes are permitted by-right if serving the "handicapped" and subject to a conditional use permit (CUP) otherwise. Zoning and standards should simply implement a barrier-free definition of family instead of subjecting, potentially persons with disabilities, to special regulations. Zoning code regulations that isolate and regulate various types of housing for persons with disabilities based on the number of people and other factors may pose a constraint on housing choice for persons with disabilities. The element should include specific analysis of these and any other constraints for impacts on housing for persons with disabilities and add or modify programs as appropriate. For more information, please consult HCD's Group Home Technical Advisory Memo <a href="https://www.hcd.ca.gov/sites/default/files/docs/planning-and-community/group-home-technical-advisory-2022.pdf">https://www.hcd.ca.gov/sites/default/files/docs/planning-and-community/group-home-technical-advisory-2022.pdf</a>.

- Reasonable Accommodation: While the element includes discussion of reasonable accommodation procedures for persons with disabilities (pp. 5-30), additional information is required to address this finding. Specifically, the element must also analyze fees and processing times for requests received.
- 6. An analysis of potential and actual nongovernmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including.....the requests to develop housing at densities below those anticipated in the analysis required by subdivision (c) of Government Code section 65583.2, and the length of time between receiving approval for a housing development and submittal of an application for building permits for that housing development that hinder the construction of a locality's share of the regional housing need in accordance with Government Code section 65584... (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(6).)

<u>Permit Approval Times</u>: While the element includes a general description of delays between approval and building permits (pgs. 5-48-49), it must still identify the length of time between receiving approval for a housing development and submittal of an application for building permits. The element must address any hinderance on the development of housing and include programs as appropriate.

7. Analyze existing assisted housing developments that are eligible to change to non-low-income housing uses during the next 10 years due to termination of subsidy contracts, mortgage prepayment, or expiration of use restrictions. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (a)(9) through 65583(a)(9)(D).).

The element indicates that the Rafael Town Center (38 assisted units) is at-risk of conversion in the planning period. Therefore, the element must include additional analysis that provides estimates of replacement and preservation costs for at-risk housing. In addition, the element includes Table 3.32 which lists known affordable housing developments. For your information, HCD's records indicate the following projects are also within the City's affordable housing portfolio. The element should verify affordability information for the following projects: Vivalon Healthy Aging Campus (66 assisted units located on 999 3<sup>rd</sup> Street), Belle Avenue (9 assisted units located on 519 Belle Avenue), 3301 Kerner (44 assisted units located on 3301 Kerner Boulevard), and Marin Housing for the Handicapped (12 assisted units located on 626 Del Ganado Road).

# C. <u>Housing Programs</u>

1. Include a program which sets forth a schedule of actions during the planning period, each with a timeline for implementation, which may recognize that certain programs are ongoing, such that there will be beneficial impacts of the programs within the planning period, that the local government is undertaking or intends to undertake to implement the policies and achieve the goals and objectives of the Housing Element... (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c).)

To have a beneficial impact in the planning period and address the goals of the housing element, programs must be revised with discrete timelines and programs should be evaluated to ensure meaningful and specific actions and objectives. As an example, several programs contain timelines for implementation that have since past or are underway and should be updated to reflect current conditions and circumstances. These programs include, but are not limited to, 1 (Housing and Homelessness Division), 2 (Extremely Low-Income Housing Resources), and 8 (Latinx Community Capacity Building and Engagement). Additionally, all programs should be evaluated to ensure meaningful and specific actions and objectives. Programs containing unclear language (e.g., "evaluate"; "consider"; "encourage"; etc.) or vague commitments should be amended to include more specific and measurable actions. These programs include, but are not limited to, 26 (Accessory Dwelling Units), 32 (Housing Resources for Older Adults), 41 (Streamlining of Development Approval), 43 (Revisions to Parking Standards).

2. Identify actions that will be taken to make sites available during the planning period with appropriate zoning and development standards and with services and facilities to accommodate that portion of the city's or county's share of the regional housing need for each income level that could not be accommodated on sites identified in the inventory completed pursuant to paragraph (3) of subdivision (a) without rezoning, and to comply with the requirements of Government Code section 65584.09. Sites shall be identified as needed to facilitate and encourage the development of a variety of types of housing for all income levels, including multifamily rental housing, factory-built housing, mobilehomes, housing for agricultural employees, supportive housing, single-room occupancy units, emergency shelters, and transitional housing. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(1).)

As noted in Finding B4, the element does not include a complete site analysis, therefore, the adequacy of sites and zoning were not established. Based on the results of a complete sites inventory and analysis, the City may need to add or revise programs to address a shortfall of sites or zoning available to encourage a variety of housing types. In addition, the element should be revised as follows:

<u>Publicly-Owned Sites</u>: The element identifies City-owned sites to accommodate a portion of the RHNA. The element must include a program that ensures compliance with the Surplus Lands. The program should include numerical objectives, and provide incentives and actions, along with a schedule, to facilitate development of City-owned sites. Actions could include outreach with developers, issuing requests for proposals, incentives, fee waivers, priority processing, and financial assistance.

<u>Single-Room Occupancy</u>: The element notes that SROs are not explicitly defined in the City's Zoning Code and notes that a corresponding action should be considered (pp. 5-25-26). As such, the element must include a program to establish appropriate to establish appropriate zoning.

3. Address and, where appropriate and legally possible, remove governmental and nongovernmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing, including housing for all income levels and housing for persons with disabilities. The program shall remove constraints to, and provide reasonable accommodations for

housing designed for, intended for occupancy by, or with supportive services for, persons with disabilities. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(3).)

As noted in Findings B5 and B6, the element requires a complete analysis of potential governmental constraints. Depending upon the results of that analysis, the City may need to revise or add programs and address and remove or mitigate any identified constraints.

4. Promote and affirmatively further fair housing opportunities and promote housing throughout the community or communities for all persons regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, national origin, color, familial status, or disability, and other characteristics protected by the California Fair Employment and Housing Act (Part 2.8 (commencing with Section 12900) of Division 3 of Title 2), Section 65008, and any other state and federal fair housing and planning law. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(5).)

As noted in Finding B1, the element must include a complete analysis of AFFH. Based on the outcome of that analysis, the element must add or modify programs.

Goals, Policies, and Metrics: While the element included significant and meaningful programs to address issues identified in its AFFH analysis, HCD received public comment that identified homelessness as an ongoing concern in the City. Given the City's significant homeless population, the element should include reference to programs that the City is undertaking to address homelessness in Table 6-2 and modify these programs to geographically target actions in areas with high concentration of persons experiencing homelessness as part of the City's place based AFFH strategies. Additionally, HCD also received public comment regarding the need to strengthen Program 11 (Tenant Protection Measures). The element should commit to implementing some or all of these strategies, depending on the outcomes of the City's feasibility evaluation and identify potential funding sources and timelines to secure funding to support some or all of the actions identified by stakeholders in Program 11.

5. The housing program shall preserve for low-income household the assisted housing developments identified pursuant to paragraph (9) of subdivision (a). The program for preservation of the assisted housing developments shall utilize, to the extent necessary, all available federal, state, and local financing and subsidy programs identified in paragraph (9) of subdivision (a), except where a community has other urgent needs for which alternative funding sources are not available. The program may include strategies that involve local regulation and technical assistance. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (c)(6).)

The element includes Program 30 (Preservation of At-Risk Housing) and specifies actions to monitor at-risk units, including contacting property owners within two years of the affordability expiration dates on projects. However, the program should be modified to include noticing requirements within 3 years and 6 months of the affordability expiration dates, in addition to coordinating with qualified entities such as nonprofit organizations and establish time parameters around such actions.

### D. Quantified Objectives

Establish the number of housing units, by income level, that can be constructed, rehabilitated, and conserved over a five-year time frame. (Gov. Code, § 65583, subd. (b)(1 & 2).)

The element provides a summary of quantified objectives (pp. 6-54). For your consideration, conservation and rehabilitation objectives could be increased by incorporating anticipated outcomes from the following programs: 12 (Periodic Housing Inspection), 15 (Increasing Equity in Home Maintenance), and 29 (Conversion of Residential and Nonresidential).