

Project Narrative:

Restoration and Additions to the Castagnasso Horse Farm, 196 East Spain St

Context:

The farm complex as we see it now was built in 1919 and included pastures for up to 10 draft horses. In 1992 the farm was included as a contributing element in the Sonoma Plaza National Register Historic District.

The City of Sonoma zoned these parcels Medium Density Residential, resulting in a land value far exceeding the value of the existing agricultural use. This act alone doomed this bucolic cultural resource. The farm buildings were allowed to decline. All but the house and one barn became ruins or fell into partial collapse. Sometime around 2006, the City successfully negotiated with the Castagnasso's to purchase development rights to the parcels in order to preserve the rural open space. After the housing crash of 2008, the City wanted to renegotiate, and the owners refused the lower offer.

In 2018, the farm was put on the market for over \$7 million. A local non-profit preservation group spent a year successfully generating overwhelming support for saving the property as a horse farm. The City itself pledged \$500,000. For Sonoma Culture, the horses standing in the pasture and a barnyard is the cultural resource. Arguably, the cultural resources or at least the cultural affections are entirely about the horses.

But only half the money was raised for the purchase alone. Even more funds would be needed to restore the buildings and maintain the horses and property. The deadlines came, and the property was put back on the marketplace.

Benign neglect, zoning for destruction, reneged agreements, under-financed community efforts.

The new Owners purchased the farm in 2021 with the intent of full-time residence, building restoration, and boarding for retired and rescue horses as part of their horse rescue nonprofit, Georgia's Pasture. The nonprofit will not offer public boarding for those not part of the rescue nor serve visitors. It will be run by the owners and staff (a small number of stable hands and helpers during the day), similar to when the property was used for training Clydesdales by the previous owners. The nonprofit is named after the late mother of one of the owners, who was a horse breeder and riding instructor at a therapeutic riding program for people with physical disabilities. She shared her love of horses with her husband and children. When she passed, she requested her ashes be scattered in a horse pasture, which the family did in Ireland – inspiring the name for the nonprofit, Georgia's Pasture.

In July 2022, horses, including a retired Castagnasso Clydesdale named Gunner, were restored to the property. Two stable hands, including a high school student from the Castagnasso family who remembers Gunner as a foal, and many volunteers now care for the horses. The horse manure from the property is used as fertilizer at The Patch and at various local wineries, continuing relationships that have existed for many years.

Clearly, by their intent, the new owners of these parcels have accomplished more to preserve the historic, cultural, and open space nature of this bucolic piece of our town than any government, institution, or other individual. All previous actions have been well meaning failures at best, and destructive acts at worst. The town came within inches and days of losing the whole thing.

Project Scope:

*Refer to plan 1 / Overall Site Plan (Existing) for existing building key and building numbers referenced below in parenthesis (BLDG. #). Photos of existing structures being unaltered or demolished are included at the end of this narrative.



Barn yard:

The character defining aspect of the barn yard is a space surrounded by simple barn structures, and not so much about the structures themselves. We are maintaining this character, while moving the “Dairy Barn” to the SW corner of the barnyard from the SE corner so that it can more conveniently serve as hay storage for the adjacent paddocks.

The 1,288 square foot Dairy Barn itself (BLDG. 4), near collapse, requires extensive repair. The existing exterior appearance will be retained, with the exception of the removal of an addition on the west side of the building and the reconstruction of the dilapidated shed addition on the south side, resulting in an overall structure size of 1,291 square feet.

The 2,814 square foot Horse Barn (BLDG. 9) requires some rot and waterproofing repairs, but it’s existing appearance and size will be maintained.

A run down storage shed (BLDG. 2) will be repaired/rebuilt for use as a chicken coop and relocated on site to be next to another existing shed (BLDG. 5). The dilapidated 302 square foot turkey coop (BLDG. 3) will be repaired, relocated, and reduced to 261 square feet to function as a pool house. The existing silo (BLDG. 6) will be relocated to be adjacent to the Dairy Barn. The Carriage Barn (BLDG. 7) and collapsed shed ruins at the Dairy Barn will be dismantled and the materials used for repair and rebuilding of existing ag structures. The existing well pump shed (BLDG. 8) will remain.

ADU:

A 1-story, 382 square foot ADU for a future farm manager will be built at the SE corner of the barnyard, separated from the residence by a covered, 189 square foot outdoor storage area.



Residence (BLDG. 1):

Additions will be added to the existing 2,007 square foot structure to convert the 3-bedroom, 1-bath house to a 4,322 square foot 4-bedroom, 4.5-bath residence. A new sidewalk conforming to City of Sonoma standards will be added along the East Spain Street property line, but an alternative material such as decomposed granite (or similar) is being proposed to preserve an historical appearance.

The additions are as large as the original house, but their austere single-story form is a subordinate contrast to the fancy, animated two-story gambrel-roofed original house. Because of this contrast, we believe that we may treat the residence as a whole rather than as separate unrelated elements. The resulting whole is not fake history but is rather an honest interpretation of the California Ranch vernacular.

More than half of the footprint and volume of the house addition comes from the 2,050 square feet of open porches. Shallow porches are the rule on Spain Street from the Jones Demler Price Adobe (Casa Castenada) west of the Plaza, all the way to 4th Street East. The addition's porches, particularly on the Spain Street side, are the device that very lightly unifies the residence.

Frontage and site:

As part of the relocations and remodels, some of the existing trees on the property will be removed, many due to poor tree health. None of the trees to be removed are considered significant per City of Sonoma code, with the exception of a 9" diameter tree at the southeastern corner of the lot in the public right of way, which is in very poor health (reference Arborist Report for additional information).

New curbs, curb cuts, frontage improvements, and a sidewalk along East Spain Street are being added per City of Sonoma Standards. A variance is being requested for the sidewalk material, to allow for a material more in keeping with the agrarian nature of the property and neighboring pasture. Tan colored

decomposed granite or a similar material is proposed as an alternate, to maintain continuity with the historic setting while also allowing for an ADA compliant and accessible path. A concrete curb will be provided, as well as a concrete curb ramp with truncated dome bump pads to be installed per City Standards. An exception is also being requested to allow the curb cut at the agrarian yard/Horse Barn to remain at its current width (18'-3"), which is wider than current City of Sonoma standards, due to the wider turning radius required for horse trailers that may occasionally be needed as part of caring for the horses.

Basic Findings:

Design Review:

Alice Duffee Healy of APD Preservation prepared Historic Resource Evaluations (HREs) for both the main house and the Dairy Barn. As detailed in these reports, the main residence, Dairy Barn, Horse Barn, and adjacent pasture were listed as contributing elements to the Sonoma Plaza National Register Historic District (NRHD, 1992) and are therefore automatically included in the California Register of Historic Resources and are historic resources under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The ways that the proposed designs address the specific elements of the property that warranted its inclusion in the National Register, as well as the criterion in the Integrity Analysis included in both HREs, are summarized below.

1. It was built during the district's period of significance (1835-1944).
The existing structures built during this time period will remain. The portions of the structures to be removed and/or rebuilt are the main house porch addition on the west side (which was enclosed after 1978, then rebuilt and modified in 1999, and is not part of the original structure) and the western shed addition on the Dairy Barn (constructed sometime between 1941 and 1953, with significant modifications since that time, and not listed as a defining feature of the structure).
2. It is associated with the early-twentieth century residential and agricultural development with the town of Sonoma.
The dual residential and agricultural uses of the property and the neighboring pasture will be maintained.
3. It is architecturally distinctive as a vernacular example of an agricultural structure.
Existing architectural features of all structures will be maintained. Additions to the main house will be stylistically simple, to differentiate from the more elaborate trim and roof forms of the existing residence.

-Historic Integrity Analysis

- o Location: The residence, Dairy Barn, and Horse Barn all maintain their integrity of location. The residence and Horse Barn will remain in their current locations. The Dairy Barn will be minorly relocated in order to better serve the adjacent pasture but will still be located on its original property.
- o Design: The residence, Dairy Barn, and Horse Barn all maintain their integrity of design. All defining design characteristics of the structures will be maintained (gambrel roofs at the main house and Dairy barn, "classic broken slope" design of Horse Barn, etc.). The new main house additions will be done in a more minimal style, to differentiate them from the existing structure.
- o Setting: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of setting. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.

- Materials: The residence maintains integrity of materials. These materials will be maintained, and patched/repared if needed, and materials at the new additions will be compatible but differentiated from them. The Dairy Barn and Horse Barn do not have integrity of materials due to extensive remodels and repairs.
- Workmanship: The residence maintains integrity of workmanship. The design and details of the existing structure will be maintained, and the details of the new addition will be subordinate to the existing. The Dairy Barn and Horse Barn do not have integrity of workmanship, the Dairy Barn due to multiple remodels and its current poor condition, the Horse Barn due to its style and nature. The only evidence of workmanship at the Dairy Barn is the gambrel roof, which will be maintained.
- Feeling: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of feeling. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.
- Association: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of association. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.

We feel that this project conforms to the guidelines for design within the Historic Overlay District, as well as the Guidelines for Infill Development. The proposed forms, scale, fenestration, and exterior materials for this project are very respectful of the surrounding structures. The Basic Findings and Findings for Projects within the Historic Overlay District provided by the City of Sonoma are listed below, along with details regarding project compliance.

- a. The project complies with applicable policies and regulations as set forth in the Development Code, other City ordinances, and the General Plan.

The main house will maintain its current dual residential and agricultural status, thus complying with the desired future for the area per the Sonoma Development Code and General Plan.

- b. On balance, the project is consistent with the intent of applicable design guidelines set forth in the Development Code.

The project meets the Development Code design guidelines for the North-East Planning Area in which this property is located by maintaining the existing land uses and by preserving the quality of the area.

- c. The project responds appropriately to the context of adjacent development, as well as existing site conditions and environmental features.

The existing main house will be maintained as the most visible structure on the property, located as it is on the corner of East Spain and 1st Street East, with the additions being subordinate to it. The existing barns will maintain their context to adjacent development, with the Dairy Barn being relocated to better conform to the site uses.

For projects within the Historic Overlay District:

- a. The project will not impair the historic character of its surroundings.

The new additions will be of a simple, single-story design, and the open porches are designed to be compatible with other structures along Spain Street. The existing combination residential/agricultural character of the property will be maintained.

b. The project substantially preserves the qualities of any significant historic structures or other significant historic features on the site.

The original section of the main house, along with all of its significant features, will be maintained. The feel and context of the site as a working farm will be maintained.

c. The project substantially complies with the applicable guidelines set forth in Chapter 19.42 (Historic preservation and infill in the Historic Zone).

The materials and design of the new additions are compatible with the design of the existing main house but have been modified to be easily differentiated from the existing structure. New additions will also be of single-story construction, in contrast to the two-story construction of the existing residence and Dairy Barn.

d. The project substantially complies with any applicable preservation plan or other guidelines or requirements pertaining to a local historic district as designated through section 19.42.020.

The proposed design will be subject to the required design review and approval as specified in section 19.42.020. Existing features of the residence and barn structures will be maintained and repaired as needed.

e. The project substantially complies with the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The project complies with the standards for Rehabilitation in that it:

1. Will require minimal changes to the property's distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of the property will be maintained, and there will be no removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.
3. No false sense of historical development will be created, with new details at the additions being intentionally simplified from the existing residence.
4. The property is historic due to its dual agricultural and residential use, and this will be maintained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features of the existing structures will be preserved.
6. Wherever possible, deteriorated features on the existing structures will be repaired rather than replaced.
7. No treatments that cause damage to the historic materials will be used.
8. Mitigation measures have been taken to protect archaeological resources, including a Cultural Resources Study, ground penetrating radar, forensic dog search, and outreach to local native groups.
9. The new additions will be differentiated but compatible from the existing structures through similar but simplified materials.
10. The new additions are designed so as to be removable from the historic portion of the structure, if desired in future. Distinctive characteristics of the existing structures will not be removed as part of the construction of the new additions.

Variance for sidewalk material:

The request for an alternate material for the new sidewalk to be installed fronting the property is due to a wish to maintain the current agrarian feel of the property, which is unique for a setting so close to the historic Sonoma Plaza. It is compliant with City requirements for a variance (SMC 12.14.050(C)(2)) in the following ways:

- a. The alternate material will not be “material detrimental to public welfare” as it will comply with ADA requirements, and will include required safety features such as transitioning to concrete at the curb ramp to allow for a truncated dome bump pad to be installed. As an expression of the individuality and history of this property, it is not in any way injurious to any of the neighboring properties.
- b. This section does not apply to the requested variance, as we are not requesting the installation of the new sidewalk will be delayed, and intend to install it during the course of construction for the structures.

Exception for curb cut width:

The request to maintain the width of the existing curb cut at the northern end of the property, along the eastern property line and in front of the existing horse barn, is due to the wider turning radius required for horse trailers that may be needed as part of caring for the horses in keeping with the continued mixed agrarian and residential use of the property. It is compliant with City requirements for an exception (SMC 19.54.050(E)) in the following ways:

1. It is consistent with the residential use set forward in the General Plan, and maintains the “neighborhood character” stated as a desired goal in the Housing Element ‘Housing and Neighborhood Preservation’ section.
2. The site has the unique environmental feature/site condition of being used for both agrarian and residential purposes, which shows the history of the property as it has been used in this capacity since the mid-1800s. The exception to maintain the existing curb cut width will help facilitate the continued use of the property in this manner.
3. The exception will not be detrimental to public health, safety, or welfare. It is a request to maintain a condition that already exists, and is specific to the continued agrarian needs of the property, so is not injurious to the property or its neighbors.

This farm project is a win with no cost or effort from the City or its citizens. In this context, at the very least, we should remember the big save here, because none of us were able to restore this place, but the new owners will.

Photos of existing structures to be unaltered or demolished:



Storage shed (BLDG. 2)
(to be relocated on site and rebuilt/repaired)



Shed (BLDG. 5) (to remain)





Silo (BLDG. 6) (to be relocated on site)



Well pump shed (BLDG. 8) (to remain)



Carriage Barn (BLDG. 7)

(to be demolished, materials salvaged for repairs at other existing structures)



Horse Barn (BLDG. 9) (to remain)

FLOOR AREA SUMMARY		
	EXISTING	PROPOSED
MAIN HOUSE MAIN LEVEL	1,281	3,861
MAIN HOUSE UPPER LEVEL	726	461
TOTAL MAIN HOUSE (BLDG. 1)	2,007	4,322
ADU	0	382
COVERED PORCHES	95	2,050
UNCOVERED PORCHES	29	0
UNCOVERED ROOF DECK	0	153
COVERED OUTDOOR STORAGE	0	189
STORAGE SHED (BLDG. 2)	40	40
TURKEY BARN (BLDG. 3, TO BECOME POOL HOUSE)	302	267
DAIRY BARN (BLDG. 4)	1,288	1,291
SHED (BLDG. 5)	93	93
SILO (BLDG. 6)	28	28
CARRIAGE BARN (BLDG. 7, TO BE DISMANTLED, MATERIALS TO BE REPURPOSED)	499	0
WELL PUMP SHED (BLDG. 8)	52	52
HORSE BARN (BLDG. 9)	2,814	2,814

LOT AREA: 1.03 ACRES (44,795 SQ.FT)

MAXIMUM FLOOR AREA RATIO = 22,398 SQ FT (.50 OF LOT AREA)

	EXISTING	PROPOSED
MAIN HOUSE (BLDG. 1)	2,007	4,322
ADU (NOT INCL. IN FAR CALCS)	0	0
COVERED OUTDOOR STORAGE	0	189
TURKEY BARN / POOL HOUSE (BLDG. 3)	302	267
DAIRY BARN (BLDG. 4)	1,288	1,291
CARRIAGE BARN (BLDG. 7)	499	0
HORSE BARN (BLDG. 9)	2,814	2,814
TOTAL F.A.R	6,910	8,883
	<i>(0.15 OF LOT AREA, OK)</i>	<i>(.20 OF LOT AREA, OK)</i>

MAXIMUM SITE COVERAGE = 26,877 SQ.FT (60% OF LOT AREA)

	EXISTING	PROPOSED
MAIN HOUSE, MAIN LEVEL (BLDG. 1)	1,281	3,861
ADU	0	382
PORCHES	124	2,050
COVERED OUTDOOR STORAGE	0	189
STORAGE SHED (BLDG. 2)	40	40
TURKEY BARN / POOL HOUSE (BLDG. 3)	302	267
DAIRY BARN (BLDG. 4)	1,288	1,291
SHED (BLDG. 5)	93	93
SILO (BLDG. 6)	28	28
CARRIAGE BARN (BLDG. 7)	499	0
WELL PUMP SHED (BLDG. 8)	52	52
HORSE BARN (BLDG. 9)	2,814	2,814
INGRESS/EGRESS PATHWAYS	259	761
DRIVEWAY AT HORSE BARN/AG YARD	1,420	1,649
PARKING/DRIVEWAY AT MAIN HOUSE	1,004	1,211
TOTAL COVERAGE	9,204	14,688
	<i>(21% OF LOT AREA, OK)</i>	<i>(33% OF LOT AREA, OK)</i>



Robert Baumann + Associates

CA License # C28431

801 Broadway, Sonoma, CA 95476 P -

707.996.7947 F - 707.996.7904

rb@robertbaumann.com

Date: April 19, 2023

To: City of Sonoma Planning Department

Re: Neighbor outreach – Pritchard Residence, 196 East Spain Street (APN 018-171-012)

The attached letter and project description have been sent to the immediate neighbors (listed below) of my client's property, using the Public Notice Report available on the City of Sonoma GIS.

155/165 East Spain Street – Yvonne and Linda Detert

175 East Spain Street – Sonoma Edge LLC

205 East Spain Street – Charles (Ned) Forrest and Leslie Whitelaw

206 East Spain Street – Katharine and Victor Conforti

323, 325, 327, 329, 337, 339, and 349 Second Street East – Roger and Junko Shishido-Cook

342 Second Street East – Michael and Margaret Lipson

360/362 Second Street East – 360-362 2nd East LLC

378 Second Street East – George Fisher and Nancy Burrus

405-407 Second Street East – Stephen Gomez and Marisa Moret

If you require additional information, or have any questions about the submitted material, please contact me at your earliest convenience.

Sincerely,

Robert Baumann, *Principal*

Robert Baumann + Associates



Robert Baumann + Associates

CA License # C28431

801 Broadway, Sonoma, CA 95476

P - 707.996.7947 F - 707.996.7904

rb@robertbaumann.com

April 14, 2023

Re: Proposed alterations to the residence located at 196 East Spain Street
(APN 018-171-012)

Dear Neighbor:

We are pleased to announce the proposed alterations to the residence and property at 196 East Spain Street. The project involves remodeling the existing residence and adding new additions to the north and west of the home. In addition to remodeling the residence to help it function better as a long-term home for the new owners, the existing gambrel barn that faces 2nd Street East will be relocated closer to the pasture to the west of the home. The relocation of the barn will allow for easier access to it from the pasture, facilitating its use for hay storage and other agricultural uses as part of the owner's horse rescue non-profit organization, Georgia's Pasture.

For further information on the project, please see the attached Project Narrative. The design drawings will be available through the City of Sonoma once a hearing date has been set for the Design Review meeting. If you would like to view these drawings in the interim, please contact our office. The owners, Amy and Ron, would also like to invite you to an open house they will be hosting at the property to get to know their new neighbors - it will be on May 20th at 5pm out back by the horse barn. The design team for the project will be present to help answer any questions about the project, and to enjoy some drinks and barbecue on this beautiful property!

I would be happy to answer any questions or concerns you may have. Please feel free to call me at (707) 996-7947 or email me at rb@robertbaumann.com.

Sincerely,

Robert Baumann, Principal
Robert Baumann + Associates

Project Narrative:

Restoration and Additions to the Castagnasso Horse Farm, 196 East Spain St

Context:

The farm complex as we see it now was built in 1919 and included pastures for up to 10 draft horses. In 1992 the farm was included as a contributing element in the Sonoma Plaza National Register Historic District.

The City of Sonoma zoned these parcels Medium Density Residential, resulting in a land value far exceeding the value of the existing agricultural use. This act alone doomed this bucolic cultural resource. The farm buildings were allowed to decline. All but the house and one barn became ruins or fell into partial collapse. Sometime around 2006, the City successfully negotiated with the Castagnasso's to purchase development rights to the parcels in order to preserve the rural open space. After the housing crash of 2008, the City wanted to renegotiate, and the owners refused the lower offer.

In 2018, the farm was put on the market for over \$7 million. A local non-profit preservation group spent a year successfully generating overwhelming support for saving the property as a horse farm. The City itself pledged \$500,000. For Sonoma Culture, the horses standing in the pasture and a barnyard is the cultural resource. Arguably, the cultural resources or at least the cultural affections are entirely about the horses.

But only half the money was raised for the purchase alone. Even more funds would be needed to restore the buildings and maintain the horses and property. The deadlines came, and the property was put back on the marketplace.

Benign neglect, zoning for destruction, reneged agreements, under-financed community efforts.

The new Owners purchased the farm in 2021 with the intent of full-time residence, building restoration, and housing for retired horses as part of their horse rescue nonprofit, Georgia's Pasture. The nonprofit is named after the late mother of one of the owners, who was a horse breeder and riding instructor at a therapeutic riding program for people with physical disabilities. She shared her love of horses with her husband and children. When she passed, she requested her ashes be scattered in a horse pasture, which the family did in Ireland – inspiring the name for the nonprofit, Georgia's Pasture.

In July 2022, horses, including a retired Castagnasso Clydesdale named Gunner, were restored to the property. Two stable hands, including a high school student from the Castagnasso family who remembers Gunner as a foal, and many volunteers now care for the horses. The horse manure from the property is used as fertilizer at The Patch and at various local wineries, continuing relationships that have existed for many years.

Clearly, by their intent, the new owners of these parcels have accomplished more to preserve the historic, cultural, and open space nature of this bucolic piece of our town than any government, institution, or other individual. All previous actions have been well meaning failures at best, and destructive acts at worst. The town came within inches and days of losing the whole thing.

Project Scope:

Barn yard:

The character defining aspect of the barn yard is a space surrounded by simple barn structures, and not so much about the structures themselves. We are maintaining this character, while moving the “Dairy Barn” to the SW corner of the barnyard from the SE corner so that it can more conveniently serve as hay storage for the adjacent paddocks.

The Dairy Barn itself, near collapse, requires extensive repair. The existing exterior appearance will be retained, with the exception of the removal of an addition on the west side of the building and the reconstruction of the dilapidated shed addition on the south side.

The Horse Barn requires some rot and waterproofing repairs, but it’s existing appearance will be maintained.

Collapsed shed ruins will be dismantled and the materials used for repair and rebuilding of existing ag structures. An existing shed will be repurposed as a chicken coop. The existing dilapidated turkey coop will be repaired and relocated to function as a pool house.

ADU:

A small studio ADU for a future farm manager will be built at the SE corner of the barnyard.

Residence:

Additions will be added to the existing structure to convert the 3-bedroom, 1-bath house to a 4-bedroom, 4.5-bath residence. A new ‘Park Tread’ sidewalk will be added along the East Spain Street property line.

The additions are as large as the original house, but their austere single-story form is a subordinate contrast to the fancy, animated two-story gambrel-roofed original house. Because of this contrast, we believe that we may treat the residence as a whole rather than as separate unrelated elements. The resulting whole is not fake history but is rather an honest interpretation of the California Ranch vernacular.

More than half of the footprint and volume of the house addition are open porches. Shallow porches are the rule on Spain Street from the Jones Demler Price Adobe (Casa Castenada) west of the Plaza, all the way to 4th Street East. The addition’s porches, particularly on the Spain Street side, are the device that very lightly unifies the residence.

Basic Findings:

Alice Duffee Healy of APD Preservation prepared Historic Resource Evaluations (HREs) for both the main house and the Dairy Barn. As detailed in these reports, the main residence, Dairy Barn, Horse Barn, and adjacent pasture were listed as contributing elements to the Sonoma Plaza National Register Historic District (NRHD, 1992) and are therefore automatically included in the California Register of Historic Resources and are historic resources under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The ways that the proposed designs address the specific elements of the property that warranted its inclusion in the National Register, as well as the criterion in the Integrity Analysis included in both HREs, are summarized below.

1. It was built during the district's period of significance (1835-1944).

The existing structures built during this time period will remain. The portions of the structures to be removed and/or rebuilt are the main house porch addition on the west side (which was enclosed after 1978, then rebuilt and modified in 1999, and is not part of the original structure) and the western shed addition on the Dairy Barn (constructed sometime between 1941 and 1953, with significant modifications since that time, and not listed as a defining feature of the structure).
2. It is associated with the early-twentieth century residential and agricultural development with the town of Sonoma.

The dual residential and agricultural uses of the property and the neighboring pasture will be maintained.
3. It is architecturally distinctive as a vernacular example of an agricultural structure.

Existing architectural features of all structures will be maintained. Additions to the main house will be stylistically simple, to differentiate from the more elaborate trim and roof forms of the existing residence.

-Historic Integrity Analysis

- Location: The residence, Dairy Barn, and Horse Barn all maintain their integrity of location. The residence and Horse Barn will remain in their current locations. The Dairy Barn will be minorly relocated in order to better serve the adjacent pasture but will still be located on its original property.
- Design: The residence, Dairy Barn, and Horse Barn all maintain their integrity of design. All defining design characteristics of the structures will be maintained (gambrel roofs at the main house and Dairy barn, "classic broken slope" design of Horse Barn, etc.). The new main house additions will be done in a more minimal style, to differentiate them from the existing structure.
- Setting: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of setting. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.
- Materials: The residence maintains integrity of materials. These materials will be maintained, and patched/repared if needed, and materials at the new additions will be compatible but differentiated from them. The Dairy Barn and Horse Barn do not have integrity of materials due to extensive remodels and repairs.
- Workmanship: The residence maintains integrity of workmanship. The design and details of the existing structure will be maintained, and the details of the new addition will be subordinate to the existing. The Dairy Barn and Horse Barn do not have integrity of workmanship, the Dairy Barn due to multiple remodels and its current poor condition, the Horse Barn due to its style and nature. The only evidence of workmanship at the Dairy Barn is the gambrel roof, which will be maintained.

- Feeling: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of feeling. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.
- Association: The residence, Horse Barn, and Dairy Barn all maintain their integrity of association. This integrity will be maintained, with the property continuing to have dual residential and agricultural uses and maintaining its relationship to the neighboring pasture.

We feel that this project conforms to the guidelines for design within the Historic Overlay District, as well as the Guidelines for Infill Development. The proposed forms, scale, fenestration, and exterior materials for this project are very respectful of the surrounding structures. The Basic Findings and Findings for Projects within the Historic Overlay District provided by the City of Sonoma are listed below, along with details regarding project compliance.

a. The project complies with applicable policies and regulations as set forth in the Development Code, other City ordinances, and the General Plan.

The main house will maintain its current dual residential and agricultural status, thus complying with the desired future for the area per the Sonoma Development Code and General Plan.

b. On balance, the project is consistent with the intent of applicable design guidelines set forth in the Development Code.

The project meets the Development Code design guidelines for the North-East Planning Area in which this property is located by maintaining the existing land uses and by preserving the quality of the area.

c. The project responds appropriately to the context of adjacent development, as well as existing site conditions and environmental features.

The existing main house will be maintained as the most visible structure on the property, located as it is on the corner of East Spain and 1st Street East, with the additions being subordinate to it. The existing barns will maintain their context to adjacent development, with the Dairy Barn being relocated to better conform to the site uses.

For projects within the Historic Overlay District:

a. The project will not impair the historic character of its surroundings.

The new additions will be of a simple, single-story design, and the open porches are designed to be compatible with other structures along Spain Street. The existing combination residential/agricultural character of the property will be maintained.

b. The project substantially preserves the qualities of any significant historic structures or other significant historic features on the site.

The original section of the main house, along with all of its significant features, will be maintained. The feel and context of the site as a working farm will be maintained.

c. The project substantially complies with the applicable guidelines set forth in Chapter 19.42 (Historic preservation and infill in the Historic Zone).

The materials and design of the new additions are compatible with the design of the existing main house but have been modified to be easily differentiated from the

existing structure. New additions will also be of single-story construction, in contrast to the two-story construction of the existing residence and Dairy Barn.

d. The project substantially complies with any applicable preservation plan or other guidelines or requirements pertaining to a local historic district as designated through section 19.42.020.

The proposed design will be subject to the required design review and approval as specified in section 19.42.020. Existing features of the residence and barn structures will be maintained and repaired as needed.

e. The project substantially complies with the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The project complies with the standards for Rehabilitation in that it:

1. Will require minimal changes to the property's distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of the property will be maintained, and there will be no removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.
3. No false sense of historical development will be created, with new details at the additions being intentionally simplified from the existing residence.
4. The property is historic due to its dual agricultural and residential use, and this will be maintained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features of the existing structures will be preserved.
6. Wherever possible, deteriorated features on the existing structures will be repaired rather than replaced.
7. No treatments that cause damage to the historic materials will be used.
8. Mitigation measures have been taken to protect archaeological resources, including a Cultural Resources Study, ground penetrating radar, forensic dog search, and outreach to local native groups.
9. The new additions will be differentiated but compatible from the existing structures through similar but simplified materials.
10. The new additions are designed so as to be removable from the historic portion of the structure, if desired in future. Distinctive characteristics of the existing structures will not be removed as part of the construction of the new additions.

This farm project is a win with no cost or effort from the City or its citizens. In this context, at the very least, we should remember the big save here, because none of us were able to restore this place, but the new owners will.