

18294
Sonoma Highway
Sonoma
CA 95476

TEL 707 996 8448
FAX 707 996 8542

ARCHITECTURE

RossDrulisCusenbery

January 8, 2021

PROJECT NARRATIVE

Application Type: City of Sonoma – Modification of an Existing Use Permit

Project Name: MacArthur Place Hotel & Spa, Guestroom Additions, Sonoma, CA

Owner: L’Auberge de Sonoma LLC

Owner’s Representative: Joe Walsh, Vice President of Development, IMH Financial Corporation

Project Architect: RossDrulisCusenbery Architecture, Inc., Michael B. Ross, AIA NCARB

USE PERMIT APPLICATION REQUEST

MacArthur Place Hotel & Spa (MPH), Sonoma CA, submits this application to modify its existing use permit to add 11 new guestrooms to be located in five new infill buildings within the existing MPH campus located at 29 E. MacArthur Street, Sonoma, CA. The following describes the scope of this use permit application.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

MacArthur Place Hotel and Spa located at 29 E. MacArthur Street in Sonoma, CA is an existing 64 guest room hotel, meeting venue, restaurant and spa. The project site is approximately 5.08 acres, of which approximately 4,543 SF or 0.10 acres is located in the Nathanson Creek riparian corridor measured center line of creek to top of bank. This riparian corridor is permanently undevelopable yielding a net developable parcel of slightly less than five acres. The property is located on a single parcel at 29 E. MacArthur Street (APN 128-091-008). The property is bounded on the north by E. MacArthur Street, on the west by Broadway Street, to the east by Nathanson Creek and to the south by Sonoma Valley High School. The property includes approximately 20 buildings distributed across a garden setting with three primary parking lots providing 131 off street parking spaces. The renovation and refurbishment of all 64 Guestrooms and the remodel and expansion of the Barn and Coach House was completed in 2019.

Since its purchase in 2017, the property was substantially improved through a series of capital investment and building renovation and addition projects which transformed the property into a luxury garden resort. All of these projects were previously reviewed and approved by the City of Sonoma Planning Commission and Design Review Commission. Work completed to date includes but is not limited to:

- Renovation, remodel and upgrades to all 64 existing guestrooms

- Exterior additions providing support space to existing buildings
- Remodel and Additions to the Existing Barn and Coach House
- Creation of the new bar, coffee shop and Layla Restaurant
- Creation of a pedestrian friendly entrance to the City of Sonoma along the Broadway Corridor
- Reestablishing the historic pedestrian entrance to the Burris House
- Increasing the parking count from 100 to 131 parking spaces
- Installation of two emergency power generator systems with acoustic screening
- Landscape improvements and enhancements across the property including upgraded storm water bio-retention and filtration systems
- New Spa Building and swimming pool, landscape and deck areas (currently in design phase)
- Preparation and implementation of a Parking Management Plan
- Proposed landscape beautification project along the Broadway Corridor

CHANGING PROGRAM REQUIREMENTS

In late 2020, IMH Financial Corporation (“IMH”) successfully completed a restructuring under Chapter 11 of the United States Bankruptcy Code. IMH emerged from bankruptcy in October of 2020, and as a result of the confirmed plan, JP Morgan Chase Funding, Inc. (“JPM”) now is the sole owner of IMH. MPH and its ownership entity were not part of the bankruptcy, but as part of the confirmed plan, the prior outside investors in the ownership of MPH were redeemed in full. MPH is now owned solely by IMH.

During the 2020-2021 COVID-19 shutdowns, IMH engaged hospitality consultants to review the hotel’s economic performance history, position in the marketplace and long-term profitability. During this operational assessment, it was determined adding 11 new infill guestrooms to MacArthur Place would be economically advantageous particularly in light of the \$30 M in improvements already completed and the financial impacts associated with the hotel closures caused by the 2017 wildfires, 2018 PGE power shut offs, 2020 wildfires and smoke disruptions and the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic shutdowns.

Due to the fixed overhead required for a Forbes 4/5 Star hotel, restaurant and spa, expansion of the guestroom count is now being pursued, as incremental guest room occupancy and revenue is a key component in assisting the hotel in gaining long-term profitability and occupancy. Increased occupancy will also translate to increased TOT revenues to the City of Sonoma.

The COVID-19 reality offers a previously unimaginable opportunity to engage in construction work while minimizing impacts to guests. The reduced occupancy of the COVID-19 shut downs and the likely gradual ramp up of occupancy percentages over the coming year make 2021 a good time for the commencement of hotel construction. The hotel would like to have the option of taking advantage of this opportunity to add the new guestrooms.

SUMMARY ADDITION OF 11 NEW GUESTROOMS

Table I summarizes the size and building types of the proposed new guestrooms.

TABLE I: NEW GUESTROOM SUMMARY TABLE

MACARTHUR PLACE HOTEL & SPA GUESTROOM ADDITION PROJECT PROPOSED GUESTROOM SUMMARY TABLE			
New Building Designation	Proposed # of New Guestrooms	New Building Area	Unit Description
U	1	554 SF	Cottage Suite
V	1	536 SF	Cottage Suite
W	4	1,914 SF	Two Story Four Plex Similar to Existing Buildings F, H, M, N, O & R
X	4	1,914 SF	Two Story Four Plex Similar to Existing Buildings F, H, M, N, O & R
Y	1	567 SF	Cottage Suite
Sub-Total	11	5,485 SF	Area calculation excludes exterior decks, outdoor showers, ramps and stairs

EXCEPTING THE ADDITION OF 11 NEW GUESTROOMS - ALL OTHER USES REMAIN UNCHANGED

Excepting for the addition of the 11 new guestrooms all other approved uses on the property will remain unchanged. Table II summarizes the status of uses on the property prior to and after the addition of the new guestrooms.

TABLE II: PROJECT USE COMPARISON TABLE

PROGRAM ELEMENT	CURRENT USE INCLUSIVE OF NEW SPA/POOL RENOVATION	ADDITION OF 11 NEW GUESTROOMS	COMMENTS
Guestrooms	64	75	11 new guestrooms added
Conference/Special Events Capacity	150	150	Unchanged
Restaurant/Bar Seating	132	132	Unchanged
Outdoor Seats	33	33	Unchanged
Parking Spaces	131	131	Unchanged
Bank of Parking Spaces in Excess of City Standards	16	4	12 spaces from 16 space “bank” of remaining excess parking spaces will be assigned to the new guestrooms.
Spa Treatment rooms	7	7	Unchanged
Spa Relaxation Room	1	1	Unchanged
Spa Locker Rooms	2	2	Unchanged
Gym	1	1	Unchanged
Stretching Area	1	1	Unchanged
Back of House Laundry	1	1	Unchanged. Relocated from Building Q to Building L
Pool Equipment Room	1	1	Unchanged
Swimming Pool/Deck Area/Hydro Therapy	1	1	New swimming pool & deck area
Rooftop Sundeck	1	1	New - Located over gym

BANK OF UNASSIGNED “EXCESS” PARKING SPACES AVAILABLE FOR ADDITIONAL GUESTROOM USE

The March 2018 Use Permit included 121 parking spaces for the hotel, of which 109 spaces were assigned to hotel use with, 12 spaces being reserved as a “bank” of spaces for future uses. On June 11, 2020, the City of Sonoma Planning Commission approved an increase in the overall parking count from 121 spaces to 131 spaces which was achieved through a restriping plan. This approval increased the overall bank of unassigned spaces for future uses from 12 spaces to 22 spaces. The June 11, 2020 approval of the Spa expansion project assigned six of 22 banked spaces to the spa expanded use leaving 16 spaces in the “bank” available for this Use Permit application, of which 12 spaces will be assigned to the proposed 11 new guest rooms.

PARKING REQUIREMENTS

The project proposes to add 11 new guestrooms totally 5,485 SF of new occupied building area over that which exists now. Table III summarizes the parking requirements for the 11 new guestrooms and the expected two additional housekeeping staff at peak times associated with the new facilities.

TABLE III: NEW GUESTROOM PARKING REQUIREMENTS

NEW OCCUPIED BUILDING AREA PARKING REQUIREMENT					
SPACE TYPE	City Parking Standard	Total Additional Guestrooms	Additional Staff This Use Permit	Total Spaces Required	Total Spaces Provided (Drawn from “bank” of 16 spaces in excess of City Standard)
HOTEL GUESTROOMS	One space per each guest room, plus one space for each two employees	11 (11 spaces)	2 (at peaked times) (1 space)	12 Spaces Required	12

PARKING MANAGEMENT PLAN

The hotel working with W Trans Traffic & Parking Engineers has developed a Parking Management Plan (attached) which focuses on limiting on street neighborhood parking by hotel staff. Hotel staff are required to self-park vehicles in the designated employee parking area of the West Lot a condition of employment at MacArthur Place Hotel & Spa. Other procedures and programs that limit staff car use are described in the Parking Management Plan.

CURRENT & PROPOSED LAND USE DATA

Table IV indicates the current vs. proposed land use data for the project.

TABLE IV: LAND USE DATA

MACARTHUR PLACE SITE DATA			
LAND USE DATA	CURRENT CONDITIONS	PROPOSED APPLICATION	COMMENT
GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION	Mixed Use	Mixed Use	Unchanged
ZONING DISTRICT	Mixed Use	Mixed Use	Unchanged
SITE AREA	221,416 SF	221,416 SF	5.08 ACRES
BUILDING FOOTPRINT	38,101 SF	41,698 SF	First Floor Increase is 3,597 SF
BUILDING SECOND FLOOR	20,143 SF	22,029SF	Second Floor Increase is 1,888 SF
TOTAL BUILDING AREA	+/- 58,314 SF	64,727 SF	
ALLOWABLE FAR	1.0	1.0	
ESTIMATED FAR	.263	.292	Compliant
ALLOWABLE COVERAGE	60% = 132,849 SF	41,698 SF	Compliant
ACTUAL COVERAGE	17.2%	18.8%	Compliant
SETBACKS	Street/Front side: 20' Side yard: 15' for one story building	15' side yard for one story Building V from E. MacArthur Street	Compliant for MX additions
HEIGHT	30'	30'	Compliant
EXISTING PARKING SPACES	131 Spaces	131 Spaces	Staff self-park and guest valet parking in three separate lots
EXCESS SPACES AVAILABLE NEW GUESTROOM USE	22 paces available per June 11, 2020 Use Permit, less six spaces for Spa = 16 spaces available for this use	16 Spaces available for Guestrooms	
EXCESS SPACES TO BE ASSIGNED TO THIS USE FOLLOWING 6 SPACE SPA REDUCTION	16 spaces	12 spaces are assigned to this Use Permit Application	4 spaces remain in the "bank" of unassigned parking spaces

DELIVERY, RECEIVING & TRASH PICK UP

These primary functions will remain in the existing East lot. Secondary functions are adjacent to Building E in the West Lot at for items such as linen pick up and deliveries.

BYCYCLE PARKING

The hotel provides and encourage the use of a fleet of bicycles for its guests. Bike parking is provided for hotel guests on the west side of the Auto Court. Secure employee bicycle parking is provided in the southwest corner of East Parking Lot. Public bicycle racks are provided near the front of the Barn.

HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION

The proposed guestroom project will be entirely new construction. The project does not substantially alter or renovate any historic buildings on the site. The project engaged the services of Page & Turnbull Historic Resource Consultants to prepare a Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE) Report (previously submitted to the City of Sonoma) to evaluate any age eligible buildings on the 29 E. MacArthur Street property. The age eligible buildings on the property include:

- Burris House (1869 with 1923 addition of the Larder Building)
- Barn (1881)
- Caretaker's Cottage (ca. 1920's/1930's)
- Pool House (ca. 1948) – Currently the single-story wing of the Spa
- Garage (ca 1974)

The HRE provided a summary of previous historical surveys and ratings, a site description, historic context statement, construction chronology and an evaluation of the property's eligibility of listing in the California Register. The HRE Summary of Findings for 29 E. MacArthur Street states the following.

"In 2001 the Burris House was evaluated for National Register eligibility and determined to be eligible under Criteria B(persons) and C (Architecture). No other buildings on the property were evaluated for historic significance. The survey noted the barn located on the property did not have high historic integrity as of 2001. Page & Turnbull document existing site conditions and undertook additional historic research to determine the eligibility of all age-eligible buildings on the subject property for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources and City of Sonoma local resources. None of the four age-eligible buildings including the former barn, appear eligible for listing in the California Register or as City of Sonoma historic resources. The buildings also do not hold together as significant grouping of buildings on the site or as a historic district that would be eligible for listing. Therefore, the former barn, pool house, caretaker's cottage and garage do not appear to qualify as historic resources for the purposes of CEQA review. The Burris House retains sufficient historic integrity to remain eligible under Criteria B and C for the National Register; since the National Register uses the same criteria as the California Register and the City of Sonoma local

register, it is also eligible for those registers. Therefore, the Burris House qualifies as a historic resource for the purposes of CEQA review”

Per the above, Page & Turnbull determined the four-other age eligible buildings do not appear eligible for the California Register under any criteria. This determination was made due to a combination of documented alterations to each building and the additional determination that each building does not bear significant association to the Burris House’s original owner.

Consistent with the above findings, the new guestroom project will not impact the historic Burris House nor does the overall site qualify as a historic resource.

FIRE MARSHAL PRE-APPLICATION MEETING

The proposed guestroom addition project was *preliminarily* reviewed during a pre-application meeting with the City of Sonoma Fire Marshal and a subsequent site walk on January 12, 2021. It was determined that due to the current site configuration that a new fire apparatus road per section 503.1.1 of the Building Code, would not be a viable means to afford fire protection to the facility, however an exception could be made as long as an Alternate Means of Protection is provided by the project and approved by the City Fire Marshal. The Alternate Means of Protection being proposed for this Use Permit will be as follows:

PRELIMINARILY PROPOSED ALTERNATE MEANS OF PROTECTION

The Project proposes to mitigate the risks associated with the inability to provide a fire apparatus access road to all portions of the existing site by adding other fire prevention systems. The additional fire prevention system may include but not be limited to:

- Full NFPA 13 compliant sprinkler systems (already required)
- Fire alarm systems (already required)
- Additional fire hydrant and standpipes to serve all new buildings. Standpipes would be plumbing running adjacent to the new hydrant placed on E. Macarthur Street that supplies 6-inch pipe to 3-inch (dry or wet) standpipes placed as approved adjacent to each newly constructed building, and existing buildings along the path of construction. The Spa building will also be required to provide one standpipe to serve the front and rear of the larger structure.
- Automatic smoke and attic heat vents
- All campus maps and directories will require updating including in room escape plans
- The improvements will be Deferred Submittal associated with the Building Permit Application
- Approval of above by the City of Sonoma Fire Marshal

REQUEST FOR ALTERNATE MEANS OF PROTECTION

With the approval of the Fire Marshal, the project will request an Alternate Means of Protection per the following requirements of the Building Code

“Requests for approval to use an alternative material, assembly or materials, equipment, method of construction, method of installation of equipment or means of protection shall be made in writing to the enforcing agency by the owner or the owner’s authorized representative and shall be accompanied by a full statement of the conditions. Sufficient evidence or proof shall be submitted to substantiate any claim that may be made regarding its conformance. The enforcing agency may require tests and the submission of a test report from an approved testing organization as set forth in California Code of Regulations, Title 19, to substantiate the equivalency of the proposed alternative means of protection.

Approval of a request for use of an alternative material, assembly of materials, equipment, method of construction, method of installation of equipment or means of protection made pursuant to these provisions shall be limited to the particular case covered by request and shall not be construed as establishing any precedent for any future request.”

HOTEL OPERATIONAL INFORMATION

Management: By Ownership – Unchanged under this application.

Number of Rooms: 75 – 11 new guestrooms added under this application.

Number of Employees at Largest Shift: 34 – Two additional housekeeping staff added

Indoor Seating Capacity of Restaurant and Bar: 132 – Unchanged under this application.

Meeting Room Capacity: 150 – Unchanged under this application.

Spa: Seven treatment rooms – Unchanged under this application.

Hours of Operation: 24/7/365 – Unchanged under this application.

Shipping and Delivery Schedule: Loading zone on east side of Barn – Unchanged under this application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN

New Guestroom Additions

The new guestrooms were designed to be simple ensemble buildings nestled in the landscape. The architectural design of the new guestrooms will be harmonious with the design, scale and massing of the all the other agrarian styled buildings on the property. Buildings W and X will almost be exact replicas in size, style, massing and scale as existing guestroom buildings F, H, M, N, O and R on the property. Cottage Suites U, V and Y will be substantially the same as the other guest cottages on the property similar to existing Cottages G and S.

All additions will be constructed with a combination of painted horizontal wood siding to match the existing material palette of the hotel. Roofing will be a combination of black asphalt shingles and galvanized corrugated metal roofing.

PROPOSED WINDOWS, DOORS

Windows and doors will be metal clad Sierra Pacific doors and windows to match the new doors and windows on the Barn and Coach House Buildings (see attached cut sheet).

PROPOSED BUILDING COLORS & LIGHTING

The following is the proposed exterior color scheme:

Exterior Wood Siding: Benjamin Moore Navajo White matching other buildings on the property

Exterior Trim: Benjamin Moore black and dark gray matching other buildings on the property

Exterior Wood Rails & Balustrade: Benjamin Moore Navajo White with painted turned spindles.

Exterior Wood Decking: Exposed Redwood with natural oil finish

Exterior Porch Lighting: Exterior light fixtures will be building mounted Goodyear Barn Lights, black finish, 24 W, 1600 lumen, night sky compliant fixtures (see attached cut sheet).

SUSTAINABLE DESIGN

The new guest rooms will be sustainably designed. Sustainable design strategies include:

- Compliance with State of California Cal Green Building Code
- Sustainable Site Development Strategies
 - No site expansion - infill of a previously developed site
 - Pedestrian oriented and bike friendly
 - Storm water retention and storage provided in rain gardens and bio swales
 - Bio filtration of storm water runoff
- Water Use Reduction Strategies
 - Water conservation features including low flow fixtures and water conserving laundry equipment
- Energy Efficiency & Atmospheric Quality
 - Ample use of natural light
 - High energy efficiency mechanical and electrical systems
 - Energy efficient building envelop design
- Materials & Resource Management
 - Recycling of construction wastes
 - Sustainably sourced new and recycled materials

LANDSCAPE DESIGN

The proposed landscape design associated with this project is conceptual. Formal design review of the landscape design will be under a separate design review application.

REMOVAL OF EXISTING TREES

The project proposes the removal of two existing trees and the relocation and transplanting of three other existing trees. Please refer to the attached Tree Transplant and Removal Plan. The project has engaged an arborist to assess the conditions of existing trees. The arborist report has been submitted to the City. The project will replace every tree removed from the construction area on a one for one basis on site.

TRASH & RECYCLING

The Hotel will conform to the recycling requirements of the City of Sonoma. Recycling staging will take place in the receiving dock of the Coach House and on the eastside of the Barn. Trash and recycle storage enclosures will be located in the East Lot.

STORM WATER MITIGATION PLAN

A Storm Water Mitigation Plan (SMP) will be prepared by the project's Civil Engineer demonstrating compliance with local and regional jurisdictional requirements.

DEMOLITION OF EXISTING STRUCTURES

No demolition of existing structures is proposed for this project.

Submitted by:

Michael B. Ross, AIA, NCARB

Principal

RossDrulisCusenbery Architecture, Inc.

Sonoma, CA