Table of Contents

Preface v

Acknowledgements vii

Introduction 1
1. Artificial Intelligence-Powered Mutual Recognition in free movement of goods? 2
2. Mapping the EU constitutional limits on deploying AI systems in the internal market 4
3. Outline and methodology 8

Title 1. Mutual recognition as an administrative procedure within the free movement of goods context 11

Introduction 13

Chapter 1. The EU framework on the free movement of goods as a starting point for mutual recognition 15
1. Free movement of goods hindered by non-tariff barriers to trade (NTBs) 16
2. The gradual emergence of the principle of mutual recognition in the field of goods 19
   2.1. Starting point 19
   2.2. The birth of a principle? 20

Chapter 2. The Court intervenes: ensuring market access in *Cassis* and the underlying principle of home state control stemming from mutual recognition 23
1. Allocation of regulatory powers and the delicate balance between home and host state control 23
2. Scope of the principle of mutual recognition and the kinds of products which fall under Article 34 TFEU 25
3. Mutual recognition is not absolute 28

3.1. Article 36 TFEU's derogations and the rule of reason doctrine: a delicate assessment between free movement and legitimate public interests ... 28
3.1.1. Derogating on grounds of consumer protection ... 30
3.1.2. Derogating on grounds of public health ... 31
3.2. Fundamental rights ... 32
3.3. Proportionality test ... 32
3.4. Preliminary conclusion ... 34
4. Relevance of the principle of mutual recognition in the internal market ... 34

Chapter 3. Mutual recognition in the framework of EU secondary law ... 37
1. The New Approach to technical harmonisation and standards for product regulation and the importance of the principle of mutual recognition ... 37
1.1. Legislative technical harmonisation ... 38
1.2. Harmonisation of standards (EU harmonised standards) ... 39
1.3. The importance of mutual recognition for the legislative technical harmonisation and harmonisation of standards (EU harmonised standards) ... 40
2. Conformity to essential requirements set in EU law and mutual recognition of accreditation certificates ... 40

Chapter 4. Enforcement of mutual recognition within the European administrative space ... 43
1. The EU's decentralised enforcement regime ... 43
2. The European administrative space ... 45
3. Towards the generalisation of informal mechanisms and e-governance-supported horizontal coordination for the enforcement of mutual recognition ... 48
4. Different types of enforcement mechanisms ... 51
4.1. Preventive approach: EU secondary law to the rescue of mutual recognition ... 52
4.1.1. Ex-ante stage at the time of the adoption of the measure: the Single Market Transparency Directive (Directive 2015/1535) and the Single Market Clause ... 52
4.1.2. Ex-post stage ... 54
4.1.2.1. Non-harmonised area: Regulation 2019/515 (repealing Regulation 764/2008) the "Mutual Recognition Regulation" ... 54
4.1.2.2. Harmonised area: Regulation 765/2008 ... 57
4.2. Pre-infringement initiatives ... 58
4.2.1. SOLVIT ... 58
4.2.2. EU Pilot ... 60

Chapter 5. Strengthening mutual recognition enforcement with technology? ... 61
1. The apparent failure of mutual recognition ... 61
1.1. Mutual lack of trust ... 62
1.2. Legal uncertainty surrounding the scope and the application of mutual recognition ... 63
1.3. Stakeholders' lack of awareness ... 65
1.4. Weak enforcement measures ... 65
2. Recommendations of the High-Level Panel of Experts for a strategy for completing the internal market ... 67

Conclusion ... 69

Title 2. Algorithmic regulation in the context of administrative enforcement: promises and pitfalls for public administrations ... 71

Introduction ... 73

Chapter 1. Introduction to Artificial Intelligence, Big Data and machine learning algorithms ... 75
1. Artificial Intelligence and Big Data: an overview ... 77
1.1. Big Data ... 77
1.2. Artificial Intelligence and algorithms ... 78
2. Machine learning: a step towards predictive data analytics ... 81
2.1. Definition of machine learning ... 81
2.2. Machine learning's characteristics ... 82
2.3. Taxonomy of machine learning stages ... 84
2.3.1. 1st workflow: playing with data ... 85
2.3.1.1. First step: defining the problem ... 85
2.3.1.2. Second step: data collection ... 88
2.3.1.3. Third step: data cleaning ... 92
2.3.1.4. Fourth step: summary statistics review ... 93
2.3.1.5. Fifth step: data partitioning ... 94
2.3.1.6. Sixth step: model selection ... 96
2.3.1.7. Seventh step: model training ... 98
2.3.2. 2nd workflow: the running model ... 100
2.3.2.1. Eighth step: model deployment ... 100

Chapter 2. Algorithmic regulation in the context of administrative enforcement through advanced Algorithmic Decision Systems (ADS) and the legal challenges ahead 101
1. Algorithmic Decision Systems usage in public sector enforcement 103
1.1. The promises and pitfalls of ADS in law enforcement contexts 103
1.2. Beyond the algorithmic drama: what really lies behind the "black box" 107
1.3. "Code as law" in public administrations: the normative impact of ADS 110
2. Legitimacy of ADS in the light of the Rule of Law 117
2.1. The Rule of Law: a constitutional principle endangered by ADS? 118
2.1.1. Accountability in algorithmic contexts 120
2.1.2. Transparency: the opacity problem and the need to understand ADS 124
2.1.2.1. The principle of transparency and the opacity problem 124
2.1.2.2. Understanding ADS: legal requirements and the explainability of ML models 127
2.1.3. ADS in the European administrative space: EU fundamental rights and power dynamics between the EU and Member States 135
2.1.3.1. EU fundamental rights 136
2.1.3.2. Power dynamics between the EU and Member States in the European administrative space 139
2.2. Discretionary power in public administrations and the potential impacts of deploying ADS for administrative decision-making 139
2.2.1. Noisy public administrations: an overview of errors in professional judgements 141
2.2.2. Deploying ADS in public administrations: what will remain of public servants' discretion? 145
2.2.3. ADS, code architecture and nudges: a road strewn with pitfalls 149
2.2.3.1. Code architecture 149
2.2.3.2. Nudges 151
2.2.4. The importance of imperfect enforcement 155
2.3. EU Ethics guidelines towards ADS 156
3. Data challenges 157
3.1. Digitisation and datafication of the public sector: perfect momentum for the use of ML algorithms 157
3.2. Data challenges: an overview on the inputs ML algorithms need 158

Conclusion 161

Title 3. Designing ADS in compliance with the Rule of Law: rule-making and administrative justice in the internal market 163

Introduction 165

Chapter 1. Constitutional principles governing the existence and exercise of Union competences as benchmarks for ADS deployment 169

1. Taxonomy of EU Competences with a focus on the internal market and administrative cooperation 170
2. Principle governing the existence of Union competences: the principle of conferral 172
3. Principles governing the exercise of Union competences 175
   - 3.1. The principle of subsidiarity 176
     - 3.1.1. Subsidiarity as a constitutional principle balancing the exercise of powers between the EU and the Member States 177
     - 3.1.2. Subsidiarity's judicial review 179
   - 3.2. The principle of proportionality 180
     - 3.2.1. Proportionality as a constitutional principle limiting the degree of EU intervention 181
     - 3.2.2. Review of legality of the substance of Union intervention 182
       - 3.2.2.1. The wide margin of appreciation offered to the EU institutions 182
       - 3.2.2.2. The procedural approach to proportionality by the ECJ in the exercise of EU competences 183
   - 3.3. National identity 184
   - 3.4. The principle of sincere cooperation 186

Chapter 2. Deploying ADS within the administrative structure of the internal market – Legislative process, harmonisation and judicial review 189

1. Institutional and procedural administrative autonomy of Member States 189
   - 1.1. The principle of institutional autonomy 190
   - 1.2. The principle of procedural autonomy 193
   - 1.3. The limited autonomy of Member States – Identifying a legal basis for the adoption of common administrative structures and procedural rules 195
2. Administrative cooperation in the internal market: the limits and possibilities of Article 197 TFEU 196
   - 2.1. Administrative cooperation in the context of mutual recognition in free movement of goods 196
   - 2.2. Article 197 TFEU, possibilities and limits 198

3. Creating administrative structure in the internal market through Article 114 TFEU 200
3.1. Rules pertaining to the choice of Article 114 TFEU as legal basis and its exercise in the context of EU integrated administrations 201
3.1.1. Conferred powers under Article 114 TFEU: the wide discretion of the EU legislature for building of the internal market administrative structure 202
3.1.1.1. General rules 202
3.1.1.2. Building of the administrative structure in the internal market 204
3.1.2. Judicial review of Article 114 TFEU under the principle of subsidiarity and proportionality 207
3.1.3. Degree of protection required under Article 114 (3) TFEU 209
3.1.4. Differentiation in the internal market: derogations mechanisms under Article 114 TFEU 210
4. Maximum v minimum harmonisation under Article 114 TFEU 213
5. Transparency in EU law-making 214
5.1. Transparency of rule-making activities in EU law and the importance of the right to access to documents 216
5.1.1. The right of access to documents 217
5.1.2. Exceptions to the right of access to documents 219
5.1.2.1. General considerations 219
5.1.2.2. Doctrine of general presumptions of confidentiality on certain categories of documents 220
5.1.3. Access to documents from or held by Member States 222
5.2. Trade secrets, algorithms and transparency 223
6. ADS in the public sector and the EU legal requirements over their use 224
6.1. The Proposal for an AI Act 224
6.1.1. Scope and definitions (Title I) 225
6.1.2. Prohibited AI practices (Title II) 226
6.1.3. High-risk AI systems (Title III) 226
6.1.4. Transparency obligations for certain AI systems (Title IV) 228
6.1.5. Governance and implementation (Titles VI, VII and VIII) 228
6.1.6. Codes of conduct (Title IX) 229
6.1.7. Confidentiality and penalties (Title X) 229
6.2. The Proposal for an AI Liability Directive 229

Chapter 3. Individuals' fundamental rights in the EU – Administrative justice through good administration principles and the principle of effective judicial protection in individual cases 231
1. Good administration and the principles stemming from it 235
1.1. Sub-principles of good administration 238
1.1.1. The duty of care 238
1.1.2. The right to be heard 240
1.1.3. The right of access to the file 241
1.1.4. The duty to give reasons 243
1.1.5. Remarks on the sub-principles of good administration 247
1.2. The European Ombudsman and the European Code of Good Administrative Behaviour 248
2. The principle of effective judicial protection and the right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial set out in Article 47 CFR 250
2.1. Control of legality of individual acts: the scope and intensity of judicial scrutiny 251
2.1.1. Judicial review and margin of appreciation in individual cases: implications for national courts 252
2.1.1.1. At the EU level 252
2.1.1.2. At the Member State level 255
2.1.2. Judicial review and fundamental rights: implications for national courts 256
2.1.2.1. At the EU level 256
2.1.2.2. At the Member State level 258
2.2. The right to an effective remedy (Article 47 (1) CFR) 261
2.2.1. Effective remedies in Member States 262
2.2.2. Limitation of the exercise of the right to an effective remedy 264
2.3. The right to a fair trial (Article 47 (2) CFR) 266
2.3.1. Sub-principles 267
2.3.1.1. The adversarial principle 267
2.3.1.2. Equality of arms 268
2.3.1.3. Rights of defence 269
2.3.1.4. The right to a reasoned judgment 272
3. Composite procedures in the European administrative space 272
3.1. Judicial review of composite procedures 275
3.1.1. Vertical composite procedures 278
3.1.2. Horizontal composite procedures 279
3.2. Diagonal procedures and ADS 282

Conclusion 283

Title 4. Assessing the deployment of ADS within the internal market administrative structure in the context of mutual recognition procedures 289

Introduction 291

Chapter 1. The deployment of ADS in mutual recognition procedures as part of the internal market administrative structure 293

1. EU law enforcement in the internal market with ADS: exploring AI-fuelled MR in free movement of goods 294
2. Deployment of ADS within the internal market administrative structure: existence and exercise of EU competences in light of the Treaties 297
   - 2.1. Conferred powers over the deployment of ADS in the internal market administrative structure 299
   - 2.2. Legal foundation required for ADS in administrative decision-making processes in the internal market 300
     - 2.2.1. Article 197 TFEU and its insurmountable constraints for the deployment of ADS 301
     - 2.2.2. Article 114 TFEU and ADS: fertile ground for the deployment of AI systems in the internal market administrative structure? 302
       - 2.2.2.1. Integrating ADS within the internal market administrative structure: possibilities under Article 114 TFEU in light of the principle of MR in free movement of goods 304
       - 2.2.2.2. Judicial review over the deployment of ADS based on Article 114 TFEU 308
       - 2.2.2.3. Exploring the degree of protection required under Article 114 (3) TFEU in algorithmic contexts and the CFR: towards harmonised protection of all non-harmonised areas? 324
       - 2.2.2.4. Derogations allowed under Article 114 TFEU: sword of Damocles hanging over the deployment of ADS? 328
       - 2.2.2.5. Democratic legitimacy and ADS: AI-fuelled trade integration over local preferences chosen by elected policymakers? 331
       - 2.2.2.6. Types of harmonisation and ADS 332

Chapter 2. Compatibility assessment of ADS with EU fundamental rights in mutual recognition procedures 335
1. The role of the EU right to good administration in shaping ADS 336
1.1. Sub-principles related to the EU right to good administration 337
1.1.1. The duty of care 337
1.1.1.1. General considerations 338
1.1.1.2. Analysis of ADS in MR procedures 341
1.1.2. The right to be heard in administrative procedures 346
1.1.3. The right of access to the file for individual administrative decisions 347
1.1.3.1. General considerations 347
1.1.3.2. Analysis of ADS in MR procedures 348
1.1.4. The duty to give reasons 349
1.1.4.1. General considerations 351
1.1.4.2. Analysis of ADS in MR procedures 355
1.2. Good administration principles, composite procedures and ADS: an additional layer of complexity 361
1.3. Principles of good administration and MR by design: embedding fundamental rights' safeguards and MR requirements in ADS 363
1.4. Additional safeguards regarding the principle of good administration 367
2. Effective judicial protection and the use of ADS in individual administrative cases 370
2.1. Judicial scrutiny in (semi-)automated MR procedures and the challenges ahead 370
2.1.1. The scope and intensity of judicial review 370
2.1.2. Judicial review and informational cooperation 3.0 with ADS: towards artificial intelligence powered cooperation 375
2.1.2.1. Algorithmic recommendations: acts with or without legal effects under EU law? 378
2.1.2.2. Judicial review, ML algorithms' opaqueness and network structures 380
2.2. Contesting algorithmic decisions and the effective remedies required to challenge them 385
2.2.1. Contestability's importance of AI systems in decision-making processes 385
2.2.1.1. General considerations 385
2.2.1.2. Contestability in algorithmic MR procedures 387
2.2.2. Ensuring effective remedies in (semi-)automated MR procedures 389
2.2.3. Transparency 390

2.3. The right to a fair trial (Article 47 (2) CFR) ... 391
2.3.1. The adversarial principle ... 392
2.3.2. Equality of arms ... 395
2.3.3. Rights of defence ... 396
2.3.3.1. Right to access to the file ... 397
2.3.3.2. Right to be heard ... 397
2.3.4. Reasoned judgment ... 400
3. Ensuring fundamental rights when trade secrets are at stake ... 400
4. The fundamental right of access to legislative documents over ADS' inner working and the scope the principle of openness in algorithmic contexts ... 403
4.1. Right of access ... 404
4.1.1. General considerations ... 404
4.1.2. Exceptions to the right of access to documents ... 405
4.2. Doctrine of general presumptions of confidentiality ... 407
4.2.1. General considerations ... 407
4.2.2. Legislative v administrative documents ... 408
4.3. The scope of the principle of openness in algorithmic contexts ... 409

Chapter 3. Legal possibility and practical feasibility of automated MR procedures in the internal market ... 413
1. The principle of mutual recognition fit uneasily with ADS ... 413
1.1. Mutual recognition's nature and implications ... 414
1.2. Power dynamics between the EU and the Member States ... 416
1.2.1. Legal considerations ... 416
1.2.2. Organisational considerations ... 417
2. Towards simpler intermediate solutions as an alternative for ADS ... 419
3. Practical feasibility issues surrounding more automated MR procedures ... 420

Conclusion ... 423
1. Article 114 TFEU ... 424
2. Good administration principles ... 426
3. Effective judicial protection ... 427
4. Trade secrets ... 429
5. Right access and the principle of openness ... 429
6. Automated MR procedures ... 430

Concluding perspectives on Artificial Intelligence-Powered Mutual Recognition in the field of free movement of goods 433
1. Answers to the research questions 433
2. General concluding observations 437

Annex 439

Bibliography 441
Literature 441
Case-law 459
Legislation 464
EU Institutions 465