

(UPDATED 3/24/25)

SUBSEQUENT HISTORY TO BOARD OF CERTIFICATION DECISIONS		
Decision No.	Treatment	Court Citation
2 OCB 58 (BOC 1968)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Fellner v. Anderson</i> , 72 LRRM 2992, N.Y.L.J., Dec. 3, 1969, at 16 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Starke, J.).
4 OCB 6 4 OCB 16 (BOC 1969)	stay vacated	<i>Matter of New York State Nurses Assn. v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Mar. 19, 1969, at 2 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Spector, J.).
6 OCB 12 (BOC 1970)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Penta v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Mar. 9, 1971, at 2 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Carney, J.).
6 OCB 13 (BOC 1970)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Randolph v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , N.Y.L.J., May 7, 1970, at 88. (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Schwartzwald, J.).
14 OCB 33 14 OCB 50 (BOC 1974)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Davis v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Jan. 29, 1976, at 7 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Postel, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 51 A.D.2d 528 (1 st Dept. 1976), <i>lv. denied</i> , 39 N.Y.2d 707 (1976).
16 OCB 23 (BOC 1975)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Rios v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Dec. 3, 1975, at 6 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Gellinoff, J.).
22 OCB 22 (BOC 1978)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 13079/1978 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 6, 1978) (Bloom, J.).
22 OCB 28 (BOC 1978)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Nurses Assn. of the Dept. of Health v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 12102/1978 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 3, 1978) (Schwartz, J.).
22 OCB 45 (BOC 1978)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Civil Service Technical Guild, Local 375 v. Anderson</i> , <i>revd.</i> , N.Y.L.J., Oct. 9, 1979, at 10 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Greenfield, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 79 A.D.2d 541 (1 st Dept. 1980), <i>revd.</i> , 55 N.Y.2d 618, (1981).
24 OCB 14 (BOC 1979)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Committee of Interns and Residents v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 11542/1979 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 3, 1980) (Dontzin, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 84 A.D.2d 694 (1 st Dept. 1981).
24 OCB 24 (BOC 1979)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. Anderson</i> , 78 A.D.2d 777 (1 st Dept. 1980), <i>lv. denied</i> , 53 N.Y.2d 602 (1981).
26 OCB 14 (BOC 1980)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Local 300, Civil Service Forum v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 19528/1980 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 13, 1981) (Taylor, J.).

32 OCB 3 (BOC 1983)	appeal dismissed	<i>Matter of Barry v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 7090/1983 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 21, 1983) (White, J.).
34 OCB 6 (BOC 1984)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Magguilli v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 19624/1984 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 20, 1984) (White, J.).
56 OCB 4 (BOC 1995)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Municipal Police Benevolent Assn. v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 114960/1995 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 22, 1995) (Schlesinger, J.).
56 OCB 6 (BOC 1995)	affirmed	<u><i>Matter of Civil Service Technical Guild v. MacDonald</i></u> , Index No. 116355/1995 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 29, 1997) (Cahn, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 249 A.D.2d 74 (1 st Dept. 1998).
60 OCB 4 (BOC 1997)	affirmed	<u><i>Matter of City of New York v. District Council 37</i></u> , Index No. 403334/1997 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 27, 1999) (York, J.).
62 OCB 1 (BOC 1998)	affirmed	<u><i>Matter of Levitt v. Board of Certification of the Office of Collective Bargaining</i></u> , Index No. 104693/1998 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 7, 1999) (Cohen, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 273 A.D.2d 104 (1 st Dept. 2000).
68 OCB 6 (BOC 2001)	affirmed	<i>Independent Laborers Union of New York City v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 113973/01 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 3, 2002) (DeGrasse, J.)
72 OCB 5 (BOC 2003)	affirmed	<i>Independent Laborers Union of New York City v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 118937/03 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 13, 2004) (Wetzel, J.)
74 OCB 4 (BOC 2004)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 402745/2004 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 27, 2005) (Wetzel, J.).
78 OCB 5 (BOC 2006)	affirmed	<u><i>Matter of New York City Health & Hospitals Corporation v. Board of Certification of the City of New York</i></u> , 2007 NY Slip Op. 30921 (U), 237 NYLJ 99, 2007 WL 2175524 (NY Sup.), 2007 NY Misc LEXIS 3853 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. April 23, 2007) (Tolub, J.).
78 OCB 9 (BOC 2006)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Bd. of Certification of the City of New York</i> , Index No. 404461/2006 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 19, 2007) (Wetzel, J.).
80 OCB 1 (BOC 2007)	appeal withdrawn	Mot dismiss denied: <i>Matter of City of New York v. NYC Bd. of Certification</i> , Index No 400464/2007 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 19, 2007) (Figueroa, J.); transferred App Div, <i>id</i> (April 1 2010) (Stallman, J.); app. withdrawn via stip Apr. 5, 2010.
2 OCB2d 14 (BOC 2009)	affirmed (indirectly)	<u><i>Matter of LEEBA v. City of New York & Office of Collective Bargaining</i></u> , Index No. 116478/2009 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 12, 2010) (Gische, J.).

3 OCB2d 33 (BOC 2010)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York, et al. v. Bd. of Certification of the City of New York, et al.</i> , 2011 N.Y. Slip Op. 32814(U), 2011 WL 5240150 (NY Sup), 2011 NY Misc. LEXIS 5119 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 27, 2011) (Kern, J.).
7 OCB2d 1 (BOC 2014)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Bd. of Certification of the City of New York</i> , Index No. 400199/2014; <i>Matter of CEU, L. 237 v. Bd. of Certification of the City of New York</i> , Index No. 100180/2014 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jun. 15, 2015) (Moulton, J.).
8 OCB2d 20 (BOC 2015)	appeal untimely; motion for leave to renew or reargue denied	<i>Matter of HHC PBA, Inc. v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 101484/15 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 18, 2017) (Hagler, J.) (finding appeal untimely); <i>Matter of HHC PBA, Inc. v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 101484/15 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 5, 2017) (Hagler, J.) (denying motion for leave to renew/reargue)
10 OCB2d 2 (BOC 2017)	Affirmed	<i>Matter of NYC Health + Hospitals v. Organization of Staff Analysts</i> , Index No. 152144/17 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 20, 2017) (Edwards, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 171 A.D.3d 529 (1 st Dept. 2019), <i>motion for leave to appeal denied</i> , 34 N.Y.3d 909 (2020).
11 OCB2d 8 (BOC 2018)	Affirmed	<i>Matter of NYC Health + Hospitals v. Organization of Staff Analysts</i> , Index No. 450553/18 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 26, 2019) (Crane, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 179 A.D.3d 573 (1 st Dept. 2020), <i>motion for leave to appeal denied</i> , 35 N.Y.3d 906 (2020).
11 OCB2d 13 (BOC 2018)	affirmed; motion for leave to renew or reargue denied	<i>Law Enforcement Employees Benevolent Association v. The City of New York Office of Collective Barg.-Bd. of Certification</i> , Index No. 156046/18 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 18, 2018) (Edmead, J.); <i>motion to renew/reargue denied</i> (Mar. 29, 2019). (Notice of appeal to First Dept. filed 12/28/18. Not perfected.)
13 OCB2d 12 (BOC 2020)	Affirmed	<i>NYC Health + Hospitals v. Communication Workers of America, Local 1180, et al.</i> , Index No. 451864/20 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov 17, 2021) (Engoron, J.).
14 OCB2d 7 (BOC 2021)	Withdrawn	<i>Sargeants Benevolent Assn. of the City of New York, Inc. v. The City of New York, et al.</i> , Index No. 153845/21 (James, J.).
15 OCB2d 20 (BOC 2022)	Motion to dismiss granted	<i>Law Enforcement Employees Benevolent Association v. City of New York, New York City Office of Collective Bargaining Board of Certification, et al.</i> , Index No. 157041/22 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. March 1, 2023) (Frank, J.)

