

TABLE OF COURT DECISIONS

SUBSEQUENT HISTORY TO BOARD OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING DECISIONS		
Decision No.	Treatment	Court Citation
5 OCB 4 (BCB 1970)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Levy v. Anderson</i> , 65 Misc. 2d 763 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 28, 1971) (Fraiman, J.).
13 OCB 7 (BCB 1974)	appeal moot	<i>Matter of Vizzini v. Beame</i> , 90 LRRM 3211, N.Y.L.J., Oct. 4, 1974 (no page available) (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Fein, J.).
13 OCB 5 (BCB 1974) & 15 OCB 1 (BCB 1975)	reversed in part	<i>Matter of Burnell v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Nov. 26, 1975, at 8, col. 1-2 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Asch, J.) (Reversal rendered moot by amendment to CSL §100(1)(d); see <i>Rockland County v. Rockland County Unit</i> , CSEA, 74 A.D.2d 812 (2d Dept. 1980), <i>affd.</i> , 53 N.Y.2d 741 (1981).)
15 OCB 6 (BCB 1975)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Knight v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Dec. 18, 1975, at 8 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.).
15 OCB 16 (BCB 1975)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., Jan. 29, 1976, at 8 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Gellinoff, J.).
15 (OCB 21 (BCB 1975)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 41993/1975 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 1, 1975) (Nadel, J.).
15 OCB 24 (BCB 1975)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , N.Y.L.J., Jan. 2, 1976, at 6 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Helman, J.).
17 OCB 13 (BCB 1976)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Queens Borough Public Library v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 40591/1977 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., May 20, 1977) (Baer, J.).
19 OCB 3 (BCB 1977) & 19 OCB 4 (BCB 1977)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Higgins v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 12280/1977 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 16, 1977) (Gomez, J.).
19 OCB 9 (BCB 1977)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn.</i> , Index No. 6574/1977 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 30, 1977) (oral decision in binder).
19 OCB 15 (BCB 1977)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Detectives Endowment Assn. v. Anderson</i> , N.Y.L.J., May 18, 1978, at 12 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Hughes, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 67 A.D.2d 648 (1 st Dept. 1979).

19 OCB 13 (BCB 1977) & 21 OCB 1 (BCB 1978)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 40532/1978 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Kassal, J.).
21 OCB 9 (BCB 1978) & 21 OCB 10 (BCB 1978)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 20264/1973 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 22, 1979) (Nadel, J.).
23 OCB 6 (BCB 1979)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Sergeants' Benevolent Assn. v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 11950/1979 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 7, 1979) (Riccobono, J.).
25 OCB 8 (BCB 1980)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. McGuire</i> , Index No. 8238/1980 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 13, 1981) (Stecher, J.).
25 OCB 16 (BCB 1980)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. McGuire</i> , Index No. 16971/1980 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., July 14, 1981) (Taylor, J.).
25 OCB 33 (BCB 1980)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. McGuire</i> , N.Y.L.J., Jan. 30, 1981, at 6 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Greenfield, J.).
27 OCB 9 (BCB 1981)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , N.Y.L.J., Oct. 23, 1981, at 6, col. 5-6 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co.) (Pecora, J.).
29 OCB 8 (BCB 1982)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Caruso v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 05411/1982 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., July 29, 1982) (Sherman, J.).
31 OCB 5 (BCB 1983)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Mondshein v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 8919/1983 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 5, 1983).
33 OCB 22 (BCB 1984)	reversed in part	<i>Matter of Organization of Staff Analysts</i> , 18 PERB ¶ 3067 (1985) (remanded for hearing).
35 OCB 6 (BCB 1985) & 35 OCB 11 (BCB 1985)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Uniformed Forces Coalition v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 10330/1985 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 2, 1986) (Baer, J.).
35 OCB 12 (BCB 1985)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Albino v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 11131/1985 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., Aug. 30, 1985).
35 OCB 26 (BCB 1985)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Detectives Endowment Assn. v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 23213/1985 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 28, 1986) (Altman, J.).

37 OCB 2 (BCB 1986)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Grazioli v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 2759/1986 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 29, 1987) (Edwards, J.).
37 OCB 7 (BCB 1986)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Seelig v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 5063/1986 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 18, 1986) (Smith, J.).
37 OCB 42 (BCB 1986)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Caruso v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 1171/1987 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 13, 1987) (Grossman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 145 A.D.2d 1004 (1 st Dept. 1988).
39 OCB 7 (BCB 1987)	affirmed in part, modified in part	<i>Matter of Levitt v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , 140 Misc. 2d 727 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June, 27, 1988) (Atlas, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 171 A.D.2d 545 (1 st Dept. 1991), <i>affd. in part, modified in part</i> , 79 N.Y.2d 120 (1992).
39 OCB 24 (BCB 1987)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Caruso v. Anderson</i> , 138 Misc. 2d 719 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 21, 1987) (Saxe, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 145 A.D.2d 1004 (1 st Dept. 1988), <i>lv. denied</i> , 73 N.Y.2d 709 (1989).
39 OCB 41 (BCB 1987)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Caruso v. Anderson</i> , Index No. 25827/1987 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 19, 1988) (Rubin, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 150 A.D.2d 994 (1 st Dept. 1989).
41 OCB 59 (BCB 1988)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Kane v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 24115/1988 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 27, 1989) (Cohen, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 161 A.D.2d 305 (1 st Dept. 1990).
41 OCB 64 (BCB 1988)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Caruso v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , 161 A.D.2d 444 (1 st Dept.), <i>lv. denied</i> , 76 N.Y.2d 706 (1990).
43 OCB 4 (BCB 1989) & 43 OCB 11 (BCB 1989)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Uniformed Firefighters Assn. v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 12338/1989 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 30, 1989) (Santaella, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 163 A.D.2d 251 (1 st Dept. 1990).
43 OCB 12 (BCB 1989)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Caruso v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 9240/1989 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 30, 1989) (McCooe, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 169 A.D.2d 644 (1 st Dept. 1991).
43 OCB 70 (BCB 1989)	affirmed	<i>Uniformed Firefighters Assn. v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 1065/1990 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 26, 1990) (Weissberg, J.).
45 OCB 27 (BCB 1990)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Brown v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 42146/1991 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 1, 1991) (Pecora, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 1993 N.Y. App. Div. Lexis 5583 (1 st Dept. May 20, 1993).

47 OCB 42 (BCB 1991)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 44429/1991 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 14, 1992) (Parness, J.), <i>modified</i> , 201 A.D.2d 258 (1 st Dept. 1994), <i>lv. denied</i> , 83 N.Y.2d 759 (1994).
49 OCB 16 (BCB 1992)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Nelson v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 20861/1992 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 11, 1992) (Friedman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 204 A.D.2d 216 (1 st Dept. 1994), <i>appeal dismissed</i> , 84 N.Y.2d 1004 (1994).
49 OCB 25 (BCB 1992)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York Dept. of Probation & City v. MacDonald</i> , <i>affd.</i> , Index No. 42861/1992 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 31, 1993) (Cohen, J.), <i>revd.</i> , 205 A.D.2d 372 (1 st Dept. 1994).
49 OCB 27 (BCB 1992)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Plumbers Local Union No. 1</i> , Index No. 43764/1992 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 13, 1993) (Friedman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 204 A.D.2d 183 (1 st Dept. 1994), <i>lv. denied</i> , 85 N.Y.2d 803 (1995).
49 OCB 38 (BCB 1992)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of New York City Off-Track Betting Corp. v. Bd. Of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 45321/1992 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 26, 1993) (Shainswit, J.).
49 OCB 44 (BCB 1992)	modified	<i>Matter of City of New York v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 45920/1992 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 23, 1993) (Evans, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 213 A.D.2d 287 (1 st Dept. 1995), <i>appeal dismissed</i> , 86 N.Y.2d 773 (1995).
51 OCB 12 (BCB 1993)	affirmed	<i>Matter of New York City Dept. of Sanitation v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 402944/1993 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 20, 1993) (Ciparick, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 215 A.D.2d 324 (1 st Dept. 1995), <i>affd.</i> , 87 N.Y.2d 650 (1996).
51 OCB 16 (BCB 1993)	affirmed	<i>Matter of McManus v. City of New York Dept. of Parks</i> , Index No. 111730/1993 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 16, 1993) (Friedman, J.).
51 OCB 23 (BCB 1993)	reversed & remanded	<i>Matter of Boyle v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 118517/1993 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 23, 1994) (Wright, J.) (no Board decision on remand).
51 OCB 26 (BCB 1993)	enforced	<i>Matter of Committee of Interns and Residents v. Dinkins</i> , Index No. 12706/1993 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 29, 1993) (Lobis, J.).
51 OCB 27 (BCB 1993)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 405350/1993 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 29, 1994) (Fisher-Brandveen, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 223 A.D.2d 485 (1 st Dept. 1996).
51 OCB 45 (BCB 1993)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Toal v. MacDonald</i> , <i>affd.</i> , 216 A.D.2d 8 (1 st Dept. 1995).

53 OCB 1 (BCB 1994)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. MacDonald</i> , Index No. 409776/1994 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb.15, 1996) (Omansky, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 239 A.D.2d 274 (1 st Dept. 1997).
59 OCB 1 (BCB 1997)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Libert v. New York City Board of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 401234/1997 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 10, 1998) (Cahn, J.).
59 OCB 46 (BCB 1997)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. DeCosta</i> , 176 Misc. 2d 936 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. 1998) (Tompkins, J.), <i>affd. sub nom. City of New York v. Uniformed Fire Officers Assn.</i> , 263 A.D.2d 3 (1 st Dept. 1999), <i>affd.</i> , 95 N.Y.2d 273 (2000).
61 OCB 1 (BCB 1998)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Knox v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 103436/1998 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 24, 1998) (Bransten, J.).
61 OCB 2 (BCB 1998)	called into question	<i>See Matter of City of New York v. DeCosta</i> , 95 N.Y.2d 273 (2000) (<i>see</i> 59 OCB 46 (BCB 1997)).
61 OCB 9 (BCB 1998)	called into question	<i>See Matter of City of New York v. DeCosta</i> , 95 N.Y.2d 273 (2000) (<i>see</i> 59 OCB 46 (BCB 1997)).
61 OCB 10 (BCB 1998)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Detectives Endowment Assn.</i> , Index No. 401478/1998 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 23, 1998) (Wetzel, J.).
61 OCB 11 (BCB 1998)	called into question	<i>See Matter of City of New York v. DeCosta</i> , 95 N.Y.2d 273 (2000) (<i>see</i> 59 OCB 46 (BCB 1997)).
61 OCB 12 (BCB 1998)	reversed	<i>Matter of Social Service Employees Union v. City of New York Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 108479/1998 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 5, 1999) (Freedman, J.).
61 OCB 32 (BCB 1998)	appeal untimely	<i>Matter of Amaker v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 400217/1999 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. May 6, 1999) (Bransten, J.).
63 OCB 1 (BCB 1999)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Saunders v. DeCosta</i> , Index No. 103467/1999 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 7, 1999) (Wilkins, J.).
63 OCB 23 (BCB 1999)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Lieutenants Benevolent Ass'n v. City of New York</i> , No. 403410/1999 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 27, 1999) (York, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 285 A.D.2d 329 (1 st Dept. 2001)
63 OCB 35 (BCB 1999)	appeal timely	<i>Matter of Matter of City of New York and Fire Department of the City of New York v. DeCosta, District Council 37, Locals 2507 and 3021</i> , Index No. 404122/1999 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 20, 2000) (Friedman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 289 A.D.2d 144 (1 st Dept. 2001) (A.D. affirmed lower court ruling that appeal timely.)

65 OCB 2 (BCB 2000)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. International Brotherhood of Teamsters</i> , Index No. 401424/2000 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 28, 2001) (Yates, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 301 A.D.2d 471 (1 st Dept. 2003).
65 OCB 9 (BCB 2000)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York and Administration for Children's Services v. DeCosta, Civil Service Bar Assn., and International Brotherhood of Teamsters</i> , Index No. 403335/2000 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 7, 2001) (Kapnick, J.).
65 OCB 13 (BCB 2000)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. DeCosta and Local 1180</i> , Index No. 403336/2000 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 12, 2001) (Stallman, J.).
69 OCB 22 (BCB 2002)	affirmed	<i>Matter of District Council 37 v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 112450/2003 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 15, 2004) (Beeler, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 22 A.D. 3d 279 (1 st Dept. 2005).
71 OCB 14 (BCB 2003)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Raby v. Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 109481/2003 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Sept. 12, 2003) (Beeler, J.).
73 OCB 12 (BCB 2004)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 112687/2004 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 8, 2005) (Friedman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 38 A.D.3d 482 (1 st Dept. 2007), <i>lv. denied</i> , 9 N.Y.3d 807 (2007).
73 OCB 14 (BCB 2004)	modified, affirmed as modified	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benevolent Assn. v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 113062/2004 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 4, 2005) (Edmead, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 27 A.D.3d 381(1 st Dept. 2007).
75 OCB 9 (BCB 2005)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. D.C. 37, 12 Misc.3d 1162(A)</i> (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 10, 2006) (Ling-Cohan, J.).
75 OCB 11A (2005)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Local 983, District Council 37, v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> Index No. 107616/2005 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Jan. 18, 2006).
75 OCB 31 (BCB 2005)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Social Serv. Empls. Union, L. 371 v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 116054/2005 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. May 30, 2006) (Stallman, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 47 A.D.3d 417 (1 st Dept. 2008).
77 OCB 18 (BCB 2006)	appeal withdrawn	<i>Matter of LEEBA v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 10737/2007 (Sup. Ct. N.Y.Co.) (Lehner, J.).
77 OCB 34 (BCB 2006)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Roberts v. City of New York</i> , Index No. 110680/2007 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 5, 2008) (DeGrasse, J.)
77 OCB 36 (BCB 2006)	affirmed	<i>Hodge v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 104531/2007 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 3, 2007) (York, J.).

77 OCB 37 77 OCB 38 (BCB 2006)	reversed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. Patrolmen's Benev. Assn.</i> , Index No. 400007/2007 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 27, 2007) (Wilkins, J.), <i>revd.</i> , 56 A.D.3d 70 (1 st Dept. 2008), <i>revd.</i> , 14 N.Y.3d 46 (2009).
1 OCB2d 6 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Roberts v. Board of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 104695/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 16, 2010) (Lehner, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 90 A.D.3d 440 (1 st Dept. 2011).
1 OCB2d 26 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benev. Assn v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 116942/2008, 2009 N.Y. Misc. LEXIS 4159 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 5, 2009).
1 OCB2d 28 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Plumbers Union Local No. 1 v. Gold</i> , Index No. 112139/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 2, 2010) (Goodman, J.).
1 OCB2d 37 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 403010/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., Oct. 23, 2009) (Lehner, J.).
1 OCB2d 34 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Moriates v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 114094/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 15, 2010) (Sherwood, J.).
1 OCB2d 39 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Rosioreanu v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 116796/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 30, 2009) (Sherwood, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 78 A.D.3d 401, (1 st Dept. 2010), <i>lv. denied</i> , 17 N.Y.3d 702 (2011).
1 OCB2d 33 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of New York City Dist. Council of Carpenters v. Gold, et al.</i> , Index No. 114353/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 2, 2010).
1 OCB2d 28 (BCB 2008)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Plumbers Loc. Union No. 1 v. Gold</i> , Index No. 112139/2008 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 2, 2010) (Goodman, J.).
2 OCB2d 10 (BCB 2009)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Roberts v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 114962/2009 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 15, 2010) (Madden, J.).
2 OCB2d 38 (BCB 2009)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Mahinda v. City of New York, et al.</i> , Index No. 117487/2009 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 5, 2010) (Scarpulla, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 91 A.D.3d 564 (1 st Dept. 2012).
2 OCB2d 44 (BCB 2009)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City v. Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 400177/2010 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 7, 2010) (Schlesinger, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 107 A.D.3d 612 (1 st Dept. 2013)
3 OCB2d 7 (BCB 2010)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Roberts v. NYC Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , 33 Misc. 3d 1224(A) (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 14, 2011) (Schlesinger, J.).

3 OCB2d 17 (BCB 2010)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Smith v. NYC Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 40216/2010 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 30, 2010) (Solomon, J.).
3 OCB2d 18 (BCB 2010)	reversed	<i>Matter of Patrolmen's Benev. Assn. v. NYC Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , 35 Misc.3d 1234(A) (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. May 29, 2012) (Schoenfeld, J.).
3 OCB2d 54 (BCB 2010)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Sergeants Benev. Assn. v. City of New York, et al.</i> , Index No. 100183/2010 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 18, 2011) (Lobis, J.).
4 OCB2d 3 (BCB 2011)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Uniformed Firefighters Assn v. City of New York, et al</i> , Index No. 101817/2011 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 17, 2012) (Huff, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 106 A.D.3d 616 (1 st Dept. 2013).
4 OCB2d 4 (BCB 2011)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 451411/2013 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 14, 2014) (Freed, J.).
4 OCB2d 19 (BCB 2011)	affirmed	<i>Roberts, et al. v. New York City Office of Collective Bargaining, et al.</i> , Index No. 106268/2011 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 30, 2012) (Torres, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 113 A.D.3d 97 (1 st Dept. 2013).
4 OCB2d 20 (BCB 2011)	affirmed; appeal to Ct of Appeals pending	<i>City of New York, et al. v. NYSNA, et al.</i> , Index No. 401425/2011 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Feb. 11, 2013) (Huff, J.); <i>revd.</i> , 130 A.D.3d 28 (1 st Dept. 2015).
4 OCB2d 30 (BCB 2011)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Uniformed Firefighters Assn v. City, et al</i> , Index No. 108759/2011 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co., Dec. 6, 2012) (Hunter, J.); <i>affd.</i> , 114 A.D.3d 510 (1 st Dept. 2014).
4 OCB2d 63 (BCB 2011)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Detectives' Endowment Assn. v. City, et al.</i> , Index No. 100946/2012 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Nov. 9, 2012) (Wright, J.); <i>revd.</i> , 125 A.D.3d 475 (1 st Dept. 2015).
5 OCB2d 26 (BCB 2012)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 451411/2013 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 14, 2014) (Freed, J.).
5 OCB2d 28 (BCB 2012)	affirmed; appeal to First Dept. pending	<i>City of New York, et al. v. Morales, et al.</i> , Index No. 401937/12 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 31, 2016) (Bluth, J.); and <i>UFT, Local 2, AFT, AFL-CIO v. New York City Bd. of Coll. Bargaining, et al.</i> , Index No. 103612/12 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Mar. 31, 2016) (Bluth, J.)

5 OCB2d 35 (BCB 2012)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Sergeants Benev. Assn. v. City</i> , 2013 N.Y. Slip Op. 33389(U) (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 9, 2013) (Wooten, J.), <i>affd.</i> , 127 A.D.3d 666 (1 st Dept. 2015).
6 OCB2d 14 (BCB 2013)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York and DCAS v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining, et al.</i> , Index No. 451081/13 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Oct. 28, 2014) (Madden, J.).
6 OCB2d 19 (BCB 2013)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City of New York v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 451411/2013 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Aug. 14, 2014) (Freed, J.).
6 OCB2d 20 (BCB 2013)	withdrawn	<i>Matter of Brown v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 101148/2013 (Moulton, J.).
6 OCB2d 33 (BCB 2013)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining & Patrolmen's Benev. Assn.</i> , Index No. 400103/14 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. June 16, 2015) (Schechter, J.).
6 OCB2d 36 (BCB 2013)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City v. Patrolmen's Benev. Assn.</i> , Index Nos. 400091/14 and 100114/14 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Apr. 10, 2015) (Schlesinger, J.).
7 OCB2d 12 (BCB 2014)	affirmed	<i>Matter of City v. New York City Bd. of Collective Bargaining & UFT</i> , Index No. 451289/14 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. July 27, 2015) (Kotler, J.).
7 OCB2d 16 (BCB 2014)	affirmed	<i>Matter of Donas v. City of New York & New York City Office of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 101265/14 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. co. Oct. 23, 2015) (Wooten, J.).
7 OCB2d 19 (BCB 2014)	affirmed	<i>UFA of Greater New York, Local 94, IAFF, AFL-CIO v. City & New York City Bd. Of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index. No. 100798/2014 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. Dec. 12, 2014) (Kern, J.).
9 OCB2d 13 (BCB 2016)	pending	<i>UFA of Greater New York, Local 94, IAFF, AFL-CIO, et al. v. City & New York City Bd. Of Collective Bargaining</i> , Index No. 101104/2016 (Bannon, J.).
9 OCB2d 21 (BCB 2016)	pending	<i>Matter of Local 376, DC 37 v. New York City Bd. Of Collective Bargaining, et al.</i> , Index No. 101755/2016 (Billings, J.).

