

The SDGs and Scotland: a discussion paper and initial analysis

Project Leader: Dr Graham Long

Project team: Dr Emily Clough, Dr Sean Molloy, Elizabeth Muggleton, Jill Hardacre, Rike Bolam, Hattie Cansino, Louise Luxton

Summary

Context and purpose

- This report analyses how Scotland appears through the lens of the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), assessing aspects of the *alignment* between Scotland's data gathering and governance and the SDG targets and indicators, and of the *relevance* of these global goals for the specific Scottish context.
- It focuses on what can be said about *data availability*, *performance*, and *delivery landscape* in Scotland across the SDGs.
- It takes the 169 targets of the 17 SDGs, the global SDG indicator set, and the underpinning commitments to *universality*, *integration*, *'leave no one behind'* and *participation*, as the core of the SDGs
- It begins from a premise of high-level alignment between Scotland's approach to governance and the SDGs. *A high-level political commitment to the SDGs; an SDG-aligned national strategic framework; an underlying commitment to national well-being and good global citizenship, a commitment to participation and partnership* in implementation, and a number of initiatives that *focus on vulnerable and marginalised groups*, are all present in the Scottish context.
- A central issue is the balance between *universality* -the SDGs as a framework for all countries, and national *differentiation* – the recognition that SDGs are supposed to be nationally owned and adapted.
- Given this balance, policymaking, review and follow up in response to the SDGs are matters for the people of each country to discuss and determine; this consultant-led report is not a substitute for a national dialogue about what the SDGs should mean for Scotland. It is intended only as a starting point for such a discussion. In particular, where SDG targets and indicators are not suitable for the Scottish context, or where levels of ambition are imprecise in the SDGs, nationally-appropriate targets or metrics might be adopted.
- The Scottish government's status as a devolved administration in a wider UK and EU context is important for this report. Any assessment of gaps and problems should take into account the Scottish government's areas of competence.
- Time was a key constraint for this project. It meant specific expertise on law and policy for every SDG target could not be sourced, there was a limit to how much further investigation could be conducted, and specific kinds of inequalities – for example, those between rural/urban areas or regions of Scotland – could not be properly investigated.

Findings

The report offers findings (1) on data availability, performance, and to a lesser extent, delivery mechanisms, goal-by-goal and target-by-target in Scotland; (2) on alignment between the National Performance Framework (NPF) – as a key vehicle for delivery of the SDGs in Scotland – and the SDGs; and (3) on Scotland's international action in light of the SDGs.

(1) Goal-by-goal Analysis

Data availability: In general, there is plenty of data available across the goals that allows for an assessment of Scotland in SDG terms. Data availability for 90 of the (domestically-relevant) SDG indicators is rated as “strong”, and in a further 64 cases, “moderate”. Data availability – in terms of the availability of data that are the same as, or directly translate into the global SDG indicators - is best in goal 3 (health), 4 (education), and 7 (energy).

- In other goals, the situation is much more mixed. There are particular difficulties in finding data on food insecurity and undernourishment, especially in vulnerable groups. The economic and human cost of natural disasters is not easily accessible. Overall, data availability was rated as “poor” for 42 SDG indicators – though in some cases this reflects an SDG indicator that is still in development, or else relatively poorly defined.
- In some instances, disaggregated data for Scotland is not available, even though such data is available for the UK as a whole. For example, UK data on our ‘material footprint’ is available – in the context of a key target on decoupling economic growth and environmental degradation – but this data is not available for Scotland, and this is also the case for a measurement of energy intensity (in respect of energy efficiency) and the cost of migrant remittances (though migration is a UK reserved matter).
- Scotland might develop a stronger and more accessible set of official statistics on sustainable consumption and production, pollution and waste, where available data was limited.
- This exercise reveals some clear, specific data challenges: how to measure the effectiveness of interventions on substance abuse; measuring recognition of women’s unpaid care and domestic work; assessment of ‘hidden’ practises such as corruption and bribery, illicit flows, and Female Genital Mutilation.
- Many official statistics are disaggregated by sex, age, ethnicity and other protected characteristics. Migrant status is less well disaggregated, and the homeless as a marginalised and vulnerable group are not present in relevant statistics (e.g. poverty and food insecurity).

Performance: performance across the SDG targets where data is available is broadly comparable to the UK as a whole, though with some more positive areas, and some that are less positive.

- Some of the SDG targets that are emblematic of the development agenda are clearly met: for example on \$1.90/day poverty; maternal and neonatal mortality, wasting and stunting in children, access to clean water and sanitation.
- There are positive trends on a number of targets, which appear to be moving towards the SDG ambition – notably on mortality from non-communicable disease, water stress, water quality, energy share from renewables, youth not in education and training, mortality from air pollution, recycling rates, levels of violence, forest management, road safety. Often, Scotland performs better on these than the rest of the UK. Analysis of why this is true is out of scope of this research.
- On some SDG targets where clear ambitions are stated, Scotland is currently *not* on track to meet the SDG ambition; notably relative and multidimensional poverty, adequate housing, violence against women and girls, healthy diets and obesity. Levels of women in government are relatively static.
- The picture on environmental protection is generally relatively stable e.g. in terms of ecosystem health and fish stocks. However, relevant SDG targets are relatively clear and ambitious, requiring significant progress: in these cases, Scotland is currently not on track.

- The SDGs pledge to “leave no one behind”, and SDG review requires a focus on the poorest and most marginalised. In common with the rest of the UK, significant inequalities in outcome – both *identifying* and *reflecting* dimensions of socio-economic disadvantage and marginalisation - are evident across almost all areas where disaggregated data is available. Gender is also reflected in differentiated outcomes, as is intersectionality across different dimensions of disadvantage.

Delivery: There was no large or systematic gap identified in delivery – laws, plans, and policies are in place across all different SDG areas.

- Notably, where the content of plans, policies and laws are themselves the subject of SDG targets, these were almost always present in the Scottish context; e.g. on gender equality, sustainability in the educational curriculum; SDG-aligned national policy frameworks; inclusion of climate change in national planning; presence of a national human rights institution; presence of multi-stakeholder partnerships around sustainable development.
- The only area where policy seems to actively stand out against an SDG target is subsidies for offshore oil and gas production: this is a UK government competence.
- Clearly, there is scope to investigate implementation of the relevant plans, policies, and initiatives – for example, policies on gender equality, planning on inclusive growth, sustainable public procurement, the NPF as a vehicle for policy coherence, and policies on enhancing equality for vulnerable and marginalised groups, to see in detail how such strategies align and how effectively they have been implemented. This should be a focus for future work.

(2) The National Performance Framework

The NPF indicators were mapped against the SDG indicators and targets to test the alignment between these two frameworks. Overall, 15 out of the 81 (19%) National Outcome indicators had a ‘closely aligned’ SDG indicator. 29 of out of the 81 NPF indicators (36%) had ‘relevant’ SDG indicators.

- Thus, at the level of indicators, the NPF and SDGs are aligned, but not especially closely. One implication is that that Scotland could potentially be successful on the NPF without achieving the SDGs, and vice versa.
- Alignment varies by goal, with targets and indicators from goals 4 (education) and 8 (economy and decent work) best overlapping with the NPF. Goals 5 (gender) 10 (inequality) and 12 (sustainable consumption and production) are the least represented in the NPF. Scotland’s focus on community does not align closely with the SDG goal on cities (goal 11). As indicated above, a lack of alignment does not always indicate a problem, but the differences across these areas may warrant further discussion and study.
- In some cases, SDG indicators are more specific and action-focused and/or less perception-based compared to those in the NPF (e.g. ‘disease mortality’ vs ‘healthy life expectancy’; ‘level of recorded crime’ vs ‘perceptions of crime’). A comparison with the SDGs also highlights that several NPF indicators sit in clusters, especially around children’s wellbeing, culture, outdoor activity. The desirability of this clustering – in the context of gaps in alignment elsewhere – may also warrant further discussion.

- In general, and assuming that “what gets measured, gets done”, there might be scope to consider the merits and drawbacks of moving towards closer alignment with the SDGs in some of these areas.

(3) Scotland’s International Development Activity

- Analysed, in terms of six areas where the SDGs direct the international activity of developed countries, an initial overview of Scotland’s global role finds *no significant dis-alignment* with the SDGs:
- **Levels, sources, components and targets of development assistance** -The *focus of Scotland’s aid*, in terms of the country partners (3 of the 4 are landlocked least developed countries), the nature of the projects funded (covering a range of SDG priorities – a traditional development agenda, but also renewable energy and sustainable agriculture) and a funding stream for capacity building, clearly align with the SDGs
- **Global Governance and Regulation** - As a devolved administration, there are very clear limitations on Scotland’s potential role in the development of *global governance and regulation*: instead, the UK government is the appropriate duty holder in this respect.
- **Global cooperation and partnership** - Available policies and documents provide evidence that *cooperation and partnership* (e.g. partnership agreements with recipient countries) is embedded in Scotland’s international aid. A more detailed analysis would be required to determine how deep this ethos of partnership goes, and how fully Scotland’s aid projects “respect the policy space” of developing country partners.
- **Research and Technology Transfer** - It is unclear whether Scotland could do more to encourage or ensure *technology and research transfer* from Scottish Research & Development actors to developing countries. Some UK-wide structures and processes are relevant here as both enabling and constraining factors.
- **Leave No-one Behind** -The stated priorities of the projects funded by Scottish aid are inclusive of vulnerable and marginalised groups. How far “*leave no one behind*” – as a focus on reaching such groups - is built into the *detail* of these projects, though, is unclear without further investigation.
- **Policy Coherence for Sustainable Development** - There is a commitment in the International Aid strategy (as well as the NPF and other related strategies) to *policy coherence*. However, a more detailed analysis of where policy incoherence might arise, and how key synergies might be leveraged, is not present.

Contents

Introduction	7
Section 1 - Context: Agenda 2030 and Scotland	8
Section 2 – Methodology	17
Section 3 - Goal-by-Goal analysis: Scotland	21
Section 4 - NPF Analysis	61
Section 5 - The SDGs and Scotland’s International Action	73
Annex of SDG Goals, Targets, and Indicators	77

The project leader gratefully acknowledges the work of all the project team across the 5 weeks of the project, often in the context of competing duties. Emily Clough led on the drafting of the [Goal 11](#) analysis and co-authored the NPF analysis. Sean Molloy led on the analysis of [Goal 16](#). The rest of the team all contributed across a number of goal areas and undertook additional research duties across the project. Errors and omissions remain the sole responsibility of Graham Long as project leader: graham.long@ncl.ac.uk.

Introduction

This project aims to assess the current situation of Scotland in respect of the UN Sustainable Development Goals. Across the broad SDG agenda, it maps Scottish data and governance across the SDGs, focusing on different aspects of the alignment between the SDGs and the Scottish context – *data, performance, and delivery*. This exercise allows for an initial assessment of how much data is available for Scotland that speaks to the SDGs. And where data is available it identifies gaps and challenges in implementation, monitoring and policy frameworks, along with areas where Scotland performs well in the terms of the SDGs. There is a deeper question about how closely Scotland *should* be aligned to the SDGs – the SDGs, though universal, are explicitly meant to be nationally owned and adapted to different national contexts. Gaps in the alignment of monitoring systems, or apparently off-track performance, should prompt discussion and debate. These might simply be areas where Scotland is right to do things its own way, or set its own ambition – or they might be areas where the SDGs could usefully guide such ambition and action. What to make of the SDGs in Scotland, then, is a question for the people of Scotland themselves – a debate to which this discussion paper will only be one input.

The key research questions that this project aims to address are:

- Is data available to measure Scotland's performance on the SDGs?
- Is Scotland performing well or badly in terms of specific SDG targets and indicators, in terms of the ambition of the targets, and comparable data from the rest of the UK?
- What are the key components of the domestic delivery framework for each target?
- How well are the indicators of the National Performance Framework (NPF) aligned to the SDGs?
- Is Scotland's international development action well-aligned to the SDGs?

This discussion paper has been produced in the context of the UK's Voluntary National Review (VNR) of the SDGs, that the UK government will present to the UN later in 2019. VNRs should be rigorous, evidence-based assessments of progress on the SDGs, reflecting on challenges and achievements, that involve all levels of government and a wide range of stakeholders. They rely, though, on an ongoing national discussion around SDG performance, to which this paper is meant as a contribution. It contains five sections. The **first** sets out the context, in terms both of key features of the SDGs and some overall features of the Scottish context, notably overarching respects in which Scotland aligns with the SDGs, and the specific devolved character of Scottish governance. The **second** briefly sets out the methodology and limitations of the approach. The **third** goes goal by goal through the SDGs in Scotland, summarising relevant Scottish data, performance and delivery, and highlighting areas for further consideration. The **fourth** looks in more detail at the NPF as a key feature of Scotland's delivery of the SDGs. Finally, a **fifth** section briefly examines the overseas implications of the SDGs and how Scotland measures up to the *international* agenda of the SDGs.

Section 1: Context

Agenda 2030 and the SDGs

Transforming our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, as adopted by UN member states in September 2015, has at its heart 17 Sustainable Development Goals, setting out “a plan of action for people, planet and prosperity”¹



The SDGs are accompanied by a set of 232 global indicators, agreed as metrics for assessing global progress towards the SDGs. Using these indicators as a starting point, the project searches for data about the Scottish context that will allow for assessment of progress in Scotland, in ways that reflect these indicators and the targets they represent. The current global indicator set, it should be noted, is under development: the UN Inter-Agency and Expert Group on SDG indicators (IAEG-SDGs) continues to develop and refine definitions, methodologies, and arrangements for data collection.²

The 2030 Agenda contains a series of commitments by member states on follow up and review at all levels including national-level review. As noted above, a system of VNRs has been established, with countries reporting on a ‘rolling’ basis, in annual groups of 40-45. The basic expectation for a VNR is “to show what steps the country has taken to implement the 2030 Agenda... and provide an

¹ UN, *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development* (2015) (preamble).

<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/post2015/transformingourworld>

² UN Statistics Division, *IAEG-SDGs*:

Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (no date). <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/iaeg-sdgs/>

assessment of the results on the ground”.³ An assessment exercise like this paper can inform such a review by identifying apparent gaps or strengths and posing or sharpening questions of where the SDG agenda is nationally-relevant.

The goals, targets and indicators of the SDGs are situated in a wider set of commitments that are also important to any review or assessment (as found, for example, in the “guiding principles” for follow-up and review in Paragraph 74 of the 2030 Agenda). They are embodied in the text of particular targets, but also more generally applicable in policy making and in reviewing of the SDGs.

- the idea that the SDGs are **universal** – accepted by all, and applicable to all. Universality is a key difference from the Millennium Development Goals, which were oriented squarely towards developing countries.
- the **indivisibility and interdependence** of the goals. This can be interpreted, first, as a factual assertion – that, when considered closely, all the goals are linked. The 2030 Agenda does indeed make several such assertions, both for the framework as a whole and for individual goal areas. But the claim to indivisibility is also an injunction to treat the goals holistically in implementing and reviewing them – for example, not to prioritise one and ignore another – and so gives rise to the need for *policy coherence*.
- The **focus on poorest and most marginalised groups** – the pledge to “leave no one behind”. Certain components of the SDGs themselves are especially closely aligned to the demand that no one be left behind – that is, a particular focus on the poorest, most marginalised and disadvantaged. It is clearly visible in the way that [SDG 10](#) ‘Reduced Inequalities’ is expressed, for example in its focus on discrimination, and in [SDG 5](#) on ‘Gender Equality’. Elsewhere in the goals, particular marginalised groups are identified by name as special focuses for efforts and review (e.g. targets [2.3](#), [8.5](#), [8.8](#)). But it is established beyond the goals too – e.g. in the preamble where the overall aims of the SDGs are established, and the section on follow-up and review.
- The commitment **to implementation through partnership** at all levels – at the global level, a global partnership for sustainable development, but also participation and partnership with stakeholders within each country.

The Scottish Government’s response to the SDGs

Clearly, in some general respects, Scotland’s approach to governance does align with the SDGs. Much of the rest of the project concerns the details *of*, and gaps *in*, Scottish alignment with the SDGs, but this high-level, overall overlap should not be lost sight of. This is especially so in five key respects:

There is high level political commitment: First Minister Nicola Sturgeon committed Scotland to the SDGs in July 2015, writing “The SDGs themselves offer a vision of the world that I believe people in Scotland share. From ending poverty to combating inequality, the aims set out by the UN form an agenda for tackling some of the world’s greatest problems... I am delighted to confirm that Scotland has become one of the very first nations on Earth to publicly sign up to these goals and provide

³ UN, *Handbook for Preparation of Voluntary National Reviews: the 2019 edition* (2018), p20.
<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/vnrs/>

leadership on reducing inequality across the globe.”⁴ The Scottish government has embraced the SDGs as an agenda with *domestic* relevance more firmly and comprehensively than some other governments – notably, that of the UK.

There is an aligned national strategic framework: The National Performance Framework (NPF) comprising National Outcomes, and then Indicators for each of these outcomes is “part of Scotland’s efforts to meet these goals”.⁵ The framework has mapped the 17 goals onto its national outcomes, with the implication that achievement of these national outcomes will also realise the SDGs in the Scottish context. The refreshed National Performance Framework, launched in the summer of 2018, was reviewed by ministers to improve its alignment with the SDGs.⁶ It is worth noting the similarity in structure between the SDGs and the NPF: both setting wider, longer term objectives to be measured and realised through more specific outcomes and their associated indicators. Scotland’s International Development Strategy is also mapped against SDG objectives.⁷

There is a commitment to interlinked economic, environmental, and social objectives. Scotland’s ambition for a successful Scotland in economic terms, but also in social and environmental terms – a broader focus on national wellbeing beyond GDP – is also in agreement with the SDGs. At the launch of the refreshed NPF, for example, the First Minister put it thus: “As a government we recognise that economic growth is hugely important, but it must be matched by improvements in our environment, in people’s quality of life, in the opportunities available to people and the public services they have access to... the challenge this new framework sets us all is to make progress in these areas to improve wellbeing across Scotland.”⁸

There is a commitment to participation and partnerships. Scotland’s government aims to cultivate an open and participatory character: Scotland is a subnational Open Government Pioneer,⁹ with an action plan targeting increased participation by citizens in governance, including participatory budgeting. The new 2018-2020 action plan was made available on 5 December.¹⁰

This builds on the legal commitment in the Community Empowerment Act (Scotland)¹¹ and the emphasis placed on participatory democracy. There is a stakeholder network in Scotland mobilised

⁴ Nicola Sturgeon ‘Why Scotland is showing international leadership on tackling poverty and inequality’ *The Herald*, 19 July 2015
https://www.heraldsotland.com/opinion/13463831.Why_Scotland_is_showing_international_leadership_on_tackling_poverty_and_inequality/

⁵ Scottish Government, *National Performance Framework: Sustainable Development Goals* (no date).
<https://nationalperformance.gov.scot/sustainable-development-goals>

⁶ National Performance Framework, *Conference 2018: About the National Performance Framework* (no date).
<https://npfconference.scot/conf2018/about-npf.html>

⁷ Scottish Government, *Global Citizenship: Scotland’s International Development Strategy* (2016).
<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/publication/2016/12/global-citizenship-scotlands-international-development-strategy/documents/00512161-pdf/00512161-pdf/govscot%3Adocument>

⁸ Scottish Government, *A vision for national wellbeing* (2018). <https://www.gov.scot/news/a-vision-for-national-wellbeing/>

⁹ Scotland was one of 15 subnational governments committing to the Open Government Partnership’s Subnational Declaration in 2016, designated as “pioneers” and pledging to produce regular action plans on Open Government - <https://www.opengovpartnership.org/local>

¹⁰ UK Open Government Civil Society Network, *Scotland’s Action Plan on Open Government complete – launch coming soon!* (2018) <https://www.opengovernment.org.uk/2018/12/07/scotlands-action-plan-on-open-government-complete-launch-coming-soon/>

¹¹ Community Empowerment Act (Scotland) 2015
<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2015/6/contents/enacted>

around the SDGs and evidence of the Scottish government working with stakeholders including the private sector.

Efforts have been made to include vulnerable and marginalised groups. There are a range of initiatives on encouraging equality in Scotland – for example, the equalities finder that has been developed to accompany the National Performance Framework, allowing for access to available disaggregation of data through an inequality-focused lens, and the One Scotland initiative. The government has made several statements on the value of a fairer, more equal society, including achieving greater socio-economic equality through sustainable and inclusive growth.

Scotland and the UK, EU

A baseline assessment of the policy levers for delivery of SDG objectives in the Scottish context is complicated by Scotland's wider governance context. The Scottish Government and Parliament has a distinctive set of competences as a result of the devolution of powers from the UK parliament in Westminster. At the same time, UK has conferred some policymaking and regulatory competences on the EU (at least pending the outcome of the Brexit process) to the extent that in some policy areas – fisheries and agriculture, for example - the EU policy context arguably shapes Scottish implementation to a greater extent than the UK does.

This division of competences is important for two main reasons. The first is the demand, as part of Agenda 2030's focus on policy coherence, for *vertical integration* of policies for sustainable development. It should be clear that policies and approaches at any one level can be undermined or blocked by policies operating in opposite directions at different levels. The UN handbook for VNRs, for example, asks "what actions are being taken to ensure that all levels of government work together... vertically from national to local... to integrate the three dimensions and the SDGs?".¹² This governance context, then, places a premium on coordination.

Second, this shared yet differentiated responsibility for implementation of the SDGs means that Scottish government and parliament can be expected to act only in areas where it has competence, and only to the extent of that competence. Beyond this point, responsibility for SDG implementation (or absence of that implementation) can lie with the UK government - to be assessed in the context of the UK VNR for example - and the EU's approach to SDG implementation, as addressed in the EU's own Sustainable Development planning – most recently, the Commission's reflection paper *Towards a Sustainable Europe by 2030*.¹³

For those matters reserved to Scotland, a further set of systems and relationships of governance are evident. Local councils share the responsibility – or are primary actors - for delivering many SDG outcomes. The role of councils includes, among other things "Education, including pre-school and school education, and adult and community education; Social Work, including Community Care; Tackling inequalities and promoting social inclusion; Roads and transportation; Planning and the environment; Economic Development; Regulatory and protective services; Housing; Leisure and library services; Cultural services; and Waste management".¹⁴ The range of governance structures

¹² UN, *Handbook for Preparation of Voluntary National Reviews: the 2019 edition* (2018), p30.

<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/vnrs/>

¹³ European Commission "Towards a Sustainable Europe by 2030" (2019)

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/sites/beta-political/files/rp_sustainable_europe_30-01_en_web.pdf

¹⁴ COSLA, *Scottish Local Government* (no date). www.cosla.gov.uk/scottish-local-government

also include issue-specific partnerships around, say, health or education, from local to national levels.

In addition to Scottish devolution, the UK has conferred (along with other member states) certain competences on the EU. In particular areas, the EU has had a significant effect in constraining and directing UK and Scottish policy. In the following analysis, identified EU competences are categorised as *exclusive*, *shared* or *supporting*. Only the EU can act in areas where it has *exclusive* competence, such as the customs union and common commercial policy. In areas of *shared* competence (such as environment, energy, and transport) either the EU or Member States may act, but once the EU has acted, Member States may be prevented from acting (unless the EU explicitly ceases to act). In areas of *supporting* competence, such as industry, tourism and education, both the EU and the Member States may act, but action by the EU must be to support, coordinate or supplement Member State activities. Supporting competence (and coordinating competence as a type of support) does not prevent the Member States from taking action on their own. Clearly, this general exercise in categorisation, has limits and problems, not least, competences are not simply legally established, but also politically negotiated.

The relationship between UK, EU and Scottish competences can be uncertain, shifting, and contested, and clearly the context of Brexit looms large. Furthermore, it should be recognised that the Scottish Government can influence matters in a variety of ways beyond lawmaking. The following sections map SDG goal areas against the *formal* competences of these different actors in a broad manner.

Goal 1 (poverty and social protection)

Key aspects of social work and social security are reserved to Westminster – notably, Pensions and Pension Credit; Child Benefit; Jobseekers Allowance; Employment and Support Allowance; Housing Benefit; Income Support; Tax Credits and Universal Credit, but other aspects of the benefits system are devolved to an extent, including social security benefits such as Disability Living Allowance, Personal independence Payment, Carer’s Allowance, Severe Disablement Allowance, Discretionary Housing Payments and Winter Fuel Payments, fuel poverty schemes. Further devolution in 2016 extended the capacity of the Scottish Government to legislate in these areas, including discretionary powers to top up benefits in reserved areas such as Universal Credit. It also gave Scottish ministers powers in relation to Part 1 of the Equality Act 2010 (Public Sector Duty regarding socio-economic inequalities): the Fairer Scotland Duty was launched in April 2018.¹⁵

The EU’s competences in economic policy, social protection, fundamental rights and disbursement of EU funds are also relevant to this goal. The EU has supporting competence in matters of economic policy. Within the framework of the Europe 2020 Strategy and European Semester process, ‘policy coordination’ under the Open Method of Co-ordination can bear on economic and social protection strategies.

Goal 2 (food security, nutrition, and agriculture)

Food security is considered a matter of multidimensional poverty, and so covered by the division of economic and social security competences above. Promotion of healthy nutrition as a matter of public health is a devolved issue, where Scotland can and does legislate, as the later, detailed analysis of [goal 2](#) makes clear. Sustainable agriculture is a devolved area, but one heavily framed by

¹⁵ Scottish Government, *Fairer Scotland Duty: interim guidance for public bodies* (2018). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/fairer-scotland-duty-interim-guidance-public-bodies/>

European Union policy, in particularly the regulations and systems of the Common Agricultural Policy. Rural affairs generally are a devolved issue.

Goal 3 (Health)

NHS funding, health education, health services, medicine, public health and mental health are all devolved issues, as are aspects of the transport system that might bear on road traffic accidents - road signs, speed limits, drink drive limit, drinks pricing. The NHS in Scotland is managed by the government and overseen on a local level by fourteen NHS Boards which work across the country to plan, commission and deliver services, including those provided by GPs, dentists, community pharmacists and opticians, who are independent contractors. These boards work together with local authorities and the voluntary sector in providing services to local populations.

Goal 4 (Education)

All aspects of education and training are devolved matters, including early learning and childcare, schools, and both further and higher education. In fact, there are very few areas where education policy in Scotland and the rest of the UK overlaps, having been separate entities even before devolution in 1999; the national curriculum for example was never rolled out in Scotland. The responsibility for the delivery of education in Scotland lies with local authorities who are under a statutory obligation to ensure that there is an adequate provision of education in their areas. Article 165 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) provides that the EU has supporting competence in this area, including measures to support coordination, access, exchanges of information via vocational training.

Goal 5 (Gender equality)

Although legislation concerning gender equality is largely reserved for Westminster, Scotland has the power to set regulations in relation to the Public Sector Equality Duty¹⁶ in Scotland. The Scottish Human Rights Commission, accountable to the Scottish Parliament, is also responsible for all human rights issues that relate to devolved matters including those regarding women's rights. The Scottish Government also has the power to set funding for many areas which may have an effect on women's equality such as social services including childcare, education, training, economic development and employability.

Goal 6 (Water)

Scottish Water services are completely devolved to Holyrood. Scottish Water is responsible for providing water and waste water, and is held to account by the Scottish Parliament, whilst the Scottish Environment Protection Agency (SEPA) is responsible for its environmental protection and improvement. EU directives relating to water include the Bathing Water Directive, the Urban Waste Water Directive, the Drinking Water Directive, and the Water Framework Directive, collectively concerning the discharge of waste water, water quality and water resource management.

Goal 7 (Energy)

Energy policy is a matter reserved for Westminster, with the exception of regimes for the promotion of renewable energy; fuel poverty and energy efficiency schemes. For example, the Scottish Parliament have set their own goals concerning renewable energy and climate change in the Climate Change (Scotland) 2009 Act, which sets annual targets for reducing emissions year on year. They also

¹⁶ Scottish Government, *Mainstreaming equality: Scottish Government's equality duties* (2016).
<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-governments-equality-duties/>

fund bodies such as the Energy Investment Fund which invest in renewable energy sources, industries and projects. The EU has shared competence in the field of energy, reflected in EU targets for renewable and clean energy, and reduced energy consumption in each member state.

Goal 8 (Decent work, economic growth)

Whilst overall economic policy is a matter reserved for the UK parliament, the Scottish Government can and does promote and support industry and economic growth in different respects, not least through its devolved control over education, training, and tourism. There are currently three key strategic interventions aimed at improving employment opportunities within Scotland. These are employability, the youth training initiative, and developing Scotland's workforce which are promoted by the Scottish Government in partnership with local authorities and public bodies such as Skills Development Scotland.

The EU, too, has competences in economic policy and employment, gender equality, labour rights, education and training, industry, and tourism are all relevant to implementation of this goal area. In respect of equal pay for equal work or work of equal value, the EU has the competence to legislate: adopting "measures to ensure the application of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation, including the principle of equal pay for equal work or work of equal value."¹⁷ The EU also enjoys some competence to adopt measures setting minimum requirements in health and safety at work, conditions of work, social security and social protection of workers, and information and consultation of workers. However, significant qualifications are present, demonstrating a concern for preserving state control and autonomy on these issues.

Goal 9 (Infrastructure)

With the exception of the rail franchises, transport and infrastructural matters are devolved to the Scottish Parliament. In general, matters relating to road traffic and road transport are only reserved where there is a need to ensure consistency of treatment and approach between Scotland and the rest of the UK. Full details of devolved powers can be found in The House of Commons Briefing Paper, (2017) 'Transport in Scotland, Wales & Northern Ireland'.¹⁸ Relevant EU areas of competence include industry; research & development; regional infrastructure, and sustainable development with respect to industry.

Goal 10 (Reducing inequalities)

Equality legislation¹⁹ is largely reserved to the UK Government. However a framework to help public authorities meet the requirements of the public sector equality duty (section 149 of the 2010 Act) has been set by Scottish Ministers through regulations²⁰. The Regulations are aimed at supporting Scottish public authorities improve implementation of the public sector equality duty by requiring enhanced data collection and evaluation, as well as greater transparency and accountability. Enforcement of the 2012 Regulations is carried out by the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC). The Scotland Act 2016 devolved further powers on equal opportunities. Migration is a UK reserved matter, though Scotland can take a somewhat distinct approach to

¹⁷ Directive 2006/54/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council (2006) para 4. <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A32006L0054>

¹⁸ The House of Commons Briefing Paper, (2017) *Transport in Scotland, Wales & Northern Ireland* <https://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/SN03156>

¹⁹ [Equality Act 2010](https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/contents). <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/contents>

²⁰ [Equality Act 2010 \(Specific Duties\) \(Scotland\) Regulations 2012 \(as amended\)](#)

migration through its policies on integration of refugees,²¹ remittances, or the kinds of actions undertaken in the 2004 Fresh Talent Initiative.²² The EU shares a measure of competence to combat discrimination (including on grounds of gender) and ensure equal treatment.

Goal 11 (Cities)

Housing policy and building control are devolved: local government, including its structure, functions, and local-centre relations, are devolved matters. The City Deals are an important example of partnerships between UK and Scottish local and national government.

Goal 12 (Sustainable consumption and production, waste)

Waste management is a devolved area, as is sustainable development in school curricula. Scotland's national zero waste plan, published in 2010, sets targets for waste prevention, improved recycling and reuse in order to reduce waste sent to landfill; and has allocated £150m of funding to achieve these targets. Relevant areas of EU competence include the environment; the guiding commitments on sustainable development and their application within EU internal and external activity (including the purposes of EU funds); sustainability reporting under internal market: banking and finance; and energy, in the context of subsidies.

Goal 13 (Climate change)

Adaptation to climate change is a devolved area, as are strategies and initiatives to promote mitigation of climate change. The key role of the Scottish Parliament here is to implement the new Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 which commits to reduce Scotland's emissions levels by 80% by 2050. As part of the National Performance Framework the government has also committed to improving on a range of indicators in this area including the reduction of the overall ecological footprint, reducing the amount of waste sent to landfill, and improving public transport. Under Article 191, combating climate change is an explicit objective of EU environmental policy.

Goal 14 (Environmental protection – marine ecosystems)

Fisheries are a devolved and an EU matter. The marine environment in Scotland is covered by two acts transposed from the EU Marine Strategy Framework Directive, the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010 which covers its inshore waters and the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009 which covers the offshore waters. Common Fisheries Policy in respect of marine biological resources - and thus [goal 14](#) on oceans - are the places where responsibility for implementation falls most clearly on the EU. Inshore fisheries are only regulated by Scottish ministers in cases where the EU has not already legislated in this area.

Goal 15 (Environmental Protection – terrestrial ecosystems)

Both forestry and environmental protection are devolved matters. The Forestry Commission is key in enacting the Scottish Forestry Strategy. This body is funded by the Scottish Government with its policy and direction overseen by Scottish ministers. Sustainable development is an overarching objective for the EU, which is committed to a 'high level of protection and improvement of the

²¹ Scottish Government, *New Scots Refugee Integration Strategy 2018-2022*

<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/publication/2018/01/new-scots-refugee-integration-strategy-2018-2022/documents/00530097-pdf/00530097-pdf/govscot%3Adocument>

²² Scottish Executive *New Scots: attracting fresh talent to meet the challenge of growth*, 2004

quality of the environment’ (Article 3 of the Treaty on European Union).”²³ A range of European level laws protect nature and biodiversity²⁴

Goal 16 (Peace, justice, and governance)

Areas including civil justice, civil law and procedure, courts, criminal justice, criminal law and procedure, police, debt and bankruptcy, family law, freedom of information, legal aid, legal profession, licensing law and property law are devolved. Where [goal 16](#) also asks for an assessment of the quality of governance in Scotland, the Scottish national and local government apparatus is clearly the appropriate focus.

Goal 17 (Measures to support global implementation of the SDGs)

The goal on Means of Implementation is partly focused on actions in the global partnership. Here, reflecting Westminster’s authority over matters of foreign policy, the UK is the lead actor (though the EU is also active internationally, as set out, for example, in the 2017 Consensus on Development – *Our World, Our Dignity, Our Future*²⁵). It also partly reflects on the governance in Scotland, and on precisely the matters most at issue in the relationship between Scotland and Westminster, notably powers of taxation. While international relations is a reserved matter, the implementation and observation of international obligations is devolved.

²³ EUR-Lex, *Environment and climate change* (no date). https://eur-lex.europa.eu/summary/chapter/environment.html?root_default=SUM_1_CODED=20

²⁴ See EC, *Nature and Biodiversity Law* (2016).
http://ec.europa.eu/environment/nature/legislation/index_en.htm

²⁵ The European Union *Our World, Our Dignity, Our Future* (2017)
https://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/sites/devco/files/european-consensus-on-development-final-20170626_en.pdf

Section 2: Methodology

This section outlines the basic approach taken to researching the relevance of the SDGs to Scotland; some specificities of the methods used and judgements made in particular areas; and some of the limitations encountered.

Relevance – internal or external; a matter of data, performance, or delivery

The research takes the SDG agenda as defined by the *targets* beneath each of the 17 broad goal areas, of which there are 169. The research approach began with a split between domestically- and externally-applicable targets, with approximately 50 targets taken as externally applicable, and approximately 125 taken as internally applicable (including a small set considered, potentially, both external and internal). As noted, though the SDGs as a whole are universal – to be applied in every country - there is no expectation that every target applies equally to every country context. Notably, some of the targets under each goal area are focused on *means* of achieving the goal, and identified by letters rather than numbers. These often, though not always, specify a focus on developing countries (for example, “[8.a](#) - Increase Aid for Trade support for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, including through the Enhanced Integrated Framework for Trade-Related Technical Assistance to Least Developed Countries”). Other targets specifically reference global level outcomes or processes (for example “[10.6](#) - Ensure enhanced representation and voice for developing countries in decision-making in global international economic and financial institutions in order to deliver more effective, credible, accountable and legitimate institutions”). Targets such as [8.a](#) and [10.6](#), this analysis assumes, are relevant to Scotland largely as a matter of its international action. This initial division of targets into ‘domestic’ and ‘external’ categories forms the basis for the analysis. The results of the domestic-oriented assessment follow in Section 3, and the results of the external-oriented assessment in Section 5.

Given this split, it was an initial assumption that *all targets not specifically directed at the global level or developing countries were applicable to Scotland* (even though, in the final analysis, they are clearly not all equally significant as policy priorities). Here, the bar was deliberately set low so as not to prejudice where the relevance of the SDGs might lie. The SDG framework is (i) designed to be universal, (ii) especially focused on “hidden” poor and marginalised groups, and (iii) especially sensitive to inequalities in access and outcomes. Just because a target ambition is met on aggregate for Scotland, for example, does not mean it is met for *everyone*: Important inequalities can persist in how far the target is met by different groups or regions. Hence, this expansive, low bar approach was deemed preferable to one which concentrated on themes identified in existing Scottish policies and plans, or themes that are prominent in public debate in Scotland.

Looking for data available that relates to the SDGs allows us to:

- (i) answer the question of how Scotland performs across the SDGs;
- (ii) identify apparent gaps where data is not available on aspects of the SDG agenda; and
- (iii) suggest where an SDG indicator might measure something that may be worth capturing (that is, it appears superior to, or complementary to the metric present in available data sources for Scotland, but is not currently measured).

Data points on the SDG indicators are clearly relevant, then, to an assessment of how Scotland is doing, but exactly *how* depends on how Scotland chooses to own the SDGs: how it chooses to balance universality and differentiation of the framework.

Where data is available, it is possible to make a judgement on performance in Scotland, in respect of each target. Three bases for such judgements are employed in this project. **First**, a gap between current performance, and the ambition of the SDG target for 2030. The SDG targets are of uneven quality and are meant to be nationally owned, prioritised and adapted – nevertheless, a gap between this target and actual or projected attainment is one way in which performance on the SDGs is relevant to Scotland, but not the only one. **Second**, comparison of performance with other like and unlike nations is also relevant to an assessment of performance. In the context of this report, this is only done with the rest of the UK. **Third**, the injunction to “leave no one behind” here is also relevant. The extent of inequalities in performance for different social groupings is also an aspect of performance on SDG (or commensurable) indicators where we offer an assessment.

An SDG can be relevant for debate in Scotland, and subsequently for law, policy and governance, even where neither indicator nor target are clear - or where data is unavailable. The SDGs are an agenda of common issues, and as such might highlight a question which, even though tricky, and/or captured imperfectly in the wording of the SDG framework, is a matter for further discussion in the Scottish context.

Data availability

Given the limited timescale, the project team began by populating a data template to identify relevant Scottish data that addressed the SDG indicators for each target selected as domestically relevant. The team initially searched identified publicly accessible databases, and then extended that search to further official and non-official data sources. Further data disaggregation was explored as a way of honouring the SDGs’ focus on the poorest and most marginalised.

Data availability was assessed and graded, roughly, on a red/amber/green scale used in the sections on each goal. The assessment here was of both the quantity and quality of the data available, and how well it addressed the specific content of the SDG indicator. Plentiful, official, directly commensurable data was graded ‘green’; the presence of data relevant to the SDG indicator, though not closely expressed, was graded ‘amber’; cases of no or poor available relevant data was graded as ‘red’. Clearly, an element of judgement was involved in the textual analysis of whether a Scottish data source is aligned to a specific SDG indicator, especially where the SDG indicator itself is not especially well-formulated, or where ambiguity exists in the wording of the target or of the metrics involved. This measure is presented only as a general, at-a-glance guide to data availability, and cannot substitute for close assessment of all available data presented in the data compilation that accompanies this report.

Performance

The commentary offered on Scottish performance in the summary and under each goal allowed for acknowledgement of ambiguities over how performance was to be assessed. The SDG targets themselves are diverse. Some set zero or 100% targets (as in “[5.1](#) End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere” or “[3.8](#) Achieve universal health coverage”), some require proportionate reductions; some set threshold levels that Scotland may already surpass; some deliberately leave the required ambition vague. This, in itself, mitigates against any “one size fits all” model of assessment. All are to be met by a future date – meaning that a judgement of performance would in many cases need to be forward-looking, whether Scotland is making the required progress

to meet a target for 2030. All are open to national adaptation, prioritisation, and interpretation (e.g. where a target is already met, it might be that Scotland should adopt a more demanding one, informed by the performance of other relevantly similar but higher performing countries). Furthermore, how to account for a comparative element, and how great a role that should play in any assessment of performance, is itself a difficult judgement. Especially given these difficulties, any assessment of performance will be preliminary and aims only to inform future discussion. The project aims at assessment in terms of the three bases for judgement outlined on the preceding page. The clearest instances of poor performance or any trends away from SDG achievement can be highlighted, as can strong performance relative to the SDG target, especially where no particular social or economic groups fare especially badly.

Delivery

Performance on SDG indicators is relevant to an assessment of the adequacy of Scotland's framework of laws, policies and governance systems. In some cases, performance itself is to be understood in non-statistical terms, since some targets invite assessment of the presence of particular kinds of policies, institutions, or laws.

The project also aimed to assemble a picture of this delivery landscape, understood as the laws, policies, initiatives, responsible bodies and active stakeholders relevant to each SDG target. This is an area where the report can claim only limited success, as discussed under 'limitations' below.

Limitations

Some limitations arise from the SDG framework itself. The SDG targets and indicators are varied as a reflection of the broad and diverse sustainable development agenda. Some are effectively binary – a relevant framework is either in place, or not. Some indicators are imperfectly aligned with the targets they are designed to illuminate; methodologies and definitions for some indicators have yet to be agreed;²⁶ and as the results of a time-limited, inter-state negotiation, the targets are not always of the highest technical standard.²⁷

It is important to note that the inclusion of multiple indicators for specific targets can make it difficult to assess performance. As an example, target [16.1](#) – “significantly reduce all forms of violence and related death rates everywhere” - includes 4 indicators, some of which demonstrate improvements, while other show less improvement. That different indicators point to levels and direction of performance makes it difficult to offer an overall assessment.

On the Scottish side, particular challenges were encountered in the data gathering process. Scottish Government data is currently split across two sets of websites, in mid-migration. In some cases, data was updated during the lifespan of the project, or else due to be updated. Like the SDG global indicator set, the National Performance Framework has a number of indicators which are still under development. Past versions of the NPF, and past claims about what is measured in line with the NPF, can be found in different places on the Scottish Government and related web pages. Environmental

²⁶ As noted earlier, The Inter-agency and Expert Group on SDG Indicators (IAEG-SDGs) continues to develop a number of the SDG indicators where no internationally established methodology or standards are yet available (<https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/iaeg-sdgs/>)

²⁷ This is the finding, for example, of the International Council of Scientific Unions' analysis: ICSU, ISSC, *Review of the Sustainable Development Goals: The Science Perspective* (2015). <https://council.science/cms/2017/05/SDG-Report.pdf>

indicators are no longer gathered via the Scottish statistics service since 2017²⁸ (and it is unclear how far the environmental data gathered on Scotland's environment web, say,²⁹ address the SDG indicators in the same way). Overall, done on a short timescale, and necessarily without detailed consultation with a full range of relevant stakeholders, it cannot be expected that the report will identify every single potentially relevant metric, and every component of the delivery framework.

A detailed assessment of delivery of the SDGs in Scotland proved especially difficult. Without specialists in Scottish law and governance in each of the SDG areas, and within a limited timescale, there is always a risk that an important part of the delivery architecture would be missed. This is especially so because delivery is not just a matter of the presence of a relevant law or policy framework, for example, but also how effectively that framework is implemented and how it is monitored and reviewed. On the short timescale of the project, there was no prospect of revealing any more than the most superficial gaps in these respects. Assessment of this aspect is especially complex since the Scottish Government, even where it lacks competence to make law, can still influence debate, exerting persuasion, funding initiatives and convening stakeholders. These functions are relatively hard to track. Inevitably, the results of this brief review of delivery mechanisms is biased towards ones with a strong web presence and those linked to from official sources.

Lastly, though the data here covers some of the background material for a process of Voluntary National Review, it should be underscored that this report is not itself such a review. VNRs rely on a high level of stakeholder engagement throughout, and here the timescale has severely limited such engagement. VNRs make firmer judgements, and invite firmer judgements or counter-assessments from others, on challenges, best practices, and national priorities. It is not the place of this report to make firm assessments in such respects; instead, this report can only be a prelude to such an exercise in the Scottish context.

²⁸ "Scottish Environment Statistics Online database and Key Scottish Environment Statistics are no longer updated as of 30 September 2017." Scottish Government, *Environment Statistics*. <https://www2.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Environment>

²⁹ Scotland's Environment. <https://www.environment.gov.scot/>

Section 3: goal-by-goal analysis of the SDGs in Scotland

In this section, findings for each goal in terms of data availability, performance and delivery, are summarised. This analysis is inevitably selective in terms of the elements highlighted, and is meant to be read in conjunction with the extensive data compilation accompanying this report. Under the 'Data Availability' heading, we offer an assessment of the availability of data for Scotland for each applicable SDG indicator, rated from green (good) to red (poor or not present).

Each goal, target and indicator referred to in the text is linked to Annex A at the end of this paper. Annex A lists all targets and global indicators by goal.

Goal 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere

Goal 1 contains targets on extreme poverty and multidimensional relative poverty; also on universal social protection floors, rights to land and economic resources, and resilience of the poor and vulnerable.

Summary

The focus of this goal is poverty, in its extreme, nationally-defined and multidimensional forms. There is no evident extreme poverty (by global definitions) in Scotland, though there is significant multidimensional poverty and material deprivation. Data availability on poverty in Scotland is strong – it is more problematic on disaster loss accounting and the budgeting on measures to benefit marginalised groups. Rates of poverty (by national definition) are lower in Scotland than the rest of the UK. However, the SDG sets a specific, demanding target on poverty reduction that Scotland does not currently appear on track to meet.

Data Availability

1.1.1	1.2.1	1.2.2	1.3.1	1.4.1	1.4.2	1.5.1	1.5.2	1.5.3	1.5.4	1.b.1

Data availability commentary

Overall data availability for the targets under this goal is very good. Scotland's robust official national statistics closely align with the global SDG indicators on poverty, and on households with access to basic services and secure tenure as understood in the Scottish context. Whilst there is no statistical evidence of extreme poverty (\$1.90 per day) in Scotland (indicator [1.1.1](#)), statistics are collected on those in severe poverty. In terms of gaps, we found little official data on potential gaps in Scotland's social protection floor and the cost – both economic and human - of natural disasters. SDG indicator [1.b.1](#) on the proportion of government expenditure directed to benefiting the poorest and most marginalised is hard to assess, but might be a potent measure of a commitment to "leave no one behind" in the Scottish context.

The picture on disaggregation is mixed (as for the UK generally). Disaggregation of poverty statistics is available – e.g. on lines of age (older persons and child poverty), gender, ethnicity: beyond the poverty indicators, though, little disaggregation is readily available. The SDGs also invite disaggregation by migrant status, and we found this to be unavailable. Perhaps the largest single data gap is the lack of data on homeless people – who might be most at risk in terms of extreme poverty, lack of access to basic services, and unfulfilled economic rights.

Performance

On poverty, severe poverty after housing costs appears to be increasing in 2015/16 compared to 2014/15. After Housing Costs, 14 per cent of people in Scotland were living in severe poverty in 2015/16. On the data available, though, no one is found to be living on less than \$1.90/day. SDG target [1.2](#) has a clear ambition of halving poverty on national definitions. The long term trend for

Scotland is positive, though the shorter term trend appears stable or negative: “After housing costs, 19% of Scotland’s population, or 1 million people each year, were living in poverty in 2014-17, the same as in 2013-16”.³⁰ On this evidence, there is insufficient progress towards the SDG target, though Scotland has a lower proportion of people of all ages in poverty of all forms than the rest of the UK, so that performance by the standard of the rest of the UK looks positive. As with the rest of the UK, though, households with one or more persons with disabilities, or from minority ethnic backgrounds, are more exposed to poverty. Elsewhere, Scotland realises the SDG ambition on the presence of an effective social protection floor and access to basic services (targets [1.3](#) and [1.4](#)). Though the SDG target and indicator on land rights are imperfect for the Scottish context ([1.4](#), [1.4.2](#)), Scottish Government analysis of the relationship between home ownership and tenancy, and poverty, shows correlation: “Before housing costs, those living in the social rented sector have the highest rates of poverty (28%), with those in the private rented sector (24%) and owner occupiers having lower levels of poverty”. After housing costs, too, poverty rates increase more dramatically for those in the private rented sector (14 percentage points), contrasted with those in social rented accommodation 10 percentage points).³¹

Prevalence of homelessness – as a particular group likely to be marginalised in terms of poverty, coverage by social protection measures and economic rights - is an area where data appears hard to come by. Data on homelessness applications suggest these have fallen over the last 10 years, though there were 34,972 homelessness applications recorded in Scotland between April 2017 and March 2018.

Target [1.5](#) addresses disaster risk reduction and reduced vulnerability to climate shock for the poorest. Planning and contingency measures for disasters are robust in Scotland on available data, though the state of reporting on this is less certain.

Delivery

There are no obvious or clear deficiencies in delivery around poverty alleviation and coverage of the social protection floor at the Scottish level. Issues of poverty and social protection as matters of benefit structure are to a large degree UK-level issues (for example, in the recent move to Universal Credit), though the Scottish Parliament has increased devolved powers in this area as of The Social Security (Scotland) Act (2018).³² The Child Poverty (Scotland) Act 2017³³ set targets for the eradication of child poverty by 2030 and places duties on Scottish Ministers to prepare delivery plans regularly, and report annually on progress. There are further Scottish policies and initiatives in place - a Strategic Initiative on ‘Social Inclusion and Poverty Reduction’; the *Fairer Scotland Action Plan*³⁴ that details 50 poverty reduction measures; and government campaigns to maximise benefit take-

³⁰ Scottish Government, *Poverty and income inequality in Scotland: 2014-2017* (2018).

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/poverty-income-inequality-scotland-2014-17/pages/4/>

³¹ Scottish Government, *Poverty equality analysis* (2017).

<https://www2.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Social-Welfare/IncomePoverty/CoreAnalysis/povertyanalysis>

³² Social Security (Scotland) Act (2018): <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2018/9/enacted>

³³ Child Poverty (Scotland) Act 2017: <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2017/6/contents/enacted>

³⁴ Scottish Government, *Fairer Scotland Action Plan* (2016). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/fairer-scotland-action-plan/>

up. A number of organisations collect disaster loss data in Scotland: a 2018 report for the National Centre for Resilience characterises data collection as “fragmented” and “sometimes sporadic”.³⁵

The Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015³⁶ obliges Community Planning Partnerships to plan for improved local outcomes with a view to reducing inequalities of outcome, through the participation of socio-economically disadvantaged groups. While Community Planning Partnerships are not required to pursue nationally set priorities, several Community Planning Partnerships (including Dundee, North Ayrshire and Renfrewshire) have set up Fairness Commissions in recent years, to consider ways to tackle poverty.

³⁵ O. Gunawan, T. Aldridge *Disaster Loss Data Management in Scotland* (2018)

http://www.naturalhazardspartnership.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/Disaster-loss-databases_FINAL.pdf

³⁶ Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015

<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2015/6/contents/enacted>

Goal 2: End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture

SDG 2 offers targets on ending hunger and malnutrition, improving the livelihoods of small-scale farmers, and ensuring the environmental sustainability of agricultural practices.

Summary

This is an important goal for Scotland. There is plentiful data available on aspects of malnutrition, especially obesity and diet, and on these metrics. Scotland is a long way from ending these forms of malnutrition, and also fares more poorly than England. Available disaggregation suggests pockets of under-nourishment as well as the effects of social deprivation. Official and non-official data show that food insecurity is experienced by some people in Scotland. Elsewhere, levels of environmentally sustainable agriculture in Scotland are positive, as is the trend. There is plentiful evidence of government and third sector activity to address nutrition, but it is impossible, here, to assess whether these responses will “end all forms of malnutrition” (target [2.2](#)) by 2030.

Data Availability

2.1.1	2.1.2	2.2.1	2.2.2	2.3.1	2.3.2	2.4.1	2.5.1	2.5.2

Data availability commentary

Data availability across the goal is mixed. Data availability on undernourishment and malnutrition is very good, generally. There is plentiful statistical evidence on obesity and quality of diet in Scotland, which are two of the most prevalent nutrition-related issues. Some disaggregation (e.g. by gender, age, social deprivation) is available. Data on food insecurity is available for 2017, allowing for an assessment of prevalence, but not trend. Data on stunting and undernourishment, especially amongst the elderly, is absent, despite indication that the latter is an issue at the UK scale. There is little data accessible on the livelihoods of small-scale farmers in particular, despite good data availability on productivity and income across Scottish agriculture as a whole. The significance of this gap depends on whether small-scale producers, as in target [2.3](#) - “By 2030, double the agricultural productivity and incomes of small-scale food producers, in particular women, indigenous peoples, family farmers, pastoralists and fishers, including through secure and equal access to land, other productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services, markets and opportunities for value addition and non-farm employment” - merit specific focus. A range of data is available speaking to the sustainability of Scottish agriculture, and it shows a positive picture, with increasing amounts of land “under management contracts” supportive of improved water and soil management, and biodiversity and landscape.³⁷ However, sustainable agriculture is a complex and contested term amongst scientists and practitioners³⁸, raising problems for measurement.

³⁷ Scottish Government *Scottish Rural Development Programme Annual Report (2017)*
p7<https://www2.gov.scot/Resource/0053/00539195.pdf>

³⁸ See for example, S. Velten, J. Leventon, N. Jager and J. Newig “What Is Sustainable Agriculture? A Systematic Review” *Sustainability*, 2015 7, 7833-7865

Performance

Available data on malnutrition, food security and undernourishment indicates that Scotland is a good distance from the SDG target ambitions (2.1, 2.2) of ending hunger and malnutrition; furthermore, that Scotland fares relatively badly in some of these areas compared to the rest of the UK. Latest data from 2017³⁹ indicates that around two thirds (65%) of adults were overweight or obese (BMI of 25 kg/m² or greater). This has remained stable since 2008 (fluctuating between 64% and 65%). Within this, the figures are 68% for men and 62% for women, compared to men - 66%, women - 57% for England, 2018. Comparison of Scottish Health Survey and Health Survey for England data shows that consumption of five or more portions of fruit and vegetables per day was 6% higher in England than Scotland across all age groups. In the 2017 Scottish Health Survey, 8% of adults reported experiencing food insecurity; that figure rises to 18% in deprived areas.⁴⁰ Moderate and severe food insecurity can be further assessed through figures on food bank access: "Between April 2016 and March 2017, The Trussell Trust's foodbank network in Scotland provided 145,865 three day emergency food supplies to people in crisis. 47,955 of these went to children."⁴¹ Disaggregation shows similar trends and problems to that for the UK more generally. Children from deprived areas in Scotland are less likely to have a healthy weight: in 2016/17, 73% of children from the most deprived areas had a healthy weight compared to 81% of those from the least deprived areas.⁴² In the least deprived quintile, 25% of adults were meeting daily fruit and vegetable consumption guidelines compared with only 13% in the most deprived quintile.⁴³

The picture on the environmental sustainability of agriculture in Scotland, by relevant available metric is positive. The *Scottish Rural Development Programme Annual Report* (2017) shows percentage of agricultural land under contract for a sustainability practice as increasing, 2014-2017, across all contract types. The definition of sustainable agriculture, though, is difficult, as is comparison with the rest of the UK due to the prevalence of different soil types and farming practices.

It remains unclear whether the SDG target (2.3) on doubling the productivity and income of small-scale farmers with a focus on the livelihoods of women, in particular, is considered relevant to the Scottish context. This seems currently under-measured and under-implemented. Even if the detail of the target itself is considered inapplicable (e.g. if it is unrealistic or not needed) there might still be issues here for further examination, since the data shows gender disparities and a special focus on crofting might be warranted.

Delivery

³⁹ Scottish Government, *Scottish health survey 2017: key findings* (2018).

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-health-survey-2017-summary-key-findings/pages/9/>

⁴⁰ Scottish Government, *Scottish health survey, 2017: main report*, pp 225-227

<https://www2.gov.scot/Resource/0054/00540654.pdf>

⁴¹ The Trussell Trust 'Non-food provision' in *The Trussell Trust Network in Scotland*

<https://www.trusselltrust.org/2017/12/06/non-food-provision-in-scotland/>

⁴² NHS Scotland Information Services Division *Body Mass Index of Primary 1 Children in Scotland*

(2017) <https://www.isdscotland.org/Health-Topics/Child-Health/Publications/2017-12-12/2017-12-12-P1-BMI-Statistics-Publication-Report.pdf>

⁴³ Public Health Information for Scotland *Diet and nutrition: Adults* (2017)

<https://www.scotpho.org.uk/behaviour/diet-and-nutrition/data/adults>

A number of policies and initiatives aim to tackle obesity and diet as public health issues, for example the Scottish Government published *A Healthier Future: Scotland's Diet & Healthy Weight Delivery Plan* in July 2018.⁴⁴ Legislation to reflect the ambition of becoming a “good food nation” is planned, with a further consultation to be under way in late 2018. The role of third-party stakeholders in both food provision and efforts to increase food education is significant, and noted as an avenue for expansion in the Scottish Government’s Independent Working Group on Food Poverty in 2016. The Scottish Government promises ‘an enhanced £2 million fund to respond to food insecurity during the school holidays’ working with COSLA, local authorities, the third sector and other stakeholders’.⁴⁵

Sustainable agriculture in Scotland is a devolved responsibility, but heavily shaped by integration with the EU Common Agricultural Policy. The Rural Development Programme and Basic Payment Scheme both offer payments to farmers for sustainable agricultural practices. SEPA’s regulations and guidelines focus on sustainability.⁴⁶ The extensive laws covering land use in Scotland cover issues such as farm pollution through a focus on water use, pesticide use, and waste disposal.⁴⁷

⁴⁴ Scottish Government, *A Healthier Future: Scotland's Diet & Healthy Weight Delivery Plan* (2018). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/healthier-future-scotlands-diet-healthy-weight-delivery-plan/>

⁴⁵ Scottish Government, *Good Food Nation: Programme of Measures* (2018), p.10. <https://www.gov.scot/publications/good-food-nation-programme-of-measures/>

⁴⁶ SEPA (Scottish Environment Protection Agency), *Agricultural Regulation and Guidance* (no date). <https://www.sepa.org.uk/regulations/land/agriculture/agricultural-regulation-and-guidance/>

⁴⁷ NetRegs *Scotland Environmental Legislation: Land* (no date). <http://www.netregs.org.uk/legislation/scotland-environmental-legislation/current-legislation/land/>

Goal 3: Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages

Goal 3 contains relatively specific targets on aspects of health, including maternal and neonatal mortality, mortality from non-communicable diseases, substance and alcohol abuse and smoking, sexual and reproductive health and rights, and road traffic accidents.

Summary

Data availability across this goal is generally good, and most outcomes for Scotland show a positive trend. Substance and alcohol abuse and tobacco-related deaths are represented in [goal 3](#) by imprecise targets and indicators, some of which are not clearly applicable to Scotland. Nevertheless, from a Scottish standpoint, these clearly remain important issues, especially in the context of marginalised and vulnerable groups in Scotland.

Data Availability

3.1.1	3.1.2	3.2.1	3.2.2	3.3.1	3.3.2	3.3.3	3.3.4	3.3.5	3.4.1	3.4.2	3.5.1	3.5.2	3.6.1	3.7.1	3.7.2	3.8.1	3.8.2	3.9.1	3.9.2	3.9.3	3.a.1	3.d.1

Data availability commentary

Overall, data availability across this goal is very strong. Extensive disaggregation is available, including across age, gender, ethnicity, for many of these measures. In one instance, the SDG indicator itself lacks clarity - [3.5.1](#). But what it is attempting to measure – i.e. the uptake and effectiveness of substance abuse interventions - is important in the Scottish context and official data is not easily available. Target [3.7](#) on sexual and reproductive health and rights is hard to measure, and the SDG indicators are imperfect. There is an estimate of unmet Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights need for the UK, but an accurate figure for Scotland is not available.

Performance

On maternal and child mortality, the SDG ambition is fully met by Scotland. With extremely low numbers, a discernible trend is hard to pick out and comparison with the rest of the UK shows no significant long term disparity.

Universal health care is considered to be fully present in Scotland, although as of 2017 “Inequalities in health status are increasing within Scotland (as seen, for example, in significantly greater increases in life expectancy in more affluent parts of Scotland compared to the least affluent)”.⁴⁸

Mortality rates for the specific non-communicable diseases targeted by SDG target [3.4](#) and the suicide rate are on the whole decreasing. Mortality rates from cardiovascular disease, cancer, and chronic respiratory disease are decreasing and in these instances Scotland may well be on track to

⁴⁸ Scot PHO (The Scottish Public Health Observatory) *Health Inequalities: Introduction* (2018). <https://www.scotpho.org.uk/comparative-health/health-inequalities/introduction/>

meet the SDG ambition of a one-third reduction by 2030. However, all of these – and diabetes – represent significant health challenges for Scotland, as for the rest of the UK. Suicide rates have decreased generally since 2000. Disaggregation reveals significant disparities: “In 2017, the suicide rate for males was more than three times that for females, and In 2013-17, the suicide rate was more than two-and-a-half times higher in the most deprived tenth of the population (decile) compared to the least deprived decile (21.9 deaths per 100,000 population compared to 7.6).”⁴⁹ Overall, suicide rates remain strongly related to level of deprivation. Mortality rates (and suicide rates, though differences in measurement are a significant factor) are higher in Scotland than the rest of the UK for some of these diseases. Social deprivation is clearly visible as a factor in disaggregated data.

Target 3.5 on alcohol and substance abuse is vague in its ambition to “strengthen prevention and treatment” but is clearly relevant to the Scottish context. Scottish alcohol consumption is higher than that for the UK generally (though decreasing). “In 2016, alcohol-specific death rates were more than twice as high in men and 75% higher in women in Scotland compared with England & Wales.”⁵⁰ Smoking-related deaths rates are also worse for Scotland than for the rest of the UK. Despite the difficult phrasing of target 3.a – to “strengthen implementation” of a specific World Health Organisation Framework Convention on smoking, this issue is clearly relevant in the Scottish context.

On road deaths, the long-term trend is downwards, with the 2017 figure⁵¹ indicating a 50% reduction in fatal injuries, a 39% reduction in serious injuries and a 61% reduction in child fatalities compared to the 2004-2008 baseline used in Scotland’s Road safety Framework. The trend on teenage pregnancy, an indicator on target 3.7 – women’s reproductive health and rights is downwards over time from 54.8 per 1000 in 2001 to 31.6 per 1000 in 2016.⁵²

Delivery

Health is a devolved responsibility of the Scottish Government, and NHS Scotland is a key actor. As the data compilation details, there are range of policies and initiatives in place across all aspects of the health landscape, for example *Heart Disease Improvement Plan 2014*,⁵³ the *Diabetes Improvement Plan Nov 2014*,⁵⁴ the *Suicide Prevention Action Plan 2018*,⁵⁵ and the 2017 *Mental Health Strategy*.⁵⁶ Third sector stakeholders and cross-parliamentary groups are present on many of these areas.

⁴⁹ Scot PHO (The Scottish Public Health Observatory) *Suicide: Key Points* (2018).

<https://www.scotpho.org.uk/health-wellbeing-and-disease/suicide/key-points/>

⁵⁰ L. Giles & M. Robinson, *Monitoring and Evaluating Scotland’s Alcohol Strategy: Monitoring Report 2018*. NHS Health Scotland (2018) p17. <http://www.healthscotland.scot/media/1863/mesas-monitoring-report-2018.pdf>

⁵¹ Reported Road Casualties Scotland 2017 <https://www.transport.gov.scot/media/43355/sct09184702081.pdf>

⁵² NHS National Services Scotland: Information Services Division, *Teenage Pregnancy - Year of conception ending 31 December 2016* (2018) p.5 Table 1. <https://www.isdscotland.org/Health-Topics/Sexual-Health/Publications/2018-07-03/2018-07-03-TeenPreg-Report.pdf>

⁵³ Scottish Government, *Heart Disease Improvement Plan* (2014).

<http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2014/08/5434>

⁵⁴ Scottish Government, *Diabetes Improvement Plan* (2014). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/diabetes-improvement-plan/>

⁵⁵ Scottish Government, *Suicide prevention action plan: every life matters*

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-suicide-prevention-action-plan-life-matters/>

⁵⁶ Scottish Government, *Mental Health Strategy 2017-2027* (2017).

<http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/03/1750>

Goal 4: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

Goal 4 targets access to training and all levels of education, and educational outcomes. It also has a focus on gender parity and inclusion, and targets on teaching staff and school infrastructure.

Summary

Scotland performs well on this goal, both by the ambition of the SDG targets and comparison to the rest of the UK. Comprehensive, commensurable data is available. Provision of quality educational facilities and the gaps in educational outcomes revealed by data disaggregation might be especial areas of focus within this larger picture.

Data Availability

4.1.1	4.2.1	4.2.2	4.3.1	4.4.1	4.5.1	4.6.1	4.7.1	4.a.1

Data availability commentary

Data availability is very good across this goal, and there is extensive disaggregation of data by characteristics including gender and ethnicity. Where the data does not quite fit the SDG indicator, this is the result of a specific national interpretation of a less stretching (in developed country contexts) SDG target.

Performance

Performance on [4.1.1](#) is good – Scotland sets expected levels of attainment beyond the minimum specified in [4.1.1](#). Overall performance is similar to previous years: around 85 per cent of pupils achieved the expected ‘Curriculum for Excellence’ (CfE) level for their relevant stage in listening and talking; at least 75 per cent for numeracy and reading and over 70 per cent for writing. Clearly, though, available data underscores the impact of disadvantage on achievement: a higher proportion of pupils living in the least deprived areas achieved the expected CfE level compared to pupils from the most deprived areas, with this gap widening throughout the primary stages. Females perform better than males at every level. The performance for children developmentally on track is improving over time, and access to pre-primary provision is very good, with near-universal uptake of funded places in 2017 (99%). A high proportion of 16-19-year olds are in education or training, and this proportion is rising. On ICT skills in particular, digital competency is higher than for the wider UK (81% of adults) and enrolment on computing science courses has increased by 10%, in line with the “significant increase” demanded by target 4.4. Data also suggests a gender division: only 19% of Higher computing students in 2015 were females. Parity between social groupings is a key target under this goal, and here the impact of social deprivation, and also the apparent correlation with ethnicity, indicate significant challenges. For example, the Scottish Government’s Pupil Census

shows that for the year 2010/11, white UK, white other, black and other pupils did worst. Chinese pupils performed best by a wide margin, followed by Asian other, mixed, Indian and Pakistani pupils.

Sustainability education is integrated into the curriculum, though we found no data on how effectively that policy had been implemented (such data might be found through further investigation – e.g. in school inspection reports). Target 4.a on quality school facilities seems relevant to the Scottish context: the proportion of pupils in an education environment of “good” or “satisfactory” suitability increased from 78 per cent in April 2011 to 84.0 per cent in April 2017 but there might still be considered room for improvement on the universal provision identified in target 4.a.

Delivery

The Education (Scotland) Act 2016 is a piece of key legislation, and “includes provisions for strategic planning to consider socio-economic barriers to learning”. The UK Equality Act (2010) outlines duties for schools.⁵⁷ Government strategies focus on equitable education for all children, and adult literacy .e.g. *Adult Literacy in Scotland (ALIS) 2020*.⁵⁸ *Realising Scotland’s Full Potential in a Digital World* is the main digital policy for ICT skills and infrastructure.⁵⁹

The Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) Education and Training strategy published in October 2017⁶⁰ includes a range of actions to tackle gender inequality in education. This includes the expansion of the Improving Gender Balance project across all schools, and the introduction of new Gender Balance and Equalities Officers in Education Scotland. On sustainability education, the Scottish Government has committed to taking forward the recommendations of the concluding report of the Learning for Sustainability National Implementation Group – Vision 2030+.⁶¹

⁵⁷ The Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations - 2012 <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2012/162/contents/made> – places additional duties on the Scottish Government in some of these respects.

⁵⁸ Scottish Government, *Adult Literacies in Scotland 2020: Strategic Guidance* (2010). <http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2011/01/25121451/0>

⁵⁹ Scottish Government, *Realising Scotland's full potential in a digital world: a digital strategy for Scotland* (2017). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/realising-scotlands-full-potential-digital-world-digital-strategy-scotland/>

⁶⁰ Scottish Government *Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) Education and Training strategy* (2017) <https://www.gov.scot/policies/science-and-research/stem-education-training>

⁶¹ Learning for Sustainability National Implementation Group, *Vision 2030+* (2016). <https://education.gov.scot/improvement/documents/res1-vision-2030.pdf>

Goal 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

Goal 5 contains targets on gender-based violence and discrimination, early and forced marriage, FGM, Sexual and reproductive health and rights, unpaid domestic and care work, and women's equal participation in public life.

Summary

This goal has ambitious targets on gender violence and women's participation, and by those ambitions, Scotland's performance must improve. Elsewhere, this goal has some challenging issues to measure, most notably on recognition of unpaid domestic and care work, where there might be scope for further national discussion – e.g. to inform further development of Scotland's gender index and ongoing action on gender equality.

Data Availability

5.1.1	5.2.1	5.2.2	5.3.1	5.3.2	5.4.1	5.5.1	5.5.2	5.6.1	5.6.2	5.a.1	5.a.2	5.b.1	5.c.1

Data availability commentary

Official data is available for key indicators here, including violence against women and girls and women's representation. Gender equality is clearly enshrined in law, as reflected in three of the non-statistical indicators here. In more specific areas, data is harder to source: notably, on early marriage and Female Genital Mutilation. There is a gap in available information on data for 16-18-year olds for Scotland, whereas information is available for the UK as a whole. No direct data on FGM is available. There is data on women's employment and on women carers, but not enough to illuminate progress on this indicator – ([5.4.1](#) – “proportion of time spent on unpaid domestic and care work, by sex, age, and location”), nor does this data appear to be collected regularly or systematically to allow for a judgement on trend. It is clear that a greater proportion of carers are women, and that the proportion of women in part time employment is higher, for example, but a systematic focus on time spent on domestic and care labour is not present. Linking to the observations on agriculture under [goal 2](#), gender disaggregated statistics on women in agriculture are not easily accessible. As under [goal 2](#), a focus on women's role in rural life might also be appropriate, though equal legal rights are guaranteed.

Performance

Clearly, Scotland has a legal framework for gender equality in place. We find a steady trend for recorded abuse by intimate partners ([5.2.1](#)), and a long-term upward trend in sexual violence ([5.2.2](#)) in the context of an ambitious SDG target of ending violence against women and girls by 2030. Scotland performs better here than the rest of the UK, but still performance is clearly not good and the comparison with the relevant SDG target underscores this. Factors such as an increased willingness to report sexual violence, and improved recording procedures, have been suggested as partial explanations for this upward trend in the UK, though there is also good reason to think that

sexual violence remains especially under-reported.⁶² The value of unpaid care and domestic work, and the indicators beneath this target is an area partly evidenced by public service provision and policy (5.4), and in the light of limited data, this would merit deeper, more systematic analysis. Women's participation and leadership in parliament is relatively good compared to the UK as a whole - 45 (34.8%) seats in Holyrood held by women were held by women in 2016-7,⁶³ though none of these are from minority ethnic backgrounds, and there is no evident upwards trend here. In local government, the picture is slightly worse: 29% of councillors are women⁶⁴ compared to England (33%) & Wales (28%).⁶⁵ Only 7/36 council leaders (including joint leaders) are women.⁶⁶

Delivery

The UK Equality Act, along with policies and frameworks to mainstream equality in different fields, are important aspects of delivery. Given the limits of gender disaggregation, the Gender Index (see below) is an incredibly important activity. The Female Genital Mutilation (Scotland) Act 2005 criminalises FGM, and a National Action Plan is in place.⁶⁷ The Scottish government has adopted a national strategy to prevent and eradicate violence against women and girls.⁶⁸

The Scottish Government are currently producing a Gender Index that brings together a range of indicators on inequalities facing both women and men in Scotland. The areas to be measured are: work, money, knowledge, time, power, health, violence, and intersecting inequalities. Disaggregation for urban/rural context and lower income groups is also noted as a priority. Currently work is being undertaken by the Scottish Government in conjunction with key stakeholders to assess where the largest data gaps are for Scotland for each indicator, and to improve indicators to make them more applicable for Scotland. Most documentation of the index, it appears, is provided by working papers and there has so far been no parliamentary review.⁶⁹

The First Minister has also set up a National Advisory Council on Women and Girls in November 2017. The role of this council is to raise awareness of gender inequality across all of Scotland, push

⁶² On both of these kinds of considerations, see ONS, *Sexual Offences in England and Wales, year ending March 2017*

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/crimeandjustice/articles/sexualoffencesinenglandandwales/yearendingmarch2017>

⁶³ The Scottish Parliament, *Scottish Parliament Statistics 2016-2017* (2018).

http://www.parliament.scot/SPICeResources/SPStatistics_16-17.pdf

⁶⁴ C. McCall 'Number of women Councillors in Scotland rises but remains low' *The Scotsman* 10 May 2017

<https://www.scotsman.com/news/politics/general-election/number-of-women-councillors-in-scotland-rises-but-remains-low-1-4442054>. See also – SPICe *Local Government Elections 2017*, p19

<https://digitalpublications.parliament.scot/ResearchBriefings/Report/2017/5/19/Local-government-elections-2017-1-1#Gender-balance-of-councillors-and-candidates>

⁶⁵ Local Government Commission *Does Local Government Work for Women? 2017*

<https://www.lgiu.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Does-local-government-work-for-women-Final-report.pdf>

⁶⁶ Data from COSLA *List of Council Leaders in Scotland* (2018) <http://www.cosla.gov.uk/councils/leaders>

⁶⁷ Scottish Government *Scotland's National Action Plan to Prevent and Eradicate Female Genital Mutilation (FGM) 2016-2020* (2016) <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-national-action-plan-prevent-eradicate-fgm/>

⁶⁸ Scottish Government *Equally Safe* (updated 2018) <https://www.gov.scot/publications/equally-safe-scotlands-strategy-prevent-eradicate-violence-against-women-girls/>

⁶⁹ Scottish Government, *Gender Index Working Paper* (2017).

<https://www2.gov.scot/Topics/People/Equality/Equalities/GenderIndex>

for progress and policies which will make a meaningful difference to women and girls' lives, assess gaps in the work being undertaken to address gender inequality and provide advice and support to the First Minister. This council is independent of the Scottish Government, however is supported through resources by the government. The first report of this body was published in 2018.⁷⁰

Further actions being taken by the Scottish Government as listed on their website, include: ensuring fairer workplaces for women, providing funding to gender equality organisations, increasing childcare provision, engaging with men, working to prevent violence against women and girls, and they are currently awaiting recommendations from the Women in Agriculture Taskforce set to tackle inequality in Scottish agriculture. This is being done through measures such as the partnership for change initiative which aims to improve gender balance on boards and through agreed proposals to expand pay information to public authorities with 20 or more employees; the formation of a working group to produce guidelines for best practice for employers around pregnant workers, as well as emphasis on the provision of information for employees; the formation of a Workplace Equalities Fund whose aim is also to try and reduce employment inequities; and the further backing of the Promoting Equality and Cohesion Fund (PECF), which funds various gender equality organisations.⁷¹

⁷⁰ First Minister's National Advisory Council on Women and Girls 2018 First Report and Recommendations (2018) <https://onescotland.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/2018-Report.pdf>

⁷¹ Scottish Government, *Equality funding 2016 to 2017* (2016). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/equality-funding-2016-2017/>

Goal 6: Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all

Goal 6 contains targets on availability of clean water and access to sanitation, also on the efficient and sustainable management of water resources

Summary

Scotland faces few challenges on the targets for this goal. There is universal access to safe and clean drinking water, water management is strong, and water stress is relatively low. Target 6.6. on protection and restoration of water-based ecosystems stands out as an area where, on available evidence, more could be done.

Data Availability

6.1.1	6.2.1	6.3.1	6.3.2	6.4.1	6.4.2	6.5.1	6.5.2	6.6.1	6.b.1

Data availability commentary

There is a presumption that there is universal access to clean water and sanitation in Scotland, and that is reflected in a relative lack of statistical data available on the early targets in this goal ([6.1](#) and [6.2](#)). Given performance as outlined below, we do not consider that access to water and sanitation is a priority challenge for Scotland: a lack of ONS data, too, reflects this understanding. Elsewhere, there is relevant or very close data available on measures around freshwater ecosystems in Scotland, notably pollution, water use efficiency, overall freshwater ecosystem health. With a relatively well-established system of water use management in place for Scotland, it is unclear how applicable an indicator on local participation in water management might be.

Performance

Using the Overall Performance Assessment (OPA) metric created by Scottish Water, Scotland is performing well in the provision of safe and clean drinking water. The Water Industry Commission for Scotland report notes that the OPA score has increased 5 points from 2015-16. In 2015 3.4% Scottish population received household water from a private supply- 95% of those measured met the required water standard.⁷² Ambient water quality is good on available data. For example, in 2016, 85.1% Rivers unpolluted; 11.9% unimpacted by pollution; 2.9% slightly polluted; 0.2% polluted; 0% severely polluted. Though exact comparisons with the rest of the UK are difficult, performance appears to be positive as is the trend since 1990. On efficient water use and water stress ([6.4.1](#) and [6.4.2](#)) there are clear positive trends. Scotland's progress on integrated water resource management has not been assessed, though there is no reason here to anticipate this to be poorer than that for the UK. On protection of freshwater ecosystems, SEPA's Scotland Freshwater

⁷² Drinking Water Quality Regulator for Scotland, *Drinking Water Quality in Scotland 2015 – Private Water Supplies* (2016). <http://dwqr.scot/media/30855/dwqr-annual-report-2015-amalgamated-copy-final-30-aug-pdf-version.pdf>

Ecosystem Indicator Summary records 10.1% High; 45.3% Good; 44.5% Less than good – clearly, this might indicate that more could be done to “protect and restore water-related ecosystems” ([6.6](#))

Delivery

Water governance is extensively covered by relevant law and policy, including The Water Services etc. (Scotland) Act 2005, the Water Resources (Scotland) Act 2013 and plans including Scotland’s River Basin Management Plans. There are a range of organisations involved in delivery of these SDG targets, most notably the Water Industry Commission for Scotland on the water supply and waste water, SEPA, and the Environment and Forestry Directorate on environmental Protection, along with partnerships such as the Hydro Nation Water Service.

Goal 7: Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

[Goal 7](#) contains targets on access to energy and renewable energy

Summary

[Goal 7](#) is the shortest of the goals, with only 5 targets, of which only a few are directed to developed country contexts. Scotland's performance on renewable energy is strong. Though access to reliable energy is universal, the "affordability" of that energy – the extent of fuel poverty faced by the poorest in Scotland, is an area for further consideration.

Data Availability

7.1.1	7.1.2	7.2.1	7.3.1

Data availability commentary

Access to reliable energy is considered to be practically universal in the Scottish context. Data availability is overall very good, including on renewable energy, though disaggregation for Scotland does not appear to be available on energy intensity (indicator [7.3.1](#)). Further investigation of disaggregation might concentrate on affordability of energy and fuel poverty in Scotland in terms of the socio-economically disadvantaged, and also access to reliable and affordable energy in relatively remote areas.

Performance

There is universal access to modern energy services in Scotland, though *Is Scotland Fairer?* notes energy poverty is an area for further investigation: "People living in poverty were also more likely to pay more for essential goods and services, including ...energy... due to their weaker position in consumer markets (known as the 'poverty premium')." ⁷³ Scottish performance on renewable energy is strong when considered against the SDG ambition to "substantially increase" renewable energy as a share of total energy, and performance in the rest of the UK. For Scotland 2015 the percentage of total energy consumption from renewable sources was 17.8%, showing a general increase 2009 to 2015 from a baseline of 7.5% in 2009. Clearly, from a 2015 baseline, a future positive trend depends in part on plans and policies in train.

Delivery

Relevant legislation includes Energy Act 1983 and Clean Air Act 1993. The most relevant policy framework is Scotland's national energy strategy. ⁷⁴

⁷³ Citizens Advice Scotland, 2016, cited in Equality and Human Rights Commission, *Is Scotland Fairer? 2018* (2018). <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/publication-download/scotland-fairer-2018>, p.104

⁷⁴ Scottish Government, *The future of energy in Scotland: Scottish energy strategy* (2017). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-energy-strategy-future-energy-scotland-9781788515276/>

Goal 8: Promote Sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

Goal 8 has targets on growth and productivity, but also on decent work, labour rights, child labour and trafficking, training, and access to banking

Summary

Scotland performs well on promoting inclusive economic growth, though it looks to face similar challenges to the rest of the UK in terms of breakdown of employment across protected characteristics. A key indicator on environmentally sustainable growth, though, is currently not available for Scotland.

Data Availability

8.1.1	8.2.1	8.3.1	8.4.1	8.4.2	8.5.1	8.5.2	8.6.1	8.7.1	8.8.1	8.8.2	8.9.1	8.9.2	8.10.1	8.10.2	8.b.1

Data availability commentary

Data availability overall is very good for this goal. There are data gaps, some of which are predictable – informal employment and trafficking, for example, where data is hard to come by. In some places, data disaggregation is an issue in responding to the specificities of the target – notably on the injury and death rates for migrants and female workers. Disaggregation around equal pay for equal work and labour market access allows for a focus on gender, ethnic minorities, and disabilities. Elsewhere, no disaggregation is available on soldiers under 18 from Scotland. No data is available on jobs dependent on unsustainable tourism, which might be an important omission. Target [8.4](#) on decoupling economic growth from environmental degradation is pivotal in the SDGs, and here nationally-disaggregated data speaking to Scotland’s “footprint” is absent, though available for the UK as a whole. It might be that further work with the ONS could resolve this issue, or that another indicator could be found in the interim.

Performance

Scottish GDP growth and productivity is relatively positive by UK standards and, like the UK, shows a general upwards trend since 2009. The proportion of people on zero hours contracts is comparable for Scotland and the rest of the UK: 2.7% for Scotland, 2.8% for England and 3.2% for Wales (2017)⁷⁵ (). Clearly, though there is scope for further progress in this respect. Gross weekly earnings are lower in Scotland than the rest of the UK. Unemployment rates are lower in Scotland than for the rest of the UK, and Scotland has the lowest proportion of low paid employee jobs in the UK - 16% compared to 17.8% for the UK overall. The unevenness of employment after disaggregation is expected, but nevertheless indicates that some groups are being “left behind” - “[In 2016] The employment rate of Equality Act disabled (42.9%) is 37.3 percentage points lower than non-disabled people (80.1%), this gap increases with age. Minority ethnic women had substantially lower employment rates (45.0%)

⁷⁵ ONS, *Labour Force Survey Zero Hours Contracts Data Tables 2017*

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/peopleinwork/earningsandworkinghours/datasets/zerohourssummarydatatables>

than white ethnic women (70.5%), whereas the employment rate for minority ethnic males (71.6%) was similar to that for white ethnic males (77.1%).”⁷⁶ Elsewhere “Disabled people experience lower rates of employment and lower pay than non-disabled people. Employment rates vary considerably by impairment, with people with depression and learning disabilities the least likely to be in employment”.⁷⁷

Scotland fares well in terms of young people not in education or training compared to the rest of the UK, and there has been a drop from 3.7% to 3.4% between 2017 and 2018,⁷⁸ indicating that Scotland may be on track to meet the SDG target of a “substantial reduction” (target [8.6](#)). Human trafficking and child exploitation, and the employment of 16-year olds in the armed forces, is present in Scotland – [8.7](#) targets the “eradication” of human trafficking, modern slavery and child soldiering. Fatal accident rates in Scotland are higher than the rest of the UK, perhaps reflecting the composition of Scottish industry, but still salient in the context of an SDG ambition on “safe and secure working environments”. In this respect, it should be noted that health and safety issues are in the main reserved to the UK government. Target [8.10](#) requires “expanding access to banking for all”. The level of ambition here is imprecise, but the ambition itself is clearly relevant to the Scottish context where “expansion” might be thought needed to address both the 2% of Scottish households that do not have access to a bank account;⁷⁹ and numbers and density of ATM networks, especially in rural areas.⁸⁰

Delivery

Clearly, there are several legal duties, plans, policies and initiatives in place – too many to summarise in the context of this wide-ranging goal. Scotland has a national action plan on youth employment, a tourism strategy, a national economic strategy, for example, and a trafficking strategy. The SDG target [8.b](#) on strategies for youth employment makes specific reference to the International Labour Organisation’s Global Jobs Pact as an appropriate global framework. No reference to this in the Scottish context could be found, and there might be scope for closer alignment with such global strategies. No clear policies or plans on informal employment could be found, nor a plan for systemic reduction of deaths at work.

⁷⁶ Scottish Government, *Regional employment patterns in Scotland: statistics from the Annual Population Survey 2016* (2017) p.1. <https://www.gov.scot/publications/regional-employment-patterns-scotland-statistics-annual-population-survey-2016-9781786529879/>

⁷⁷ Scottish Government, *Summary: Disability and Labour Market* (2018).

<https://www2.gov.scot/Topics/People/Equality/Equalities/DataGrid/Disability/DisabLab>

⁷⁸ Skills Development Scotland *Annual Participation Measure for 16 – 19 year olds in Scotland 2018*. (2018) https://www.skillsdevelopmentscotland.co.uk/media/44876/2018_annual-participation-measure-report.pdf

⁷⁹ Scottish Government *Scottish household survey 2017: annual report (2017)* p7 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-people-annual-report-results-2017-scottish-household-survey/pages/7/>

⁸⁰ See Highlands and Islands Enterprise *Access to Banking Services in Rural Areas Executive Summary* (2018) <http://www.hie.co.uk/regional-information/economic-reports-and-research/archive/access-to-banking-services-in-rural-areas.html>

Goal 9: Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation

Goal 9 contains targets on infrastructure, sustainable industry, small scale industry, and research and development, and internet coverage

Summary

This is a diverse goal, and the indicators are not always most applicable to the Scottish context. There might be a positive opportunity for Scotland to define for itself what inclusive and sustainable industry means in country context, and how it is best measured. This goal is one area where planning – for growth in research and development, for the sustainability transition in Scottish industry – is relatively under-developed, on our initial research.

Data Availability

9.1.1	9.1.2	9.2.1	9.2.2	9.3.1	9.3.2	9.4.1	9.5.1	9.5.2	9.c.1

Data availability commentary

Data availability appears patchy for this goal. Indicators under [9.1](#) are not the most suitable to measure resilient and sustainable infrastructure in Scotland (access to paved road, freight volumes) though data is available. Data on manufacturing [9.2](#) is available, though data on small scale industry ([9.3](#)) in the terms of the SDG indicators, especially is much less so: the UN indicators continue to face the problem of providing a global definition of “small scale”. Data on CO² emissions per unit of value added ([9.4.1](#)) are hard to find, though data on CO² emissions overall is present. Data on research and development expenditure (indicator [9.5.1](#)) is available; ratio of researchers per million people ([9.5.2](#)) less so. Mobile coverage ([9.c.1](#)) is not an especially stretching goal for Scotland – access to superfast broadband, however, is pertinent and data is available.

Performance

Performance on the infrastructure indicators is good, though the question is whether these are the right indicators to assess “quality, reliable, sustainable and resilient infrastructure” in Scotland ([9.1](#)). The Indicators under [9.2](#) are hard to assess in terms of performance – no overall trend on employment in manufacturing ([9.2.2](#)), but value added by manufacturing sector increasing ([9.2.1](#)). Overall, though, whether Scotland’s industry flourishes or not - arguably the spirit of target 9.2 - remains a relevant issue. There is no upward trend in manufacturing employment and it is slightly below the UK figure. It is an open question whether Scotland wishes to focus on the flourishing of small-scale industry and microbusiness, as target [9.3](#) does, and how Scotland should frame a target ambition in this area. The trend on CO² emissions is positive, though *industry’s* emissions “were broadly flat in Scotland” in 2016.⁸¹ A detailed analysis of whether Scotland has undertaken action

⁸¹Committee on Climate Change *Reducing emissions in Scotland 2018 Progress Report to Parliament (2018)*

“in accordance with its circumstances... to make industry sustainable” (as in the language of [9.4](#)) lies beyond the scope of this summary. A “substantial increase” (target [9.5](#)) in research and development workers and the share of research and development expenditure in Scotland is not evident: Scotland seems to lag slightly behind the UK as a whole. Coverage of superfast broadband lags behind the UK, and there remains large areas of Scotland where it is not possible to receive a voice or mobile data signal. It should be noted, though, that telecommunications matters are in the main reserved to the UK government.

Delivery

This is a diverse goal, and the combination of particular indicators and target ambitions make it difficult to assess. There are plans and laws present in Scotland – e.g., on climate change and the role of industry, “A manufacturing future for Scotland” (2016). Without further research, though, focused planning for some of the target outcomes here is not evident. In some cases, this may or may not be purposeful (e.g. small-scale industry [9.3](#)) in others, though, further planning for attainment of the SDG ambition (e.g. on research and development [9.5](#); industrial sustainability [9.4](#); and assessment of progress against plans for future manufacturing [9.2](#)) might be appropriate.

P49 <https://www.theccc.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/Reducing-emissions-in-Scotland-2018-Progress-Report-to-Parliament.pdf>

Goal 10: Reduce inequalities within and among countries

Goal 10 contains targets on inclusive growth, the makeup of those in poverty, discrimination and hate crime, but also targets on well-managed and beneficial immigration

Summary

Clearly, reducing material inequality through inclusive growth is a challenge in all national contexts, including Scotland, and the make-up of the socio-economically disadvantaged in Scotland is starkly laid out in disaggregated data, though again this is a common picture for developed countries. The state of discrimination and hate crime is relatively positive. Appropriate indicators and policies around migration are complex, but it seems clear that Scotland might do better in gathering data that reflects the situation of migrants.

Data Availability:

10.1.1	10.2.1	10.3.1	10.4.1	10.5.1	10.7.1	10.7.2	10.c.1

Data availability commentary

Data availability appears patchy. In part, this reflects the nature of some of the SDG indicators as “under development” (e.g. [10.2.1](#), [10.3.1](#), [10.5.1](#)). Target [10.1](#) on income growth for the bottom 40% - potentially a potent measure of inclusive growth – is only available via the World Bank for the UK as a whole. Labour share of GDP ([10.4.1](#)) is not available for Scotland. On the reporting of discrimination, good relevant data is available – as is the case for disaggregation of those in relative poverty ([10.2](#)). Statistics on migration are not available, though remittance data is available for the UK as a whole. It is not suggested here that these indicators are optimal for measurement of the SDG target, but there is a general lack of available data on the lives of migrants in Scotland that the Scottish Government might look to remedy, perhaps in partnership with stakeholders.

Performance

Target [10.1](#) is specific and action-oriented, and the Palma ratio data speaks to it only indirectly, but the Palma trend of widening inequality between the top 10% and bottom 40% tends to suggest that it is not currently being met. Clearly, Scotland faces a challenge in the “social and economic inclusion of all”: to take two examples, ‘over a third of people in minority ethnic groups were in poverty after housing costs were taken into account. For comparison, the poverty rate for the ‘White – British’ group was 18%’, and from 2014-17 24% of all households with at least one member with a disability were below the relative poverty line compared to 16% of those who did not have at least one member of the household with a disability.⁸² The trend in statistics on hate crime is relatively positive, especially in the light of a spike in hate crime after the Brexit vote across the UK. Migration is a reserved power, but it might be worth considering how policies and initiatives that could indirectly bear on migration in Scotland could be assessed.

⁸² Scottish Government, *Poverty and income inequality in Scotland: 2014-2017* (2018), pp. 19, 20. <https://www.gov.scot/publications/poverty-income-inequality-scotland-2014-17/>

Delivery

Inclusive growth is addressed through the National Performance Framework⁸³ and is part of Scotland's economic strategy. Regional inclusive growth is addressed in City Region and Growth Deals and Regional Economic Partnerships. Scotland has a range of anti-discrimination and equality laws in place. There is also a strong policy framework, with policies targeting specific groups and issues (i.e. human rights, women, LGBTI people, gypsy/travellers, faith and religion). It is a Scottish National Outcome to "Respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination".⁸⁴ The existence of a National Human Rights Institution, discussed in more detail under [goal 16](#) below is also important in the protection and promotion of equality in Scotland.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission's review of equality and human rights in Scotland, *Is Scotland Fairer?*, finds in 2018 that "despite efforts made by Scottish Government and many others, the same problems and concerns...are still apparent". The report finds that "There is evidence of progress, but this progress is slow and not consistent or widespread."⁸⁵ Issues of equality and non-discrimination are applicable across the SDGs generally. One important kind of policy response is for the Scottish Government to focus on further disaggregating existing data according to different groupings such as religious groups, gender, age, ethnic minorities, and LGBT. This would enable a more comprehensive analysis of how and in what ways government policies, priorities and legislation is benefitting/ hindering or making little impact on different groups.

The Fairer Scotland Duty is set out in legislation as Part 1 of the Equality Act 2010, where it is known as the 'duty to address socio-economic inequalities'. The duty came into force in Scotland from April 2018. It places a legal responsibility on particular public bodies in Scotland to actively consider how they can reduce inequalities of outcome caused by socioeconomic disadvantage, when making strategic decisions. The Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 gives community planning a statutory purpose focused on improving outcomes and tackling inequalities of outcome on locally identified priorities, as noted under goal 2.

⁸³ Scotland's Centre for Regional Inclusive Growth (SCRIG), *Inclusive Growth Outcomes Framework* (2018). <http://www.inclusivegrowth.scot/resources/data-and-analysis/2018/06/inclusive-growth-outcomes-framework/>

⁸⁴ Scottish Government, *National Performance Framework: National Outcomes*. <https://nationalperformance.gov.scot/national-outcomes>

⁸⁵ Equality and Human Rights Commission: Scotland, *Is Scotland Fairer? 2018* (2018). <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/is-britain-fairer-2018-is-scotland-fairer.pdf>

Goal 11: Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable

Goal 11 contains targets on many aspects of the urban agenda: housing, public transport, green space, waste, planning, and cultural/natural heritage protection

Summary

In the case of [goal 11](#), data availability in the precise terms of the SDG is not good, though plenty of related data is available. This is in part due to the precise nature of the SDG indicator set (e.g. [11.3](#)). Performance in some areas – public transport, recycling, green space and protection of cultural and natural heritage – is strong in respect of the SDG targets. Housing quality in Scotland is an area where SDG target [11.1](#), of “access for all... to adequate housing” – taking the Scottish Housing Quality Standard as the definition of adequate – is not close to being met.

Data Availability

11.1.1	11.2.1	11.3.1	11.3.2	11.4.1	11.5.1	11.5.2	11.6.1	11.6.2	11.7.1	11.7.2	11.a.1	11.b.2

Data availability commentary

Overall, sufficient raw data exists to calculate many of the indicators in SDG 11; however, some will need more analysis before the indicators are produced. Adequate housing ([11.1.1](#)), solid waste ([11.6.1](#)) and green space ([11.7.1](#)) appear to be well-captured by existing data sources. In some cases, the data is available, but extra steps need to be taken to make it more relevant to the SDG: for instance, in the case of [11.2.1](#) related to public transport, overall satisfaction with public transport is easy to locate, but it is not broken down by sex, age and persons with disabilities. Similarly, [11.3.1](#) on urban sprawl could probably be calculated using existing Ordnance Survey data, but it would require specialised analysis to accomplish this. One of the biggest gaps is [11.3.2](#), related to public participation in the planning process; it would be useful to have a systematic assessment of the democratic effectiveness of the recently established Community Planning Partnerships. There also does not appear to be any obvious data available on the deaths and economic damage sustained as a result of natural disaster (target [11.5](#)) – this indicator is repeated under other goals, where it has also been noted as a gap.

In respect of indicator [11.7.1](#), the ONS-produced *UK Natural Capital: Ecosystem accounts for urban areas* report,⁸⁶ which is being used in the ONS’s SDG portal as the indicator for [11.7.1](#), reports that 4% of Scotland’s urban area qualifies as “publicly accessible greenspace”, while the third sector organisation Greenspace Scotland reports that 41% of urban Scotland is “publicly accessible greenspace”.⁸⁷ These estimates use slightly different definitions of the geographical extent of the

⁸⁶ ONS *UK Natural Capital: Ecosystem accounts for urban areas* (2018)
<https://www.ons.gov.uk/releases/urbanecosystemaccounts>

⁸⁷ Greenspace Scotland, *The Third State of Scotland’s Greenspace Report* (2018).
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1aQLMu60G5WRI4QKBCuZJ92oT8eM2sxd3/view>

city, but it is unclear if this is enough to account for the difference in order of magnitude. Using the ONS-produced figure allows for more ready comparisons to the England and Wales results, but it is worth considering whether anything can be learned from the Greenspace Scotland report figures.

Performance

Target [11.1](#) has an ambition of “ensuring access for all to adequate, safe and affordable housing” which is currently not met in Scotland, if the Scottish Housing Quality Standard is taken as the relevant measure of “adequacy”: 45% of its housing rated as not meeting this standard.⁸⁸

Satisfaction with public transport appears to be quite high in Scotland, with 84% of individuals reporting that public transport is convenient or fairly convenient, though it is difficult to make comparisons with the rest of the UK as the ONS has not devised an appropriate measure for this target. It is essential that this data be disaggregated by sex, age and persons with disability to ensure that public transport is meeting the needs of those most left behind.

Scotland goes beyond the minimum standard on disposal of solid waste, in that waste is collected and discharged appropriately. Scotland’s *Zero Waste Plan*⁸⁹ moves beyond minimum criteria set. As of October 2018, DEFRA reports that the recycling rate in Scotland is 42.8%, a little less than England at 44.9% and much lower than Wales at 57.3%; this is also considerably short of the Zero Waste Plan’s target of 70% recycled by 2025.

The overall trend on air pollution in Scotland is stable or positive, and deaths from air pollution are lower than those for the UK generally. The estimated number of attributable deaths (adults over 25 years) in Scotland from PM2.5 in 2016 was 1724. However, in the period 2011-2016 the number of attributable deaths has varied from 1642 to 1780, averaging 1725 deaths per year, with no discernible trend.⁹⁰

Delivery

Two recent developments stand out as important in this arena: the City Region Deals financed and implemented by the UK and Scottish Governments and the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act passed in 2015. The City Region Deals substantially in how much they support delivery of the SDGs. For instance, the City Region Deal for Edinburgh includes clear and specific commitments to funding public transport, housing and cultural venues, while the Glasgow City Region Deal focuses on job creation and infrastructure and makes no clear and specific commitments to targets or indicators found in the SDGs. The potential for implementation of the SDGs through the City Region

⁸⁸ Scottish Government, *Scottish House Condition Survey 2016* (2017). p.11 <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-house-condition-survey-2016-key-findings/pages/2/>. It is difficult to make comparisons across the UK with respect to housing because of the different metrics used. Approximately 23% of housing in England not meeting the minimum standard “decent homes criteria”, though clearly, the set of metrics employed for the two approaches differ.

⁸⁹ Scottish Government, *Scotland’s Zero Waste Plan* (2010) <https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/publication/2010/06/scotlands-zero-waste-plan/documents/00458945-pdf/00458945-pdf/govscot%3Adocument>

⁹⁰ Health Protection Scotland *Air Pollution & Health Briefing Note: Mortality associated with exposure to fine particulate matter (PM2.5 attributable mortality) in Scotland*. (2018) <https://www.hps.scot.nhs.uk/resourcedocument.aspx?id=6660>

Deal would be significant, but with so many already funded and under way, it may be difficult to integrate SDG commitments at this point.

The Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act provides a new framework for planning and community participation in the planning process; it relates directly to the implementation of SDGs [11.3.1](#) and [11.a](#). The act establishes Community Planning Partnerships that are intended to involve local people more systematically in planning processes across levels. It leaves considerable room for individual CPPs to decide how they will involve members of the local community.⁹¹ The government has produced guidance for how this might be accomplished, but it is worth considering whether this guidance could better reflect examples of SDG best practice. Scotland's *Housing Beyond 2021* initiative, launched in 2018, addresses housing policy up to 2040.⁹²

⁹¹ The Act also introduced the right for community bodies to make requests to all local authorities, Scottish Ministers and a wide-ranging list of public bodies, for any land or buildings they feel they could make better use of. Community bodies can request ownership, lease or other rights, as they wish. Participation requests were also introduced under the same Act and are means by which community groups can request to have greater involvement in, and influence over, decisions and services that affect communities and community life.

⁹² Scottish Government *Housing Beyond 2021: Discussion Paper* (2018)
<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/advice-and-guidance/2018/09/housing-beyond-2021/documents/housing-beyond-2021-discussion-paper/housing-beyond-2021-discussion-paper/govscot:document/>

Goal 12: Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns

Goal 12 has indicators on sustainable consumption and production planning, environmental “footprint”, reducing waste and pollution, sustainability education, sustainable tourism, and ending fossil fuel subsidies

Summary:

Data availability and performance are both mixed across this goal, in part reflecting the specificities of the SDG indicators. The non-statistical indicators here assessing the presence of suitable plans, policies and strategies require deeper analysis. What data is available shows a positive trend on the relevant statistical indicators.

Data Availability:

12.1.1	12.2.1	12.2.2	12.3.1	12.4.1	12.4.2	12.5.1	12.6.1	12.7.1	12.8.1	12.b.1	12.c.1

Data availability commentary

Overall, there is plenty of relevant data available across this goal (and in some cases, the precise SDG indicators are not yet available). Some of these indicators are to a degree non-statistical – e.g. the presence of sustainable public procurement or sustainability reporting by Scottish companies, or of a sustainable consumption and production plan (Scotland does have a circular economy plan,⁹³ but implementation is somewhat unclear). A judgement on successful implementation of these plans requires more fine-grained data. As under [goal 8](#), the absence of a disaggregated-for-Scotland measure for the environmental footprint (not just emissions) of Scotland’s consumption and production is significant.

Performance

In general, trends are positive on many indicators here - recycling rates ([12.5.1](#)) and hazardous waste ([12.4.2](#)), for example. What is less clear is how far these positive trends will yield a “substantial reduction” in the terms of the SDG target against an appropriate baseline between now and 2030. Scotland’s recycling rate, for example, has increased from 32.5% in 2010, to 42.8% in 2016: this looks like a substantial reduction, but the future trajectory is harder to assess. The SDG ambition on food waste – *halving* global food waste (target [12.3](#)) – is especially clear; how, precisely, these SDG targets translate to the Scottish context is an important question. There is a Scottish legal framework for sustainable public procurement (indicator [12.7.1](#)), and a Scottish circular economy strategy ([12.1.1](#)). Inevitably, a judgement of performance against targets [12.1](#) and [12.7](#) rests in part on the detail of these frameworks and their effective implementation. Education for sustainability ([12.8.1](#)) is integrated into Scottish curricula. Eliminating fossil fuel subsidies, highlighted by [12.c](#), is

⁹³ Scottish Government, *Making Things Last: a Circular Economy Strategy for Scotland* (2016). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/making-things-last-circular-economy-strategy-scotland/>

an objective not currently met in the Scottish context (despite a debate about the definition of “subsidy”) though responsibility for this looks to lie at the UK level.

Delivery

In the case of [goal 12](#), the question of devolved and reserved matters is clearly at issue. It is not clear how far the Scottish Government might be expected to act to eliminate the fossil fuel subsidies for offshore oil and gas in Scotland, nor exactly how much power Scotland has to promote sustainability reporting on the part of Scottish companies. Elsewhere, Scotland has a range of clear policies and strategies in place to address target areas. *The Circular Economy Strategy* is especially notable in this respect. The circular economy is a model of sustainable consumption and production and as a concept arguably exceeds goals of sustainable production and consumption. In other respects, it is also narrower in its focus on a kind of economic model, and so issues of policy coherence might be especially worthy of investigation here. Clearly, too, there are associated policies on reuse of plastics and encouragement of household efficiency.

Goal 13: Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impact

Goal 13 supports the Paris Agreement on Climate Change with SDG targets on resilience and adaptation, the presence of climate change policy and planning, and education and awareness raising.

Summary:

With the exception of data on climate-related disaster loss, the indicators are largely non-statistical, and Scotland has a full set of applicable laws and plans in place.

Data Availability:

13.1.1	13.1.2	13.1.3	13.2.1	13.3.1	13.3.2

Data availability commentary

The indicators under [goal 13](#) are almost completely non-statistical, concerning the existence and character of frameworks, policies and initiatives. As noted under [goal 1](#), disaster-related loss – here, climate-related – is not systematically captured in the Scottish context. There is relevant available data on climate adaptation policies in the form of annual progress updates on climate change adaptation. Scotland has National Indicators on climate change risks and capacity to adapt.⁹⁴

Performance

Scotland's performance – as judged by the presence of relevant law and active policymaking in support of that law, is strong. In the case of this goal, the performance in question is largely the performance *of delivery*: the presence of relevant plans and policies, such as the integration of climate change into national curriculum ([13.3.1](#)) and planning for adaptation and mitigation. As such, a judgement on the extent of *implementation* of these policies and plans is an area for further investigation.

Delivery

The Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009⁹⁵ - has section on adaptation to climate change. Legislation is reflected in planning – e.g. Climate Change Plan: third report on proposals and policies 2018-2032.⁹⁶ Mitigation is addressed by the Scottish greenhouse gas emissions annual target report:

⁹⁴ Climate Exchange *Climate Change Risks to Society and our Capacity to Adapt* (2016) <https://www.climateexchange.org.uk/research/indicators-and-trends/society/climate-change-risks-to-society-and-our-capacity-to-adapt/>

⁹⁵ Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009: <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2009/12/contents>

⁹⁶ Scottish Government, *Climate Change Plan: third report on proposals and policies 2018-2032 (RPP3)* (2018). <https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-governments-climate-change-plan-third-report-proposals-policies-2018/>

emissions are detailed in annual reports, with the latest one from 2016.⁹⁷ Disaster preparedness (13.1) is a responsibility of the Resilience Division, but also distributed through a range of national and local bodies.⁹⁸ A report by Education Scotland from 2016 details how the Scottish Curriculum for Excellence implements learning on mitigation and adaptation to climate change.⁹⁹

⁹⁷ Scottish Government, *Scottish greenhouse gas emissions annual target report: 2016* (2018).

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-greenhouse-gas-emissions-annual-target-report-2016/>

⁹⁸ Scottish Government: Ready Scotland, *Resilience Division*. <https://www.readyscotland.org/ready-government/resilience-division/>

⁹⁹ Education Scotland, *Submission to the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee* (2016). http://www.parliament.scot/S5_Environment/Reports/20161019_Education_Scotland_to_Convener.pdf

Goal 14: Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development

Goal 14 has targets on minimising marine pollution, protection and conservation of marine ecosystems, including sustainable fisheries, the livelihoods of small-scale fishers, and upholding UN convention on the law of the seas.

Summary

Performance is good across the goal – there is no doubt, overall, of provision to “sustainably manage and protect marine ecosystems” around Scotland. A combination of challenging indicators and uneven data availability, though, means that the detail of this picture is not fully, readily, available.

Data Availability

14.1.1	14.2.1	14.3.1	14.4.1	14.5.1	14.6.1	14.a.1	14.b.1	14.c.1

Data availability commentary

Generally, data is available on matters relating to each indicator, even though this can rarely be mapped onto the SDG indicator. The exception is ocean acidification ([14.3.1](#)), where a data gap has been identified. Ocean acidification, as far as this research has found, is only measured in one site as part of a preliminary study. Data availability elsewhere across the goal remains imperfect: some is not easily disaggregated from the UK level, some is not easily found at all (e.g. proportion of research budget spent on marine research [14.a.1](#)).

[Goal 14](#) might be one area where it is worth further deliberate effort to disaggregate available data – e.g. on [14.2.1](#), ocean zones managed using ecosystem-based approaches, to the Scottish level and map it more systematically against the SDG indicators, perhaps in cooperation with Joint Nature Conservation Committee and the Office for National Statistics in England.

Performance

Performance is relatively good in most areas, on available data. Only one coastal region around Scotland is regarded as problematic in respect of eutrophication, that is, over-enrichment by nutrients, as measured by indicator [14.1.1](#). Conserved areas (target [14.5](#)) exceed the SDG target ambition of 10%. 20% of Scotland’s sea areas are protected. Fish stocks record steady trends, rather than improving in accordance with the SDG ambition to “end overfishing” (target [14.4](#)); results vary by species, with cod regarded as overfished; the trend for herring is worsening. There is clearly legal provision and a monitoring system in place to prevent illegal fishing. Few convictions for illegal fishing are reported, which might indicate effective enforcement.

Delivery

There are a range of laws, plans and policies in place – including the Marine (Scotland) Act 2010¹⁰⁰, and Scotland's *National Marine Plan*.¹⁰¹ Marine Scotland is the governmental organisation responsible for integrated management of fisheries. Clearly, there is an important European context for delivery in light of the EU common fisheries policy.

¹⁰⁰ Marine (Scotland) Act 2010: <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2010/5/contents>

¹⁰¹ Scottish Government, *Scotland's National Marine Plan* (2015).
<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-national-marine-plan/>

Goal 15: Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss

Goal 15 contains targets on sustainable management of different kinds of ecosystems – inland freshwater ecosystems, forests, mountains – on conservation and protection of biodiversity, and integration of biodiversity into national planning.

Summary:

The picture on this goal, both in terms of availability and performance, is mixed. Specific targets on conservation, biodiversity and endangered species are strongly framed, and judged against those targets Scotland is not on track.

Data Availability:

15.1.1	15.1.2	15.2.1	15.3.1	15.4.1	15.4.2	15.5.1	15.6.1	15.7.1	15.8.1	15.9.1	15.a.1	15.b.1

Data availability commentary

Good data is available around every indicator under this goal, however, this is not always closely matched to the SDG indicator - nor are the SDG indicators always a perfect reflection of the targets under this goal. Up-to-date, comprehensive information on soil health is not readily available. Where indicators require assessing the presence of legal measures (e.g. on genetic resources, invasive species) an assessment is readily made. Regulation of the wildlife trade ([15.7.1](#)) is not disaggregated to the Scottish level, and budgeting is not necessarily categorised in the terms required by particular indicators ([15.a.1](#), [15.b.1](#)). Overall, though, enough relevant data is available for assessment of most components.

Performance

Overall, performance on biodiversity and ecosystem conservation is stable or slightly worsening, indicating that the SDG targets – framed in terms of strong ambitions to “ensure conservation” or “take urgent and significant action” - are not on track to be met. On the positive side, Scotland has the largest proportion of sustainably managed forest in the UK - 57.7% against a UK average of 43.4%; elsewhere, the proportion of upland areas in favourable condition has declined by 2% 2017-2018; data on biodiversity up to 2016 showed a mixed trend. The 'Scottish Biodiversity Strategy - Report to the Scottish Parliament - 2014-2016' of July 2017 contains a summary of Biodiversity State Indicators. Of the current indicators in the report, three (abundance of terrestrial breeding birds; notified species in favourable condition; notified habitats in favourable condition) were considered to be improving, three (wintering waterbirds; breeding seabirds; butterflies - specialists) were getting worse, and one was stable (butterflies - generalists).¹⁰² In terms of the situation of

¹⁰² Scottish Government, *Scottish Biodiversity Strategy Report to the Scottish Parliament 2014 - 2016* (2017). <https://www2.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00522533.pdf>

endangered species, 56% of “red” and “amber” listed species in a 2018 NGO report declined.¹⁰³ Performance on non-statistical indicators – compliance in legal and policy terms – is strong.

Delivery

There is a series of laws concerning management and protection of terrestrial ecosystems, e.g. The Protection of Wild Mammals (Scotland) Act 2002¹⁰⁴, the Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004¹⁰⁵, and The Forestry and Land Management (Scotland) Act 2018¹⁰⁶, and There are national strategies on Forestry and Biodiversity. Governmental responsibility lies with the Environment and Forestry Directorate and the Scottish Environment Protection Agency; and Scottish Natural Heritage. Target [15.9](#) targets biodiversity integration into planning, and performance here looks appropriate: There is a statutory duty on all public sector bodies in Scotland to further the conservation of biodiversity.¹⁰⁷ The Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017,¹⁰⁸ mentions planning specifically, and The Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017, lay out Environmental Impact Assessments for planning.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰³ A Focus on Nature et al, *State of Nature 2016: Scotland* (2016).

https://www.rspb.org.uk/globalassets/downloads/documents/conservation-projects/state-of-nature/stateofnature2016_scotland.pdf

¹⁰⁴ Protection of wild mammals (Scotland) Act 2002: <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2002/6/contents>

¹⁰⁵ Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004:

http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2004/6/pdfs/asp_20040006_en.pdf

¹⁰⁶ Forestry and Land Management (Scotland) Act 2018:

<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2018/8/contents/enacted>

¹⁰⁷ Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004:

http://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2004/6/pdfs/asp_20040006_en.pdf

¹⁰⁸ Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017:

<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/uksi/2017/1012/contents/made>

¹⁰⁹ Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) (Scotland) Regulations 2017:

<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2017/102/contents/made>

Goal 16: Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

Goal 16 covers targets on peace within and between societies, crime and access to justice, fundamental freedoms, and the centrality of effective, responsive and inclusive institutions.

Summary

This is a large, complex and wide-ranging goal area. There is plentiful data available that speaks to different target areas, with a mix of positive, worsening, and steady trend. Because of different levels of performance in respect of different indicators; lack of available data; and lack of disaggregated data in the context precisely of a focus on discrimination against such groups, it is difficult to offer any definitive conclusions regarding performance.

Data availability:

16.1.1	16.1.2	16.1.3	16.1.4	16.2.1	16.2.2	16.2.3	16.3.1	16.3.2	16.4.1	16.4.2	16.5.1	16.5.2	16.6.1	16.6.2	16.7.1	16.7.2	16.9.1	16.10.1	16.10.2	16.a.1	16.b.1

Data availability commentary

The availability of data across SDG targets and indicators is varied. In some cases, there is clear data available that is comparable with the SDG targets and indicators – e.g. homicide per year (16.1.1), number of people that feel safe walking home (16.1.4), human trafficking (16.2.2), data on prison population (16.3.2), government spending (16.6.1), registered children (16.9.1), and access to public information (16.10.1). Scotland also has a National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) that is fully compliant with the Paris Principles and accredited with ‘A’ Status¹¹⁰ by the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions (GANHRI).¹¹¹ In a number of these cases, for example, 16.1.1, the data is usefully broken down to the level of local government.

Greater disaggregation, where possible, would aid understanding of the current level of discrimination across different vectors. In the longer term, it would be worthwhile digging into existing data on SDG 16 further, particularly in regards to how data on discrimination disaggregates specific groups and along specific vectors i.e. race, religion, ethnicity, religion, gender etc. In the interim, reports such as *Is Scotland Fairer?* appear to offer a useful overview of discrimination, particularly because they draw on and synthesise a vast range of these various sources.¹¹²

¹¹⁰ A" status NHRIs have speaking rights in the Human Rights Council and other international human rights fora, and are entitled to request that they be recognized as the official national monitoring mechanism under the Optional Protocol to the Convention Against Torture and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. See C. S. Renshaw, 2012. ‘National Human Rights Institutions and Civil Society Organizations: New Dynamics of Engagement at Domestic, Regional, and International Levels’, *Global Governance* 18 (2012), 299-316

¹¹¹ Formerly known as the International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions, which serves as the global network of national human rights institutions.

¹¹² Equality and Human Rights Commission (2018) *Is Scotland Fairer?: The State of Equality and Human Rights* (2018) <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/is-britain-fairer-2018-is-scotland-fairer.pdf>

In many cases, data exists that is broadly similar to SDG targets but not precisely comparable. E.g. a number of related indicators, such as *Recorded Crime in Scotland*,¹¹³ *Domestic abuse in Scotland*; ¹¹⁴ and *Scottish Crime and Justice Survey*¹¹⁵ are present, and all speak to the *spirit* of indicator [16.1.3](#).¹¹⁶

Age ranges often do not correspond exactly. For example, target [16.2.1](#) addresses the ‘Proportion of children aged 1-17 years who experienced any physical punishment and/or psychological aggression by caregivers in the past month’. Also relevant is indicator [16.2.3](#) on ‘Proportion of young women and men aged 18-29 years who experienced sexual violence by age 18.’ At present, available data provides only yearly breakdowns and disaggregates data into three age ranges (children under 13; children aged between 13-15 and adults 16+). This makes it difficult to measure Scotland’s performance against these indicators.

There is a number of cases where there is little or no available data, e.g. on illicit financial flows ([16.4.1](#)); seized, found or surrendered arms ([16.4.2](#)); bribery ([16.5.1](#), [16.5.2](#)); and proportions of positions (by sex, age, persons with disabilities and population groups) in public institutions ([16.7.1](#)). On [16.7.1](#), there is some data on the number of women in local government, but none were found on the number of ethnic minorities in public institutions or on people with disabilities.

In regards to certain areas, it may be desirable to conceptualise indicators in a way that better reflects the national context. For instance, while the aforementioned indicator might not be applicable it remains the case that the overall target - ‘[16.10](#) - Ensure public access to information and protect fundamental freedoms, in accordance with national legislation and international agreements’ - is wholly applicable.

Performance

On *Crime and Justice*, the results are mixed, with some areas of improvement. Although for the period 2016/2017 to 2017/2018 Scotland’s performance has decreased on some indicators, the overall trend across a ten-year period is positive. It should be noted that in respect of certain indicators, such as sexual offences, higher incidents might be the result of increased reporting rather than the prevalence of the criminal behaviour. Moreover, new legislation, such as the Abusive Behaviour and Sexual Harm (Scotland) Act 2016 on 3rd July 2017, includes 421 new crimes of disclosing or threatening to disclose an intimate image. This might also affect overall trends. On *Inclusive and Transparent institutions*, Scotland’s performance is improving or has remained the same, depending on the indicator in question. On *rights and equality*, while Scotland performs well in regards to some indicators (e.g. a NHRI, access to information and birth registration), it is difficult to assess overall performance given the lack of disaggregated data on discrimination. Further work is therefore required. These categories are further broken down below:

Crime and Justice: There is some improvement towards the SDG target ambition in the level of homicides (indicator [16.2.1](#)); perceptions of crime (relevant to indicator [16.1.4](#)); proportion of people who feel safe in their neighbourhood; number of prisoners on remand or untried (indicator

¹¹³ Scottish Government, Recorded Crime in Scotland, 2017-18, <https://www2.gov.scot/Publications/2018/09/2051>

¹¹⁴ Scottish Government, Domestic abuse in Scotland: 2016-17 statistics, <https://www.gov.scot/publications/domestic-abuse-recorded-police-scotland-2016-17/>

¹¹⁵ Scottish Government, 2016-17 *Scottish Crime and Justice Survey*, <https://www2.gov.scot/Resource/0053/00533870.pdf>

¹¹⁶ 16.1.3 Proportion of population subjected to physical, psychological or sexual violence in the previous 12 months

[16.3.2](#)); other sexual crimes involving 13-15 year olds;¹¹⁷ and other sexually coercive conduct against a child aged 13-15 (relevant to indicators [16.2.1](#) and [16.2.3](#)).¹¹⁸

In some cases, the situation has apparently worsened: e.g. increasing number of crimes recorded (relevant to indicators [16.1.3](#) and [16.3.1](#)); increases in reports of sexual assault against a child aged 13-15¹¹⁹; sexual assault against a child under 13; other sexually coercive conduct against a child under 13 (relevant to indicator [16.2.1](#)); domestic abuse (relevant to indicator [16.2.1](#)); and human trafficking (indicator [16.2.2](#)). The different age ranges, along with categories of offence make it difficult to give an overall trend regarding target [16.2.1](#) and [16.2.3](#).

Inclusive and Transparent Institutions: Areas of improvement include the proportion of population who believe decision-making is inclusive and responsive, (indicator [16.7.1](#)) and primary government expenditures as a proportion of original approved budget, (indicator [16.6.1](#)). Proportion of the population satisfied with their last experience of public services ([16.6.2](#)). Public perceptions of police (relevant to indicator [16.3.1](#)) are roughly unchanged.

Rights and Equality: The level of hate crime has decreased (relevant to indicator [16.b.1](#)). Access to information, presence of an NHRI, and birth registration all meet the target. On levels of discrimination across different vectors (i.e. race, religion, ethnicity etc.), it is impossible at this stage to reach any conclusions without further, deeper analysis of the data. In some cases, the lack of available data might suggest that there are simply no examples of these practices. Targets that fall within this more ambiguous group are [16.4](#) and [16.5](#).

Delivery

In respect of [SDG 16](#), delivery encompasses a range of legislation on such issues as crime, criminal justice and equality. Relevant policy framework includes Justice in Scotland: Vision and Priorities, 2017 to 2020; Scotland's National Performance Framework (national outcomes and indicators) and a range of targeted policies on such issues as Crime prevention and reduction; Violence against women and girls; and human rights.

The overarching framework on crime and justice in Scotland is *Justice in Scotland: Vision and Priorities, 2017 to 2020*, which sets out a vision for a modern justice system to meet the needs of people in Scotland.¹²⁰ An accompanying delivery plan sets out the key actions that the Scottish Government, justice organisations and partners are taking during 2017 and 2018.¹²¹ Scotland also has a crime prevention and reduction policy in place, which addresses several issues pertinent to [SDG 16](#) indicators, including human trafficking, violence against women and girls, and violence and knife crime. There is a broad range of laws that are applicable under this section, which cuts across

¹¹⁷ Sexual Crimes Include Rape; Attempted rape (see Scottish Government, *Recorded Crime in Scotland, 2017-18*, p110 <https://www2.gov.scot/Publications/2018/09/2051>).

¹¹⁸ Other sexual crimes includes: coercive conduct; Other sexual crimes involving 13-15 year old children; Taking, distribution, possession etc. of indecent photos of children; Incest; Unnatural crimes; Public indecency; Sexual exposure; Threatening to disclose and intimate image; Disclosure of an intimate image; and Other sexual crimes (see Scottish Government, *Recorded Crime in Scotland, 2017-18*, <https://www2.gov.scot/Publications/2018/09/2051>, p 111).

¹¹⁹ Sexual assault Includes: Contact sexual assault (13-15 year old or adult 16+); Sexually coercive conduct (13-15 year old or adult 16+); Sexual crimes against children under 13 years; Lewd and libidinous practices (see Scottish Government, *Recorded Crime in Scotland, 2017-18*, <https://www2.gov.scot/Publications/2018/09/2051>, p 111)

¹²⁰ Scottish Government, *Justice in Scotland: Vision and Priorities, 2017 to 2020*, <https://www.gov.scot/publications/justice-scotland-vision-priorities/>

¹²¹ See Scottish Government, *Justice in Scotland: vision and priorities delivery plan, 2017-2018*, <https://www.gov.scot/publications/justice-vision-priorities-delivery-plan-2017-18/>

multiple themes. A useful illustration is legislation on children's rights, which include laws on domestic abuse, sexual violence, criminal law, modern slavery and human trafficking.

Various pieces of legislation, such as the Scotland Act 1998,¹²² Human Rights Act 1998,¹²³ and Equality Act, 2010¹²⁴ regulate the activities of public institutions. Scotland has a strong and effective NHRI. NHRIs, while required to be independent of the state pursuant to the Paris Principles, are included here namely because they serve the function of ensuring that the state and state institutions are complying with international human rights standards.

Scotland also has several policies in place, which seek to improve the performance of public institutions and increase inclusivity. Efforts towards the former include policies on local government and improving public services.

In respect of inclusiveness, Scotland also has in place a policy on community empowerment, which includes such actions as 'supporting public service providers to work together and with local communities via community planning to shape and deliver better services.'¹²⁵ In December 2018 the Scottish Government published its second Open Government Partnership National Action Plan for 2018-2020, focused on financial transparency, and on improved inclusiveness and political participation at all levels. The Local Governance Review – assessing local decision making and local democracy – is ongoing.

Scotland has a range of anti-discrimination and equality laws in place. There is also a strong policy framework, with policies targeting specific groups and issues (i.e. human rights, women, LGBT, gypsy/travellers, faith and religion).

¹²² Scotland Act 1998: <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1998/46/contents>

¹²³ Human Rights Act: <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1998/42/contents>

¹²⁴ The Equality Act 2010: <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/contents>

¹²⁵ See Scottish Government, *Community empowerment*, <https://www.gov.scot/policies/community-empowerment/>

Goal 17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development

Goal 17 targets reflect the different means of implementing Agenda 2030. A number of these targets focus on overseas action and are addressed in the later section on Scotland's international action. Some are applicable in the Scottish context, , even though they might be more relevant in other national contexts (and the indicators are often skewed towards such contexts). Targets cover taxation, policy coherence for sustainable development, promotion of partnerships, and measuring development beyond GDP

Summary

[Goal 17](#) covers a range of issues, only a few of which are relevant to the Scottish domestic context. A number of these, in turn, relate to the presence of particular frameworks or policies. Scotland performs well in these terms, though the detail of the relevant policy frameworks – especially the National Performance Framework as a tool for policy coherence, and the way that stakeholder networks are engaged, are matters for deeper investigation.

Data Availability

17.1.1	17.1.2	17.14.1	17.16.1	17.17.1	17.19.2

Data availability commentary

The most relevant indicators for Scotland here are largely non-statistical – in particular, the indicator on frameworks for coherent policymaking ([17.14](#)) and the presence of multi-stakeholder partnerships. Data on the statistical indicators is generally good.

Performance

Scotland has a National Performance Framework aligned to the SDGs, addressing indicator [17.16.1](#), and the extent and character of that alignment is the focus of a later section. As highlighted earlier, there is an umbrella SDG-oriented multi-stakeholder partnership in Scotland, “SDG network Scotland”.¹²⁶ Scotland has an effective national statistical service and a regular census. The *targets* here offer broader, and perhaps more relevant, ambitions for Scotland than the content of the specific indicators selected to track them at the global level. For example, Scotland is committed to measuring national progress beyond GDP (target [17.19](#)) and the ambition of target ([17.17](#)) to encourage effective partnerships of all kinds might well align with Scotland's approach to governance outlined at the outset of this paper. Elsewhere, as a devolved administration, how much of Scotland's revenue comes from domestic taxation is an intensely political question where

¹²⁶ Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations, *The Global Goals for Sustainable Development in Scotland: SDG Network*. <https://globalgoals.scot/scotlands-sustainable-development-goals-network/>

“performance” is beyond the scope of this report to judge. This SDG also asks after the character of mixed public-private partnerships, judged by amount of state expenditure committed to public private and civil society partnerships. Clearly, given the vexed issue of Private Finance Initiative funding in Scotland, public-private finance is not always a boon; though funding civil society engagement, and engaging the private sector, is part of the ethos of the SDGs.

Delivery

As outlined above, for many of these indicators, the presence of delivery structures is itself the indicator of performance, and a thorough judgement depends on investigation of the detail. For example, an NPF aligned to the SDGs does not guarantee policy coherence for sustainable development (target [17.14](#)). Policy coherence is a wider issue of how policy choices are made to take advantage of synergies between sustainable development objectives, and avoid damaging trade-offs. Importantly, one dimension of policy coherence is between *internal* and *external*-facing policies – the effects of policies in Scotland on people across the world. Another dimension is between present and future generations – the effects of current policies on future inhabitants of Scotland. These dimensions cannot be examined in this paper.

Section 4: Alignment between the NPF and the SDGs

Introduction

As outlined earlier, Scotland operates on a National Performance Framework, recently updated to be “SDG aligned”. The NPF is comprised of a set of 11 national outcomes, and these have been mapped against SDG goal areas as an exercise of determining, roughly, the overall or ‘high-level’ alignment between the frameworks. High level alignment – mapping the 17 Goals of the SDGs against NPF outcomes – is a worthwhile strategic exercise. However, here we focus on alignment at a closer level: how the 81 indicators under these 11 outcomes of the NPF map against SDG targets and indicators.

It must be noted from the outset that the results of this analysis should be treated with caution. The NPF can align with the SDGs despite a lack of overlap in what, precisely, is measured – not least, the SDGs are nationally owned and differentiated and countries are expected to design their own indicators in response to the SDGs. Nevertheless, this exercise might inform an aspect of the national debate in Scotland around the SDGs and indeed the future of the NPF: is there anything in the SDGs, that Scotland currently does not measure, that it ought to? The high-level fit established so far represents a kind of *passive* alignment; mapping the two frameworks against each other and highlighting where they overlap. But the exercise we undertake here might form the basis for making a decision on whether to *actively* align the NPF to the SDGs over time – that is, orient the NPF more towards specific SDG targets and indicators. It might also add to the store of knowledge that would underpin the use of the NPF as a model for other countries in their own approaches to governance for the SDGs.

Method

Two experienced assessors, combed SDG indicators (and less directly, targets and goals) for fit with the indicators for each NPF outcome, using both the indicator title and the full descriptive text as the basis to seek a match. Where we found a close SDG indicator – one that measures the same concept, broadly speaking, as the NPF indicator, we record that in the green column in the charts that follow as a “**close SDG indicator**”. Where we found an indicator in the SDG global set that measured not the same concept, but something that was clearly related – for example, a metric that might be a partial proxy, a near neighbour, or address another dimension of the same underlying issue, we identify this in the charts that follow as a “**related SDG indicator**”. Where we could find no close or relevant metrics, we looked for more distant relationships with the SDGs – where there was a genuine link with an aspect of the SDG agenda, even though there was no real overlap. We recorded instances of this in the “**distant or diffuse SDG relevance**” column of the tables that follow. In this final category, looking at more general relations between the NPF and SDGs, we also looked for cases where an NPF indicator spoke to the general idea of some SDG targets, or even the headline ambitions of particular SDG goals.

It is important to note that the SDG indicators were not *uniquely* identified with NPF indicators—in several cases, a single SDG indicator was identified as having a related or distant/diffuse identification with several NPF indicators. It is also important to note the key limitations to such an exercise. Some of the NPF indicators still in development, and some of the SDG indicators are

unclear, open to interpretation, and under development: hence, the indicators involved might be prone to competing evaluations, and evaluations might change in the future as indicators develop.

Below, we present the results of this analysis by National Outcome area, and then offer some analysis of (and broader reflections on) these results.

National Outcome:

We have a globally competitive, entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable economy.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Productivity	Scottish Government's Labour Productivity and Quarterly National Accounts Scotland. OECD Productivity Statistics Portal		8.2.1 10.4.1	
International exporting	Export Statistics Scotland		9.1.2	
Economic growth	Office of the Chief Economic Adviser. Office for National Statistics	8.1.1		
Carbon footprint	Leeds University and Scottish Government			12.2.1 Goal 13
Natural Capital	Scottish Natural Heritage: Natural Capital Asset Index			Goal 2 Target 6.6 Goal 15
Greenhouse gas emissions	National Atmospheric Emissions Inventory			Goal 13 (and by extension, Paris Climate Change Agreement)
Access to superfast broadband	Ofcom - Connected Nations Report	17.6.2	Target 9.c 17.8.1	
Spend on research and development	Gross Expenditure on Research and Development Scotland 2016, Scottish Government and Main Science and Technology Indicators 2017/2, OECD	9.5.1		
Income Inequalities	Family Resources Survey		10.1.1	Target 10.3 Target 10.4
Entrepreneurial activity	Global Entrepreneurship Monitor UK Monitoring Report			

National Outcome:

We are open, connected and make a positive contribution internationally.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
A positive experience for people coming to Scotland	NPF Indicator under development			8.9.1 12.b.1
Scotland's reputation	Anholt GfK-Roper Nation Brands Index (NBI)			
Scotland's population	Under assessment			10.7.2
Trust in public organisations	Under assessment	16.6.2 16.7.2		
International relationships	Under assessment			Target 16.6 17.5.1 17.6.1
Contribution of development support to other nations	Under assessment		17.2.1 17.9.1	

National Outcome:

We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Relative poverty after housing costs	Scottish Household Survey	1.2.2 1.2.1		
Wealth inequalities	Wealth and Assets survey			10.1.1 Target 10.3 Target 10.4
Cost of living	Living Costs and Food Survey			2.1.1 Target 11.1 Target 7.1
Unmanageable debt	Option: measure the percentage of households where the household is falling behind with bills or credit commitments and either making excessive debt repayments or is in arrears on monthly commitments (liquidity problems); or where the household is burdened by high debt levels relative to annual income (solvency problems)			
Persistent poverty	Understanding Society Survey	1.2.2 1.2.1		
Satisfaction with housing	Scottish House Condition Survey		11.1.1	
Food insecurity	Scottish Health Survey -UN Food Insecurity Experience Scale questions	2.1.2		

National Outcome:**We live in communities that are inclusive, empowered resilient and safe.**

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Perceptions of local area	Scottish Household Survey			11.2.1 11.7.2 16.1.4
Loneliness	NPF Indicator under development			
Perceptions of local crime rate	Scottish Crime and Justice Survey		16.1.4	
Community land ownership	NPF Indicator under development			1.4.2 11.3.2
Crime victimisation	Scottish Crime and Victimization survey		Target 5.2 11.7.2 16.1.3	
Access to green and blue space	Scottish Household Survey		11.7.1	
Places to interact	Scottish Household Survey			
Social capital	Currently unavailable			

National Outcome: We grow up loved, safe and respected so that we realise our full potential.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Child social and physical development	ISD Scotland		4.2.1	
Child wellbeing and happiness	Scottish Health Survey		4.2.1	
Children's voices	Young people in Scotland Survey			
Healthy start	National Records of Scotland	3.2.2		
Quality of children's services	Care Inspectorate, Early Learning and Childcare Statistics publication			4.a 4.1 4.2 4.3
Children have positive relationships	Scottish Schools Adolescent Lifestyle and Substance Use Survey			
Children's material deprivation	Family Resources Survey		1.2.2 1.3.1	

National Outcome:

We are well educated, skilled and able to contribute to society

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Educational attainment	Achievement of curriculum for Excellence Level statistics		4.1.1 4.5.1	
Confidence of children and young people	Children and Young People's Health and Wellbeing			
Resilience of children and young people	Children and Young People's Health and Wellbeing			(4.2.1 – for Under 5s)
Work place learning	Currently unavailable			
Engagement in extra-curricular activities	Children and Young People's Health and Wellbeing			
Young people's participation	Skills Development Scotland	4.3.1		
Skill profile of the population	Annual Population Survey	4.6.1	4.3.1 4.4.1	
Skill shortage vacancies	UK Employer Skills Survey			4.4.1 8.b.1
Skills underutilization	Annual Population Survey			

National Outcome:

We have thriving and innovative businesses, with quality jobs and fair work for everyone.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
The number of businesses	Business in Scotland 2017, Scottish Government			
High growth businesses	The Inter-Departmental Business Register			
Innovative businesses	UK Innovation Survey			9.5.1 9.b.1
Economic participation	Annual Population Survey	8.5.2		
Employees on the living wage	Annual Survey of Hours and Learning		8.5.1	
Pay gap	Annual Survey of Hours and Learning	8.5.1		
Contractually secure work	Annual Population Survey / Labour Force Survey		8.3.1	
Employee voice	Labour Force Survey / UK Employer skills survey		8.8.2	
Gender balance in organisations	Labour Force Survey		5.5 16.7.1	

National Outcome:

We are healthy and active.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Healthy life expectancy	Scottish Health Survey, Scottish Household Survey, National Records of Scotland births, deaths and populations data			Goal 3
Mental wellbeing	Scottish Health Survey			3.4.2 Target 3.4
Healthy weight	Scottish Health Survey		2.2.2	
Health risk behaviours	Scottish Health Survey		3.5.1 3.5.2	
Physical activity	Scottish Health Survey			
Journeys by active travel	Scottish Household Survey			11.2
Quality of healthcare experience	Health and Care Experience Survey			Target 3.8
Work related ill health	Annual Population Survey		8.8.1	
Premature mortality	National Records of Scotland - Scottish Government Health Analytical Services Unit			

National Outcomes:

We are creative and our vibrant and diverse cultures are expressed and enjoyed widely.

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Attendance at cultural events or places of culture	Scottish Household Survey			
Participation in a cultural activity	Scottish Household Survey			
Growth in cultural economy	Annual Business Survey, Office for National Statistics		11.4	
People working in arts and culture	Business Register and Employment Survey, Office for National Statistics			

National Outcome:

We value, enjoy, protect and enhance our environment

Indicator	Data source	Close SDG Indicators:	Related SDG Indicators:	Distant or Diffuse SDG relevance
Visits to the outdoors	Scottish Recreation Survey			11.7.1
State of historic sites	Scottish House Condition Survey		11.4	
Condition of protected nature sites	Scottish Natural Heritage		15.1.2 15.4.1	
Energy from renewable sources	Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy - Sub-national Total final energy consumption	7.2.1		
Waste generated	Scottish Environmental Protection Agency		12.5 12.5.1	
Sustainability of fish stocks	Sea Fisheries statistics	14.4.1		
Biodiversity	Scottish Natural Heritage		15.4 15.5	
Marine environment AKA Clean Seas	NPF Indicator under development		14.1 (14.1.1) 14.2.1 14.5.1	

National Outcome:

We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination

Indicator	Data source	SDG Indicators: Close	SDG Indicators: Relevant	SDG Indicators: Distant
Public services treat people with dignity and respect	NPF Indicator under development		16.6.2	
Quality of public services	Scottish Household Survey	16.6.2		
Influence over local decisions	Scottish Household Survey		16.7.2	11.3.2
Access to justice	Scottish Crime and Justice Survey			16.3

Analysis

Overall, roughly half of the National Outcome indicators had SDG indicators that were closely aligned or relevant (green or yellow). We found that 15 out of the 81 (19%) National Outcome indicators had a closely aligned (green) SDG indicator. 29 out of the 81 NPF indicators (36%) had relevant (yellow) SDG indicators; 2 of these also had green level indicators.

National Outcomes vary a great deal in terms of how many closely aligned/relevant SDG indicators they have. National Outcomes addressing poverty, business, the economy more generally, and the environment, have a relatively high proportion of closely aligned/relevant SDG indicators. Those National Outcomes focusing on culture and community have *no* closely aligned SDG indicators. In some ways, then, the differences between SDG and NPF indicators reflects SDGs' focus on the economic, social and environmental pillars of sustainable development over the richer, more specific facets that the NPF chooses to measure.

Some SDGs are well-represented by the indicators of the NPF. [SDG 4](#), which relates to education, is reasonably well-represented in the NPF; two of its targets have been deemed closely aligned and four have been deemed relevant. [SDG 8](#), which relates to economic development, is also reasonably well-represented in the NPF, with three closely aligned indicators and a further two relevant indicators. SDGs related to poverty ([SDG 1](#)), hunger and food security ([SDG 2](#)), health ([SDG 3](#)), energy ([SDG 7](#)), infrastructure ([SDG 9](#)), and justice ([SDG 16](#)), all had at least one closely aligned indicator. Given the difference in size and scope of the NPF v. the SDGs, this might be thought a reasonable representation of these goals.

Two goals that stand out as having relatively little representation in the NPF are [SDG 5](#) (gender) and [SDG 10](#) (inequality). Where the NPF does engage directly with the issue of inequality, this is focused largely on economic inequality, rather than narrowing in specifically on some of the many dimensions or bases for inequality, e.g. gender, race, disability or other characteristics. Inequality is to some extent a crosscutting issue, and it might be that it can be captured by disaggregation and comparison for outcomes and access across different social groupings. Nevertheless, if the NPF will guide action and policymaking, then the absence of a focus on *parity*, and on the fates of marginalised, discriminated against, or disadvantaged, might be an issue for further examination.

Some National Outcomes have no closely aligned indicators because they push beyond the expectations of the SDGs. The National Outcomes regarding children and education move beyond what the SDGs require, particularly in [SDG 4](#), in their focus on children's emotional development and economic circumstances.

As a further example of this approach to a richer and 'stretched' set of national objectives, the National Outcome regarding community is most closely related to SDG [goal 11](#) on cities and communities. However, the NPF indicators push significantly beyond the SDG indicators, engaging in aspects of community life such as access to green and blue space and places to interact. The yet-to-be-developed indicators on loneliness and social capital also engage more thoroughly with the concept of community than [goal 11](#) allows for. At the same time, though, the NPF seems relatively disengaged from the content of [goal 11](#) (cities and communities) and [goal 12](#) (sustainable consumption and production). Given Scotland's highly urban demographics, it might be thought surprising that SDG issues such as public transport, urban sprawl and waste management are not allotted their own indicators in the NPF.

The Health national outcome and the 'Health' SDG - [3](#) - share no close indicators, though several SDG indicators are relevant to the NPF ones. The indicators under [SDG 3](#) are generally more specific than the ones chosen under the NPF. For instance, the SDG indicator (target [3.5](#)) for alcohol focuses on the availability of treatment options and the total volume of alcohol consumed; whereas the NPF indicator gives the much less specific metric of how many people are engaging in risky behaviours. The government might also consider whether the SDG indicators related to target [3.4](#) on death by non-communicable diseases are worth engaging with more directly; this target includes the number of deaths by suicide, and number of deaths due to cardiovascular disease, cancer, diabetes or chronic respiratory disease. Again, these indicators are more specific – and perhaps more action-guiding - than the NPF indicator of premature mortality. SDG target [3.9](#), regarding deaths from hazardous chemicals and pollution, is another SDG target the Scottish government might engage with, given the current political discussion around air pollution. Integrating SDG target [3.8](#) regarding universal access to healthcare might highlight, and assess, Scotland's NHS.

Assessing the NPF from the standpoint of the SDG indicators and targets, then, allows for an assessment of how the NPF embodies a distinctive set of priorities. It highlights where NPF indicators cluster, and where aspects of the SDGs are not clearly addressed in what gets measured. It may be that this question of indicator distribution merits further discussion – across 2 national outcome areas, for example, there are 11 indicators on the physical, social and educational attainment of children, but no indicator clearly focused on care for the elderly.

It also allows for reflection on the differing character of the indicators. On balance, the SDG indicators are less perceptions-based than the NPF indicators on the same subjects. This, of course, is purposeful. It reflects Scotland's excellent survey-based statistics capacity which might be a significant challenge in other contexts globally, but also the specific reasons for choosing to measure some indicators over others. While good survey data can be excellent and highly reliable, the inherent uncertainty that comes along with sample data makes year-on-year changes challenging to estimate, and this is significant in making judgements about progress over time. Overall, depending on the aim of measurement, each kind of data possesses advantages and drawbacks. This contrast in approach between the SDGs and the NPF, though, might merit further consideration.

Conclusions and Future Development

One question posed by this analysis is the relationship between success for Scotland *measured on the NPF*, and *attainment of the SDGs* in Scotland by 2030 – whether, for example, success on one would lead to success in terms of the other. Given that the NPF is meant to be a key vehicle for Scotland's achievement of the SDGs, with the NPF intended to highlight and track certain outcomes as part of an effort to coordinate government action, any gaps between NPF and SDG indicator sets warrant further reflection.

This analysis, it should be noted, has not systematically examined "leave no one behind" in terms of data disaggregation for each of the indicators. It is also an important limitation of this evaluation that it has not assessed the NPF from the standpoint of policy coherence – whether the NPF facilitates policies that address and respect interlinkages across the different outcome areas. These are both areas for further research.

Further engagement with the SDG indicators might also give some clearer guidance for NPF indicators that have not yet been developed. For instance, the Marine Environment indicator under the environmental National Outcome does not yet have a clearly developed precise indicator; here,

the government might look to the indicators for [SDG 14](#) (life at sea) and consider adopting some of these. Not least, this would strengthen the connection between the National Outcome and Sustainable Development Goal indicators whilst using the efforts of the IAEG-SDGs as source of guidance on how to measure clean Seas.

The NPF has overarching objectives, but does not commit to specific end-point targets on each indicator. It should be recognised that this lack of specificity is intentional, and also that the SDG targets are patchy in terms of their quality. Nevertheless, the ambitions of the SDGs might be helpful in suggesting or calibrating target levels, if more detailed target-setting is deemed important in the Scottish context.

Lastly, the exercise undertaken here stops short of overlaying this picture of indicator-to-indicator alignment onto the strategic, high level alignment identified between the SDGs and the NPF, but this is an obvious next step in terms of better understanding the degree and character of alignment between the NPF and the SDGs.

Section 5: The SDGs and Scotland's International Role

Introduction

This project has looked at how the SDGs apply to Scotland domestically: but, as outlined in the methodology, not all targets are intended to apply to the domestic affairs of every country. Some - especially in [goal 17](#), but also elsewhere - are intended to guide the “global partnership for sustainable development”, aiming at global action on systemic issues and international drivers and challenges. Others are especially targeted at development cooperation relationships – explicitly reference overseas development assistance, for example – and still others direct attention specifically to developing countries and their challenges or policies. As identified earlier, Scotland's strategy for international aid and wider international cooperation is specifically presented, like the NPF, as SDG-aligned.

This component of the project offers a brief assessment of Scotland's action in respect of these international dimensions.

Approximately 50 targets and their associated indicators from amongst the SDGs are best understood as relevant to Scotland's international role. This section has two parts. In the first part, the paper presents a taxonomy of these targets, splitting them into four thematic categories, and also considers two underpinning principles of SDG implementation - that they *leave no one behind* in implementation and review, and that they are an integrated agenda to be realised through *policy coherence for sustainable development*. Together, these become the point of comparison for a mapping and assessment of Scotland's international contribution. In the second part, I then briefly assess the alignment of aspects of Scotland's international role against these criteria.

The SDGs and the international activity of developed countries

Broadly speaking, the 50 or so SDG targets relevant to the overseas activity of developed countries fall into four categories.

First, the SDGs steer **development assistance** – both in (1) its sources, its level, and its focus countries and (2) its targets, priorities, and outcomes. Some SDGs set out general principles about levels of ODA (0.7%) and sources (e.g. [17.2](#); [17.3](#)); about respect for the policy space of recipient countries ([17.15](#)); SDGs variously highlight the need for development assistance to flow to support the development of national statistical services ([17.18](#)), poverty alleviation policies ([1.a](#)) and healthcare ([3.c](#))

Second, the SDGs agree ambitious objectives for **global governance and regulation** – including international law in general, trade and finance agreements (e.g. [8.a](#), [10.a](#)) and markets ([2.b](#), [2.c](#); [17.13](#))

Third, the SDGs set targets for specific processes of **global coordination and cooperation** that are to constitute, together, the revitalised global partnership. Particular targets address aspects of that cooperation ([17.16](#), [17.19](#), [6.a](#))

Fourth, the SDGs envisage a track of development activity focused on **technology and research transfer**, including a technology bank (e.g. [17.7](#), [17.8](#))

Two of the underpinning principles are also relevant to all external activity (the third, Universality, is arguably expressed in the targets identified above):

Leave no one behind. The SDGs demand a focus on “leaving no one behind”. In contrast to the MDGs that too often focused on “low hanging fruit”, Agenda 2030 places a premium on reaching the poorest, most vulnerable, and marginalised. It is, in part, a matter of human rights-based and gender-sensitive development, but it goes beyond this as a pledge of the entire framework, and a distinctive requirement of reporting and review. The principle of focusing on the poorest, most vulnerable and most marginalised groups is surprisingly complex in how it is to be understood, and its implications for policy. What seems clear, though, is that it shifts the debate on value for money in aid by placing a premium on reaching groups who are hardest to reach. It seems clear, also, that not all development activity does an equally good job of realising good outcomes for marginalised groups. Lastly, leave no one behind might reinforce the need for the participation of such groups in development processes and processes of review.

Policy Coherence for Sustainable Development. As outlined earlier, the integrated nature of this agenda results in a focus on *policy coherence for sustainable development*. In respect of international development, this first demands acknowledgement of all three pillars of sustainable development - the inseparability of economic, social and environmental concerns in international aid activity. This is partly reflected in the four categories above, for example in monitoring aid for sustainable agriculture or conservation activities, and the kind of research and technology to be transferred.

Evaluating Scotland’s overseas agenda

Scotland’s overseas development activity

(1) Nature and orientation of development assistance

The level of Scotland’s development assistance is unproblematic in light of the relevant SDG ambition. The UK as a whole is compliant with the 0.7% global target, and Scotland shares in its contribution to this figure. Scotland also has a £3m Climate Justice Fund addressing SDG target [13.a](#).

Scotland’s aid is focused on four particular country links – Malawi, Zambia, Rwanda, and Pakistan. The ‘global partnership’ is wholly compatible with countries focusing on existing links and partnerships – indeed, there might be reasons to think that this should be encouraged. A general problem, of course, would be the *overall* distribution of development assistance across the global partnership, and whether this reflected priority areas and themes. In this respect, Scotland’s aid funding aligns well with the SDGs. Malawi, Zambia and Rwanda are all landlocked and least developed countries which are identified by the SDGs as priorities for development assistance.

Aid is disbursed to projects through the International Development Fund. The priority areas for funding are identified as “education, health, sustainable economic development, civic governance and society, food security, renewable energy, climate change, water”¹²⁷ all of which align with SDG goals or targets earmarked in the SDGs for special assistance (renewable energy, for example).

Aligning with the SDGs’ focus on capacity building, a stream of Scotland’s International Development Fund is specifically earmarked for such activity.¹²⁸ Clearly, general partnership agreements are in

¹²⁷ Scottish Government, *Policy: International development* <https://www.gov.scot/policies/international-development/development-assistance-programmes/>

¹²⁸ e.g. Scottish Government, *Policy: International development*, p9

place between the Scottish Government and the governments of developing country partners. Reflecting target [10.b](#), there is mention of encouraging inwards investment by the private sector. Nevertheless, it goes beyond this study to examine how far the particular projects funded mesh with the national plans of these partner countries, and so effectively “respect the policy space” of developing countries.

(2) Global Governance and Regulation

Scotland’s contribution here as an independent actor can only be informal; here, the UK as the signatory state to United Nations agreements, or as holding the membership of the WTO or the World Bank for example, is the key actor. There might be scope for a further assessment informal Scottish initiatives and strategies to encourage SDG fulfilment in, say, global financial regulation or reform of global institutions.

(3) Global cooperation

The language of partnership and collaboration is ever-present in the national strategy, and in the descriptions of the particular projects funded by the scheme. A cooperative spirit of partnership is evidenced, for example, in the partnership agreement with Malawi government¹²⁹ and partnership with other donors and civil society organisations is stressed.¹³⁰ The Scottish International Development Alliance functions as an umbrella group for Scottish NGOs working in international development.

(4) Tech transfer

Some initiatives do address research and tech transfer components; more generally, the Global Challenges Research Fund, which funds projects in Scottish universities, is partly designed to foster such activity and the Climate Justice Innovation Fund supports “projects developing innovative solutions for strengthening African communities against the effects of climate change”. More research is required, though, into how far Scotland does, and encourage, technology and research transfer.

(5) Leave no one behind

The principle of focusing on poorest most marginalised groups is surprisingly complex in how it is to be understood, and its implications for policy. What seems clear, though, is that it shifts the debate on value for money in aid by placing a premium on reaching groups who are hardest to reach. Emphasis on empowerment and human rights¹³¹ is welcome, but this, by itself, does not directly address how Leave No-one Behind is built into development funding, programming or evaluation.

Some identified programmes, of course, do address aspects of the “leave no one behind” agenda. Sense Scotland’s project on equal access to education for people with disabilities - Promoting equal access to education in Malawi North,¹³² and Christian Aid’s project in Zambia, as examples, are explicitly focused on the most marginalised. Overall, the projects funded are gender-aware and

¹²⁹ Scottish Government, *Global Goals Partnership Agreement between Scotland and Malawi* (2018).

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/global-goals-partnership-agreement-between-scotland-and-malawi/>

¹³⁰ e.g. Scottish Government, *Global Citizenship: Scotland’s International Development Strategy* (2016). p17

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/global-citizenship-scotlands-international-development-strategy/>

¹³¹ e.g. Scottish Government, *Global Citizenship: Scotland’s International Development Strategy* (2016)., p9

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/global-citizenship-scotlands-international-development-strategy/>

¹³² Scottish Government, *International Development Fund: Malawi projects 2018-2023* (2018).

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/international-development-fund-malawi-projects-2018-2023/>

disability-focused; but closer alignment with the needs of marginalised groups in Zambia, Rwanda, Malawi, cannot be tested. In general, further investigation is needed into how “leave no one behind” is operationalised: it is not prominent in the International Development Strategy or website pages. However, application forms do invite applicants to address the inclusion of vulnerable and marginalised groups, and also invite applicants to address how such groups have been consulted on their needs.

(6) Policy coherence

Coherent policymaking is emphasised in the strategy and elsewhere, for example in the report dedicated to the wider contribution of Scotland to SDG realisation. Related policy areas, and government strategies in those areas, are identified, in the “policy context” annex of the International Development Strategy. There is a clear commitment to the “beyond aid” agenda,¹³³ with cognate areas of Scottish Government identified. The extent of this commitment, though – e.g. in actively mapping areas of potential policy incoherence and developing strategies to address them – is not easily evidenced. In these respects, SIDA (Scotland’s International Development Alliance)’s report on Policy coherence identifies 6 focus areas where coherence could be further followed up.¹³⁴

Summary

Overall, there are no straightforward areas of misalignment between the SDGs and Scotland’s international development strategy. There are, however, areas where a further analysis is required before a definitive judgement is made. Notably, these include how ‘leave no one behind’ is operationalised in specific grants and the overall strategy, how effectively technology and research transfer is facilitated and encouraged, and how policy coherence is put into practice across the Scottish Government.

¹³³ Scottish Government, *Global Citizenship: Scotland’s International Development Strategy* (2016), p20. <https://www.gov.scot/publications/global-citizenship-scotlands-international-development-strategy/>

¹³⁴ NIDOS (Network of International Development Organisations in Scotland), now known as SIDA (Scotland’s International Development Alliance), *Scotland’s Place in Building a Just World: Shaping a coherent international development policy for Scotland* (2013). (<https://www.intdevalliance.scot/application/files/2815/0185/9508/ScotlandsPlaceReport.pdf>)

Annex A: Targets and Indicators of the Sustainable Development Goals

<i>Goals and targets (from the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development)</i>		<i>Indicators</i>
Goal 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere		
1.1 By 2030, eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, currently measured as people living on less than \$1.25 a day		1.1.1 Proportion of population below the international poverty line, by sex, age, employment status and geographical location (urban/rural)
1.2 By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions		1.2.1 Proportion of population living below the national poverty line, by sex and age
		1.2.2 Proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions
1.3 Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable		1.3.1 Proportion of population covered by social protection floors/systems, by sex, distinguishing children, unemployed persons, older persons, persons with disabilities, pregnant women, newborns, work-injury victims and the poor and the vulnerable
1.4 By 2030, ensure that all men and women, in particular the poor and the vulnerable, have equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to basic services, ownership and control over land and other forms of property, inheritance, natural resources, appropriate new technology and financial services, including microfinance		1.4.1 Proportion of population living in households with access to basic services
		1.4.2 Proportion of total adult population with secure tenure rights to land, (a) with legally recognized documentation, and (b) who perceive their rights to land as secure, by sex and type of tenure
1.5 By 2030, build the resilience of the poor and those in vulnerable situations and reduce their exposure and vulnerability to climate-related extreme events and other economic, social and environmental shocks and disasters		1.5.1 Number of deaths, missing persons and directly affected persons attributed to disasters per 100,000 population
		1.5.2 Direct economic loss attributed to disasters in relation to global gross domestic product (GDP)
		1.5.3 Number of countries that adopt and implement national disaster risk reduction strategies in line with the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015–2030
		1.5.4 Proportion of local governments that adopt and implement local disaster risk reduction strategies in line with national disaster risk reduction strategies

1.a Ensure significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources, including through enhanced development cooperation, in order to provide adequate and predictable means for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, to implement programmes and policies to end poverty in all its dimensions	1.a.1 Proportion of domestically generated resources allocated by the government directly to poverty reduction programmes
	1.a.2 Proportion of total government spending on essential services (education, health and social protection)
	1.a.3 Sum of total grants and non-debt-creating inflows directly allocated to poverty reduction programmes as a proportion of GDP
1.b Create sound policy frameworks at the national, regional and international levels, based on pro-poor and gender-sensitive development strategies, to support accelerated investment in poverty eradication actions	1.b.1 Proportion of government recurrent and capital spending to sectors that disproportionately benefit women, the poor and vulnerable groups
Goal 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture	
2.1 By 2030, end hunger and ensure access by all people, in particular the poor and people in vulnerable situations, including infants, to safe, nutritious and sufficient food all year round	2.1.1 Prevalence of undernourishment
	2.1.2 Prevalence of moderate or severe food insecurity in the population, based on the Food Insecurity Experience Scale (FIES)
2.2 By 2030, end all forms of malnutrition, including achieving, by 2025, the internationally agreed targets on stunting and wasting in children under 5 years of age, and address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating women and older persons	2.2.1 Prevalence of stunting (height for age <-2 standard deviation from the median of the World Health Organization (WHO) Child Growth Standards) among children under 5 years of age
	2.2.2 Prevalence of malnutrition (weight for height $>+2$ or <-2 standard deviation from the median of the WHO Child Growth Standards) among children under 5 years of age, by type (wasting and overweight)
2.3 By 2030, double the agricultural productivity and incomes of small-scale food producers, in particular women, indigenous peoples, family farmers, pastoralists and fishers, including through secure and equal access to land, other productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services, markets and opportunities for value addition and non-farm employment	2.3.1 Volume of production per labour unit by classes of farming/pastoral/forestry enterprise size
	2.3.2 Average income of small-scale food producers, by sex and indigenous status
2.4 By 2030, ensure sustainable food production systems and implement resilient agricultural practices that increase productivity and production, that help maintain ecosystems, that strengthen capacity for adaptation to climate change, extreme weather, drought, flooding and other disasters and that progressively improve land and soil quality	2.4.1 Proportion of agricultural area under productive and sustainable agriculture

2.5 By 2020, maintain the genetic diversity of seeds, cultivated plants and farmed and domesticated animals and their related wild species, including through soundly managed and diversified seed and plant banks at the national, regional and international levels, and promote access to and fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge, as internationally agreed	2.5.1 Number of plant and animal genetic resources for food and agriculture secured in either medium- or long-term conservation facilities
	2.5.2 Proportion of local breeds classified as being at risk, not at risk or at unknown level of risk of extinction
2.a Increase investment, including through enhanced international cooperation, in rural infrastructure, agricultural research and extension services, technology development and plant and livestock gene banks in order to enhance agricultural productive capacity in developing countries, in particular least developed countries	2.a.1 The agriculture orientation index for government expenditures
	2.a.2 Total official flows (official development assistance plus other official flows) to the agriculture sector
2.b Correct and prevent trade restrictions and distortions in world agricultural markets, including through the parallel elimination of all forms of agricultural export subsidies and all export measures with equivalent effect, in accordance with the mandate of the Doha Development Round	2.b.1 Agricultural export subsidies
2.c Adopt measures to ensure the proper functioning of food commodity markets and their derivatives and facilitate timely access to market information, including on food reserves, in order to help limit extreme food price volatility	2.c.1 Indicator of food price anomalies
Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages	
3.1 By 2030, reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per 100,000 live births	3.1.1 Maternal mortality ratio
	3.1.2 Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel
3.2 By 2030, end preventable deaths of newborns and children under 5 years of age, with all countries aiming to reduce neonatal mortality to at least as low as 12 per 1,000 live births and under-5 mortality to at least as low as 25 per 1,000 live births	3.2.1 Under-5 mortality rate
	3.2.2 Neonatal mortality rate
3.3 By 2030, end the epidemics of AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and neglected tropical diseases and combat hepatitis, water-borne diseases and other communicable diseases	3.3.1 Number of new HIV infections per 1,000 uninfected population, by sex, age and key populations
	3.3.2 Tuberculosis incidence per 100,000 population
	3.3.3 Malaria incidence per 1,000 population
	3.3.4 Hepatitis B incidence per 100,000 population

	3.3.5 Number of people requiring interventions against neglected tropical diseases
3.4 By 2030, reduce by one third premature mortality from non-communicable diseases through prevention and treatment and promote mental health and well-being	3.4.1 Mortality rate attributed to cardiovascular disease, cancer, diabetes or chronic respiratory disease
	3.4.2 Suicide mortality rate
3.5 Strengthen the prevention and treatment of substance abuse, including narcotic drug abuse and harmful use of alcohol	3.5.1 Coverage of treatment interventions (pharmacological, psychosocial and rehabilitation and aftercare services) for substance use disorders
	3.5.2 Harmful use of alcohol, defined according to the national context as alcohol per capita consumption (aged 15 years and older) within a calendar year in litres of pure alcohol
3.6 By 2020, halve the number of global deaths and injuries from road traffic accidents	3.6.1 Death rate due to road traffic injuries
3.7 By 2030, ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care services, including for family planning, information and education, and the integration of reproductive health into national strategies and programmes	3.7.1 Proportion of women of reproductive age (aged 15–49 years) who have their need for family planning satisfied with modern methods
	3.7.2 Adolescent birth rate (aged 10–14 years; aged 15–19 years) per 1,000 women in that age group
3.8 Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all	3.8.1 Coverage of essential health services (defined as the average coverage of essential services based on tracer interventions that include reproductive, maternal, newborn and child health, infectious diseases, non-communicable diseases and service capacity and access, among the general and the most disadvantaged population)
	3.8.2 Proportion of population with large household expenditures on health as a share of total household expenditure or income
3.9 By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination	3.9.1 Mortality rate attributed to household and ambient air pollution
	3.9.2 Mortality rate attributed to unsafe water, unsafe sanitation and lack of hygiene (exposure to unsafe Water, Sanitation and Hygiene for All (WASH) services)
	3.9.3 Mortality rate attributed to unintentional poisoning
3.a Strengthen the implementation of the World Health Organization Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in all countries, as appropriate	3.a.1 Age-standardized prevalence of current tobacco use among persons aged 15 years and older
3.b Support the research and development of vaccines and medicines for the communicable and non-communicable diseases that primarily affect developing countries, provide access to affordable	3.b.1 Proportion of the target population covered by all vaccines included in their national programme
	3.b.2 Total net official development assistance to medical research and basic health sectors

essential medicines and vaccines, in accordance with the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, which affirms the right of developing countries to use to the full the provisions in the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights regarding flexibilities to protect public health, and, in particular, provide access to medicines for all	3.b.3 Proportion of health facilities that have a core set of relevant essential medicines available and affordable on a sustainable basis
3.c Substantially increase health financing and the recruitment, development, training and retention of the health workforce in developing countries, especially in least developed countries and small island developing States	3.c.1 Health worker density and distribution
3.d Strengthen the capacity of all countries, in particular developing countries, for early warning, risk reduction and management of national and global health risks	3.d.1 International Health Regulations (IHR) capacity and health emergency preparedness
Goal 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all	
4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes	4.1.1 Proportion of children and young people (a) in grades 2/3; (b) at the end of primary; and (c) at the end of lower secondary achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex
4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education	4.2.1 Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex
	4.2.2 Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex
4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university	4.3.1 Participation rate of youth and adults in formal and non-formal education and training in the previous 12 months, by sex
4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship	4.4.1 Proportion of youth and adults with information and communications technology (ICT) skills, by type of skill
4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations	4.5.1 Parity indices (female/male, rural/urban, bottom/top wealth quintile and others such as disability status, indigenous peoples and conflict-affected, as data become available) for all education indicators on this list that can be disaggregated
4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and a substantial proportion of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy	4.6.1 Proportion of population in a given age group achieving at least a fixed level of proficiency in functional (a) literacy and (b) numeracy skills, by sex

4.7 By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development	4.7.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in (a) national education policies; (b) curricula; (c) teacher education; and (d) student assessment
4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all	4.a.1 Proportion of schools with access to (a) electricity; (b) the Internet for pedagogical purposes; (c) computers for pedagogical purposes; (d) adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities; (e) basic drinking water; (f) single-sex basic sanitation facilities; and (g) basic handwashing facilities (as per the WASH indicator definitions)
4.b By 2020, substantially expand globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries	4.b.1 Volume of official development assistance flows for scholarships by sector and type of study
4.c By 2030, substantially increase the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States	4.c.1 Proportion of teachers in: (a) pre-primary; (b) primary; (c) lower secondary; and (d) upper secondary education who have received at least the minimum organized teacher training (e.g. pedagogical training) pre-service or in-service required for teaching at the relevant level in a given country
Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls	
5.1 End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere	5.1.1 Whether or not legal frameworks are in place to promote, enforce and monitor equality and non-discrimination on the basis of sex
5.2 Eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual and other types of exploitation	5.2.1 Proportion of ever-partnered women and girls aged 15 years and older subjected to physical, sexual or psychological violence by a current or former intimate partner in the previous 12 months, by form of violence and by age
	5.2.2 Proportion of women and girls aged 15 years and older subjected to sexual violence by persons other than an intimate partner in the previous 12 months, by age and place of occurrence

5.3 Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilation	5.3.1 Proportion of women aged 20–24 years who were married or in a union before age 15 and before age 18
	5.3.2 Proportion of girls and women aged 15–49 years who have undergone female genital mutilation/cutting, by age
5.4 Recognize and value unpaid care and domestic work through the provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate	5.4.1 Proportion of time spent on unpaid domestic and care work, by sex, age and location
5.5 Ensure women’s full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life	5.5.1 Proportion of seats held by women in (a) national parliaments and (b) local governments
	5.5.2 Proportion of women in managerial positions
5.6 Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights as agreed in accordance with the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development and the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences	5.6.1 Proportion of women aged 15–49 years who make their own informed decisions regarding sexual relations, contraceptive use and reproductive health care
	5.6.2 Number of countries with laws and regulations that guarantee full and equal access to women and men aged 15 years and older to sexual and reproductive health care, information and education
5.a Undertake reforms to give women equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to ownership and control over land and other forms of property, financial services, inheritance and natural resources, in accordance with national laws	5.a.1 (a) Proportion of total agricultural population with ownership or secure rights over agricultural land, by sex; and (b) share of women among owners or rights-bearers of agricultural land, by type of tenure
	5.a.2 Proportion of countries where the legal framework (including customary law) guarantees women’s equal rights to land ownership and/or control
5.b Enhance the use of enabling technology, in particular information and communications technology, to promote the empowerment of women	5.b.1 Proportion of individuals who own a mobile telephone, by sex
5.c Adopt and strengthen sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels	5.c.1 Proportion of countries with systems to track and make public allocations for gender equality and women’s empowerment
Goal 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all	
6.1 By 2030, achieve universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all	6.1.1 Proportion of population using safely managed drinking water services
6.2 By 2030, achieve access to adequate and equitable sanitation and hygiene for all and end open defecation, paying special	6.2.1 Proportion of population using (a) safely managed sanitation services and (b) a hand-washing facility with soap and water

attention to the needs of women and girls and those in vulnerable situations	
6.3 By 2030, improve water quality by reducing pollution, eliminating dumping and minimizing release of hazardous chemicals and materials, halving the proportion of untreated wastewater and substantially increasing recycling and safe reuse globally	6.3.1 Proportion of wastewater safely treated
	6.3.2 Proportion of bodies of water with good ambient water quality
6.4 By 2030, substantially increase water-use efficiency across all sectors and ensure sustainable withdrawals and supply of freshwater to address water scarcity and substantially reduce the number of people suffering from water scarcity	6.4.1 Change in water-use efficiency over time
	6.4.2 Level of water stress: freshwater withdrawal as a proportion of available freshwater resources
6.5 By 2030, implement integrated water resources management at all levels, including through transboundary cooperation as appropriate	6.5.1 Degree of integrated water resources management implementation (0–100)
	6.5.2 Proportion of transboundary basin area with an operational arrangement for water cooperation
6.6 By 2020, protect and restore water-related ecosystems, including mountains, forests, wetlands, rivers, aquifers and lakes	6.6.1 Change in the extent of water-related ecosystems over time
6.a By 2030, expand international cooperation and capacity-building support to developing countries in water- and sanitation-related activities and programmes, including water harvesting, desalination, water efficiency, wastewater treatment, recycling and reuse technologies	6.a.1 Amount of water- and sanitation-related official development assistance that is part of a government-coordinated spending plan
6.b Support and strengthen the participation of local communities in improving water and sanitation management	6.b.1 Proportion of local administrative units with established and operational policies and procedures for participation of local communities in water and sanitation management
Goal 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all	
7.1 By 2030, ensure universal access to affordable, reliable and modern energy services	7.1.1 Proportion of population with access to electricity
	7.1.2 Proportion of population with primary reliance on clean fuels and technology
7.2 By 2030, increase substantially the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix	7.2.1 Renewable energy share in the total final energy consumption
7.3 By 2030, double the global rate of improvement in energy efficiency	7.3.1 Energy intensity measured in terms of primary energy and GDP
7.a By 2030, enhance international cooperation to facilitate access to clean energy research and technology, including renewable energy, energy efficiency and advanced and cleaner fossil-fuel technology, and promote investment in	7.a.1 International financial flows to developing countries in support of clean energy research and development and renewable energy production, including in hybrid systems

energy infrastructure and clean energy technology	
7.b By 2030, expand infrastructure and upgrade technology for supplying modern and sustainable energy services for all in developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and landlocked developing countries, in accordance with their respective programmes of support	7.b.1 Investments in energy efficiency as a proportion of GDP and the amount of foreign direct investment in financial transfer for infrastructure and technology to sustainable development services
Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all	
8.1 Sustain per capita economic growth in accordance with national circumstances and, in particular, at least 7 per cent gross domestic product growth per annum in the least developed countries	8.1.1 Annual growth rate of real GDP per capita
8.2 Achieve higher levels of economic productivity through diversification, technological upgrading and innovation, including through a focus on high-value added and labour-intensive sectors	8.2.1 Annual growth rate of real GDP per employed person
8.3 Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services	8.3.1 Proportion of informal employment in non-agriculture employment, by sex
8.4 Improve progressively, through 2030, global resource efficiency in consumption and production and endeavour to decouple economic growth from environmental degradation, in accordance with the 10-Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production, with developed countries taking the lead	8.4.1 Material footprint, material footprint per capita, and material footprint per GDP
	8.4.2 Domestic material consumption, domestic material consumption per capita, and domestic material consumption per GDP
8.5 By 2030, achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value	8.5.1 Average hourly earnings of female and male employees, by occupation, age and persons with disabilities
	8.5.2 Unemployment rate, by sex, age and persons with disabilities
8.6 By 2020, substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training	8.6.1 Proportion of youth (aged 15–24 years) not in education, employment or training

8.7 Take immediate and effective measures to eradicate forced labour, end modern slavery and human trafficking and secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, including recruitment and use of child soldiers, and by 2025 end child labour in all its forms	8.7.1 Proportion and number of children aged 5–17 years engaged in child labour, by sex and age
8.8 Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment	8.8.1 Frequency rates of fatal and non-fatal occupational injuries, by sex and migrant status
	8.8.2 Level of national compliance with labour rights (freedom of association and collective bargaining) based on International Labour Organization (ILO) textual sources and national legislation, by sex and migrant status
8.9 By 2030, devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products	8.9.1 Tourism direct GDP as a proportion of total GDP and in growth rate
	8.9.2 Proportion of jobs in sustainable tourism industries out of total tourism jobs
8.10 Strengthen the capacity of domestic financial institutions to encourage and expand access to banking, insurance and financial services for all	8.10.1 (a) Number of commercial bank branches per 100,000 adults and (b) number of automated teller machines (ATMs) per 100,000 adults
	8.10.2 Proportion of adults (15 years and older) with an account at a bank or other financial institution or with a mobile-money-service provider
8.a Increase Aid for Trade support for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, including through the Enhanced Integrated Framework for Trade-related Technical Assistance to Least Developed Countries	8.a.1 Aid for Trade commitments and disbursements
8.b By 2020, develop and operationalize a global strategy for youth employment and implement the Global Jobs Pact of the International Labour Organization	8.b.1 Existence of a developed and operationalized national strategy for youth employment, as a distinct strategy or as part of a national employment strategy
Goal 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation	
9.1 Develop quality, reliable, sustainable and resilient infrastructure, including regional and transborder infrastructure, to support economic development and human well-being, with a focus on affordable and equitable access for all	9.1.1 Proportion of the rural population who live within 2 km of an all-season road
	9.1.2 Passenger and freight volumes, by mode of transport
9.2 Promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and, by 2030, significantly raise industry's share of employment and gross domestic product, in line with national circumstances, and double its share in least developed countries	9.2.1 Manufacturing value added as a proportion of GDP and per capita
	9.2.2 Manufacturing employment as a proportion of total employment
9.3 Increase the access of small-scale industrial and other enterprises, in	9.3.1 Proportion of small-scale industries in total industry value added

particular in developing countries, to financial services, including affordable credit, and their integration into value chains and markets	9.3.2 Proportion of small-scale industries with a loan or line of credit
9.4 By 2030, upgrade infrastructure and retrofit industries to make them sustainable, with increased resource-use efficiency and greater adoption of clean and environmentally sound technologies and industrial processes, with all countries taking action in accordance with their respective capabilities	9.4.1 CO ₂ emission per unit of value added
9.5 Enhance scientific research, upgrade the technological capabilities of industrial sectors in all countries, in particular developing countries, including, by 2030, encouraging innovation and substantially increasing the number of research and development workers per 1 million people and public and private research and development spending	9.5.1 Research and development expenditure as a proportion of GDP
	9.5.2 Researchers (in full-time equivalent) per million inhabitants
9.a Facilitate sustainable and resilient infrastructure development in developing countries through enhanced financial, technological and technical support to African countries, least developed countries, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States	9.a.1 Total official international support (official development assistance plus other official flows) to infrastructure
9.b Support domestic technology development, research and innovation in developing countries, including by ensuring a conducive policy environment for, inter alia, industrial diversification and value addition to commodities	9.b.1 Proportion of medium and high-tech industry value added in total value added
9.c Significantly increase access to information and communications technology and strive to provide universal and affordable access to the Internet in least developed countries by 2020	9.c.1 Proportion of population covered by a mobile network, by technology
Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries	
10.1 By 2030, progressively achieve and sustain income growth of the bottom 40 per cent of the population at a rate higher than the national average	10.1.1 Growth rates of household expenditure or income per capita among the bottom 40 per cent of the population and the total population
10.2 By 2030, empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status	10.2.1 Proportion of people living below 50 per cent of median income, by sex, age and persons with disabilities

10.3 Ensure equal opportunity and reduce inequalities of outcome, including by eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and action in this regard	10.3.1 Proportion of population reporting having personally felt discriminated against or harassed in the previous 12 months on the basis of a ground of discrimination prohibited under international human rights law
10.4 Adopt policies, especially fiscal, wage and social protection policies, and progressively achieve greater equality	10.4.1 Labour share of GDP, comprising wages and social protection transfers
10.5 Improve the regulation and monitoring of global financial markets and institutions and strengthen the implementation of such regulations	10.5.1 Financial Soundness Indicators
10.6 Ensure enhanced representation and voice for developing countries in decision-making in global international economic and financial institutions in order to deliver more effective, credible, accountable and legitimate institutions	10.6.1 Proportion of members and voting rights of developing countries in international organizations
10.7 Facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well-managed migration policies	10.7.1 Recruitment cost borne by employee as a proportion of yearly income earned in country of destination
	10.7.2 Number of countries that have implemented well-managed migration policies
10.a Implement the principle of special and differential treatment for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, in accordance with World Trade Organization agreements	10.a.1 Proportion of tariff lines applied to imports from least developed countries and developing countries with zero-tariff
10.b Encourage official development assistance and financial flows, including foreign direct investment, to States where the need is greatest, in particular least developed countries, African countries, small island developing States and landlocked developing countries, in accordance with their national plans and programmes	10.b.1 Total resource flows for development, by recipient and donor countries and type of flow (e.g. official development assistance, foreign direct investment and other flows)
10.c By 2030, reduce to less than 3 per cent the transaction costs of migrant remittances and eliminate remittance corridors with costs higher than 5 per cent	10.c.1 Remittance costs as a proportion of the amount remitted
Goal 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable	
11.1 By 2030, ensure access for all to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic services and upgrade slums	11.1.1 Proportion of urban population living in slums, informal settlements or inadequate housing
11.2 By 2030, provide access to safe, affordable, accessible and sustainable transport systems for all, improving road safety, notably by expanding public transport, with special attention to the needs of those in vulnerable situations,	11.2.1 Proportion of population that has convenient access to public transport, by sex, age and persons with disabilities

women, children, persons with disabilities and older persons	
11.3 By 2030, enhance inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable human settlement planning and management in all countries	11.3.1 Ratio of land consumption rate to population growth rate
	11.3.2 Proportion of cities with a direct participation structure of civil society in urban planning and management that operate regularly and democratically
11.4 Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage	11.4.1 Total expenditure (public and private) per capita spent on the preservation, protection and conservation of all cultural and natural heritage, by type of heritage (cultural, natural, mixed and World Heritage Centre designation), level of government (national, regional and local/municipal), type of expenditure (operating expenditure/investment) and type of private funding (donations in kind, private non-profit sector and sponsorship)
11.5 By 2030, significantly reduce the number of deaths and the number of people affected and substantially decrease the direct economic losses relative to global gross domestic product caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and people in vulnerable situations	11.5.1 Number of deaths, missing persons and directly affected persons attributed to disasters per 100,000 population
	11.5.2 Direct economic loss in relation to global GDP, damage to critical infrastructure and number of disruptions to basic services, attributed to disasters
11.6 By 2030, reduce the adverse per capita environmental impact of cities, including by paying special attention to air quality and municipal and other waste management	11.6.1 Proportion of urban solid waste regularly collected and with adequate final discharge out of total urban solid waste generated, by cities
	11.6.2 Annual mean levels of fine particulate matter (e.g. PM2.5 and PM10) in cities (population weighted)
11.7 By 2030, provide universal access to safe, inclusive and accessible, green and public spaces, in particular for women and children, older persons and persons with disabilities	11.7.1 Average share of the built-up area of cities that is open space for public use for all, by sex, age and persons with disabilities
	11.7.2 Proportion of persons victim of physical or sexual harassment, by sex, age, disability status and place of occurrence, in the previous 12 months
11.a Support positive economic, social and environmental links between urban, peri-urban and rural areas by strengthening national and regional development planning	11.a.1 Proportion of population living in cities that implement urban and regional development plans integrating population projections and resource needs, by size of city
11.b By 2020, substantially increase the number of cities and human settlements adopting and implementing integrated policies and plans towards inclusion, resource efficiency, mitigation and adaptation to climate change, resilience to disasters, and develop and implement, in	11.b.1 Number of countries that adopt and implement national disaster risk reduction strategies in line with the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015–2030
	11.b.2 Proportion of local governments that adopt and implement local disaster risk reduction

line with the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015–2030, holistic disaster risk management at all levels	strategies in line with national disaster risk reduction strategies
11.c Support least developed countries, including through financial and technical assistance, in building sustainable and resilient buildings utilizing local materials	11.c.1 Proportion of financial support to the least developed countries that is allocated to the construction and retrofitting of sustainable, resilient and resource-efficient buildings utilizing local materials
Goal 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns	
12.1 Implement the 10-Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production Patterns, all countries taking action, with developed countries taking the lead, taking into account the development and capabilities of developing countries	12.1.1 Number of countries with sustainable consumption and production (SCP) national action plans or SCP mainstreamed as a priority or a target into national policies
12.2 By 2030, achieve the sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources	12.2.1 Material footprint, material footprint per capita, and material footprint per GDP
	12.2.2 Domestic material consumption, domestic material consumption per capita, and domestic material consumption per GDP
12.3 By 2030, halve per capita global food waste at the retail and consumer levels and reduce food losses along production and supply chains, including post-harvest losses	12.3.1 Global food loss index
12.4 By 2020, achieve the environmentally sound management of chemicals and all wastes throughout their life cycle, in accordance with agreed international frameworks, and significantly reduce their release to air, water and soil in order to minimize their adverse impacts on human health and the environment	12.4.1 Number of parties to international multilateral environmental agreements on hazardous waste, and other chemicals that meet their commitments and obligations in transmitting information as required by each relevant agreement
	12.4.2 Hazardous waste generated per capita and proportion of hazardous waste treated, by type of treatment
12.5 By 2030, substantially reduce waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse	12.5.1 National recycling rate, tons of material recycled
12.6 Encourage companies, especially large and transnational companies, to adopt sustainable practices and to integrate sustainability information into their reporting cycle	12.6.1 Number of companies publishing sustainability reports
12.7 Promote public procurement practices that are sustainable, in accordance with national policies and priorities	12.7.1 Number of countries implementing sustainable public procurement policies and action plans
12.8 By 2030, ensure that people everywhere have the relevant information and awareness for sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature	12.8.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development (including climate change education) are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies; (b) curricula; (c) teacher education; and (d) student assessment

12.a Support developing countries to strengthen their scientific and technological capacity to move towards more sustainable patterns of consumption and production	12.a.1 Amount of support to developing countries on research and development for sustainable consumption and production and environmentally sound technologies
12.b Develop and implement tools to monitor sustainable development impacts for sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products	12.b.1 Number of sustainable tourism strategies or policies and implemented action plans with agreed monitoring and evaluation tools
12.c Rationalize inefficient fossil-fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption by removing market distortions, in accordance with national circumstances, including by restructuring taxation and phasing out those harmful subsidies, where they exist, to reflect their environmental impacts, taking fully into account the specific needs and conditions of developing countries and minimizing the possible adverse impacts on their development in a manner that protects the poor and the affected communities	12.c.1 Amount of fossil-fuel subsidies per unit of GDP (production and consumption) and as a proportion of total national expenditure on fossil fuels
Goal 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts²	
13.1 Strengthen resilience and adaptive capacity to climate-related hazards and natural disasters in all countries	13.1.1 Number of deaths, missing persons and directly affected persons attributed to disasters per 100,000 population
	13.1.2 Number of countries that adopt and implement national disaster risk reduction strategies in line with the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015–2030
	13.1.3 Proportion of local governments that adopt and implement local disaster risk reduction strategies in line with national disaster risk reduction strategies
13.2 Integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies and planning	13.2.1 Number of countries that have communicated the establishment or operationalization of an integrated policy/strategy/plan which increases their ability to adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change, and foster climate resilience and low greenhouse gas emissions development in a manner that does not threaten food production (including a national adaptation plan, nationally determined contribution, national communication, biennial update report or other)
13.3 Improve education, awareness-raising and human and institutional capacity on climate change mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning	13.3.1 Number of countries that have integrated mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning into primary, secondary and tertiary curricula

	13.3.2 Number of countries that have communicated the strengthening of institutional, systemic and individual capacity-building to implement adaptation, mitigation and technology transfer, and development actions
13.a Implement the commitment undertaken by developed-country parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change to a goal of mobilizing jointly \$100 billion annually by 2020 from all sources to address the needs of developing countries in the context of meaningful mitigation actions and transparency on implementation and fully operationalize the Green Climate Fund through its capitalization as soon as possible	13.a.1 Mobilized amount of United States dollars per year between 2020 and 2025 accountable towards the \$100 billion commitment
13.b Promote mechanisms for raising capacity for effective climate change-related planning and management in least developed countries and small island developing States, including focusing on women, youth and local and marginalized communities	13.b.1 Number of least developed countries and small island developing States that are receiving specialized support, and amount of support, including finance, technology and capacity-building, for mechanisms for raising capacities for effective climate change-related planning and management, including focusing on women, youth and local and marginalized communities
Goal 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development	
14.1 By 2025, prevent and significantly reduce marine pollution of all kinds, in particular from land-based activities, including marine debris and nutrient pollution	14.1.1 Index of coastal eutrophication and floating plastic debris density
14.2 By 2020, sustainably manage and protect marine and coastal ecosystems to avoid significant adverse impacts, including by strengthening their resilience, and take action for their restoration in order to achieve healthy and productive oceans	14.2.1 Proportion of national exclusive economic zones managed using ecosystem-based approaches
14.3 Minimize and address the impacts of ocean acidification, including through enhanced scientific cooperation at all levels	14.3.1 Average marine acidity (pH) measured at agreed suite of representative sampling stations
14.4 By 2020, effectively regulate harvesting and end overfishing, illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing and destructive fishing practices and implement science-based management plans, in order to restore fish stocks in the shortest time feasible, at least to levels that can produce maximum sustainable yield as determined by their biological characteristics	14.4.1 Proportion of fish stocks within biologically sustainable levels

14.5 By 2020, conserve at least 10 per cent of coastal and marine areas, consistent with national and international law and based on the best available scientific information	14.5.1 Coverage of protected areas in relation to marine areas
14.6 By 2020, prohibit certain forms of fisheries subsidies which contribute to overcapacity and overfishing, eliminate subsidies that contribute to illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing and refrain from introducing new such subsidies, recognizing that appropriate and effective special and differential treatment for developing and least developed countries should be an integral part of the World Trade Organization fisheries subsidies negotiation ³	14.6.1 Progress by countries in the degree of implementation of international instruments aiming to combat illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing
14.7 By 2030, increase the economic benefits to small island developing States and least developed countries from the sustainable use of marine resources, including through sustainable management of fisheries, aquaculture and tourism	14.7.1 Sustainable fisheries as a proportion of GDP in small island developing States, least developed countries and all countries
14.a Increase scientific knowledge, develop research capacity and transfer marine technology, taking into account the Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission Criteria and Guidelines on the Transfer of Marine Technology, in order to improve ocean health and to enhance the contribution of marine biodiversity to the development of developing countries, in particular small island developing States and least developed countries	14.a.1 Proportion of total research budget allocated to research in the field of marine technology
14.b Provide access for small-scale artisanal fishers to marine resources and markets	14.b.1 Progress by countries in the degree of application of a legal/regulatory/policy/institutional framework which recognizes and protects access rights for small-scale fisheries
14.c Enhance the conservation and sustainable use of oceans and their resources by implementing international law as reflected in the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, which provides the legal framework for the conservation and sustainable use of oceans and their resources, as recalled in paragraph 158 of "The future we want"	14.c.1 Number of countries making progress in ratifying, accepting and implementing through legal, policy and institutional frameworks, ocean-related instruments that implement international law, as reflected in the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, for the conservation and sustainable use of the oceans and their resources
Goal 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss	

15.1 By 2020, ensure the conservation, restoration and sustainable use of terrestrial and inland freshwater ecosystems and their services, in particular forests, wetlands, mountains and drylands, in line with obligations under international agreements	15.1.1 Forest area as a proportion of total land area
	15.1.2 Proportion of important sites for terrestrial and freshwater biodiversity that are covered by protected areas, by ecosystem type
15.2 By 2020, promote the implementation of sustainable management of all types of forests, halt deforestation, restore degraded forests and substantially increase afforestation and reforestation globally	15.2.1 Progress towards sustainable forest management
15.3 By 2030, combat desertification, restore degraded land and soil, including land affected by desertification, drought and floods, and strive to achieve a land degradation-neutral world	15.3.1 Proportion of land that is degraded over total land area
15.4 By 2030, ensure the conservation of mountain ecosystems, including their biodiversity, in order to enhance their capacity to provide benefits that are essential for sustainable development	15.4.1 Coverage by protected areas of important sites for mountain biodiversity
	15.4.2 Mountain Green Cover Index
15.5 Take urgent and significant action to reduce the degradation of natural habitats, halt the loss of biodiversity and, by 2020, protect and prevent the extinction of threatened species	15.5.1 Red List Index
15.6 Promote fair and equitable sharing of the benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and promote appropriate access to such resources, as internationally agreed	15.6.1 Number of countries that have adopted legislative, administrative and policy frameworks to ensure fair and equitable sharing of benefits
15.7 Take urgent action to end poaching and trafficking of protected species of flora and fauna and address both demand and supply of illegal wildlife products	15.7.1 Proportion of traded wildlife that was poached or illicitly trafficked
15.8 By 2020, introduce measures to prevent the introduction and significantly reduce the impact of invasive alien species on land and water ecosystems and control or eradicate the priority species	15.8.1 Proportion of countries adopting relevant national legislation and adequately resourcing the prevention or control of invasive alien species
15.9 By 2020, integrate ecosystem and biodiversity values into national and local planning, development processes, poverty reduction strategies and accounts	15.9.1 Progress towards national targets established in accordance with Aichi Biodiversity Target 2 of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011–2020
15.a Mobilize and significantly increase financial resources from all sources to conserve and sustainably use biodiversity and ecosystems	15.a.1 Official development assistance and public expenditure on conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity and ecosystems

15.b Mobilize significant resources from all sources and at all levels to finance sustainable forest management and provide adequate incentives to developing countries to advance such management, including for conservation and reforestation	15.b.1 Official development assistance and public expenditure on conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity and ecosystems
15.c Enhance global support for efforts to combat poaching and trafficking of protected species, including by increasing the capacity of local communities to pursue sustainable livelihood opportunities	15.c.1 Proportion of traded wildlife that was poached or illicitly trafficked
Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels	
16.1 Significantly reduce all forms of violence and related death rates everywhere	16.1.1 Number of victims of intentional homicide per 100,000 population, by sex and age
	16.1.2 Conflict-related deaths per 100,000 population, by sex, age and cause
	16.1.3 Proportion of population subjected to (a) physical violence, (b) psychological violence and (c) sexual violence in the previous 12 months
	16.1.4 Proportion of population that feel safe walking alone around the area they live
16.2 End abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence against and torture of children	16.2.1 Proportion of children aged 1–17 years who experienced any physical punishment and/or psychological aggression by caregivers in the past month
	16.2.2 Number of victims of human trafficking per 100,000 population, by sex, age and form of exploitation
	16.2.3 Proportion of young women and men aged 18–29 years who experienced sexual violence by age 18
16.3 Promote the rule of law at the national and international levels and ensure equal access to justice for all	16.3.1 Proportion of victims of violence in the previous 12 months who reported their victimization to competent authorities or other officially recognized conflict resolution mechanisms
	16.3.2 Unsented detainees as a proportion of overall prison population
16.4 By 2030, significantly reduce illicit financial and arms flows, strengthen the recovery and return of stolen assets and combat all forms of organized crime	16.4.1 Total value of inward and outward illicit financial flows (in current United States dollars)
	16.4.2 Proportion of seized, found or surrendered arms whose illicit origin or context has been traced or established by a competent authority in line with international instruments
16.5 Substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all their forms	16.5.1 Proportion of persons who had at least one contact with a public official and who paid a bribe to a public official, or were asked for a bribe by those public officials, during the previous 12 months

	16.5.2 Proportion of businesses that had at least one contact with a public official and that paid a bribe to a public official, or were asked for a bribe by those public officials during the previous 12 months
16.6 Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels	16.6.1 Primary government expenditures as a proportion of original approved budget, by sector (or by budget codes or similar)
	16.6.2 Proportion of population satisfied with their last experience of public services
16.7 Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels	16.7.1 Proportions of positions (by sex, age, persons with disabilities and population groups) in public institutions (national and local legislatures, public service, and judiciary) compared to national distributions
	16.7.2 Proportion of population who believe decision-making is inclusive and responsive, by sex, age, disability and population group
16.8 Broaden and strengthen the participation of developing countries in the institutions of global governance	16.8.1 Proportion of members and voting rights of developing countries in international organizations
16.9 By 2030, provide legal identity for all, including birth registration	16.9.1 Proportion of children under 5 years of age whose births have been registered with a civil authority, by age
16.10 Ensure public access to information and protect fundamental freedoms, in accordance with national legislation and international agreements	16.10.1 Number of verified cases of killing, kidnapping, enforced disappearance, arbitrary detention and torture of journalists, associated media personnel, trade unionists and human rights advocates in the previous 12 months
	16.10.2 Number of countries that adopt and implement constitutional, statutory and/or policy guarantees for public access to information
16.a Strengthen relevant national institutions, including through international cooperation, for building capacity at all levels, in particular in developing countries, to prevent violence and combat terrorism and crime	16.a.1 Existence of independent national human rights institutions in compliance with the Paris Principles
16.b Promote and enforce non-discriminatory laws and policies for sustainable development	16.b.1 Proportion of population reporting having personally felt discriminated against or harassed in the previous 12 months on the basis of a ground of discrimination prohibited under international human rights law
Goal 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development	
Finance	
17.1 Strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to developing countries, to improve domestic capacity for tax and other revenue collection	17.1.1 Total government revenue as a proportion of GDP, by source
	17.1.2 Proportion of domestic budget funded by domestic taxes

17.2 Developed countries to implement fully their official development assistance commitments, including the commitment by many developed countries to achieve the target of 0.7 per cent of gross national income for official development assistance (ODA/GNI) to developing countries and 0.15 to 0.20 per cent of ODA/GNI to least developed countries; ODA providers are encouraged to consider setting a target to provide at least 0.20 per cent of ODA/GNI to least developed countries	17.2.1 Net official development assistance, total and to least developed countries, as a proportion of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee donors' gross national income (GNI)
17.3 Mobilize additional financial resources for developing countries from multiple sources	17.3.1 Foreign direct investment (FDI), official development assistance and South-South cooperation as a proportion of total domestic budget
	17.3.2 Volume of remittances (in United States dollars) as a proportion of total GDP
17.4 Assist developing countries in attaining long-term debt sustainability through coordinated policies aimed at fostering debt financing, debt relief and debt restructuring, as appropriate, and address the external debt of highly indebted poor countries to reduce debt distress	17.4.1 Debt service as a proportion of exports of goods and services
17.5 Adopt and implement investment promotion regimes for least developed countries	17.5.1 Number of countries that adopt and implement investment promotion regimes for least developed countries
Technology	
17.6 Enhance North-South, South-South and triangular regional and international cooperation on and access to science, technology and innovation and enhance knowledge-sharing on mutually agreed terms, including through improved coordination among existing mechanisms, in particular at the United Nations level, and through a global technology facilitation mechanism	17.6.1 Number of science and/or technology cooperation agreements and programmes between countries, by type of cooperation
	17.6.2 Fixed Internet broadband subscriptions per 100 inhabitants, by speed
17.7 Promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries on favourable terms, including on concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed	17.7.1 Total amount of approved funding for developing countries to promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies
17.8 Fully operationalize the technology bank and science, technology and innovation capacity-building mechanism for least developed countries by 2017 and enhance the use of enabling technology, in	17.8.1 Proportion of individuals using the Internet

particular information and communications technology	
Capacity-building	
17.9 Enhance international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the Sustainable Development Goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation	17.9.1 Dollar value of financial and technical assistance (including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation) committed to developing countries
Trade	
17.10 Promote a universal, rules-based, open, non-discriminatory and equitable multilateral trading system under the World Trade Organization, including through the conclusion of negotiations under its Doha Development Agenda	17.10.1 Worldwide weighted tariff-average
17.11 Significantly increase the exports of developing countries, in particular with a view to doubling the least developed countries' share of global exports by 2020	17.11.1 Developing countries' and least developed countries' share of global exports
17.12 Realize timely implementation of duty-free and quota-free market access on a lasting basis for all least developed countries, consistent with World Trade Organization decisions, including by ensuring that preferential rules of origin applicable to imports from least developed countries are transparent and simple, and contribute to facilitating market access	17.12.1 Average tariffs faced by developing countries, least developed countries and small island developing States
Systemic issues	
<i>Policy and institutional coherence</i>	
17.13 Enhance global macroeconomic stability, including through policy coordination and policy coherence	17.13.1 Macroeconomic Dashboard
17.14 Enhance policy coherence for sustainable development	17.14.1 Number of countries with mechanisms in place to enhance policy coherence of sustainable development
17.15 Respect each country's policy space and leadership to establish and implement policies for poverty eradication and sustainable development	17.15.1 Extent of use of country-owned results frameworks and planning tools by providers of development cooperation
<i>Multi-stakeholder partnerships</i>	
17.16 Enhance the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development, complemented by multi-stakeholder partnerships that mobilize and share knowledge, expertise, technology and financial resources, to	17.16.1 Number of countries reporting progress in multi-stakeholder development effectiveness monitoring frameworks that support the achievement of the sustainable development goals

support the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals in all countries, in particular developing countries	
17.17 Encourage and promote effective public, public-private and civil society partnerships, building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships	17.17.1 Amount of United States dollars committed to (a) public-private partnerships and (b) civil society partnerships
<i>Data, monitoring and accountability</i>	
17.18 By 2020, enhance capacity-building support to developing countries, including for least developed countries and small island developing States, to increase significantly the availability of high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts	17.18.1 Proportion of sustainable development indicators produced at the national level with full disaggregation when relevant to the target, in accordance with the Fundamental Principles of Official Statistics
	17.18.2 Number of countries that have national statistical legislation that complies with the Fundamental Principles of Official Statistics
	17.18.3 Number of countries with a national statistical plan that is fully funded and under implementation, by source of funding
17.19 By 2030, build on existing initiatives to develop measurements of progress on sustainable development that complement gross domestic product, and support statistical capacity-building in developing countries	17.19.1 Dollar value of all resources made available to strengthen statistical capacity in developing countries
	17.19.2 Proportion of countries that (a) have conducted at least one population and housing census in the last 10 years; and (b) have achieved 100 per cent birth registration and 80 per cent death registration