

<b>Subject of Appeal:</b>	Disputed Claim	<b>Case:</b>	R2
---------------------------	----------------	--------------	----

<b>Event</b>	1 <sup>st</sup> Sunday Open Pairs	<b>Event DIC</b>	Jeff Jacob
<b>Date</b>	07/23/2017	<b>Session</b>	First Session

### Auction

West	North	East	South
1♠	Pass	1NT <sup>1</sup>	Pass
2♣	Pass	Pass	Pass

### Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: Forcing

### Hand Record

<b>Board</b>	<b>28</b>	N	10,900 MPS		
<b>Dealer</b>	<b>W</b>	♠	AQ5		
		♥	92		
<b>Vul</b>	<b>N/S</b>	♦	AJ76		
		♣	6543		
W	1700 MPS			E	2300 MPS
♠	J10432			♠	(void)
♥	A104			♥	J7653
♦	Q			♦	K105
♣	KQJ2	♣	A10987		
		S	8800 MPS		
		♠	K9875		
		♥	KQ8		
		♦	98432		
		♣	(void)		

<b>Final Contract</b>	<b>Result of Play</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Opening Lead</b>
2♣ by W	Made 4	E/W +130	♣3

### Facts Determined at the Table

N/S called the director when West claimed. The play had gone: trump lead won with dummy's 7; diamond to the queen and North's ace; club 4 won with declarer's jack; heart 4, 9, jack won with South's queen; heart 8 return won with the ace; heart 10 to South's king; diamond 2 ruffed with West's queen; club king overtaken by dummy's ace. At this point, declarer claimed stating that dummy was good. No mention was made of the outstanding trump in North's hand.

### Director Ruling

The director believed that overtaking the club king with the ace made it clear that declarer was aware of the outstanding trump. He ruled the result to be 2♣ by West, making four, E/W +130, per Law 70C.

<b>Director's Ruling</b>	<b>2♣ by W, Made 4, E/W +130</b>
--------------------------	----------------------------------

### The Review

N/S appealed the ruling, and all four players attended the review. North said the sequence of play and declarer's failure to mention the trump suggested West might have forgotten about it.

West stated he was careless in not mentioning that he would draw the last trump, but he knew it was there since South had shown out on the first round of trump.

## Panel Findings

The panel agreed that overtaking the club king with the ace was strong evidence that West had remembered the outstanding trump, but not conclusive. Three professionals were consulted because of their experience watching less accomplished players declare a hand. One expert agreed that overtaking the club king with the ace suggested declarer might have remembered the remaining trump, but it was not clear. Two other experts insisted that overtaking proved nothing. They thought it was totally random chance whether playing the ace proved anything.

By majority decision, the panel decided per Law 70C that declarer might have been unaware of the outstanding trump. One trick was awarded to N/S, for a result of 2♣ by West, making three, E/W +110

<b>Panel Decision</b>	<b>2♣ by W, Made 3, E/W +110</b>
-----------------------	----------------------------------

## Panel Members

<b>Reviewer</b>	Gary Zeiger
<b>Member</b>	Matt Koltnow
<b>Member</b>	Eric Bell