

Subject of Appeal:	Misinformation	Case:	N6
---------------------------	----------------	--------------	----

Event	Whitehead Women's Pairs	Event DIC	Brian Russell
Date	11/29/2016	Session	Second Qualifying

Auction

West	North	East	South
			Pass
Pass	1NT ¹	Pass	Pass
Dbf ²	Pass	2♣	Pass
Pass	P/2♦ ³	Pass	Pass
2♥	Pass	3♣	Pass
Pass	Pass		

Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: 15-17 HCP
2: Clubs (no alert)
3: Auction reopened

Hand Record

Board	19	N	Susan Jackowitz		
Dealer	S	♠	8542		
		♥	A8		
Vul	E/W	♦	AKQ5		
		♣	A43		
W	Marjorie Michelin			E	Ellen Anten
♠	K10			♠	A76
♥	J10742			♥	K96
♦	7			♦	9843
♣	KQ962	♣	J107		
		S	Kari Nolletti		
		♠	QJ93		
		♥	Q53		
		♦	J1062		
		♣	85		

Final Contract	Result of Play	Score	Opening Lead
3♣ by E	Made 3	E/W +110	

Facts Determined at the Table

The director was called after 2♣ was passed out. West explained that double should have been alerted as showing clubs. The director reopened the auction, allowing North to change her final Pass to a different call. Once the auction concluded, the director instructed the players to summon him after play if they believed that any damage had not been sufficiently addressed.

Following play, North summoned the director back. Her view was that, with proper information, she would have taken direct action over the double, resulting in a different outcome in the auction.

Additional Factors Determined Away from the Table

The TD polled several players, giving them the North hand. Most bid 2♦ directly with the information that double showed clubs. A projected auction continued 2♦-P-P-2♥. Some pollees now chose 2♣. A 3♣ bid was assigned to East, after either Pass or 2♠ by North. In the auctions where North bid 2♠, the TD now polled players with the South hand; all competed to 3♠.

Director Ruling

Per Laws 21C and 12C1c, the result was changed to 30% of 3♠ by North, making 3, N/S +140, and 70% of 3♣ by East, making 3, E/W +110.

Director's Ruling	30% 3♠ by N, Made 3, N/S +140 70% 3♣ by E, Made 3, E/W +110
--------------------------	--

The Review

E/W requested a review of the ruling. They believed that North did nothing to protect herself - if she had wanted to know what a passed-hand double of 1NT was, all she had to do was ask.

Panel Findings

The reviewer agreed that the double was practically self-alerting. In an event of this caliber, North was expected to ask a question if she wanted to know the meaning of double in this auction. Once the auction had been reopened, North had had the opportunity to show her spade suit in addition to her diamond suit and had elected not to do so. Therefore, the supposition about a spade contract was not supported by an indication from the player that she had considered advancing the suit in the actual auction. The reviewer overturned the director's ruling and restored the table result of 3♣ by East, making 3, E/W +110, to both sides. The appeal was deemed to have merit.

Panel Decision	3♣ by E, Made 3, E/W +110
-----------------------	----------------------------------

Panel Members

Reviewer	Matt Koltnow
-----------------	--------------