

Subject of Appeal:	Claim	Case:	R2
---------------------------	-------	--------------	----

Event	Sunday Daylight Pairs	Event DIC	Terry Lavender
Date	11/27/2016	Session	Second Session

Auction

West	North	East	South
	Pass	1NT ¹	Pass
2♦ ²	Pass	2♥	Pass
Pass	Pass		

Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: 15-17 HCP
2: Transfer to ♥

Hand Record

Board	10	N	1100 MP		
Dealer	E	♠	A10		
		♥	762		
Vul	Both	♦	QJ9		
		♣	Q6542		
W	1600 MP			E	50 MP
♠	9865			♠	QJ74
♥	Q10985			♥	A4
♦	84			♦	A1072
♣	KJ			♣	A87
		S	700 MP		
		♠	K32		
		♥	KJ3		
		♦	K653		
		♣	1093		

Final Contract	Result of Play	Score	Opening Lead
2♥ by E			♣ 10

Facts Determined at the Table

At trick 12, with North on lead, South claimed the last tricks. E/W called the director. The end position was:

	♠ —	
	♥ 7	
	♦ —	
	♣ 6	
♠ 6		♠ Q
♥ Q		♥ 4
♦ —		♦ —
♣ —		♣ —
	♠ —	
	♥ K J	
	♦ —	
	♣ —	

Director Ruling

The director ruled that South's claim with partner on lead gave North extraneous information that the lead of the trump would be more beneficial to their side than a club. Law 70D2 states: "The Director shall not accept any part of a defender's claim that depends on his partner's selecting a particular play from among alternative normal plays." "Normal" is defined as including "play that would be careless or inferior for the class of player involved." The director assigned the result of 2♥ by East, making two, E/W +110.

Director's Ruling	2♥ by E, Made 2, E/W +110
--------------------------	----------------------------------

The Review

N/S said that North's lead under any circumstances based on the past tricks would be the heart. N/S said that the play of the hand had shown North that he was the only one to still hold clubs. Clubs had been played three times with a ruff in dummy. North had held five clubs so all the clubs had been accounted for. A club lead would result in a ruff and sluff, which would be illogical.

N/S also testified that they had been behind for the previous several rounds, and South claimed to help catch the partnership up.

E/W stated that without the comment by South, North could not know South had two trumps or that South had the high trump

Panel Findings

After hearing N/S, the panel was satisfied that North knew that the club was the last club and leading it would give a ruff and sluff. The Panel accepted that leading the club could never win, and thus it could never be the right choice. Therefore, the panel ruled that the play of the club was not a "normal" play per Law 70D2, so N/S was awarded the last two tricks. The result changed to 2♥ by East, down one, N/S +100.

Panel Decision	2♥ by E, Down 1, N/S +100
-----------------------	----------------------------------

Panel Members

Reviewer	Jeff Jacob
Member	Mike Roberts
Member	John Gram