

Subject of Appeal:	Misinformation	Case:	R7
---------------------------	----------------	--------------	----

Event	10K Pairs	Event DIC	Charlie MacCracken
Date	07/23/2016	Session	Second Qualifying

Auction

West	North	East	South
Pass	Pass	1NT ¹	Pass
2♠ ²	Pass	3♣ ³	Pass
Pass	3♥	Dbl	Pass
Pass	Pass		

Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: 14-17 HCP
2: Transfer to clubs
3: Alerted as "likes clubs"

Hand Record

Board	24	N	1200 MPS		
Dealer	W	♠ 83	♥ AQJ53		
Vul	None	♦ J9853	♣ 5		
W	6500 MPS			E	9500 MPS
♠ Q109	♥ 97			♠ A752	♥ K1082
♦ 106	♣ J109764			♦ K2	♣ AK2
		S	550 MPS		
		♠ KJ64	♥ 64		
		♦ AQ74	♣ Q83		

Final Contract	Result of Play	Score	Opening Lead
3♥X by N	Down 4	E/W +800	♣ K

Facts Determined at the Table

The director was called after the play of the hand. West explained that the 3♣ bid by East was "likes clubs". When asked what that meant he said that he answered "at least an honor with three." Both North and South only heard "at least an honor."

After 8 tricks, declarer had determined that East had a 4-4-2-3 or 4-4-3-2 hand. He asked about the lead of the ♣K. There was nothing marked on the E/W card. West said that they generally lead A from AK. He was then asked when his partner would lead the K from AK and was told "generally from AK doubleton." North played East for the AK doubleton and went down 4 doubled. He felt he was misled or not given the best information that he could have been. When he was asked later why he led the K and not the A, East said he really didn't think about it. They were the same, so he just pulled one.

The five card end position was

♠ —	♠ —	♠ 7
♥ —	♥ 5	♥ 10
♦ 10	♦ 9 8 5 3	♦ 2
♣ 10 9 7 4	♣ —	♣ A 2
	♠ J	
	♥ —	
	♦ Q 7 4	
	♣ Q	

North was on lead at trick nine. He led the ♠9 and, believing that East has started with K10x, floated the 9 to West's 10. At that point he lost control of the hand and went down 4 doubled.

Director Ruling

With West showing clubs, and East "liking" clubs and having at least 14 HCP, North should be in a position to know that East held the AK of clubs. With West not raising clubs over 3♥, it is unlikely he has seven of them, so therefore East must have three. North made the wrong decision about the layout on his own not due to the explanation of when either A or K is led. The damage was therefore self-inflicted.

Director's Ruling	3♥X by N, Down 4, E/W +800
--------------------------	-----------------------------------

The Appeal

N/S appealed the ruling. The panel spoke with the North player who explained his point of view and how ambiguous answers to the lead question and the answer given when he asked for information about "liking clubs."

Panel Findings

The panel found that E/W failed its responsibility to make sure that N/S were given correct, full and accurate explanations of their partnership agreements. In that neither North nor South heard the "with three" part of the explanation for 3♣, it was difficult for declarer to "get it right." If he knew that East had three clubs with an honor, he would make the hand. The panel changed the ruling for both sides to 3♥X by N, making 3, N/S +530.

Panel Decision	3♥X by N, Made 3, N/S +530
-----------------------	-----------------------------------

Panel Members

Reviewer	Marilyn Wells
Member	Eric Bell
Member	Kevin Perkins