

Subject of Appeal: Misinformation	Case: N2
--	-----------------

Event Nail LM Pairs	Event DIC Ken Van Cleve
Date 11/28/2015	Session Second Final


Auction

West	North	East	South
2NT ¹	3♣ ²	Db1 ³	Pass
3♠	Pass	3NT	Pass
Pass	Pass		

Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: 20-21 HCP
2: No Alert
3: Negative

Hand Record

Board 4	N	Stephen McConnell		
Dealer W	♠	A10832		
	♥	J96532		
Vul Both	♦	2		
	♣	9		
W	Andrea Manno		E	
♠	J754		♠	KQ
♥	A7		♥	KQ108
♦	AKQJ5		♦	8763
♣	KQ		♣	J63
		S	Robert Giragosian	
		♠	96	
		♥	4	
		♦	1094	
		♣	A1087542	

Final Contract	Result of Play	Score	Opening Lead
3NT by W	Made 5	E/W +660	♥ 5

Facts Determined at the Table

East/West summoned the director at the end of the hand. There had been no Alert of North's 3♣ bid, so they had both assumed it was natural. They stated if they had known it was for the majors, they would have doubled any contract in which North/South eventually settled, earning a better result by defending.

South stated that he did not Alert because they did not have an artificial agreement for 3♣ over 2NT. North stated that he thought either South would read what he meant by the bid or he could run to 3♥ if he was doubled. The N/S agreement for defending 1NT has 2♣ showing the majors.

Director Ruling

South could tell from his own hand that 3♣ was not natural, but was under no obligation to disclose this. There was no evidence that North bid assuming an agreement was in place. As there was no evidence of a partnership agreement that required disclosure, no Alert was required. Per Law 40, there was no misinformation, and no adjustment to the table result was required.

Director's Ruling	3NT by W, Made 5, E/W +660
--------------------------	-----------------------------------

The Appeal

E/W appealed the ruling and both pairs attended the hearing. E/W believed that N/S had to have some sort of agreement.

Committee Findings

As there was no evidence of a partnership agreement, there was no evidence of misinformation. The committee confirmed the director's ruling. The committee did not issue an Appeal without Merit Warning.

Committee Decision	3NT by W, Made 5, E/W +660
---------------------------	-----------------------------------

Committee Members

Chairman	Dick Budd
Member	Joel Wooldridge
Member	Don Kern
Member	Jan Jansma
Member	Fred King