



Subject of Appeal: Misinformation	Case: N8
--	-----------------

Event	Senior Mixed Pairs	Event DIC	Susan Doe
Date	12/04/2013	Session	Second Qualifier

Auction

West	North	East	South
	Pass	2NT	Pass
3♣	Pass	3♦	Pass
3♠ ¹	Pass	3NT	Pass
Pass	Pass		

Explanation of Special Calls and Points of Contention

1: No Alert; Explained as
5 ♠ & 4 ♥

Hand Record

Board	13	N	Dennis McGarry		
Dealer	N	♠	843		
		♥	Q9864		
		♦	QJ5		
Vul	Both	♣	73		
W	June Pocock			E	Michael Yuen
♠	Q9			♠	A76
♥	7532			♥	K10
♦	K1093			♦	A876
♣	1054			♣	AKQ6
		S	Molly O'Neill		
		♠	KJ1052		
		♥	AJ		
		♦	42		
		♣	J982		

Final Contract	Result of Play	Score	Opening Lead
3NT by E	Made 3	E/W +600	♣ 2

Facts Determined at the Table

Before the opening lead, South inquired as to the meaning of the 3♠ bid. East explained that it showed five spades and four hearts. When the dummy was tabled, it was revealed that West forgot the agreement and had intended 3♠ to show a four card heart suit, as in a puppet Stayman auction. The E/W convention card did not have puppet Stayman marked, nor did it indicate that they play Smolen. N/S claimed that had they known West had only two spades, the opening lead would have been a spade, which would then have resulted in down four.

Director Ruling

The director maintained that N/S received a correct explanation of the E/W agreement about the meaning of 3♠, and that this was a case of a mistaken call rather than a mistaken explanation. Per Law 75C, there was no infraction and the table result was allowed to stand, 3NT by East, making three, E/W +600

Director's Ruling	3NT by E, Made 3, E/W +600
--------------------------	-----------------------------------

The Appeal

N/S appealed the ruling and attended the hearing. They felt that with a correct explanation, South would have led a spade, which would have defeated the contract.

Committee Findings

Prior to the opening lead, West should have summoned the director and stated that in her opinion, there had been a failure to alert the 3♠ bid (Law 20F5b). Because this infraction caused damage to the non-offending side, the contract and result were changed to 3NT by East, down one, N/S +100

Committee Decision	3NT by E, Down 1, N/S +100
---------------------------	-----------------------------------

Committee Members

Chairman	Aaron Silverstein
Member	Dick Budd
Member	Richard Popper
Member	Fred King
Member	Ed Lazarus