#### \*Manuscript

# Modern speleothem oxygen isotope hydroclimate records in water-limited SE Australia

- 3 <sup>1,2,3,4</sup>Monika Markowska, <sup>2,5</sup>Mark O. Cuthbert, <sup>2,3\*</sup>Andy Baker, <sup>1,2</sup>Pauline C. Treble, <sup>2,6</sup>Martin
- 4 S. Andersen, <sup>7</sup>Lewis Adler, <sup>1</sup>Alan Griffiths, <sup>8</sup>Silvia Frisia.
- 5
- 6 <sup>1</sup>ANSTO, Lucas Heights, Sydney 2234, Australia
- 7 <sup>2</sup>Connected Waters Initiative Research Centre, UNSW Australia, Kensington, Sydney 2033,
- 8 Australia.
- 9 <sup>3</sup>School of Biological, Earth and Environmental Sciences, UNSW Australia, Kensington,
- 10 Sydney 2033, Australia.
- <sup>4</sup>Faculty of Geosciences, Tübingen University, Tübingen, 72074, Germany
- <sup>5</sup>School of Earth and Ocean Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, CF10 3AT, UK
- <sup>6</sup>School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, UNSW Australia, Kensington, Sydney 2033,
- 14 Australia.
- 15 <sup>7</sup>Bioanalytical Mass Spectrometry Facility, Mark Wainwright Analytical Centre, UNSW
- 16 Australia, Kensington, Sydney 2033, Australia.
- <sup>8</sup>School of Environmental and Life Science, University of Newcastle, Callaghan NSW, 2308,
- 18 Australia.
- 19 \*Corresponding author: a.baker@unsw.edu.au
- 20
- 21 Keywords: speleothems, water-limited climate, water isotopes, hydroclimate,
- 22
- 23

## 24 Abstract

Dryland regions are generally projected to become drier under future climate change 25 scenarios. Understanding the long-term natural variability of dryland regions via paleo-26 reconstructions is therefore highly desirable. The  $\delta^{18}$ O of two coeval modern speleothems 27 28 from Cathedral Cave, Wellington, in semi-arid SE Australia are compared to the instrumental record to assess their efficacy as a proxy of past hydrological variability. Stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O was 29 30 found to be modulated by the frequency of recharge events and epikarst evaporation of 31 storage water. Prolonged intervals between recharge events, such as droughts, resulted in higher stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O. Conversely, periods with more frequent recharge events and positive 32 water balance, resulted in lower  $\delta^{18}$ O. Disequilibrium cave processes are likely to be 33 enhanced during dry conditions, although it is argued that these will modulate  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  in the 34 same direction as epikarst evaporation, effectively amplifying the response of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 35 36 Extreme events, such as floods and droughts, were also captured in the stalagmite records, 37 although potentially with a lag of several years. We verify that modern speleothems from semi-arid regions can be used to reconstruct hydroclimate due to variations in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 38 39 modulated by karst processes. Such records are archives of past changes in recharge rather 40 than precipitation amount or surface temperature, as is commonly applied to speleothem 41 records from non-water-limited regions.

# 42 **1. Introduction**

43 Drylands are water-limited regions where precipitation is less than potential 44 evapotranspiration, causing either perennial or seasonal soil water deficits (D'Odorico and 45 Porporato, 2006). They cover approximately 45 % of Earth's land surface and contain 46 approximately 30% of its population (STAP, 2010). Globally, the largest expansion of 47 drylands over the last 60 years has occurred in semi-arid regions (Huang et al., 2016). In 48 Australia, a large portion of the area outside of the central arid desert regions are semi-arid 49 and dry sub-humid drylands, which are also predicted to expand (Feng and Fu, 2013). 50 Predicting the hydroclimatic response to climate change on the Australian continent, and 51 particularly in SE Australia with the densest population, is therefore highly desirable. 52 53 One approach to understanding hydroclimate change is to use proxy records to obtain records 54 of past hydroclimate variability. Speleothems are a particularly useful proxy in this regard, as 55 they form directly from subsurface percolation waters (cave drips and seeps) which can 56 contain geochemical indicators of environmental change (Fairchild and Baker, 2012). 57 However, our current understanding of speleothem-forming processes is biased to 58 cave-monitoring in regions with surplus water balances and frequent groundwater recharge. 59 Significant exceptions are monitoring programs at Soreq Cave, Israel (Bar-Matthews et al., 60 1996; Ayalon et al., 1998; Even et al., 1986; Lange et al., 2003; Kaufman et al., 2003;); Sif 61 Cave, Israel (Sheffer et al., 2011); Cathedral Cave, Australia (Cuthbert et al., 2014a, b; 62 Rutlidge et al., 2014; Rau et al., 2015; Rutlidge et al., 2015; Markowska et al., 2016; 63 McDonough et al., 2016; Baker et al., 2016a); and St. Michaels Cave, Gibraltar (Mattey et 64 al., 2008; Mattey et al., 2010; Mattey et al., 2013; Baker et al., 2014). These studies have demonstrated that commonly used climate proxies in speleothems, such as  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , may have 65 different interpretations in dryland environments, owing to a higher likelihood of: (1) 66

discontinuous calcite precipitation, (2) non-equilibrium calcite precipitation, (3) high
heterogeneity of karst hydrology, and (4) large soil moisture deficits which must be
overcome to initiate recharge.

70

71 Drip interval and drip water supersaturation are theoretically the primary controls on kinetic 72 fractionation during calcite precipitation, due to rapid degassing resulting in enhanced fractionation of the resulting  $\delta^{13}C_{calcite}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$  (Mühlinghaus et al., 2007, 2009). In 73 dryland regions, the water-limited environment is a major control on drip hydrology and may 74 75 consequently have the largest influence on in-cave isotopic fractionation. The dependence of  $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$  fractionation on drip interval is less than for  $\delta^{13}C_{calcite}$ , due to the buffering effects 76 77 of the water solution (Mühlinghaus et al., 2009; Scholz et al., 2009). If degassing is 78 sufficiently rapid, the CO<sub>2</sub> loss from solution is typically greater than the typical exchange 79 time of several minutes between  $HCO_3^-$  and  $H_2O$  in solution (Scholz et al., 2009). This results in kinetic fractionation and higher  $\delta^{13}C_{calcite}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$  values (Mickler et al., 2006; Baker 80 81 et al., 2011). In dryland caves with relatively low relative humidity, in-cave processes may also play a role in modifying the  $\delta^{18}$ O in both drip waters and calcite. Deininger and Scholz 82 83 (2019) demonstrated theoretically the significance of in-cave evaporation on driving disequilibrium isotopic fractionation for both  $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$  and  $\delta^{13}C_{calcite}$  due to the loss of H<sub>2</sub>O 84 from the precipitating solution, which results in an increase in  $Ca^{2+}_{(aq)}$  concentration, faster 85 precipitation rates and greater isotopic fractionation. 86

87

Soil and karst hydrology can also be a significant control on the oxygen isotope signature observed in cave drips and associated speleothems in dryland regions. For example, drip water  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  may be higher relative to precipitation  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  due to epikarst evaporation. In studies in Israel and Australia, this isotopic enrichment was observed to be +1.5 ‰ to +3 ‰,

92 respectively (Bar-Matthews et al., 1996; Cuthbert et al., 2014; Markowska et al., 2016). As in 93 more humid regions, hill-slope aspect can favour evaporative enrichment of subsurface water, where slopes with greater sun exposure are associated with higher  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  (Denniston et al., 94 1999). The proportion of total precipitation likely to reach subsurface karst may be less in 95 drylands compared to humid regions, due to larger antecedent soil moisture deficits (Sheffer 96 et al., 2011; Jex et al., 2012). As a result, recharge  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  may be biased towards high 97 magnitude precipitation events. For example, large convective storms are often associated 98 with lower  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  values, even in mid-latitude regions (Ayalon et al. 1998; Fleitmann et 99 al., 2004; Treble et al., 2005). Rayleigh distillation, whereby <sup>18</sup>O/<sup>16</sup>O isotopes are fractionated 100 101 between liquid and vapour, is enhanced in rapidly ascending air masses, resulting in precipitation with low  $\delta^{18}$ O values (Dansgaard, 1964; Rozanski et al., 1993). In a global 102 analysis of  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  records, recharge-weighted  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  was shown to best explain  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  in 103 warm climate regions (Baker et al. 2019). Consequently, dryland speleothem  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  should 104 be interpreted as a  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  signal that is potentially highly modified by subsurface 105 106 evaporative enrichment and subject to larger recharge thresholds due to low antecedent soil 107 moisture and high evaporation rates. It may be more valid to consider these records as 108 reconstructions of recharge frequency/intensity rather than simply mean precipitation  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  (Markowska et al, 2016; Baker et al., 2019). 109

110

In dryland regions,  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  is likely to be biased to the isotopic signature of recharge events, and potentially also the extent of partial evaporation of epikarst water. In addition, cave environments with low humidity and water supply limitations on drip rates lead to conditions suitable for the disequilibrium precipitation of calcite are likely, resulting in greater extent of  $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$  fractionation. Also, replication of coeval stalagmites oxygen isotope records may be lower in dryland caves, which are more water-limited and sensitive to hydrological changes 117 at the individual drip level, compared to caves with well-mixed large water storage reservoirs from temperate environments. An assessment of the replicability of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  and hydroclimate 118 signal contained in  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{spel}}$  from a dryland site is required to increase our understanding of 119 cave processes and investigate the dominant processes impacting the speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O record 120 121 in water-limited environments. Here, we make such an assessment by comparing two modern, chronologically-constrained stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O time series to the instrumental record. 122 123 The instrumental era (<160 years) provides a critical test period for paleoclimate records derived from natural archives (Anderson et al., 1998; Mattey et al., 2008; Moquet et al., 124 2016). We use an established <sup>14</sup>C bomb-pulse age-model (Markowska et al. 2019) to 125 126 constrain the chronology for the two modern (1935-2010 CE) speleothems from Cathedral 127 Cave, SE Australia. A previously-developed karst hydrological model for the site (Cuthbert 128 et al., 2014a) is extended for the period of speleothem deposition to model speleothem  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . This model uses an evaporative enrichment function to assess whether the variability 129 in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  can be explained by karst hydrology and the extent to which a climate signal is 130 131 preserved in the stalagmite. The implications of these results for the identification of suitable 132 speleothems for hydroclimate reconstruction in water-limited environments are addressed. 133

## 134 **2. Background**

## 135 **2.1 Cave environment**

Cathedral Cave is located at Wellington Caves Reserve, New South Wales, Australia
(32° 37'S; 148° 56'E) (Figure 1, cave map: Figure S1). The cave descends to approximately
30 m below land surface and has formed within Devonian limestone which has been
marmorised, leaving no primary porosity. Water flow is dominated by fracture-flow. A thinlayer of red-brown soil comprising clays, iron oxides, fine quartz sands, and calcite nodules,

141 with aeolian contributions, overlies the limestone (Baker et al., 2016a). Soil cover is not 142 complete, with exposed karstified limestone abundant. Where present, soil thickness is typically less than 20 cm, with a thin (< 5 cm) organic layer followed by a sandy-clay 143 144 textured soil down to bedrock (Berthelin et al. 2019). Cathedral Cave is within a temperate 145 semi-arid region, with mean annual precipitation of 619 mm (1956-2005 CE) and pan 146 evaporation of 1825 mm (1956-2005 CE) recorded 7 km north of the cave at Wellington (Bureau of Meteorology, 2015; climate data accessible at www.bom.gov.au/climate/data/). 147 148 There is a large seasonal temperature variation, with monthly mean maximum ranging from 15 °C in July and 32 °C in January. Cathedral Cave is a long-term monitoring site for the 149 150 modern monitoring of cave drip water hydrology in a water-limited environment. The 151 stalagmites studied here come from South Passage, at approximately 25 m below land 152 surface, and within the long-term drip water monitoring network (Jex et al 2012; Cuthbert et 153 al 2014a).

154

155 Inactive speleothems are apparent throughout Cathedral Cave. Dripping is intermittent in the 156 upper, drier chambers of the cave and speleothem formation is rare here, whilst speleothem formation dominates the deeper and wetter 'South Passage' where the stalagmites in this 157 158 study were collected. South Passage generally has high relative humidity (97.1  $\pm$  0.7%; Rau 159 et al., 2015), little evidence of in-cave evaporative enrichment of water from evaporative pan experiments (<0.1 %/ h,  $\delta^{18}O_{water}$ ) (Markowska et al., 2016), and high cave air CO<sub>2</sub> (mean 160 concentration: 3535 ppm in winter, 7784 ppm in summer; McDonough et al., 2016).  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$ 161 is dominated by evaporation of stored karst water under high humidity (Cuthbert et al., 162 2014a). During periods of low recharge,  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  typically has more positive values (Cuthbert 163 et al., 2014a; Markowska et al., 2016). 164

165

#### 166 2.2 Wellington Caves climate, 1930 to 2010 CE

167 Figure 2 shows the temperature anomaly (°C), deep drainage (mm / d), monthly potential 168 evaporation (mm) and annual rainfall amount (mm / a). At Wellington, mean annual 169 temperature over 1900-2014 CE is 16.7 °C (Raupach et al. 2009, 2012; Figure 2). Overnight 170 minimum temperature has increased by +0.4 °C since approximately 1950 CE (Figure 2), 171 consistent with observations across the Australian continent in general (Fawcett et al., 2012; 172 Trewin, 2013). The monthly Cumulative Rainfall Departure (CRD) and seasonal CRD, were 173 calculated based on the cumulative departures from the mean monthly rainfall over the 174 speleothem growth period 1930-2010 CE (Weber and Stewart, 2004; Bredenkamp, 1995). 175 This approach is based on the principle that the cumulative departures from mean rainfall 176 should broadly reflect changes in groundwater levels (eg. Butterworth et al., 1999). Monthly 177 mean rainfall shows weak seasonality and large inter-annual variability (Markowska et al., 178 2016), associated with four major climate phenomena (El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO), 179 Indian Ocean Dipole (IOD), Southern Annular Mode (SAM) and the Interdecadal Pacific 180 Oscillation (IPO) (Pittock et al., 2006; Verdon-Kidd and Kiem, 2009; Ummenhofer et al., 181 2011; Christensen et al. 2013; King et al., 2013). 182 183 Climate predictions for SE Australia suggest further pressure on water resources, due to (1)

anticipated decreases in cool season precipitation due to poleward expansion of the subtropical dry zone (Christensen et al., 2013) and decreasing groundwater recharge in (Crosbie et al., 2013), coupled with a global increase in drought frequency and/or severity (Dai, 2013). However, the general trend of declining rainfall over SE Australia during the latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century reported by others (Nicholls, 2010; BoM, 2015) is not represented in annual rainfall totals at Wellington. Seasonal cumulative rainfall departure time-series exhibit contrasting seasonal trends, with increasing spring rainfall and decreasing winter rainfall since 1960 CE. The latter has likely exacerbated the reduction in recharge,
since infiltration of cool season rainfall tends to be more hydrologically effective due to
lower potential evapotranspiration (PET) and higher soil moisture saturation. Two periods of
deep drainage (defined as when water drains from the bottom of the modelled deep soil layer
(6 m) into the groundwater stores) occur during the 1950's and early 1990's (Raupach et al.,
2009, 2012; Figure 2).

197

198 Potential evaporation (PE) is derived using solar irradiance data from satellite imagery from 199 1990 to present, and for the period 1900-1990 is obtained by using the calibration against 200 monthly climatological data for the post 1990 CE period. Mean and standard deviation PE is 201 the same for both time periods (pre-1990: mean = 4.06 mm / day (3.94 - 4.1895% CI,202 n=1080); post-1990: mean = 4.12 mm / day (3.88 to 4.37 95% CI, n = 290). A small decrease 203 in PE variance (~5%, variance decreases from 4.4 to 4.2 mm / day) is observed in the time 204 series prior to 1990 CE which is likely to be a calibration artefact. Most recently, the mid-205 2000's was correlated with years of persistently declining rainfall. This period, termed the 206 "Millennium Drought" beginning in 1997 CE (Figure 2), experienced prolonged rainfall 207 deficits brought about by widespread protracted dry conditions over most of continental 208 Australia. The drought ended in 2010 CE, after ENSO activity switched to a strong La Niña 209 phase. This brought about high precipitation resulting in large-scale flooding in many parts of 210 southeast Australia and east Australia, including the town of Wellington in December 2010 211 CE (van Dijk et al., 2013). It was the second wettest December on record for the Murray-212 Darling Basin region, and Australia's wettest July to December period on record (NCC and 213 BoM, 2011).

214

Drought conditions also occurred in the late 1940's (Figure 2), clearly seen in the sum of
departures in mean monthly rainfall amounts (CRD; Figure 2). This
"WWII Drought", which was widespread over eastern Australia during 1937 – 1945 CE
(Ummenhofer et al., 2009), impacted summer and autumn rainfall totals most. This was
followed by significantly wet conditions in the 1950's, including the highest annual rainfall
on record and the largest flood on record delivering ~180 mm rainfall in 24 hours, flooding
the local town of Wellington (~8 km from the study site) in 1955 CE. This coincided with a

222 moderate La Niña, which had a strong effect across the eastern third of Australia (BoM,

223 2010).

224

## 225 2.3 Stalagmites WB and WC: morphology, chronology and drip regimes

226 The two stalagmites from Cathedral Cave, "WB" and "WC", were collected in mid-2010 CE 227 from South Passage and were located approximately 5 m distance from each other. WB grew 228 over a Bakelite (early plastic) cable installed in 1932 CE, the installation of which likely 229 resulting in damage to the stalactite tip which re-invigorated dripping. Photographs of the 230 sectioned samples are presented in Figure 3. WB and WC mostly consist of columnar calcite. 231 The fabric of WB is more typically open columnar to microcrystalline types (Frisia, 2015), 232 whereas WC is predominantly composed of compact columnar. In addition, WB appears to 233 have been characterized by an initial overall greater porosity, which allowed destruction of 234 the inter-crystalline porosity by early diagenetic cement precipitation (translucent calcite in 235 Fig. 3A).

236

Carbonate <sup>14</sup>C<sub>spel</sub> analysis results for stalagmites WB and WC were presented in Markowska et al (2019). Markowska et al. (2019) constructed an age model for each stalagmite which produced chronologies that cover the periods from 1936.7  $\pm$  3.9 CE (WB) and 1982  $\pm$  2.65 240 CE (WC) to the date of sampling. The resultant annual deposition rate is greater than 0.2 mm 241 / year, and for WC over 0.7 mm / year, permitting high temporal resolution  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  sampling 242 (see section 3.1).

243

244 The median drip rate for seven other monitored drip sites in South Passage, where WB and 245 WC were located, is slow, between 0 and 0.2 drips / min (Cuthbert et al., 2014a). The drip above the site of WC is also slow, with an average drip rate of 0.24 drips / min, slowing to 0 246 247 to 0.02 drips / min during non-recharge periods and up to 0.67 drips / min during recharge periods. No drip data was collected for WB due to insufficient drip height for drip logger 248 249 installation; however, opportunistic observations suggest that WB had an overall faster drip 250 rate than WC. In addition, during field observations in January 2016 CE the drip above WC 251 was dry, but the drip above WBwas still active – suggesting that stalagmite WB had access to 252 a larger karst water reservoir. Prior to January 2016 CE, the last rainfall event to significantly 253 increase drip discharge in South Passage, and by inference increase the volume of water in 254 the overlying stores, was in July 2013 CE (see Markowska et al 2016, Fig 2).

255

#### 256 **3 Methods**

257 **3.1 Carbonate**  $\delta^{18}$ **O and**  $\delta^{13}$ **C analysis** 

Slices 13 mm and 6 mm thick were cut from the central growth axis of stalagmites WB and WC respectively and then halved along the growth axis, on the right-hand side edge of an apparent dissolution hole in order to maximize sample recovery (Panel C, Figure 3). A Micromill 2000 ER-LR system with mechanical repeatability (precision) of 0.0127 mm was used to obtain sample powders. Carbonate powders were milled continuously from each stalagmite, using a 2 mm diameter tungsten carbide drill bit, along the edge of the growth axis in 0.1 mm increments (x-axis), 2 mm (y-axis) and 2 mm (z-axis) (WC, n = 220 and WB, 265 n = 360). Milling transects for isotopic analysis are shown in Figure 3, Panels C and D. Approximately 20-40 µg sub-samples of these powders were analysed on the MAT-253 266 267 Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometer with Kiel carbonate device (Thermo Fisher Scientific, 268 Bremen, Germany) at the Mark Wainwright Analytical Centre at UNSW Australia. They were reacted at 70 °C with 2 drops of 100 % phosphoric acid. The Kiel IV carbonate device 269 270 settings used were a reaction one time of 420 s, a reaction two time of 120 s and a transfer 271 time of 90 s. An integration time of 16 s and 8 cycles was used for the isotopic measurement of CO<sub>2</sub> gas. Data were standardized to the Vienna Peedee Belemnite (VPDB) scale using 272 IAEA National Bureau Standards NBS-18 ( $\delta^{18}O = -23.20$  ‰ and  $\delta^{13}C = -5.01$  ‰) and NBS-273 19 ( $\delta^{18}$ O = -2.20 ‰ and  $\delta^{13}$ C = +1.95 ‰) using a two-point calibration. The analytical 274 precision of the standards calculated for these datasets was 0.05 % and 0.06 %, for  $\delta^{13}$ C and 275  $\delta^{18}$ O, respectively. 276

277

# 278 **3.2 Karst hydrology** $\delta^{18}$ **O model**

 $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  is modelled using a Soil Moisture Balance (SMB) model first presented in Cuthbert 279 et al. (2013), coupled with a karst hydrology model (Cuthbert et al., 2014a) to simulate 280 281 groundwater recharge, shallow karst flow, and oxygen isotopic composition of drip waters. 282 The combined SMB-karst model was parameterised for Cathedral Cave and successfully used to model drip water isotopic composition for a range of drips from South Passage for 283 monthly-integrated samples (Markowska et al., 2016) over a two-year period in Cuthbert et 284 285 al. (2014a). Unique to the study of Cuthbert et al (2014a) was a function to model the isotopic evolution of drip waters due to epikarst evaporation under high humidity conditions 286 following Gonfiantini (1986). This accounted for the measured <sup>18</sup>O enrichment of karst drip 287 waters relative to rainfall <sup>18</sup>O, which fell on the local meteoric waterline rather than an 288

evaporation line typical of water evaporated under low humidity (Cuthbert et al., 2014a). The
sensitivity of all model parameters was assessed in Cuthbert et a (2014a). The model

structure (Figure S2) and code are available in the Supplemental Materials.

292

Here, the model is extended back through the 20<sup>th</sup> century, keeping the same parameters as 293 294 previously calibrated for the SMB-karst model. For the isotope model, since the previous 295 calibration was carried out for a wide range of drips, a slight modification was needed for the 296 parameters to best represent the drip feeding WB. Based on field observations (see section 2), 297 WB had a relatively faster drip rate compared with the range of drips previously represented 298 in the model. It was assumed from this higher drip rate, that WB is fed by a larger store. 299 Hence, the parameter S2Lim (the depth in the modelled box karst reservoir where epikarst 300 evaporation 'turns on') was decreased from 60 mm to 20 mm, to reduce the level at which 301 evaporation became important. In the parameterisation of this model, perhaps 302 counterintuitively, a higher S2Lim parameter (greater depth) results in higher evaporation 303 due to the greater range of depths where the evaporation term is 'turned on', 0-60 mm 304 opposed to 0-20 mm. The epikarst evaporation rate was also reduced from 0.04 mm / d to 305 0.01 mm / d in order to capture an oxygen isotopic composition closer to mean rainfall. 306

Precipitation-weighted mean annual rainfall ( $\delta^{18}O_{precip} = \sim -4 \%$ ) was used as the model input, based on two years of rainfall monitoring (Cuthbert et al., 2014a). This value is close to modern groundwater values (mean = -4.78 ‰, n = 11) from Spicers Creek catchment 68 km away (Morgan et al., 2006) and at in two boreholes at Wellington Caves that were monthly sampled between November 2013 and July 2014 (BH1: -4.28 ± 0.29‰; BHGolf: -4.70 ± 0.20‰; Keshavarzi, 2018). Monthly-integrated  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  presented in Cuthbert et al. (2014) over the two-year monitoring period has a very weak relationship with rainfall amount (r<sup>2</sup> = 314 0.03; p > 0.05 n = 24). However, end member event isotopic rainfall composition of < 5 mm and > 45 mm suggests there may be a stronger relationship if event-based samples are 315 316 considered (Figure 4, Supplementary Figure 2). Opportunistic rainfall event samples (0.5 - 24 317 h), sporadically collected over 2010 - 2012 CE (data available as Supplemental Materials). Samples were stored in glass bottles with no headspace and analysed on the Los Gatos © 318 319 cavity ring down mass spectrometer at UNSW Australia. The overall precision was  $\pm 0.12$  ‰  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\pm 1.2 \% \delta$ D. Event end-member samples showed a moderate  $\delta^{18}$ O<sub>precip</sub> relationship 320 with daily rainfall amount ( $r^2 = 0.48$ ; p < 0.05, n = 12) (Figure S3). This correlation was 321 considered too weak to be used as a transfer function to enable a calculated rainfall  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$ 322 323 time series to be used as the model input. However, as a test of how the model might perform if such an input was known, a value of  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}} = -12$  ‰ was used as the input value for the 324 325 most extreme rainfall events (>120 mm / d) observed at this site based on event rainfall samples (e.g.  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip.}} = -11.3$  % after ~105 mm rainfall over two days). All other 326 327 parameterisation was the same as in Cuthbert et al. (2014a).

328

Since the original model was calibrated for drip water oxygen isotopes, a correction was 329 required to convert the modelled data ( $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  VSMOW) to a calcite equivalent ( $\delta^{18}O_{calcite}$ 330 VPDB) for comparison with the measured  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . This conversion was based on a CO<sub>2</sub>-H<sub>2</sub>O 331 332 fractionation factor of 1.0412, an acid fractionation factor for H<sub>3</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> liberated CO<sub>2</sub> from 333 calcite of 1.01025 (Freidman and O'Neil, 1977), and a H<sub>3</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>-liberated CO<sub>2</sub> from VPDB-334 CO<sub>2</sub> in equilibrium with VSMOW of 1.00027 (Gonfiantini, 1984; Hut, 1987) following 335 Coplen (1988), Eq. 12, (p. 295). The in-cave temperature dependent fractionation at the time 336 of calcite precipitation from drip water was calculated from the equation of Kim and O'Neil (1997) and the mean annual surface temperatures from the AWAP database (Raupach et al., 337 2009, 2012) to produce predicted calcite  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{calcite.}}$  It is assumed that evaporative cooling is 338

negligible at the stalagmite sites of WB and WC in South Passage, as the RH is ~97% most
of the time (Rau et al., 2015)

341

## 342 **4 Results**

# 343 **4.1 Stalagmite** $\delta^{18}$ **O time series**

Time series and  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  vs.  $\delta^{13}C_{spel}$  scatterplots for stalagmites WB and WC are compared in 344 Figure 5. The isotopic time series for WB is seasonally resolved (~4.9 samples / year) and for 345 346 WC is bi-monthly resolved (~7.9 samples / year). The isotopic mean of WC is offset overall by approximately +0.5 % ( $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ ) and +1.2 % ( $\delta^{13}C_{spel}$ ) relative to WB (Figure 5), and by 347 +0.3  $(\delta^{18}O_{spel})$  and +1.4  $(\delta^{13}C_{spel})$  over the period of overlapping growth. Both 348 stalagmites have  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  approximately 1 %, higher than the precipitation-weighted mean 349 350 annual rainfall when rainfall is considered on the equivalent (VPDB) scale, i.e. mean rainfall of -4 ‰ VSMOW should theoretically form calcite with  $\delta^{18}$ O of -4.9 ‰ using the equation 351 352 from Kim and O'Neil (1997).

353

The two stalagmite records overlap from  $1982 \pm 2.65$  CE onwards. With respect to mean  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , the comparison between the two stalagmite records between 1990 and 2004 CE is typically within 0.5 ‰ (Figure 6). Both  $\delta^{18}O$  records show sub-decadal and longer-term trends throughout their respective growth periods, but there is typically less variability in WB which appears more smoothed relative to WC (Figure 5).

359

360 Comparing the sub-decadal trends and peaks, between 1982 and 1990 CE, there is little 361 agreement between stalagmites, with  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  maxima in 1985 and 1987 CE in WC not 362 represented in WB. Starting in 1990 CE,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  becomes more positive in both stalagmites

by ~1 ‰ for about 5 years, followed by a ~1 ‰ decrease until 2000 CE. Following this, 363  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  of both stalagmites begins to increase again by ~1.2 ‰, with maximum values 364 around 2002 and 2003 CE (Figure 5). The subsequent decrease in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  was greatest in WB 365 (1 ‰) compared to WC (0.4 ‰). After this minima,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  for both stalagmites increased by 366 +1.4 ‰ up to 2010 CE. This was a smooth  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  increase in WB, whereas in WC the 367 general increasing trend was punctuated by peaks and troughs in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  every 1 - 2 years 368 369 (Figure 5). We statistically compared the correlation between the two stalagmites for the post 1990 CE period, after interpolating the  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  series to a common timescale, normalising to 370 z values, and detrending (0.05 z-score /yr), and then investigated all correlations within the 371 372 chronological uncertainties of the two stalagmites. Despite the visual correlations, the 373 maximum Kendall's Tau value was 0.21, confirming differences in the number, and 374 amplitude of, isotope peaks and troughs between the stalagmites.

375

Considering the long-term WB  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  record,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  begins at -5.4 ‰ in 1936 CE and 376 increases to -3.3 ‰ by 1948 CE, punctuated by a short-term trough in 1947 CE (Figure 5). 377 WB  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  decreases to -5.0 ‰ at 1950 CE. A further increase and decrease of ~1 ‰ 378 379 occurs, before an increase to -2.5 ‰, the highest value in the WB time series, in 1953 CE. 380 The lowest value in the record (-6.4 ‰) occurs shortly after (1956 CE), a 4 ‰ decline in 381 three years. This is accompanied by a slower growth rate (0.12 mm / a) continuing until 1965 CE, where WB  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  increases to -3.1 ‰ in 1966 CE, although values are ~1 ‰ lower in 382 the early 1960's.  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  decreases by ~1 ‰ again until 1970 CE, after which it remains 383 stable at the long-term  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  isotopic mean of -4.1 % until the early 1980's. 384 385



The  $\delta^{18}$ O vs  $\delta^{13}$ C relationship for WC is strong as shown in the scatterplot inset in Figure 5 387  $(r^2 = 0.77)$ , suggesting that WC may have precipitated under enhanced disequilibrium 388 conditions (Desmarchelier et al., 2000). Conversely, WB shows no relationship between  $\delta^{18}$ O 389 and  $\delta^{13}$ C (r<sup>2</sup> = 0.00), as judged by the scatterplot in Figure 5. This agrees with the observed 390 391 speleothem fabrics where WB is more typically open columnar to microcrystalline types, whereas WC is predominantly composed of compact columnar. Frisia et al. (2018) propose 392 393 that cave calcite grows by nanocrystal aggregation rather than classical mechanisms; compact 394 crystals aggregate and then coalesce, whereas more porous, nanocrystals are bridged by 395 organics. The compact columnar calcite of WC is due to the slow drip rate, with drip water 396 having time to degas on the speleothem surface, and with calcite precipitated without much 397 disturbance by colloidal and particulate matter. In contrast, WB has more open and 398 microcrystalline fabrics, which can be indicative of the presence of dissolved organic matter 399 and more disturbance by colloidal and particulate matter. These are representative of a 400 quicker hydrological connectivity to the surface, agree with the observation of a faster drip 401 rate, and less disequilibrium calcite deposition from the film of fluid (Dreybrodt and Scholz, 402 2011; Deininger et al 2012).

403

# 404 4.1.2 $\delta^{*8}O$ relationship with the instrumental climate record

405 Figure 6 shows the two  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  records (Panel E) alongside variables: deep drainage (mm / d;

406 Panel E), water excess (mm / d; Panel D), annual CRD, winter CRD, PE (mm / d; Panel C),

407 Southern Oscillation Index (SOI; Panel B) anomalies and IOD events (Panel A).  $\delta^{18}O_{spel.}$ 

- 408 trends are broadly anti-correlated to the monthly CRD (Figure 6). For example, a long-term
- 409 15-year decline in the CRD over 1935-1950 CE, an indicator of groundwater levels, is
- 410 mirrored by an overall increase in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . Water balance deficits (P < ET) also occurred in

411 12 of the 15 years (Figure 6) and the period 1937-1945 CE was recognised as a drought due to high water deficits (WWII Drought; Figure 6). WC  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values are also higher during 412 413 drought periods (i.e. Millennium Drought; Figure 6) and show a continuous positive trend, for example from -4.1 ‰ in 1999 CE to -2.4 ‰ in 2008 CE (Figure 6). In addition, during the 414 same period, six periodic oscillations in WC  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  were observed, approximately 1 % in 415 amplitude and approximately 1 - 2 years in wavelength (numbered 1 to 6; Figure 6). These 416 417 correspond with the longest (six consecutive years) period of annual water deficit (P<ET) 418 (numbered 1 to 6; Figure 6). The oscillations in the stalagmite do not all occur synchronously 419 with the climate record, but are within chronological error  $\pm 2.65$  years. This asynchrony 420 could be due to the uncertainty in the chronology because of non-linear growth or a nonlinear transfer function of surface hydroclimate dynamics to the stalagmite. WB  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 421 values in the Millennium Drought were also higher but not dissimilar from other dry (but not 422 drought) periods in the time series (e.g. 1995-1996 CE) although  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  did persist above 423 the arithmetic mean for most of the 2000's (Figure 5). 424 425 Conversely, during periods of water excess (P > ET), lower  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  is typically observed

426

427 (Figure 6). For example, in 1950 CE Wellington experienced the highest rainfall year on

428 record (1386 mm / a), resulting in an estimated deep drainage of ~0.45 mm / d (deep drainage

429 from AWAP data; Figure 6) and water excess (P - ET from AWAP data; Figure 6),

coinciding with a trough in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . During periods of high and sustained water excess, e.g. 430

1969-1974 CE (Figure 6),  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  is less variable and is similar to arithmetic mean  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 431 432 values (Figure 5).

433

A major flood event (1955 CE) is the only part of the WB  $\delta^{18}$ O time series outside of the 434 range of observed drip  $\delta^{18}O_{water}$  (e.g. -6.4 ‰ VPDB; Figure 5). In the historical record, 435

436 flooding occurred in the town of Wellington in February 1955 CE due to a trough bringing in moist airflow associated with a monsoon depression moving down from Queensland 437 438 (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2008), delivering 178 mm of rainfall in 24 hours and ~240 439 mm over a four-day period. The resulting February 1955 CE rainfall was the highest on 440 record (BoM, 2010). This flooded the Wellington township and surrounding regional areas 441 bringing unprecedented rainfall to an area which, in decades previous, had been in drought conditions (Thorpe and Tweedie, 1956; Walker, 2010). Rainfall event samples over 2011-13 442 CE (Figure 5) at Wellington revealed that modern  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{precip}}$  of extreme rainfall events are 443 444 likely to be isotopically depleted (e.g. -11.4 % VSMOW, ~105 mm rainfall). The flood period is a clear outlier in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , with rapid depletion starting in 1955 CE and continuing to 445 1957 CE (Figure 6). The timing of the surface flood event and rapid  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  change occur 446 447 almost synchronously (Figure 6), suggesting that the karst hydrological response to these types of events has no measurable lag, although their persistence in the  $\delta^{18}$ O record continues 448 449 years after the flood occurred (e.g. 1956-57 CE) demonstrating the vadose zone hydrologic 450 memory.

451

## 452 **5 Discussion**

# 453 **5.1 Climatic controls on stalagmite** $\delta^{18}$ **O**

The frequency of effective recharge and partial evaporation of water stored in the karst control the drip  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  variability at Cathedral Cave (Cuthbert et al., 2014a; Markowska et al., 2016). Drip water monitoring has demonstrated that the process of epikarst evaporation drives the isotopic composition of storage water towards higher values during dry periods. When recharge occurs, this dilutes the high <sup>18</sup>O storage water with low <sup>18</sup>O from rainfall events that generate recharge (Cuthbert et al 2014a). With no seasonality in precipitation at 460 the site, annual cycles of depletion and enrichment in  ${}^{18}O_{drip}$  of sampled drips have not been 461 observed. Furthermore, there is no correction between monthly rainfall amount and monthly 462  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  composition (Markowska et al., 2016).

463

The irregular timing of recharge events explains an absence of regular, annual  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  cycles 464 465 in the stalagmite time series (Figure 5). The irregular timing of recharge events means that variability in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  due to intra-annual changes in  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  will not be uniform (i.e. varying 466 on a seasonal basis) and are more likely synoptically driven depending on moisture source of 467 individual rainfall events. Monthly  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  data suggest that epikarst evaporation could be 468 responsible for the magnitude of the high frequency increases in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , with shifts in 469  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  of up to ~2 ‰ in the space of several months (Cuthbert et al 2014a). Over the 3-year 470 471 drip water monitoring period (2010-2013 CE) drip waters in South Passage varied by 2.8 ‰ (n = 85) with a standard deviation of 0.45 % (Cuthbert et al 2014a). Observed  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . 472 variability is all within the same range of observed  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$  (once converted to the equivalent 473 474 VPDB scale using the temperature dependent fractionation equations of Kim and O'Neill 475 (1997)). One exception is the 1955 CE flood period discussed in section 4.2.3. With limited recharge,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  increases from -5.0 % to -4.2 % (Figure 6) over the WWII drought in 476 1937-1945 CE. Conversely, recharge causes  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  to move towards lower values. For 477 example,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  shifted from -3.3 ‰ in previously dry years to -4.9 ‰, a difference of 478 ~1.5 ‰, after very high precipitation amount in 1950 CE (Figure 6). Overall,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  data 479 480 supports the previous conclusions in Cuthbert et al. (2014a) from drip monitoring studies in 481 Cathedral Cave where epikarst evaporation isotopically enriches storage water during dry periods, punctuated by recharge during wet periods which dilutes high <sup>18</sup>O storage water with 482 low <sup>18</sup>O water from recharge. 483

484

# 485 **5.2 Mechanisms affecting speleothem** $\delta^{18}$ **O composition**

#### 486 **5.2.1** Cave climate

High humidity at the end of the South Passage chamber >97 % (Rau et al., 2015) means both 487 488 stalagmites would have experienced a similar cave air environment. Limited ventilation 489 occurs, with the absence of noticeable airflow, with a measurable decrease in CO<sub>2</sub> from an 490 average of 7784 ppm in summer to 3535 ppm in winter (McDonough et al., 2016). As both 491 stalagmites are at least seasonally resolved, one would expect to see any seasonal changes in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  driven by cave ventilation effects, particularly in stalagmite WC with bi-monthly 492 resolution. Seasonally driven ventilation effects are likely to lead to higher  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{spel}}$  and 493 494  $\delta^{13}C_{spel}$  due to changing the relative pCO<sub>2</sub> and determining the rate of degassing CO<sub>2</sub> from a 495 thin film of water (Baker et al., 2011; Deininger et al., 2012; Scholz et al., 2012). Annual 496 trends in isotopic composition have been observed in speleothems in well-ventilated caves (Mattey et al 2008). However, there is no annual periodicity in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  or  $\delta^{13}C_{spel}$  in 497 stalagmites WC and WB and ventilation is therefore an unlikely cause for the higher  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 498 499 observed here. Instead, it is likely that the interplay of supersaturation and drip rate are the 500 dominant controls on growth rate and disequilibrium fractionation.

501

#### 502 5.2.2 Kinetic isotope fractionation effects during precipitation

503 Cave parameters other than relative humidity and wind velocity may also cause  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  to 504 deviate from isotope equilibrium precipitation e.g. temperature, drip interval, drip water 505 supersaturation with respect to calcite (Day and Hendersen (2011), Dreybrodt and Scholz 506 (2011) and Deininger et al. (2012)). The estimated theoretical equilibrium of precipitation at 507 Cathedral Cave using the measured precipitation-weighted mean annual rainfall is -4.89 ‰ 508 VPDB ( $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$ ). This is calculated using the equation of Kim and O'Neil (1997), which 509 does not account for in-cave processes in its formulation. The majority of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values for

stalagmite WB and all  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values for stalagmite WC are greater than the predicted 510 equilibrium value, with relative overall offsets of 0.8 ‰ and 1.3 ‰, respectively. This 511 suggests that stalagmite  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  rarely if ever reflects the mean isotopic composition of 512 precipitation at Cathedral Cave. Furthermore, the overall relationship between  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  and 513  $\delta^{13}C_{spel}$ , an indicator for disequilibrium processes (Dreybrodt and Scholz, 2011), over the 514 whole time series for stalagmite WC is strong ( $r^2 = 0.77$ ) and likely precipitates under greater 515 disequilibrium conditions (Figure 5). WB shows no relationship ( $r^2 = 0.00$ ) and likely 516 517 precipitates closer to equilibrium conditions (Figure 5).

518

High drip water pCO<sub>2</sub> can cause  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  to deviate from isotope equilibrium due to kinetic 519 520 isotope fractionation during calcite precipitation. Evidence for this at Cathedral Cave 521 includes the fast growth rates for WB and WC ( $\sim 0.53$  and  $\sim 0.76$  mm / a, respectively). 522 Calcium concentration is one of the driving forces behind growth rate (Baker et al., 1998; Dreybrodt, 1999; Baker et al., 2016b) and high mean drip Ca concentration ~2.2 mmol /  $L^{-1}$ 523 524 (Baker et al., 2016b) is also observed. Changes in drip water pCO<sub>2</sub> can occur over time, which in turn could control the amount of kinetic isotope fractionation and changes in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ 525 526 over time. Prior calcite precipitation (PCP), vegetation cover, fire, and vadose zone microbial 527 and root respiration (Baker et al., 2016b) can all control the degree of host rock dissolution 528 and potentially the extent of drip water pCO<sub>2</sub>. At Wellington, fire has not been experienced at 529 the site and thus can be ruled out as an important process. Trees present over the cave are 530 potentially providing an additional source of vadose zone CO<sub>2</sub> at Cathedral Cave, and their regrowth over several decades could lead to long-term changes in drip water pCO2 and 531  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  over time through changes in the amount of root respiration. Field observations 532 reveal the stagnant chamber adjacent to South Passage has consistently high CO<sub>2</sub> (up to 533 534 ~50,000 ppm), and deep tap roots from large eucalyptus trees growing on the surface (e.g.

above WC; Figure 3; Panel K) are clearly visible in neighbouring Gaden Cave. Over shorter
time periods, variations in PCP could be an important control drip water pCO<sub>2</sub> and associated
kinetic isotope fractionation during calcite precipitation. With intermittent recharge at the
site, there is adequate time for PCP to occur in the karst stores supplying drip water to WB
and WC, and in drier conditions, Ca remaining in solution in the drip water is hypothesised to
decrease due to PCP. The extent of PCP at the site is currently poorly constrained.

541

542 Drip interval is also important in kinetic fractionation as it determines the replenishment rate 543 of solution on top of the stalagmite, and the isotope fractionation potential is a time 544 dependent process controlled by the solution residence time (Mühlinghaus et al., 2007, 2009; 545 Hartmann and Baker, 2017). Longer drip intervals may have a significant effect on enriching <sup>18</sup>O and <sup>13</sup>C due to Rayleigh distillation processes (Mickler et al., 2006; Mühlinghaus et al., 546 547 2009). Specifically, it is the increasing enrichment in the HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reservoir resulting from 548 degassing and subsequent CaCO<sub>3</sub> precipitation (Mickler et al., 2006). Mickler et al. (2006) observed progressive increases in  $\delta^{18}$ O away from the growth axis, as high as +1.7 ‰. Day 549 and Henderson (2011) estimated  $\sim +1.5$  % enrichments in <sup>18</sup>O induced from the combination 550 551 of both rapid DIC depletion and evaporation. For very slow drip rates (~1 drip / 50 min) isotopic exchange with the cave atmosphere is also important and will cause the upper layers 552 553 of solution to be in equilibrium with cave atmosphere (Scholz et al., 2009; Dreybrodt et al., 554 2011). However, this is less likely to be important here as the average drip rate in South 555 Passage is between 0 and 0.2 drips / min (Cuthbert et al., 2014a) and is usually > 1 drip / 15 556 min.

557

A conceptual model for dryland caves using Cathedral Cave and stalagmites WC and WB asan example is shown in Figure 7. The effects of both in-cave disequilibrium processes and

epikarst evaporation shift  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  in the same direction; towards higher values with respect to 560 precipitation-weighted mean annual rainfall. Both processes will be enhanced during drier 561 562 phases. Disequilibrium fractionation can provide one explanation for the positive offset of WC  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  relative to WB, as well as the contrasting  $\delta^{18}O$  vs.  $\delta^{13}C$  relationship, as WC is 563 hydrologically fed by a different store which is likely a smaller overflow, evidenced by its 564 565 slower drip rate and the fact that it stops dripping in drier periods. This may be due to its 566 position directly beneath a large eucalyptus tree (Figure 3, Panel K) where roots have 567 penetrated to access the water store. Although not visible in this cave, there are roots clearly 568 visible at a similar depth in neighbouring Gaden Cave and similar observations have been 569 made in Golgotha Cave, SW Western Australia (Treble et al., 2016). Disequilibrium alone cannot account for the magnitude of variability >2 % in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , suggesting that the 570 571 influence of epikarst evaporation observed in drip waters (Cuthbert et al., 2014a; Markowska et al., 2016) is also important for the stalagmite  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  variability. 572

573

#### 574 5.2.3 Climate signals in $\delta^{18}O$

575 Two significant hydrological drought periods occurred over the stalagmite growth period; the "Millennium Drought" (1997-2010 CE) and the "WWII Drought" (1937-1945 CE). The 576 577 Millennium Drought was characterized by increases in PE, warmer temperatures, water 578 deficits (decreasing P-ET), an unusually long succession of positive IOD phases (Figure 6; 579 Ummenhofer et al., (2011)) and a decrease in the rainfall intensity, rather than the number of 580 rain days (Verdon-Kidd and Kiem, 2009). However, it is suggested that the WWII Drought 581 (1937-1945 CE) was more severe in intensity than the Millennium Drought (Jonathan et al., 582 2015). It was also a precursor to the largest rainfall deficit period (1947-49 CE) during the 583 WB stalagmite growth period and was characterised by a persistent 10-year decline in CRD 584 (Figure 6). Whilst both droughts exhibit negative P-ET, suggesting rainfall deficits, the

585 Millennium Drought, in terms of P-ET, appears to be drier. In contrast, the WWII Drought 586 was characterised by a persistent 10-year decline in CRD (Figure 6) and the greatest negative 587 cumulative departures from mean rainfall, suggesting depleted groundwater reservoirs. This 588 is in direct contrast to the Millennium Drought, which had a slightly positive CRD, 589 suggesting groundwater reservoirs were less negatively impacted, despite drought conditions. 590

The fabric of stalagmite WB during the decline in CRD over 1937 to 1947 CE contains 591 592 microsparite layers (Figure 3; Panels E, I, J). Microsparite forms via episodes of nucleation 593 via nanocrystal aggregates, often involving biomediation, which occurs during slow to no 594 drip periods or during prolonged dry phases (Frisia, 2015). This supports the evidence that 595 the karst aquifer feeding WB was likely declining in response to this drought period. However,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  over the drought period was not significantly higher compared to the 596 597 arithmetic mean (WB, Figure 6). Positive trends accelerated several years later, for example in 1948 CE when  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  reached -3.3 ‰, coinciding with the highest negative rainfall 598 599 departures (low CRD, Figure 6). Similarly, after significant rainfall during the 1950's, which led to increased deep drainage,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  fluctuated by 1-2 ‰, but continued an upward trend 600 601 to a maximum of -2.5 ‰ in 1954 CE (WB, Figure 6), before the recharge response occurs. 602 These responses suggest that there is a lag between surface rainfall and karst store recharge, 603 where low karst store volumes persist even after surface drought conditions had abated, thus allowing them to be more susceptible to epikarst evaporation and subsequent <sup>18</sup>O<sub>water</sub> 604 605 enrichment. This may imply that a large reservoir is feeding stalagmite WB, which became 606 depleted in volume over the drought period, and took a long time to be refilled. As a result, 607 when the karst reservoir was in this low volume phase, the stored water may be more 608 sensitive to karst evaporative enrichment due to larger air-filled voids and conditions suitable for PCP, shown in Figure 7. Consequently, stalagmite  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  correlations to dry surface 609

610 climate conditions are drawn out due to an apparent persistence or memory effect of previous 611 conditions or due to non-linear responses to changes in climate. The stalagmite record 612 suggests that it took a decade after the drought abated (1945 CE) for karst store volumes to 613 significantly increase, because although there is evidence of recharge from high rainfalls in the 1950's (Figure 6), the  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  trend continues to rise, and fabric contains microsparite 614 615 layers until the 1955 CE flood. The effect of this drought on long-term store levels might 616 have been more impactful than the Millennium Drought, although there is no data from years 617 after the Millennium Drought as the stalagmite was removed from the cave in 2010 CE. However, stalagmite fabric precipitated during the Millennium Drought contained no 618 619 microsparite layers, perhaps suggesting that its impact on the shallow karst water reservoir 620 was not as extreme.

621

#### 622 5.2.4 Karst $\delta^{18}O$ modelling

A combined SMB-karst model was employed to determine whether  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  can be modelled, 623 using epikarst evaporation of water as the major driver dominating trends in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  by 624 raising  $\delta^{18}O_{drip}$ . The parameterisation of the karst model has been optimised in Cuthbert et al., 625 (2014a) for this field site. The model results are shown in Figure 8 and a model schematic is 626 627 shown in Supplemental Material in Figure S2. Comparing first the model output for stalagmite WC,  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  is generally in good agreement with  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . Almost all major 628 629 peaks and troughs could be replicated within the age uncertainty ( $\pm 2.65$  years) suggesting that epikarst evaporation provides a good explanation for the variability in WC  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . One 630 peak in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  in 2001 CE was not captured in  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  but all five subsequent peaks were 631 within  $\pm 1$  years of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . There is an offset of ~0.5 - 1 ‰ between WC  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  and 632  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values (e.g. 1990 CE). This may be because the model only considered karst 633 evaporation and temperature dependent fractionation (Kim and O'Neil, 1997) as the two main 634

635 drivers of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  variability, and not potential additional kinetic effects. The co-variation of 636 WC  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values here strongly suggest that WC can be explained by a 637 simple single-reservoir model, which is very sensitive to karst evaporation and changes in 638 water storage volumes, controlled by alternating periods of recharge and decline.

639

Conversely, WB  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  values are less in agreement (Figure 8). The first 640 peak in  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  does not appear in  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , although it coincides with the stalagmite 641 growth nucleation phase. Otherwise, the first part of the WB  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  time series is 642 generally in good agreement with  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  until ~1950 CE. As expected, given the prescribed 643 depleted isotopic input for large rainfall events, the 1955 CE flood is captured with similar 644 magnitude to the observed  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . The long stable period from 1970-1990 CE also shows 645 good agreement with WB  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{modelled}}$  and  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{spel}}$ , although  $\delta^{18}O_{\text{modelled}}$  is offset in some parts 646 by up to 0.5 ‰. The Millennium Drought, which is captured as a rising trend punctuated by 647 toughs and peaks in  $\delta^{18}O_{modelled}$  for WC, is not well represented by the model for WB. 648 649 Complex flow behaviour, variable lags and have been demonstrated in this cave system 650 (Markowska et al., 2016). This suggests that WB cannot be explained by a simple single-651 reservoir model and likely is fed by multiple reservoirs. WB's position in the cave, behind a 652 large flowstone feature, which has grown over the entire Quaternary period, suggests a 653 possible connection to a larger storage reservoir. Thus, while the model used can provide insights into the likely processes controlling  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ , it also likely points to the necessity of 654 (1) a more complex multi-store model to capture the variability in WB, (2) quantification of 655 disequilibrium processes from additional cave monitoring of drips feeding WB and WC, and 656 657 (3) a longer time series of drip water isotope data for model calibration before the model can 658 reliably hindcast past droughts and recharge events.

659

660 The selection of speleothems for analysis is subject to trade-offs due to the sensitivity of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  to epikarst evaporation and volume and discontinuous growth, where smaller near-661 surface reservoirs with large headspaces will show the greatest epikarst evaporation 662 663 sensitivity but also may be more likely to exhibit discontinuous growth by virtue of their small storage volumes. Figure 9 shows the relationship between the modelled offset in  $\delta^{18}$ O 664 665 from the mean rainfall composition due to epikarst evaporation, the water storage depth 666 where epikarst evaporation 'switches on' (S2lim) and the epikarst evaporation rate (mm/d). 667 The location of the two stalagmites from this study are shown in this parameter space (Figure 9). For a water-limited environment as modelled here, the amount of epikarst evaporation is a 668 small fraction of the total karst water balance, and the continuity of speleothem growth can 669 670 be assumed to be solely a function of the storage volume via S2lim. Assuming that our 1D 671 model store approximates to the actual 3-dimensional karst void, then the more sensitive a 672 stalagmite is to evaporation the more likely it is to have discontinuous growth or longer 673 hiatuses. At Wellington Caves, the near vertical bedding combined with hypogene solution 674 features means that the development of vertical voids is a reasonable conceptualisation. Figure 9 shows that WC  $\delta^{18}$ O will be more affected by karst evaporation processes compared 675 676 to WB. Therefore, WC is more sensitive to climatic influences including changes in water 677 balance. Similarly, climatically sensitive samples, potentially identified through fabric 678 analysis, could therefore be more useful for paleoclimate applications.

679

#### 680 **6. Conclusion**

This study reveals that the use of  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  as a source of paleoenvironmental information does not require the prerequisite that speleothems formed under isotopic equilibrium conditions. However, coeval stalagmites oxygen isotope records have differences that we relate to their individual hydrology and flow path, demonstrating that in a water-limited environment,  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  can be sensitive to hydrological changes at the individual drip level. Because of this, replication of coeval stalagmites oxygen isotope records may be lower in dryland caves compared to caves with well-mixed large water storage reservoirs from temperate environments. This is conceptually demonstrated in Figure 7, by showing the relative sizes of water stores feeding drips WC and WB during dry conditions. In Figure 7 the overflow store feeding WC, is quickly depleted in dry conditions as opposed to WB, which is connected to a more consistent water source and fed via multiple flow routes.

692

693 In semi-arid environments sensitive to water balance changes, epikarst evaporation and disequilibrium fractionation from kinetic effects are likely to lead to <sup>18</sup>O enrichment during 694 695 drier phases. Epikarst evaporation driven fractionation is controlled by changes to water 696 balance and rainfall amount on the surface which has lag times before being expressed in the 697 stalagmite record. This is more important in dry or drought conditions (e.g. Millennium 698 Drought; Figure 6) where storage volumes are low and larger air pockets develop as stores decline (Figure 7). However, the timing of the  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  response to dry surface conditions 699 700 suggests that they are out-of-phase with the actual occurrence of drought periods on the surface (Figure 6; e.g. WB, peak  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  occurs ~9 years after the end of the WWII Drought). 701 Thus, the interpretation of  $\delta^{18}O_{snel}$  represents water balance excursions but lagged due to 702 703 inertia of the vadose zone in its response to surface climate changes.

704

Stalagmites in this study show that  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  is sensitive to changes in hydroclimate or water balance, resulting in isotopic enrichment as a direct result of drying conditions – thus preserving the isotopic impact of reduced recharge. This differs from a classic direct interpretation of the  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  as a proxy for rainfall amount. Large modifications of the original  $\delta^{18}O_{precip}$  value occurs in this water-limited cave system, from both the karst and the cave environment, and consequently cave monitoring is essential to ascertain the dominant processes that affect  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$ . The combination of epikarst evaporation and kinetic isotope effects in the cave e.g. resulting from a rapid loss of CO<sub>2</sub> or change in drip interval, are likely to positively shift  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  in the same direction and thus these disequilibrium stalagmites in dryland environments may be useful as past water balance or paleorecharge records.

715

716 The significant flood event affecting most of SE Australia in 1955 CE was recorded in 717 stalagmite WB, suggesting that these stalagmites, because of their sensitivity to water balance 718 changes, may be very suitable archives of extreme pluvials or floods. Rainfall in this region is 719 strongly governed by ENSO, where La Niña's have a more significant influence on the intensity and duration of rainfall events than El Niño's. Thus, paleorecharge records from 720 721 Wellington Caves would be useful for providing evidence of the frequency and severity of 722 past pluvial and drought periods. Such records may be important in determining 723 paleoprecipitation anomalies and could be used to elucidate the relationship of climatic 724 dynamics with rainfall over SE Australia.

725

#### 726 Acknowledgements

Thank you to the Dubbo Regional Council and continued support of cave staff and
management at Wellington Caves. Thank you to Dr. Peter Graham for collecting
instantaneous rainfall samples and to Dr. Catherine Jex for analysing the rainfall samples.
AB, MM and MSA were partly supported by the ARC/NWC National Centre for
Groundwater Research and Training. SF acknowledges the support of DP 160101058. The
outcomes of this study contribute to ARC Discovery Project DP140102059 awarded to PCT.
MOC was supported by the European Community's Seventh Framework Programme

734	[FP7/2007–2013] under grant agreement No.299091 and by an Independent Research
735	Fellowship from the UK Natural Environment Research Council (NE/P017819/1).
736	
737	References
738	
739	Anderson, W. T., Bernasconi, S.M., McKenzie, J.A., and Saurer, M. (1998). Oxygen and
740	carbon isotopic record of climatic variability in tree ring cellulose (Picea abies): An
741	example from central Switzerland (1913–1995). J. Geophys. Res-Atmos 103(D24),
742	31625-31636.
743	Australian Bureau of Statistics (2008) 1301.0 - Yearbook Complete, 2008 Natural Disasters
744	in Australia, Article 4. Retrieved from:
745	http://www.abs.gov.au/AUSSTATS/abs@.nsf/7d12b0f6763c78caca257061001cc588/fe
746	cb2ab6de16171eca2570de0005871b!OpenDocument
747	Ayalon, A., Bar-Matthews, M. and Sass, E. (1998). Rainfall-recharge relationships within a
748	karstic terrain in the Eastern Mediterranean semi-arid region, Israel: $\delta^{18}O$ and $\delta D$
749	characteristics. J. Hydrol. 207, 18-31.
750	Baker, A., Genty, D., Dreybrodt, W., Barnes, W.L., Mockler, N.J. and Grapes, J., 1998.
751	Testing Theoretically Predicted Stalagmite Growth Rate with Recent Annually
752	Laminated Samples: Implications for Past Stalagmite Deposition. Geochim. Cosmochim.
753	<i>Acta</i> <b>62,</b> 393-404.
754	Baker, A., Wilson, R., Fairchild, I.J., Franke, J., Spötl, C., Mattey, D., Trouet, V., and
755	Fuller, L. (2011). High resolution $\delta^{18}$ O and $\delta^{13}$ C records from an annually laminated
756	Scottish stalagmite and relationship with last millennium climate. Global Planet. Change
757	<b>79</b> , 303-311.

- 758 Baker, A., Jex, C.N., Rutlidge, H., Woltering, M., Blyth, A.J., Andersen, M.S., Cuthbert,
- 759 M.O., Marjo, C.E., Markowska, M., Rau, G.C. and Khan, S.J. (2016a). An irrigation
- repriment to compare soil, water and speleothem tetraether membrane lipid
- 761 distributions. Org. Geochem. 94, 12-20.
- 762 Baker, A., Flemons, I., Andersen, M.S., Coleborn, K. and Treble, P.C. (2016b). What
- determines the calcium concentration of speleothem-forming drip waters? *Global Planet*. *Change* 143, 152-161.
- 765 Baker, A., Hartmann, A., Duan, W., Hankin, S., Comas-Bru, L., Cuthbert, M.O., Treble,
- P.C., Banner, J., Genty, D., Baldini, L., Bartolomé, M., Moreno, A., and Pérez-Mejías,
- 767 C. Global distribution and controls on cave drip water oxygen isotope composition.
- 768 *Nature Communications*, **10**, Article number: 2984
- Baker, A.J., Mattey, D.P. and Baldini, J.U.L. (2014). Reconstructing modern stalagmite
  growth from cave monitoring, local meteorology, and experimental measurements of
- dripwater films. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **392**, 239-249.
- 772 Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Matthews, A., Sass, E. and Halicz, L. (1996). Carbon and
- 773 oxygen isotope study of the active water-carbonate system in a karstic Mediterranean
- cave: Implications for paleoclimate research in semiarid regions. *Geochim. Cosmochim.*
- 775 *Acta* **60**, 337-347.
- Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Gilmour, M., Matthews, A. and Hawkesworth, C.J. (2003).
- Sea–land oxygen isotopic relationships from planktonic foraminifera and speleothems in
- the Eastern Mediterranean region and their implication for paleorainfall during
- interglacial intervals. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **67**, 3181-3199.
- 780 Benavente, J., Vadillo, I., Carrasco, F., Soler, A., Liñán, C. and Moral, F. (2010). Air
- 781 Carbon Dioxide Contents in the Vadose Zone of a Mediterranean Karst. *Vadose Zone J*.
- **9**, 126-136.

783	Berthelin, R., Rinderer, M., Andreo, B., Baker, A., Kilian, D., Leonhardt, G., Lotz, A.,
784	Lichtenwoehrer, K., Mudarra, M., Padilla, I. Y., Pantoja Agreda, F., Rosolem, R., Vale,
785	A., and Hartmann, A.: A soil moisture monitoring network to characterize karstic
786	recharge and evapotranspiration at five representative sites across the globe, Geosci.
787	Instrum. Method. Data Syst. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/gi-2019-22
788	Bureau of Meteorology (2010). Rainfall Deciles (AWA grids 1900-pres) February 1955.
789	Retrieved from: http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/enso/lnlist/195457/195502.gif .
790	Bureau of Meteorology (2011). Australian Water resources Assessment 2010. Retrieved
791	from: http://www.bom.gov.au/water/awra/2010/documents/assessment-low.pdf
792	Bureau of Meteorology (2015). Recent rainfall, drought and southern Australia's long-term
793	rainfall decline. Retrieved from: http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/updates/articles/a010-
794	southern-rainfall-decline.shtml Bureau of Meteorology (2019). Southern Oscillation
795	Index (SOI) since 1876. Retrieved from:
796	http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/current/soihtm1.shtml
797	Bureau of Meteorology (2019a). Indian Ocean influences on Australian climate. Retrieved
798	from: http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/iod/
799	Butterworth, J. A., Schulze, R. E., Simmonds, L. P., Moriarty, P., and Mugabe, F.:
800	Hydrological processes and water resources management in a dryland environment IV:
801	Long-term groundwater level fluctuations due to variation in rainfall, Hydrol. Earth Syst.
802	Sci., 3, 353-361, https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-3-353-1999, 1999.
803	Cai, Y., Cowan, T., Briggs, P.R. and Raupach, M.R. (2009). Rising temperature depletes soil
804	moisture and exacerbates severe drought conditions across southeast Australia. Geophys.
805	<i>Res. Lett.</i> <b>36</b> L21709.

- 806 Christensen, J.H., K. Krishna Kumar, Marshall, G., Turner, J. (2013). Climate Phenomena
- 807 and their Relevance for Future Regional Climate Change. In: Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K.
- 808 Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M.
- 809 Midgley (eds.) The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth
- 810 Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 2013. Cambridge,
- 811 UK and New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1217-1308.
- 812 Clarke, H., Lucas, C. and Smith, P. (2013). Changes in Australian fire weather between 1973
  813 and 2010. *Int. J. Climatol.* 33, 931-944.
- 814 Coplen, T.B. (1988). Normalization of oxygen and hydrogen isotope data. *Chem. Geol.:*
- 815 *Isotope Geoscience* **72**, 293-297.
- 816 Coplen, T.B. (2007). Calibration of the calcite–water oxygen-isotope geothermometer at
- 817 Devils Hole, Nevada, a natural laboratory. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **71**, 3948-3957.
- 818 Crosbie, R.S., Pickett, T., Mpelasoka, F.S., Hodgson, G., Charles, S.P. and Barron, O.V.
- 819 (2013). An assessment of the climate change impacts on groundwater recharge at a
- 820 continental scale using a probabilistic approach with an ensemble of GCMs. *Climatic*
- 821 *Change* **117**, 41-53.
- 822 Cuthbert, M., Mackay, R. and Nimmo, J. (2013). Linking soil moisture balance and source-
- 823 responsive models to estimate diffuse and preferential components of groundwater
- 824 recharge. *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.* **17**, 1003-1019.
- 825 Cuthbert, M.O., Baker, A., Jex, C.N., Graham, P.W., Treble, P.C., Andersen, M.S. and Ian
- Acworth, R. (2014a). Drip water isotopes in semi-arid karst: Implications for speleothem
  paleoclimatology. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **395**, 194-204.
- 828 Cuthbert, M.O., Rau, G.C., Andersen, M.S., Roshan, H., Rutlidge, H., Marjo, C.E.,
- 829 Markowska, M., Jex, C.N., Graham, P.W., Mariethoz, G., Acworth, R.I. and Baker, A.
- 830 (2014b). Evaporative cooling of speleothem drip water. *Sci. Rep.* **4**, 5162.

- B31 D'Odorico, P. and Porporato, A. (2006). *Dryland Ecohydrology*. New York, NY: Springer832 verlag.
- Bai, A. (2013). Increasing drought under global warming in observations and models. *Nature Clim. Change* 3, 52-58.
- B35 Dansgaard, W. (1964). Stable isotopes in precipitation. *Tellus* **16**, 436-468.
- 836 Day, C.C. and Henderson, G.M. (2011). Oxygen isotopes in calcite grown under cave-
- analogue conditions. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **75**, 3956-3972.
- 838 Deininger, M., Fohlmeister, J., Scholz, D. and Mangini, A. (2012). Isotope disequilibrium
- 839 effects: The influence of evaporation and ventilation effects on the carbon and oxygen
- 840 isotope composition of speleothems A model approach. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **96**,
- 841 57-79.
- 842 Deininger, M. and Scholz, S. (2019). ISOLUTION 1.0: an ISOtope evoLUTION model
- 843 describing the stable oxygen ( $\delta^{18}$ O) and carbon ( $\delta^{13}$ C) isotope values of speleothems.

844 *International Journal of Speleology*, **48**, 21-32.

- 845 Denniston, R.F., González, L.A., Asmerom, Y., Baker, R.G., Reagan, M.K. and Bettis, E.A.
- 846 (1999). Evidence for increased cool season moisture during the middle Holocene.
- 847 *Geology* 27, 815-818.
- 848 Desmarchelier, J.M., Goede, A., Ayliffe, L.K., McCulloch, M.T. and Moriarty, K. (2000).
- 849 Stable isotope record and its palaeoenvironmental interpretation for a late Middle
- 850 Pleistocene speleothem from Victoria Fossil Cave, Naracoorte, South Australia. *Quatern*.
- 851 Sci. Rev. 19, 763-774.
- B52 Dietzel, M., Tang, J., Leis, A. and Köhler, S.J. (2009). Oxygen isotopic fractionation during
- 853 inorganic calcite precipitation Effects of temperature, precipitation rate and pH. *Chem.*
- 854 *Geol.* **268**, 107-115.

- Breybrodt, W. (1999). Chemical kinetics, speleothem growth and climate. *Boreas* 28, 347356.
- 857 Dreybrodt, W. and Scholz, D. (2011). Climatic dependence of stable carbon and oxygen
- 858 isotope signals recorded in speleothems: from soil water to speleothem calcite. *Geochim.*859 *Cosmochim. Acta* **75**, 734-752.
- 860 Even, H., Carmi, I., Magaritz, M. and Gerson, R. (1986). Timing the transport of water
- through the upper vadose zone in a Karstic system above a cave in Israel. *Earth Surf. Proc. Land.* 11, 181-191.
- 863 Fawcett, R.J.B., Trewin, B.C., Braganza, K., Smalley, R.J., Jovanovic, B. and Jones, D.A.
- 864 (2012). On the sensitivity of Australian temperature trends and variability to analysis
- 865 *methods and observation networks, CAWCR Technical Report* (Report no. 050).
- Aspendale, VIC: The Centre for Australian Weather and Climate Research.
- Feng, S. and Fu, Q. (2013). Expansion of global drylands under a warming climate. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* 13, 10081-10094.
- 869 Fleitmann, D., Burns, S.J., Neff, U., Mudelsee, M., Mangini, A. and Matter, A. (2004).
- 870 Palaeoclimatic interpretation of high-resolution oxygen isotope profiles derived from
- annually laminated speleothems from Southern Oman. *Quatern. Sci. Rev.* 23, 935-945.
- 872 Friedman, I. and O'Neil, J.R. (1977). Compilation of stable isotope fractionation factors of
- 873 *geochemical interest* (Report no. 440-KK). Washington, DC: U.S. Geological Survey.
- 874 Frisia, S. (2015). Microstratigraphic logging of calcite fabrics in speleothems as tool for
- palaeoclimate studies. *Intern. J. Speleology* **44**, 1-16.
- 876 Frisia, S., Borsato, A and Hellstrom, J. (2018) High spatial resolution investigation of
- 877 nucleation, growth and early diagenesis in speleothems as exemplar for sedimentary
- 878 carbonates. *Earth Sci. Rev.* **178**, 68-91.

- 879 Gonfiantini, R. (1984). Advisory Group Meeting on Stable Isotope Reference Samples for
- 880 *Geochemical and Hydrological Investigations* (Report to the Director General of the
- 881 International Atomic Energy Agency). Vienna, WIE: IAEA.
- 882 Gonfiantini, R. (1986). Chapter 3 Environmental isotopes in lake studies In: Fontes, J.C.
- (Ed.), *The Terrestrial Environment*, (pp. 113-168). Amsterdam, NH: Elsevier.
- Hartmann, A. and Baker, A. (2017). Modelling karst vadose zone hydrology and its relevance
- for paleoclimate reconstruction. *Earth Sci. Rev.* **172**, 178-192.
- Huang, J., Ji, M., Xie, Y., Wang, S., He, Y. and Ran, J., 2016. Global semi-arid climate
- change over last 60 years. *Clim. Dynam.* **46**, 1131-1150.
- 888 Hut, G. (1987). Consultants' Group Meeting on Stable Isotope Reference Samples for
- 889 *Geochemical and Hydrological Investigations*, Report to the Director General of the
- 890 International Atomic Energy Agency. Vienna, WIE: IAEA.
- Jex, C.N., Mariethoz, G., Baker, A., Graham, P.W., Andersen, M.S., Acworth, R.I., Edwards,
- N. and Azcurra, C. (2012). Spatially dense drip hydrological monitoring and infiltration
- behaviour at the Wellington Caves, South East Australia. *Int. J. Speleol.* **41**, 283-296.
- Jolly, W.M., Cochrane, M.A., Freeborn, P.H., Holden, Z.A., Brown, T.J., Williamson, G.J.
- and Bowman, D.M.J.S. (2015). Climate-induced variations in global wildfire danger from
- 896 1979 to 2013. *Nature Comms.* **6**, 7537.
- 897 Kaufman, A., Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A. and Carmi, I. (2003). The vadose flow above
- Soreq Cave, Israel: a tritium study of the cave waters. J. Hydrol. 273, 155-163.
- 899 Keshavarzi, M., 2017. Assessing hydraulic connection and dissolved organic matter in a karst
- 900 landscape: Wellington, Australia. Unpublished PhD, UNSW.
- 901 http://handle.unsw.edu.au/1959.4/59756
- 902 Kim, S. and O'Neil, J.R. (1997). Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope effects in
- 903 synthetic carbonates. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **61**, 3461-3475.

- King, A.D., Alexander, L.V. and Donat, M.G. (2013). Asymmetry in the response of eastern
  Australia extreme rainfall to low-frequency Pacific variability. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 40,
  2271-2277.
- 907 Lange, J., Greenbaum, N., Husary, S., Ghanem, M., Leibundgut, C. and Schick, A.P. (2003).
- 908 Runoff generation from successive simulated rainfalls on a rocky, semi-arid,
- 909 Mediterranean hillslope. *Hydrol. Procs.* **17**, 279-296.
- 910 Markowska, M., Baker, A., Andersen, M. S., Jex, C. N., Cuthbert, M. O., Rau, Gabriel C.,
- 911 Graham, P. W., Rutlidge, H., Mariethoz, G., Marjo, C. E., Treble, Pauline C., and
- 912 Edwards, N. (2016). Semi-arid zone caves: Evaporation and hydrological controls on
- 913  $\delta^{18}$ O drip water composition and implications for speleothem paleoclimate
- 914 reconstructions. *Quatern. Sci. Rev.* **131**, 285-301.
- 915 Markowska, M., Fohlmeister, J., Treble, P.C., Baker, A., Andersen, M.S. and Hua, Q. (2019).
- 916 Modelling the 14C bomb-pulse in young speleothems using a soil carbon continuum

917 model, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2019.04.029

- 918 Mattey, D., Lowry, D., Duffet, J., Fisher, R., Hodge, E. and Frisia, S. (2008). A 53 year
- seasonally resolved oxygen and carbon isotope record from a modern Gibraltar
- 920 speleothem: reconstructed drip water and relationship to local precipitation. *Earth Planet*.
- 921 Sci. Lett. 269, 80-95.
- 922 Mattey, D.P., Fairchild, I.J., Atkinson, T.C., Latin, J.-P., Ainsworth, M. and Durell, R.
- 923 (2010). Seasonal microclimate control of calcite fabrics, stable isotopes and trace
- 924 elements in modern speleothem from St Michaels Cave, Gibraltar. *Geol. Soc. Spec. Publ.*925 **336**, 323-344.
- 926 Mattey, D.P., Fisher, R., Atkinson, T.C., Latin, J.P., Durrell, R., Ainsworth, M., Lowry, D.
- 927 and Fairchild, I.J. (2013). Methane in underground air in Gibraltar karst. *Earth Planet*.
- 928 Sci. Lett. **374**, 71-80.

929	McDonough, L.K., Iverach, C.P., Beckmann, S., Manefield, M., Rau, G.C., Baker, A. and
930	Kelly, B.F.J. (2016). Spatial variability of cave-air carbon dioxide and methane
931	concentrations and isotopic compositions in a semi-arid karst environment. Environ.
932	<i>Earth Sci.</i> <b>75</b> . 1-20.

- Mickler, P.J., Stern, L.A. and Banner, J.L. (2006). Large kinetic isotope effects in modern
  speleothems. *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.* 118, 65-81.
- 935 Moquet, J.S., Cruz, F.W., Novello, V.F., Stríkis, N.M., Deininger, M., Karmann, I., Santos,
- 936 R.V., Millo, C., Apaestegui, J., Guyot, J.L., Siffedine, A., Vuille, M., Cheng, H.,
- 937 Edwards, R.L. and Santini, W. (2016). Calibration of speleothem  $\delta$ 18O records against
- 938 hydroclimate instrumental records in Central Brazil. *Global Planet. Change* 139, 151-
- 939 164.
- 940 Morgan, K., Jankowski, J. and Taylor, G. (2006). Structural controls on groundwater flow
- 941 and groundwater salinity in the Spicers Creek catchment, Central West region, New South
  942 Wales. *Hydrol. Procs.* 20, 2857-2871.
- 943 Mühlinghaus, C., Scholz, D. and Mangini, A. (2007). Modelling stalagmite growth and δ13C
- as a function of drip interval and temperature. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **71**, 2780-2790.
- 945 Mühlinghaus, C., Scholz, D. and Mangini, A. (2009). Modelling fractionation of stable

946 isotopes in stalagmites. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **73**, 7275-7289.

- Murphy, B.F. and Timbal, B. (2008). A review of recent climate variability and climate
  change in southeastern Australia. *Int. J. Clim.* 28, 859-879.
- 949 NCC & BoM: National Climate Centre, Bureau of Meteorology (2011). Frequent heavy rain
- 950 events in late 2010/early 2011 lead to widespread flooding across eastern Australia.
- 951 Special Climate Statement 24. Retrieved form:
- 952 <u>http://www.bom.gov.au/climate/current/statements/scs24b.pdf</u>

- Nicholls, N. (2010). Local and remote causes of the southern Australian autumn-winter
  rainfall decline, 1958–2007. *Clim. Dyn.* 34, 835-845.
- Pittock, B., Abbs, D., Suppiah, R. and Jones, R. (2006). Climatic Background to Past and
  Future Floods in Australia, *Adv. Ecol. Res.* 39,13-39.
- 957 Rau, G.C., Cuthbert, M.O., Andersen, M.S., Baker, A., Rutlidge, H., Markowska, M.,
- 958 Roshan, H., Marjo, C.E., Graham, P.W. and Acworth, R.I. (2015). Controls on cave drip
- 959 water temperature and implications for speleothem-based paleoclimate reconstructions.
- 960 *Quatern. Sci. Rev.* **127**, 19-36.
- 961 Raupach, M.R., Briggs, P.R., Haverd, V., King, E.A., Paget, M. and Trudinger, C.M. (2009).
- 962 Australian Water Availability Project (AWAP): CSIRO Marine and Atmospheric
- 963 Research Component: Final Report for Phase 3 (CAWCR Technical Report 013),
- 964 Canberra, ACT: CSIRO.
- 965 Raupach, M.R., Briggs, P.R., Haverd, V., King, E.A., Paget, M. and Trudinger, C.M. (2012).
- 966 *Australian Water Availability Project*. CSIRO Marine and Atmospheric Research.
- 967 Retrieved from: <u>http://www.csiro.au/awap</u>
- 968 Rozanski, K., Araguás-Araguás, L. and Gonfiantini, R. (1993). Isotopic Patterns in Modern
- 969 Global Precipitation, Climate Change in Continental Isotopic Records. Washington, DC:
- 970 American Geophysical Union.
- 971 Rutlidge, H., Baker, A., Marjo, C.E., Andersen, M.S., Graham, P.W., Cuthbert, M.O., Rau,
- 972 G.C., Roshan, H., Markowska, M., Mariethoz, G. and Jex, C.N. (2014). Dripwater
- 973 organic matter and trace element geochemistry in a semi-arid karst environment:
- 974 Implications for speleothem paleoclimatology. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **135**, 217-230.
- 975 Rutlidge, H., Andersen, M.S., Baker, A., Chinu, K.J., Cuthbert, M.O., Jex, C.N., Marjo, C.E.,
- 976 Markowska, M. and Rau, G.C. (2015). Organic characterisation of cave drip water by LC-
- 977 OCD and fluorescence analysis. *Geochim. et Cosmochim. Acta* **166**, 15-28.

- 978 Scholz, D., Mühlinghaus, C. and Mangini, A., 2009. Modelling δ13C and δ18O in the
- 979 solution layer on stalagmite surfaces. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **73**, 2592-2602.
- 980 Scholz, D., Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Spötl, C., Fohlmeister, J., Mudelsee, M., Miorandi, R. and
- 981 Mangini, A. (2012). Holocene climate variability in north-eastern Italy: potential
- 982 influence of the NAO and solar activity recorded by speleothem data. *Clim. Past* 8, 1367-
- 983 1383.
- 984 Sheffer, N.A., Cohen, M., Morin, E., Grodek, T., Gimburg, A., Magal, E., Gvirtzman, H.,
- 985 Nied, M., Isele, D. and Frumkin, A. (2011). Integrated cave drip monitoring for epikarst
- 986 recharge estimation in a dry Mediterranean area, Sif Cave, Israel. *Hydrol. Process.* 25,
- 987 2837-2845.
- 988 STAP (2010) Report of the Scientific and Technical Advisory Panel to the Fourth GEF
- Assembly. Accessed at: <u>https://www.thegef.org/sites/default/files/council-meeting-</u>
   documents/GEF-A.4-3 <u>Report\_of\_STAP\_0\_1.pdf</u>
- 991 Thorpe, E.W. and Tweedie, A.D. (1956). The N.S.W. floods of February 1955. *Aust. Geogr.*992 6, 3-13.
- 993 Trabucco, A. and Zomer, R.J. (2009). Global Aridity Index (Global-aridity) and Global
- 994 Potential Evapo-transpiration (Global-PET) Geospatial Database. CGIAR Consortium for
- 995 Spatial Information. Available from the CGIAR-CSI GeoPortal at
- 996 http://www.csi.cgiar.org/.
- 997 Treble, P.C., Budd, W.F., Hope, P.K. and Rustomji, P.K. (2005). Synoptic-scale climate
- 998 patterns associated with rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O in southern Australia. J. Hydrol. 302, 270-282.
- 999 Treble, P.C., Fairchild, I.J., Baker, A., Meredith, K.T., Andersen, M.S., Salmon, S.U.,
- 1000 Bradley, C., Wynn, P.M., Hankin, S.I., Wood, A. and McGuire, E. (2016). Roles of forest
- 1001 bioproductivity, transpiration and fire in a nine-year record of cave dripwater chemistry
- 1002 from southwest Australia. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **184**, 132-150.

- Trewin, B. (2013). A daily homogenized temperature data set for Australia. *Int. J. Clim.* 33,
  1004 1510-1529.
- 1005 Ummenhofer, C.C., Sen Gupta, A., Briggs, P.R., England, M.H., McIntosh, P.C., Meyers,
- 1006 G.A., Pook, M.J., Raupach, M.R. and Risbey, J.S. (2011). Indian and Pacific Ocean
- 1007 Influences on Southeast Australian Drought and Soil Moisture. J. Clim. 24, 1313-1336.
- 1008 Van Dijk, A.I.J.M., Beck, H.E., Crosbie, R.S., de Jeu, R.A.M., Liu, Y.Y., Podger, G.M.,
- 1009 Timbal, B. and Viney, N.R. (2013). The Millennium Drought in southeast Australia
- 1010 (2001–2009): Natural and human causes and implications for water resources,
- 1011 ecosystems, economy, and society. *Wat. Res. Res.* **49**, 1040-1057.
- 1012 Verdon-Kidd, D.C. and Kiem, A.S. (2009). Nature and causes of protracted droughts in
- 1013 southeast Australia: Comparison between the Federation, WWII, and Big Dry droughts.
- 1014 Geophys. Res. Lett. 36, L22707.
- 1015 Walker, B. (2010). Dubbo's big flood, gone but not forgotten, *Daily Liberal*. Retrieved from:
- 1016 <u>http://www.dailyliberal.com.au/story/855359/dubbos-big-flood-gone-but-not-forgotten/</u>
- 1017 Weber, K., Stewart, M. (2004). A Critical Analysis of the Cumulative Rainfall Departure
- 1018 Concept. *Groundwater*. **42** (6); 935-938.
- 1019 Williamson, G., J., Prior, L., D., Jolly, W.M., Cochrane, M., A., Murphy, B., P., Bowman,
- 1020 D.M.J.S. (2016). Measurement of inter- and intra-annual variability of landscape fire
- 1021 activity at a continental scale: the Australian case. *Environ. Res. Lett.* **11**, 035003.

1022 Figure Captions

1023

Figure 1. Aridity map of Australia compiled with spatial aridity data from Trabucco andZomer (2009). The location of Wellington is shown.

1026

1027 Figure 2. Climate variables over 1930 – 2010 CE. Panels A and B show the monthly 1028 maximum and minimum temperature anomalies, respectively, derived from the Australian 1029 Water Availability Project (AWAP) (Raupach et al., 2009, 2012) using a 13-point box 1030 averaging algorithm and a 96-point smoothing (black line). Panel C shows AWAP-derived 1031 monthly PE with a 6-point box smoothing. Panel D shows monthly deep drainage (recharge) 1032 from AWAP data. Panel E is the annual rainfall from Bureau of Meteorology (Wellington, 1033 station ID: 065034) with the thick blue line showing the 9-point box smoothing. Panel F 1034 shows the monthly cumulative rainfall departure (black line) calculated from Bureau of 1035 Meteorology rainfall data (station ID: 065034); seasonal rainfall departure, where DJF 1036 represents summer months, MAM represents autumn months, JJA represents winter months 1037 and SON represents spring months. The period of stalagmite growth for WB (green) and WC 1038 (orange) are also shown in Panel G at the bottom of the figure.

1039

Figure 3. Upper panel shows cross-section of stalagmite WB (Panel A) and WC (Panel B); The sampling transects are indicated in panels C (stalagmite WB) and D (stalagmite WC) and the  $\delta^{18}$ O time series overlain on calcite fabric in panels E (stalagmite WB) and F (stalagmite WC). The photographs in the lower panels show a microscope image of the WB flood layer (Panel G); the UV fluorescence microscope (365 nm) image of WB microsparite layers at the top of the panel before the flood (Panel H); the Ziess microscope image of WB top layers 1046 (Panel I) and microsparite layers below the flood (Panel J); and the surface above Cathedral1047 Cave showing the relative positions of 'WB' and 'WC' (Panel K).

1048

1049 Figure 4. Rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O versus  $\delta$ D with the local meteoric waterline (black), precipitation-

1050 weighted mean annual rainfall (yellow diamond), monthly-integrated rainfall (red stars),

small volume event rainfall < 5 mm samples (blue triangles) and large volume (> 45mm)
event rainfall samples (blue circles).

1053

Figure 5. Time series of stalagmite WB  $\delta^{18}$ O (Panel A) and  $\delta^{13}$ C (Panel B) and timeseries of 1054 of WC  $\delta^{18}$ O (Panel C) and  $\delta^{13}$ C (Panel D). Scatterplots of stalagmite WB  $\delta^{18}$ O vs.  $\delta^{13}$ C 1055 showing  $r^2 = 0.00$  (Panel E) and WC  $\delta^{18}$ O vs.  $\delta^{13}$ C (Panel F) showing  $r^2 = 0.77$ . 3-year box-1056 1057 smoothing was applied to the time series, shown by the "Trend" (red line). The blue background behind each  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$  time series shows the range (-0.13 to -5.53 % VPDB) of 1058 1059 calculated calcite from the temperature dependent fractionation equation in Kim and O'Niel 1060 (1997) for the measured drip water values from South Passage from Cuthbert et al. (2014). <sup>14</sup>C bomb-pulse age and Organic Carbon models presented in Markowska et al. (2019) were 1061 1062 used to build chronologies for stalagmites WB and WC, respectively.

1063

Figure 6. Coeval  $\delta^{18}$ O stalagmite records compared to the instrumental record. Panel A shows the IOD phases with positive (red rectangles) and negative phases (blue rectangles) (BoM, 2019a); Panel B shows the positive SOI anomalies (La Niña phases; green) and negative SOI anomalies (El Niño phases; yellow) based on the standardised anomaly of the Mean Sea Level Pressure difference between Tahiti and Darwin according to the Australian Bureau of Meteorology Convention (BoM, 2019); Panel C shows the Monthly Cumulative Rainfall

- 1070 Deficit (CRD) (thick black line); Winter CRD (blue line); Panel D shows the water excess
- 1071 (precipitation (P) evapotranspiration(ET)) (mm/d) with mean annual P-ET (thick black
- 1072 line); Panel E shows WB stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O (red squares) and WC stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O (black
- 1073 circles) alongside modelled recharge events (deep drainage (blue), from AWAP). The
- 1074 Millennium Drought and WWII Drought are outlined in red and two short droughts (1965-
- 1075 1968 CE and 1982-1983 CE) in yellow. Two significant water excess periods are highlighted
- 1076 in blue (1950-1952 CE and 1955-1956 CE). Numbers 1-6 correspond to peaks in WC  $\delta^{18}O_{spel}$
- 1077 (black) and annual water deficits (yellow), respectively.
- 1078
- 1079 Figure 7. Conceptual model of Cathedral Cave over wet and dry hydrological periods using

1080 stalagmites WC and WB as examples. Stalagmite WB is connected to a larger storage

1081 reservoir than WC, which buffers the response effects of dry periods.

1082

1083 Figure 8. Modelled versus measured  $\delta^{18}$ O for stalagmites WB and WC. The age model 1084 uncertainty is delineated by the red error bars for an example sample point.

1085

Figure 9. Model output showing the sensitivity of variables water storage depth below which epikarst evaporation occurs, or the volume where epikarst evaporation 'switches on' or becomes important (S2lim, mm) versus the epikarst evaporation rate (mm/d) and the resultant offset in  $\delta^{18}$ O due to epikarst evaporation. Assuming that our 1D model store approximates to the actual 3-dimensional karst void, then the likelihood of discontinuous growth is higher when S2lim increases.

Figure 1 revised 191204







Mean weighted annual rainfall Monthly-integrated rainfall 10 Ж  $\mathbb{X}$ Local meteoric waterline Event rainfall <5 mm 0 Event rainfall >45 mm -10 **8D (%o VSMOW)**  $\mathbb{X}$ -20 -30 -40 -50 Ж -8 -6 -2

 $\delta^{18}$ O (% VSMOW)

Figure 4





## Controls on speleothem $\delta^{18}$ O in drylands caves: Example from Cathedral Cave, SE Australia

## Wet conditions



slow drip rate

stalagmite WC

stalagmite

ŴΒ









Appendix Click here to download Appendix: Appendix - Figure S1 S2 S3.pdf Source or Other Companion File Example climate input Click here to download Source or Other Companion File: Model\_Climate\_Input.xlsx MATLAB File (.fig, .m) Click here to download MATLAB File (.fig, .m): Isotope\_FAO\_SMBM\_Markowskaetal\_GCA2019.m

#### **Declaration of interests**

 $\boxtimes$  The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

□The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests: