

OUR
CONSTITUTION

DEFACED

AND

DEFILED

N. A. PALKHIVALA



CONTENTS

Introduction	v
------------------------	---

PART I

BASIC HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RULE OF LAW

1. Democracy and Freedom	
—in India and the U.S.A.	1
A shower of rain	6
Common features of Indian and U.S.A. democracies	8
High moral tone	10
Conditions for survival of free democracy .	13
The future of democracy	15
2. Fundamental Rights	19
Freedom is fragile	19
The philosophy underlying constitutional guarantee of human rights	20
Secured rights envisaged by fighters for national freedom	23
Historical compulsions for paramount fundamental rights	25
A pledge to our own people and a pact with the civilized world	27
The common man's rights	29
No conflict between fundamental rights and directive principles	33
3. The Right to Property	35
Recognition of the right in all democracies .	35
Legislative history	37
Property necessary for the meaningful exercise of other fundamental rights .	38
A dirty word	39
The ambit of the right under the Constitution .	39

CONTENTS

x

4. Human Rights Guaranteed by International Conventions	41
5. Article 31C — An Outrage on the Constitution	50
The Twenty-fourth and Twenty-fifth Amendments	50
Subversion of seven essential features of the Constitution	53
6. Freedom is in Peril	62
7. Constitutional Amendment to Abrogate Freedom of Vote and Conscience of M.P.s and M.L.A.s	67
8. Deviations from the Constitution	71
9. The Supreme Court and High Courts as Guardians of Liberty	76
I Privilege of legislatures	77
Propositions of constitutional law on which the Supreme Court's opinion rested	81
Implications of the legislature's stand	83
II Safeguarding the common man against the tyranny of the executive and the legislature	89
10. A Judiciary Made to Measure	93
Law Commission's Report	95
Traditions in other countries	97
Judges suitable from the Government's viewpoint	99
If the salt have lost his savour	105

CONTENTS

xi

PART II

PARLIAMENT'S POWER TO AMEND THE CONSTITUTION

11. Provisions for Amendment of the Constitution	109
A. Controlled and Uncontrolled Constitutions	112
B. Limitations on the Amending Power	113
Various meanings of "amendment"	114
Inherent or implied limitations	115
C. Universal Acceptance of Inherent or Implied Limitations	117
D. Judicial Recognition of Inherent and Implied Limitations on the Amending Power	120
E. Reasons for Construing Parliament's Amending Power to be Limited	122
The U.S.A. Constitution	131
F. Parliament could not Enlarge its own Amending Power	133
G. Examination of Objections to Limitations on Amending Power	135
"The democratically expressed will of the people".	135
The special majority in Article 368	136
Judicial review of constitutional amendments	137
Are essential features vague and unascertainable?	138

H. Consequences of the Rival Constructions	143
Consequences of holding the amending power to be unlimited	143
Consequences of holding the amending power to be limited.	146
I. The Supreme Court's Judgment in the Fundamental Rights Case .	147

APPENDIX—The text of the relevant provisions of the Constitution	151
---	------------